

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. FC195/14-15  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

**Finance Committee of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 37<sup>th</sup> meeting**  
**held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**  
**on Saturday, 14 February 2015, at 3:23 pm**

**Members present:**

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon WONG Yuk-man  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Members absent:**

Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

Hon Kenneth LEUNG  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon Dennis KWOK  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

**Public officers attending:**

Professor K C CHAN, GBS, JP	Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury
Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) <sup>1</sup>
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, GBS, JP	Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development
Miss Susie HO, JP	Permanent Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development (Communications and Technology)
Mr Joe WONG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development (Communications and Technology)
Miss Janet WONG, JP	Commissioner for Innovation and Technology
Mr Johann WONG, JP	Deputy Commissioner for Innovation and Technology
Mr Victor LAM, JP	Acting Government Chief Information Officer
Miss Joey LAM, JP	Deputy Government Chief Information Officer (Policy and Community)

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6

---

Action

**Item No. 1 – FCR(2014-15)36**

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT  
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 11 JUNE 2014**

**Item No. 2 – FCR(2014-15)37**

**NEW HEAD "GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :  
INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY BUREAU"**

**HEAD 47 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :  
OFFICE OF THE GOVERNMENT CHIEF  
INFORMATION OFFICER**

**HEAD 55 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :  
COMMERCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT  
BUREAU (COMMUNICATIONS AND  
TECHNOLOGY BRANCH)**

**HEAD 155 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT :  
INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY COMMISSION**

Motion to adjourn discussion on item FCR(2014-15)36

The meeting continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr Albert HO that discussion on item FCR(2014-15)36 be now adjourned.

2. Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Ms Emily LAU, Mr Albert CHAN, Ms Claudia MO, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Mr WU Chi-wai expressed support for the motion. In gist, these members did not find the justifications for establishing the proposed Innovation and Technology Bureau ("ITB") credible. They stressed that it was the Administration's responsibility to explain clearly the justifications for establishing ITB, but it had yet to address questions by members. Members also criticized the Administration's making use of the establishment of ITB to reward the supporters of the Chief Executive ("CE").

3. Ms Alice MAK, Mr Christopher CHUNG, Mr WONG Kwok-hing, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr WONG Kwok-kin, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Mr Andrew LEUNG, Mr CHAN Kam-lam, Mr Jeffrey LAM, Mr WONG Ting-kwong and Mr Steven HO expressed opposition against the motion. In gist, these members said that filibustering should not be supported. The proposed establishment of ITB had received support from the industry and the academia. The justifications for establishing ITB had already been thoroughly deliberated, and further delay in the matter was tantamount to giving up Hong Kong's competitive advantage to its regional competitors.

4. When Mr Albert CHAN was making his speech, the Chairman pointed out to Mr CHAN that the word "狗" in a phrase he had spoken had been ruled by the President of the Legislative Council in the past to be offensive and insulting language about Members. Mr Albert CHAN said that the alleged insulting expression in his speech was not directed towards any particular member.

5. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development ("SCED") gave response to members' speeches in respect of the motion. He appealed to members to support the establishment of ITB.

6. Mr Albert HO gave concluding remarks on his motion. The Chairman put to vote the motion to adjourn discussion on item FCR(2014-15)36. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman announced that nineteen members voted in favour of and 32 members voted against the motion. The votes of individual members were as follows –

*For:*

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan  
Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long  
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Ms Claudia MO

Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok  
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Mr IP Kin-yuen  
(19 members)

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan  
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing  
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan  
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit  
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Mr WU Chi-wai  
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen  
Dr KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan

*Against:*

Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Dr LAU Wong-fat
Mr TAM Yiu-chung	Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr CHAN Kin-por	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr IP Kwok-him
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee	Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr POON Siu-ping	Mr TANG Ka-piu
Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun	Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen
(32 members)	

7. The Chairman declared that the motion was negatived.

Establishment of the Innovation and Technology Bureau

8. Ms Cyd HO asked how the Administration would prevent potential conflict of interest or collusion after the establishment of ITB. SCED said that there were established practices for preventing potential conflict of interest which bound all Government bureaux and departments.

9. Mr CHAN Kin-por and Dr Priscilla LEUNG expressed support for the establishment of ITB and called on members to expedite discussions and allow the items to be put to vote at the meeting.

10. Dr KWOK Ka-ki questioned whether the Administration had implemented policies to bolster Hong Kong's competitiveness in innovation and technology. Dr Helena WONG requested the Administration to provide successful examples of innovations or start-ups fostered by Government-driven initiatives such as the Hong Kong Science & Technology Parks ("the Science Park"). Dr WONG urged the Administration to review its focus on developing innovation and technology.

11. SCED said that the Administration had strived to cultivate a business-friendly environment which was conducive to the development of innovation and technology. Commissioner for Innovation and Technology

said that support had been made to foster growth of private companies in the Science Park. Researches in information and communications technology, and in life sciences were noteworthy examples of focus areas. The Administration would continue to support proposals for innovation and technology under existing funds and schemes in pursuit of prevailing global trends. The Administration had also conducted a comprehensive review of the Innovation and Technology Fund, including the work of research and development centres and financial assistance under its various schemes. Findings of the review had been reported to the Panel on Commerce and Industry.

12. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan questioned whether the establishment of ITB was to complement the National 13<sup>th</sup> Five-year Plan. SCED said that the Administration had been seeking trade opportunities with a variety of potential partners to leverage on the benefits of the National 13<sup>th</sup> Five-year Plan. In addition, the Administration had strived to make bilateral trade agreements with partners including members of the Alliance of Southeast Asian Nations.

13. Mr Alan LEONG asked whether the Administration had promulgated performance indicators for driving policies on innovation and technology, such as the growth in gross domestic product as a result of these policies. SCED said that the economic benefits of innovation and technology encompassed a variety of industries, including financial services and logistics, and it was not easy to quantify the economic benefits.

#### Other issues

14. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung asked whether the Administration had reviewed the progress of developing pillar industries highlighted in the 2015 Policy Address. SCED said that the current proposals under discussion were related to innovation and technology and other priority industries were under the purview of other policy bureaux.

15. Dr KWOK Ka-ki criticized the Administration for rewarding the supporters of the CE by way of the proposed establishment of ITB.

#### Motion to adjourn discussion on item FCR(2014-15)37

16. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung moved, without notice, discussion on item FCR(2014-15)37 be then adjourned pursuant to paragraph 39 of the Finance Committee Procedure.

17. The Chairman thereupon put the question on Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's motion and directed that each member, when speaking on the question, could speak once for not more than three minutes.

18. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung introduced his motion. He expressed dissatisfaction towards the Administration's refusal to answer members' questions on the items under discussion. He reiterated his stance that the proposed ITB was not necessary for driving policies on innovation and technology.

19. Mr Gary FAN, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Ms Emily LAU, Mr Albert HO, Mr WONG Yuk-man, Ms Claudia MO, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr WU Chi-wai, Mr Alan LEONG, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan and Mr Albert CHAN expressed support for the motion. In gist, these members reiterated their doubts about the justifications and vision for establishing the ITB, and their criticisms on the Administration of cronyism by dishing out rewards to supporters of the CE. These members also expressed dissatisfaction towards the Administration's refusal of reviewing its land policy to assist the commercialization of innovations. Commenting that establishing ITB without a comprehensive strategy was premature, these members urged the Administration to conduct further consultation with Members of the Legislative Council and the industry before putting forth the proposals for establishing ITB.

20. Dr LO Wai-kwok expressed opposition against the motion. He said that representatives of the industry, the academia and the public had expressed support for the establishment of the proposed ITB for high-level policymaking and coordination. Filibustering on the proposal should be opposed.

21. At 5:20 pm, the Chairman said that as there would not be sufficient time to put to vote Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's motion to adjourn discussion on the item FCR(2014-15)37 before the scheduled end time of the meeting, the motion would lapse unless the item FCR(2014-15)37 was included in the agenda for a future meeting.

22. The Chairman declared that the meeting be adjourned.

23. The meeting was adjourned at 5:21 pm.