

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. ESC51/14-15  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/3/2

**Establishment Subcommittee of the Finance Committee**

**Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting**  
**held in Conference Room 1 of Legislative Council Complex**  
**on Wednesday, 7 January 2015, at 8:30 am**

**Members present:**

Hon Kenneth LEUNG (Chairman)  
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon Dennis KWOK  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

**Members absent:**

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Public Officers attending:**

Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)1
Mr Eddie MAK Tak-wai, JP	Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service (1)
Dr KO Wing-man, BBS, JP	Secretary for Food and Health
Mr Richard YUEN, JP	Permanent Secretary for Food and Health (Health)
Mrs Betty FUNG, JP	Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs
Mrs Avia LAI	Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)
Mrs Sorais LEE	Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)
Ms Sabrina LAW	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District)

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Connie SZETO	Chief Council Secretary (1)4
-----------------	------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr Jason KONG	Council Secretary (1)4

Ms Alice CHEUNG  
Miss Yannes HO  
Ms Clara LO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1  
Legislative Assistant (1)6  
Legislative Assistant (1)8

---

Action

The Chairman drew members' attention to the information paper ECI(2014-15)10 which set out the latest changes in the directorate establishment approved since 2002. He then reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP"), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the funding proposals under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the item. He also drew members' attention to RoP 84 on voting in case of direct pecuniary interest.

**EC(2014-15)12 & 12A      Proposed retention of two supernumerary posts of one Administrative Officer Staff Grade B (D3) and one Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (D2) for three years to provide continued directorate support to the Healthcare Planning and Development Office under the Health Branch of the Food and Health Bureau**

2. The Chairman said that at the Subcommittee meeting on 10 December 2014 when members considered the item EC(2014-15)12, which sought to retain two supernumerary posts of one Administrative Officer Staff Grade B and one Administrative Officer Staff Grade C for five years in the Healthcare Planning and Development Office ("HPDO") under the Health Branch of the Food and Health Bureau, Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr WU Chi-wai jointly submitted a proposed motion on the item under paragraph 31A of the Establishment Subcommittee Procedure. In gist, the proposed motion sought to recommend to the Administration to reduce the retention period of the two supernumerary posts from five years to three years. The Chairman pointed out that the Administration had subsequently provided a supplementary note EC(2014-15)12A to amend the retention period of the two posts to three years. In view of the amended proposal, Dr KWOK and Mr WU had withdrawn their proposed motion.

3. Ms Emily LAU commended the Administration for its positive response to members' suggestions. Noting that the Administration had originally proposed to retain the posts for five years, she asked why the Administration decided to revise the proposal.

4. Secretary for Food and Health ("SFH") responded that when the Panel on Health Services was consulted on the proposal, some members were concerned about the need to retain the two posts for five years. The

Administration had explained that the various tasks related to the implementation of the Voluntary Health Insurance Scheme (formerly Health Protection Scheme), such as conducting public consultation and analyzing views and comments received, formulating the detailed legislative proposals and taking the relevant bill through the Legislative Council, and undertaking preparatory work for the implementation of the scheme, would take more than three years to complete. While some Panel members had suggested retaining the two posts for three years, the Administration counter-proposed at the Panel meeting to extend the posts for five years and undertook to review the need for continued retention of the posts after three years. The Administration considered that the above undertaking had addressed the concern of some Panel members, and thus put forward the proposal to the Subcommittee. Having regard to the similar views expressed by some Subcommittee members at the meeting on 10 December 2014 and the undertaking to conduct the said review after three years, the Administration decided to amend the proposal. Ms Emily LAU stressed the need for the Administration to follow the established practices and exercise prudence in submitting funding proposals. She also urged that HPDO expedite its work.

5. The Chairman said that members were invited to consider EC(2014-15)12 & 12A together, i.e. the proposal to retain the two posts for three years. The Chairman then put the item to vote. Members agreed that the Subcommittee should recommend the item to the Finance Committee ("FC") for approval.

**EC(2014-15)13      Proposed retention of two supernumerary posts of one Principal Government Engineer (D3) and one Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (D2) in the Home Affairs Bureau for four years from 1 April 2015 to continue monitoring the implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

6. The Chairman said that the Administration's proposal was to retain two supernumerary posts in the Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB"), including one Principal Government Engineer ("PGE") (designated as Project Manager (HAB)) and one Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (designated as Principal Assistant Secretary (West Kowloon Cultural District) ("PAS(WKCD)")), for four years from 1 April 2015 to continue monitoring the implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") project.

7. The Chairman advised that the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project ("Joint Subcommittee") discussed the proposal at its meeting on 24 November 2014 and did not raise objection to the Administration submitting the proposal to the

Establishment Subcommittee. Members in general expressed concern about the progress of the WKCD project. Some members considered that HAB should assume a more proactive role in steering the development of WKCD including formulating concrete plans to resolve the various problems encountered, and enhance monitoring of the work of the WKCD Authority ("WKCDA") to ensure that it could meet community expectations. Members also enquired about the professional qualifications for the post of Project Manager (HAB) and the duties to be discharged by PAS(WKCD).

*(At 10:12 am, the Chairman announced that the meeting would be extended for not more than 15 minutes. Members agreed.)*

Responsibilities and retention period of the two posts and their roles in the Board and committees of WKCDA

8. Mr MA Fung-kwok said that he was a member of the Board of WKCDA ("the WKCDA Board"). While expressing support for retaining the Project Manager (HAB) post for four years, he opined that the Administration should consider making the PAS(WKCD) post permanent as a number of tasks performed by the post holder, including coordination between WKCDA and other stakeholders on the future development of arts and culture software in WKCD, were on-going in nature. Mr MA also considered that the Administration's representatives in the WKCDA Board and those of relevant departments such as Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") sitting in the committees of WKCDA should assume a more proactive role in giving advice on the implementation of the WKCD project. It was also necessary for the Government officials to enhance their efforts in assisting the work of the Joint Subcommittee.

9. Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs ("PSHA") responded that the Administration would continue to monitor the WKCD project and conduct a holistic review taking into account the progress and evolving needs of the project before the lapse of the proposed four-year extension period of the two posts in March 2019. The review would cover aspects such as the continued need of dedicated directorate support to oversee implementation of the WKCD project. Hence, the Administration considered it prudent at this juncture to maintain the two posts on a supernumerary basis. She added that having regard to the need to coordinate the planning and construction of the public infrastructure works and facilities in WKCD, one of the two supernumerary Administrative Officer ("AO") grade posts created in HAB in 2008 to support the initial operation of WKCDA was turned into the supernumerary PGE post in 2010. On the roles of the Administration's representatives, PSHA responded that representatives from HAB, including Project Manager (HAB), PAS(WKCD), Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3) ("DSHA(3)") and herself, had been attending and actively giving advice at the meetings of the

WKCDA Board and its committees.

10. Mr WU Chi-wai pointed out that as WKCDA was a statutory body, it should be entrusted to develop and implement the WKCD project independently and should carry out its work under prudent financial principles. Project Manager (HAB) and PAS(WKCD), being representatives of the Government, should be responsible for monitoring WKCDA in the performance of its functions and duties as specified in the WKCDA Ordinance ("WKCDAO"). He cautioned that the Administration's involvement in the daily work of WKCDA would lead to duplication of responsibilities. Referring to the operation of other statutory bodies which had full autonomy in their work, Mr Albert CHAN echoed the concern about retaining the two posts which was an indication of a lack of confidence in WKCDA. Mr WU and Mr CHAN further queried how the two posts could effectively monitor the performance of WKCDA, given that the Chairman of the Board of WKCDA was the Chief Secretary for Administration ("CS") who was of a much more senior rank.

11. PSHA explained that the two posts in question assumed a monitoring role and had not and would not intervene in the daily work of WKCDA. Given the large scale and complexities of the works projects in WKCD; and the wide scope of the tasks involved including planning, design and construction of Government and communal facilities; and coordination of such projects with the facilities to be developed by WKCDA, the Project Manager (HAB) was heavily involved in liaising with Government bureaux/departments, WKCDA and other external parties concerned to resolve interface issues, provide advice to WKCDA, and monitor utilization of the endowment fund given to WKCDA. PSHA stressed that there was a clear division of work between HAB and WKCDA, and in accordance with WKCDAO, WKCDA was fully independent in the development of arts and cultural software in WKCD.

12. Mr WU Chi-wai sought information on how the two posts could help expedite the development and implementation of the WKCD project and how Project Manager (HAB) could monitor the project costs to avoid costs overruns, the respective duties of WKCDA and Project Manager (HAB) in overseeing the progress of work projects, and details of the coordination work performed by Project Manager (HAB).

13. PSHA reiterated that the two posts had their respective duties in monitoring the implementation of the WKCD project, and HAB was the responsible bureau overseeing the project. She advised that there were Government representatives on the WKCDA Board and its committees including, the Executive Committee, Development Committee, Investment Committee, Museum Committee, Performing Arts Committees and

Remuneration Committee. If matters discussed by such committees were related to the work of other bureaux/departments, the relevant Government representatives would seek views from the bureaux/departments concerned and reflect them to the committees. In respect of Project Manager (HAB), she played a leading role in coordinating inputs from bureaux/departments to support WKCD in taking forward the works projects of WKCD. For instance, she had been maintaining an effective working relationship with various bureaux/departments, including the Transport and Housing Bureau ("THB"), Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD"), Lands Department, Buildings Department ("BD") and Planning Department ("PlanD"); and conveying their views to WKCD. Her major counterparts in WKCD included the Executive Director, Project Delivery and Chief Operating Officer, who oversaw the works projects. Project Manager (HAB) supplemented that she was mainly responsible for coordinating interface issues related to Government-funded infrastructure works, including road improvement works in the vicinity of WKCD and construction of the integrated basement and public infrastructure works within WKCD, and ensuring that the designs and standards of the facilities concerned would meet the requirements of WKCD and relevant bureaux/departments.

14. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung and Ms Claudio MO considered that the role of Project Manager (HAB) and her work focuses unclear. Ms MO further asked if WKCD was bound to accept the advice and views provided by Project Manager (HAB). PSHA said that the advice given by Project Manager (HAB) were appropriate and mostly adopted by WKCD. In addition, CS as the Board Chairman of WKCD worked closely with the Chief Executive Officer ("CEO") and chairmen of the committees of WKCD in monitoring the performance of WKCD.

Admin

15. At the request of Mr WU Chi-wai, the Administration agreed to provide a summary of major advice given by the holders of the two posts to WKCD on the implementation of the WKCD project.

16. Mr YIU Si-wing said that the WKCD project was beyond an arts and cultural project, and would become a major tourist destination for local and overseas visitors. As such, he stressed the importance to enhance the accessibility of WKCD and make arrangement catering the expected heavy flow of visitors and travellers of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL"). He opined that Project Manager (HAB) should be involved in matters relating to the planning and development of supporting transport infrastructure in WKCD, including provision of parking spaces, pick-up and drop-off points for coaches, and pedestrian facilities, etc. Mr YIU further suggested that the Administration should provide more details to the Joint Subcommittee regarding progress in the development of supporting transport infrastructure. Mr Martin LIAO sought details on the ancillary

tourism-related facilities in WKCD and Project Manager (HAB)'s role in this respect.

17. PSHA responded that the Administration attached great importance to ensuring adequate provision of supporting transport infrastructure in WKCD to cater for the needs of tourists. WKCDA had recently commenced the planning of tourism-related facilities in WKCD and recruited new staff members for commercial development and promotional activities. WKCDA and the Administration would report to the Joint Subcommittee with a detailed proposal in due course. On the integration and connectivity of WKCD with neighbouring districts, PSHA said that the Joint Subcommittee would discuss related issues at the meeting on 12 January 2015. She stressed that WKCD would be conveniently and effectively connected with other places of Hong Kong and Mainland cities by various transport facilities, such as XRL, the China Ferry Terminal, and road networks. Project Manager (HAB) advised that WKCDA had commissioned a consultancy study to develop a comprehensive traffic operation plan for future management of pedestrian and vehicular traffic, formulate transport strategies for WKCD, and enhance its connectivity with neighbouring districts. Besides the provision of loading/unloading facilities, parking facilities and related services for coaches within WKCD, the consultancy study also covered pedestrian connections such as footbridges and subways and public transport connections to/from WKCD. The Administration planned to report the interim findings of the consultancy study to the Joint Subcommittee around mid 2015.

18. Noting that it was among the duties of PAS(WKCD) to monitor WKCDA's work in drafting bylaw under the WKCDAO for the Park and public open space in WKCD, Ms Cyd HO stressed the need for the post holder to adopt a new approach in the work instead of following existing LCSD's conservative approach which had imposed restrictive conditions in the usage of facilities.

19. PSHA said that WKCDA was mindful of the need to allow more freedom for the public in using the Park and public open space in WKCD. The bylaw being formulated by WKCDA would be different from those under the Pleasure Grounds Regulation (Cap. 132BC) governing the use of leisure facilities and public open space managed by LCSD. The Consultation Panel of WKCDA had engaged a consultant to conduct a public opinion survey on the management of the Park. Views collected from the survey would be taken into account in the drafting of the bylaw. WKCDA would consult the Yau Tsim Mong District Council, Harbourfront Commission and the Joint Subcommittee on the draft bylaw shortly. While PAS(WKCD) would not be involved in the detailed drafting of the bylaw which was the responsibility of WKCDA, she needed to ensure consistency of the format of the bylaw with other comparable legislation and that the relevant legislative process was duly



followed.

20. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen said that LegCo Members supported the staffing proposal in general. He enquired about the Administration's plan to seek the Finance Committee ("FC")'s approval for the proposal, and whether there would be alternatives if FC's approval was not granted before the lapse of the two posts on 31 March 2015. Mr WU Chi-wai stressed the importance for the Administration to prepare contingency plans in this regard. Ms Claudia MO enquired how the Administration would ensure work continuity in the event that the two supernumerary posts were not extended by 31 March 2015.

21. PSHA said that the Administration was not provided with authority to extend the duration of the two supernumerary posts in question, and HAB would need to discuss contingency plans with the Civil Service Bureau ("CSB") if the two posts were not extended by 31 March 2015. Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service (1) explained that supernumerary posts were created on a time-limited basis, and the two posts in question would lapse if no extension was approved by FC by 31 March 2015. In that case, HAB would need to consider possible rearrangements for the relevant work in consultation with CSB, pending reinstatement of the posts concerned.

#### Professional qualities of the post holders

22. Ms Cyd HO stressed that inputs from professionals with knowledge and expertise in, and experience of the relevant fields were prerequisite for the planning and construction of arts and cultural facilities. She asked if holder of the Project Manager (HAB) post had the relevant expertise and experience in discharging the required duties.

23. PSHA said that the Project Manager (HAB) post required engineering backgrounds as the holder was responsible for coordinating with bureaux/departments, including CEDD, BD and PlanD, to resolve engineering issues. Moreover, through maintaining close liaison with other relevant bureaux/departments, and with support from a team of non-directorate staff including among others, a Senior Architect, a Senior Engineer, a Senior Town Planner and a Senior Treasury Accountant, Project Manager (HAB) was provided with the necessary professional inputs to her work. On the other hand, to ensure that the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD would meet the required international standards, consultation and monitoring mechanisms had been put in place to gauge the views and draw the support from different parties. The Performing Arts Committee and the Museum Committee of WKCDA comprised representatives from HAB and LCSD as well as professionals in the arts and cultural sector, who gave advice on venue and facility requirements. Moreover, WKCDA conducted focus group studies for

the designs of venues with participants from the arts and cultural sector. Furthermore, WKCD had set up dedicated teams to oversee the development of various arts and cultural facilities and would engage consultants in the planning and design stages.

### Progress of the WKCD project

24. Ms Emily LAU expressed concerns about the slow progress of the WKCD project and late delivery of facilities due to delay in the completion of the Hong Kong section of XRL. PSHA responded that Xiqu Centre (in Zone 1A) and M+ (in Zone 3A) would not be affected by the construction of the Hong Kong section of XRL. According to MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL"), a portion of the works area in Zone 3B of the integrated basement would continue to be occupied by XRL's barging facilities, which would have an impact on the completion date of the Lyric Theatre. As regards Zones 2A, 2B and 2C of the integrated basement, MTRCL had advised that the works area above the basement and the area adjoining the XRL West Kowloon Terminus would be released in phases between 2016 and 2017. WKCD and the Administration aimed to advance the development of the Artist Square, which covered Zone 3A and Zone 3B, to create a "mini-WKCD" which would enhance vibrancy of the WKCD site. In response to Ms LAU's enquiry about whether the two supernumerary posts in question would be involved in the XRL project, PSHA explained that the XRL project was within the purview of THB. Ms LAU was concerned that there would be coordination problems as there was no THB representative in the WKCD Board.

25. Echoing the concern on the slow progress, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr Alan LEONG urged the Administration to expedite implementation of the WKCD project. Dr KWOK commented that the prolonged development of WKCD was attributed to the adoption of the single-tender approach insisted by the Administration which had aroused wide public concern. He expressed dissatisfaction that due to slow progress of the WKCD project, the public had been deprived of the use of public open space which was included in the relevant Outline Zoning Plan. Dr KWOK and Mr LEONG called on the Administration to expedite delivery of the public open space in WKCD. Mr TANG Ka-piu enquired about the progress of development of various facilities in WKCD and their target completion dates.

26. PSHA said that the Administration had provided the Joint Subcommittee with a progress update on the implementation of the WKCD project and the target completion dates of Batch 1 and Batch 2 facilities. For Xiqu Centre, its foundation works had been completed and the tender for construction of the superstructure was awarded in December 2014. The facility was targeted for completion in mid 2017. Regarding M+, foundation

works was commenced in August 2014 and expected to complete in August/September 2015. Completion date was anticipated in 2018. As for the Park (including the Temporary Tree Nursery Park and Black Box), it would be completed in stages starting from 2015, followed by the Arts Pavilion in 2016. As for the provision of public open space in WKCD, PSHA said that the West Kowloon Waterfront Promenade was open for public use at present. According to the development plan, there would be 23 hectares of public open space in WKCD. She assured members that the Administration would strive to open the Temporary Tree Nursery Park in mid 2015 and complete construction of Batch 1 facilities, including the Park, between 2017 and 2018. Upon members' request, the Administration agreed to provide supplementary information on the target completion and commissioning dates of the WKCD facilities.

Admin

27. Ms Emily LAU noted from paragraph 5 of EC(2014-15)13 that the Administration had undertaken to fund the construction of the integrated basement. However, she said that the Joint Subcommittee was informed recently that WKCDA would deploy some \$300 million from its endowment to fund the design and advance works of the integrated basement. She sought clarification on the funding arrangement for the integrated basement.

28. PSHA said that the Administration would fully fund the capital works of the integrated basement and had adopted a phased approach in implementing the project. While the Administration had applied to the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") in June 2014 for upgrading the first stage of design and advance works for the integrated basement involving an estimated cost of \$304.5 million, the funding application was still awaiting consideration by PWSC as at the end of December 2014. At its meeting on 24 November 2014, the Joint Subcommittee had urged the Administration to make contingency planning in the event that the relevant funding was not approved by FC on time, which in turn would delay the construction of M+ and Lyric Theatre and lead to increase in project costs. It was estimated that a month's delay in the commissioning of the M+ construction works could result in an increase of \$20 million in cost. Hence, the Administration had discussed with WKCDA and the latter had agreed to fund the first stage design and advance works in relation to the construction of the integrated basement. That said, when the Administration sought FC's funding approval for the second stage of integrated basement and associated public infrastructure works in mid-2015, it would also seek an appropriate amount for reimbursement to WKCDA. She stressed that the above was an exceptional and one-off arrangement agreed with WKCDA, and the latter was aware that the reimbursement would be subject to FC's approval. She added that the Administration would brief the Joint Subcommittee on the details at its meeting on 12 January 2015.

29. Mr NG Leung-sing expressed support for retaining the two supernumerary posts. Pointing out that the "non-co-operation movement" in LegCo initiated by Members in the opposition camp had caused delay in funding approval for public works projects and led to increase in project costs, he asked whether the Administration had any contingency plans to address the situation. He also considered that the Administration should enhance the understanding of the public on the present situation facing the Administration in seeking funding approval from FC.

30. Ms Cyd HO, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Ms Emily LAU and Mr Albert CHAN disagreed that the "non-co-operation movement" had contributed to the delay in the development of facilities in WKCD, or the costs overruns in projects. Mr Albert CHAN stressed that in considering funding proposals relating to the WKCD project, LegCo Members had duties to examine the proposals in detail; and in doing so Members should not be regarded as deliberately delaying the funding application process. Mr Albert CHAN and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen pointed out that the above-mentioned one-off arrangement for funding the first stage design and advance works of the integrated basement had demonstrated that the Administration and WKCDA had flexibility in deploying resources for the implementation of the WKCD project.

31. PSHA responded that the implementation of the WKCD project faced a number of challenges including the delay in funding approval from FC on relevant proposals. While with WKCDA's agreement to the above-mentioned exceptional and one-off funding arrangement for the first stage of integrated basement works, the Administration would still need to seek FC's approval for re-paying WKCDA and funding of the subsequent phases of works at a later stage in order to honour the Government's undertaking in 2013 to fund the construction of the basement. PSHA added that the progress of deliberation on funding applications by LegCo was beyond the Administration's control. She reiterated that retaining the two supernumerary posts was necessary to monitor the WKCD project and strengthen coordination with bureaux/departments and other stakeholders in the implementation of the project. If the two posts were to lapse, the relevant duties would need to be absorbed by PSHA and DSHA(3) in HAB. Given that these officers were already fully occupied by their respective duties, and did not have the relevant professional expertise, the arrangement would adversely affect the timely implementation of the WKCD project.

32. Ms Starry LEE said that LegCo Members of the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment supported retaining the two supernumerary posts. Noting the wide public concern about costs overruns in the WKCD project, Ms LEE enquired about the roles of Project Manager (HAB) and PAS(WKCD) in controlling the project costs. Dr KWOK Ka-ki stressed that holders of the

two posts should exercise tight control over the expenditure of the project. Ms Claudio MO was of the view that the timetable for the delivery of Batch 3 facilities would be affected by the progress of the XRL project, and expressed concern about future costs overruns in the WKCD project.

33. PSHA remarked that CS had reported the financial situation of the WKCD project to the Joint Subcommittee in May 2014. According to her report, it was expected that the upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion provided to WKCD in 2008 would be sufficient to cover the costs of development of Batch 1 and Batch 2 facilities. The cost estimate of Batch 3 facilities was not available at the moment and would be affected by factors such as the timetable for delivery of the facilities. WKCD had been exercising tight cost-control measures, including adopting simple and practical designs in lieu of iconic designs for various arts and cultural facilities to be developed in WKCD. Project Manager (HAB) and PAS(WKCD) were responsible for monitoring the use of the upfront endowment and operating expenditure of WKCD. Project Manager (HAB) added that she was involved in the design works of WKCD's arts and cultural facilities, such as providing advice on the choice of materials and design features with a view to enhancing cost effectiveness. PAS(WKCD) said that she was involved in monitoring WKCD's expenses for the organization of events and exhibitions, as well as its procurement of certain services. She also gave advice at the WKCD's Remuneration Committee on creation of posts and salary review matters.

34. Pointing out that there had been positive public response to West Kowloon Bamboo Theatre organized by WKCD in the WKCD site in recent years, Mr TANG Ka-piu asked if WKCD would continue to hold similar large-scale audience development events in the WKCD site prior to the commissioning of the various arts and cultural facilities. PSHA responded that WKCD had continued to make progress in audience development through a series of popular events and performances including West Kowloon Bamboo Theatre and Freespace Fest. With the commencement of construction works of Batch 1 facilities, some of these large-scale events would be relocated to other venues and the formats might also change. WKCD would continue to initiate a wide array of performances, events, exhibitions, etc., to nurture new audience.

35. Mr Albert CHAN expressed concern about problems associated with the WKCD project, including costs overruns and corporate governance issues exposed by the resignation of the former CEO of WKCD shortly after he had taken up the position. As members of the Board of WKCD were mainly persons supporting the Government, he further expressed concern about how WKCD could uphold freedom in artistic expression in WKCD.

36. In response, PSHA said that HAB's major role in the WKCD project

was to ensure proper utilization of public resources for the implementation of the project. HAB would not interfere in WKCD's artistic direction. She said that the WKCD Board comprised professionals in the arts and cultural sector, who gave professional and practical advice on the implementation of the WKCD project. PSHA added that the first CEO of WKCD had resigned for personal reasons, and she did not notice any problems in the working relationship between the current CEO and his team. It was also noted that WKCD had appreciated the Administration's inputs and assistance in the WKCD project.

### Positioning of M+ and the Hong Kong Museum of Art

37. Noting that the Administration had plans to expand and renovate the Hong Kong Museum of Art ("HKMA"), the Chairman expressed concern about possible overlap in the roles of M+ and HKMA. The Chairman and Ms Claudia MO asked whether the Administration would formulate a policy on the positioning of two museums, such as that for Tate and Tate Modern in London. Ms MO further enquired whether M+ would play a similar role as Cattle Depot Artist Village at Ma Tau Kok Road which functioned as a breeding ground for emerging local artists and vanguard artists.

38. PSHA explained that M+ and HKMA had different roles and positioning. M+ would be a cultural institution focusing on the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century contemporary visual culture and would develop content from a Hong Kong perspective with a global vision. HKMA covered a much longer time period in art history, from the classical period to the contemporary period. It would also showcase traditional paintings and calligraphies, historical pictures and antiquities, with both ancient Chinese and Western exhibits. While exhibits in HKMA would include local artworks, they would be presented in the context of international artistic trends. As such, M+ and HKMA would have different collection and acquisition directions. PSHA supplemented that the renovation project for HKMA was necessary to upgrade the facilities and expand the exhibition space therein partly because there had been no major renovation for the museum since its commissioning in 1991 and the space for showcasing Hong Kong artists and their artworks was inadequate. The Panel on Home Affairs and the Art Museum Advisory Panel under LCSD had been consulted and supported the renovation project.

39. On the positioning of M+ and HKMA, PSHA said that M+ would be more similar to Tate Modern as both museums were designed for contemporary art. In addition to visual arts, the collection would cover architecture and moving images. Both HKMA and M+ would actively engage local visual artists and promote local art.

40. In response to the Chairman's enquiry about arrangement for

exhibits of M+ and HKMA, PSHA explained that donation of artworks were usually made to designated museums but arrangement could be made between museums for loans of artworks. At the Chairman's request, the Administration agreed to provide information on the estimated cost of the proposed expansion and renovation of HKMA.

Admin

41. The Chairman advised that an additional meeting would be held on 23 January 2015 from 8:30 am to 10:30 am to continue discussion on this item and deal with other unfinished items on the agenda for today's meeting. Notice of the additional meeting had been given to members vide LC Paper No. ESC22/14-15.

42. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:35 am.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
12 February 2015