

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1444/14-15
(These minutes have been
cleared by the Chairman)

Ref : CB4/PL/EDEV+CB1/PL/EA

Panel on Economic Development and Panel on Environmental Affairs

Minutes of joint meeting
held on Monday, 27 April 2015, at 10:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Members of the Panel on Economic Development

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
* Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
* Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
* Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon YIU Si-wing
* Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
* Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
* Hon Kenneth LEUNG
* Hon Dennis KWOK
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

Members of the Panel on Environmental Affairs

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP (Chairman)
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Member attending : Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Members absent: Members of the Panel on Economic Development

Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan (Deputy Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
* Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
* Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
* Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

Members of the Panel on Environmental Affairs

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

* Also members of the Panel on Environmental Affairs

Clerk in attendance : Ms Debbie YAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)5

Staff in attendance : Ms Shirley TAM
Senior Council Secretary (4)5

Miss Mandy NG
Council Secretary (4)5

Ms Zoe TONG
Legislative Assistant (4)5

Miss Shanice LOK
Clerical Assistant (4)4

I. Election of Chairman

1. Mr Jeffrey LAM, Chairman of the Panel on Economic Development ("the EDEV Panel"), advised that as agreed with Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Chairman of the Panel on Environmental Affairs ("the EA Panel"), he would be the Chairman of the joint meeting ("the Chairman").

Declaration of interests

2. The Chairman declared that he was a member of the Executive Council and a director of the Board of the Airport Authority Hong Kong ("AAHK"). Mr Frankie YICK also declared that he was a director of the Board of AAHK.

II. Appointment of a joint subcommittee to monitor the implementation of the Three-Runway System at the Hong Kong International Airport

(LC Paper No. CB(4)824/14-15(01) — Proposal for appointment of a joint subcommittee to monitor the implementation of the Three-Runway System at the Hong Kong International Airport prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

3. The Chairman said that the EDEV Panel passed the following motion moved by Mr Dennis KWOK at the meeting on 23 March 2015 –

"That this Panel requests a subcommittee ("the Subcommittee") be set up under the Legislative Council ("LegCo") to continue to follow up issues relating to the three-runway system ("3RS") at Hong Kong International Airport ("HKIA")."

The Chairman said that the EA Panel had been following up matters relating to statutory environmental impact assessment and other environmental impacts arising from the development of 3RS. During the discussion of the motion, members had diverse views on whether the Subcommittee should be formed under the EDEV Panel, under the two panels concerned or under the House Committee ("HC"). As discussed with the Chairman of the EA Panel, it was proposed that the Subcommittee be jointly formed under the two panels.

He reminded the meeting that only members of the EDEV and EA Panels were eligible to join the Subcommittee.

Discussion

4. Mr Dennis KWOK referred to the relevant discussion of HC at its meeting on 10 April 2015. He said that the development of 3RS involved multiple issues such as financial affairs, air transport, planning and economic development which straddled the policy areas of several Panels. Moreover, as it was anticipated that many Members would be interested in joining the Subcommittee, he said that he might make a proposal to HC suggesting establishing the Subcommittee under it, so that its membership could be open to all Members.

5. Dr Kenneth CHAN referred to his joint letter with Mr Dennis KWOK dated 24 April 2015 requesting to set up the Subcommittee under HC in order to monitor all the controversial issues related to 3RS. He noted that so far, there were at least two opinion polls that the majority of respondents had indicated objection to the development of 3RS. As such, the Subcommittee should be tasked to review whether 3RS should be taken forward, instead of just monitoring its implementation. Dr CHAN said he agreed that the Subcommittee be set up under HC to facilitate the participation of Members who had not joined the two panels in question. He would also provide after this meeting his view on the terms of reference ("TOR") of the Subcommittee for the consideration of HC.

6. Echoing the views of Mr Dennis KWOK and Dr Kenneth CHAN, Dr Fernando CHEUNG agreed that the matter relating to the appointment of the Subcommittee be discussed by HC, and the scope of study should not be limited to monitor the implementation of 3RS but the whole planning and decision of the project. He said that if the Subcommittee was eventually formed under HC, the name of the Subcommittee, i.e. "joint" subcommittee might need to be revised accordingly.

7. Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that he was not a member of both the EDEV and EA Panels. Noting that the Town Planning Board was going to deliberate the amendments to the approved Chek Lap Kok Outline Zoning Plan on 8 May 2015, he said that the amendments of the plan would affect the future development of the airport as well as the environment of the adjoined areas. Dr KWOK opined that as the impact of 3RS involved issues other than those under the purview of the EDEV and EA Panels, he supported appointing the Subcommittee under HC in order to allow all interested Members to join and discuss relevant issues.

8. The Chairman said that if most of the members agreed to the proposed appointment of the Subcommittee under HC, it was necessary to draw up the corresponding TOR of the Subcommittee for members' consideration.

9. Mr TAM Yiu-chung said that the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong ("DAB") supported developing 3RS and appointing a Subcommittee to follow-up and monitor issues related to the development of 3RS. DAB also agreed to appoint the Subcommittee under HC in order to allow all Members to join it.

10. Mr YIU Si-wing said that according to his understanding, most of the industries and the members of the public supported the development of 3RS. He agreed that the implementation of 3RS should be monitored by LegCo but the Subcommittee should not become a hurdle to the project. Mr YIU opined that comments from different perspectives expressed in a fair and impartial manner should be welcomed during the deliberations in LegCo. Mr YIU also said that he was open to the appointment of either a joint subcommittee under the EDEV and EA Panels or a subcommittee under HC.

11. Ms Cyd HO referred to her own proposal made after the motion passed at the EDEV Panel meeting on 23 March 2015 that the Subcommittee should preferably be appointed jointly under the EDEV and EA Panels. Notwithstanding this, Ms HO supported the appointment of the Subcommittee under HC as all interested Members could take part in the discussion on the controversial issues on 3RS.

12. Mr CHAN Hak-kan said that members of the EA Panel were of grave concern on the issues related to 3RS. The EA Panel had received a lot of submissions from the green groups and had held several hearings on 3RS-related matters.

13. Mr Michael TIEN said that the New People's Party supported the development of 3RS as the Secretary for Transport and Housing had provided positive feedback to address the following three concerns in relation to the commissioning of 3RS, viz. the noise pollution problem in Ma Wan when 3RS was in place; the availability of airspace to meet the target of 102 air traffic movements per hour; and the early submission to LegCo for consideration and funding approval of new government facilities required for the operation of 3RS. He said that the Subcommittee should be appointed to monitor the above three issues on 3RS. Mr TIEN also said that he would support appointing the Subcommittee under HC if majority of the members supported the proposal.

14. The Chairman concluded that majority of the members supported the appointment of the proposed Subcommittee under HC and the Secretariat would follow-up with the issue.

(Post-meeting note: Members endorsed the appointment of the Subcommittee under HC at its meeting on 15 May 2015.)

III. Any other business

15. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:50 am.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
2 September 2015