

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC47/15-16

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 59th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 10 July 2015, at 2:31 pm

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH

Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS

Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Professor Sophia CHAN, JP	Under Secretary for Food and Health
Miss Diane WONG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2
Mr CHIU Yu-chow	Assistant Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (Grade Management and Development)
Mr LEUNG Koon-kee, JP	Director of Architectural Services
Mrs Alice YU NG Ka-chun	Project Director (3), Architectural Services Department
Mr David LAM	District Planning Officer (Tuen Mun and Yuen Long West), Planning Department
Mr HO Wai-kee	Acting Chief Traffic Engineer (New Territories West), Transport Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1)7

Mr Raymond SZETO
Mr Frankie WOO
Ms Michelle NIEN
Miss Yannes HO

Council Secretary (1)5
Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Legislative Assistant (1)5
Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

Scheduling additional meetings from 14 to 18 July 2015

Mr Albert CHAN pointed out that according to the outcome of the consultation with members regarding the Administration's request for scheduling additional Finance Committee ("FC") meetings between 14 and 18 July 2015, there were equal numbers of members who respectively supported or objected to the holding of additional meetings on some of the dates. He questioned the justification for the Chairman's decision to schedule additional meetings on those dates.

2. The Chairman said that in addition to members' views expressed in the consultation, he had taken into account other relevant factors such as the request by three members that 11 items from FCR(2015-16)29 related to the recommendations of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") be singled out for separate discussion and voting at the FC meeting. To allow sufficient time for the deliberation of all the outstanding agenda items, he had decided that additional meetings should be held during the above-mentioned period.

Item No. 1 – FCR(2015-16)29

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 16, 24 AND 30 JUNE 2015**

3. The Chairman said that the item invited the Committee to approve the recommendations of the PWSC made at its meetings on 16, 24 and 30 June 2015. Mr Albert CHAN, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen had requested that the items PWSC(2015-16)9, 19, 21, 22, 24, 26, 29, 30, 31, 32 and 33 should be considered and voted on separately at the FC meeting.

4. The Chairman put the remaining items in FCR(2015-16)29 (i.e. PWSC(2015-16)20, 23, 27, 28, 34, 35, 37, 38 and 39) to vote. At the request of Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman announced that 50 members voted for and no member voted against the item. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che
Mr IP Kwok-him
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Ms Claudia MO
Mr James TIEN Pei-chun
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Mr Kenneth LEUNG
Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Mr SIN Chung-kai
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan
(50 members)

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr WONG Yuk-man
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Dennis KWOK
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Mr IP Kin-yuen
Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen

5. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the items.

PWSC(2015-16)19

HEAD 703 – BUILDINGS

Environmental Hygiene – Burial grounds, columbaria and crematoria

19NB – Provision of columbarium and garden of remembrance at Tsang Tsui, Tuen Mun

6. The Chairman said that the item invited the Committee to approve the upgrading of 19NB to Category A at an estimated cost of \$2,874.3 million in money-of-the-day prices for the provision of a columbarium and garden of remembrance ("GoR") at Tsang Tsui, Tuen Mun.

7. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen expressed concern about the transportation arrangements and the traffic impact of the proposed project, in particular during the two peak grave sweeping periods every year. Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") and Acting Chief Traffic Engineer (New Territories West), Transport Department ("Atg CTE(NTW)/TD") advised that a traffic impact assessment ("TIA") study was conducted to assess the traffic impact of the proposed project. The study included the estimated traffic flow induced by the project, the traffic conditions of the new access road and the adjacent road network on peak grave sweeping days and other days. It concluded that the additional vehicular traffic arising from the proposed project would not adversely affect the performance of the key roads in the vicinity of the project site with the implementation of appropriate traffic improvement measures, and special transport, traffic and crowd control arrangements during the peak periods. The Administration had consulted the Tuen Mun District Council ("TMDC") on the project, and had addressed the concerns of TMDC members on traffic issues. TMDC members had no objection to the proposed project.

Motion to adjourn further proceedings of the Committee

8. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen moved, without notice, a motion under paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure that further proceedings of the Committee should then be adjourned. Thereupon the Chairman proposed the question on Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's motion to adjourn. The Chairman directed that a member when speaking on the question might not speak more than once and should not make a speech for longer than three minutes.

9. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen introduced his motion. He expressed grave dissatisfaction against the Administration's request for scheduling additional 14 FC meetings from 14 to 18 July 2015. He pointed out that according to the outcome of the consultation with members, there were equal numbers of members who respectively supported or objected to the holding of additional meetings on some of the above-mentioned dates. He criticized the Chairman's acceding to the Administration's request. He added that he and two other members made the request for separate discussion and voting of 11 PWSC items of the discussion paper FCR(2015-16)29 at the FC meeting only after the Administration had unreasonably requested the scheduling of the additional 14 FC meetings.

10. Mr Gary FAN, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr SIN Chung-kai, Ms Claudia MO, Ms Emily LAU, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Mr Alan LEONG, Mr WONG Yuk-man, Mr Albert CHAN and Mr LEE Cheuk-yan expressed grave dissatisfaction against the Administration's request for scheduling additional meetings, which they considered a means aimed at

forcing the Committee to approve the funding proposal for the establishment of the Innovation and Technology Bureau ("ITB") before the summer recess of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), and was an act of disrespect to LegCo. Mr Gary FAN expressed support for Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's motion while Dr Fernando CHEUNG indicated that he did not support the motion.

11. In response to Mr James TO's enquiry, the Chairman advised that if the motion to adjourn further proceedings of the Committee was carried, the second and third meetings scheduled for the day would be cancelled. If the motion was negatived, no member would be allowed to move such a motion again in the second and third meetings of the day.

12. Mr WONG Kwok-hing, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung, Dr Elizabeth QUAT, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Mr Steven HO and Dr CHIANG Lai-wan spoke against the motion. They criticized that the adjournment motion was nothing more than a filibustering tactic aimed at procrastinating the funding process of the proposed ITB, and if passed, would defer the Committee's deliberation of the agenda items directly related to the livelihood of Hong Kong people.

13. The Administration did not have comments in response to the motion.

14. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen delivered concluding remarks.

15. The Chairman put to vote Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's motion that further proceedings of the Committee be then adjourned. At the request of Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. Six members voted in favour of and 45 members voted against the motion. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai
(6 members)

Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr WONG Yuk-man
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

Against:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan
Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Vincent FANG Kang
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan

Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Mr CHAN Kin-por
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr IP Kwok-him
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit	Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr James TIEN Pei-chun	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok	Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr KWOK Wai-keung	Mr Dennis KWOK
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Mr SIN Chung-kai	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr TANG Ka-piu	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	
(45 members)	

16. The Chairman declared that the motion was negatived.
17. The Committee resumed deliberation on the item PWSC(2015-16)19.
18. Pointing out that there was a large demand for public niches, Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed support for the proposal and called on members of the opposition camp to stop filibustering the funding proposal.

Transport arrangements for visitors to the columbarium

19. Mr Albert CHAN and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen supported the development of more columbarium facilities to meet the demand for public niches. Mr Albert CHAN enquired about the results of TIA in terms of the estimated maximum number of columbarium visitors during peak hours, as well as the special transport arrangements in grave sweeping periods. He was concerned that the traffic to Lung Kwu Tan Village, which was in the vicinity of the proposed columbarium, would be affected during peak grave sweeping periods.

20. USFH and Atg CTE(NTW)/TD responded that it was estimated that there would be a maximum of 16 000 columbarium visitors during peak hours in grave sweeping periods. Private cars would not be allowed to enter the proposed columbarium during peak grave sweeping periods, and feeder bus services would be provided between the proposed columbarium and the Tuen Mun West Rail Station, the Mass Transit Railway Tsing Yi Station and the

Tuen Mun Road Bus-Bus Interchange. The consultants and the Transport Department had confirmed that there was sufficient space to provide pick-up and drop-off areas for feeder bus services at the above three locations during peak grave sweeping periods. The TIA study concluded that the additional vehicular traffic arising from the proposed project would not adversely affect the performance of the key roads in the vicinity of the project site with the implementation of appropriate traffic improvement measures, and special transport, traffic and crowd control arrangements during the peak periods.

21. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether the above estimated maximum number of columbarium visitors had included visitors to the GoR. Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2 replied that while the TIA covered the traffic data for the proposed columbarium at Tsang Tsui, the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department and the Transport Department had separate discussions, drawing reference from the number of visitors to other GoRs, and accepted the estimation of maximum number of visitors to the proposed GoR at Tsang Tsui. In response to Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's and Mr Albert HO's queries about the justifications for leaving out the number of visitors to the GoR in the TIA, USFH said that in line with the concept of green burials, the Administration had launched the Internet Memorial Service which provided users the way to pay tribute to the deceased anytime and anywhere they wanted. Therefore, it was estimated that the number of visitors to GoR would be lower than that of columbarium visitors. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration provided copies of the TIA report to Mr Albert CHAN and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen for their reference.

Facilities in the GoR and columbarium building

22. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen sought information on the design and size of the plaques to be mounted on the designated walls in GoR in memory of the deceased, and enquired whether the Administration would consider building more designated walls for mounting of plaques. USFH responded that information on the plaque sample used in the Diamond Hill GoR was provided to PWSC members upon Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's request at the PWSC meeting held on 16 June 2015. The Administration would keep in view the demand for facilities of GoR and consider building more designated walls when necessary.

23. In response to Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's enquiry about the number of niches in the columbarium building, USFH advised that the initial design of the columbarium building involved the provision of 110 000 niches. In response to TMDC's suggestion for the provision of more niches to optimize the use of the site, the Administration had conducted an additional TIA on the basis of housing 160 000 niches, and revised the detailed design accordingly.

Traffic arrangements

24. Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Mr Albert HO were concerned about the access to the proposed columbarium by persons with disabilities and the elderly with mobility problems. They suggested that the Administration should consider allowing access to the columbarium by private cars bearing "Disabled Person's Parking Permit" and private vans carrying columbarium visitors during peak grave sweeping periods. Mr HO pointed out that private vans were more efficient than taxis in terms of the number of passengers they carried. Dr CHEUNG also suggested that the Administration should provide suitable facilities to assist persons with disabilities in paying respect to the deceased.

25. USFH responded that according to the relevant TIA, there would be a large number of visitors to the proposed columbarium during the peak grave sweeping periods. Given the limited space in the facility and to better manage the vehicular and pedestrian flows entering and leaving the facility, the Administration planned to allow entry of franchised buses and taxis only during such periods. Upon completion of the project, the Administration would review the situation in the light of the actual operation and make appropriate traffic arrangements when necessary.

26. Mr Albert CHAN and Mr Albert HO expressed concern about the long term traffic planning of Lung Kwu Tan and the vicinity. Mr CHAN urged the Administration to construct a new road connecting Nim Wan Road to Lau Fau Shan in Yuen Long so as to improve the road network and access to the area. USFH responded that the consultancy studies for the West New Territories landfill extension project would include a feasibility study on connecting Nim Wan Road with Ha Pak Nai. The Administration would brief TMDC and the Yuen Long District Council on the consultancy studies in due course.

27. The Chairman announced that the meeting be adjourned and deliberation on the agenda items would continue at the next meeting after a break of 10 minutes.

28. The meeting was adjourned at 4:29 pm.