

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC81/14-15
(These minutes have been
cleared with the Chairman)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 17th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 5 December 2014, at 5:10 pm

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr WONG Kam-sing, JP	Secretary for the Environment
Mr Howard CHAN Wai-kee, JP	Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2)
	Environmental Protection Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Ken WOO	Senior Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1)7

Item No. 1 – FCR(2014-15)31A
HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING
Environmental Protection – Refuse Disposal
164DR – Southeast New Territories Landfill Extension

Item No. 2 – FCR(2014-15)32A
HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING
Environmental Protection – Refuse Disposal
163DR – Northeast New Territories Landfill Extension

Item No. 3 – FCR(2014-15)33A
HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING
Environmental Protection – Refuse disposal
165DR – West New Territories Landfill Extension

Item No. 4 – FCR(2014-15)34A
HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING
Environmental Protection – Refuse Disposal
177DR – Development of integrated waste management facilities phase 1

The Committee continued to deal with the motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FC Procedure") to express views on the item FCR(2014-15)31A.

Motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG

2. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG numbered SE337 to SE381 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Dr CHEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

3. When motion SE365 was put to vote, Mr Abraham SHEK declared interest as an independent non-executive director of the Mass Transit Railway Corporation.

Voting on FCR(2014-15)31A

4. As the Committee had dealt with all of the proposed motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on item FCR(2014-15)31A, the Chairman then put the item to vote. At the request of

members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman explained that the motion to shorten the duration of the division bell from five minutes to one minute had been moved and carried at the meeting held on 28 November 2014, and would apply to divisions claimed on motions voted upon in respect of the item FCR(2014-15)31A. The duration of division bell to be sounded on motions to be moved in relation to subsequent items FCR(2014-15)32A to 34A would remain five minutes unless a motion to shorten the duration of the division bell pursuant to paragraph 47 of the FC Procedure was moved and carried for each of the abovementioned items.

5. After members had cast their votes, the Chairman announced that 33 members voted in favour of, and 19 voted against the item. The voting results of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Dr LAU Wong-fat
Mr TAM Yiu-chung	Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr CHAN Kin-por	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr IP Kwok-him
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee	Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr MA Fung-kwok	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Miss CHAN Yuen-han	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr TANG Ka-piu	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	
(33 members)	

Against:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung	Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee	Mr Vincent FANG Kang
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan	Dr LEUNG Ka-lau
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip	Mr James TIEN Pei-chun
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming	Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung	Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan

Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan
(19 members)

6. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.
 7. Ms Cyd HO suggested that when the Chairman put the item to vote after having dealt with all relevant motions, the duration of the division bell should be sounded for five minutes instead of one minute so as to allow time for members to return to the Conference Room to cast their votes. Mr Albert CHAN and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen made similar comments. Ms Cyd HO further suggested that the Chairman might remind members when the meeting was about to finish dealing with the motions to be moved under 37A of the FC Procedure.
 8. The Chairman agreed that he would remind members when there were, say, 10 or so motions to be dealt with before he put to the item to vote. He commented, however, that the arrangement would be effective only if members would not keep on putting forward additional motions during the meeting as he could not then determine when he might put the item to vote.
 9. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen raised a point of order and asked if members could move a motion to revert the duration of division bell from one minute back to five minutes. Mr Albert CHAN raised the same question. The Chairman said he would look into this procedural question after the meeting and advise the Committee of his ruling.
- Motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on FCR(2014-15)32A
10. The Chairman said that the meeting would proceed to deal with motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on FCR(2014-15)32A. He said that 78 motions had been received and he had ruled that 71 motions were directly related to the item, and that they would be put to the Committee to decide whether they should be proceeded forthwith.
 11. The Chairman reminded members that after all the proposed motions to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure in respect of FCR(2014-15)32A had been dealt with, he would then put the item FCR(2014-15)32A to vote.

Motion proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

12. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung numbered NE045 to be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG read out his proposed motion during the ringing of the division bell. The question was negatived.

Motion to shorten the duration of the division bell

13. Mr IP Kwok-him moved without notice under paragraph 47 of FC Procedure that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, the Committee should proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute.

14. The Chairman proposed the question on Mr IP Kwok-him's motion. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr Albert CHAN and Ms Cyd HO spoke against Mr IP's motion. In gist, they argued that more time should be allowed for members to return to the Conference Room for voting and members should be given some time to consider the motions moved by members under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure before they cast their votes.

15. There being no further comments from members, the Chairman put the question to vote. At the requests of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman announced that 29 members voted in favour of and 13 members voted against the question. The voting results of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr IP Kwok-him
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Elizabeth QUAT

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr MA Fung-kwok
Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong

Mr POON Siu-ping
Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun
(29 members)

Mr TANG Ka-piu
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok

Against:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan
Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit
Mr WU Chi-wai
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Mr IP Kin-yuen
(13 members)

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

16. The Chairman declared that Mr IP Kwok-him's motion was carried.

Motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on FCR(2014-15)32A

Motions proposed by Ms Emily LAU

17. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Ms Emily LAU numbered NE070, NE071, NE073 to NE075, NE077 and NE078 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Ms LAU read out each of her proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

18. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen numbered NE005 to NE031 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

19. The Chairman declared that the meeting was adjourned and that the Committee would continue to deal with the remaining motions from Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Mr Gary FAN at the next meeting scheduled for 12 December 2014.

20. The meeting was adjourned at 7:10 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
15 January 2015