

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)77/14-15
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/TP/1

Panel on Transport

**Minutes of meeting held on
Tuesday, 25 March 2014 , at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Member absent : Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item III**

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Judy CHUNG Sui-kei
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)5

Mrs Joanna KWOK TAM Yuk-ying
Deputy Director of Highways

Mr Albert LIU
Assistant Director/Development
Highways Department

Mr NG Kwok-kwan
Chief Engineer/Lighting
Highways Department

Agenda item IV

Mr YAU Shing-mu
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Ivy LAW
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)3

Miss Cinderella LAW
Deputy Commissioner for Transport /Transport
Services and Management

Mr CHEUNG Jin-pang
Assistant Commissioner for
Transport/Administration and Licensing

Mr Patrick WONG
Chief Transport Officer/Driving Services
Transport Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

I Information papers issued since the last meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1007/13-14(01) - Letter from Hon WONG Kwok-hing on road safety problem of using electric wheelchair

LC Paper No. CB(1)1036/13-14(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon TANG Ka-piu on the study of establishing a fuel surcharge mechanism for taxis

LC Paper No. CB(1)1037/13-14(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai on Transport Department's monitoring of franchised bus companies in respect of bus trip frequency

LC Papers Nos. - Administration's response to the letters from Hon CB(1)1038/13-14(01) and (02) WU Chi-wai and Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai on the operation of public light buses

LC Paper No. CB(1)1054/13-14(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon CHAN Han-pan on

- Cheung Chau's ferry services provided by the First Ferry
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1069/13-14(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT requesting to discuss the problem of the shortage of parking spaces for school buses and nanny vans
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1114/13-14(01) - Letter from Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai on nanny van services and student service vehicle safety
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1143/13-14(01) - Letter from Hon CHAN Han-pan on improvement of ferry services for Cheung Chau)

Members noted the above papers issued since the last meeting.

II Items for discussion at the next meeting on 11 April 2014

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1101/13-14(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion
LC Paper No. CB(1)1101/13-14(02) - List of follow-up actions)

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting to be held on 11 April 2014 –

- (a) Road improvement works in West Kowloon Reclamation Development (Phase 1); and
- (b) Fare increase application from The Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited.

3. Mr TANG Ka-piu expressed concern over the fare adjustments of the six major outlying island ferry routes notwithstanding the Government's allocation of \$191 million for provision of special helping measures for them in the next three-year licence period from mid-2014 to mid-2017. As such, he requested to discuss also the matter at the next regular meeting.

4. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan recalled that at the Panel meeting in November 2012, the bus companies had pledged to provide rest time as appropriate for bus drivers. He requested the Administration to update the Panel the progress on the implementation of the above-said rest time and other safety measures. Mr Albert CHAN also requested for information on the provision of rest place and toilet facilities for drivers at bus terminals.

5. After discussion, members agreed to add an agenda item at the next regular meeting to discuss "Outlying island ferry services and fare adjustments". The matter on "Occupational safety for bus drivers" would be discussed by the Panel at a future meeting.

III Public lighting in Hong Kong

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1101/13-14(03) - Administration's paper on public lighting in Hong Kong

LC Paper No. CB(1)1101/13-14(04) - Paper on public lighting in Hong Kong prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief)

6. Under Secretary for Transport and Housing ("USTH") briefed members on the Administration's paper which introduced the public lighting system in Hong Kong, including the design standards, operation, maintenance, beautification and energy saving measures. Assistant Director/Development ("AD/D") of Highways Department ("HyD") then made a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(1)1170/13-14(01)) for further illustration.

Lighting for public facilities

7. Mr WONG Kwok-hing said that some members of the public and the transport trade had reflected that the illumination at quite a number of public transport interchanges ("PTIs"), in particular the Lam Tin Station PTI, was insufficient. He requested the Administration to follow up the matter.

8. Mr TANG Ka-piu reflected that street lights were however too bright at some residential areas, new development areas and harbour-front promenade. He considered that the Administration should assess the need of different illumination levels in different areas.

9. USTH and Deputy Director of Highways ("DDHy") said that the design of the public lighting system in Hong Kong was based on the Public Lighting Design Manual ("Manual") published by HyD, with the illumination levels selected according to road classification (including function, traffic volume, traffic segregation), pedestrian volume and ambient brightness of the roads. The design standards stipulated in the Manual were developed according to the most commonly adopted international road lighting standard, which was widely adopted in various European and Asian countries. The recommended lighting levels and requirements were important to the safety of drivers and pedestrians.

10. Mr Albert CHAN believed that the road lights in Hong Kong were more and brighter than that of other advanced cities. In his view, the lighting levels in Hong Kong had exceeded the actual needs, causing light pollution and wasting electricity. He was particularly concerned over the excessive lighting installations at the pedestrian footbridges such as the one connecting Yat Tung Estate with the nearby petrol filling station, and requested the Administration to improve the situation. Declaring that he was a resident in the rural area, Mr CHAN reflected that the street lights were installed too close to the windows of village houses, causing light nuisance to villagers.

11. USTH responded that the Administration was concerned about the nuisance caused by light pollution and the energy consumption of lights. He said that the number of complaints about road light nuisance in Hong Kong was relatively low. There were only about ten-odd complaints received annually. HyD was replacing wall lights with column lights, or installing light shields on wall lights to avoid the diffusion of light from source to the walls of buildings to reduce the impact of wall lights on residential units. USTH added that the locations and designs of public lights in rural areas were usually sorted out with the assistance of the Home Affairs Department ("HAD"). HyD would liaise with HAD on how their design could be improved. He also undertook to follow up the concern about the excessive lighting installations at the pedestrian footbridges at Yat Tung Estate.

Admin

12. Mr WU Chi-wai expressed concern over the excessive illumination levels at carriageways, subways, footbridges and toll plazas like the Eastern Harbour Crossing ("EHC") Toll Plaza. He considered that the Administration should reduce the lamp luminosity and consider reducing one fluorescent light tube from each light fitting at subways and footbridges to save energy. He further said that drivers relied mainly on illumination of the head lamp of the vehicle rather than road lighting while driving.

13. USTH said that the Administration had conducted a site visit to the EHC Toll Plaza and found that two highmast lights were relatively closed to Yau Lai Estate. He said that the Transport Department ("TD") would liaise with the operator of EHC on possible improvement measures.

14. Regarding the illumination level of carriageways, Chief Engineer/Lighting ("CE/L") of HyD advised that the illumination of the head lamp of a vehicle was limited and could not allow the vehicle to stop with sufficient safety distance. As such, it was important to maintain the illumination of a carriageway to a certain level for road safety. He added that, given that HyD had included the maintenance factor in designing the light fittings for new footbridges and subways, the illumination level of newly installed lights might be higher than that required but would gradually dim down to the required level over time. HyD was installing dimmable electronic ballasts for these lamps as a measure to reduce the light output and energy consumption while they were relatively new.

Maintenance of public light system

15. Mr Christopher CHUNG noted that some road lights were turned on as early as 4 am but some were still off as late as 9 am. He asked about the controlling mechanism of the public lighting. He also enquired whether there was any system installed to monitor the road light conditions.

16. DDHy said that the switching on/off of road lighting was controlled by the photo-electric controllers ("PECs") installed in roadside public lighting control cubicles. When the photo-electric sensors detected a fall of the ambient lighting to below a specified level (that was, 55 lux), road lights were switched on automatically. On the contrary, when the ambient lighting was detected to be higher than 83 lux, road lights would be switched off automatically. The maintenance contractors would regularly check if PECs were functioning well. She added that there were occasions on which road lights were switched on during daytime for testing and repair.

17. CE/L supplemented that the Administration had carried out a trial scheme on the adoption of a remote control monitoring system for a total of 30 000 lights to enhance the efficiency of maintenance of public lighting. However, the study result had shown that the system could slightly improve public lighting maintenance response time but the improvements could not justify the costs of such a system. After thorough consideration, the Administration decided not to extend the scheme to the remaining lights. At the request of Mr Christopher CHUNG, CE/L agreed to provide information regarding the details and outcome of the study.

18. In reply to Mr POON Siu-ping and the Chairman's enquiries on the repair work of faulty lighting facilities, DDHy said that HyD had arranged maintenance contractors to conduct night patrol to check if the public lighting system was operating normally and to carry out corrective maintenance for timely repair of any faulty lighting facilities. She said that the required usability standard was set as 99.5%, which was higher than the international standard of 98%. HyD would monitor the performance of contractors to ensure the compliance of the usability standard.

19. The Chairman suggested that the Administration should consider providing a hotline number on the lamp pole to facilitate fault report by the public. AD/D replied that the public could dial the Government's hotline 1823 to report any faulty lighting facilities.

Energy saving measures of public lighting system

General views

20. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan noted from the powerpoint presentation that the number of road lighting lanterns had increased considerably from 2012 to 2013 compared to the past few years. He wondered why and whether the number of road lighting lanterns would be increasing in 2014. He also asked about the Administration's target in energy saving for lighting facilities.

21. USTH said that, although the number of road lighting lanterns had increased from 2012 to 2013, the electricity consumption was maintained at almost the same level. This revealed the Administration's efforts in pursuing energy saving.

22. DDHy supplemented that HyD had committed together with the Environmental Protection Department ("EPD") to reduce electricity consumption of 5 million kilowatt hours ("kWh") electricity per annum between 2009 and 2014. With the implementation of various energy saving measures, an annual electricity consumption of about 4 odd million kWh had been saved in the past few years. HyD would discuss with EPD on the new target from 2014 onwards and would continue to replace the existing road lights with high efficiency ones and install dimmable electronic ballasts for them.

23. The Deputy Chairman noted that if a good quality medium wattage Light Emitting Diode ("LED") light was used for replacing a high pressure sodium lamp, the electricity cost saving was about \$200 per annum. He

also noted that there were about 20 000 road lights operated with light bulbs of wattage higher than necessary. According to his rough calculation, if the Administration replaced all the 20 000 road lights operated with light bulbs with LED lights, a total of about 4 million kWh electricity would be saved and the emission of about 3.16 million kg carbon dioxide would be reduced per annum. In his view, LED lights were highly efficient in energy saving. He requested the Administration to compare the energy efficiency of LED lights and that of high pressure sodium lights.

24. USTH said that, apart from functions, energy saving and effectiveness to eliminate light pollution were also the major considerations of the Administration when adopting different types of road lights. He added that, at present, LED lights were not as efficient as high pressure sodium lights in terms of cost-effectiveness and energy saving. Notwithstanding that, HyD would continue to monitor the development of LED lights.

25. DDHy supplemented that LED lights were not cost-effective compared with high pressure sodium lights. She explained that the cost of a medium power LED light was about 10 times higher than that of a high pressure sodium light, but only about \$200 in electricity cost per annum could be saved. The other major reason for not widely adopting LED lights was the insufficient supply of certified LED road lights in Hong Kong.

Adoption of renewable energy for provision of public lighting

26. Pointing out that the use of solar energy had been put on trial in some overseas countries and the Mainland, Mr WONG Kwok-hing asked whether the Administration had any plan to use solar energy for provision of public lighting.

27. DDHy said that solar energy was not adopted for provision of conventional road lights due to its low reliability, which was dependent on the amount of daylight. She explained that the insufficient day light during spring, winter and rainy days would affect the amount of energy collected. In addition, restrictions on installation of solar photovoltaic panels at street lights and shading by many of the tall buildings in built-up areas were other constraints. Based on the above reasons, the Administration had no plan to adopt solar energy for street lights.

28. The Chairman suggested that solar-powered street lights might be considered to be installed at remote village areas for trial. The Administration noted the Chairman's suggestion.

29. Mr TANG Ka-piu, Mr Christopher CHUNG and Mr Frankie YICK expressed concern that residents in Po Toi Island had to purchase their own diesel to generate electricity to power up the public facilities, including piers and street lights. They opined that the Administration should consider developing renewable energy, such as solar energy, wind energy and tidal power, for the Island such that residents did not need to bear the electricity cost for public lighting. USTH said that the provision of lighting facilities on Po Toi Island might be under the purview of HAD. He undertook to consider how to follow up the views of members.

Admin

Installation of decorative lights

30. Mr POON Siu-ping noted that to tie in with streetscape enhancement works at tourist spots and on characteristic roads in districts, HyD had installed at those locations over 6 800 decorative lights of various styles to enhance the streetscape in the vicinity. He asked whether HyD had any new plan to install more decorative lights.

31. DDHy said that HyD would consider to install such decorative lights upon requests made by District Councils. HyD was planning to install more decorative lights in Tsuen Wan and Tung Chung in the near future.

32. Mr Tony TSE and the Deputy Chairman appreciated HyD's initiatives to install decorative lights at tourist spots and on characteristic roads in districts. The Deputy Chairman considered that more of such lights should be installed. Mr TSE asked whether the Administration would regularly review the design of road lights in Hong Kong and provide hooks on lamp posts to facilitate mounting of promotional banners and so on.

33. DDHy said that, given the considerable cost involved in providing decorative lights, HyD would only install decorative lights to meet the district needs and in tandem with streetscape enhancement works where appropriate. In addition, priority would be given to representative locations, such as Shing Mun River Promenade, adjacent areas of Tseung Kwan O Sports Ground and tourist spots. As for the provision of hooks for banners and plants, she said that, upon request, HyD would facilitate such display works on lamp posts in association with festivals and local events.

Concluding remarks and motion

34. The Chairman considered that the Administration should conduct a trial scheme to develop renewable energy on outlying islands or in rural areas. He requested the Administration to critically assess the light levels of subways and footbridges which were found to be too bright. As for carriageways, he considered the public lighting system appropriate and recognized that it was important to provide sufficient light for road safety. Pointing out that bollard lights were frequently damaged by vehicles, the Chairman requested the Administration to review the design of bollard lights to reduce their damage rate.

35. The Chairman said that Mr WONG Kwok-hing had submitted a motion which was tabled for members' reference. Members agreed to deal with the motion. Mr WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion, which was seconded by Mr TANG Ka-piu –

"促請政府研究公共照明應用再生能源的試驗計劃，並向本會和公眾交代。"

(Translation)

"That this Panel urges the Government to examine the implementation of a trial scheme on the use of renewable energy for public lighting, and to report to this Panel and the public."

36. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Six members voted for and no member voted against it. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

IV Private Driving Instructors' licences

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1101/13-14(05) - Administration's paper on Private Driving Instructors' licences

LC Paper No. CB(1)1101/13-14(06) - Paper on Private Driving Instructors' licences prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief)

LC Paper No. CB(1)908/13-14(01) - Submission from a member of the public

- LC Paper No. CB(1)1102/13-14(01) - Submission from 前駕駛學院導師團體
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1102/13-14(02) - Submission from driving instructors of Hong Kong School of Motoring
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1102/13-14(03) - Submission from 港九駕駛教師聯會
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1115/13-14(01) - 6 almost identical submissions from members of the public
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1115/13-14(02) - 7 almost identical submissions from members of the public
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1115/13-14(03) - 137 almost identical submissions from members of the public
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1115/13-14(04) - 7 almost identical submissions from members of the public
- LC Papers Nos. CB(1)1115/13-14(05), (06), (07), (08), (09), (10), (11), (12), (13), (14), (15), (16), (17), (18), (19), (20), (21), (22), (23), (24), (25), (26), (27), (28), (29) and (30) - Submissions from members of the public
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1108/13-14(01) - Administration's supplementary information on Private Driving Instructors' licences)

37. Upon invitation, USTH briefed members on the outcome of the consultation with the driving instructor trade regarding the review on the issuing mechanism of Private Driving Instructors' ("PDI") licences and the way forward. He said that in July 2013, TD had put forth nine options on the said issuing mechanism for discussion with the driving instructor trade, and had made it clear that while the Administration was open minded about all the options, any change to the status quo must require a clear and firm support of stakeholders. However, given that TD's extensive consultations with the trade yielded no consensus, it was considered prudent that the Administration should continue with the current mechanism to issue new PDI licences.

38. Dr Elizabeth QUAT considered that the Government's policy on driver training was quite unreasonable and out-dated and hence should be reviewed. She pointed out that there were grievances that the current issuing mechanism of restricted driving instructors ("RDI") licences was in favour of Hong Kong School of Motoring ("HKSM") and that RDIs were not allowed to provide driving instruction after leaving the designated driving schools ("DDSs"). There was also criticism that PDI of group 2 and group 3 could not provide driving instruction for group 1 vehicles. She opined that the problems could not be solved by adopting any of the nine options put forth by the Administration. Indeed, the Administration should review the legislation, having regard to the social needs, market situation and road safety. She indicated that she would move a motion urging the Government to adopt a phased approach and flexibly handle matters relating to the issuance of new licences for this year. She also urged the Government to comprehensively review and improve the existing driving training policy, including the grouping and number of driving instructor licences, and conditions imposed on RDIs, etc.

39. USTH said that the Administration, in view of the market demand, considered that it should timely issue new PDI licences in accordance with the results of the last biennial review. Regarding the suggestion of issuance in phases, Deputy Commissioner for Transport /Transport Services and Management said that the results of the biennial review as announced in July 2013 had already concluded that 287 PDI licences should be issued. If TD were not to issue new PDI licences accordingly, it would fall short of the public's expectation and might be subject to challenge.

40. Mr TANG Ka-piu considered the Administration's decision to maintain the current mechanism to issue new PDI licences acceptable. In view of the criticisms over the licensing mechanism of RDI and privileges accorded to HKSM in the processing of driving tests, he suggested that the Administration should consider regulating the wage level of RDIs and suspending the issuance of new RDI licences. Noting that the number of new PDI licences to be issued was far below the demand, Mr TANG Ka-piu opined that more new PDI licences should be issued. He also indicated that he would not support Dr QUAT's motion of issuing the new PDI licences in phases given the keen demand for new PDI licences.

41. Mr WONG Kwok-hing recalled that when the Panel discussed the matter on 19 July 2013, the majority of deputations attending the meeting were in favour of Option 1 (i.e., maintaining the status quo whereby both the existing issuing mechanism of new PDI licences and the benchmarks of the three groups remain unchanged). As such, he agreed to the

Administration's decision to follow the current mechanism to issue new PDI licences first and then continue its review on the issuing mechanism of PDI licences to allow flexibility of change in the future.

42. USTH reiterated that the Administration was open minded about whether to change the current issuing mechanism. As the matter would involve the stakes of various holders, any change must require a clear and firm support from the stakeholders. However, after TD did a nine-month extensive consultation period, stakeholders' views were still diverse. Given the keen demand for new PDI licences, it was considered prudent that the Administration should continue with the current mechanism to issue the licences. These new licences should be issued to the three groups based on the biennial review, which was started in 2012 and completed the year after; and the results of which were published at the Panel meeting on 19 July 2013, i.e. 212, 32 and 43 new PDI licences for Group 1, Group 2 and Group 3 respectively.

43. The Deputy Chairman expressed the Neo Democrats' disappointment with the Administration's decision of maintaining the status quo and not removing the "two-pronged approach" driver training policy as requested by RDIs. He stressed that the current mechanism was unfair to experienced RDIs who were badly remunerated. Considering that it would be difficult to arrive at a majority view he asked whether the Administration would consider consolidating the nine options to fewer options for further consultation.

44. USTH said that the nine options put forth by TD for consultation were practicable enough to facilitate discussion. He said that of the nine options, some of them were variations of the others.

45. Mr WU Chi-wai recognized that it would take time to amend the legislation before the new mechanism could be applied for issuance of new PDI licences. As an interim measure to improve the current situation of RDIs being unfairly remunerated, he considered that the Administration should consider freezing the granting of any new RDI licences for DDSs through Administrative measures.

46. USTH said that the idea of freezing any issuance of new RDI licences for DDSs should be carefully considered having regard to its impacts on the service performance, operation and financial viability of DDSs. For instance, learner drivers might have to bear with potential increase in fees and reduced choices of instructors. He added that since DDSs were allowed to apply for RDI licences under the law and TD was

required to consider such application having considered all the relevant factors, withholding the issuance of any new RDI licence might give rise to disputes and even judicial review. The matter had to be advised by the Department of Justice. He also drew members' attention to the fact that in the past ten odd years, the Administration had only issued a total of 31 new RDI licences.

47. Mr Frankie YICK considered that the Administration should clearly explain to the public the purpose of setting up DDSs. He noted that a majority of deputations attending the July 2013 Panel meeting was in support of maintaining the current mechanism; while some individuals expressed the views that they should not be deprived of the right to apply for PDI licences. He was aware that some people obtained the PDI licence not for livelihood but regarded it as an asset. He opined that the Administration should not be too conscious about the quantity of licences to be issued. He also considered that the Administration should keep the statistics on the number of in-service PDIs. During the present situation that no consensus was made, he considered that there was a need to issue new PDI licences now.

48. USTH explained that the Government had been adopting a two-pronged approach for driver training in view of the traffic conditions in Hong Kong. On the one hand, the Administration promoted off-street driver training through the establishment of DDS to reduce traffic congestion caused by on-street driver training. On the other hand, it maintained a sufficient supply of PDI for on-street driver training provided that such activities would neither aggravate traffic situation nor compromise road safety. In response to the views of renouncing the two-pronged approach, USTH said that if all RDIs were allowed to provide driving instructions on-street, it would load a burden on road traffic, therefore, the two-pronged approach should be kept.

49. Mr Albert CHAN considered that the current problem faced by the trade had been caused by the fact that the quantity of new PDI licences to be issued was governed by the law. However, he noted that this arrangement was not applied to all other professional trades. He indicated that he would move a motion urging the Government to open up the market of PDIs such that interested persons could apply for new PDI licences freely. He considered that the Administration should take the lead to propose changes in the public's interest and should not allow the trade to discuss and reach a consensus amongst themselves.

50. USTH responded that the Administration had all along acted in the public interest. Firstly, the two-pronged approach was adopted in view of

the traffic situation in Hong Kong. Secondly, the current mechanism by means of drawing lots provided a fair opportunity for any qualified person, either a member of the public, of RDIs or other groups of driving instructors, to apply for a new PDI licence.

51. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung considered that the current mechanism of dealing with applications of PDI licences by drawing lots should be well justified. He said that the current mechanism was in favour of HKSM and had facilitated its monopoly. In his view, the Administration had the duty to allow all qualified persons to obtain PDI licences. The matters on the usage of PDI licences and the form of carrying out driving tests could however be further discussed. He expressed that he supported Mr Albert CHAN's motion.

52. USTH said that driving school was not a franchise business. In fact, there was no limit on the number of DDS. As long as an interested party had met prescribed requirements, it might submit an application for operating a DDS to TD for consideration. Moreover, under the two-pronged approach, applicants were fully aware of the respective career prospects of becoming a RDI and a PDI.

53. The Chairman noted that there were different voices regarding the Administration's two-pronged approach for driver training. He called on the Administration to comprehensively study the feasibility of revamping the two-pronged approach. The Administration noted his view.

54. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan indicated the Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions's view that the monopoly of HKSM should be terminated. He said that due to the monopoly of HKSM, RDIs were exploited as employees of DDS and were disallowed to provide driver training after leaving DDS. In his opinion, although there were views that lifting the restrictions on RDI licences was unfair to those who were interested to enter the trade, the Administration should first safeguard the job of existing RDIs in the trade. He said that he would not support the suggestion of Mr Albert CHAN for a full liberalization of the PDI market as this would aggravate the situation of existing RDIs. He considered that once the monopoly was broken, DDSs would be required to employ PDIs in the market, thus providing more choices to serving PDIs. He urged the Administration to set a target to apply new arrangements in the next biennial review. Mr LEE added that if all RDIs were granted PDI licences, it would not increase the on-street traffic as DDSs would also need to employ PDIs from the market to provide off-street driver training.

55. USTH noted that the members' views were diverse on the issuing mechanism of driving instructors' licence. He underlined that any changes to the issuing mechanism would require legislative amendment which would be subject to the approval of the Legislative Council. As such, a majority view from the trade would help gauge Members' support for any legislative amendments in this regard. He called on the trade to arrive at a consensus to effect a change, if any, so that new arrangements could be put in place for issuance of new PDI licences in the future.

Motion

56. The Chairman proposed that the two motions to be moved by Dr Elizabeth QUAT and Mr Albert CHAN could be dealt with and put them to vote. Members agreed.

57. After discussion, Dr Elizabeth QUAT moved the following motion, which was seconded by Mr Christopher CHUNG –

"鑒於駕駛教師業界對現行新簽發私人駕駛教師執照機制出現意見分歧，未能達致共識，本會促請政府採取分期方式，彈性處理本年度新簽發事宜；同時，當局應全面檢視現行駕駛訓練政策，包括駕駛教師執照組別的釐定及數目，受限制駕駛教師的規定等，以便更迎合目前社會需要。"

(Translation)

"That, given that there is no consensus in the driving instructor trade on the current mechanism for issuing new Private Driving Instructors' licences due to divergent views on the issue, this Panel urges the Government to adopt a phased approach and flexibly handle matters relating to the issuance of new licences for this year. At the same time, in order to better meet current social needs, it is incumbent for the Government to comprehensively review the existing driving training policy, including the grouping and the number of driving instructor licences, and conditions imposed on Restricted Driving Instructors, etc."

58. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Five members voted for the motion, none voted against it and three abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

59. Mr Albert CHAN then moved the following motion, which was seconded by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung –

"有鑒於政府當局長期凍結私人駕駛教師執照數目，剝奪市民從事私人駕駛教師的權利，本會反對政府當局繼續凍結私人駕駛教師執照數目上限，並要求政府當局立即全面開放私人駕駛教師市場，讓有意從事私人駕駛教師的市民可以自由考取私人駕駛教師執照，並保障市民有合理的選擇權，令私人駕駛教師市場可健康發展。"

(Translation)

"That, given that the Government has imposed a freeze on the number of Private Driving Instructors' ("PDIs") licences for a long time, thus depriving members of the public of the rights to work as PDIs, this Panel opposes the Government's decision to keep the cap on the number of PDI licences, and demands a full liberalization of the PDI market immediately so that those interested in working as PDIs can freely apply for PDI licences in order to ensure that members of the public have a reasonable right of choice, thereby facilitating a healthy development of the market for PDIs."

60. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Three members voted for and five members voted against it. The Chairman declared that the motion was negatived.

61. The Chairman hoped that the Administration could comprehensively review the existing driving training policy and report the outcome to the Panel in due course.

V Any other business

Consideration of an overseas duty visit

- | | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| LC Paper No. CB(1)598/13-14(01) | - Letter from Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai on the proposal to conduct an overseas duty visit to Singapore to study the experience of providing public transport services |
| LC Paper No. IN08/13-14 | - Paper on public transport facilities and traffic control |

measures in Singapore prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (information note)

LC Paper No. CB(1)1146/13-14(01) - Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai's supplementary information on the proposal to conduct an overseas duty visit to Singapore)

62. The Chairman said that the Deputy Chairman had suggested to conduct an overseas duty visit to Singapore or other countries to study the public transport facilities and traffic management arrangements. He consulted members on whether the Panel should conduct the duty visit, the scope of study, the place and timing of the duty visit and whether non-Panel members were allowed to participate.

63. The Deputy Chairman said that in view of the traffic congestion problem in Hong Kong, there was a need to conduct an overseas duty visit to study overseas practice on public transport system, public transport interchanges and electronic road pricing system. He proposed to visit an Asian country for four days as it would be more cost-effective. If the duty visit would be conducted to Singapore, he considered it worthy of also studying its automatically operated mass rapid transit system as it would provide a good reference for the South Island Line (East) to be commissioned in the near future.

64. Mr Albert CHAN pointed out that the Government was considering to construct monorail system in Kowloon East so he was interested in studying the system in overseas countries. He suggested to visit Sydney to study its unsuccessful experience in operating the system.

65. The Chairman requested the Research Division to prepare an information paper to address the areas mentioned by members above for discussion at the next meeting. He said that if members agreed that the duty visit would last for four days, the place of visit should be close to Hong Kong. To avoid affecting members' participation in Council's activities, he suggested that the duty visit should be conducted during the summer recess and that non-Panel members should be invited to join the duty visit. Members agreed to the above arrangements. The Chairman remarked that the duty visit would have to be approved by the House Committee.

66. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:48 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
21 October 2014