立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1826/13-14 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB2/PS/3/12

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project

Minutes of meeting held on Friday, 28 March 2014, at 9:00 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present

Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)

Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP Hon Steven HO Chun-yin Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming

Hon YIU Si-wing

Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen Hon CHAN Han-pan

Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen

Member attending

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Members absent

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Claudia MO

Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

Public Officers:

Item II

attending

Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Raymond YOUNG, JP Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mr WAN Man-leung Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH Chief Executive Officer

Dr CHAN Man-wai Executive Director, Project Delivery

Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd

Mr Dickson HUI Director

Mott MacDonald

Mr Eric CHING Associate

MVA Hong Kong Ltd

Mr Fred BROWN Honorary Chairman

Ms Lily CHAN
Divisional Director

Item III

Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Raymond YOUNG, JP Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mr WAN Man-leung Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

Ms Sabrina LAW
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West
Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH Chief Executive Officer

Dr CHAN Man-wai

Executive Director, Project Delivery

Mr Louis YU

Executive Director, Performing Arts

Bing Thom Architects

Mr Bing THOM Principal

Item IV

Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Raymond YOUNG, JP

Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Ms Sabrina LAW

Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH Chief Executive Officer

Mr Louis YU

Executive Director, Performing Arts

Clerk in attendance

: Ms Amy YU

Chief Council Secretary (2)6

Staff in attendance

: Miss Jasmine TAM Council Secretary (2)6

Miss Meisy KWOK

Legislative Assistant (2)6

I. Confirmation of minutes

<u>The Joint Subcommittee</u> deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

- 2. The minutes of the meeting held on 24 January 2014 were confirmed.
- II. Technical assessment results of the planning application for minor relaxation of development intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District site

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1153/13-14(01)-(02), CB(2)716/13-14(01) and CB(2)1188/13-14(01))

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") and its planning consultant briefed members on the technical assessment results of the planning application for minor relaxation of development intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") site, details of which were set out in WKCDA's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1153/13-14(01)) and the powerpoint presentation material tabled at the meeting.

(*Post-meeting note*: The powerpoint presentation material provided by WKCDA was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1198/13-14(01) on 28 March 2014.)

4. Mr MA Fung-kwok declared that he was a member of the Board of WKCDA.

Admin/ WKCDA

- 5. <u>The Joint Subcommittee</u> requested the Administration/WKCDA to
 - (a) explain in more detail the traffic impact assessment results of the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site ("the proposal"), including (i) the traffic impact on the adjacent road networks as a result of the proposal and the proposed traffic improvement measures to cope with the increasing traffic demand in the West Kowloon Area arising from the proposal; and (ii) the impact of the proposal on the pedestrian forecasts in WKCD and the crowd dispersal arrangements for major events held on the site;
 - (b) provide more information on the potential benefit of the proposal on the financial situation of the WKCD project, including whether and how the additional revenue generated from the proposal would help WKCDA meet the construction costs of the additional facilities arising from the proposal and/or other costs incurred in implementing the WKCD project; and

issues.

(c) provide details of recent appointment and/or re-appointment of senior executives of WKCDA, staff changes in relevant directorate officers of the Home Affairs Bureau as well as the period of appointment of the incumbent members of the Board of WKCDA and whether there would be any changes to the Board's membership in the next term of appointment.

(*Post-meeting note*: The Administration's/WKCDA's response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1329/13-14 on 17 April 2014.)

6. <u>Members</u> agreed to further discuss the traffic impact assessment of the planning application for minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site at a meeting to be scheduled for April 2014. <u>Members</u> also agreed that representatives of the bureau(x)/department(s) overseeing traffic matters should be requested to attend the meeting to respond to relevant

(*Post-meeting note*: With the concurrence of the Chairman, the meeting was scheduled for Friday, 25 April 2014 at 2:30 pm.)

III. Update on the development of Xiqu Centre (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1153/13-14(03)-(04))

7. At the invitation of the Chairman, <u>WKCDA</u> and its design architect briefed members on the progress of the development of Xiqu Centre, details of which were set out in WKCDA's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1153/13-14(03)) and the powerpoint presentation material tabled at the meeting.

(*Post-meeting note*: The powerpoint presentation material provided by WKCDA was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1198/13-14(02) on 28 March 2014.)

8. <u>Mr Frankie YICK</u> declared that he was a member of the Council of the Hong Kong Repertory Theatre.

IV. Artistic characteristic and partnership framework of performing arts venues in the West Kowloon Cultural District (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1153/13-14(05)-(06))

9. At the invitation of the Chairman, <u>WKCDA</u> briefed members on the proposed facility and artistic partnership framework for the performing arts venues in WKCD, details of which were set out in WKCDA's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1153/13-14(05)) and the powerpoint presentation material tabled at the meeting.

(*Post-meeting note*: The powerpoint presentation material provided by WKCDA was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1198/13-14(03) on 28 March 2014.)

V. Any other business

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:24 pm.

Council Business Division 2
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
18 June 2014

Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project held on Friday, 28 March 2014, at 9:00 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

| Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--|---|--|
| m I - Confirmation of m | inutes | |
| Chairman | Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 24 January 2014. [LC Paper No. CB(2)1151/13-14]. | |
| | | tion of development |
| Chairman Admin WKCDA Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd | Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") and its planning consultant on the technical assessment results of the planning application for minor relaxation of development intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") site ("the planning application") [LC Paper No. CB(2)1198/13-14(01)]. | |
| Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCDA Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd | Mr Tony TSE raised the following views and enquiries – (a) since 23 hectares of the WKCD site were designated as public open space and building developments would mainly be concentrated on the remaining around 17 hectares of the site, the current proposal of WKCDA might result in a greater increase in the development intensity of the WKCD site, rather than a minor increase of 15% as suggested by WKCDA; (b) WKCDA's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)1153/13-14(01)] and the powerpoint presentation materials did not provide sufficient information to address the concerns raised on, among others, the potential benefit of the planning application on the financial situation of the WKCD project and the crowd dispersal arrangements for major events held on the WKCD site; and (c) given that WKCDA had indicated in its paper for the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee on 24 January 2014 (LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(01) that the planning application would not be scheme specific in order to allow flexibility in future developments, on what basis were the various technical assessments conducted for the planning application. WKCDA and its planning consultant advised that – (a) the 23 hectares of public open space in WKCD covered the Park, the waterfront promenade, piazzas/squares, a tree-lined avenue as well as terrace gardens. All these are essential components for the | |
| | m I - Confirmation of m Chairman m II - Technical assess intensity of the W Chairman Admin WKCDA Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCDA Llewelyn-Davies | Chairman Confirmation of minutes Chairman It - Technical assessment results of the planning application for minor relaxation intensity of the West Kowloon Cultural District site Chairman Admin WKCDA Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCDA Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd Mr Tony TSE raised the following views and enquiries — Mr Tony TSE WKCDA Llewelyn-Davies Hong Kong Ltd Mr Tony TSE raised the following views and enquiries — Mr Tony TSE raised the following views and enquiries — Mr Tony TSE raised the following views and enquiries — Mr WCDA might result in a greater increase in the development intensity of the WKCD site, rather than a minor increase of 15% as suggested by WKCDA; (b) WKCDA's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)1153/13-14(01)] and the powerpoint presentation materials did not provide sufficient information to address the concerns raised on, among others, the potential benefit of the planning application on the financial situation of the WKCD project and the crowd dispersal arrangements for major events held on the WKCD site; and (c) given that WKCDA had indicated in its paper for the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee on 24 January 2014 (LC Paper No. CB(2)716/13-14(01) that the planning application would not be scheme specific in order to allow flexibility in future developments, on what basis were the various technical assessments conducted for the planning application. WKCDA and its planning consultant advised that — (a) the 23 hectares of public open space in WKCD covered the Park, the waterfront promenade, piazzas/squares, a tree-lined avenue as well as terrace |

| Time marker | Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|--|---|-----------------|
| | | for plot ratio calculation would deviate from the basis as adopted under the approved Development Plan ("DP"). Even if the plot ratio was calculated by excluding the land area zoned for public open space, the plot ratio would not exceed 4.0 which was relatively low in urban area; and | |
| | | (b) the technical assessments conducted sought to examine the traffic, environmental, air ventilation and visual impacts as well as infrastructure implications of the proposed minor relaxation of the maximum gross floor area ("GFA") and building height restrictions of the WKCD site. An indicative scheme had been prepared in accordance with the maximum GFA/building height restrictions proposed under the subject application. Upon comparison of the assessment results between the DP case and the indicative scheme, it was concluded that the proposed relaxation of GFA and building height restrictions would still be acceptable in various technical terms. | |
| 003356 - 003842 | Chairman Mr MA Fung-kwok WKCDA MVA Hong Kong Ltd | Mr MA Fung-kwok expressed support for WKCDA's proposal to submit the planning application to the Town Planning Board ("TPB") to increase the plot ratio of the WKCD site, so as to optimize the utilization of the site, provide more facilities for the arts and cultural community and enhance the vibrancy of the WKCD. He enquired about the following – | |
| | | (a) the basis on which the original plot ratio of 1.81 for the WKCD site was determined; | |
| | | (b) how the revenue generated by the proposed increase in the plot ratio of the WKCD site would be allocated between the Government and WKCDA, and whether and how it would help WKCDA cope with the rising costs of the WKCD project; and | |
| | | (c) whether WKCDA considered that sufficient justifications could be provided to secure the support of TPB and the public for the planning application. | |
| | | WKCDA responded that – | |
| | | (a) the plot ratio of 1.81 for the WKCD site was the outcome of years of consultation with the public and the Legislative Council ("LegCo"); and | |
| | | (b) the additional hotel, office and residential ("HOR") sites arising from the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site would be allocated to and disposed of separately by the Government, whereas the additional GFA for arts and cultural uses and the retail, dining and entertainment ("RDE") uses would be vested in WKCDA. | |

| Time marker | Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|--|--|-----------------|
| | | In response to the Chairman's enquiry about the impact of the proposal on the pedestrian flow and the crowd dispersal arrangements for performances staged at the arts and cultural venues in WKCD, WKCDA's traffic consultant advised that pedestrian forecasts and crowd dispersal analysis were covered in the traffic impact assessment conducted for the planning application. The analysis results indicated that all pedestrian corridors and footbridges serving the WKCD site would still operate within capacity even assuming that crowds would be dispersed from all the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD after events at the same time. | |
| | | WKCDA was requested to provide more information on the impact of the proposal on the pedestrian forecasts in WKCD and the crowd dispersal arrangements for major events held on the site. | WKCDA |
| 003843 - 004338 | Chairman Miss Alice MAK Admin WKCDA | Miss Alice MAK expressed concern about how the additional GFA generated from the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site would be allocated between WKCDA and the Government. She considered that the Administration should allocate a greater portion of the additional GFA generated to WKCDA, so that more arts and cultural facilities could be provided in WKCD to meet the needs of both major arts groups and small and medium arts groups. | |
| | | The Administration responded that – (a) under the approved DP of WKCD, about 60% of the total GFA would be vested in WKCDA for the development of arts and cultural facilities as well as RDE facilities, whereas the remaining about 40% of the total GFA would be deployed for HOR uses and the relevant sites would be disposed of separately by the Government; | |
| | | (b) as this GFA mix under the approved DP was adopted after extensive public consultation, it was considered more prudent and appropriate to increase the GFA of different land uses on a pro-rata basis to ensure a balanced development with good day and night vibrancy for WKCD; and | |
| | | (c) the additional HOR GFA generated would help meet the acute demand for hotel, office and housing supply in the urban areas. | |

| Time marker | Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|---|--|---|-----------------|
| Ms Emily LAU Admin relaxation of devel intended primarily the problem of cossought clarificating generated would be and WKCDA. The Administration additional GFA generated to WKCI the provision of artifacilities. While help generate mosproposal sought metallities ancillary cultural venues in local arts commerce revenue. Given incurred in develop the operation of an not profitable, the improve the finance. The Administration of development of the provision of an not profitable, the improve the finance. The Administration of development of the provision of an not profitable, the improve the finance. | Ms Emily LAU | Ms Emily LAU questioned whether the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site was intended primarily to generate more revenue to address the problem of cost overrun of the WKCD project. She sought clarification on how the additional revenue generated would be allocated between the Government and WKCDA. | |
| | The Administration responded that about 60% of the additional GFA generated from the proposal would be allocated to WKCDA, which would be used primarily for the provision of arts and cultural facilities as well as RDE facilities. While the additional RDE facilities would help generate more rental proceeds for WKCDA, the proposal sought mainly to provide more arts and cultural facilities ancillary to or in support of the core arts and cultural venues in WKCD which were requested by the local arts community, and not to boost WKCDA's revenue. Given that construction costs would be incurred in developing the various additional facilities and the operation of arts and cultural facilities was generally not profitable, the proposal might not necessarily help improve the financial situation of WKCDA. The Administration/WKCDA was requested to provide details of recent appointment and/or re-appointment of senior executives of WKCDA, staff changes in the directorate officers of the Home Affairs Bureau | Admin/WKCDA | |
| | | overseeing the WKCD development, period of appointment of the incumbent members of the Board of WKCDA and whether there would be any changes to the Board's membership in the next term of appointment. | |
| 004914 - 005627 | Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA Admin | Dr Helena WONG raised the following enquiries and views – (a) whether WKCDA had consulted nearby residents on its proposal for minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site and if so, details of the consultations conducted and the views expressed by the residents; | |
| | | (b) given that the proposal might further add to the heavy traffic pressure in the West Kowloon area, the Administration and WKCDA should carefully study the traffic impact of the proposal on the whole West Kowloon area, taking into account the progressive commissioning of the West Kowloon Terminus of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link and the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD; and | |
| | | (c) in addition to representatives of WKCDA, representatives of the bureau(x)/department(s) overseeing traffic matters should also be invited to a meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to brief members | |

| Time marker | Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|--------------------------------------|---|-----------------|
| | | on the proposed traffic improvement measures to cope with the increasing traffic demand in the West Kowloon area arising from the proposal. | |
| | | WKCDA advised that – | |
| | | (a) in preparing the planning application, consultation meetings had been held with, among others, the Yau Tsim Mong District Council ("YTMDC") and local resident representatives. While concerns had been expressed on, among others, the proposed minor relaxation of building height restrictions of the WKCD site, WKCDA had reassured the residents that the building height in WKCD would not be increased in such a way that would impact on the existing residential buildings; and | |
| | | (b) the technical assessment results showed that the traffic impact on the adjacent road networks as a result of the minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site would be minor. Given that the connectivity plan of WKCD had been formulated to make WKCD accessible by various modes of transport, and that WKCD adopted a "vehicle-free" design concept where all vehicular traffic and servicing facilities would be put underground and the project was not premised on cars being the dominant form of access to the site, WKCDA was confident that the impact of the proposal on the traffic of WKCD and its surrounding areas would be manageable. | |
| | | In response to Dr WONG's enquiry about whether the Administration/WKCDA would undertake not to seek a further increase of the plot ratio of the WKCD site in future, the Administration advised that as any proposed amendments to the approved DP would be governed by the Town Planning Ordinance (Cap. 131) and subject to the approval of TPB, it would be very difficult to seek a further/major increase in the development parameters of WKCD. | |
| 005628 - 005832 | Chairman Mr Frankie YICK WKCDA | Mr Frankie YICK suggested that consideration should be given to providing trams, which was an environmentally friendly and iconic mode of transport in Hong Kong, as a major form of public transport service in WKCD. He asked whether WKCDA had explored the feasibility of providing such service in WKCD with the Hong Kong Tramways Limited. | |
| | | WKCDA advised that an environmentally friendly transport system ("EFTS") would be provided in WKCD to facilitate pedestrian movement within the site. Various transport modes, such as trams and other electric vehicles, would be considered. The mode of operation and routing of the EFTS would be subject to further study. | |

| Time marker | Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|---|--|-----------------|
| 005833 - 010317 | Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCDA MVA Hong Kong Ltd | Mr YIU Si-wing was concerned whether WKCDA had assessed the future demand for coach parking spaces in WKCD and whether adequate provision of such spaces had been planned. | |
| | Did | WKCDA's traffic consultant advised that according to its assessment, some 30 parking spaces for coaches would be required for all the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD. Under the current planning for WKCD, a total of 42 coach parking spaces would be provided. | |
| | | Mr YIU considered the proposed provision of some 40 parking spaces for coaches inadequate and urged WKCDA to consider increasing the provision of such spaces in WKCD. He stressed that in planning the provision of coach parking spaces in WKCD, WKCDA should take into account not only the demand arising from the various facilities in WKCD but also the demand arising from neighbouring districts of WKCD (e.g. Tsim Sha Tsui), given the acute shortage of coach parking spaces in these districts. The Chairman also cautioned that the planned provision of coach parking spaces in WKCD should also cater for the situation where performances at different arts and cultural venues within the site ended at the same time. | |
| | | In response to Mr YIU's enquiry about whether WKCDA would consider setting up bazaars/night markets to enhance the vibrancy of WKCD and draw visitors to the site both day and night, WKCDA advised that there would be RDE facilities in WKCD which would be open during the day and a significant part of the night. In formulating the mode of operation including the opening hours of such facilities, due regard would be given to, among others, the needs and concerns of the office and residential developments in the vicinity, so as to create a vibrant atmosphere and welcoming environment in WKCD for both tourists and the local community. | |
| 010318 - 011125 | Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCDA Ms Emily LAU | The Deputy Chairman enquired about the following – (a) in respect of the additional GFA arising from the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site which would be allocated to WKCDA, whether and how the revenue generated from the additional facilities would help WKCDA address the issue of additional construction cost, and details of WKCDA's progress in exploring the possibility of working with developers on the additional commercial related facilities; and | |
| | | (b) the expected timing for consideration of the planning application by TPB and the major views of objection expected to be received from members of the public. | |
| | | WKCDA responded that – | |

| Time marker | Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|---|--|-----------------|
| | | (a) one of the additional facilities proposed to be provided was a hostel for visiting artists, and the possibility of delivering the facility through joint venture with private developers was being explored. The additional GFA arising from the proposal would also allow the provision of more RDE facilities in WKCD, which would help generate more rental proceeds for WKCDA to meet the operating costs of the arts and cultural facilities; and | |
| | | (b) consultation meetings had been held with the Harbourfront Commission, YTMDC and local resident representatives on the planning application and no substantive issues of concern had been raised so far. | |
| | | The Administration/WKCDA was requested to explain in more detail whether and how the additional revenue generated from the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site would help WKCDA meet the construction costs of the additional facilities arising from the proposal and/or other costs incurred in implementing the WKCD project. | Admin/WKCDA |
| 011126 - 012019 | Chairman Mr IP Kwok-him WKCDA MVA Hong Kong Ltd | Mr IP Kwok-him said that the traffic congestion problems in the West Kowloon area was a long-standing issue which had been discussed and followed up by LegCo for years, and he did not consider that proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site would have substantial impact on the traffic conditions in the West Kowloon area. He added that while he supported the current proposal to optimize the utilization of the WKCD site, he considered that WKCDA should explain in more detail the potential benefits of the proposal on the WKCD development. | |
| | | The Chairman expressed doubt over the reliability of WKCDA's estimation on the increase in traffic generation in WKCD resulting from the proposal (i.e. 456 passenger car units ("pcu")/hour during the morning peak hours and 429 pcu/hour during the evening peak hours). He raised the following enquiries – | |
| | | (a) whether WKCDA's assessment on the traffic generation in WKCD had taken into account the peak traffic time when audience were in a hurry to get to WKCD before the start of the shows staged at the performance venues on the site; | |
| | | (b) whether the estimated traffic generation had covered buses and coaches travelling to/from WKCD; and | |
| | | (c) despite the availability of five vehicular accesses in WKCD, whether due regard had been given to the possibility that the traffic to be generated in WKCD would ultimately be concentrated on the local road | |

| Time marker | Speaker(s) | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|-------------------------------------|--|-----------------|
| | | network in nearby old districts, which might further add to the heavy traffic pressure on such areas. | |
| | | WKCDA's traffic consultant advised that – | |
| | | (a) in assessing the traffic generation in WKCD during the evening peak hours, account had been taken of the scenarios where people returned home after work and where people came to WKCD to attend the shows at various arts and cultural venues, among others; and | |
| | | (b) five at-grade/underground/elevated vehicular accesses connecting to different major roads had been planned in WKCD. Estimation on the split of WKCD traffic generation to/from various districts, which was generated from the territory-wide transport forecasting model, had been covered in the traffic impact assessment conducted for the proposal. | |
| | | The Administration/WKCDA was requested to provide further details of the traffic impact assessment results, including the impact on the adjacent road networks as a result of the proposal and the proposed traffic improvement measures to cope with the increasing traffic demand in the West Kowloon area arising from the proposal. | Admin/WKCDA |
| 012020 - 012448 | Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA | Dr Helena WONG suggested that instead of holding consultation meetings with Owners' Committees/residents' representatives, WKCDA should consider gauging the views of the local residents more directly through, for instance, issuing information pamphlets on matters relating to the WKCD project to the residents. | |
| | | Members agreed that – | Clerk |
| | | (a) a meeting be scheduled for April 2014 to further discuss issues relating to the traffic impact assessment of the planning application; and | |
| | | (b) representatives of the bureau(x)/department(s) overseeing transport matters be requested to attend the meeting. | |
| 012449 - 012524 | Chairman Mr Frankie YICK | Mr Frankie YICK suggested that in planning the provision of coach parking spaces in WKCD, WKCDA should take into account the consideration that the waterfront promenade in WKCD would be an ideal location for watching "A Symphony of Lights", which was a very popular activity among tourists. | |

| Agenda Iten | n III - Update on the dev | velopment of Xiqu Centre | |
|--------------------|---|--|--|
| 012525 - 014456 | Chairman Admin Bing Thom Architects WKCDA | Powerpoint presentation by WKCDA and its design architect ("the design architect") on the progress of development of Xiqu Centre [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1153/13-14(03) and CB(2)1198/13-14(02)]. | |
| 014457 - 014953 | Chairman Mr Frankie YICK Admin WKCDA | Mr Frankie YICK expressed appreciation of the design of Xiqu Centre, especially the inclusion of Tea House as part of its facilities. Pointing out the acute shortage of performance venues in Hong Kong, Mr YICK asked whether the Administration would consider making available the Yau Ma Tei Theatre ("YMTT") and the Ko Shan Theatre New Wing ("KSTNW"), which were planned to present Xiqu performances, for the staging of performances in other art forms such as drama after the opening of Xiqu Centre in WKCD. | |
| | | The Administration responded that – (a) the opening of Xiqu Centre would help address the keen demand for venues for the staging of Xiqu performances: | |
| | | performances; (b) similar to Xiqu Centre, KSTNW was not positioned as a venue solely for Xiqu performances, whereas YMTT was currently used mainly for Xiqu performances by budding Xiqu artists /troupes and related training activities; and | |
| | | (c) as for KSTNW which was scheduled to open in 2014, while priority would be given to Xiqu performances and activities, it would also be open for hire for the staging of performances and events in other art forms. | |
| | | In response to Mr YICK's enquiry about the governance and management structure of Xiqu Centre, WKCDA advised that having considered the views of the Xiqu community, it would not engage a single Xiqu troupe to take on a residency role at Xiqu Centre. Instead, a dedicated Artistic Director would be appointed to take charge of the artistic direction of the venue and forge collaborations with different Xiqu troupes. | |
| 014954 - 015451 | Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen WKCDA | Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered it important for WKCDA to control the construction cost of Xiqu Centre while at the same time striving to maintain the overall function and quality of the facilities contained therein. Mr CHAN also sought the following information – | |
| | | (a) elaboration on "streamlining the vertical transport design after vertical transport study", a value engineering strategy adopted by WKCDA referred to in paragraph 6(b) of WKCDA's paper; | |
| | | (b) whether the reduction of the RDE spaces in Xiqu Centre sought mainly to alleviate the over-budget | |

| | | situation of the project, and the basis on which WKCDA determined which RDE spaces in Xiqu Centre were of less value and should be removed; and (c) reasons for the drop in the attendance of the West Kowloon Bamboo Theatre from 100 000 in 2013 to 63 000 in 2014. | |
|--------------------|---|---|-------|
| | | WKCDA advised that – | |
| | | (a) the vertical traffic study aimed to analyse how visitors would make use of the escalators and lifts to be provided in Xiqu Centre and measures to enhance the efficiency of such facilities; | |
| | | (b) upon the findings and recommendations of a consultancy study conducted on the provision of RDE facilities in Xiqu Centre, WKCDA had decided to remove some of the less valuable RDE spaces on the upper floors of Xiqu Centre, so as to enhance the overall efficiency of the provision of such facilities in the Centre; and | |
| | | (c) the West Kowloon Bamboo Theatre was built on the site of Xiqu Centre in 2013 and the attendance of 100 000 covered both the audience for the various performances staged as well as the participants of the exhibition held on the Xiqu Centre Design Competition. As the construction works of Xiqu Centre commenced in September 2013, the event was relocated to the West Kowloon Waterfront Promenade in 2014 featuring mainly Chinese opera programmes. The attendance rates for the various performances staged during the West Kowloon Bamboo Theatre were over 85% in both 2013 and 2014. | |
| 015452 - 020134 | Chairman Ms Emily LAU Bing Thom Architects | Ms Emily LAU expressed appreciation of the external and interior designs of Xiqu Centre. Ms LAU also raised the following questions and request – | |
| | WKCDA | (a) how WKCDA would control the project cost of Xiqu Centre to ensure its completion within the target budget; | |
| | | (b) whether any difficulty was envisaged in cleaning and maintaining the external building façade of Xiqu Centre; and | |
| | | (c) the Artistic Director and General Manager of Xiqu Centre, upon their appointments, should attend a meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to brief members on their plans for the promotion of software development as well as the management and operation of Xiqu Centre in preparation for the commissioning of the venue. | WKCDA |

The design architect assured members that the project team would make every effort to deliver Xiqu Centre project and seek to achieve the best balance between controlling the project cost and maintaining the quality and function of the Centre.

In response to Ms LAU's enquiries about the feasibility of transporting the building materials for Xiqu Centre to the works site by marine vessels so as to avoid adding pressure on the heavy road traffic in the West Kowloon area and whether any assistance would be required from the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") in this regard, WKCDA advised that it had maintained close liaison with MTRCL and relevant government departments on the planning and construction of WKCD to ensure that appropriate arrangements were in place to facilitate the smooth implementation of the WKCD project.

Ms LAU suggested that MTRCL should be requested to render all necessary assistance to WKCDA to facilitate the construction works of the WKCD project.

020135 -021024 Chairman
Dr Helena WONG
Admin
Bing Thom
Architects
WKCDA

Dr Helena WONG enquired about the reasons for installing a balustrade along the ramp in the covered plaza of Xiqu Centre as shown in the powerpoint presentation materials [LC Paper No. CB(2)1198/13-14(02)]. She suggested that the passage leading to the staircase beside the ramp be widened, and that handrails be installed at the ramp and the staircase to meet the needs of the elderly.

The design architect advised that the ramp served to provide a barrier-free access from the lower plaza to the upper plaza. It would be installed with translucent glass balustrade. The passage leading to the staircase situated next to the ramp which led to the upper plaza would be more than 3 metres wide. As it was expected that Xiqu Centre would appeal to elderly people in particular, the facilities in the Centre had been designed with a focus on facilitating universal access.

Dr WONG further sought the following information –

- (a) details of the arts education facilities and rehearsal and training spaces to be provided in Xiqu Centre, including whether a multi-media library with appropriate audio-visual facilities would be set up to facilitate access to collections of Xiqu performances and Xiqu-related educational software by students and members of the public; and
- (b) the respective functions of YMTT and Xiqu Centre and the coordination between the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") and WKCDA in optimizing the usage of the two venues.

| | | WKCDA advised that an entire floor of Xiqu Centre would be dedicated to the provision of arts education as well as rehearsal and training facilities, which included a 120-seat seminar room, four small practice rooms, two medium and two large rehearsal rooms. WKCDA would maintain communication and explore collaboration with different Xiqu groups, educational institutes and relevant government departments on the organization of Xiqu-related education and training activities in Xiqu Centre. The Administration advised that at present, YMTT had the Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong ("CAAHK") as its venue partner and numerous Xiqu performances as well as education and training activities had been held at YMTT. Given the keen demand for Xiqu venues in the territory, Xiqu Centre and YMTT were expected to complement each other in the provision of venue support for the conduct of Xiqu performances and related training and rehearsal activities. | |
|--------------------|-------------------------------------|---|--|
| 021025 - 021744 | Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCDA | The Deputy Chairman expressed appreciation of the design of Xiqu Centre and the facilities included therein. He considered that WKCDA should seek to develop Xiqu as a performing art form of high artistic as well as commercial values, such that more people would be interested in paying to watch Xiqu performances and patronizing this art form, which would in turn support its further development. The Deputy Chairman also raised the following enquiries – | |
| | | (a) whether the Artistic Director of Xiqu Centre was responsible to the Board of WKCDA, and whether he/she would be responsible for making decisions on matters relating to the artistic output of the Centre, and would not be bound to take the advice of the advisory committee to be set up as referred to in paragraph 15 of WKCDA's paper; | |
| | | (b) whether WKCDA would consider inviting seasoned Xiqu artists from places with rich Xiqu culture to serve as resident artists at Xiqu Centre, so as to bring more high quality Xiqu performances to Hong Kong and facilitate the sharing of experience and skills with young local Xiqu talents; and | |
| | | (c) whether WKCDA had formulated any plans for promoting arts education and building audience for Xiqu Centre. | |
| 021745 - 022059 | Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCDA | Mr YIU Si-wing considered that apart from establishing the key artistic objectives for Xiqu Centre, WKCDA should also draw up quantifiable and objective indicators (e.g. target number and types of Xiqu performances to be | |

| | | staged, target number of audiences attending the performances and target revenue to be generated each year) to facilitate review of the operation and evaluation of the performance of Xiqu Centre in different aspects. WKCDA advised that following the establishment of the artistic positioning and the governance and management structure of Xiqu Centre, it was formulating a suitable business plan for the Centre that would actively support its artistic visions. Issues such as hire charges for the facilities in the Centre, charges for performances and number of performances to be staged, etc. would be considered. The proposed business strategy would be submitted to the Board of WKCDA for consideration and endorsement within 2014. | |
|--------------------|--|---|--|
| 022100 - 022524 | Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCDA | In response to Mr Tony TSE's enquiries about the value engineering strategies for Xiqu Centre as referred to in paragraph 6(c) and (d) of WKCDA's paper, WKCDA advised that – (a) according to the consultancy study conducted on the provision of RDE facilities in Xiqu Centre, the RDE spaces on the upper floors of the Centre were generally of less value than those on the ground floor given the lower pedestrian volumes. The removal of the less efficient RDE spaces on the upper floors would help enhance the overall efficiency of the provision of such spaces in Xiqu Centre; and (b) workshops had been held with the shortlisted contractors to solicit their views and suggestions on ways to streamline the design and construction methodology for Xiqu Centre. WKCDA would take into account the views and suggestions received in enhancing the efficiency of the design and construction of the Centre. | |
| 022525 - 023130 | Chairman WKCDA Bing Thom Architects | The Chairman made the following comment and enquiries – (a) while the architectural design of Xiqu Centre was aesthetically and visually pleasing, it appeared to be lacking in or unable to manifest traditional Xiqu elements; (b) whether handrails would be installed at the ramps and staircases and whether any lifts would be provided in Xiqu Centre to meet the needs of persons with disabilities and the elderly; and (c) whether the current interior design of Main Theatre with multiple curved structures on the walls would have any impact on the acoustic effect in the theatre. The design architect responded that – | |

| | | (a) there might be different views as to what should be an appropriate physical expression of Xiqu. While the building of Xiqu Centre would provide a background for such expression, it would be for the Artistic Director, performers, audience and students, etc. coming to Xiqu Centre to manifest the true spirit of Xiqu and to bring the building to life after its opening; (b) escalators, lifts, as well as staircases and ramps with handrails would be provided in Xiqu Centre to satisfy all public access requirements; and (c) Main Theatre was designed specifically for the staging of Xiqu performances, where performers would be able to perform without microphones and speakers. The curved structures in the theatre would allow the sound to come through and be scattered and dispersed naturally. | |
|--------------------|--|---|--|
| 023131 - 023503 | Chairman Dr Helena WONG Bing Thom Architects WKCDA | Dr Helena WONG enquired whether the balustrade of the ramp in the covered plaza would hinder access to the staircase leading to the upper plaza. She also reiterated her view that a multi-media library should be set up in Xiqu Centre. | |
| | | The design architect advised that the balustrade was a railing which visitors might hold on to when walking along the ramp. | |
| | | WKCDA advised that while it had no plans to set up a new Xiqu archive, it had been in discussion with various Xiqu groups (e.g. CAAHK), educational institutes and museums in Hong Kong to explore the possibility of loaning their Xiqu-related information and records to WKCDA for display at exhibitions and educational activities to be held in Xiqu Centre. | |
| 023504 - 023717 | Chairman Ms Emily LAU WKCDA | Ms Emily LAU suggested that WKCDA should provide more briefings/information to the media to enhance understanding of the design concepts of Xiqu Centre and promote awareness of the target completion of the Centre in 2016. | |
| | | In response to Ms LAU's enquiry about WKCDA's timetable for the appointment of the Artistic Director and General Manager of Xiqu Centre, WKCDA advised that pending the endorsement of the business plan for Xiqu Centre by the Board of WKCDA, it would tentatively kick-start the search for potential candidates for Artistic Director and General Manager within the 2014-2015 financial year. | |
| 023718 - 023922 | Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCDA | In response to the Deputy Chairman's earlier enquiries, WKCDA advised that – | |

| | | (a) while the advisory committee to be set up would advise on various matters in relation to the management and operation of Xiqu Centre, the Artistic Director to be appointed would take charge of the artistic direction and be responsible for the artistic output of the venue. He/she was an employee of WKCDA and would be responsible to the management and the Board of WKCDA; and (b) with the increased GFA generated by the proposed minor relaxation of development intensity of the WKCD site, it was hoped that a hostel for visiting artists could be built in WKCD so that seasoned experts/artists of different art forms and from different parts of the world could be invited to visit and stay in WKCD for longer periods of time. This would not only foster cultural exchange but also enhance the international outlook of WKCD. | |
|--------------------|---|--|--------------------|
| 023923 - 024045 | Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA Admin | Dr Helena WONG suggested that apart from Artistic Director and General Manager, WKCDA should also engage an expert in Xiqu education to take charge of matters relating to the promotion of Xiqu education, audience building and community participation. | |
| 024046 - 024131 | Chairman | The Chairman considered that WKCDA should attach importance to making available appropriate set-ups in the theatres of Xiqu Centre to achieve the best acoustic effects. | |
| Agenda Iter | m IV - Artistic characte Cultural District | ristic and partnership framework of performing arts venues i | n the West Kowloon |
| 024132 - 025350 | Chairman WKCDA | Briefing and powerpoint presentation by WKCDA on the proposed facility and artistic partnership framework for the performing arts ("PA") venues in WKCD [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1153/13-14(05) and CB(2)1198/13-14(03)]. Extension of meeting for 15 minutes | |
| 025351 - 025814 | Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCDA | Mr YIU Si-wing considered that many arts groups would be interested in applying to become Resident Partners ("RPs") of the PA venues in WKCD, given that RPs would have priority access to the venues and be provided with office accommodation in the venues. He made the following enquiries – (a) whether a cap would be set on the number of RPs to | |
| | | (a) whether a cap would be set on the number of Kr's to be appointed;(b) how WKCDA would devise the eligibility criteria for becoming RPs; | |
| | | (c) whether any mechanism would be put in place to ensure that the selection of RPs would be conducted in a fair manner; and | |

(d) whether WKCDA would consider changing the term of commitment required of RPs from "three to five years" to "not more than five years", so as to enhance clarity and facilitate the long-term resource planning of arts groups interested in becoming RPs. WKCDA advised that -(a) it would first develop and establish the artistic positioning and business model for each PA venue in WKCD, based on which the requirements to be fulfilled for becoming RPs would be drawn up. A "Request for Proposals" would then be issued to invite proposals from local professional PA companies for becoming RPs, and an open, objective and professional mechanism would be set up under the WKCDA Board's supervision for the selection of RPs: (b) while it had initially proposed a three-to-five year term of commitment for RPs, it would continue to listen to views before finalizing the details of the RP arrangements; and (c) the selection and appointment of RPs would be conducted progressively and subject to the progress of development of individual PA venues. WKCDA would report relevant issues to the Joint Subcommittee in due course. The Chairman suggested that WKCDA should also consider the need to introduce an "entry and exit mechanism" for RPs, so as to allow flexibility and ensure effectiveness in the management and operation of the PA venues. 025815 -The Deputy Chairman raised the following view and Chairman 030445 Deputy Chairman enquiry -Admin (a) given that the current funding mechanism for PA **WKCDA** groups in Hong Kong was not conducive to the development of avant garde and non-mainstream art forms, he hoped that WKCD would become a platform for nurturing such creative art forms for the appreciation of the public; and (b) whether WKCDA would implement an artistic accountability system at the PA venues in WKCD, under which the artistic directors or RPs appointed would be tasked to take charge of and be responsible for the artistic programming and operation of the venues. WKCDA responded that it would establish the artistic positioning for each PA venue in WKCD and develop a business model for each venue which supported its artistic positioning. The artistic director/other dedicated staff or

| | | RP appointed for each PA venue would be tasked to take charge of the artistic direction of the venue, establish and deliver the vision and objectives of the venue in line with its artistic positioning, and be responsible for the artistic output and overall image of the venue. | |
|--------------------|-----------------------------------|---|--|
| 030446 - 030854 | Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA | Dr Helena WONG raised the following views and enquiry in respect of the selection and appointment of RPs – | |
| | | (a) whether upper and lower limits would be set on the number of RPs to be appointed; | |
| | | (b) the eligibility criteria for becoming RPs should not be drawn up in such a way that small local arts groups would be deprived of the opportunity to become RPs; and | |
| | | (c) to hold the RPs responsible for the effective operation of the PA venues, the first term of appointment of RPs should be relatively short, say, two years, upon the expiry of which WKCDA should review critically the performance of the appointed RPs against a set of prescribed performance indicators. Re-appointment of RPs with satisfactory performance for a period of three years might be considered. | |
| | | Dr WONG further remarked that apart from planning the provision of various PA programmes at indoor venues, WKCDA should also attach importance to facilitating the staging of street performances in the public open space of WKCD, so as to enhance the vibrancy of WKCD. In particular, WKCDA should seek to make available appropriate space, both indoor and outdoor, for artistic performances and expressions by small arts groups and artists. | |
| | | WKCDA advised that – | |
| | | (a) there were a number of small and medium-sized PA facilities in WKCD which were suitable for use by small and medium arts groups. They might also consider to apply to become partners of the PA venues concerned; and | |
| | | (b) given that the engagement of RPs also involved long-term resource commitment on the part of WKCDA, it would carefully consider and devise an appropriate term of appointment of RPs in consultation with the relevant stakeholders. | |
| 030855 - 031743 | Chairman Ms Emily LAU Admin | Ms Emily LAU expressed the following views – | |
| | | (a) the partnership framework for the PA venues in WKCD should be carefully devised such that both major and small arts groups would be provided with the opportunity to become partners of the venues; and | |

031744 -

032454

Chairman

Admin WKCDA

Ms Emily LAU

(b) given that the various PA venues in WKCD would only be delivered in phases starting from 2015-2016, the Administration should seek to ensure more effective coordination between LCSD and WKCDA in the development and management of PA venues in Hong Kong, so as to better address the venue shortage problem currently faced by local arts groups and artists. Ms LAU also suggested that local arts groups/artists be invited to express views on relevant issues at a future meeting of the Joint Subcommittee. The Administration advised that – (a) numerous discussions had been held among WKCDA, LCSD and the nine major PA groups on the proposed partnership framework for the PA venues in WKCD. While some of the major PA groups had indicated that they preferred maintaining their existing partnership with LCSD venues, the availability of more comprehensive venue support at some of the PA venues in WKCD, including the provision of office accommodation at the venues, might attract some major PA groups which were currently LCSD venue partners to become partners of those PA venues in WKCD. This might, in turn, help release some LCSD venues for use by other small and medium arts groups; and (b) in tandem with the development of the PA venues in WKCD, a Cross District Community Cultural Centre in Kowloon East had been planned and was expected to be commissioned around 2019-2020. Administration did not envisage any great difficulty in the coordination between LCSD and WKCDA in the development and management of PA venues, as there should be no direct competition between LCSD venues and WKCD venues which had their own respective positioning. The new PA venues to be developed, be it by LCSD or WKCDA, should help to alleviate the shortage of PA venues and meet the increasing need for performing space in the territory. The Chairman raised the following concern and suggestion – (a) given the small audience base of dance programmes, whether it was appropriate to designate "dance" as the preferred art form at the Lyric Theatre, which had a seating capacity of 1 200 and was equipped with a resident company centre; and

(b) while the PA venues in WKCD should seek primarily to meet the venue needs of local arts groups and

support local productions, WKCDA should also foster closer collaboration and partnership with overseas arts groups, so as to facilitate the staging of high quality overseas productions in WKCD and enhance WKCD's status as a world-class arts and cultural hub.

Ms Emily LAU shared the Chairman's concern that most LCSD venues were usually available for hire only for a short period of time, which was not conducive to attracting overseas arts groups to stage large scale arts and cultural programmes in Hong Kong.

The Administration responded that invitations had been extended to many overseas arts groups to present arts and cultural programmes in the Hong Kong Arts Festival and numerous overseas productions had been staged in the past years. While both local and overseas arts groups were welcome to stage performances at LCSD venues, LCSD was unable to offer a very long hire period (say six months) for its venues to individual arts groups given the keen demand for PA venues in Hong Kong.

In response to Ms LAU's concern about the low utilization rate of some PA venues under the management of LCSD, the Administration advised that while the utilization rate of some LCSD venues in the New Territories was relatively lower, an average utilization rate of over 90% was recorded in the LCSD venues in the urban areas.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
18 June 2014