

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(4)1461/14-15

(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/ED

**Panel on Education**

**Minutes of meeting**

**held on Wednesday, 15 July 2015, at 10:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** :
- Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP (Chairman)
  - Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)
  - Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
  - Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
  - Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
  - Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
  - Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
  - Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
  - Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
  - Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
  - Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
  - Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
  - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
  - Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
  - Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
  - Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
  - Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
  - Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
  - Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
  - Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
  - Hon Dennis KWOK
  - Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
  - Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
  - Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
  - Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Member attending** : Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

**Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

**Public Officers attending** : Agenda item II

Mr Eddie NG, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

Dr K K CHAN  
Deputy Secretary for Education (5)

Mr Stephen YIP  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum Development)  
Education Bureau

Mr Edwin TSUI  
Principal Education Officer (Hong Kong & Kowloon)  
Education Bureau

Agenda item III

Mr Eddie NG, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

Dr K K CHAN  
Deputy Secretary for Education (5)

Mr Stephen YIP  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum Development)  
Education Bureau

Dr C S TONG  
Secretary General  
Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority

Agenda item IV

Mr Eddie NG, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

Mr Brian LO, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Education (1)

- Invited participant** : Agenda item IV  
Dr Roy CHUNG Chi-ping, BBS, JP  
Chairman  
Task Force on Promotion of Vocational Education
- Clerk in attendance** : Miss Polly YEUNG  
Chief Council Secretary (4)4
- Staff in attendance** : Mr KWONG Kam-fai  
Senior Council Secretary (4)4  
  
Miss Mandy NG  
Council Secretary (4)4  
  
Ms Sandy HAU  
Legislative Assistant (4)4

---

Action

**I. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**

- (LC Paper No. CB(4)1133/14-15(01) -- Letter dated 30 April 2015 from Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan concerning the promotion of Basic Law education in schools and "Basic Law Video Teaching Resource Package"
- LC Paper No. CB(4)1133/14-15(02) -- Administration's written response dated 8 June 2015 to the letter dated 30 April 2015 from Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan concerning the promotion of Basic Law education in schools and "Basic Law Video Teaching Resource Package"
- LC Paper No. CB(4)1219/14-15(01) -- Referral from the Public Complaints Office of the Legislative Council Secretariat on policies relating to support

for child carers  
(*Restricted to members only*)

LC Paper No. CB(4)1280/14-15(01) -- Letter dated 16 June 2015 from Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan concerning the policy on funding support provided to post-secondary institutions by the University Grants Committee

LC Paper No. CB(4)1280/14-15(02) -- University Grants Committee's written response dated 3 July 2015 to the letter dated 16 June 2015 from Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan concerning the policy on funding support provided to post-secondary institutions by the University Grants Committee)

Members noted the above paper issued since the last meeting.

2. Before proceeding to the discussion items, the Chairman drew members' attention to Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure which provided that a Member shall not move any motion or amendment relating to a matter in which he had a pecuniary interest, whether direct or indirect, or speak on any such matter, except where he disclosed the nature of that interest. He reminded members to declare interests, if any, in the matter under discussion.

## **II. Implementation of civic education (including education on Basic Law and promoting understanding of "one country, two systems")**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(01) -- Paper provided by the Administration)

### Briefing by the Administration

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Education ("SED") briefed members on the implementation strategies, strengthening measures, work outcomes and way forward regarding the promotion of moral and civic education ("MCE") in school education (including Basic Law education and promoting understanding of "one country, two systems"), as set out in the Administration's

paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(01)].

## Discussion

### *Issues related to the implementation of MCE in schools*

4. Mrs Regina IP noted that according to the Administration, one of the objectives of promoting MCE was to cultivate students' positive values and attitudes. However, she was gravely concerned that some students' behaviour, such as protesting at graduation ceremonies and opposing the appointment of the president of a university which had gone through the due selection process, were totally incongruent with the objectives of MCE. Referring to the concept of a moral compass, Mrs IP was of the view that the Education Bureau ("EDB") should issue a statement to condemn the unruly behaviour of students and to remind them to act in a morally acceptable way.

5. SED highlighted that promoting MCE was an ongoing long journey and task of EDB. On certain occasions when students' actions had given rise to public concerns, EDB did respond by issuing public statements urging for core Hong Kong values of the rule of law and respect for others and upholding positive values and attitudes.

6. Mrs Regina IP noted with grave concern that during a TV interview, the vice-president of the students union of a local university expressed his view that Hong Kong should become an independent territory. He was also reluctant to identify himself as a Chinese national. Mrs IP considered that the main reason for this lack of national identity was the removal of Chinese ties from the existing school curriculum. For example, Chinese classic set texts had been taken out from the senior secondary Chinese Language subject. In this regard, SED said that whilst there had been different views expressed by students over topical issues in Hong Kong, there was no evidence that Chinese elements were removed from the school curriculum.

7. Mr Steven HO concurred that certain universal values should be promoted in MCE. He considered that the participation of some members of the legal profession in the illegal occupation movement had cast a negative effect on the implementation of MCE. Given the important role of teachers in implementing MCE and Basic Law education in schools, Mr HO was keen to ensure that teachers would not form and impart biased views. To enhance teachers' understanding of the Basic Law, he enquired whether EDB would improve the teaching resources by providing more elucidation on key provisions of the Basic Law. In reply, SED advised that EDB would continue to organize training programmes, seminars and sharing sessions on Basic Law for teachers and school principals.

Action

8. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen was of the view that sex education was part of MCE. He referred to the elements covered in the Revised Framework of Moral and Civic Education and highlighted that the learning expectations under the fourth key stage (Secondary 4 to 6) included how to develop stable and close relationship with people of the opposite sex. Mr CHAN considered that the learning expectations should be reviewed to include understanding and respect for people of different sexual orientations or gender identity. SED advised that the Equal Opportunities Commission had been invited to take part in relevant activities organized by EDB for enhancing the understanding of teachers and school principals on issues related to gender equality.

9. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan opined that the Administration should step up measures to enhance the national identity of young people in Hong Kong, as well as consider putting in place targets for evaluating the effectiveness of MCE.

10. In reply, SED said that the implementation of MCE was already an ongoing initiative and the Administration had not set specific targets on this. However, it was noted that promoting MCE and understanding of the Mainland through traditional channels such as classroom teaching might not be sufficient for students' learning motive. The Administration had therefore adopted a more dynamic approach by promoting Mainland student exchange and sister schools programmes to enable students to acquire direct experience in and exposure to developments in the motherland. The Administration would continue to update and enhance existing teaching materials. SED gave an example that he had met the students participating in the Inter-school Quiz Competition on Basic Law and found that they had good understanding of the Basic Law.

11. Mr WONG Kwok-hing concurred with the importance of MCE, and said that teachers played a pivotal role as they should set a good example for their students. Mr WONG appreciated the commitment and professionalism demonstrated by some teaching professionals, such as Mr LEUNG Kee-cheong, headmaster of Fresh Fish Traders' School, and considered that their exemplary acts should be duly recognized.

12. SED advised that MCE had been implemented through various school activities, such as school assemblies and classroom teaching, etc. Students were also encouraged to analyze issues from multiple perspectives. He referred to the Chief Executive's Award for Teaching Excellence which was set up to give due recognition to professional competence in teaching practices, including the delivery of MCE.

13. Mr Christopher CHUNG was gravely concerned that the Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union ("HKPTU") had appealed to teachers to take part in class boycott, while some members of the legal profession had flouted the law by

participating in the illegal occupation movement last year. He considered that some teaching and legal professionals had acted in blatant contravention of the law and set bad examples to young people. Mr CHUNG doubted whether MCE and Basic Law education could be effectively implemented if the teachers themselves did not have a correct understanding of the Basic Law, nor any respect for the rule of law.

14. SED said that the Administration was also concerned about the impact of the recent spate of incidents including the Occupy Movement on students. However, he was pleased to note that schools and the teaching force had upheld their professionalism and ensured that teaching and learning activities were carried on without disruption. Meanwhile, students were free to express and exchange diverse views.

15. The Chairman was of the view that the promotion of Basic Law education had not been effective. He noted that according to the Administration, schools could promote MCE and Basic Law education according to the context of the schools, students' needs and professional judgement. However, the Chairman considered that the Administration should take a more proactive role. He was also concerned about the professional capacity of teachers in promoting Basic Law education in schools.

16. Deputy Secretary for Education (5) ("DS(Ed)5") advised that EDB had been providing professional development programmes ("PDPs") to enhance the professional capacity of teachers in implementing MCE and Basic Law education in schools. In this connection, the Chairman requested the Administration to provide further information on the number of PDPs conducted in the past three years, the number of participating teachers, and the measures, if any, to further enhance these PDPs.

*(Post-meeting note: The Administration's written responses were issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1362/14-15(01) on 23 July 2015.)*

#### *Teaching and learning resources on the Basic Law*

17. Dr Kenneth CHAN said that the Progressive Lawyers Group ("PLG") (法政匯思) had recently published a report commenting on the Basic Law Video Teaching Resource Package 2015 (活學趣論·基本說法——《基本法》視像教材套 2015) ("the Package") which was produced by EDB earlier this year. He referred to PLG's conclusion that civic education and Basic Law education should not be confined to learning the legal provisions per se and that the concept of the rule of law did not merely mean obeying the law. Students should be encouraged to analyze issues objectively and from multiple perspectives. Dr CHAN highlighted that according to PLG, certain contents of the Package were incorrect and biased.

No detailed explanation had been given on important concepts such as civil rights and the rule of law.

18. The Deputy Chairman shared Dr Kenneth CHAN's views, and said that HKPTU had also published a report commenting on the inadequacies of the Package. He was also concerned that no legal experts had participated in the preparation of the Package.

19. SED advised that given the importance of the Basic Law as an important constitutional document for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region ("HKSAR"), EDB had made clarification and elucidated the issues in question in response to the comments made by PLG and HKPTU. He confirmed that renowned legal experts in Hong Kong had been consulted in the preparation of the Package.

20. The Deputy Chairman referred to the summary chart showing the relationship between the Central Authorities and HKSAR in module 3 of the Package, and noted with grave concern that according to the hierarchy as shown in the chart, the Chief Executive of HKSAR and the HKSAR Government were subordinate to the Hong Kong and Macao Affairs Office of the State Council. He queried whether the description was correct and consistent with relevant provisions of the Basic Law.

21. Dr Helena WONG, Mr Albert HO and Dr Fernando CHEUNG shared the Deputy Chairman's query. Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that the hierarchy as showed in the chart might be in contravention of Article 22 of the Basic Law, which stated that no departments of the Central People's Government, province, autonomous region, or municipality directly under the Central Government might interfere in the affairs which HKSAR administered on its own in accordance with the Basic Law.

22. In response, Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum Development) ("PAS(CD)") pointed out that as clearly indicated in the chart referred to by the Deputy Chairman, the relevant provision under reference was Article 12 of the Basic Law which stated that HKSAR shall be a local administrative region enjoying a high degree of autonomy and coming directly under the Central People's Government. He further said that the Package had been developed for junior secondary students. At junior secondary levels, the teaching and learning of the Basic Law should focus on basic knowledge. At the senior secondary levels, contemporary issues closely related to the Basic Law had been appropriately included in the Liberal Studies ("LS") curriculum.

23. Dr Priscilla LEUNG welcomed the launch of the Package but opined that it could be enhanced by including the judgements on court cases involving



constitutional issues which had given rise to public concerns. It would be useful if more examples could be given to illustrate how provisions of the Basic Law were relevant to people's daily life. Information on the background of the drafting of the Basic Law should also be provided. Dr LEUNG remarked that the Deputy Chairman's comments on the chart in module 3 of the Package might be due to inadequate understanding of the Basic Law and the organizational structure of the Central Authorities. It might also reflect that the promotion of Basic Law education over the years had not been successful.

24. Mr Michael TIEN said that EDB should issue teaching resources such as the Package earlier for use by schools. He considered that Basic Law education had not been effectively implemented, as many people were still unclear about how the concept of "one country, two systems" should operate in Hong Kong. Referring to many students' participation in illegal occupation movement and some other acts such as burning copies of the Basic Law, Mr TIEN remarked that their unruly behaviour reflected a lack of respect for the rule of law and the principle of "one country, two systems".

25. Mr Albert HO stressed the need for balanced coverage and objectivity if the Package was intended to serve useful teaching and learning purposes. He also noted with concern that no reference had been made to the two international covenants on human rights. Dr Fernando CHEUNG remarked that the promotion of MCE and Basic Law education appeared to be an attempt to promote national identity among people in Hong Kong and to play down intensifying conflicts between local people and Mainlanders. He considered it equally important for the Administration to promote understanding of civil rights.

26. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung and Dr Helena WONG considered that the concepts of "one country, two systems", administering Hong Kong affairs by people of Hong Kong, and a high degree of autonomy for HKSAR should be properly explained in the Package. Dr WONG suggested that a teacher handbook with more detailed explanation on key constitutional concepts should accompany the Package. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung however said that as constitutional issues were not under the policy purview of EDB, it might not be appropriate for EDB to elucidate the provisions of the Basic Law in the Package.

27. Mr Dennis KWOK noted that Basic Law education was also implemented through MCE and the LS curriculum. He recalled that in 2011, EDB had launched a set of learning package on Basic Law education, namely Understanding the Law, Access to Justice – Basic Law Learning Package (Junior Secondary) (明法達義——《基本法》學習教材套(初中)). Mr KWOK opined that Basic Law education should not be used as a means to impose on students the Administration's interpretation of the Basic Law provisions. Students should be given the opportunities to understand the Basic Law from different perspectives.

In this connection, the legal profession had been invited to give talks in schools on issues related to the rule of law, the Basic Law and "one country, two systems". Mr KWOK added that where appropriate, the legal profession would be pleased to exchange views with different sectors of the community and Members of the Legislative Council on various legal issues arising from the Basic Law.

28. SED took note of members' views and concerns on the Package. He advised that the Package, which comprised five modules, covered a wide range of concepts and issues on the rights and obligations of the people of Hong Kong. If put to good use, the Package would enable junior secondary students to develop a proper understanding of the concept of "one country, two systems", rights and obligations, and that the Basic Law was closely integrated into people's daily life and activities.

### **III. Progress of the New Academic Structure Medium-term Review: Senior Secondary Curriculum and Assessment**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(02) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(03) -- Updated background brief entitled "Issues related to the review of the new senior secondary curriculum and assessment" prepared by the LegCo Secretariat)

29. Members noted the background brief prepared by the Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(03)].

#### Briefing by the Administration

30. At the invitation of the Chairman, SED briefed members on the progress of the New Academic Structure ("NAS") Medium-term Review and the recommendations on the new senior secondary ("NSS") curriculum and assessment, as set out in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(02)].

#### Discussion

##### *Issues related to core subjects under the NSS curriculum*

31. Ms Starry LEE noted that among the existing four core subjects under the

NSS curriculum, only Mathematics was science-related while the other three core subjects, i.e. Chinese Language, English Language and LS, placed heavy emphasis on literary competency. She was concerned that the existing four core subjects might not provide a broad and balanced knowledge base for students.

32. DS(Ed)5 advised that under the NSS curriculum, in addition to the core subjects, students were given a much more diversified choice of elective subjects rather than being streamed early into arts and science classes as under the old academic system. It was noted that more than 60% of senior secondary students had taken elective subjects across different Key Learning Areas. In addition, the six modules in the curriculum of the LS subject covered different disciplines, including science and technology. The Administration would explore how to increase the science and technology elements in the Independent Enquiry Study ("IES") of the LS subject.

33. Mrs Regina IP was concerned that the Chinese Language subject lacked cultural and literary contents. She pointed out that student enrolment for the Chinese History and Chinese Literature subjects was low and even Cantonese buzzwords had been featured in public examination questions. To improve students' knowledge of Chinese culture, Mrs IP considered that the curriculum of the Chinese Language subject should be enriched by including more contents on Chinese culture and literature. In this regard, SED advised that to enhance students' appreciation of Chinese literature, 12 classical set texts had been prescribed in the NSS curriculum of the Chinese Language subject, at Secondary 4 in the 2015-2016 school year.

34. Mrs Regina IP noted that the Faculty of Medicine of The Chinese University of Hong Kong ("CUHK") had recently proposed to change its admission policy by allowing students with excellent results in the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education ("HKDSE") Examination to be admitted to the second year of its undergraduate programme. As a result, these students would be exempted from studying the foundation year of the university curriculum with its heavy emphasis on general education. Mrs IP said that as indicated by the universities, students' knowledge or attainment in LS was not crucial for studying various undergraduate programmes. She therefore questioned the need of maintaining LS as a mandatory NSS subject.

35. Dr Priscilla LEUNG was of the view that LS should be an elective, rather than a mandatory, subject under the NSS curriculum. She considered that even if LS was taken as an elective subject, students were still able to understand current affairs and analyze issues from multiple perspectives through conducting IES. Noting that the LS curriculum covered a wide range of specialized topics, Dr LEUNG was concerned about the professional capacity of teachers in teaching the subject and whether teachers and students could handle the heavy workload

arising from the LS subject. She also remarked that local universities usually did not give much weighting to students' HKDSE results in LS when considering their applications for admission to undergraduate programmes.

36. In this regard, SED said that the Administration had expressed reservation on CUHK's proposed change of admission policy. He also noted that CUHK had announced that it would not introduce any change to its admission policy for the cohort to be admitted in the 2015-2016 academic year. SED further said that according to media reports, other local universities shared the view that the LS subject played an important role under the NSS curriculum and in the whole-person education of students.

*Issues related to elective subjects under the NSS curriculum*

37. Mr Michael TIEN noted from the Administration's paper that EDB would encourage students to take three to four NSS elective subjects. However, according to his understanding, the percentage of students taking three NSS elective subjects had dropped from 27% in 2012 to 15% in 2015. This might indicate that students might not wish to increase their workload by taking more than two elective subjects. He therefore questioned the rationale for EDB's view.

38. Mr Charles MOK agreed with the Administration's suggestion that students should be encouraged to take more elective subjects if they were capable of doing so, as this would help broaden their knowledge base. However, he was concerned that in choosing elective subjects, students might only have in mind their chance of getting admitted to universities.

39. DS(Ed)5 explained that the number of elective subjects taken by most students might be due to the common practice among post-secondary institutions that only required four core subjects plus only one to two elective subjects of HKDSE as basic requirements for admission to their programmes. However, senior secondary students with high ability and extensive interests should be encouraged to take more elective subjects to broaden their knowledge base and explore more academic and career options. SED said that the Administration had all along encouraged students to take two to three elective subjects in addition to the four core subjects. If they decided to take a fourth elective subject (i.e. a total of eight subjects in the HKDSE Examination), it must come from a certain group of subjects as specified by the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority ("HKEAA") to align with the overall objectives of Other Learning Experiences.

40. Ms Starry LEE expressed concern about the relatively low uptake of certain elective subjects, such as Chinese History. In response, SED advised that Chinese History had been the eighth most popular subject among all the NSS

elective subjects in the first three HKDSE Examinations, and shared the rank of the seventh most popular subject with Information and Communication Technology ("ICT") in the enrolment rate for the 2015 HKDSE Examination. The drop in the number of students taking individual elective subjects was also the result of the decrease in the overall student population.

41. The Deputy Chairman enquired about the way forward after completion of the NAS Medium-term Review. Mr Charles MOK noted that one of the objectives of the NAS Review was to respond to macro changes in economic, scientific and technological developments in Hong Kong and even the world. He sought information on the measures, if any, to respond to these changes and on the review of the ICT subject.

42. DS(Ed)5 advised that upon completion of the Medium-term Review, all NSS subjects would be reviewed and improved on a regular basis taking into consideration their regular curriculum and assessment development cycle, and moving towards continual renewal under the "Learning to Learn 2.0" to keep abreast of the times. Meanwhile, the Chief Executive had announced in his 2015 Policy Address to enrich Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics education. PAS(CD) supplemented that the contents of the compulsory part of the ICT curriculum had been updated and refined.

43. The Chairman welcomed the NAS Medium-term Review. He enquired about the recognition of qualifications attained by students, in particular the qualifications obtained upon completion of Applied Learning ("ApL") courses. DS(Ed)5 explained that 12 ApL courses had been quality assured for recognition under the Qualifications Framework ("QF") at QF Level 3. A quality assurance mechanism had been put in place under which the delivery of ApL courses was subject to review by the Hong Kong Council for Accreditation of Academic and Vocational Qualifications. Secretary General, HKEAA ("SG, HKEAA") advised that students attaining the results of "Attained" in ApL subjects (Category B subjects) were accepted as having attained the competencies required at Level 2 of HKDSE. HKEAA would continue to promote international recognition of the HKDSE qualification including peer review of examination papers by overseas assessment authorities.

#### *Support for schools and teachers in implementing the NSS curriculum*

44. The Deputy Chairman said that some schools had reduced the number of elective subjects offered to their senior secondary students due to the lack of qualified teachers to teach the subjects. He was concerned about the heavy workload on teachers if additional elective subjects were offered by schools and the support provided to teachers and schools in implementing the NSS curriculum.

45. SED explained that the Administration had introduced a basket of relief measures aimed at preserving the stability and strengths of schools and the teaching force so as to alleviate the impact of the temporary decline in student population. One of the relief measures was to extend the retention period for surplus teachers so that experienced teachers could be retained.

46. Regarding the Deputy Chairman's enquiry on whether the Administration would release the detailed findings of the different surveys as mentioned in paragraphs 11 to 15 of its paper, SED said that the findings of various annual surveys were usually published by the end of year.

47. Dr Helena WONG expressed concern about the workload and pressure on teachers arising from supervising students' School-based Assessment assignments and catering for learner diversity, such as supporting non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students and students with special educational needs ("SEN"). Referring to the discontinuation of the Liberal Studies Curriculum Support Grant ("LSCSG"), which had been used by many schools to engage additional teachers or teaching assistants to support the teaching of the LS subject, Dr WONG asked whether any new source of funding would be provided.

48. SED recapitulated that various resources and support measures were in place for facilitating schools to cater for NCS students and SEN students. On concerns about the discontinuation of LSCSG, SED clarified that LSCSG had been introduced as a time-limited one-off grant to facilitate the introduction of the LS curriculum at the initial stage of implementing NAS. To relieve teachers' workload in preparing teaching materials for the LS subject, over 2 000 items of teaching materials were available from the web-based platform for LS teachers' use. EDB would also provide ready-to-use learning and teaching resources for teachers and encourage them to share teaching materials.

49. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung opined that the Administration should review the existing level of public expenditure on education and the support provided for schools. He noted with concern that there was a growing number of students taking other curricula and examinations such as the International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme, which might be a vote of no confidence on the existing NSS curriculum and assessment. He also highlighted that there were insufficient publicly-funded undergraduate places for the large number of students who could meet the minimum university entrance requirements.

#### *Support for SEN students and special schools*

50. Dr Fernando CHEUNG noted with concern that the support for SEN students and the implementation of the NSS curriculum in special schools had received very little attention in the NAS Medium-term Review. He referred to the

low uptake of ApL courses by students of special schools, and pointed out that unlike students in ordinary schools who could choose from diversified pathways, students who had completed senior secondary education in special schools would need adult services provided by the Social Welfare Department. He stressed the need to strengthen co-ordination between different departments/bureaux in providing support for secondary school leavers of special schools.

51. DS(Ed)5 informed members that under the current funding arrangement, schools with students taking ApL courses were contributing around 25% of the average course fees in general. To encourage more schools to offer ApL courses based on their student profiles, the Task Force on Promotion of Vocational Education had recommended that the Government should consider providing 100% subsidy to schools for the ApL course fees. She further said that apart from the NAS Medium-Term Review, the Administration was conducting another study on the implementation of NSS curriculum in special schools.

52. Dr Fernando CHEUNG sought latest information on the feasibility of allowing SEN students to use speech-to-text software and assistive tools in public examinations. In reply, SG, HKEAA advised that as approved by the Public Examination Board, starting from 2015-2016, eligible SEN candidates could apply to use speech-to-text software in taking the LS Examination in the 2017 HKDSE Examination.

#### **IV. Promotion of Vocational Education**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(04) -- Paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(05) -- Background brief entitled "Issues related to the promotion of vocational education" prepared by the LegCo Secretariat)

53. Members noted the background brief prepared by the Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(05)]. They also noted a submission from Hong Kong Unison Limited tabled at the meeting [subsequently issued vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1334/14-15(01)].

#### **Briefing by the Administration**

54. At the invitation of the Chairman, SED briefed members on latest developments of vocational education in Hong Kong and the work of the Task

Force on Promotion of Vocational Education ("the Task Force"), as set out in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(04)]. Dr Roy CHUNG, Chairman of the Task Force, briefed members on the strategies and recommendations proposed in the Task Force's report submitted to the Government in July 2015.

55. To allow sufficient time to complete the discussion and with the consent of all members present, the Chairman extended the meeting for about 30 minutes beyond the appointed end-time.

### Discussion

56. Some members including the Chairman, the Deputy Chairman, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Mrs Regina IP expressed appreciation for the work of the Task Force led by Dr Roy CHUNG.

### *The Task Force*

57. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan enquired whether the Task Force was set up on an ongoing basis. In reply, SED said that the Task Force, which was set up in June 2014 with a view to mapping out a strategy to promote vocational education, had completed its work and submitted a report. The Government would study ways to implement the recommendations of the Task Force.

58. Mr WONG Kwok-hing noted with concern the absence of any employee representative on the membership of the Task Force. He considered that if similar committees were appointed in future, their membership should include employee representatives. SED said that the Administration attached great importance to consultation with teaching staff of vocational education institutions to obtain their views on the implementation of vocational education and training ("VET").

59. To gauge the views and concerns of all relevant stakeholders, the Chairman concurred with Mr WONG Kwok-hing that employee representatives should be appointed as members of the Task Force.

### *Issues related to the promotion of vocational education*

60. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan considered that life planning education should be strengthened to enable secondary students to understand that university education was not the only option for them. She also highlighted the need to provide adequate structured training places on life planning education for teachers. SED informed members that the number of structured training places on life planning education for teachers had been increased from the previous 80 places to 240 places per annum from the 2014-2015 school year onwards. Experience sharing sessions for teachers had also been organized.



61. Dr Priscilla LEUNG expressed strong support for promoting vocational education. She said that as individuals differed in their aptitudes, interests and aspirations, traditional academic pursuits might not necessarily fit all. Dr LEUNG referred to specialization in certain trades such as hair styling, culinary arts and photography which could bring good incomes. She also considered it necessary to enhance the image and working conditions of industries such as the construction industry to attract newcomers.

62. Mrs Regina IP noted that in Hong Kong, the proportion of students taking ApL courses and vocation-oriented programmes was considerably lower than those in overseas jurisdictions such as South Korea and the United Kingdom. She enquired on the reasons for the low uptake and the measures, if any, to enhance recognition for vocational education. Referring to the close link between education and manpower, Mrs IP remarked that VET programmes should be geared to meeting the manpower needs for the future development of Hong Kong.

63. In this connection, SED explained that ApL courses were relatively new to students and parents. The low uptake of vocational education might be attributed to the lack of a clear definition of VET under the relevant government policy in Hong Kong. One of the Task Force's recommendations was to rebrand VET in Hong Kong as vocational and professional education and training ("VPET") covering programmes up to degree level with a high percentage of curriculum consisting of specialized contents in vocational skills or professional knowledge.

64. Dr Roy CHUNG said that VET was commonly perceived by different stakeholders as a second choice, with traditional academic pursuits being held as the preferred option. The Task Force therefore considered it necessary to rebrand VET as VPET with a view to promoting the message of "Every Trade has its Master (行行出專才)".

65. The Deputy Chairman considered that the existing senior secondary curriculum lacked diversity and could not cater for the diverse interests and abilities of students. He sought the views of Dr CHUNG on the current design and implementation of VET in Hong Kong, such as whether vocational education programmes should be introduced at upper secondary levels, as in the case of Germany.

66. Dr Roy CHUNG referred to the implementation of life planning education and ApL courses at senior secondary levels, which would enable students to understand the diversified articulation pathways to meet their career and academic aspirations. He stressed the need to raise awareness and recognition of VET as an attractive pathway rather than a second choice for students.

67. Referring to the successful experience of Germany, Mr Michael TIEN strongly supported the promotion of vocational education. He affirmed the usefulness of the Pilot Training and Support Scheme ("the Pilot Scheme") which integrated structured apprenticeship training and clear career progression pathways. He also considered that the training programmes offered by the Youth Colleges under the Vocational Training Council ("VTC") provided valuable articulation opportunities for many young people who did not excel in academic studies. In this regard, Deputy Secretary for Education (1) ("DS(Ed)1") advised that a review would be conducted on the Pilot Scheme very shortly to explore whether its duration should be extended or its scope expanded to cover other industries. He stressed that the financial support from the Government, the industries, as well as the participation of students were crucial for the success of the Pilot Scheme.

68. The Chairman observed that currently, there were insufficient subsidized undergraduate places for all students who met the general admission requirements. Besides, traditional academic pursuits might not suit all students. Hence, vocational education played a key role in providing a viable articulation option to young people. He reiterated that VET should no longer be described as a second choice, but should be promoted as a competitive articulation pathway for young people. The Chairman also urged the Administration to take steps to promote VET among the business sector and parents as one of the diversified options to nurture the human capital for Hong Kong.

69. Dr Roy CHUNG said that as revealed in the public engagement activities conducted by the Task Force, there was an entrenched bias among many parents that VET was a second choice. The Task Force saw merits in organizing forums and sharing sessions to enhance parents' understanding of VET and to provide an opportunity for VET graduates to share their experience. To improve the perception on VET, Dr CHUNG referred to publicity videos, as well as TV drama series featuring stories in specific industries (e.g. aircraft repair), which had helped promote vocational education in the community at large.

#### *Articulation and progression pathways under the vocational education system*

70. The Chairman was of the view that to enhance the attractiveness of vocational education, it was necessary to provide young people with a full picture of the articulation/progression pathways and future prospect for various types of VET programmes.

71. Mr TANG Ka-piu remarked that in presenting the number of training places, it might not appropriate to include the places provided by training bodies such as the Employees Retraining Board and the Construction Industry Council as the focus of the Task Force's study was on vocational education as an articulation

option for students having completed junior or senior secondary education. Mr TANG was concerned that despite the multiple articulation pathways under VTC as depicted in Chart 2.3 in the report of the Task Force, many young people pursuing Diploma in Vocational Education programmes might eventually choose to articulate to undergraduate studies instead of taking up employment in the relevant field after completion of their vocational training.

72. In response, DS(Ed)1 said that the Chart served to illustrate the flexible and diversified study pathways with multiple entry and exit points for secondary school leavers. SED further advised that in recognition of the keen demand for manpower of specific industries, the Pilot Scheme had been implemented starting from the 2014-2015 academic year to integrate structured apprenticeship training programmes and clear career progression pathways. A total of five industries had joined the Pilot Scheme.

73. Ms Cyd HO considered the provision of practical training or industrial attachment highly important in VET. She was concerned about the vocational education opportunities for sub-degree holders who could not articulate to undergraduate programmes, as well as those students who could not complete their secondary education.

74. DS(Ed)1 advised that for students who could not attain Level 2 in five subjects in the HKDSE Examination, they could consider applying for the Yi Jin Diploma programmes, or Foundation Diploma programmes offered by VTC. At the senior secondary level, vocational education opportunities would be introduced to students through implementation of ApL courses, as well as career and life planning education with the Business-School Partnership Programme.

75. Referring to the practices of overseas universities, Ms Cyd HO considered that the Administration should explore the feasibility of sandwich programmes made up of academic study and practicum training in alternate years. In Ms HO's view, this arrangement could ensure the provision of practical training for VET students while utilizing the university places released by students on practicum training for admitting more eligible students.

## **V. Any other business**

76. To allow sufficient time to complete the discussion and with the consent of all members present, the Chairman extended the meeting for another five minutes to 12:35 pm.

Proposed extension of the period of work of the Subcommittee to Study the Implementation of Free Kindergarten Education

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(06) -- Paper prepared by the LegCo Secretariat)

77. The Chairman referred members to the paper prepared by the Secretariat [LC Paper No. CB(4)1287/14-15(06)] seeking the Panel's endorsement for the Subcommittee to Study the Implementation of Free Kindergarten Education ("the Subcommittee") to seek the House Committee's approval to extend its period of work for six more months until 30 April 2016.

78. Members raised no objection to the Subcommittee's proposal to extend its period of work. Ms Cyd HO said that the Subcommittee might consider extending its period of work until the end of the 2015-2016 session to allow more time for deliberation and preparation of its report. The Chairman advised that Ms HO's views would be conveyed to the Chairman of the Subcommittee for consideration.

79. The Chairman said that the items on the Panel's "List of outstanding items for discussion" would be carried forward to the 2015-2016 session, subject to any views from members.

(Post-meeting note: After reviewing the Panel's "List of outstanding items for discussion" ("the List") with the assistance of the Secretariat, the Chairman considered that some items could be taken out from the list for the time being. Where necessary or if there were new developments, members were at liberty to raise the issues again. An updated version of the List was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1347/14-15(01) on 17 July 2015.)

80. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:32 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
14 September 2015