

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No.CB(2)2370/13-14  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/12

**Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development**

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation  
of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting  
held on Wednesday, 23 July 2014, at 11:00 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon YIU Si-wing  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Members absent** : Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming

**Public Officers attending** : Items I and II

Home Affairs Bureau

Mrs Sorais LEE KWAN Siu-kuen  
Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

Ms Sabrina LAW Chung  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West  
Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH  
Chief Executive Officer

Dr CHAN Man-wai  
Executive Director, Project Delivery

Ms Bonny WONG  
Director, Chief Executive Officer's Office

Item I

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Dr Lars NITTVE  
Executive Director, M+

Item II

West 8

Mr Martin BIEWENGA  
Partner

Dennis Lau & Ng Chun Man Architects and Engineers (HK) Ltd

Mr CHEUNG Kwong-wing  
Director

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Amy YU  
Chief Council Secretary (2)6

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Bonny LOO  
Assistant Legal Adviser 3

Miss Jasmine TAM  
Senior Council Secretary (2)8

Miss Meisy KWOK  
Legislative Assistant (2)6

---

**I. Update on the development of M+**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)2071/13-14(01)-(02))

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") updated members on the progress of M+ development, details of which were set out in WKCD's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)2071/13-14(01)).

*(Post-meeting note: The powerpoint presentation material provided by WKCD was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)2124/13-14(01) on 23 July 2014.)*

Admin/  
WKCD

3. The Joint Subcommittee requested the Administration/WKCD to -

- (a) explain the concept and characteristics of, as well as meaning to be conveyed by, the current architectural design of M+ as the winning design of the M+ Design Competition;
- (b) outline the positioning of M+ in the context of Hong Kong, Asia and beyond which should guide the collection strategy and acquisition policy of M+;
- (c) explain the need for and the rationale behind the current proposal for implementing the governance of M+, and not the other arts and cultural venues in the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD"), through the establishment of a wholly owned subsidiary company under WKCD; and respond to members' concerns about whether the Administration/WKCD Board would be able to retain effective monitoring and control over the operation of M+, as well as whether the funding allocation and expenditure of M+ would be subject to monitoring by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") under the proposed governance structure; and
- (d) provide estimation on the increase in the construction cost of M+ for every month that consideration by the Finance Committee of the funding application for the advance public infrastructure works in the M+ portion of the integrated basement was deferred.

**II. Update on the Park development – design, use and management**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)2071/13-14(03)-(04), CB(2)2104/13-14(01) and

Action

CB(2)2109/13-14(01))

4. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, WKCD and its consultant briefed members on the latest concept design for the Park of WKCD as well as the use and management of the Park in preparation of the relevant bylaws, details of which were set out in WKCD's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)2071/13-14(03)).

*(Post-meeting note: The powerpoint presentation material provided by WKCD was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)2124/13-14(02) on 23 July 2014.)*

WKCD 5. At the request of Miss CHAN Yuen-han, WKCD undertook to provide a physical model of the Park to facilitate the Joint Subcommittee's understanding of the Park design and configuration.

Admin/  
WKCD 6. The Administration/WKCD were requested to consult the Joint Subcommittee on the proposed Park bylaws before they were introduced into LegCo in early 2015.

**III. Extension of period of work of the Joint Subcommittee**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)2071/13-14(05))

7. Members agreed that the Joint Subcommittee should seek approval for extension of its work in the 2014-2015 legislative session.

**IV. Any other business**

8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:53 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
30 September 2014

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor  
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project  
held on Wednesday, 23 July 2014, at 11:00 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
<i>Agenda Item I - Update on the development of M+</i>			
000300 - 002959	Chairman WKCDA	Chairman's opening remarks  Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") on the latest progress in the development of M+ [LC Paper Nos. CB(2) 2071/13-14(01) and CB(2) 2124/13-14(01)].	
003000 - 003547	Dr Helena WONG WKCDA	<p>Dr Helena WONG raised the following view and enquiries –</p> <p>(a) to realize its mission to focus on the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century visual culture from a Hong Kong perspective, M+ should place more emphasis on featuring local visual culture and history in its collection strategy and curatorial direction;</p> <p>(b) given that public processions and demonstrations were a major characteristic of Hong Kong's culture, whether M+ had any plans to acquire relevant works as part of its collection on Hong Kong Visual Culture and Moving Image and set up a dedicated gallery for the display of such works; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration/WKCDA should provide details on the composition of the M+ Board for the wholly owned subsidiary company to be set up under WKCDA and explain why it was the M+ Board, and not the Board of WKCDA, which was tasked to develop the mandate/mission and vision for M+.</p> <p>WKCDA advised that –</p> <p>(a) it was mindful that M+ should not be like any other museums overseas and should be unique to Hong Kong. While the content of M+ was rooted in and meant to reflect Hong Kong, M+ was not only a museum about Hong Kong and should be distinct from other local museums (e.g. Hong Kong Museum of Art and Hong Kong Heritage Museum) in that it sought to develop content from a Hong Kong perspective with a global vision; and</p> <p>(b) the Interim Acquisition Committee ("IAC") had discussed the roadmap for the Moving Image collection of M+ and Ms Nansun SHI, member of IAC, had indicated support for inclusion of important documentary films/materials into the M+ Collection.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
003548 - 004045	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCDA	<p>In response to Mr YIU Si-wing's enquiry about the total number of audience as well as the ratio between local and non-local audience who had attended the audience-building programmes/activities organized by M+, WKCDA advised that –</p> <p>(a) "Mobile M+: INFLATION!" exhibition and "Building M+: The Museum and Architecture Collection" exhibition had respectively attracted about 150 000 and 20 000 visitors, whereas the other exhibitions organized by M+ had recorded a total attendance of about 10 000 to 20 000;</p> <p>(b) as regards "Mobile M+: NEONSIGNS.HK" project which was an interactive, online exhibition dedicated to exploring, mapping and documenting Hong Kong's neon signs, the dedicated website set up for the project had attracted about 300 000 unique visits so far and more than 4 000 individuals had submitted images of their favourite neon signs in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(c) while the various pre-opening exhibition programmes were attended mostly by Hong Kong people, M+ had been building up its status and standing internationally and had received many visit requests from overseas artists/organizations.</p> <p>Referring to the revised completion date for M+ as mentioned in paragraph 11 of WKCDA's paper, Mr YIU Si-wing requested the Administration/WKCDA to provide estimation on the increase in the construction cost of M+ for every month that consideration by the Finance Committee of the funding application for the advance public infrastructure works in the M+ portion of the integrated basement was deferred.</p>	<b>Admin/ WKCDA</b>
004046 - 004634	Deputy Chairman WKCDA	<p>The Deputy Chairman raised the following enquiries –</p> <p>(a) M+'s plans/strategies, especially in terms of its curatorial policy/arrangements, for grooming local visual culture artists and bringing their works to the public and the international arts community; and</p> <p>(b) whether the proposed model of implementing the governance of M+ through the establishment of a wholly owned subsidiary company under WKCDA would be applicable to other arts and cultural venues of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD"), and whether an artistic accountability system would be implemented under the proposed governance model.</p> <p>WKCDA advised that –</p> <p>(a) M+ would be a platform for Hong Kong artists just as</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>any national museum would be for its artists. M+ hoped to provide suitable platform and backing for talented Hong Kong artists to showcase their works to the public as well as to the international arts community. It would also bring artists from other parts of the world to Hong Kong to present their works to the local community, providing a platform for artistic inspiration and exchanges; and</p> <p>(b) while the proposed governance structure of M+ would help enhance public perception of the artistic freedom and curatorial independence of M+, strengthen the capacity of M+ to raise funds and solicit donations in artworks, and put M+ on a similar basis with other major contemporary arts museums around the world, it should not be presumed that the same governance model would be adopted for other arts and cultural venues of WKCD. WKCD would consider how these venues should be managed and determine the best governance and business model for each venue.</p> <p>In response to the Deputy Chairman's further enquiry, WKCD advised that the Chairman of the M+ Board for the wholly owned subsidiary company to be set up would be appointed by the WKCD Board.</p>	
004635 - 005258	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin WKCD	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that she was not convinced of the justifications provided by WKCD for its proposal to establish a wholly owned subsidiary company to implement the governance of M+. She was concerned whether the Administration/WKCD Board would be able to retain effective monitoring and control over the operation of M+ under the proposed governance structure. The Chairman shared such concern and sought clarification whether the funding allocation and expenditure of M+ would be subject to monitoring by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") under the proposed governance structure.</p> <p>The Administration responded that –</p> <p>(a) it agreed to WKCD's proposal to establish a wholly owned subsidiary company to implement the governance of M+, which was generally in line with the arrangements adopted by other major museums around the world; and</p> <p>(b) given that under the proposed governance structure, the budget and business plan of M+ would be subject to the approval of the WKCD Board and M+'s management and governance would need to be compliant with WKCD's policies, the Administration was of the view that effective controls would be in place.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		The Administration/WKCDA was requested to explain in writing the need for and the rationale behind the proposed governance structure of M+; and respond to members' concerns about the proposal.	<b>Admin/ WKCD</b>
005259 - 005740	Ms Cyd HO WKCD	<p>Ms Cyd HO expressed appreciation of WKCD's efforts in securing donations to M+. She also raised the following views and enquiries –</p> <p>(a) as compared with its architectural design of the exterior of the building, the interior design of a museum was even more important as it should allow flexibility for the staging of different types of exhibitions and enable audience to have an interactive experience in viewing the exhibitions. She hoped that WKCD would provide information on the interior design of M+ as soon as practicable;</p> <p>(b) given that many valuable images of the streets of Hong Kong could be found from old Hong Kong films, M+ should consider exploring collaborations with the Hong Kong Film Archive in identifying such images and incorporating them into the M+ Collection as appropriate; and</p> <p>(c) as WKCD had stated in its paper that one of the purposes of implementing the governance of M+ through the establishment of a wholly-owned subsidiary company was to remove legal ambiguity in the eyes of people dealing with M+, WKCD should advise who these people were and explain clearly the legal ambiguity concerned.</p> <p>WKCD reiterated that to enhance the capacity of M+ for soliciting donations from prospective donors, it was important for M+ to be perceived as an independent institution which operated on the same basis with other major museums around the world. Furthermore, there was strong in-principle support from the local arts community for establishing the governance structure of M+ on a different basis from other arts and cultural venues in Hong Kong. In WKCD's view, the current proposal to implement the governance of M+ through the establishment of a wholly-owned subsidiary company under WKCD would allow for more effective and professional operation of M+, while ensuring that a close relationship was maintained between M+ and the WKCD Board.</p>	
005741 - 010217	Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCD	<p>Ms Claudia MO raised the following enquiry and view –</p> <p>(a) whether the funding proposals of M+ would need to go through LegCo under the proposed governance structure of M+; and</p> <p>(b) the architectural design of M+ was unimpressive.</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>WKCD A responded that –</p> <p>(a) irrespective of the final governance structures to be adopted for M+ and other arts and cultural venues of WKCD, the development and future operation of the venues would remain under the scrutiny of LegCo. While part of M+'s funding would come from the endowment fund managed by WKCD A and its business plan would be subject to the approval of the WKCD A Board, WKCD A would seek to diversify the funding sources of M+ through, for instance, enlisting philanthropic support; and</p> <p>(b) the current architectural design of M+ was selected unanimously by an international Jury Panel of the M+ Design Competition as the winning design and had received positive response both in Hong Kong and from abroad.</p>	
010218 - 010708	Chairman WKCD A	<p>WKCD A was requested to explain in writing –</p> <p>(a) the concept and characteristics of, as well as meaning to be conveyed by, the current architectural design of M+ as the winning design of the M+ Design Competition; and</p> <p>(b) the positioning of M+ in the context of Hong Kong, Asia and beyond which should guide the collection strategy and acquisition policy of M+.</p> <p>WKCD A responded that the M+ Acquisition Policy and information on its collection including all the acquisitions made had been uploaded onto WKCD A's website for public information. Any proposed acquisitions, including both purchases and donations, would need to undergo the same selection, reporting and approval procedures and comply with the strategy and acquisition criteria as set forth in the M+ Acquisition Policy.</p>	<b>WKCD A</b>
<i>Agenda Item II - Update on the Park development – design, use and management</i>			
010709 - 012601	Chairman WKCD A West 8	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by WKCD A and its design consultant ("the consultant") on the latest concept design for the Park of WKCD as well as the use and management of the Park in preparation of the relevant bylaws [LC Paper Nos. CB(2) 2071/13-14(03), CB(2)2109/13-14(01) and CB(2) 2124/13-14(02)].	
012602 - 013202	Chairman Mr Gary FAN WKCD A West 8	<p>Mr Gary FAN raised the following enquiries –</p> <p>(a) why the design of the north-western part of WKCD, which should form part of the Park, was not conducted in parallel with that of the other parts of the Park;</p> <p>(b) given WKCD A's plan to adopt a high proportion of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>soft landscape coverage in developing the Park, whether the area of the sites currently occupied by the Western Harbour Crossing ("WHC") ventilation building and the MTR ventilation building had been reduced to a minimum, and how WKCDA would ensure that the two buildings would be properly integrated with the surrounding green environment;</p> <p>(c) similarities between the concept design of the WKCD Park and that of other famous parks prepared by the consultant, and design features that were unique to the WKCD Park; and</p> <p>(d) whether WKCDA would take into account the views presented in the joint submission on the planning, operation and management of the WKCD Park (LC Paper No. CB(2)2104/13-14(01) in its preparation of the Park bylaws.</p> <p>WKCDA and its consultant advised that –</p> <p>(a) the north-western end of WKCD was currently being occupied mainly by a tree nursery which would become a temporary Park facility scheduled to be open to the public starting from 2015. It was also the site reserved for the Mega Performance Venue/Exhibition Centre ("MPV/EC"), the development programme of which had yet to be confirmed. WKCDA would look into extending the Park into the north-western end of WKCD after the construction of the other parts of the Park was completed and a decision had been made on the development programme for MPV/EC; and</p> <p>(b) given the prominent appearance of the WHC ventilation building and the MTR ventilation building, the Park design team would seek to put more trees and plants around them to make them less noticeable in the Park and integrate with the surrounding landscape setting. WKCDA and the design team were in discussion with the owners of the two buildings on ways to minimize the impact of the buildings and their associated facilities/structures on the overall appearance of the Park.</p>	
013203 - 013653	Deputy Chairman WKCDA	<p>The Deputy Chairman expressed appreciation of the latest concept design for the WKCD Park. He further raised the following views and enquiries –</p> <p>(a) while he agreed to the view that WKCDA should define the vision and mission of the Park before drafting the Park bylaws, he was concerned whether WKCDA would conduct public engagement to refine and enrich the proposed vision and mission of the Park as stated in paragraph 6 of its paper before they</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>were finalized; and</p> <p>(b) when the report on the results of the public survey on the use and management of the Park was expected to be available and the next steps to be taken by WKCD for preparation of the Park bylaws before they were introduced into LegCo in early 2015.</p> <p>WKCD advised that –</p> <p>(a) having considered the views of the public and LegCo that the Park should be as free and open as possible to all people in Hong Kong, it would endeavour to manage the Park with a light hand and encourage a wide range of cultural and leisure uses and activities in the Park, while respecting and balancing the needs of different users;</p> <p>(b) given the vast area of the Park and the potential areas of danger that might need to be dealt with, the Park bylaws to be formulated would enable WKCD to ensure the best interests of public safety and security as well as strike a proper balance among the various activities that would take place in WKCD; and</p> <p>(c) it aimed to finalize the report on the survey results by September 2014 and revert to the Joint Subcommittee on relevant findings thereafter.</p>	
013654 - 014100	Mr Tony TSE WKCD	<p>Mr Tony TSE expressed appreciation of the concept design for the WKCD Park under which all arts and cultural venues and activities in the Park would be integrated and embedded in a rich landscape setting. He also raised the following views –</p> <p>(a) the design of the Park should seek to minimize the visual impact of the WHC ventilation building, the MTR ventilation building and the WHC structures on the overall appearance of the Park; and</p> <p>(b) in preparing the detailed design of the Park, WKCD should seek to enhance pedestrian accessibility to and within the Park having regard to, among others, the construction works being/to be conducted in the Park throughout the development process of WKCD.</p> <p>WKCD responded that accessibility had all along been one of the key planning and design principles underpinning the WKCD project. The current concept design for the Park would enable provision of appropriate forms of transport for, among others, people who were mobility-challenged to get to every part of the Park. Due regard would be given to the need to enhance the accessibility of the Park for all in the detailed design stage.</p>	
014101 -	Chairman	Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that while she considered it	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
014507	Miss CHAN Yuen-han WKCD Admin	<p>necessary for WKCD to draw up bylaws for the management of the Park, it was important to ensure that the bylaws would facilitate, and not unduly restrict, public enjoyment of the Park. She requested the Administration/WKCD to consult the Joint Subcommittee on the proposed bylaws before they were introduced into LegCo in early 2015.</p> <p>The Administration responded that WKCD would consult the Joint Subcommittee on the proposed bylaws before they were introduced into LegCo.</p> <p>At Miss CHAN's request, WKCD undertook to provide a physical model of the Park to facilitate the Joint Subcommittee's understanding of the Park design and configuration.</p>	<p><b>WKCD/ Admin</b></p> <p><b>WKCD</b></p>
014508 - 014903	Chairman Ms Cyd HO WKCD	<p>Ms Cyd HO expressed the following views –</p> <p>(a) the WKCD Park should seek to distinguish itself from other public parks in Hong Kong and undertake a mission to promote and encourage cultural pursuits for all;</p> <p>(b) the layout and the management approach of the WKCD Park should be formulated in such a way that would help create an open and welcoming atmosphere and enable harmonious co-existence of different activities in the Park; and</p> <p>(c) WKCD should take into account the views expressed in the joint submission from 20 organizations and 280 members of the public on the planning, operation and management of the WKCD Park (LC Paper No. CB(2)2104/13-14(01)), and consult the public as well as the arts and cultural sectors on issues relating to the layout and bylaws for the Park.</p> <p>WKCD responded that arrangement would be made for the Park design team to meet with the organizations and members of the public who had signed the joint submission to solicit their views and suggestions on the design, use and management of the Park.</p>	
014904 - 015350	Chairman Mr Gary FAN WKCD	<p>The Chairman raised the following views and request –</p> <p>(a) WKCD should seek to ensure that the design of the WKCD Park would be functional and would facilitate easy access to and within the Park. It should also make available sufficient emergency accesses in different parts of the Park;</p> <p>(b) in formulating the detailed design of the Park, WKCD should consider the appropriate species of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>trees to be planted having regard to, among others, the climate of Hong Kong and the location of WKCD; and</p> <p>(c) WKCDA should provide the model(s) of the Park and consult the Joint Subcommittee on the proposed Park bylaws before they were introduced into LegCo.</p> <p>Mr Gary FAN suggested that to help members visualize the design and configuration of the WKCD Park as well as understand the scale of the various features/facilities in the Park, WKCDA and its consultant could make use of computer graphics to illustrate the design of the Park.</p> <p>WKCDA advised that some 1 000 trees had been planted in the tree nursery in WKCD which sought to, among others, test the resistance of different species of trees to the exposure to wind, rain, salt water and typhoons. According to the consultant, most of the trees in the tree nursery would be able to be used and planted on the WKCD site as the Park developed.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item III - Extension of period of work of the Joint Subcommittee</i>			
015351 - 015428	Chairman	Members agreed that the Joint Subcommittee should seek approval for extension of its work in the 2014-2015 legislative session.	