

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC180/14-15

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

**Minutes of the 22nd meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 9 January 2015, at 3:00 pm**

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr WONG Kam-sing, JP	Secretary for the Environment
Mr Howard CHAN Wai-kee, JP	Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2)
Mrs Elina CHAN	Environmental Protection Department
Mr LAM Ka-tai, JP	Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare (Welfare) ³
	Deputy Director of Social Welfare (Services)
	Social Welfare Department
Miss Cecilla LI	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)
	Social Welfare Department
Mr LAI Cheuk-man	Senior Architect, Social Welfare Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1) ⁵
Mr Ken WOO	Senior Council Secretary (1) ⁵
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1) ⁷

Mr Raymond SZETO
Mr Frankie WOO
Ms Michelle NIEN
Miss Yannes HO

Council Secretary (1)5
Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Legislative Assistant (1)5
Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

Item No. 1 – FCR(2014-15)34A
HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING
Environmental Protection – Refuse Disposal
177DR – Development of integrated waste management facilities phase 1

The Committee continued to deal with motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee ("FC") Procedure to express views on the item FCP(2014-15)34A.

2. The Chairman said that members had submitted 238 proposed motions, of which 174 had been dealt with at the FC meetings on 19 December 2014. The Chairman had thereafter ruled one more proposed motion to be out of order. He said that he would then put the remaining 63 motions to the Committee to decide whether they should be proceeded forthwith. After all the proposed motions in respect of FCR(2014-15)34A had been dealt with, he would put the item FCR(2014-15)34A to vote.

Changing the duration of the division bell

3. Mr Albert CHAN requested the Chairman to revert the duration of the division bell from one minute to five minutes when the item was put to vote. The Chairman said that he had already explained at the previous meetings that there was no procedure to revert the duration of the division bell when the Committee had agreed, by a motion under paragraph 47 of the FC Procedure, to shorten it from five minutes to one minute. He had already informed members that, as an administrative measure, when the Committee was about to deal with the last 10 motions proposed under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure and proceed to vote on the funding proposal under the item, he would alert members present in the conference room so that they might remind other members to return to vote.

Motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on FCR(2014-15)34A

4. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung numbered IWMF525 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell

was rung for one minute. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG read out his motion when the division bell was being rung. The question was negated.

5. At this juncture, Mr Ronny TONG said that he had pressed the button to vote in support of the motion but the electronic voting system had not displayed his voting preference correctly. The Chairman instructed that Mr TONG's voting preference be recorded.

6. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung numbered IW MF526, IW MF527, and IW MF529 to IW MF588 be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG read out his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negated.

7. During the Committee's consideration of the proposed motions numbered IW MF579, IW MF583 and IW MF588, the Chairman reminded members that those were, respectively, the last tenth, last fifth and the last of the proposed motions from Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung.

Voting on FCR(2014-15)34A

8. As the Committee had dealt with all of the motions proposed to be moved under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on the item FCR(2014-15)34A, the Chairman put the item to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute.

9. The Chairman announced that 40 members voted in favour of, and 17 members voted against the item. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Vincent FANG Kang
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr LAU Wong-fat
Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Dr LAM Tai-fai
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Dr LEUNG Ka-lau

Mr IP Kwok-him	Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr James TIEN Pei-chun	Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Mr Kenneth LEUNG
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr TANG Ka-piu	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun	Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen
(40 members)	

Against:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan	Mr James TO Kun-sun
Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung	Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip	Ms Claudia MO
Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung	Mr SIN Chung-kai
Mr IP Kin-yuen	
(17 members)	

10. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

11. Ms Cyd HO raised a point of order. She claimed that she had voted against the item, but the electronic voting system had incorrectly displayed her voting preference. The Chairman said that he had already declared the voting result and the voting record could not be altered. The Chairman instructed that Ms Cyd HO's voting preference should be duly reflected in the minutes of the meeting.

Item No. 2 – FCR(2014-15)40
LOTTERIES FUND
HEAD 341 – NON-RECURRENT GRANTS

12. The Chairman advised that the item invited the Committee's approval of an allocation of \$65,043,000 from the Lotteries Fund for meeting the construction cost of a new Contract Residential Care Home for the Elderly

("RCHE") with a Day Care Unit for the Elderly ("DCU") at the ancillary facilities block in the public rental housing development of the Housing Authority at the site of Anderson Road, Kwun Tong.

13. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che, Chairman of the Panel on Welfare Services ("the Panel"), reported that the proposal was discussed at the meeting of the Panel held on 9 June 2014. While the Panel supported the proposal in principle, some Panel members requested the Administration to carry out the construction works and the tendering exercise for selecting the operator for the proposed Contract RCHE with DCU in tandem, so that the proposed facilities could come into operation about three to six months after the completion of the construction works. Panel members also requested the Administration to increase the ratio of subsidized to non-subsidized residential care places in the proposed Contract RCHE from 6:4 to 8:2.

14. The Chairman instructed that members' speaking time should be limited to five minutes each, including the Administration's response.

Construction cost and works schedule

15. Mr TANG Ka-piu noted that the funding proposal was submitted to FC in July 2014 pending deliberation. He asked whether there was any change to the estimated construction cost and any delay to the work schedule. Deputy Director of Social Welfare (Services) ("DDSW(S)") explained that the construction works were expected to be completed by mid-2017 and the cost estimate of \$65 million, which as advised by the Housing Authority, had allowed for inflation and other cost variation factors.

16. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che asked if the proposed RCHE with DCU could come into operation about three to six months after the completion of the construction works. DDSW(S) advised that the Administration had tried to expedite the project by compressing the tendering process. Time would still be needed for the operator of the proposed RCHE with DCU to procure furniture and equipment, to carry fitting-out works, and to apply for relevant licences.

Ratio of subsidized to non-subsidized places in RCHE

17. Mr TANG Ka-piu asked whether the proportion of subsidized residential care places could be increased in the proposed RCHE so that more elderly people could be benefited. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che and Dr Fernando CHEUNG raised a similar query. Mr TANG Ka-piu also enquired about the

vacancy rate of the non-subsidized residential care places in the 22 Contract RCHEs in operation.

18. DDSW(S) said that both subsidized and non-subsidized residential care services units were subject to close monitoring to ensure high quality of service. He said that the ratio of 6:4 of subsidized to non-subsidized places was adopted as a general practice. The Administration would, where appropriate, take into account the socio-economic conditions of the service catchment areas and the availability of other non-subsidized residential care places in the vicinity when determining the number of subsidized and non-subsidized places in individual Contract RCHEs.

19. As regards vacancy rate of non-subsidized places, DDSW(S) said that the occupancy rate of non-subsidized places in Contract RCHEs was about 94%.

20. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen queried whether the ratio of subsidized to non-subsidized RCHE places could be changed if the take-up rate of non-subsidized places in a Contract RCHE turned out to be unsatisfactory. DDSW(S) explained that the Administration could adjust the ratio and convert some of the non-subsidized places to subsidized places when a RCHE contract was due for renewal.

Long term strategy to meet demand for RCHEs

21. Ms Emily LAU expressed support for the funding proposal. She noted that there was a long waiting queue for RCHE services but the number of places provided in each project was small. Ms LAU asked if there was policy to incorporate elderly care facilities in new or redeveloped public housing projects so that planning could proceed at an early stage. Ms Emily LAU also enquired about the Administration's target in meeting the demand for RCHE services.

22. DDSW(S) responded that welfare facilities would be provided in new or redeveloped subsidized public housing developments. Where appropriate, vacant housing units or vacated facilities such as school premises might also be converted for welfare services purposes. However, the actual facilities and the scale of the facilities to be provided would be subject to the physical constraints of the premises available.

23. DDSW(S) supplemented that the Administration had implemented the Special Scheme on Privately Owned Sites for Welfare Uses which encouraged social welfare organizations to better use their land through in-situ

expansion or redevelopment, especially to provide additional facilities for elderly and rehabilitation services. The Administration was in the process of handling about 60 such proposals from 43 non-governmental organizations.

24. Ms Emily LAU asked the Administration to provide details on meeting the demand for services in future related funding proposals.

25. Mr Albert CHAN commented that many elderly people died while awaiting allocation of RCHE places. He asked how many RCHE places the Administration planned to provide in the coming 10 years and how many vacated school premises the Administration planned to convert to RCHEs. In particular, Mr CHAN asked if those school premises included one in Tin Shui Wai.

26. DDSW(S) said that many elderly people received day care services while awaiting allocation of RCHE places. He added that about 7 000 RCHE places would be provided through the Special Scheme on Privately Owned Sites for Welfare Uses. Five more Contract RCHEs would come into operation in 2016-2017. In addition, the Administration planned to convert vacated primary school premises into RCHEs. These school premises included the CCC Kei Leung Primary School in Tuen Mun and the CCC Kei Ching Primary School in Tai Po.

27. DDSW(S) undertook to provide further information, including whether the planned conversion of vacated school premises included any facilities in Tin Shui Wai.

28. The Chairman reminded Mr Albert CHAN to follow up any policy issues on RCHE services in the relevant Panel.

Design and location of RCHE services

29. Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed support for the funding proposal. He criticized the Administration for not having a clear policy objective in planning and providing elderly services. He said that RCHEs should, as far as possible, be located within a community, and should best be incorporated inside a public rental housing development. Dr CHEUNG suggested smaller scale RCHEs should be set up using public rental housing units as accommodation for elderly services users.

30. DDSW(S) explained that of the 11 sites earmarked for construction of new Contract RCHEs, RCHEs with DCUs and Day Care Centres for the Elderly, seven would be located in public housing developments and only two

were to be accommodated within ancillary facility blocks. Elderly services facilities were mostly integrated into the local community, and most of these facilities were located in the ground floors or lower floors of public housing developments.

31. DDSW(S) supplemented that the Social Welfare Department was closely in contact with the Housing Department to incorporate elderly services facilities in new or redeveloped public housing projects. As regards whether smaller RCHEs using public rental housing units could be introduced, DDSW(S) said that operational efficiency of welfare services facilities would be an important factor to be considered.

Overall policy direction in the provision of elderly services

32. Mr Alan LEONG said that Members belonging to the Civic Party supported the funding proposal. He requested to put on record the Civic Party's dissatisfaction with the Administration's slow pace in the supply of elderly services, especially RCHE places, as many elderly people died away while still awaiting allocation of places. Mr LEONG also expressed dissatisfaction against the Administration's policy objective of "ageing in place as the core, institutional care as back-up" which, Mr LEONG considered, was an excuse for not addressing the demand for RCHE services and for failing to meet the Chief Executive's pledge of providing a decent home for the elderly.

Other comments

33. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed support for the funding proposal, and he requested to put on record his comment that the proposed RCHE with DCU should have been in progress had it not been for the delay as a result of the filibustering tactics deployed by the opposition members. He appealed to members to deliberate funding proposals expeditiously. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen responded to Mr WONG Kwok-hing's comment and said that there were many factors affecting the supply of RCHE places, rather than members' filibustering tactics.

34. The Chairman announced that the meeting was adjourned, and discussion on the item would continue at the ensuing meeting scheduled for the day.

35. The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 pm.