

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)508/14-15
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/FE

Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene

Minutes of special meeting
held on Thursday, 25 September 2014, at 10:00 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan (Chairman)
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Members attending** : Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
- Members absent** : Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP

**Public Officers : Item I
attending**

Dr KO Wing-man, BBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

Mr Philip CHAN Kwan-ye, JP
Deputy Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Miss Vivian LAU Lee-kwan, JP
Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene

Dr Gloria TAM Lai-fan, JP
Controller, Centre for Food Safety
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Dr HO Yuk-yin, JP
Consultant (Community Medicine) (Risk Assessment
and Communication), Centre for Food Safety
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr Laurie LO Chi-hong, JP
Deputy Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene
(Environmental Hygiene)

Mr Howard CHAN Wai-kee, JP
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2)

Mrs Alison LAU CHAN Suk-chun
Assistant Director (Cross-Boundary and International)
Environmental Protection Department

Mr Edmond HO Ka-man
Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Territorial Control)
Environmental Protection Department

**Attendance : Item I
by invitation**

Consumer Council

Ms Gilly WONG
Chief Executive

Institution of Dining Art

Mr Kelvin YAU
First Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Catering Industry Association

Mr LEUNG Kui-tang
Member

Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants and Related
Trades Limited

Mr Ricky LAM Kwok-leung
Vice-chairman

Kam Fat Noodle Factory

Mr LAM Ka-chun
Representative

Hong Kong Biodiesel Association

Mr Steve CHOI
Chairman

ASB Biodiesel (Hong Kong) Limited

Mr Roberto Vazquez Lucerga
Chief Executive Officer

Champway Technology Limited

Mr Kenji WONG Yiu-kwong
Operation Director

Clerk in attendance : Ms Alice LEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

Staff in attendance : Mr Kelvin LEE
Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Mr Jove CHAN
Senior Council Secretary (2) 2

Mr Richard WONG
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Emma CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

Action

I. Sub-standard lard incident and food safety issues

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)2310/13-14(01), CB(2)2310/13-14(02), LS75/13-14, CB(2)2275/13-14(01), CB(2)2275/13-14(02), CB(2)2325/13-14(01) and Legislative Council Brief: File Ref: FHB/F/5/1/1]

At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Food and Health ("SFH"), Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene ("DFEH") and Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2) ("DDEP(2)") briefed members on the investigation and follow-up work of the Centre for Food Safety ("CFS") on the sub-standard lard incident in Taiwan, and the preliminary ideas on how to strengthen regulation of the safety of edible oil and the recycling of used cooking oil in Hong Kong, details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)2310/13-14(01)).

2. Members also noted the information note entitled "The incident of substandard lard" (LC Paper No. CB(2)2310/13-14(02)) prepared by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat.

3. The Chairman reminded the deputations attending the meeting that they were not covered by the protection and immunity provided under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) when addressing the Panel. At the invitation of the Chairman, eight deputations presented their views on the subject.

Deputations' views

Consumer Council

[LC Paper No. CB(2)2310/13-14(03)]

4. Ms Gilly WONG presented the views of the Consumer Council, as set out in its submission.

Action

Institution of Dining Art
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2310/13-14(04)]

5. Mr Kelvin YAU presented the views of the Institution of Dining Art, as set out in its submission.

Hong Kong Catering Industry Association
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2328/13-14(01)]

6. Mr LEUNG Kui-tang presented the views of the Hong Kong Catering Industry Association, as set out in its submission.

Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants and Related Trades Limited
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2310/13-14(05)]

7. Mr Ricky LAM Kwok-leung presented the views of the Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants and Related Trades Limited, as set out in its submission.

Hong Kong Biodiesel Association
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2332/13-14(01)]

8. Mr Steve CHOI presented the views of the Hong Kong Biodiesel Association, as set out in its submission.

ASB Biodiesel (Hong Kong) Limited
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2332/13-14(02)]

9. Mr Roberto Vazquez Lucerga presented the views of the ASB Biodiesel (Hong Kong) Limited, as set out in its submission.

Champway Technology Limited
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2332/13-14(03)]

10. Mr Kenji WONG Yiu-kwong presented the views of the Champway Technology Limited, as set out in its submission.

Kam Fat Noodle Factory

11. Mr LAM Ka-chun presented the views of the Kam Fat Noodle Factory that it was inappropriate for CFS to publicize the list of food traders who might have distributed or used lard/lard products manufactured by Chang Guann Co. Ltd. ("Chang Guann") on or after 1 March 2014 ("the list") without providing further details to members of the public. In his view,

Action

subsequent to the publication of the list on 14 September 2014, CFS should follow up immediately with the food traders concerned and provide updated information to members of the public on whether these traders still had stock of relevant products, so as to restore consumers' confidence in dining out.

12. Members noted the written submission from the Association of Restaurant Managers (LC Paper No. CB(2)2328/13-14(01)).

Administration's response to deputations' views

13. At the invitation of the Chairman, SFH gave a consolidated response to the views and concerns raised by the deputations as follows -

- (a) as regards the follow-up actions for strengthening the regulation and monitoring of the recycling of local used cooking oil, the Administration was considering to require, through the licensing conditions for restaurant and food factory licence of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD"), all used cooking oil be handed over to collectors or recyclers recognized by the Environmental Protection Department ("EPD") and all records to be properly kept to prevent at source the used cooking oil from re-entering the food chain. The Environment Bureau ("ENB") would in parallel consider legislative amendments to strengthen the regulatory efforts;
- (b) the aim of publicizing the list on 14 September 2014 was to protect consumers' right to know and to ensure that the recall of specified products would be conducted in a timely and systematic manner under the Food Safety Order. The Administration had made it clear to members of the public on various occasions that - (i) the list represented customer information provided by importers and major distributors of lard/lard products manufactured by Chang Guann on or after 1 March 2014; and (ii) at the time of publication of the list, companies on the list might have no stock of relevant products, or had returned them to suppliers, or had removed them from the shelves, or had stopped using such products over a period of time. The Administration would consider working with the food trade to restore consumers' confidence in restaurants and food factories in Hong Kong;
- (c) the Administration had also emphasized to members of the public that during stage one of the investigation and before the announcement of the list, the Administration had, for prudence

Action

sake, appealed to the trade to stop selling and using all brands of lard/lard products manufactured by Chang Guann, and had marked and sealed such products; and

- (d) the Administration would review the relevant legislation relating to food safety and had suggested to require by legislation that "used cooking oil" or "sub-standard oil" not intended for human consumption must not be used as ingredient for the production of edible oil. The proposed legal standard for edible oil would be made with reference to relevant international standards as well as in consultation with experts' views.

Discussion

Follow-up by the Administration on the sub-standard lard incident

14. Members expressed grave concerns about the follow up actions taken by the Administration in response to the incident of sub-standard lard/lard products. Mr Vincent FANG and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen criticized that the Administration had merely relied on the information provided by the Taiwan authorities and the Administration's reaction was passive in the incident. The information announced by the Administration in particular the publication of the list was confusing and restaurants as well as food factories had eventually become the victims of the incident. They commented that the Administration should act more proactively by regularly updating the public on the development of the sub-standard lard incident.

15. Mr Tommy CHEUNG expressed great dissatisfaction about the Administration's failure to communicate adequately with the trade and members of the public. After the publicizing of the list of known lard/lard products from Chang Guann involved in the incident, the Administration had not updated the public as to whether the lard/lard products held by the food traders on the list had been recalled, or were no longer supplied to customers. He opined that this had caused panic to members of the public. Expressing similar view, Dr Elizabeth QUAT considered that the Administration should take into account the impact on the food trade in handling similar food incidents in future. The Deputy Chairman also urged the Administration to enhance its communications with operators of food premises and food traders.

16. SFH said that he understood that members of the public might feel confused with various information announced at different stages of the incident. He explained that CFS had to verify the affected consignments of the problem lard/lard products with the Taiwan authorities before a food recall order could be made by DFEH. When the Administration sought

Action

clarification from the Taiwan authorities, the Administration had been initially informed that only two products manufactured by Chang Guann were affected. The Taiwan authorities subsequently listed another 24 lard/lard products manufactured by Chang Guann as suspected contaminated products. Six Hong Kong importers had imported the contaminated products which were manufactured by Chang Guann on or after 1 March 2014. He reiterated that to protect the consumers' right to know and to ensure the recall of specified products would be conducted in a timely and systematic manner under the Food Safety Order, CFS immediately released a list of traders who might have distributed or used lard/lard products manufactured by Chang Guann on or after 1 March 2014. SFH stressed that the Administration would endeavour to enhance the communication with the trade so as to provide the updated information on the problem lard/lard products to members of the public and the trade in a more effective manner.

17. Mr Tommy CHEUNG expressed concern that the Administration had failed to inform food traders and members of the public of the risk of consuming food products made with the problem lard/lard products. Mr Vincent FANG pointed out that the Taiwan authorities had conducted testing on Chang Guann's lard/lard products and found that they were not dangerous or prejudicial to health. In his view, the Administration should make public such information.

18. SFH responded that CFS had conducted testing on the lard/lard products which were of higher-risk and might be contaminated and the testing results showed that they did not pose high food safety risk to the public. However, consumers were also concerned about the hygienic quality of food and would not consume food with ingredients made with used/contaminated cooking oil even it did not pose any food safety risk.

19. Mr Tommy CHEUNG commented that some cooking oil importers had fraudulently informed food traders that their lard products were not imported from Chang Guann. Food traders affected had sold food products made with the problem lard/lard products without any knowledge on their part. The Deputy Chairman and Dr Priscilla LEUNG echoed Mr CHEUNG's view, saying that restaurants which had purchased the problem lard/lard products were victims of the incident. They urged the Administration to help revive the confidence of members of the public in dining out and consuming food manufactured by local food factories.

20. Mr Tommy CHEUNG said that the Administration should help restore the confidence of members of the public in patronizing restaurants by advising that the problem lard/lard products were no longer supplied in the market. While lard/lard products were used as ingredients for making certain bakery products, they were not commonly used for cooking.

Action

21. Dr Elizabeth QUAT said that the recent food incidents had caused great impact on the consumers' confidence in dining out and thus affected the business of food premises. She was concerned that as there was no specific time limit for the submission of information by food traders when they were requested under the Food Safety Ordinance (Cap. 612), the existing food tracing mechanism could not identify the source of problem food efficiently. Expressing similar view that members of the public did not have confidence in the Administration's mechanism for tracing the source of problem food, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen urged the Administration to make efforts to revive the confidence of the public in the food trade.

22. Pointing out that the Council and the Panel had passed motions urging the Administration to step up the regulation of edible oil after the incident of sub-standard cooking oil occurred in 2012, Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Mr Paul TSE expressed dissatisfaction on the slow progress of the Administration on the regulation of the food safety of edible oil. Mr James TO and Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed similar views and criticized that the occurrence of the sub-standard lard incident was caused by the Administration's failure to follow up on the call to enhance the food surveillance of edible oil after the incident of sub-standard cooking oil.

23. SFH responded that the Administration was determined to step up the regulation of the safety standards of and the ingredients used for manufacturing edible oil through administrative measures in the short-term and legislation in the long-term. The Administration proposed to enhance the import and export control of edible oil. Among other measures, edible oil importers would be required to provide an official certificate issued by the place of origin or an independent testing institution recognized by the government of the place of origin for food safety of edible oil for inspection by FEHD. It would also enhance the monitoring of the recycling of used cooking oil to avoid it from being used as ingredient and re-entering the supply chain of edible oil. He said that the Administration's proposals were comprehensive to safeguard the food safety of edible oil and the Administration hoped that this could help revive customers' confidence in restaurants and food factories.

24. The Chairman, the Deputy Chairman and Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed similar concerns about the effectiveness of the Administration's proposal to require cooking oil importers to provide an official certificate issued by the place of origin or a certificate issued by an independent testing institution recognized by the government of the place of origin for inspection by FEHD. They were worried that unscrupulous traders might produce fraudulent certificates for inspection. The Deputy Chairman was concerned that as time was required for the Administration to liaise with the relevant authorities in

Action

the exporting countries on the certificate requirements, the legislative process for the regulation of the import of edible oil might take a long time. He was worried that this might have impact on the supply and prices of edible oil products.

25. At the invitation of the Chairman, Ms Gilly WONG gave views on the proposal of provision of official certificate. She suggested the Administration to consider establishing a verification mechanism to ensure the validity of the official certificates provided by food traders.

26. SFH stressed that the Administration would make its best efforts in liaising with exporting countries of edible oil on the proposed requirement for the provision of official certificates. After the implementation of such requirement, verification would be conducted to ensure the authenticity of certificates. He hoped that the mechanism devised to implement the requirement of the provision of official certificates by cooking oil importers would, on the one hand, effectively regulate the quality of imported cooking oil products, and, on the other hand, only bring minimal impact on the supply and prices of such products.

27. Mr WONG Kwok-hing suggested that before the enactment of the proposed legislation, the Administration could consider collaborating with the trade to issue a label, as a symbol of quality assurance, to restaurants which used safe cooking oil with a view to enhancing the confidence of members of the public in local food premises. In response, SFH said that to make the suggested label credible, the Administration would need to verify the procurement process of each restaurant and food trader. Given the substantial number of restaurants and food traders involved, it might not be feasible or practical to take forward the suggestion. SFH stressed that before the proposed legislation came into operation, the Administration would implement an administrative measure to require, through the licensing conditions for restaurants and food factories, all used cooking oil to be handed over to collectors or recyclers recognized by EPD and all records to be properly kept to prevent at source the used cooking oil from re-entering the food chain.

28. While expressing support for the Administration's initiative, the Chairman hoped that the Administration would provide the timetable for implementing the proposed administrative measures and legislation. Ms Cyd HO was concerned about the manpower needed for the implementation of the proposed administrative measures. She hoped that sufficient resources would be allocated to CFS for implementing these measures.

Action

29. In response to the Deputy Chairman's enquiry, SFH said that the Department of Justice would be consulted to confirm whether the subsidiary legislation would be introduced to LegCo for scrutiny under the negative vetting procedure.

Regulation of the recycling of used cooking oil

30. Dr Priscilla LEUNG noted that lard products for use in animal feed had been exported from Hong Kong to Taiwan, and had subsequently been imported into Hong Kong as raw ingredients of food for human consumption. She expressed concern about the import and export control of cooking oil.

31. Dr KWOK Ka-ki criticized that the Customs and Excise Department ("C&ED") and FEHD had not maintained the statistics of the trading of used cooking oil exported to Taiwan. He expressed worries that the used cooking oil was being processed and re-sold as edible oil in Hong Kong market.

32. Expressing concern that there was a substantial amount of used cooking oil being imported into Hong Kong, the Chairman, Mr WU Chi-wai and Mr James TO were worried that a large amount of it had been used by food premises and food factories. They sought information on the import/export trading figures of used cooking oil, and how the used cooking oil was used after it was imported into Hong Kong. In their view, the Administration should consider measures to prevent the exported used cooking oil from re-entering Hong Kong as edible oil products. Mr Vincent FANG held the view that the Administration should stipulate in the legislation that imported used cooking oil should only be used for the manufacturing of bio-diesel.

33. Pointing out that C&ED had maintained the information on import and export of edible oil, Ms Cyd HO said that C&ED should make available such information to CFS so as to facilitate CFS's work on regulating of the food safety of edible oil.

34. SFH stressed that the Administration attached importance to the usage of the imported used cooking oil as manufacturers of edible oil should obtain a valid licence and should not use improper ingredients, such as used cooking oil, to produce edible oil. At present, there were nine licensed edible oil manufacturers in Hong Kong. The Administration was verifying the import and export figures of used cooking oil with the manufacturers and food traders concerned, and would carry out follow-up investigation on the discrepancies identified. He agreed that the Administration would provide (a) the respective statistics on the quantities of used cooking oil imported to, re-exported and exported from Hong Kong in the past three years; and (b) the

Action

result of the Administration's inter-departmental investigation into the use of used cooking oil (particularly whether/how much used cooking oil had re-entered the food chain) once available.

35. Mr WU Chi-wai asked whether it was feasible for the Administration to request food premises to provide information on the amount of used cooking oil disposed of and the whereabouts of it. DFEH advised that EPD and FEHD would work together to strengthen the regulation and monitoring of the recycling of local used cooking oil. Consideration would be given to requiring, through the licensing conditions for restaurant and food factory licence of the FEHD, all used cooking oil to be handed over to collectors or recyclers recognized by EPD and all records to be properly kept to prevent at source the used cooking oil from re-entering the food chain. ENB would in parallel consider legislative amendments to strengthen the regulatory efforts. SFH assured members that the Administration would step up the regulation of the food safety of edible oil, including the legislation to prohibit the use of used cooking oil for manufacturing edible oil products. The Administration would consider setting a higher level of penalty for breaches to achieve a higher deterrent effect.

36. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen asked whether the Administration would consider the suggestion raised by the Biodiesel Association to temporarily suspend the export of used cooking oil, and encourage the food premises to report any suspicious collection of used cooking oil. Ms Cyd HO enquired about the regulation of the recycling of used cooking oil through a registration system.

37. SFH and DDEP(2) reiterated that the Administration would consider legislative amendments to regulate the collection and handling of used cooking oil. However, it would take time to complete such legislative amendment exercise. Before the enactment of the legislation, EPD and FEHD would collaborate to implement an administrative measure to require, through the licensing conditions for restaurants and food factories, all used cooking oil to be handed over to collectors or recyclers recognized by EPD.

38. Expressing support to the Administration's proposals to step up the regulation of the recycling of used cooking oil, Dr Elizabeth QUAT suggested the Administration to consider applying information technology to facilitate the source tracing of problem food by requiring food traders to keep their transaction records by electronic means. SFH responded that at the initial stage, food traders could keep their transaction records in paper format as small and medium size food traders might have difficulties in applying information technology to their businesses.

Action

39. With a view to implementing regulation of the import of used cooking oil more expeditiously, Mr Paul TSE suggested the Administration to include used cooking oil in the Sixth or Seventh Schedule to the Waste Disposal Ordinance (Cap. 354) ("the Ordinance") so as to require importers under section 20A of the Ordinance to acquire a permit issued by the waste disposal authority for the import of used cooking oil into Hong Kong.

40. SFH and DDEP(2) reiterated that the Administration proposed to regulate the disposal of used cooking oil by legislation, and before its enactment, administrative measures would be implemented in the short-term for such purpose. The Administration would consider any possible means which could implement the regulation of proper disposal of used cooking oil expeditiously.

Quality of cooking oil

41. The Chairman, the Deputy Chairman, Mr Vincent FANG and Ms Cyd HO expressed similar concern about the definition of used cooking oil. They enquired whether the Administration would specify the standard (such as the number of times) for the used cooking oil that it could be re-used for cooking before it was required to be disposed of.

42. SFH and Controller, CFS advised that it was not practicable to specify a unique standard for the repeated use of cooking oil as it would vary with the different cooking temperatures and different kinds of food, etc. SFH stressed that the Administration aimed to monitor the recycling of used cooking oil to ensure that it would not be used for manufacturing of cooking oil after it was disposed of by restaurants and collected by recycling trade operators.

43. In response to the Chairman's enquiry about the testing on the quality of cooking oil, Controller, CFS advised that -

- (a) around 200 samples of cooking oil had been taken for testing in 2012, the content of Benzo[a]pyrene ("BaP") in three samples which were collected from cooking oil relating to the incident of sub-standard cooking oil imported from the Mainland, were found exceeding the Mainland limit of BaP level of 10 mcg/kg;
- (b) around 400 samples of cooking oil had been tested in 2013 and none of them had exceeded the maximum limit for BaP;
- (c) in the light of the sub-standard lard incident, CFS would increase the number of cooking oil samples for testing by 20% in 2015; and

Action

- (d) Food legislation in Hong Kong had not specified any safety standard for cooking oil and the Codex Alimentarius Commission had not made any specific recommendations on the safety standard for cooking oil. CFS had consulted overseas food safety authorities and noted that it was not a common practice to regulate the food safety of cooking oil by legislation.

(Members agreed to extend the meeting by 15 minutes.)

44. Dr KWOK Ka-ki held the view that the Administration should follow the European Union to adopt a more stringent standard of 2mcg/kg for the existence of BaP in food. The Chairman and Ms Cyd HO subscribed to the suggestion of the Consumer Council that in addition to the level of BaP, testing on peroxide value and the level of fatty acids could be conducted to inspect the quality of cooking oil and check whether used cooking oil had been mixed with cooking oil.

45. Controller, CFS advised that cooking oil samples were tested by CFS for different chemicals to assess their food safety (e.g. testing on BaP and aflatoxins, etc.) and their quality (e.g. testing on peroxide value and erucic acid).

46. In response to Ms Cyd HO's enquiry about the deputations' views about the definition of "used cooking oil", representatives of deputations including Mr Kelvin YAU, Mr Ricky LAM and Mr LAM Ka-chun made the following points -

- (a) the number of times that cooking oil could be repeatedly used for cooking and deep frying depended on a number of factors including the temperature in heating oil, food ingredients and cooking methods; and
- (b) there were reference standards for the maximum time and the ideal temperature for cooking different food ingredients with different types of cooking oil to achieve the desired cooking quality.

47. Mr Paul TSE said that as there were a lot of undesirable cooking practices in Hong Kong dining culture, it would take time for enhancing the health concern of the Hong Kong people through public education and promotion.

Action

II. Any other business

48. The Chairman enquired the Administration about whether there was any progress regarding the Panel's proposed duty visit to Guangdong Province to enable members to have a better understanding of the regulation and operation of registered farms which supplied food such as live poultry, fish and vegetable to Hong Kong. SFH responded that the reply from the relevant Mainland authorities was pending.

49. The Chairman said that according to the press release of CFS on 24 September 2014, a white string pod sample taken from a vegetable stall in Kennedy Town was found to contain residues of carbofuran and chlorpyrifos at levels of 14 and three times exceeding the legal limits respectively, and a green string pod sample taken from a vegetable stall in Yau Ma Tei was found to contain residues of carbofuran at a level of 44 times exceeding the legal limit. She enquired whether CFS had traced the sources of the problem vegetables and prohibited the import of vegetables from the registered vegetable farms concerned. SFH said that the origins of the problem vegetables had yet to be identified and CFS would continue to monitor the situation.

Admin

50. The Chairman requested the Administration to provide further information, after the meeting, including -

- (a) the progress made by the Administration in tracing the source of origin of the problem vegetables; and
- (b) whether follow-up actions had been taken/would be taken against the source farm(s) supplying problem vegetables to Hong Kong; if so, the details (including whether the list of the source farm(s) supplying problem vegetables to Hong Kong had been/would be publicized).

51. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:42 pm.