

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC51/15-16

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(1)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

**Minutes of the 63rd meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Tuesday, 14 July 2015, at 11:10 am**

Members present:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS

Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Hon WONG Yuk-man

Hon Claudia MO

Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai

Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-ye, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Vincent LIU Ming-kwong, JP	Deputy Secretary for the Environment
Miss Sheena YAP Kah-yan	Assistant Secretary for the Environment (Energy) ²
Mr LAI Hon-chung, JP	Assistant Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services (Electricity and Energy Efficiency)
Mr LO Siu-kuen	Acting Chief Engineer (Energy Efficiency) B, Electrical and Mechanical Services Department
Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP	Acting Deputy Director of Home Affairs (1)
Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong	Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department
Mr Anthony LI Ping-wai, JP	District Officer (Islands), Home Affairs Department
Ms Dilys CHEUNG Yuk-king	Chief Leisure Manager (New Territories West), Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr CHOW Yuk-tong, BBS, MH	Chairman, Islands District Council
Ms CHAU Chuen-heung, BBS, MH, JP	Vice Chairman, Islands District Council

Ms Cora HO Lai-sheung, JP	District Officer (Sha Tin), Home Affairs Department
Mr WONG Wai-man	Deputy Project Manager (New Territories East) 1, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr HO Hau-cheung, BBS, MH	Chairman, Sha Tin District Council

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Daniel SIN	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

Item No. 1 – FCR(2015-16)29

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 16, 24 AND 30 JUNE 2015**

PWSC(2015-16)29

HEAD 705 – CIVIL ENGINEERING

Civil Engineering – Multi-purpose

45CG – District Cooling System at the Kai Tak Development

The Committee continued the deliberation on the item PWSC(2015-16)29 which was taken out from the recommendations of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") made on 16 June 2015 for separate voting.

Motion proposed by Mr Albert CHAN

2. Mr Albert CHAN moved, without notice, a motion under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on the pipe laying works under Phase III (Package B) of the District Cooling System at the Kai Tak development.

3. The Chairman ruled that the motion proposed by Mr Albert CHAN was directly related to the funding proposal under discussion. He then put to vote the question that the motion from Mr Albert CHAN numbered [0001](#) be proceeded forthwith. At Mr CHAN's request, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr Albert CHAN read out his proposed motion during the ringing of the division bell. The Chairman declared that the question was negatived.

Voting on PWSC(2015-16)29

4. There being no further question from members, the Chairman put the item PWSC(2015-16)29 to vote. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman announced that 36 members voted for and no member voted against the proposal. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him	Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee
Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan	Mr CHAN Kin-por
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr IP Kwok-him	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip	Mr WONG Yuk-man
Mr NG Leung-sing	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
Mr IP Kin-yuen	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr TANG Ka-piu	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun	Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen
(36 members)	

5. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

PWSC(2015-16)32

HEAD 707 – NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Open spaces

453RO – Signature Project Scheme (Central and Western District) – Harbourfront Enhancement and Revitalisation at the Western Wholesale Food Market

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Mixed amenity packages

61RG – Signature Project Scheme (Islands District) – Yung Shue Wan Library cum Heritage and Cultural Showroom, Lamma Island

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Sports facilities

285RS – Signature Project Scheme (Islands District) – Improvement Works at Silvermine Bay Beach, Mui Wo, Lantau Island

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Mixed amenity packages

59RG – Signature Project Scheme (North District) – Improvement of Trails and Provision of Ancillary Facilities at Wu Tip Shan and Wa Mei Shan in Fanling

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Mixed amenity packages

60RG – Signature Project Scheme (North District) – Improvement of Trails and Provision of Facilities in Sha Tau Kok

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Cultural facilities

70RE – Signature Project Scheme (Wong Tai Sin District) – Enhancement of Leisure Facilities of Morse Park

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Mixed amenity packages

65RG – Signature Project Scheme (Sham Shui Po District) – Mei Foo Neighbourhood Activity Centre

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Open spaces

454RO – Signature Project Scheme (Sha Tin District) – Revitalisation of Shing Mun River Promenade near Sha Tin Town Centre

6. The Chairman advised that FCR(2015-16)29 invited the Committee to approve eight of the ten projects under PWSC(2015-16)32, namely, 453RO, 61RG, 285RS, 59RG, 60RG, 70RE, 65RG and 454RO, under the Signature Project Scheme ("SPS") as recommended by PWSC at its meeting on 30 June 2015. There were requests from members that, among these eight projects, items 454RO and 285RS be discussed separately at the meeting. As for the other two projects under PWSC(2015-16)32, namely, 461RO – Redevelopment

of Sai Lau Kok Garden and 170CD – Decking of Tai Wai Nullah in Sha Tin, the Government would submit the project proposals to the Committee for consideration in due course.

454RO – Signature Project Scheme (Sha Tin District) – Revitalisation of Shing Mun River Promenade near Sha Tin Town Centre

7. Pointing out the potential health effects of the light emitted from light-emitting diode (commonly known as "LED") light bulbs, in particular the toxic effect of blue light and the risk of glare, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed concern whether the Administration would adopt LED light fittings under the project 454RO. Deputy Project Manager (New Territories East)1, Civil Engineering and Development Department ("DPM(NTE)1, CEDD") advised that LED lighting products had become increasingly popular in both interior and exterior lighting product applications because of its longer service life, more versatile colour changing ability and lower power consumption. Under 454RO, new LED lighting systems would be installed for Lek Yuen Bridge, Sand Martin Bridge and Banyan Bridge. Light would be directed on the body of the bridges so as to create soft light reflection. The mounting heights and aiming angles of the LED lights would be so adjusted that the original light sources could not be seen directly. Under normal circumstances, the use of LED lights would not pose any health risks or cause light nuisance to nearby developments. DPM(NTE)1, CEDD further explained that when designing the lighting systems for the two footbridges, the angles and illumination levels of the existing street lights nearby would be taken into consideration to minimise excessive glare to pedestrians.

8. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen further enquired whether LED lighting products manufactured in the Mainland would be procured for the project. DPM(NTE)1, CEDD explained that as Hong Kong was a member of the World Trade Organisation, the Government had to comply with a corresponding set of procurement requirements for goods and services. Subject to the funding approval of the Committee, the Government planned to invite tenders for 454RO in September 2015 and commence construction works in late 2015. Mr CHAN urged the Administration to take into account the quality and safety of products when conducting procurement.

9. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung enquired about the on/off time and energy efficiency of the LED lighting products to be installed on the three bridges. Mr Albert CHAN also sought comparison between the energy saving performance of LED lights and compact fluorescent lamps ("CFLs"). Chairman, Sha Tin District Council ("C, STDC") advised that the three bridges would be installed with thematic LED lighting systems which would showcase

featured lighting effects at dedicated junctures, such as Christmas and other special events. The thematic lighting systems would dovetail with each other to ensure coherence and enhance aesthetics. The thematic lighting systems would also be synergized with the annual temporary festive lighting in Sha Tin ("ST") District each year.

10. As regards the energy efficiency of LED lights and CFLs, DPM(NTE)1, CEDD explained that LED lighting products consumed less energy than conventional lighting, thus reducing energy costs. For example, assuming that the LED lighting system for Lek Yuen Bridge was to operate for around three hours a day, the electricity charge per day would be about \$8. For the other two bridges, the estimated electricity charges would be around \$30 to \$40 assuming operation for three hours a day. The estimated recurrent expenditure arising from 454RO had included the costs of replacement and maintenance of LED lighting products. Disposal of LED lighting products would be conducted according to relevant regulations and procedures.

11. Mr WONG Yuk-man doubted the cost effectiveness of 454RO in revitalising the promenade of Shing Mun River. He criticised the Administration for not making reference to the successful design and management of promenades in other cities, such as Cheong Gye Cheon of Seoul in South Korea.

12. C, STDC advised that, in deciding on the scope of the SPS projects of ST District, STDC had made reference to different waterfront promenade projects, and the proposed scope of works under 454RO comprised not only installation of new lighting systems, but also creation of space and improvement of display facilities along the promenade. Given the various existing facilities and attractions along the promenade of Shing Mun River, 454RO would focus on improvement and construction works on the portion of the promenade around ST town centre. District Officer (Sha Tin), Home Affairs Department ("DO(ST), HAD") supplemented that STDC had engaged the Kadoorie Institute of the University of Hong Kong on, amongst others, revitalisation of Shing Mun River in general in 2009. Capitalising on the SPS, STDC proposed to undertake 454RO to enhance the promenade of Shing Mun River for public enjoyment. The Government would continue to monitor the water quality of Shing Mun River, carry out improvement works of the promenade as and when necessary and conduct studies to promote a water-friendly culture.

13. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen commented that the estimated cost of \$2 million for the organization of community involvement and publicity activities for 454RO was relatively high compared with other SPS projects. DO(ST), HAD advised that STDC planned to roll out an array of publicity and

promotional activities, including various public engagement programmes targeted at the younger generation and arts and cultural sector, so as to inspire creativity to 454RO as well as to promote arts and culture in ST District. As such, the estimated cost of \$2 million was considered reasonable. She further said that the Hong Kong Jockey Club Charities Trust had agreed in principle to donate up to \$40 million for the two SPS projects of ST District. Of the \$40 million, STDC planned to finance \$15.3 million in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices for the capital cost of 454RO. C, STDC stressed that the estimated cost for the organization of community involvement and publicity activities was reasonable given that the population in ST District was the largest among districts. Mr CHAN said that he was not convinced by the explanation.

14. Dr LO Wai-kwok and Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed support for 454RO to enhance space for public enjoyment. They said that 454RO had undergone lengthy discussions and thorough consultation, and it had not been easy for STDC to come up with a consensus on the proposal. They appealed to members to respect STDC's consensus views and support 454RO.

285RS – Signature Project Scheme (Islands District) – Improvement Works at Silvermine Bay Beach, Mui Wo, Lantau Island

15. Mr TANG Ka-piu expressed concern whether sufficient provision for contingencies had been set aside in the project estimates of 285RS to cater for any additional costs caused by unforeseen circumstances in case the Administration failed to obtain funding approval from the Committee for the project in the 2014-2015 session. Acting Deputy Director of Home Affairs (1) ("DDHA(1)(Ag.)") responded that the project costs of SPS projects to be sought from the Committee were in MOD prices so as to take into account inflation in construction cost. Furthermore, the estimates on the construction cost and duration of the proposed works were based on project definition statements, technical feasibility studies and detailed designs of the projects conducted by the Government. Besides, a contingency of about 10% of the construction cost had been set aside for each project to cater for unforeseen circumstances during construction. She assured members that the Government would strive to implement the two SPS projects of Islands District within the budget of \$100 million earmarked for the district. Subject to the funding approval of the Committee, the Government would invite tenders for the projects.

16. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed support for 285RS to rejuvenate the Silvermine Bay ("SMB") beach and attract more visitors to Mui Wo to bring business opportunities to the community. He considered that 285RS had undergone lengthy discussions and thorough consultation, and appealed to members to support the project.

17. Mr Albert CHAN said that he supported in principle 285RS. However, he was concerned whether the proposed improvement works under the project would be conducive to the organization of large-scale activities at the SMB beach, such as the SMB Music Festival. He suggested converting the proposed viewing deck into a performance stage for large-scale events and adopt a wooden design for the viewing deck to foster the relaxing atmosphere of the beach.

18. Vice Chairman, Islands District Council ("VC, IDC") advised that Mui Wo used to be a major tourist destination on Lantau Island and a variety of events and activities had been organized at the SMB beach. However, the overall design and the facilities of the SMB beach were dated and aged. Riding on CEDD's "Improvement Works at Mui Wo" project which would enhance the environment and attractiveness of Mui Wo town centre, 285RS aimed to rejuvenate the SMB Beach and boost the number of visitors to Mui Wo. As for the suggestion of converting the proposed viewing deck into a performance stage for the SMB Music Festival or other large-scale events, VC, IDC considered it not feasible as the viewing deck would be located near the entrance to the SMB beach. Detailed design for the beach facilities and buildings including the proposed viewing deck would be worked out, taking into account the environmental conditions and neighbourhood of the project site.

19. Mr Albert CHAN and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung further enquired whether electricity supply installations to support the organization of large-scale concerts would be included under 285RS, and whether sufficient electricity could be provided by those installations. District Officer (Islands), Home Affairs Department ("DO(I), HAD") advised that among the major events held at the SMB beach, the SMB Music Festival was of the largest scale with greatest power supply requirement. Having considered the electricity capacity available for the SMB beach, new sources of outdoor permanent power supply would be set up under 285RS. DO(I), HAD undertook to provide relevant information regarding the electricity supply installations under 285RS for members' reference.

Admin

[Post-meeting note: The Government's response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC234/14-15(01) on 4 August 2015.]

20. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Ms Claudia MO expressed concern about the provision of sanitary facilities on the SMB beach. VC, IDC assured members that after completion of 285RS, the facilities on the SMB beach would be significantly increased to better serve the increasing number of visitors

during the swimming seasons and major annual events such as the SMB Music Festival. DO(I), HAD then advised that the numbers of male and female toilet compartments would increase from seven and nine to 12 and 13 respectively. The numbers of male and female changing rooms would also increase from nine and seven to 11 and 12, representing an increase of 22% and 71% respectively. Moreover, there would also be provision of breast feeding room, family changing room and accessible toilet with shower, and the outdoor shower areas would be extended. Ms MO considered the proposed enhancement works could not alleviate the inadequate provision of sanitary facilities for female in public places. Mr LEUNG further urged for the provision of locker facilities for beach users as part of the improvement works under 285RS.

21. In response to Ms Claudia MO's enquiry about the enhancement of greenery under 285RS, VC, IDC said that 285RS would adopt a modern design for different beach facilities and buildings as well as the viewing deck to foster a relaxing atmosphere of holiday resorts and provide visitors with a venue to enjoy sea views. DO(I), HAD further advised that 285RS would involve the removal of 15 trees, including 14 to be felled and one to be transplanted within the project site. All the trees to be removed were not important trees. The Government would incorporate planting proposals in 285RS, and \$10.6 million had been earmarked for external works and soft landscape including the relevant planting works.

Other issues

22. Mr James TO sought elaboration on whether the facilities and public open spaces to be provided with in the different SPS projects proposed by the 18 District Councils ("DCs") would be managed by government departments according to their by-laws. DDHA(1)(Ag.) advised that of the eight SPS projects under PWSC(2015-16)32 seeking the Committee's approval, the proposed Mei Foo Neighbourhood Activity Centre ("the Centre") in Sham Shui Po ("SSP") District would be operated and managed by the selected partner organisation, namely Yan Oi Tong ("YOT"). SSP District Office ("SSPDO") would sign a memorandum of understanding and service and tenancy agreements with YOT setting out, inter alia, YOT's responsibilities in operating and managing the Centre. SSPDC would set up a tripartite committee comprising representatives of SSPDC, SSPDO and YOT to monitor the operation of the Centre. She added that the management and maintenance of the facilities of the other seven projects would be taken up by the relevant government departments. VC, IDC added that the SMB beach would continue to be managed by Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") according to its by-laws, and prior approval from LCSD was required for organizing activities on the beach. C, STDC also advised that the proposed

Futsal pitch under the "Decking of Tai Wai Nullah in Sha Tin" project of STDC, which would be submitted to the Committee for consideration in due course, would also be managed by LCSD after completion.

23. While supporting the development of the Centre to provide services and activities of diverse nature to local residents in Mei Foo, Ms Claudia MO expressed concern whether YOT would take into account the political background of the organizations submitting applications for hiring of facilities in the Centre when approving applications. DDHA(1)(Ag.) emphasized that YOT was selected after an open and fair process. YOT would operate the Centre according to the provisions of the service agreement to be entered into with SSPDO. It would also be required to report the progress and operation of the Centre to SSPDC on a regular basis. She undertook to relay Ms MO's concerns to the Chairman of SSPDC and District Officer.

Voting on PWSC(2015-16)32

24. There being no further question or comment from members, the Chairman put the item PWSC(2015-16)32 to vote. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman said that 25 members voted for and no member voted against the proposal. No member abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Mr POON Siu-ping
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen
(25 members)

Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Dr LAM Tai-fai
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Mr IP Kwok-him
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Ms Claudia MO
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr MA Fung-kwok
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr TANG Ka-piu
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun

25. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

Action

26. The Chairman announced that the meeting was adjourned, and the Committee would discuss other items on the agenda at the next meeting scheduled for 6:45 pm.

27. The meeting was adjourned at 1:10 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat

15 December 2015