

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)2118/14-15  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/12

**Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development**

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation  
of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting  
held on Friday, 17 July 2015, at 9:30 am  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Public Officers attending** : Item I

Home Affairs Bureau

Ms Angela LEE Chung-yan  
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Ms Sabrina LAW  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West  
Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH  
Chief Executive Officer

Dr Lars NITTVE  
Executive Director, M+

Ms Anna CHAN  
Head, Artistic Development (Dance)

Ms Bonny WONG  
Director, Chief Executive Officer's Office

**Attendance : Item I**  
**by invitation**

The Lion Rock Institute

Mr Saanal Deshpande  
Research Assistant

Civic Party

Miss Bonnie LEUNG Wing-man  
Member of the Executive Committee

Hong Kong Repertory Theatre

Mr Marble LEUNG  
Head of Programme and Education

Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association

---

Prof WONG Kam-fai, MH  
Vice President

Individual

Ms Yolanda NG Yuen-ting  
Member of Wan Chai District Council

Arts with the Disabled Association Hong Kong

Mr Edmond CHAN  
Manger, Physical Access

Art of Nature International Co. Ltd.

Dr Cissy CHEUNG Chu-yu  
President

City Contemporary Dance Co.

Mr WONG Kin-wang  
Director, CCDC Dance Centre

Wholala.org

Mr LEE Ting-chuen

Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Society

Mr LAM Man-kong

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Amy YU  
Chief Council Secretary (2)6

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Jasmine TAM  
Senior Council Secretary (2)8

Miss Meisy KWOK  
Legislative Assistant (2)6

---

Action

**I. Capacity building and stakeholder engagement for the West Kowloon Cultural District**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1902/14-15(01)-(02))

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") briefed members on the progress of its work on building capacity and engaging stakeholders for the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD"), details of which were set out in its paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1902/14-15(01)) and powerpoint presentation materials tabled at the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the powerpoint presentation materials provided by WKCD was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1934/14-15(01) on 17 July 2015.)*

Action

3. Mr Frankie YICK declared that he was a member of the Council of Hong Kong Repertory Theatre.

WKCD 4. WKCD was requested to provide a follow-up paper outlining the difficulties it had encountered in building capacity and engaging stakeholders for WKCD (including difficulties encountered in promoting arts education and enhancing the training of artistic, technical, and administrative talents; attracting young people to pursue a career in the arts and cultural industries and retaining talents in the industries; addressing possible inherent tension between mainstream and minority art forms, etc.).

**II. Any other business**

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 11:43 am.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
18 September 2015

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor  
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project  
held on Friday, 17 July 2015, at 9:30 am  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)/Discussion</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
<i>Agenda Item I - Capacity building and stakeholder engagement for the West Kowloon Cultural District</i>			
000733 - 004123	Chairman Admin WKCD	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") on the progress of its work on building capacity and engaging stakeholders for the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1902/14-15(01) and CB(2)1934/14-15(01)].	
004124 - 004514	Mr Saanal Deshpande, The Lion Rock Institute	Presentation of views	
004515 - 005028	Mr Marble LEUNG, Hong Kong Repertory Theatre	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1941/14-15(01)]	
005029 - 005441	Prof WONG Kam-fai, Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1902/14-15(03)]	
005442 - 005910	Ms Yolanda NG Yuen-ting, Member of Wan Chai District Council	Presentation of views	
005911 - 010425	Miss Bonnie LEUNG Wing-man, Civic Party	Presentation of views	
010426 - 010930	Mr Edmond CHAN, Arts with the Disabled Association Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1902/14-15(04)]	
010931 - 011440	Dr Cissy CHEUNG Chu-yu, Art of Nature International Co. Ltd.	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1919/14-15(01)]	
011441 - 011906	Mr WONG Kin-wang, City Contemporary Dance Co.	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1902/14-15(05)]	
011907 - 012317	Mr LEE Ting-chuen, Wholala.org	Presentation of views	
012318 - 012840	Mr LAM Man-kong, Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Society	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1941/14-15(02)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
012841 - 013911	Admin WKCD	<p>The Administration responded that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) given that extensive consultation had been conducted on the development of WKCD and the public were generally in support of early realization of the WKCD project, the Administration was committed to developing the WKCD site into an integrated arts and cultural district as planned. Nonetheless, the concern raised by the Lion Rock Institute about the opportunities for students to receive subsidized tertiary education would be relayed to the relevant bureau; and</li> <li>(b) apart from the various capacity building initiatives launched by WKCD, the Administration had provided funding support through the Hong Kong Arts Development Council and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department for local artists and arts groups to stage performances and showcase their talents. In addition, sponsorships were provided under the Arts Development Fund for local arts groups and arts practitioners to participate in outbound cultural exchange projects/activities.</li> </ul> <p>WKCD responded that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the suggestion of increasing the plot ratio of the WKCD site to 7.5 would be unacceptable to the Government and the people of Hong Kong;</li> <li>(b) WKCD had proactively engaged with, among others, Arts with the Disabled Association Hong Kong to ensure that the design and management of the venues and the public spaces in WKCD would be in line with the best practice in facilitating universal access. WKCD would continue to work on enhancing not only physical access to the WKCD facilities but also software access to its arts programmes for the disabled;</li> <li>(c) M+ had acquired numerous works produced by Hong Kong artists and information on such works had been/would be uploaded onto WKCD's website. WKCD would make the acquired works as accessible as possible through mounting exhibitions in and outside Hong Kong and loans to institutions, so as to build support from Hong Kong artists as well as showcase their talents to the world;</li> <li>(d) WKCD recognized the importance of upholding gender equality. The M+ Acquisition Policy had provided that a work should not be excluded from being collected by M+ for reasons not related to the quality of the work itself;</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>(e) WKCD positively encouraged street entertainment that would add to the colour and life of WKCD. It had spent months working with the local street performers and relevant groups to develop guidelines for the staging of street performance in WKCD, and the Temporary Tree Nursery Park to be opened would provide a good opportunity for testing out the proposed guidelines;</p> <p>(f) WKCD attached great importance to engaging the young people and the District Councils. It would make good use of the established mechanism to reach out to the wider community to promote understanding of the WKCD project; and</p> <p>(g) WKCD appreciated the aspirations of the local music community for the implementation of the Music Centre and it was WKCD's intention to build the Music Centre by 2030.</p>	
013912 - 014437	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han Prof WONG Kam-fai, Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association Mr LAM Man-kong, Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Society</p>	<p>Referring to paragraph 7 of the submission from Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association [LC Paper No. CB(2)1902/14-15(03)], Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that she considered it necessary for the Home Affairs Bureau, as the house-keeping bureau of WKCD, to ensure that WKCD would step up efforts to provide more opportunities for local arts talents to participate in the WKCD project and facilitate the exchange of expertise and experience between foreign and local talents engaged in the project, so as to help build up local expertise and strengthen Hong Kong's overall artistic capacity. She sought the deputations' views in this regard.</p> <p>Hong Kong Professionals and Senior Executives Association said that while it noted that WKCD had implemented various initiatives to facilitate exchanges between local and overseas arts groups/artists, there seemed to be a lack of achievement indicators to assess whether and to what extent the programmes organized/supported by WKCD had met the intended objectives.</p> <p>Hong Kong Oil Painting Research Society expressed the view that local arts professionals had no chance to join the senior management team of WKCD and many members of WKCD's committees were neither from the arts and cultural sectors nor familiar with arts and culture. In its view, both local arts professionals and foreign experts should be engaged to facilitate the successful implementation of the WKCD project.</p>	
014438 - 014837	Ms Claudia MO WKCD	Ms Claudia MO requested WKCD to respond to the following concern and suggestion raised by Wholala.org –	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>(a) many performers who wished to stage street performance in WKCD were worried that they would be screened out in the process of applying for a performance permit; and</p> <p>(b) whether WKCD would consider designating a section of the public open spaces in WKCD for the staging of street performance without requiring performers to obtain a permit.</p> <p>WKCD responded that as reported to the Joint Subcommittee in March 2015, local street performers had been consulted on the proposed arrangement for street performance in WKCD and the relevant draft guidelines had taken into account their views. While WKCD would endeavour to provide ample opportunities for performers to stage street performance within WKCD, it was necessary to ensure proper management of the street performance activities for the benefit of all users of the public open spaces in WKCD. WKCD was confident that street performance would become a fundamental part and a major focus of WKCD, and it would further report to the Joint Subcommittee on relevant issues in due course.</p>	
014838 - 015415	Deputy Chairman WKCD	<p>The Deputy Chairman considered that capacity building and stakeholder engagement were essential for the development of a humanistic WKCD and WKCD was generally proceeding on the right track in this regard. While he appreciated that WKCD had introduced a number of initiatives to nurture artistic, technical and administrative talents and to facilitate artistic and cultural exchanges, it had not provided a detailed analysis of whether and to what extent these initiatives had met the objectives it had set. He requested WKCD to provide a follow-up paper outlining the difficulties it had encountered in building capacity and engaging stakeholders for WKCD (including difficulties encountered in promoting arts education and enhancing the training of artistic, technical, and administrative talents; attracting young people to pursue a career in the arts and cultural industries and retaining talents in the industries; addressing possible inherent tension between mainstream and minority art forms, etc.).</p>	WKCD
015416 - 015827	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Mr Marble LEUNG, Hong Kong Repertory Theatre Mr WONG Kin-wang, City Contemporary Dance Co. Chairman</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen said that Legislative Council Members were increasingly worried about the WKCD project, particularly in view of the uncertainties surrounding the completion timeframe of the various facilities and the project scale. He invited the deputations to express their views in this regard and enquired whether they had communicated with WKCD on relevant issues.</p> <p>Hong Kong Repertory Theatre said that it had been involved in the discussions on WKCD since around</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>2002/2003 and had been concerned about its development. Recognizing that local arts groups played a key role in driving cultural software development which was pivotal to the success of WKCD, it would make every endeavour to complement the efforts of the Administration and WKCD to take forward the development of WKCD.</p> <p>In response to Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's enquiry about whether the local arts groups were still eager to access the future venues in WKCD, City Contemporary Dance Co. said that it had collaborated with WKCD on various projects well before the commissioning of the performing arts ("PA") venues in WKCD. It hoped to work in close collaboration with WKCD in planning and operating the PA venues in WKCD, rather than merely maintaining a lessee-lessor relationship with WKCD.</p> <p>Extension of meeting for 15 minutes.</p>	
015828 - 020229	Mr Frankie YICK	<p>Declaration of interest by Mr Frankie YICK.</p> <p>Mr Frankie YICK shared the view of Hong Kong Repertory Theatre that there should be resident companies at individual PA venues in WKCD. He added that as resident companies would generally be able to secure more time slots for staging performances, they would have more capacity to reduce the production cost and the ticket price, thereby helping to attract more members of the public to participate in arts and cultural activities.</p> <p>Mr YICK further expressed the following view and concern –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) to groom artistic and creative talents, it was important to cultivate interest in the arts and culture from a young age. The Administration should review the education system and the implementation of arts education in schools, particularly secondary schools, and seek to provide more opportunities for students to take part in arts and cultural activities in school; and</li> <li>(b) the wage level of local arts and cultural workers, which was generally on the low side, and the Administration's limited funding support to arts groups were not conducive to retaining talents in the arts and cultural industries.</li> </ul>	
020230 - 020710	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han raised the following enquiry and view –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) how the Administration would ensure that there would be sufficient arts administrators in Hong</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>Kong upon the commissioning of the first batch of the WKCD facilities; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration and WKCD should strengthen their communication and engagement with the local arts groups, in particular the nine major performing arts groups ("MPAGs") which were receiving annual government subvention, in promoting the software development of WKCD.</p> <p>The Administration advised that –</p> <p>(a) to meet the growing demand for arts administrators arising from the phased commissioning of the WKCD facilities, the Administration had allocated additional funding to provide around 600 new training opportunities to strengthen the training of arts administrators for five years starting from 2013-2014. These training opportunities included, among others, local/overseas internships /attachments and scholarships for overseas/local Master's degree or professional training programmes. The Administration would closely monitor the situation and review in due course the need to further enhance the training of arts administrators; and</p> <p>(b) WKCD had held numerous engagement meetings and discussions with the local arts groups, including the MPAGs, in the course of taking forward the WKCD project, which had laid the foundation for mutual cooperation in facilitating the development of WKCD. It would continue its communications with the arts and cultural stakeholders to gather their views and update them on the latest development of the WKCD project.</p>	
020711 - 021119	Deputy Chairman	The Deputy Chairman recapped his earlier request for WKCD to provide a follow-up paper to the Joint Subcommittee after the meeting.	
021120 - 021356	Chairman	<p>The Chairman expressed the following views –</p> <p>(a) WKCD's communications with the local arts community were far from adequate. It should maintain close dialogue with the local artists and arts/cultural groups to better understand and address their needs and concerns about the WKCD project; and</p> <p>(b) WKCD should formulate and adopt clear and objective benchmarks for evaluating the effectiveness and adequacy of its work on building capacity and engaging stakeholders for WKCD.</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)/Discussion</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
		The Chairman expressed gratitude to the Chief Executive Officer of WKCD, who would be retiring in August 2015, for his contribution to the development of WKCD over the past four years.	
<i>Agenda Item II - Any other business</i>			
021357 - 021422	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
18 September 2015