For discussion on 11 December 2012

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PANEL ON FOOD SAFETY AND ENVIRONMENTAL HYGIENE

Public columbaria - Supply of public niches, including the proposed columbarium, crematorium cum funeral parlour at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery

#### **PURPOSE**

This paper –

- (a) sets out, for Members' information, the progress made in taking forward development of the 24 potential sites identified for public columbarium use; and
- (b) seeks Members' views on our proposal to upgrade part of **758CL** "Site formation and associated infrastructural works for development of columbarium, crematorium and related facilities at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery" to Category A at an estimated cost of \$66.4 million in money-of-the-day (MOD) prices for engaging consultants to undertake detailed design and site investigation works of the site formation and associated infrastructural works for the proposed columbarium and crematorium (C&C) developments at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery.

### (A) Latest Position of Public Columbarium Development

- 2. To increase the supply of public niches, the Government has been promoting the district-based columbarium development scheme. In this connection, we have identified 24 potential sites in 18 districts for columbarium development. The 24 sites were announced in three batches on 6 July 2010, 16 December 2010 and 21 April 2011 respectively.
- 3. On 16 March 2012 when we last briefed the Panel on the public consultation exercise related to the regulation of private columbaria, Members requested the Administration to provide an information paper on the progress of the public columbaria development at these 24 sites.

- 2 -

4. On various previous occasions, Members noted that whether these 24 potential sites could eventually be used for developing columbarium facilities will depend on the results of the technical feasibility studies or traffic impact assessments (TIAs) or engineering feasibility studies (EFS) (where applicable)<sup>1</sup>. Upon completion of the relevant studies, we will consult the relevant District Councils (DCs) before going firm on developing the sites for columbarium use. We set out the progress made since July 2010 in taking forward the 24 sites.

#### TIAs, EFS and technical feasibility studies

- 5. A TIA assesses the traffic and transport implications arising from the columbarium development with a view to confirming the development potential of a site, and recommends appropriate traffic and transport improvement/management measures to mitigate adverse impacts, if any, identified.
- 6. Due to their topographical and other conditions, some potential sites require more intensive EFS to confirm their development potential. An EFS comprises, in addition to a TIA, site investigation, geotechnical, drainage, sewerage, landscape, environmental (and, in some cases, hazard) assessments in order to determine the scale, feasibility and sustainability of the proposed columbarium development at a site.
- 7. Technical feasibility studies seek to establish the technical feasibility of a project on a prima facie basis, having regard to all relevant aspects including design constraints, environmental considerations, project cost estimate and implementation programme. Key findings, such as land requirements in terms of zoning and land availability etc., site utilisation, tree preservation, heritage implications etc., need to be provided in these assessments.
- 8. Having regard to the complexity of the projects
  - (a) six projects require neither TIAs nor engineering feasibility

Factors such as the topographic conditions and infrastructural support may affect the development potential of these sites. Given the large volume of traffic during the gravesweeping seasons, it is necessary to conduct TIAs to assess the capacity of the existing roads and pedestrian walkways leading to the proposed development and to formulate traffic and transport improvement measures where appropriate. Where the site is currently being used for other purpose, relocation of existing uses will also be necessary.

studies, but only technical feasibility studies:

- (i) Diamond Hill columbarium extension;
- (ii) Cheung Chau Cemetery extension;
- (iii) Mui Wo Lai Chi Yuen extension;
- (iv) FEHD's Hong Kong Cemeteries and Crematoria Office (part thereof) at Wong Nai Chung Road;
- (v) former school within Tin Hau Temple on Temple Street; and
- (vi) a vacant staff quarter (part thereof) inside a funeral parlour at 6 Cheong Hang Road, Hung Hom.
- (b) eight projects require TIAs and technical feasibility studies:
  - (i) a site on Cape Collinson Road, opposite the Chai Wan Chinese Permanent Cemetery Columbarium and next to Wan Tsui Estate Park;
  - (ii) a site on On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, next to Shatin Refuse Transfer Station;
  - (iii) Fu Shan columbarium extension;
  - (iv) surplus coffin burial grounds and other land within the Wo Hop Shek Cemetery;
  - (v) part of the Tsang Tsui ash lagoon next to Black Point Power Station;
  - (vi) ex-Kwai Chung Incineration Plant on Kwai Yu Street;
  - (vii) a site on Kwai Tai Road, southeast of ex-Kwai Chung Incineration Plant; and
  - (viii) a site on Tsing Tsuen Road near the Tsuen Wan Chinese Permanent Cemetery.
- (c) ten sites require EFS (which include TIAs) and technical feasibility studies:

- (i) undeveloped areas within the Sandy Ridge Cemetery;
- (ii) a site at Mount Davis Road, east of the Chiu Yuen Cemetery;
- (iii) a site north of Ching Cheung Road near the Roman Catholic Cemetery;
- (iv) a site next to the Ex-Ma Yau Tong Central Landfill site;
- (v) a site adjoining the Chinese Christian Cemetery at Pok Fu Lam;
- (vi) two sites located at the eastern and western ends of Sham
- & Shui Kok Drive, Siu Ho Wan, North Lantau;
- (vii)
- (viii) a site between San Tam Road and Mai Po Lung Road, San Tin;
- (ix) a site at the southwestern corner of the Shuen Wan Ex-Landfill, near Tai Po Industrial Estate; and
- (x) a site at Area 132, Tsuen Kwan O, near the Tseug Kwan O Chinese Permanent Cemetery.
- 9. Of the six sites in paragraph 8 (a), we completed the technical feasibility studies for the Diamond Hill project and the Cheung Chau project, and are forging ahead with the technical feasibility studies on the remaining four sites of smaller scale in Islands District, Wan Chai District, Yau Tsim Mong District and Kowloon City District. Such ongoing assessments are mainly related to loading implications, requirements on accessibility for the disabled, heritage preservation issues and relocation of existing facilities on the site. We have completed TIAs for all the potential sites in paragraph 8 (b) to confirm their development potential from the traffic and transport point of view. Of the ten sites in paragraph 8 (c), the EFS for the site within the Sandy Ridge Cemetery was completed in the third quarter of 2012 while the EFS for the remaining sites commenced in the second half of 2012 for completion in mid 2014. While the technical feasibility studies of some of the sites in paragraph 8 (b) and (c) have been completed, those in respect of the other sites are either continuing or have yet to commence.

#### Consultation with District Councils (DC)

- 10. We consulted the Islands DC on 23 May 2011 regarding the proposal to build about 990 niches at the Cheung Chau Cemetery extension. Construction works will commence in the second quarter of 2013 for completion in the fourth quarter of 2013.
- 11. We consulted the Wong Tai Sin DC on 28 June 2011 regarding the proposal to build about 1 540 niches in the Diamond Hill columbarium extension. Construction works commenced in October 2011 and were completed in April 2012.
- 12. We consulted the North DC on 12 April 2012 regarding the various sites at Wo Hop Shek. The DC conveyed no objection to proceeding with the columbarium development regarding Phase 1 (providing about 44 000 niches) and requested the Administration to study the widening of the pedestrian footbridge at Fanling Station, East Rail and liaise with nearby villagers on the provision of public open space.
- 13. We consulted the Tuen Mun DC on 8 May and 6 November 2012 regarding the site at Tsang Tsui (providing about 110 000 niches). The DC conveyed no objection to proceeding with the introduction of the OZP for columbarium use on this site and requested the Administration to study various road improvement works in nearby areas.
- 14. We consulted the Kwai Tsing DC on 20 June 2012 regarding the various sites in Kwai Tsing. The DC conveyed no objection to proceeding with the site on Tsing Tsuen Road (providing about 20 000 niches) and requested the Administration to report back to the DC on the detailed design.
- 15. We consulted the North DC on 11 October 2012 regarding developments at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery. For further details, please see paragraph 30 below.
- 16. **Annex A** sets out the current state of play regarding the 24 sites.
- 17. Meanwhile, the new public columbarium at Kiu Tau Road, Wo Hop Shek (funding for which had been approved by LegCo before we identified the 24 sites) was completed in July 2012. It provides about 43 000 niches.
- 18. Subject to the outcome of the TIAs, EFS and technical feasibility studies as well as support of DCs and LegCo for columbarium developments

in the pipeline, together with the supply of the Chinese Permanent Cemeteries, we estimate that over 120 000 new niches (including the 43 000 new niches in Kiu Tau Road, Wo Hop Shek completed in July 2012) will be made available in 2012 to 2016, and that thereafter the supply of new niches will cumulatively increase to hundreds of thousands in the medium to long run (i.e. 2017 to 2031).

19. While we would continue to press ahead with these projects, we need to be realistic about the long term prospects of identifying yet more land for building public columbaria for depositing human cremains. The competing demands on the finite supply of land in Hong Kong, taken together with the difficulties we face in managing local concerns that the traffic and environmental impact that any proposed columbarium developments may have on the neighbourhood, are such that it will become increasingly difficult to find land suitable for columbarium developments. To make better use of the limited land resources that may be available, we feel that sooner or later the community as a whole must come to terms with the need to even out the traffic impact that may be brought by columbarium developments during the two peak seasons in grave sweeping. New measures such as designating different worship periods for different blocks of niches, limiting access during one or both of the grave sweeping seasons etc. will need to be actively explored. To relieve the shortage and increase the supply, we may need to consider time-limited occupation of new niches, with post-occupation re-use through renewal or re-allocation. Meanwhile, the Government is taking steps to foster a change in mindset and culture by encouraging community acceptance of more sustainable forms of "green burial" (such as scattering of human cremains at sea or gardens of remembrance, and internet memorial service) by improving our services in these areas.

# (B) <u>Site Formation and Associated Infrastructural Works for Development of C&C Facilities at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery</u>

20. Among the 24 potential columbarium sites, the Sandy Ridge Cemetery is the largest one. The Administration proposes to develop a cluster of funeral parlour, crematorium and columbarium facilities at Sandy Ridge to provide one-stop service for the public.

#### **PROPOSAL**

21. We propose to upgrade the following part of **758CL** to Category A at an estimated cost of \$66.4 million for carrying out

#### pre-construction consultancy services, namely –

- (a) detailed design of the works described in (i) to (iii) below, including review of the impact assessments on traffic, drainage, sewerage and geotechnical aspects
  - (i) site formation of about 10 hectares of land for development of C&C facilities at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery;
  - (ii) associated environmental mitigation measures, landscaping works, geotechnical works, drainage and sewerage works, waterworks, roadworks including tunnel, viaducts and ancillary works to existing road network in North District, and other utility services, etc.; and
  - (iii) a pedestrian walkway between Lo Wu Mass Transit Railway Station and the columbarium facilities at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery and associated works;
- (b) environmental impact assessment (EIA);
- (c) associated site investigation works including supervision; and
- (d) preparation of tender documents and assessment of tenders.
- 22. The remaining part of **758CL** covers mainly construction of the site formation and associated infrastructural works described in item (a) of paragraph 21 above. Funding for these works will be sought to dovetail with the implementation programme of the project.
- 23. Subject to approval of the Finance Committee (FC), we plan to engage consultants in July 2013 to carry out the proposed detailed design and to supervise site investigation works for completion by September 2016.
- 24. A layout plan of the proposed site formation and associated infrastructural works for the development of C&C facilities at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery is at **Annex B**.

#### LATEST POSITION

- 25. While the Sandy Ridge Cemetery has been identified as a suitable site to develop C&C facilities, it is necessary to carry out site formation and associated infrastructural works at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery before taking forward the C&C development project.
- In March 2011, we engaged consultants to conduct a feasibility study on the site formation and associated infrastructural works for the development of columbarium facilities (providing at least 200 000 niches), a crematorium, a funeral parlour and a visitor service centre at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery. The study was completed in September 2012. The consultants recommended to commence the site formation works by phases with the handover of the formed land in 2019 at the earliest to suit the construction of building works of the C&C facilities for completion in 2022. We have formulated the layout plan of the site formation and associated infrastructural works for the C&C development.
- 27. Taking into account the multi-disciplinary nature of the project and competing demands on in-house resources, we propose to employ consultants to undertake the proposed detailed design and supervise site investigation works. In order to meet the earliest target date of handing over formed land in 2019, and subject to FC's approval, we plan to start the proposed detailed design in July 2013.

#### FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

28. We estimate the cost of the proposed detailed design and site investigation works to be \$66.4 million in MOD prices, made up as follows –

		\$ million		
(a)	Consultants' fees		46.2	
	(i) detailed design	34.0		
	(ii) environmental impact assessment	8.0		
	(iii) supervision of site investigation works	0.8		
	(iv) preparation of tender documents and assessment of tenders	3.4		
(b)	Site investigation works		5.0	
(c)	Contingencies		5.1	
	Sub-total		56.3	(in September

				2012 prices)
(d)	Provision for price adjustment		10.1	
		Total	66.4	(in MOD prices)

29. The proposed detailed design and site investigation works will not give rise to any recurrent consequences.

#### **PUBLIC CONSULTATION**

We consulted the Ta Kwu Ling District Rural Committee on 4 30. October 2012. There was concern about possible impact on the existing graves at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery and the traffic impact on the existing roads near the Cemetery. We consulted the North DC on 11 October 2012. Whilst members conveyed no objection to proceeding with the site investigation proposed detailed design and works. thev registered concerns about the traffic impact on the existing roads in the North District. We will review the TIA and propose mitigation measures in the detailed design to alleviate the impact on the traffic. We will also consult the relevant stakeholders at the detailed design stage.

#### **ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS**

- 31. The site formation and associated infrastructural works will include designated projects under Schedule 2 of the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO) (Cap. 499), such as road bridges and widening of a district distributor road, etc. which require environmental permits prior to construction and operation. We will conduct an EIA to address the environmental impact and propose mitigation measures if necessary. We have included \$8.0 million (in September 2012 prices) in the cost estimate for conducting the EIA.
- 32. The proposed detailed design and site investigation works are not a designated project under the EIAO. The proposed detailed design and site investigation works will only generate very little construction waste. We will require the consultants to fully consider measures to minimize the generation of construction waste and to reuse/recycle construction waste as much as possible in implementing the construction works in future.

#### HERITAGE IMPLICATIONS

33. The proposed detailed design and site investigation works will not affect any heritage site, i.e. declared monuments, proposed monuments, graded historic sites/buildings, sites of archaeological interest and Government historic sites identified by the Antiquities and Monuments Office.

#### LAND ACQUISITION

34. The proposed detailed design and site investigation works will not require any land clearance or acquisition.

#### **BACKGROUND**

- 35. In March 2011, we engaged consultants to undertake the feasibility study on the site formation and associated infrastructural works for development of C&C facilities at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery at an estimated cost of \$8.0 million chargeable to **Head 139** "Government Secretariat: Food and Health Bureau (Food Branch)". We completed the study in September 2012 and upgraded **758CL** to Category B in the same month.
- 36. The proposed detailed design and site investigation works will not directly involve any tree removal or planting proposals. We will require the consultants to take into consideration the need for tree preservation and planting proposal during the detailed design stage.
- 37. We estimate that the proposed detailed design and site investigation works will create about 27 jobs (3 for labourers and another 24 for professional/technical staff), providing a total employment of 840 man-months.

#### WAY FORWARD

38. Subject to Members' views, we plan to seek the support of the Public Works Sub-committee in January 2013 for upgrading part of **758CL** as stated in paragraph 21 to Category A with a view to seeking funding approval from the FC in February 2013.

Food and Health Bureau December 2012

The 24 sites identified for public columbarium development

	District	Potential Site	<b>Latest Position</b>
1	Eastern	A site on Cape Collinson Road, opposite the Chai Wan Chinese Permanent Cemetery Columbarium and next to Wan Tsui Estate Park	Traffic Impact Assessment completed.
			Under technical feasibility study.
2	Wong Tai Sin	Diamond Hill columbarium extension	Project completed (providing 1 540 niches).
3	Sha Tin	A site on On Hing Lane, Shek Mun, next to Shatin Refuse Transfer Station	Traffic Impact Assessment completed.
4	Sha Tin	Fu Shan columbarium extension	Traffic Impact Assessment completed.
			Under technical feasibility study.
5	North	Surplus coffin burial grounds and other land within the Wo Hop Shek Cemetery	Traffic Impact Assessment completed.
			Technical feasibility study for Phase 1 completed, and for Phases 2 and 3 underway.
			Consulted NDC on 12 April 2012.

	District	Potential Site	<b>Latest Position</b>
6	North	Undeveloped areas within the Sandy Ridge Cemetery	Stage I: Site formation and associated
		Ridge Cemetery	infrastructural works
			Engineering feasibility study completed.
			Technical feasibility study completed.
			Consulted NDC on 11 October 2012.
			The next step is to seek funds for engaging consultants to undertake detailed design and site investigation works of the site formation and associated infrastructural works.
			Stage II: Building works for the C&C developments
			We will set in train follow-up actions, with an aim of commencing the building works upon the hand-over of the formed land in 2019.
7	Tuen Mun	Part of the Tsang Tsui ash lagoon next to Black Point Power Station	Traffic Impact Assessment and technical feasibility study completed.
			Consulted TMDC on 8 May and 6 November 2012.

	District	Potential Site	Latest Position
8	Kwai Tsing	Ex-Kwai Chung Incineration Plant on Kwai Yu Street	Traffic Impact Assessment completed.
9	Kwai Tsing	A site on Kwai Tai Road, southeast of ex-Kwai Chung Incineration Plant	Traffic Impact Assessment completed.
10	Kwai Tsing	A site on Tsing Tsuen Road near the Tsuen Wan Chinese Permanent Cemetery	Traffic Impact Assessment and technical feasibility study completed.  Consulted K&TDC on 20 June 2012.
11	Islands	Cheung Chau Cemetery extension	Project scheduled for completion in late 2013 (providing 990 niches).
12	Islands	Mui Wo Lai Chi Yuen extension	Traffic Impact Assessment not required in view of the small number of niches.  Under technical feasibility study.
13	Central and Western	A site at Mount Davis Road, east of Chiu Yuen Cemetery	Under engineering feasibility study.
14	Wan Chai	FEHD's Hong Kong Cemeteries and Crematoria Office (part thereof) at Wong Nai Chung Road	Traffic Impact Assessment not required in view of the small number of niches.  Under technical feasibility study.
15	Shum Shui Po	A site north of Ching Cheung Road near the Roman Catholic Cemetery	Under engineering feasibility study.

	District	Potential Site	<b>Latest Position</b>
16	Kwun Tong	A site next to the Ex-Ma Yau Tong Central Landfill Site	Under engineering feasibility study.
17	Yau Tsim Mong	Former school within Tin Hau Temple on Temple Street	Traffic Impact Assessment not required in view of the small number of niches.
			Under technical feasibility study.
18	Southern	A site adjoining the Chinese Christian Cemetery at Pok Fu Lam	Under engineering feasibility study.
19	Kowloon City	A vacant staff quarter (part thereof) inside a funeral parlour at 6 Cheong Hang Road, Hung Hom	Traffic Impact Assessment not required in view of the small number of niches.  Under technical feasibility study.
20 & 21	Tsuen Wan	Two sites located at the Eastern and Western Ends of Sham Shui Kok Drive, Siu Ho Wan, North Lantau	Under engineering feasibility study.
22	Yuen Long	A site between San Tam Road and Mai Po Lung Road, San Tin	Under engineering feasibility study.
23	Tai Po	A site at the southwestern corner of the Shuen Wan Ex-Landfill, near Tai Po Industrial Estate	Under engineering feasibility study.
24	Sai Kung	A site at Area 132, Tsueng Kwan O, near the Tseung Kwan O Chinese Permanent Cemetery	Under engineering feasibility study.

