

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC256/14-15

(These minutes been seen
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

**Minutes of the 45th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 8 May 2015, at 5:10 pm**

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO

Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-ye, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr John LEE Ka-chiu, PDSM, PMSM, JP	Under Secretary for Security
Mr Alex CHAN Yuen-tak	Principal Assistant Secretary for Security (B)
Mr LI Kin-yat, FSMSM	Deputy Director of Fire Services
Dr Axel SIU Yuet-chung	Medical Director, Ambulance Command, Fire Services Department
Mr NGAI Tak-yung	Senior Divisional Officer (Special Project), Fire Services Department
Mr Eric CHUNG Kin-sang	Superintendent (Special Project), Fire Services Department
Mr Billy WOO	Principal Assistant Secretary for Security (D)
Mr David CHIU Wai-kai, IDSM	Assistant Director of Immigration (Personal Documentation)
Mr LOK Wai-man	Assistant Director of Immigration (Information Systems)
Miss Caroline FAN Mei-hing	Chief Systems Manager (Technology Services), Immigration Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

Item No. 2 – FCR(2015-16)6

CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND

HEAD 710 – COMPUTERISATION

Fire Services Department

New Subhead "Development of computer system for provision of post-dispatch advice"

The meeting continued with the deliberation on the item.

2. Mr IP Kwok-him, Mr NG Leung-sing and Mr Abraham SHEK expressed support for the item. These members expressed commendation for the efficiency of emergency ambulance services ("EAS") provided by the Fire Services Department ("FSD"), and urged the Administration to expedite the implementation of the proposed system for post-dispatch advice ("PDA").

3. Deputy Director of Fire Services ("DDFS") said that the Administration would strive to implement the PDA system as soon as practicable.

Choice of hospital by patients using emergency ambulance services

4. While conceding that it was normally reasonable for EAS to take patients to the nearest public hospital, Mr LEUNG Ka-lau asked whether a patient could be taken to a private hospital of his choice if the private hospital had made prior preparations to admit the patient.

5. Under Secretary for Security ("US for S") explained that the Administration's policy on EAS, which was a public service, was to ensure the timely delivery of patients to the nearest hospital for receiving emergency medical care, which might not necessarily be the hospital of their choice. Mr IP Kwok-him and Mr NG Leung-sing expressed agreement with the Administration's explanation.

6. The Chairman said that members should focus their discussions on the item under deliberation and follow up policy issues at the Panel on Health Services.

Training for operators of the PDA system

7. Mr IP Kwok-him asked whether the current funding proposal included training for staff, which would be vital for the provision of PDA. DDFS replied that the Administration fully recognized the importance of training for staff, and operators of the PDA system, namely Fire Services Communications Centre ("FSCC") operators, would undergo a 12-week training programme. To ensure quality services, individual FSCC operators would receive a minimum of 40 hours of training on PDA, and there would be daily spot checks on PDA given by the operators.

8. Mr KWOK Wai-keung enquired why the regular assessment of FSCC operators would start to incur expenditure in 2019-20 but not in 2018-19 when the PDA system was put to use. DDFS said that as the expenditure for training and assessments of FSCC operators in 2018 was included in the provision for the capital expenditure for the system.

Anticipated benefits of the PDA system

9. Mr TSE Wai-chuen expressed support for the item. He enquired how the PDA system could benefit the efficiency and quality of PDA provided to ambulance callers, and whether it was compatible with FSD's Third Generation Mobilizing System ("TGMS") for dispatch of fire appliances and ambulances.

10. US for S said that the PDA system would incorporate a well-structured questioning protocol prompting mainly "yes" or "no" answers from EAS callers, which would allow FSCC operators to grasp the patients' conditions systematically, thereby providing PDA for stabilising the patients' conditions before the arrival of an ambulance. The questioning protocol for PDA was well-established, clinically approved, adopted worldwide and constantly improved by the International Academies of Emergency Dispatch ("IAED"). DDFS supplemented that using the PDA system in conjunction with the TGMS, the FSCC could provide ambulance dispatch and PDA simultaneously.

11. Mr LEUNG Ka-lau enquired about the maximum number of ambulance calls that the PDA system could handle simultaneously. DDFS said that normally there were 12 operators handling emergency ambulance calls

at the FSCC concurrently, and other staff at the FSCC could be deployed to provide extra manpower for handling emergency ambulance calls if there was a surge in operational demands. On average, the FSCC handled about 2 000 calls a day. However, due to varying circumstances of individual cases, the Administration did not have an estimate of the average time required for handling a call or the number of ambulance calls that could be handled concurrently.

12. Mr Alan LEONG, Mr WU Chi-wai and Mr LEUNG Ka-lau requested the Administration to explain in detail the operation and cost-effectiveness of the proposed PDA system and how it would provide better assistance than the existing arrangement for providing PDA.

13. DDFS said that under the existing arrangement, operators of the FSCC would dispatch an ambulance immediately after obtaining information on the location of the incident and the nature of injury or sickness. However, the call would be discontinued and PDA would only be provided if the nature of the ambulance call fell within the six types of easily identified injury/sickness. Under the present proposal, the PDA system would expand the coverage to over 30 types of injury/sickness, basically covering all types of injury/sickness that FSD dealt with in its daily handling of emergency ambulance calls. Under the proposed PDA system, the procedures of taking calls and dispatching resources would be taken up by two FSCC operators as call-taker and dispatcher respectively. Once a call-taker confirmed the location of the incident, the nature of the call and the caller's contact information, the computer system would instantly transmit the information and dispatch instructions to a dispatcher for the immediate dispatch of ambulances. Meanwhile, the call-taker would maintain communication with the caller on the phone, raise a set of pre-structured questions according to the questioning protocol in the system to grasp the patient's conditions systematically, thereby giving detailed and appropriate PDA to the caller through immediate analysis by the computer system. There would be no delay in the process of dispatching an ambulance as the dispatching and questioning processes would be taken up separately by two operators.

14. Medical Director, Ambulance Command/Fire Services Department supplemented that the proposed PDA system could enable the call-taker to better ascertain the patient's conditions, thereby giving appropriate and more sophisticated PDA to the caller, such as instructions on cardiopulmonary resuscitation, which could promote a higher chance of patient survival.

15. US for S indicated that the PDA system was effective in enhancing the EAS as shown by the overseas experiences.

16. Mr Alan LEONG requested the Administration to provide supplementary information to substantiate the claim, which would serve as documentary reference in case the Director of Audit conducted value-for-money study on the proposed PDA system in future.

Project tendering and implementation

17. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Ms Emily LAU considered that the two-year lead time for implementing the project was too long, and urged the Administration to shorten the lead time.

18. DDFS said that tender preparation for the project was underway, but the preparation of tender documents would require getting input from other departments, including the Department of Justice and the Government Logistics Department ("GLD"). A considerable amount of time would also be required for testing the PDA system's hardware and software operations, its integration with the TGMS, and proper translation of nomenclature for the questioning protocol. Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) said that the Administration would strive to streamline the tendering procedures where possible, and it was possible to shorten the time required for preparing the tender for the PDA system.

19. Mr LEUNG Ka-lau sought clarification on how the contractors for developing the software of the PDA system were selected and the relevant software licensing fee arrangements.

20. DDFS said that the software of the PDA system was developed based on the questioning protocol maintained by IAED. FSD would choose the contractors recognized by IAED for providing the required software of the PDA system. The Administration had already contacted IAED for viewing the demonstration of the PDA system by prospective contractors.

21. Mr LEUNG Ka-lau expressed concern that there might not be sufficient competition among the contractors recommended by IAED for developing the PDA system. He surmised that the Administration might have already chosen a contractor prior to tendering.

22. Mr Albert CHAN shared a similar concern. Citing the purchase of the faulty Autotrac 3 system by the Civil Aviation Department as an example, Mr CHAN cast doubt on the impartiality of Government departments in drafting tender specifications in the procurement process. He enquired about the mechanism, if any, to prevent tender specifications from favouring particular contractors.

23. US for S said that there were established procedures to ensure the integrity of the tender process, including scrutiny of specifications by GLD, as well as the Central Tender Board, both of which were independent from FSD. Standard Government contracts also included clauses for termination in the event that the goods and services provided by the contractors were not to the satisfaction of the Administration.

24. Mr NG Leung-sing suggested that the Administration consider using contingency provision to expedite the implementation of the PDA system, such as hiring more staff if necessary.

25. US for S said that the capital expenditure of the project had provided for contingency expenses to cover unforeseen circumstances, such as upward adjustments to prices for the hardware and software due to inflation, fluctuations in currency exchange rates, etc.

Upgrading of the PDA system

26. On enquiries by Mr KWOK Wai-keung and Mr Jeffrey LAM, DDFS said that the expected service lifespan of the proposed PDA system was about 10 years. The software of the PDA system would be updated annually to deploy the most up-to-date questioning protocol developed by IAED. The questioning protocol in use upon the completion of the project would be the latest version available at that time.

27. On enquiry by Mr WU Chi-wai, DDFS said that the software for the PDA system would be Microsoft Windows-based. Mr Charles MOK envisaged that the PDA system could be enhanced for different operating systems, such as Linux.

28. Mr WU Chi-wai expressed concern about the compatibility of the PDA system with TGMS, particularly in the event that TGMS would also be upgraded in future. In that case, the future enhancements required for the PDA system would inevitably incur additional expenses. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed a similar concern.

29. DDFS said that one of the requirements for the PDA system was its compatibility with TGMS. Provisions for enhancements of the PDA system were included in the recurrent expenditure of the item. Since the existing TGMS was rolled out in 2005 and its expected operation lifespan was between 10 to 15 years, the Administration had hired a consultant to conduct a study on upgrading the TGMS. He assured members that the Administration would ensure compatibility of the PDA system with the future upgraded TGMS.

Other concerns

30. Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed support for the item and commendation for the high-quality service provided by EAS. He urged the Administration to consider installing tail-lifts for all ambulances to accommodate the wheelchairs used by some of the patients.

31. DDFS said that while some ambulances had been equipped with tail-lifts, there were operational difficulty in accommodating wheelchairs inside the ambulances and the priority of ambulances was the timely delivery of patients for immediate medical care.

32. Ms Cyd HO expressed support for the item but was concerned that the complexity in operating the PDA system might delay the response to emergencies by the FSCC. She asked the Administration to provide information on the time taken from the activation of the interactive voice response system when a person dialled the 999 emergency call to the time when the caller received a response from the EAS.

33. US for S undertook to provide supplementary information to address Ms Cyd HO's enquiry after the meeting. DDFS said that as PDA and ambulance dispatch would be handled by two different FSCC operators, the provision of PDA using the proposed system would not cause delay in ambulance dispatch.

34. Mr KWOK Wai-keung expressed support for the item. He enquired about how the personal data collected by the PDA system would be transferred to ambulance staff on their way to retrieve the patient.

35. DDFS said that patients' information would be transferred from the FSCC to the ambulance staff via mobile data terminals installed in the ambulances or mobile phones, both of which were found to be reliable means for the secured transfer of information.

Voting on FCR(2015-16)6

36. There being no other question from members, the Chairman put the item to vote. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND
HEAD 710 – COMPUTERISATION
Immigration Department
New Subhead "Next Generation Smart Identity Card System"

37. The Chairman advised that the item sought the Committee's approval of a new commitment of \$1,448,786,000 for the Next Generation Smart Identity Card System.

Report by Panel Chairman

38. Mr IP Kwok-him, Chairman of the Panel on Security ("the Panel"), reported that the Panel discussed the proposal on 6 January, 3 February and 3 March 2015. Some members of the Panel expressed concern about the security and privacy protection of the new smart Hong Kong Identity Card ("new smart HKIC"), where someone with a suitable device might be able to read information stored in the chip of a new smart HKIC from a distance without being noticed by the cardholder. Members also expressed concern about the types of data stored, the serviceable lifespan and the replacement arrangement of the proposed new smart HKIC.

39. To these concerns, the Administration had responded that the proposed new smart HKICs would adopt a bi-level encryption mechanism and the question of someone, without being authorized, reading information stored inside a new smart HKIC would not be allowed. Panel members held different opinions as to whether the proposal should be put forth for the Finance Committee ("FC")'s consideration. At the meeting on 3 February 2015, 14 members expressed support for and 11 members were against the submission of the proposal to FC.

40. Mr IP Kwok-him said that in response to concerns raised by members about security and privacy protection of the new smart HKIC, the Administration had provided a written reply, which was tabled for the Panel's further deliberation on 3 March 2015.

41. The Chairman said that as two members had requested to speak and the meeting was near its scheduled end time, the item should be carried over to the next meeting. He declared that the meeting be adjourned.

42. The meeting was adjourned at 7:04 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
5 October 2015