

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)714/13-14
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/12

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation
of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Friday, 29 November 2013, at 8:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

Member attending : Hon James TO Kun-sun

Members absent : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Public Officers : Item III
attending

Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Raymond YOUNG, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mr WAN Man-leung
Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

Ms Elizabeth TAI
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon
Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH
Chief Executive Officer

Dr CHAN Man-wai
Executive Director, Project Delivery

Dr Lars NITTVE
Executive Director, M+

Mr Louis YU
Executive Director, Performing Arts

Ms Bonny WONG
Director, Chief Executive Officer's Office

Clerk in : Ms Amy YU
attendance Chief Council Secretary (2)6

Staff in : Miss Josephine SO
attendance Senior Council Secretary (2)6

Miss Jasmine TAM
Council Secretary (2)6

Miss Meisy KWOK
Legislative Assistant (2)6

Miss LEE Wai-yan
Clerical Assistant (2)6

I. Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required)

Mr Christopher CHUNG was elected Chairman of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project ("the Joint Subcommittee") for the 2013-2014 legislative session. Members considered it not necessary to re-elect the Deputy Chairman of the Joint Subcommittee. Mr Alan LEONG agreed to continue to serve as the Deputy Chairman of the Joint Subcommittee in the 2013-2014 legislative session.

II. Matters arising

(LC Paper No. CB(2)358/13-14(01))

2. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

3. Members noted the list of follow-up actions required of the Administration and the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") arising from the discussions of the Joint Subcommittee at its meetings in the 2012-2013 legislative session.

III. Update on the progress of the West Kowloon Cultural District development

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)358/13-14(02)-(04))

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs and Chief Executive Officer of WKCD briefed members on the progress of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") development, details of which were set out in the relevant paper. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, Executive Director, Project Delivery and Executive Director, M+ of WKCD introduced the key facilities in Xiqu Centre and the space and general accommodation distribution in M+.

(Post-meeting note: The powerpoint presentation material provided by WKCD was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)406/13-14(01) on 29 November 2013.)

WKCD 5. The Joint Subcommittee requested WKCD to -

- (a) clarify whether M+ would be a cluster of three buildings as shown in the powerpoint presentation given by WKCD, and if so, provide a schematic illustration of the building cluster including the appearance of the two buildings behind the main museum building and advise their respective uses; and

Action

- (b) provide more information on details of the architectural design of M+, including the material(s) and colour(s) to be used for the external walls of the museum building to manifest the architectural style and aesthetic of the chosen design of M+, which featured a semi-transparent appearance according to the powerpoint presentation materials provided by WKCDA.

6. The Deputy Chairman expressed the view that the Administration and WKCDA should enhance the functions of the Consultation Panel of WKCDA so that it would perform a role similar to that of Metropoli-30 of the Abandoibarra project in Bilbao of Spain, details of which were set out in the reports of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development formed in the Third Legislative Council ("the former Subcommittee") on its duty visit to Bilbao of Spain in September 2005. To facilitate members' understanding, the Chairman directed that relevant information be provided to members for reference.

Clerk

(Post-meeting note: The relevant information was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)510/13-14 on 12 December 2013.)

IV. Any other business

Site visit to WKCD

7. Members noted that pursuant to the decision of the Joint Subcommittee at its meeting on 10 July 2013, a site visit to WKCD had been scheduled for 17 December 2013 to enable members to have a better understanding of the connectivity of WKCD with its surrounding areas. Members raised no objection to inviting non-Subcommittee members to join the visit.

Items for discussion at the next meeting

8. Members agreed that the Joint Subcommittee would discuss the following items at its next meeting tentatively scheduled to be held in January 2014 –

- (a) Minor relaxation of the development intensity of the WKCD site; and
- (b) Progress on Arts Pavilion.

(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, the next meeting of the Joint Subcommittee was scheduled for Friday, 24 January 2014, from 8:30 am to 10:30 am.)

Action

9. Members noted that the Chairman and the Deputy Chairman would meet and discuss with the Administration and WKCDA for the purpose of drawing up a proposed work plan of the Joint Subcommittee for the 2013-2014 legislative session for members' consideration.

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:44 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
20 January 2014

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project
held on Friday, 29 November 2013, at 8:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
<i>Agenda Item I - Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required)</i>			
000059 - 000840	Mr Christopher CHUNG Mr IP Kwok-him Mr Steven HO Dr Kenneth CHAN Mr Alan LEONG Ms Cyd HO	Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman	
<i>Agenda Item II - Matters arising</i>			
000841 - 000917	Chairman	List of follow-up actions required of the Administration and the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") [LC Paper No. CB(2)358/13-14(01)].	
<i>Agenda Item III - Update on the progress of the West Kowloon Cultural District development</i>			
000918 - 004127	Chairman Admin WKCD	Briefing by the Administration and powerpoint presentation by WKCD on the progress of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") development [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)358/13-14(02) and CB(2)406/13-14(01)].	
004128 - 004614	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan WKCD Admin	<p>In response to Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's enquiries about the seating capacities of the main theatre and the tea house of Xiqu Centre and whether the Mega Performance Venue ("MPV") was planned to be an outdoor facility, WKCD advised that –</p> <p>(a) Xiqu Centre was planned to include a 1 100-seat main theatre and a 400-seat small theatre. The seating capacity of the main theatre was proposed with reference to that of other Cantonese opera performance venues in Hong Kong (e.g. the Sunbeam Theatre), and was considered ideal for xiqu performances by the local xiqu community;</p> <p>(b) noting that a medium-sized theatre with 600 seats for Cantonese opera performances would be provided at the Ko Shan Theatre New Wing which was scheduled to open in 2014, WKCD planned to develop the small theatre of Xiqu Centre in its phase 2 development;</p> <p>(c) the tea house in Xiqu Centre comprised two parts, which could be used for xiqu performances for up to 200 and 80 audiences respectively; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		(d) while MPV was intended to be developed as an indoor rather than an outdoor seated facility for large-scale music performances and entertainment events, consideration was being given to providing an open-air performance venue in the Park of WKCD.	
004615 - 005445	Chairman Ms Emily LAU WKCD Admin	<p>Ms Emily LAU's views and suggestions as follows –</p> <p>(a) the Administration and WKCD should exercise proper cost control in developing individual facilities in WKCD and ensure the implementation of the WKCD project in a timely manner and without delay;</p> <p>(b) the Administration and WKCD should respond to the concern of local arts groups/artists about whether they could access the future performing arts ("PA") venues in WKCD and how such venues would be managed;</p> <p>(c) the admission fees to the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD should be set at reasonably affordable levels, so as to encourage the public's participation in arts and cultural programmes; and</p> <p>(d) noting the Administration's plan to develop a new cultural centre in Kwun Tong, the Administration should brief the Joint Subcommittee on its coordination with WKCD in the development and management of performance venues in Hong Kong.</p> <p>The Administration's advice that –</p> <p>(a) discussions had been initiated among WKCD, the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") and different PA groups on issues relating to the future use and management of the PA venues in WKCD, including the feasibility of implementing a partnership framework at individual venues in WKCD, with a view to putting in place appropriate arrangements for individual PA venues in WKCD before their scheduled completion in phases; and</p> <p>(b) a Cross District Community Cultural Centre ("CDCCC") in Kowloon East was under active planning. Recognizing that it had been a long-standing request of the local community for a new performance venue in</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Kowloon East, which was currently served by Ngau Chi Wan Civic Centre only, the Administration hoped to seek funding to implement the project as soon as possible. As the proposed CDCCC would be located in Kowloon East and was planned to cater mainly for the needs of the residents in the districts, there would be no direct competition between CDCCC in Kowloon East and the future PA venues in WKCD.</p> <p>WKCD's response that it had all along attached great importance to cost control when developing the WKCD facilities and it would maintain liaison with LCSD on the development of CDCCC in Kowloon East.</p> <p>Suggestion of Ms Emily LAU and the Chairman that issues relating to the coordination and delineation of responsibility between the Government and WKCD in the development and management of PA venues in Hong Kong be discussed by the Joint Subcommittee at a future meeting.</p>	
005446 - 010114	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCD Admin	<p>Dr Helena WONG queried why WKCD, on the one hand, applied for minor relaxation of the total gross floor area ("GFA") restriction on the WKCD site to generate additional GFA for various uses including retail/dining/entertainment ("RDE") facilities, but, on the other hand, planned to reduce the floor area of the RDE facilities in Xiqu Centre as part of its cost-saving efforts.</p> <p>WKCD's advice that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) having considered the design of Xiqu Centre with an atrium and on the advice of retail experts, a reduction of the floor area of the RDE facilities in Xiqu Centre was proposed with the aim of enhancing the overall efficiency of the provision of RDE facilities in WKCD; and (b) there was no inherent contradiction between the proposed reduction of the floor area of RDE facilities in Xiqu Centre and the proposed minor relaxation of the total GFA restriction of the WKCD site, as the former proposal sought to reduce a small amount of less efficient RDE area in a specific facility in WKCD, whereas the latter proposal aimed to increase the overall provision of the floor area for various uses, including RDE facilities, across the WKCD site. The 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		rental proceeds from the RDE facilities, which would be incorporated in the arts and cultural facilities, hotel/office/residential ("HOR") developments as well as other facilities in WKCD, would provide a major source of recurrent income for WKCD to run the facilities in WKCD.	
010115 - 011114	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin WKCD	<p>The Deputy Chairman highlighted the views and concerns of the Civic Party as follows –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration and WKCD should strike a proper balance between controlling the costs of developing various facilities in WKCD and maintaining the overall functions and quality of the facilities; (b) with the appointment of the new Chairman of the Consultation Panel ("CP") of WKCD, the roles and functions of CP should be enhanced so that it would serve as an open platform for consulting regularly and building consensus among stakeholders and the public on major matters relating to the WKCD development; (c) WKCD should expeditiously draw up bylaws for the management of the Park in WKCD and make available appropriate spaces in the Park and other open space in WKCD for the staging of street performances; (d) more information should be provided on the delineation of responsibility, allocation of resources and coordination among the Government, its collaborators (e.g. Hong Kong Arts Development Council and Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts) and WKCD in the development of culture and the arts in Hong Kong; and (e) arts education in schools and training of arts-related personnel should be strengthened so as to build audience and nurture talents for WKCD as well as local arts development. <p>The Administration's responses that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) acknowledging that the increase in the capital costs of the WKCD project was partly attributable to the inclusion of the integrated basement as an integral part of the Development Plan ("DP") of WKCD, the Administration planned to fully fund the capital works of the integrated basement as 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>general enabling works to facilitate the development of the whole WKCD project;</p> <p>(b) the Deputy Chairman's comments and suggestions on the work of CP would be relayed to WKCDA for consideration; and</p> <p>(c) WKCDA would press ahead with the preparation of the bylaws for the management of the Park and reference would be made to, among others, existing regulations governing the operation of public parks in Hong Kong.</p> <p>The Chairman's request that to facilitate the Joint Subcommittee's consideration of the funding proposal for the implementation of the integrated basement, the Administration should provide in its proposal details on the funding arrangements for the development of the public infrastructure for WKCD (including whether WKCDA was required to share the related costs) as set out in the funding submission for the provision of an upfront endowment fund of \$21.6 billion to WKCDA approved by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2008.</p>	
011115 - 011810	Chairman Mr Gary FAN WKCDA	<p>Mr Gary FAN's comments and enquiry on the M+ project as follows -</p> <p>(a) the architectural design of M+, which resembled Hong Kong tropical cyclone warning signal No. 3 in appearance, was too simple and lacked character;</p> <p>(b) the "+" sign in the current logo of M+ was not legible; and</p> <p>(c) whether WKCDA had any plans to make use of the external walls of M+ as a screen on which images of, for instance, artistic works would be projected and displayed for promotion or other purposes, and if so, details of its plans.</p> <p>WKCDA's expression of disagreement with Mr FAN's comments on the architectural design of M+ and its advice that -</p> <p>(a) the winning design of M+ was considered by the international Jury Panel of the M+ Design Competition as the best among the submitted designs that worked within the budget and site constraints;</p> <p>(b) the design team of M+ was still working on the typographical design of M+; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>(c) given that M+ was a museum of visual culture, consideration would be given, during the design process of M+, to whether and how the museum building itself could be used as a screen for display of images of artistic works or dissemination of other information as appropriate, having regard to the fundamental purpose of the building as a museum, practice of other buildings in the vicinity and other relevant factors.</p> <p>Mr FAN's request for information concerning the architectural design of M+.</p>	<p>WKCD A to provide information (paragraph 5(a) &(b) of the minutes)</p>
011811 - 012226	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen WKCD A	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's enquiries in respect of the Xiqu Centre project as follows –</p> <p>(a) whether the proposal to reduce the floor area of the RDE facilities was made in the light of the over-budget situation of Xiqu Centre, and details of other cost saving measures as outlined in paragraph 5 of the paper provided by WKCD A;</p> <p>(b) whether only the RDE facilities in the first and second floors would be provided with air-conditioning as alleged in media reports, and if so, whether the lack of air-conditioning in the atrium would render it unsuitable for public enjoyment in the summer; and</p> <p>(c) its expected commissioning date.</p> <p>WKCD A's responses that –</p> <p>(a) construction cost escalation was the major factor leading to the substantial increase in the project estimate of the Xiqu Centre. WKCD A had agreed with the Government that the total budget for Xiqu Centre (Phase 1) would be \$2.7 billion and it would make every effort to contain costs and adhere to this target budget;</p> <p>(b) the provision of public space was an important component in the design of Xiqu Centre and the design team did not envisage any problems with the provision of appropriate ventilation and air-conditioning in the facility; and</p> <p>(c) while the contract for the foundation works of Xiqu Centre had been awarded and the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>related works were underway, the tender out date for the main construction contract was scheduled for the first quarter of 2014 with target completion in 2016.</p>	
012227 - 012859	<p>Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin WKCD</p>	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's view that the additional GFA generated from the proposed minor relaxation of the development intensity of the WKCD site should be devoted solely to arts and cultural uses to meet the aspirations of the local arts community.</p> <p>The Administration's responses that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) under the approved DP, WKCD was subject to a maximum plot ratio of 1.81, of which about 50% of the total GFA would be deployed for HOR uses and the relevant sites would be disposed of separately by the Government, whereas the remaining about 50% of the total GFA would be vested in WKCD for the development of arts and cultural facilities as well as RDE facilities; (b) following the above development mix for WKCD, possible uses of the additional GFA generated from the proposed minor relaxation of the total GFA restriction on the WKCD site would include other arts and cultural facilities, RDE facilities as well as HOR uses; and (c) proposals for provision of additional arts and cultural facilities in WKCD could be made to WKCD, which would consider such requests in consultation with the local arts community and other relevant stakeholders. <p>Miss CHAN's request that the Administration and WKCD should consult the Joint Subcommittee on the proposed minor relaxation of the development intensity of the WKCD site before submitting the relevant application to the Town Planning Board for approval.</p> <p>On Miss CHAN's concern about the recent decision of Yau Tsim Mong District Council to reduce the number of days in a week for which the Mong Kok Pedestrian Precinct was implemented and her view that appropriate spaces should be provided in WKCD for street performances, WKCD advised that no less than 23 hectares of public open space would be provided in WKCD and appropriate spaces/venues would be made available for artistic performances/expressions.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
012900 - 013341	Chairman WKCD Admin	In response to the Chairman's comment that the design of Xiqu Centre appeared to be lacking in traditional Xiqu elements, WKCD advised that the current design of Xiqu Centre, including that of the facilities to be provided therein, was the outcome of extensive consultation with the local xiqu community. Eminent representatives of the xiqu community had been engaged as members of the Jury Panel for the Xiqu Centre Design Competition and the local xiqu community had specifically requested that a more modern design should be adopted for Xiqu Centre so as to enhance the appeal of xiqu to the younger generation.	
013342 - 013711	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Admin WKCD	<p>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's concern whether green concepts had been incorporated in the design of individual facilities in WKCD such as M+.</p> <p>WKCD's responses that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the winning design of the M+ Design Competition was considered by the Jury Panel as having the merits of, among others, an environmentally sustainable and functional building design; (b) as sustainability was one of the key principles upon which the whole WKCD development was predicated, sustainable planning and design would be adopted as far as practicable in the development of individual facilities in WKCD; and (c) the Director of Environmental Protection had approved the Environmental Impact Assessment Report for WKCD and no concern had been raised about the environmental sustainability of the facilities in WKCD. WKCD was in discussion with the Government on the implementation of other district-wide green initiatives, such as the provision of a district cooling system in WKCD. 	
013712 - 013941	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCD	<p>Dr Helena WONG's view that effective time, budget and quality controls were vital for the successful implementation of the WKCD project.</p> <p>On Dr WONG's enquiries about whether WKCD envisaged any difficulties in delivering the various facilities in WKCD on schedule and whether relevant government departments had rendered sufficient support to WKCD in implementing the WKCD project, WKCD advised that it had been cooperating well with the government departments concerned and was</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		confident that a major part of the project would be delivered by 2020.	
013942 - 014243	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han WKCD Admin	The responses of the Administration and WKCD to Miss CHAN Yuen-han's suggestion that the Administration and WKCD should consider setting up a Bruce Lee Memorial Hall in WKCD in response to the demand of the local film industry.	
014244 - 014510	Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCD	The Deputy Chairman's view that CP should perform a role similar to that of Metropoli-30 in Bilbao of Spain, details of which were set out in the reports of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development formed in the Third LegCo ("former Subcommittee") on its duty visit to Bilbao of Spain.	
014511 - 015042	Chairman WKCD Mr Gary FAN	<p>In response to the Chairman's enquiry about the amount of exhibition space in M+, WKCD advised that the area designated for display galleries was between one-fourth to one-third of the total GFA of M+, which was roughly 15 000 square metres. Apart from display galleries, artworks and design and architecture installations would also be displayed in the general public spaces of M+.</p> <p>The Chairman's request that WKCD should provide more information on the allocation of space within M+ for different uses and the display galleries to be set up when the progress of the development of M+ was revisited by the Joint Subcommittee.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item IV - Any other business</i>			
015043 - 015433	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Miss CHAN Yuen-han WKCD	<p>Site visit to WKCD scheduled for 17 December 2013.</p> <p>Items to be discussed at the next meeting.</p> <p>The Chairman's instruction that relevant reports of the former Subcommittee on its duty visit to Bilbao of Spain be provided to members for reference.</p>	Clerk to follow up (paragraph 6 of the minutes)