

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1151/13-14
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/12

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation
of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Friday, 24 January 2014, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Members absent : Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP

Public Officers attending : Items II and III
Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB")
Mr Raymond YOUNG, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mr WAN Man-leung
Project Manager (HAB)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH
Chief Executive Officer

Dr CHAN Man-wai
Executive Director, Project Delivery

Dr Lars NITTVE
Executive Director, M+

Ms Bonny WONG
Director, Chief Executive Officer's Office

Clerk in attendance : Ms Amy YU
Chief Council Secretary (2)6

Staff in attendance : Miss Jasmine TAM
Council Secretary (2)6

Miss Meisy KWOK
Legislative Assistant (2)6

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes
(LC Paper No. CB(2)714/13-14)

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The minutes of the meeting held on 29 November 2013 were confirmed.

II. Minor relaxation of the development intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District site
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)716/13-14(01) and (02))

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs ("PSHA"), Chief Executive Officer and Executive Director, Project Delivery of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA")

Action

briefed the Joint Subcommittee on the proposal of WKCDA for minor relaxation of the development intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") site ("the proposal"), details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(01)).

4. Mr MA Fung-kwok declared that he was a member of the Board of WKCDA.

Admin/
WKCDA

5. The Joint Subcommittee requested the Administration/WKCDA to -

- (a) reorganize the information set out in the table "Key Planning Parameters" under paragraph 5 of the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(01)) based on the categories of development mix for WKCD as shown in the table under paragraph 4 of the same paper;
- (b) provide details of the application to be submitted to the Town Planning Board, including details of the results of the technical assessments carried out on the traffic, environmental, air ventilation, visual impacts and building height implications of the proposal; and
- (c) provide more information on the planned uses of the additional gross floor area arising from the proposal which would be allocated to WKCDA, as well as estimation of the construction costs for and income to be generated from such additional facilities.

Admin

6. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration undertook to provide the following information when it briefed the Joint Subcommittee on the financial situation of the WKCD project and the proposal for the implementation of the integrated basement in May 2014 –

- (a) details of the respective funding responsibility of the Government and WKCDA for the development of public infrastructure for WKCD when the funding proposal for the provision of the upfront endowment fund to WKCDA was submitted to the Legislative Council in 2008; and
- (b) information on the costs covered by the Government for WKCDA in implementing the integrated basement.

Clerk

7. Members agreed that the Administration and WKCDA should be requested to brief the Joint Subcommittee at its next meeting, which was tentatively scheduled to be held in March 2014, on the results of the technical assessments conducted on the impacts of the proposal. Members further agreed that representatives of the bureau/department overseeing traffic

Clerk

matters should also be invited to attend the meeting to respond to issues concerning the traffic impacts of the proposal.

III. Progress on Arts Pavilion

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)716/13-14(03) and (04) and CB(2)756/13-14(01))

8. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, Executive Director, Project Delivery and Executive Director, M+ of WKCDA briefed members on the progress on Arts Pavilion, details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(03)) and the press release issued by WKCDA on 23 January 2014 (LC Paper No. CB(2)756/13-14(01)).

(Post-meeting note: The powerpoint presentation material provided by WKCDA was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)761/13-14(01) on 24 January 2014.)

9. Members noted that WKCDA had appointed VPANG architects ltd + JET Architecture Inc + Lisa Cheung, a design team formed by three Hong Kong-born architects whose submission had been selected as the first prize winning design of the Arts Pavilion Design Competition, to design the Arts Pavilion scheduled for completion in 2015.

IV. Work plan of the Joint Subcommittee

(LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(05))

10. The Chairman informed members that based on the views expressed by members at the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee on 29 November 2013 and the discussion between the Chairman, Deputy Chairman and representatives of the Administration and WKCDA at the informal meeting on 13 December 2013, the Secretariat had prepared a proposed work plan of the Joint Subcommittee in the remainder of the 2013-2014 legislative session for members' consideration. Members endorsed the proposed work plan.

11. Members noted that in addition to the item raised in paragraph 7 above, the Joint Subcommittee would also discuss the two items "Update on the development of Xiqu Centre" and "Artistic characteristic and partnership framework of performing arts venues in WKCD" at its next meeting tentatively scheduled for March 2014.

(Post-meeting note: With the concurrence of the Chairman, the next meeting of the Joint Subcommittee was scheduled for Friday, 28 March 2014, from 9:00 am to 12:00 noon.)

Action

V. Any other business

12. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:42 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
26 March 2014

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project
held on Friday, 24 January 2014, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
<i>Agenda Item I - Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000506 - 000543	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 29 November 2013 [LC Paper No. CB(2)714/13-14].	
<i>Agenda Item II - Minor relaxation of the development intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District site</i>			
000544 - 001715	Chairman Admin WKCD	Briefing by the Administration and the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") on WKCD's proposal for minor relaxation of the development intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") site [LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(01)].	
001716 - 002318	Chairman Mr MA Fung-kwok Admin WKCD	<p>Mr MA Fung-kwok expressed the following views –</p> <p>(a) while he supported increasing the plot ratio of the WKCD site and the proposed arts and cultural facilities to be constructed with the additional gross floor areas ("GFA") generated, he considered the magnitude of the proposed increase (i.e. from 1.81 to 2.08 or a 15% increase) too small; and</p> <p>(b) the plot ratio of the WKCD site could be further increased to between 2.5 and 3, so as to allow the provision of more arts and cultural facilities in WKCD, bring more visitors to the WKCD site, generate more revenues for the Government and WKCD to meet the rising capital costs of the WKCD project, and increase the land supply in Hong Kong for various uses.</p> <p>The Administration responded that -</p> <p>(a) the proposed increase of the plot ratio of the WKCD site from 1.81 to between 2.5 and 3 would be a major deviation from, and involved fundamental revisions to, the approved Development Plan ("DP") of WKCD. It would also have significant traffic and visual impacts as well as building height implications on WKCD and its surrounding areas; and</p> <p>(b) as the current proposal of WKCD only sought to apply for minor relaxation of the development intensity of the WKCD site under section 16 of the Town Planning Ordinance (Cap. 131) ("TPO") without requiring any major revamp of the approved DP, it was considered more prudent and appropriate and had the support of the Government.</p> <p>WKCD advised that as any proposals for a major increase of the plot ratio of the WKCD site would impact</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		upon the implementation timetable of the WKCD project, WKCDA considered that the current proposal was in the interests of all the stakeholders concerned and would add to the overall benefits of the WKCD project.	
002319 - 003005	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Admin WKCDA	<p>Dr Helena WONG made the following enquiries and comments -</p> <p>(a) whether the current proposal of WKCDA was intended to generate more revenue to address the problem of cost overrun of the WKCD project;</p> <p>(b) in respect of the additional GFA for hotel, office and residential ("HOR") uses arising from the current proposal, the estimated costs of site formation and associated works to be borne and the estimated unit price per square foot of such HOR sites to be disposed of by the Government; and</p> <p>(c) the categorization and order of the information shown in the table "Key Planning Parameters" under paragraph 5 of the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(01)) did not correspond to those set out in the table under paragraph 4 of the same paper, which rendered it difficult for the public to comprehend such information.</p> <p>The Administration advised that -</p> <p>(a) while the additional GFA for retail, dining and entertainment ("RDE") uses arising from the current proposal would help generate more rental proceeds for WKCDA, the main purpose of the proposal was to provide more arts and cultural facilities ancillary to or in support of the core arts and cultural venues in WKCD, and not to boost WKCDA's revenue. The additional HOR GFA generated under the proposal would also help meet the acute demand for land in the urban areas; and</p> <p>(b) the additional HOR GFA would be put up for sale in the market in a fair and open manner and at suitable timing in future. Information on the estimated unit price per square foot of the relevant sites would be available only after a confirmed disposal programme had been drawn up.</p> <p>The Administration/WKCDA was requested to reorganize the information set out in the table "Key Planning Parameters" under paragraph 5 of the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(01)).</p>	Admin/ WKCDA to follow up
003006 - 003739	Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCDA	<p>Mr Tony TSE raised the following views and enquiry -</p> <p>(a) while he was supportive of optimizing the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>development potential of the WKCD site, due regard should be given to the fact that the current design concept of WKCD as spelt out in the approved DP was the outcome of years of consultation;</p> <p>(b) the current plot ratio of 1.81 was calculated based on the area of 40.91 hectares of the entire WKCD site. However, as 23 hectares of the site were designated as public open space and building developments would be concentrated on the remaining around 17 hectares, the actual plot ratio had been underestimated by WKCDA. According to his calculation, if only the 17 hectares were taken into consideration, the current proposal of WKCDA should represent a 36% increase in development intensity, instead of 15% as suggested by WKCDA;</p> <p>(c) to maintain the building height profile for WKCD as envisaged in the approved DP, WKCDA should seek to ensure that only minor relaxation of the current building height restrictions ("BHRs") on WKCD (i.e. ranging from 50 to 100 metres above Principal Datum) would be sought where necessary;</p> <p>(d) WKCDA should carefully study the traffic impact of its proposal; and</p> <p>(e) to tie in with the initiative proposed by the Chief Executive in his 2014 Policy Address to develop underground space in the urban areas, the Administration and WKCDA should explore ways to better utilize the underground space of WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that -</p> <p>(a) under the current proposal, only minor increase in the height of a few buildings in WKCD would be considered, while the basic development parameters underpinning the approved DP would continue to be complied with; and</p> <p>(b) according to WKCDA's initial assessment, the proposed 15% increase in the development intensity of the WKCD site would unlikely generate any adverse impact on the traffic of WKCD and its surrounding areas.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's enquiry about the traffic and environment impacts of the proposal, WKCDA advised that a full range of technical assessments were being carried out by its consultant to ascertain that the proposal would not generate unacceptable impacts on WKCD and its surrounding areas before submission of the application to the Town Planning Board ("TPB").</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
003740 - 004156	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCD A	<p>Mr YIU Si-wing expressed the following views and concerns -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) in view that the maximum domestic plot ratio for the urban areas was around 7, he supported increasing the plot ratio of the WKCD site and considered that there was room for further increasing the plot ratio to beyond 2.08 as currently proposed by WKCD A; (b) the large area of the WKCD site and the provision of mainly arts and cultural facilities within the site might result in an insufficient flow of visitors in WKCD, particularly during weekdays, thereby turning the WKCD project into a "white elephant"; (c) the Administration and WKCD A should capitalize on the proximity of WKCD to various major public transport nodes, such as Kowloon Station and West Kowloon Terminus, and develop WKCD as a major tourist attraction in Hong Kong; and (d) in planning the use of the additional GFA arising from its current proposal, WKCD A should consider injecting more tourism elements into WKCD and providing more RDE facilities, especially at the podium level, to enhance the appeal of WKCD to tourists. <p>WKCD A responded that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it recognized that WKCD was well served by various railway corridors, with visitors arriving via the Airport Express, the West Rail Line and the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") through Kowloon Station, Austin Station and West Kowloon Terminus respectively. To make WKCD a destination of choice in Hong Kong for both local people and tourists, WKCD A would operate the arts and cultural facilities day and night and would attach importance to enhancing the tourism appeal of WKCD through organizing different events on the WKCD site; and (b) apart from arts and cultural facilities, a variety of RDE uses as well as HOR developments had been planned to create vibrancy in WKCD during both day and night time. 	
004157 - 005234	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Admin WKCD A Deputy Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO considered it not necessary to increase the plot ratio of the WKCD site, given that the land value of the HOR part of WKCD had increased sharply in recent years and the Government should deploy the increased revenue to be generated from the disposal of such HOR sites to meet the increased capital costs of the WKCD project.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Ms HO also sought information on the difference between the Government's estimation of the revenue to be generated from the disposal of the HOR sites in WKCD when its funding proposal for the provision of the \$21.6 billion endowment fund to WKCD was submitted to the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2008 and its current estimation of such revenue.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman asked whether the revenue generated from the disposal of the additional HOR GFA arising from the current proposal would facilitate more favourable consideration by the Government to injecting additional funding into the WKCD project where the situation warranted.</p> <p>The Administration advised that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) as stated in its funding submission to LegCo in 2008, the land sale proceeds from the disposal of the HOR sites in WKCD should go to the Government and be transferred to the Treasury. The proceeds would become the Government's General Revenue, the use of which would be determined having regard to the funding needs of different bureaux/departments and the overall funding priorities set by the Government; (b) given the long time span of the WKCD project, it was impossible to ascertain at the moment the capital costs required for the entire project. As such, it would be difficult to justify the need to seek LegCo's approval for providing additional funding to WKCD to supplement the original endowment fund at this stage of the project; (c) the Government considered it more prudent and appropriate to ensure efficient use of the endowment fund by WKCD to complete the first and second batches of facilities in WKCD first, and review in due course the need to seek additional funding in the light of any changes in circumstances and WKCD's continued effort on cost containment; and (d) while the proceeds from the disposal of the HOR sites in WKCD could not be designated to be used for financing the WKCD project, the Government would consider the appropriate form of support to be rendered to facilitate the WKCD development should the need for additional funding arise in future. In this regard, the Government had committed to fully fund the capital works of the integrated basement as general enabling works to facilitate the development of the whole WKCD project. <p>In response to the Deputy Chairman's enquiry, WKCD advised that the proposed maximum building height and mass for individual plots of land in WKCD would be</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>indicated in the application to be submitted to TPB.</p> <p>In response to the concern of Ms Cyd HO and the Deputy Chairman whether the current proposal would impact upon the overall building height profile of WKCD, WKCDA advised that it had requested its design consultants to maintain the original design concepts under the approved DP and seek to keep to a minimum any requirements for relaxation of BHRs. The BHRs for developments near the waterfront, which were mainly arts and cultural facilities, would be kept unchanged.</p> <p>WKCDA was requested to provide details of its application to be submitted to TPB.</p>	WKCDA to provide information
005235 - 005702	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan WKCDA	<p>WKCDA's response to Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's enquiry about whether WKCDA had assessed the impacts of the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site.</p> <p>Dr CHIANG suggested that WKCDA should consider providing an update report to members on its latest plans on, among others, the mode of management and operation of WKCD and the financial arrangements for the project.</p>	
005703 - 010118	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen WKCDA Admin	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered that to facilitate members' and the public's consideration of whether the proposal for minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site was worth pursuing, the Administration and WKCDA should provide information on the estimated construction and related costs for, and income to be generated from, the additional GFA arising from the proposal.</p> <p>The Administration responded that while it was technically feasible for WKCDA to draw up a ballpark estimate on the construction costs for the additional GFA, such an estimate might not be of much reference value as the tenders for the construction works were yet to be issued. The current proposal was predicated on the idea of providing more arts and cultural facilities for the arts community and the public, rather than the need to achieve full cost-recovery.</p>	
010119 - 010513	Chairman Mr Frankie YICK WKCDA	<p>Mr Frankie YICK expressed the following views -</p> <p>(a) he was concerned whether WKCD would be able to draw visitors to the site during both day and night time, given that only a small proportion of the total GFA of the site was allocated for RDE uses;</p> <p>(b) he supported WKCDA's proposal as it would allow more facilities to be built. He considered that</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>WKCD should work on enhancing the appeal of WKCD through, for instance, organizing more daily and street-level activities to animate the WKCD site and make it a habit for people to visit the site; and</p> <p>(c) given the BHRs on WKCD, WKCD should explore developing the underground space of WKCD to maximize the development potential of the site.</p> <p>WKCD responded that -</p> <p>(a) various activities and pre-opening programmes had been held on the WKCD site in the past two years to bring people to WKCD and raise public awareness of the future uses of the site;</p> <p>(b) with the completion of the Park, Xiqu Centre and M+ in 2015-2017 and taking advantage of the transport services provided by XRL and other major transport nodes adjacent to WKCD, WKCD should be able to build a critical mass of audience progressively;</p> <p>(c) WKCD would pursue its discussion with relevant government departments on the provision of marine access to the WKCD site, with a view to bringing visitors from Hong Kong Island and other parts of Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(d) apart from pressing ahead with the hardware development, WKCD would also attach importance to promoting software development through building audience and enhancing the capacities of local arts groups and artists in taking forward the WKCD project.</p>	
010514 - 011220	Chairman WKCD Admin	<p>The Chairman made the following views and requests –</p> <p>(a) although the Government had not made additional capital injection into WKCD to supplement the upfront endowment fund, it had, in effect, given additional funding support to WKCD through fully funding the capital works of the integrated basement;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should provide in due course details on the respective funding responsibility of the Government and WKCD for the development of public infrastructure for WKCD when the funding proposal for the endowment fund was submitted to LegCo in 2008, as well as information on the costs covered by the Government for WKCD in implementing the integrated basement; and</p> <p>(c) to facilitate the Joint Subcommittee's examination of the cost-effectiveness of WKCD's proposal for minor relaxation of development intensity of the</p>	Admin to provide information

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>WKCD site, the Administration/WKCDA should provide information on its estimation of the cost to be borne and income to be received respectively by the Government and WKCDA arising from the additional GFA generated under the proposal.</p> <p>The Administration responded that -</p> <p>(a) information on the costs covered by the Government for WKCDA would be provided when WKCDA/the Administration briefed the Joint Subcommittee in May 2014 on the financial situation of the WKCD project and the proposal for the implementation of the integrated basement;</p> <p>(b) as there was no confirmed programme at the moment for the disposal of the additional HOR GFA arising from the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site, it was not feasible to draw up a realistic estimate on the proceeds to be generated from the disposal of such sites; and</p> <p>(c) in regard to the additional GFA which would be allocated to WKCDA, while it might be possible for WKCDA to compute the estimated construction costs for and income to be generated from such additional facilities, the figures so computed would serve little purpose given that it was not known yet when such facilities would be built.</p> <p>The Administration/WKCDA was requested to provide more information on the planned uses of the additional GFA which would be allocated to WKCDA as well as estimation of the construction costs for and income to be generated from such additional facilities.</p>	<p>Admin/ WKCDA to provide information</p>
<p>011221 - 011508</p>	<p>Chairman Mr MA Fung-kwok Admin</p>	<p>In response to Mr MA Fung-kwok's enquiry whether the Administration would consider making further capital injection into WKCDA or vesting the HOR part of WKCD in WKCDA to help it meet the construction costs for the additional facilities arising from the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site, the Administration reiterated that it did not see a strong case for seeking LegCo's approval for providing additional funding to WKCDA at the current stage.</p>	
<p>011509 - 011750</p>	<p>Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han WKCDA</p>	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han was of the view that the proposed minor relaxation of the development intensity of the WKCD site was acceptable provided that there would not be any major changes to BHRs on WKCD. However, she considered that the additional GFA generated from the proposal should be devoted solely to arts and cultural uses to meet the aspirations of the local arts community.</p> <p>WKCDA advised that -</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>(a) with the proposed 15% increase in the total GFA of the WKCD site, the GFA of different land uses would be increased on a pro-rata basis to ensure a balanced development mix for WKCD; and</p> <p>(b) the increase of the non-HOR GFA would enable the development of more arts and cultural facilities, such as hostel/hotel for visiting artists, rehearsal facilities/offices for arts groups and creative space for young people and artists, which would benefit both artists and practitioners of the creative industries.</p>	
011751 - 012135	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCD	<p>Dr Helena WONG requested that –</p> <p>(a) the Administration/WKCD should brief the Joint Subcommittee at a meeting on the results of the technical assessments conducted before submission of the application to TPB; and</p> <p>(b) given that the proposed increase in development intensity of the WKCD site might add pressure on the already heavy traffic in the West Kowloon area, representatives of the bureau/department overseeing traffic matters should also be invited to the Joint Subcommittee's meeting to explain the mitigation measures to be adopted and respond to members' questions.</p>	
012136 - 012550	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan WKCD	<p>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan raised the following view and enquiries–</p> <p>(a) given the various existing residential and commercial developments behind WKCD, proposals, if any, for increasing the height of buildings in WKCD might be subject to legal challenge;</p> <p>(b) whether WKCD would consider developing the underground space of WKCD; and</p> <p>(c) WKCD's latest plan on how it would take forward the implementation of the WKCD project.</p> <p>WKCD responded that -</p> <p>(a) it would only consider proposing minor increase in the height of a couple of buildings in WKCD;</p> <p>(b) it would work jointly with the Government to maximize the development potential of WKCD within the constraints imposed by the approved DP; and</p> <p>(c) while the Joint Subcommittee had been briefed at its meeting in July 2013 on WKCD's latest approach and timetable for developing the facilities in WKCD</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>and the overall implementation programme of the WKCD project, relevant updates could be provided to the Joint Subcommittee if considered necessary.</p> <p>In response to the Chairman's enquiry, WKCD advised that the technical assessments on the impacts of the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site were expected to be completed by end of February 2014 and the relevant reports should be available in March 2014.</p>	
012551 - 013111	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin WKCD	<p>The Deputy Chairman enquired whether the Administration could provide, in its paper on the financial situation of the WKCD project / the proposal for the implementation of the integrated basement for discussion by the Joint Subcommittee in May 2014, information on the estimated revenue to be generated from the disposal of the additional HOR GFA arising from the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that in the absence of a confirmed programme for the disposal of the additional HOR GFA, it would be difficult to provide a realistic estimation of the land sale proceeds to be generated. Advice of the Lands Department and the Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau would be sought on whether the requested information could be provided to the Joint Subcommittee for reference.</p>	Admin to follow up
013112 - 013706	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Dr Helena WONG Deputy Chairman	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han suggested that given the concerns of the Yau Tsim Mong District Council about the connectivity of WKCD with its surrounding areas, the Joint Subcommittee should revisit the subject at a future meeting and representatives of the bureau/department overseeing traffic matters should be invited to the meeting to respond to relevant issues as appropriate.</p> <p>Members agreed that –</p> <p>(a) the Administration and WKCD should be requested to brief the Joint Subcommittee, at its next meeting tentatively scheduled to be held in March 2014, on the results of the technical assessments conducted on the impacts of the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site; and</p> <p>(b) representatives of the bureau/department overseeing traffic matters should be invited to the meeting to respond to members' questions.</p> <p>On Dr Helena WONG's concern that WKCD might have submitted the application to TPB when it reverted to the Joint Subcommittee in March 2014, the Deputy Chairman said that there would be about several weeks'</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		time for the public to inspect and make comments on the planning applications received by TPB under section 16 of TPO before such applications were considered by TPB, and the Joint Subcommittee would thus at least be able to examine WKCD's application concurrently with the public.	
<i>Agenda Item III - Progress on Arts Pavilion</i>			
013707 - 014851	Chairman WKCD	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by WKCD on the progress on Arts Pavilion [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)716/13-14(03) and CB(2)761/13-14(01)].	
014852 - 015324	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCD	<p>Dr Helena WONG made the following enquiries -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the criteria to be adopted by WKCD for allocating the Arts Pavilion for use by artists or other interested parties and whether a rental fee would be charged for the staging of exhibitions or events at the facility; (b) the respective positioning and curatorial direction of the Arts Pavilion, M+ and the Hong Kong Museum of Art; and (c) given WKCD's proposal for increasing the total GFA of the WKCD site by 15%, whether the GFA of the Arts Pavilion would be increased. <p>WKCD responded that -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Arts Pavilion served to provide an exhibition and event space for artists, designers, photographers, organizations and other parties to stage small-scale multidisciplinary arts exhibitions and events in WKCD. In the run-up to the scheduled completion of M+ in 2017, the Arts Pavilion would also serve as the museum's primary site for its exhibitions; (b) while the governance structure of the Arts Pavilion beyond 2017 was yet to be determined, WKCD aimed to make it a permanent facility which should add to the existing facilities in Hong Kong to help meet the keen demand of local visual culture practitioners for exhibition and event space; (c) the Arts Pavilion with a GFA of 470 square metres and M+ with an exhibition space of around 15 000 square metres would cater for exhibitions and events of different scales; (d) although the rental fee for the Arts Pavilion was yet to be determined, WKCD was of the view that the Arts Pavilion should be run as a not-for-profit venue and the rental fee should be pitched at a low level; and 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>(e) appropriate space had been set aside in the Park for the construction of the Arts Pavilion and the original GFA of the Arts Pavilion will remain unchanged in the minor relaxation proposal. As this was the first pavilion to be built in WKCD, consideration might be given to expanding it or building more pavilions on other parts of the WKCD site subject to review of its operation in future.</p> <p>Extension of meeting for 15 minutes.</p>	
015325 - 015517	Chairman Mr Frankie YICK WKCD	<p>Mr Frankie YICK expressed appreciation of the first prize winning design of the Arts Pavilion Design Competition, which provided for an elevated exhibition space in the Park for the display of artworks against a backdrop of the spectacular views of the Victoria Harbour.</p> <p>In response to Mr YICK's enquiries, WKCD advised that –</p> <p>(a) the Arts Pavilion was expected to be completed in the third quarter of 2015; and</p> <p>(b) fees and other project expenses which would be excluded from WKCD's budget for the construction of the Arts Pavilion as specified in the Competition Documents (i.e. HK\$20 million) included the costs of the infrastructure works (e.g. site formation, site drainage and sewerage works) required for supporting the implementation of the chosen design of the Arts Pavilion.</p>	
015518 - 015757	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han WKCD	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han commended the first prize winning design for providing good visual permeability and enabling the Arts Pavilion to blend in with its surroundings and the views of the Victoria Harbour.</p> <p>On Miss CHAN's enquiries about whether the external walls of the Arts Pavilion would be used as a screen on which images of artistic works would be projected and whether barrier free access would be provided at the Arts Pavilion which would seemingly be built on a small slope, WKCD advised that –</p> <p>(a) the external walls of the Arts Pavilion would be made of mirror finish stainless steel, reflecting the surrounding expanses of greenery and immersing the building within its Park setting; and</p> <p>(b) a ramp and a lift would be installed at the Arts Pavilion to ensure its accessibility for persons with a disability.</p>	
015758 - 020148	Chairman Ms Claudia MO	Ms Claudia MO raised the following enquiries/concern -	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
	WKCD	<p>(a) the criteria to be adopted by WKCD in determining whether an artist's application for staging an exhibition/event at the Arts Pavilion would be approved and whether WKCD would ensure that no political screening would be involved in the vetting and approval process; and</p> <p>(b) whether the Arts Pavilion would be able to be completed in the third quarter of 2015 as scheduled and within the budget set by WKCD.</p> <p>WKCD responded that –</p> <p>(a) it fully respected Hong Kong's freedom of expression, which would be the basic principle upon which the WKCD venues would be run; and</p> <p>(b) the artistic excellence and value of an artist's works would be the main determinants of how the Arts Pavilion would be allocated for use by artists.</p> <p>The Chairman considered that WKCD should develop a clear programming/curatorial direction for each of the arts and cultural venues in WKCD.</p>	
020149 - 020550	Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCD	<p>The Deputy Chairman raised the following views and enquiry -</p> <p>(a) the Arts Pavilion Design Competition had been successful in attracting the participation of both local and international design teams and the first-prize winning design was of an excellent standard;</p> <p>(b) expression of appreciation that WKCD had stated clearly in the assessment criteria for the Competition, which had been included in the Competition Documents for the participants' reference, that WKCD's budget for the construction of the Arts Pavilion was HK\$20 million and evaluation of a design submission would be adversely affected if its estimated construction cost exceeded the prescribed budget; and</p> <p>(c) which party would be responsible for curating the exhibitions to be held at the Arts Pavilion.</p> <p>WKCD advised that -</p> <p>(a) the curatorial responsibility for the Arts Pavilion would come under M+ until the latter's expected opening scheduled for 2017; and</p> <p>(b) after the opening of M+, the Arts Pavilion would be run independently of M+ and would serve as another venue for artists and organizations to stage exhibitions and events in WKCD. WKCD's</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		current thinking was that a board should be set up in due course to oversee the management of the Arts Pavilion and to ensure that it would be used primarily for non-profit-making activities.	
020551 - 020809	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan WKCD	In response to Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's enquiry, WKCD advised that the Arts Pavilion occupied a site area of more than 600 square metres and had a GFA of 470 square metres. The Chairman and Dr CHIANG expressed appreciation of the winning design and the efforts made by WKCD in controlling the construction cost of the Arts Pavilion.	
<i>Agenda Item IV - Work plan of the Joint Subcommittee</i>			
020810 - 021237	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Dr Helena WONG	Endorsement of the proposed work plan by the Joint Subcommittee and items for discussion at the next meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item V - Any other business</i>			
021238 - 021253	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 26 March 2014