

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)926 /13-14
(These minutes have been seen
with the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/DEV/1

Panel on Development

**Minutes of special meeting
held on Saturday, 16 November 2013, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen (Deputy Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

Member attending : Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Members absent : Hon James TO Kun-sun
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP

Public officers attending : **Agenda item I**

Mr Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP
Secretary for Development

Mr Michael CHAN Chun-fung
Principal Assistant Secretary (Planning and Lands) 5
Development Bureau

Ms Phyllis LI Chi-miu, JP
Deputy Director of Planning/Territorial
Planning Department

Mr Edward CHAN Cheuk-wing
Acting Chief Engineer / Project 1
(New Territories North and West)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Attendance by Invitation : **Agenda item I**

余顯璧女士
Spokesperson
Green Sense

Mr HO Hoi-fat
Speaker
Hung Shui Kiu New Development Joint Village Concern
Group

Mr KONG Kin-shing
Social Worker
推動天水圍經濟大聯盟

Mr Stanley CHAING
Chairman
Lok Ma Chau China - Hong Kong Freight Association

Dr Kenneth TANG Siu-sing
Representative
The Hong Kong Institute of Planners

Mr NG Kai-hong
Director
Hung Uk Tsuen Merchants Association

Sr LAU Chun-kong
Chairman of Land Policy Panel
The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors

Mr NG Hei-man
Assistant Campaign Manager
The Conservancy Association

Mr YAU Kin-wo
召集人
元朗起動

Mr LEUNG Wai-kuen
Spokesperson
Tin Sum Sun Tsuen Concern Group

Mr FU Ka-ho
Representative
反對香港「被規劃」行動組

Mr Tony CHAN Tung-ngak

Co-opted Councillor
Heung Yee Kuk New Territories

Mr CHAN Kin-cheung

Mr LEUNG Chi-ming

Mr WANG Chi-yung
Executive Officer
Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives
Association

馮玉玲女士

Ms Vivian SHEK Wai-him

彭樂欣女士
組織幹事
關注綜援低收入聯盟

莊立彬先生
幹事
土地正義聯盟

Mr CHENG Sze-lut
Vice Chairperson
Labour Party

Ms Nancy WU
Member, Logistics Policy Committee
The Chartered Institute of Logistics & Transport in Hong
Kong

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sharon CHUNG
Chief Council Secretary (1)6

Staff in attendance : Mr Anthony CHU
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Fred PANG

Council Secretary (1)6

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)6

Ms Haley CHEUNG
Clerical Assistant (1)6

Action

I To receive views on the Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area Planning and Engineering Study

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1543/12-13(03) -- Administration's paper on Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area Planning and Engineering Study -- Preliminary Outline Development Plan and Stage Two Community Engagement

LC Paper No. CB(1)1543/12-13(04) -- Paper on the planning and engineering study for the Hung Shui Kiu new development area prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Background brief))

Submissions from deputation(s)/individual(s) not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(02) -- Submission from Ping Shan Rural Committee

LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(06) -- Submission from Yick Yuen Tsuen Concern Group dated 1 November 2013

LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(08) -- Submission from Shek Po Road Mei Tsuen Concern Group dated 27 October 2013

LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(10) -- Submission from Civic Party dated 15 October 2013

LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(11) -- Submission from Kai Hong Chui dated 24 October 2013

LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(12) -- Submission from Designing

- Hong Kong Limited dated 26 October 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(13) -- Submission from The Real Estate Developers Association of Hong Kong dated 29 October 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(14) -- Submission from Tuen Mun District Council dated 29 October 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(15) -- Submission from The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers dated 31 October 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(16) -- Submission from a member of the public (陳明潔) dated 3 November 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(17) -- Submission from Association of Engineering Professionals in Society Ltd. dated November 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(18) -- Submission from Hong Kong Logistics Association dated 4 November 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(19) -- Submission from a deputation (丹桂村、和平新村寮屋居民關注組) dated 4 November 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)321/13-14(04) -- Submission from World Wide Fund - Hong Kong dated 30 October 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)321/13-14(05) -- Submission from Neighbourhood and Worker's Service Centre dated 9 November 2013
- LC Paper No. CB(1)321/13-14(06) -- Submission from Association of the New Territories Open Storage Operators Limited dated 13 November 2013)

Members noted the following submissions tabled at the meeting --

- (a) Submission from the New Territories Association of Societies;
and

- (b) Submission from the Democratic Party.

(Post-meeting note: The above submissions tabled at the meeting were circulated to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(1)338/13-14(01) and (02) on 18 November 2013.)

Meeting arrangements

2. The Chairman invited members' views on the meeting arrangements. He suggested that each deputation be given four minutes to present his/her views. Afterwards, he would invite members to express views and ask questions. The Administration would then respond to the concerns raised by deputations and members. Members raised no objection to the meeting arrangements.

Welcoming remarks by the Chairman

3. The Chairman welcomed representatives of the Administration and deputations to the meeting for an exchange of views on the Administration's proposal on the Preliminary Outline Development Plan ("PODP") formulated for the proposed Hung Shui Kiu ("HSK") New Development Area ("NDA") under the Stage 2 community engagement ("CE") exercise. He reminded deputations that when addressing the Panel during the meeting, they were not covered by the protection and immunity under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) and their written submissions were also not covered by the said Ordinance.

Oral presentation by deputations

4. A total of 21 deputations presented their views, which were summarized in the **Appendix**.

Discussion

Planning issues

5. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan asked the Administration to clarify if the proposed HSK NDA was planned to support the development of the new Qianhai area in Shenzhen. He was concerned that Hong Kong's increasing dependence on the economic development of the Mainland would weaken its own competitiveness in the long run. Dr Fernando CHEUNG also queried whether the proposed development of HSK, which would require many existing residents to move out without proper rehousing arrangements, was undertaken for the benefits of Hong Kong people.

6. SDEV said that the proposed HSK NDA had an advantage in its strategic location, which made it well linked to the Hong Kong International Airport, the Kwai Chung Container Port and Shenzhen, but any accusation that HSK or North West New Territories ("NT") was planned and developed to support the economic growth of Shenzhen was groundless. He stressed that both North East New Territories ("NENT") NDAs and HSK NDA were developed for Hong Kong people. He said that the historical background of the planning for HSK NDA showed clearly that the NDA was developed for Hong Kong people. He said that HSK had been identified under the Planning and Development Study on North West NT, completed in 2003, as a suitable location for development as an NDA to cater for the long-term development needs of Hong Kong in terms of housing and employment opportunities. In the light of a slower growth of population and housing demand at that time, the proposal of developing HSK NDA had been temporarily shelved. Later on, the "Hong Kong 2030: Planning Vision and Strategy" had revisited the need for NDAs in the NT and recommended proceeding with the development of various NDAs, including HSK NDA. The then Chief Executive had announced in his 2007-2008 Policy Address the planning for the NDAs in HSK and NENT as one of the 10 major infrastructure projects for economic growth. After commencing the HSK NDA Planning and Engineering Study in August 2011 to formulate a feasible land use framework for the proposed HSK NDA, two rounds of Stage 1 CE had been undertaken. The PODP for HSK NDA had been formulated taking into account the views received in Stage 1 CE. In July 2013, the Administration had launched a three-month Stage 2 CE to seek public comments on the PODP.

7. Mr CHENG Sze-lut, Vice Chairman, Labour Party, considered that despite SDEV's denial, NT North was to be developed for the integration of

the Mainland and Hong Kong. He was opposed to the proposed development of a mega shopping facility in the proposed HSK NDA on the ground that such development would not be conducive to nurturing local small- and medium-sized businesses. In his view, shopping mall development would only benefit large business conglomerates and chain shops.

8. Mr HO Hoi-fat, Speaker, Hung Shui Kiu New Development Joint Village Concern Group, said that in Stage 1 CE, the consultation document had not mentioned Qianhai but in Stage 2 CE, the consultation document did refer to the Qianhai City Centre. It was reasonable to infer that the planning of HSK NDA had taken into account the development of Qianhai.

9. SDEV highlighted that from the economic perspective, the planning for HSK NDA should capitalize on its advantageous location, i.e. by taking the opportunities arising from the economic activities between HSK NDA and nearby areas, including those beyond North West NT. In fact, a lot of Hong Kong people travelled daily to work in the Mainland. These people would welcome the development of an NDA in HSK, which would have good transport connections via the Kong Sham Western Highway with Shenzhen. SDEV added that, to cater for the changes in Hong Kong's economic development in the next 10 years, some sites had been reserved in the NDA for the development of new industries. In addition to developing new economic activities in the proposed HSK NDA, the Administration would look into how to address the possible impacts on the existing business operators in HSK.

Provision of employment opportunities

10. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan and Mr YIU Si-wing said that a major problem with Tin Shui Wai, an area with over-concentration of public rental housing development, was the lack of sufficient commercial activities and job opportunities, which had made it necessary for many residents travel a long distance every day to work in other districts. While welcoming the provision of 100 000 employment opportunities in the proposed HSK NDA, they requested the Administration to provide more details about such opportunities. In view of HSK's proximity to the Shenzhen Bay Immigration Control Point and the Hong Kong Wetland Park, Mr YIU opined that the natural environment and old villages in the area should be promoted as attractions to tourists from the Mainland. Pointing out that tourism development would benefit local economy, he called on the Administration to formulate a plan for tourism development in HSK.

11. Mr Albert CHAN sought deputations' views on whether a larger commercial zone should be planned in HSK NDA with a view to providing more job opportunities.

12. Sr LAU Chun-kong, Chairman of Land Policy Panel, the Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors, said that for commercial activities to flourish, the floor area of the relevant facilities must reach a critical mass, say, over six million square feet. Consideration should be given to relocating some Government offices to the proposed HSK NDA so as to promote the use of office space in the area. Supporting facilities like transportation and hotels should be planned. Citing Kowloon East as an example, Mr LAU said that the development of a commercial area would take a long time, so the land should be granted at a low premium at the initial stage to provide incentives to developers.

13. Mr Tony CHAN Tung-ngok, Co-opted Councillor, Heung Yee Kuk New Territories, said that the economic development of Hong Kong should be viewed from a macro and forward-looking perspective to take into consideration the development of the Pearl River Delta region. As the new Qianhai area would become a new financial centre and a free trade zone would be developed in Guangdong, he considered that in the next 10 or 20 years, it would be important to provide convenient cross-boundary transport facilities for the future working population of the proposed HSK NDA. He believed that, with the potential to develop hotels and facilities for providing commercial and professional services, the proposed NDA would provide ample employment opportunities for local residents. As the traditional commercial areas in Hong Kong had limited scope for further expansion due to high rentals, he held the view that it was appropriate to develop new commercial areas in the NT.

14. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan stated opposition against relying on the shops in stereotyped shopping malls in the proposed HSK NDA to provide job opportunities to local residents. He opined that the jobs offered by those shops were not conducive to promoting creativity among the young generation. He considered that more street shops should be provided in the proposed NDA to increase the vibrancy of the area and generate business opportunities.

15. In response, Deputy Director of Planning/Territorial ("DD/Planning/Territorial") advised that the proposed HSK NDA would not only be a major source of land supply to meet the housing needs of Hong

Kong in the medium- to long-term, but also a regional centre that would serve to foster the future economic development and growth of Hong Kong. As regards the employment opportunities in the proposed NDA, it was planned that a regional commercial-residential hub would be proposed around the new West Rail HSK Station. There would be a wide range of land uses including hotels, offices, retail, and private and public residential developments. Street shops would be provided in the residential areas. Under the preliminary planning, the commercial developments, logistics/special industries and Government/social services would provide 40 000, 50 000 and 10 000 employment opportunities respectively, making a total of 100 000. SDEV agreed that more street shops should be provided in the proposed HSK NDA to increase the vibrancy of the district and promote local economy.

Impact on non-indigenous villages and existing business operations

16. Noting that under the PODP, only non-indigenous villages would be cleared for the development of HSK NDA, Ms Emily LAU queried whether the non-indigenous villagers had been treated unfavorably and unfairly. She asked if the Administration had adequate communication with these villagers on the development project and how their concerns would be addressed. Dr KWOK Ka-ki sought explanation from the Administration on why only non-indigenous villages were affected.

17. SDEV said that the PODP for HSK NDA had been drawn up by the Planning Department ("PlanD") based on their professional knowledge. PlanD had considered a set of relevant factors, including the geographical, ecological and economic features of the area, to arrive at the optimal planning of the NDA. The objective of Stage 2 CE was to listen to the views of all stakeholders, including non-indigenous villagers, on the PODP. He assured members that the Administration would strive to minimize the impact of the HSK NDA project on the existing residents. Taking into account the views received in Stage 2 CE, the Administration would further examine the measures to be taken, apart from the compensation and rehousing arrangements under the existing mechanism, to address the concerns of affected residents and business operators.

18. DD/Planning/Territorial added that out of the 29 villages in the area covered by the proposed HSK NDA, five non-indigenous villages would be affected as they were located either at or in close proximity of the future town centre of the NDA, the proposed West Rail HSK Station or the sites required for transport infrastructure and public facilities. The other

non-indigenous villages were not affected. For instance, all the non-indigenous villages located to the south of Castle Peak Road would be retained. The Administration had visited the affected villages during Stage 1 and Stage 2 CE and explained to the villagers the HSK NDA project.

19. Mr HO Hoi-fat, Speaker, Hung Shui Kiu New Development Joint Village Concern Group, said that as only non-indigenous villages would be cleared to make way for the project, it would be difficult for the Administration to dismiss the suspicion that there was discrimination against non-indigenous villages.

20. In response to Mr Abraham SHEK's enquiry on whether the planning for the proposed HSK NDA had adopted a people-oriented approach, SDEV stressed that the impact of the NDA project on the existing residents would be an important consideration as the Administration took forward the project. He clarified that the status of a village, whether it was an indigenous or non-indigenous one, was not the major critical factor to be taken into consideration in formulating the PODP.

21. Referring to the views of Hung Uk Tsuen Merchants Association that some local factories were not suitable for relocation to industrial buildings or industrial estates, Ms Emily LAU asked about the Administration's plan to assist the concerned operators. Dr KWOK Ka-ki sought details of the assistance that the Administration would render to the business operators whom the NDA project would affect.

22. Noting that under the PODP, a Logistics and Technology Quarter would be designated to accommodate logistics facilities, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan cast doubt on the scope for further development of the logistics industry in Hong Kong in the next 10 years, given the tough competition from the neighbouring cities. He was worried that the planned job opportunities in the logistics industry would not materialize. In view of the lack of job opportunities in Tin Shui Wai ("TSW") at present, he suggested that the Administration should introduce measures to facilitate the development of the logistics industry in TSW so as to provide jobs in the near future.

23. SDEV said that the Administration was mindful of the views and demand of the existing business operators in HSK and more details about the arrangements to address the impacts on the existing business operators would be worked out in the next stage of the Study. DD/Planning/Territorial supplemented that the present operation of port back-up/open storage services in HSK were land extensive and had caused environmental

problems and nuisances to the residents nearby. The plan for the proposed HSK NDA was to facilitate the development of high value-added industries to sustain the economic competitiveness of Hong Kong. The Administration noted the views that some land should be reserved for use as container yards. In HSK NDA, the proposed Logistics and Technology Quarter was located near Kong Sham Western Highway, which would provide direct connection through the transport corridor to the airport and the Mainland. The operation of logistics and technology industries there should cause only minimal impact on the residents in the NDA. As regards the proposal to develop logistics industry in TSW, she said that the impact of the operation of the logistics industry on the local environment and residents had to be considered carefully. To provide more jobs for TSW residents, the Administration would explore the enhancement of the connectivity between HSK NDA and TSW. Under the PODP, an area for commercial-cum-residential use would be developed near the West Rail TSW Station with a view to increasing job opportunities for TSW residents.

(The Chairman directed that the meeting be extended for 15 minutes.)

Compensation and rehousing arrangements

24. Dr Fernando CHEUNG was of the view that the planning for HSK NDA was designed in the context of the development of the Pearl River Delta region. Under the plan of the Administration, NT North and HSK would be developed to support the economic growth in Shenzhen. However, with the focus placed on economic benefits, the planning for HSK NDA had not adopted a people-oriented approach. During the planning process, the Administration had not given due regard to the impact of the development on the existing residents, farmers and business operators. The affected residents/farmers were very worried about their future as they had received no information about compensation, rehousing or relocation arrangements from the Administration. Noting that special compensation and rehousing packages for the residents and business operators to be affected by the Kwu Tung North and Fanling North NDAs development projects would be arranged, Dr CHEUNG and Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked if the Administration would do the same for the affected residents in HSK. They were concerned that many of them might not be eligible for rehousing to public rental housing units under the existing arrangement. Dr CHEUNG also asked whether village resite arrangements would be made for the villages to be cleared for the proposed HSK NDA project.

25. SDEV reiterated that the focus of Stage 2 CE was to collect views on the POPD for HSK NDA. The Administration would work out the details on compensation, rehousing, and agricultural rehabilitation in the next stage of the Study. He considered it unfair to say that HSK NDA was developed purely to support the development of the Pearl River Delta region and the integration of Hong Kong and Shenzhen. He stressed that, as laid down in the vision statement for the project, the favourable location of HSK NDA would enable development of the area in promoting economic activities including support to airport and port services, and in turn the logistics industry, which accounted for a significant share in Hong Kong's economy.

26. SDEV acknowledged that compensation and rehousing was an important issue in the implementation of the HSK NDA project. Given that the POPD might be revised with reference to public views collected during Stage 2 CE, it would be premature at this stage to set out the details of the compensation and rehousing arrangements. Taking into account that the villages to be affected had not yet been finalized, discussing these issues with the villagers at this stage might also arouse unnecessary worries. In finalizing the development plan for the NDA, the Administration would ensure that the impact on the existing residents and business operators would be minimized and more details on compensation and rehousing arrangements would be worked out in the next stage of the Study.

27. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan was dissatisfied that the Administration had turned a blind eye to the concerns of the affected residents and business operators in HSK. He did not agree that providing details on the compensation and rehousing arrangements would arouse unnecessary worries. The affected residents and farmers were concerned that they would not be compensated and rehoused fairly. He asked if SDEV would visit the affected villagers to listen to their views. In reply, SDEV said that he had visited HSK as well as Yuen Long South.

28. Mr Tony CHAN Tung-ngok, Co-opted Councillor, Heung Yee Kuk New Territories, said that a new mechanism for the handling of resumption of land from non-indigenous villagers had been adopted for the clearance of Choi Yuen Village in 2010. Heung Yee Kuk New Territories had provided assistance to the genuine farmers affected to continue their farming practices. He suggested that consideration might be given to making reference to the case of Choi Yuen Village on future resumption of farmland.

Agricultural rehabilitation

29. Ms Emily LAU, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan and Dr KWOK Ka-ki sought details of the Administration's measures to assist the existing farmers in HSK who wished to continue their farming practices. They cautioned the Administration that, for the implementation of both the HSK NDA and the NENT NDAs projects, agricultural rehabilitation was a contentious issue which had to be dealt with seriously. Dr KWOK asked if the Development Bureau ("DEVB") and the Food and Health Bureau ("FHB") had coordinated with each other on the policy to support the development of local agricultural industry.

30. SDEV said that under the existing agricultural rehabilitation policy, which was under the purview of FHB, the Administration would offer assistance to affected farmers by matching them with landowners who were willing to sell/rent their farmland. The Administration was mindful that the existing policy was inadequate for addressing the demand of affected farmers. DEVB was working with FHB on new measures to facilitate agricultural rehabilitation.

31. Ms Emily LAU invited the deputations to express views on the Administration's policy on agricultural rehabilitation. Mr NG Hei-man, Assistant Campaign Manager, the Conservancy Association, asked the Administration whether DEVB and FHB were working on special agricultural rehabilitation arrangements for HSK NDA or a general policy applicable to all farmers affected by land development projects. He opined that, to facilitate the discussion of the general public and LegCo Members on agricultural rehabilitation, the Administration should provide information about the number of farmers affected by the HSK NDA project and the amount of active and abandoned farmlands in the area covered by the project.

32. SDEV confirmed that DEVB and FHB were working on the enhancement of agricultural rehabilitation arrangements from a policy perspective.

(To allow more time for discussion, members agreed to further extend the meeting for 15 minutes.)

Transport and accessibility

33. Mr Albert CHAN said that in the past, the Administration had disregarded the interests of residents in the process of developing new towns in NT West, such as Tuen Mun and Tin Shui Wai, by failing to provide adequate transport and other infrastructure/community facilities. He cautioned the Administration that such planning blunder should not be repeated in the proposed HSK NDA. Pointing out that in the urban areas, one mass transit railway station was provided for a population cluster size of 50 000 to 80 000, he queried why only one railway station would be provided in HSK NDA, where the population size would be over 200 000. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan expressed concern about the capacity of the West Rail to cope with the new population in HSK NDA and other housing development projects in Yuen Long.

34. Mr HO Hoi-fat, Speaker, Hung Shui Kiu New Development Joint Village Concern Group, said that according to his estimation, out of the new population of 175 000 in the proposed HSK NDA, over 80 000 people would have to travel out of the NDA for work every day and the existing capacity of the West Rail would not be able to accommodate the increased passenger flow during peak hours.

35. Dr Kenneth TANG Siu-sing, Representative of the Hong Kong Institute of Planners, said that the future residents of HSK NDA would have relatively easy access to three stations of the West Rail, namely, the existing Tin Shui Wai Station, Siu Hong Station and the proposed HSK Station. According to the Administration's consultation document, around 45% of the residents in the future HSK NDA would live within 500 metres of a railway station or a transport hub. He suggested that, if more railway stations were needed but could not be accommodated in the NDA, a convenient feeder bus service should be provided for the residents.

36. Acting Chief Engineer/Project 1 (New Territories North and West), Civil Engineering and Development Department ("ACE/Project 1(NTNW)/CEDD") advised that the Highways Department ("HyD") had commissioned a consultancy study on the review and update of the Railway Development Strategy 2000 in March 2011 with a view to meeting the transport needs of Hong Kong in the coming years. The study also covered the transport needs arising from the proposed development of HSK NDA. It was expected that the results of the study would be published in early 2014. According to the information provided by the MTR Corporation Limited, during peak hours, the West Rail now served some 50 000 passengers per

direction per hour. Subject to enhancements to the signaling system for increasing the service frequency and with the launch of the 8-car system, the West Rail could handle up to 75 000 passengers per direction per hour at peak hours. As regards the timing for the construction and commissioning of the West Rail HSK Station, ACE/Project 1(NTNW)/CEDD advised that it would be subject to the progress of the HSK NDA project. Subject to the implementation mechanism and programme of HSK NDA, it was scheduled that the station would be commissioned in the early stage of the HSK NDA development, if at all possible, before the first intake of population in the NDA. As regards the feeder service to the proposed stations, the Administration had made provision in the road network within the NDA for the operation of an environmentally-friendly transport system. The Administration would take into account the views collected in Stage 2 CE in taking forward the planning of transport facilities in the NDA. DD/Planning/Territorial added that improvements would be made to the north-south accessibility within the NDA so that more jobs provided locally would be taken up by the local residents and the need for cross-district transport would be minimized.

37. The Chairman asked if the Administration had considered developing a new mass transit system connecting Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan. In reply, ACE/Project 1(NTNW)/CEDD said that he would convey the suggestion to the Transport and Housing Bureau and HyD.

Community facilities to be provided in the proposed Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area

38. In the light of the complaints against the nuisances caused by residents' performances in the Tin Shui Wai Park, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan urged the Administration to consider suitable provision of open space and performing venues for the future residents in HSK NDA. She also suggested that markets selling affordable food to the residents should be provided.

Concluding remarks

39. SDEV assured members that the Administration would consider the views received at the meeting and study whether adjustments to the layout of HKS NDA could be made to address the concerns of members and deputations.

40. In concluding the meeting, the Chairman thanked the deputations for expressing various views and concerns on the PODP for HSK NDA. He

asked the Administration to take the views of the deputations into consideration when working out the way forward for the proposal.

II Any other business

41. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 11:55 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
19 February 2014

Panel on Development

Special meeting on Saturday, 16 November 2013 at 9:00 am
Meeting to receive views on the Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area Planning and Engineering Study
Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
1.	Green Sense	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)321/13-14(01)).
2.	Hung Shui Kiu New Development Joint Village Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(01)).
3.	推動天水圍經濟大聯盟	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tin Shui Wai residents welcomed the proposal to develop HSK NDA. It was believed that the development would bring more job opportunities for those in Tin Shui Wai who had been suffering from insufficient employment opportunities in the district. However, the planning population of the proposed HSK NDA should be reduced. Otherwise, the community facilities and employment opportunities in the NDA might not be sufficient to cater for the demand of the large population. It would be undesirable for shops to be provided only in public housing estates. Street shops should be planned for creating more business opportunities and building a better social network for the residents.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• To facilitate residents in Tin Shui Wai to go to work in the commercial areas in the south of the NDA, good connectivity between Tin Shui Wai/ the northern part of the NDA and the southern part of the NDA should be planned.
4.	Lok Ma Chau China - Hong Kong Freight Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The HSK NDA project would have a great impact on the logistics and freight industries as the area in HSK for the operation of port back-up and open storage services would be reduced from 192 hectares to 62 hectares.• The proposal to relocate the logistics and freight industries in HSK to multi-storey buildings was not practical, as some facilities, such as container yards, could not be accommodated in an indoor environment. The HSK NDA project should not be proceeded at the expense of the livelihood of operators of the logistics and transport industries and their employees.• If operators of the logistics and transport industries in HSK were required to relocate to Government land, the short duration of the tenancy agreements and the open tender arrangement would affect the sustainable development of the industries. The Administration should ensure that appropriate arrangements for replacement sites and assistance would be provided to the operators.
5.	The Hong Kong Institute of Planners	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)321/13-14(02))

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
6.	Hung Uk Tsuen Merchants Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(03)).
7.	The Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(04)).
8.	The Conservancy Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(05)).
9.	元朗起動	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation supported in principle the development of the proposed HSK NDA to provide more housing land to improve the living conditions of Hong Kong people. The Administration should work out a reasonable public-private housing mix in the NDA as well as an appropriate geographical distribution of the residential buildings to ensure diversity. The "Hong Kong Property for Hong Kong People" policy should apply to private housing as far as practicable. A comprehensive planning for future housing development in Yuen Long, including HSK and Yuen Long South, was desirable, taking into account the interests and demand of different stakeholders. The Administration should provide more information on the breakdown of the planned 100 000 employment opportunities to ensure that there would be no mis-match between the new jobs and the local residents. Sufficient land should be provided for promoting local economy.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
10.	Tin Sum Sun Tsuen Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(07)).
11.	反對香港「被規劃」行動組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed HSK NDA was another instance of "selling out Hong Kong". Given its proximity to Qianhai, the NDA was to complement the development of Qianhai and facilitate the integration of China and Hong Kong. Several studies undertaken by the Administration had highlighted the role of HSK NDA in supporting the economic development of the western part of Shenzhen. With the plan to develop a special industry area, hotels and a mega shopping facility in HSK NDA, it was obvious that the NDA was not planned for Hong Kong people.
12.	Heung Yee Kuk New Territories	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The deputation supported in principle the HSK NDA project but the Administration had to address the concerns of the affected villagers and business operators. In-situ village resite, relocation assistance and allowances should be provided. Ex-gratia compensation for land resumption should adopt the rate for Zone A, similar to the arrangement for the NENT NDAs project. Issuance of land exchange entitlements to the affected landowners should also be considered. In addition to consulting the relevant District Councils, the Administration should listen to the views of the Ha Tsuen, Ping Shan and Tuen Mun Rural Committees.
13.	Mr CHAN Kin-cheung	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> He supported the development of the proposed HSK NDA as part of the

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		<p>development of NT West.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The provision of transport infrastructure facilities in NT West would remain insufficient if only one new railway station would be constructed to serve HSK NDA, which would have a population of more than 200 000. Consideration might be given to constructing a spur line of the West Rail to connect HSK with North Tin Shui Wai. The Northern Link and a railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan would enhance the connectivity of North West NT.• Sufficient employment opportunities should be provided for local residents in HSK NDA.
14.	Mr LEUNG Chi-ming	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• More employment opportunities should be provided in the proposed HSK NDA to avoid repeating the planning blunder in Tin Shui Wai. The town centre of the NDA could be developed into a hotel area instead of a shopping mall so as to minimize the nuisances caused to local residents.• The planning of HSK NDA could adopt more local characteristics. Green living should be promoted, say, with the provision of a cycle track.• The NDA should be planned according to professional guidelines. The Administration should not give an impression to the public that non-indigenous villages were treated unfairly in the process of developing HSK NDA. The Administration should consult and listen to the views of the affected non-indigenous villagers to address their concerns, including their requests for village resite.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
15.	Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none">The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)321/13-14(03)).
16.	馮玉玲女士	<ul style="list-style-type: none">As a Tin Shui Wai resident, she welcomed the implementation of the HSK NDA project, which was believed to increase job opportunities for Tin Shui Wai residents. There were insufficient employment opportunities and supporting facilities in Tin Shui Wai. As a result, residents of Tin Shui Wai suffered a lot.In Tin Shui Wai, there were only shopping malls but not street shops. Without activities on the streets, the area lacked vitality. Street shops should be provided in the proposed HSK NDA.
17.	Ms Vivian SHEK Wai-him	<ul style="list-style-type: none">In the proposed NENT NDAs and HSK NDA, people would have limited choices in life style, as the Administration would transplant the urban life style to the NDAs. Many non-indigenous villagers, who chose to live in HSK many years ago to enjoy the rural life style, would be forced to give up their way of living.The limited amount of land designated for agricultural use under the PODP could not address the demand of existing farmers to continue their farming activities. Moreover, such land was surrounded by buildings. The Administration should reserve more land in NT for agricultural use so that people could have an alternative way of living and provide safe and healthy food to the community.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
18.	關注綜援低收入聯盟	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Hong Kong had a low self-sufficiency rate, at less than 2%, in terms of food provision. A lot of people were on the waiting list for the Administration's arrangement for agricultural rehabilitation. Under the POPD, agricultural land in HSK would be reduced. Such planning had not taken into account the aspiration of the existing farmers for continuing their farming practices in HSK.• Local economy, such as operation of street shops and large bazaars, should be developed to generate more job/business opportunities for the residents.• The Administration should consult the affected non-indigenous villagers on the HSK NDA project, respond to their views and address their demand.
19.	土地正義聯盟	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The Administration should conduct a comprehensive consultation with the affected residents, farmers and business operators in HSK and strive to address their needs and demand.• There was no information from the Administration on the social costs arising from the implementation of the proposed HSK NDA project. In the consultation document, there was no reference to any social impact assessment on the project. Some tenants had already been evicted from HSK by landowners when the Administration was conducting studies on the NDA.• The large piece of farmland between Tin Sum Sun Tsuen and San Sang

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Major views and concerns
		<p>San Tsuen had high ecological value. It should not be cleared for developing housing but should be reserved for agricultural use. It was not appropriate to develop the farmland at the north of Shek Po Tsuen to a town park. Instead, it should be retained as farmland to provide job opportunities and increase the self-sufficiency rate of food provision.</p>
20.	Labour Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• With the development of a railway and residential sites, the HSK NDA project would benefit the parties with vested interests, such as the MTR Corporation Limited and private developers. The interests of the existing residents, farmers and business operators in HSK would be sacrificed as they would be forced to change their life styles or discontinue their business/work.• Situated beside the Kong Sham Western Highway, the proposed HSK NDA was planned to support the development of Qianhai in Shenzhen. The luxury apartments and shopping malls to be provided in the NDA were to serve the executives with high pay. All in all, the project would widen the gap between the rich and the poor.
21.	The Chartered Institute of Logistics & Transport in Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The deputation's views were detailed in its submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)270/13-14(09)).