

Laying of the Report The Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year end 31 March 2014 and his Report No. 63 on the results of value for money audits were laid in the Legislative Council ("LegCo") on 20 November 2014. The Public Accounts Committee ("the Committee")'s Report (Report No. 63) was subsequently tabled on 11 February 2015, thereby meeting the requirement of Rule 72 of the Rules of Procedure of LegCo that the Report be tabled within three months of the Director of Audit's Report ("Audit Report") being laid.

2. **The Government Minute** The Government Minute in response to the Committee's Report No. 63 was laid in LegCo on 20 May 2015. A progress report on matters outstanding in the Government Minute was issued on 2 November 2015. The latest position and the Committee's further comments on these matters are set out in paragraphs 3 to 31 below.

Administration of road safety measures

(Paragraphs 3 and 4 of Part 3 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

3. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2015 that:

Measures to tackle drink driving

- in view of the satisfactory result of a trial mobile breath test centre launched in end 2013, the Hong Kong Police Force ("HKPF") would set up three additional mobile breath test centres by 2017 for collection of the evidential breath specimen from drivers at the roadside. By then, the time interval between taking screening breath tests and evidential breath tests should be further reduced;

Measures to tackle speeding and red light jumping

- in exploring new measures to enhance the effectiveness of the present red light camera system, the Transport Department ("TD") had considered the option of taking frontal photo of offending vehicles as recommended by the Audit Commission ("Audit"). Upon the advice of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data, TD had engaged a consultant to conduct a privacy impact assessment to see whether the option could comply with the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance

(Cap. 486). The privacy impact assessment was now underway and both TD and HKPF would study the outcome before deciding the way forward for using frontal cameras;

Measures to promote safer vehicle operation

- *public light buses ("PLBs")* In April 2012, the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374) was amended to introduce measures to deter speeding by PLB drivers and enhance safe operation of PLBs. Three of such measures came into effect after the amendment legislation was passed by LegCo in April 2012. Another measure, i.e. the mandatory requirement for the installation of approved electronic data recording device on newly registered PLBs, came into effect on 1 December 2014. The remaining measure, i.e. requiring applicants for PLB driving licences to complete a pre-service course before they were issued with PLB driving licences, became effective on 1 June 2015;
- *for all drivers* In light of the advice of the Department of Justice, TD would, having regard to individual circumstances of the case, approach the medical practitioner(s) concerned to request medical records when there was a need to ascertain whether a suspected health-impaired driver was fit for driving and where consent from the driver for TD to access his medical records was not forthcoming; and

Accuracy of traffic accident data

- HKPF had made some improvements to the Traffic Operations and Management System to improve the accuracy of accident contributory factors input to the System. HKPF would further upgrade the System to enhance its compatibility with TD's Transport Information System so as to further minimize data input errors.

4. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Recoverability of the outstanding advances to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

(Paragraphs 8 to 10 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

5. The Committee was informed that:

- the Government had continued to urge the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees ("UNHCR") to make renewed efforts to appeal to the international community for donations with a view to settling the outstanding advances, which remained at \$1,162 million;
- the Security Bureau wrote to the Hong Kong Sub-office of UNHCR in July 2015 again to reiterate the Government's stance and register the Hong Kong community's expectation of an early recovery of the outstanding advances; and
- although it was not optimistic that repayment could be made by UNHCR in the near future, the Government would continue to pursue an early repayment of the outstanding advances from UNHCR.

6. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of the development on the Government's recovery of the outstanding advances to UNHCR.

Footbridge connections between five commercial buildings in the Central District

(Paragraphs 11 to 13 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

7. The Committee was informed that in late July 2015, the owner of Building II submitted a general building plan in respect of the proposed Footbridge A to the Buildings Department for approval pursuant to requirements under the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123). In processing the application, the Buildings Department had, in accordance with the centralized processing system for building plans, referred the plan to relevant government departments, including the District Lands Office/Hong Kong West and South of the Lands Department ("LandsD"), for consideration of matters in their respective areas of concern or under their purview. The Buildings Department, LandsD and other concerned departments would continue to follow up with the owners of Building I and Building II on the matter.

8. The location of the proposed Footbridge A is shown in *Appendix 3*.
9. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Small house grants in the New Territories

(Paragraphs 14 to 17 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

10. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was an indigenous villager of the New Territories.

11. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2015 that:

- the existing small house policy had been in operation for a long period of time. The relevant review would inevitably entail complex issues including legal, environment and land use planning issues which required careful examination; and
- at the same time, the Administration would maintain dialogue with key stakeholders as well as the community at large.

12. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Direct land grants to private sports clubs at nil or nominal premium

(Paragraphs 38 to 40 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

13. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was a member of Hong Kong Country Club, Hong Kong Football Club, Hong Kong Golf Club, Hong Kong Jockey Club ("HKJC") and Royal Hong Kong Yacht Club; Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was a member of HKJC, Scout Association of Hong Kong and South China Athletic Association; Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit declared that he was a member of HKJC; Hon NG Leung-sing declared that he was a member of HKJC and Craigenhower Cricket Club; Hon CHAN Hak-kan declared that he was a member of

HKJC; and Hon Kenneth LEUNG declared that he was a member of the Ladies Recreation Club and Craigenower Cricket Club.

14. The Committee was informed that:

Review of the Private Recreational Lease ("PRL") policy

- an inter-departmental working group had been set up by the Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB") in mid-2014 to conduct a review of PRL policy. HAB was finalizing the recommendations. The Government proposed to brief LegCo Panel on Home Affairs on the review findings in the second quarter of 2016;

Implementation of the "opening-up" requirement

- HAB would continue to advertise the availability of sports facilities operated by PRL holders to encourage outside bodies to make use of the facilities;

Monitoring of compliance with lease conditions

- HAB was monitoring the utilization rates of sports facilities on PRL sites, in particular with regard to the implementation of the opening-up schemes, and had started annual inspections of each PRL site to ensure compliance by PRL holders with the opening-up schemes; and
- LandsD, in consultation with HAB and other relevant bureaux and departments, continued to follow up on cases of irregularity and suspected non-compliance with lease conditions identified in the Audit Report and would take lease enforcement action as appropriate. LandsD had also conducted site inspections of PRLs where lease renewal was not yet due and would follow up in consultation with HAB as appropriate.

15. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of roadside skips

(Paragraphs 41 to 43 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

16. The Committee was informed that:

Magnitude of skip problem

- the Joint Working Group on Management of Roadside Skips ("JWG"), led by the Environment Bureau/Environmental Protection Department and supported by the Development Bureau ("DEVB"), the Transport and Housing Bureau ("THB"), the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department, the Home Affairs Department, HKPF, the Highways Department ("HyD"), LandsD and TD, completed the review of the problems caused by roadside skips and the effectiveness of the existing enforcement actions on roadside skips taken by LandsD and HKPF. JWG found that the main reason of placement of skips on the roads and in public places in the territory was due to a lack of proper storage locations, in particular during the night time;

Strategies and action plans for regulating and facilitating skip operations

- in light of the above findings, Secretary for the Environment, Secretary for Development and Secretary for Transport and Housing agreed to a two-pronged approach in tackling the problems caused by placing of skips at the roadside or in public places in the short term, by finding suitable sites which satisfy site accessibility, land use and other relevant requirements for storing skips, as well as enhancing the enforcement efficiency to reduce malpractices on placement of road skips;
- JWG was actively pursuing the preparatory work with a view to introducing in 2016 the measures proposed under its two-pronged approach so as to better regulate and facilitate the operation of roadside skips;

Introduction of regulatory system

- the Government would, having regard to the effectiveness of the measures to be introduced in 2016, consider the need for introducing other institutionalized measures in the longer term, e.g. a regulatory

system or assigning a government department to take up the responsibilities for regulating and facilitating skip operations; and

Progress made in implementing Audit's recommendations

- follow-up actions had been on-going to address the following two remaining audit recommendations:
 - (a) formulating strategies and action plans for regulating and facilitating skip operations, and assigning a government department to take up the responsibilities for regulating and facilitating skip operations; and
 - (b) conducting a review to reassess whether the current situation justified government actions to introduce a regulatory system to regulate and facilitate skip operations.

17. The Committee wrote to Chief Secretary for Administration on 8 January 2016 to urge the Administration to expeditiously regulate the operations of skips so as to safeguard the safety of the public. The Committee also enquired details of latest enforcement actions of HKPF and LandsD against "idling" skips on roadside, which government bureau(x)/department(s) would take up the responsibilities for regulating and facilitating skip operations, and details of strategies and action plans for regulating and facilitating skip operations. The replies from Director of Environmental Protection in *Appendix 4*.

18. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Provision of long-term care services for the elderly
(Chapter 1 of Part 8 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

19. The Committee was informed that:

- the Government would continue to adopt a multi-pronged approach to provide some 1 700 new subsidized residential care places from 2014-2015 to 2017-2018 and some 330 new subsidized day care places till 2016-2017. The Social Welfare Department ("SWD") had also

earmarked a total of 13 sites for construction of residential care homes for the elderly ("RCHes"), day care units attached to contract RCHes and day care centres for the elderly; and

- insofar as enhancing community care services ("CCS") to support ageing in place was concerned, SWD would continue to implement the Pilot Scheme on Community Care Services Voucher for the Elderly. SWD had taken into account the waiting time and service demand of individual districts in deciding the distribution of CCS places. SWD would also make use of cross-district arrangement to flexibly increase day care places in those districts with longer waiting time. For example, through expansion of an existing day care centres for the elderly in Wan Chai in October 2015, the additional 58 day care places would serve the elderly persons living in Wan Chai and Eastern districts. An additional 1 666 Enhanced Home and Community Care Services places had been in full operation by end-June 2015. SWD was exploring the feasibility and form of integrating Integrated Home Care Services with Enhanced Home and Community Care Services, taking into consideration the various new CCS initiatives being piloted and the fact that Integrated Home Care Services included both ordinary and frail cases while Enhanced Home and Community Care Services covered only frail cases.

20. The Committee recommends that the outstanding issues be referred to LegCo Panel on Welfare Services for follow up.

Provision of health services for the elderly
(Chapter 2 of Part 8 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

21. The Committee was informed that:

Elderly health assessment services of the Department of Health ("DH")

- with the commissioning of one new clinical team in the Lek Yuen Elderly Health Centres ("EHC") in March 2015 and the introduction of various improvement measures, including the conduct of extra health assessments at EHCs with lower attendance for curative treatment and increasing the proportion of first-time assessments in all EHCs, the overall median waiting time for first-time health assessments had been

reduced from 20.1 months in 2014 to 17.4 months in 2015 (as of July). Another new clinical team in the Wan Chai EHC would be established in 2016 and the overall waiting time was expected to further improve. DH would closely monitor the waiting time of all EHCs and would explore the feasibility of setting a performance pledge for the waiting time for the elderly who wished to enroll for EHC membership and first-time health assessment. EHCs' services would also be reviewed taking into account the experience from the Elderly Health Care Voucher Scheme ("EHCVS") and the Elderly Health Assessment Pilot Programme;

- the two-year Elderly Health Assessment Pilot Programme ended in July 2015, with participation of over 7 900 elders. DH had commissioned a research organization to evaluate the implementation of the Elderly Health Assessment Pilot Programme. The Government proposed to report the findings of the evaluation to LegCo Panel on Health Services in the first quarter of 2016;

Educational and advisory health services provided by visiting health teams of DH

- DH had completed a review of the educational and advisory health services provided by the visiting health teams. Various measures to improve the efficiency of the visiting health teams had been/were being implemented, which included reviewing the operational guidelines to standardize the procedures, collecting statistics regularly to monitor the frequency of health promotion activities conducted at each RCHE and non-RCHE, formulating service strategy and priorities, and adopting a risk-based approach for the health record review programme at the RCHEs;

Administration of DH's EHCVS

- DH continued to promote EHCVS to attract more healthcare service providers to join. A comprehensive review of EHCVS would soon commence, covering the monitoring protocol and inspection strategy;

Waiting time for Specialist Out-patient Clinic ("SOPC") consultation

- the Hospital Authority ("HA") had implemented a number of measures to shorten the waiting time for SOPCs, including enhancing public

primary care service, enhancing manpower, exploring the possibility of launching Public-Private Partnership projects, implementing annual plan programmes to manage SOPC waiting time, displaying updated waiting time information in SOPCs and on HA's website, strengthening the cross-cluster referral arrangement and optimizing the scheduling of appointment. HA would monitor the effectiveness of these measures and implemented suitable supplementary measures as appropriate to shorten the waiting time in SOPCs further. On the other hand, a comprehensive review of the appointment scheduling practices of SOPCs was being conducted; and

Community Geriatric Assessment Teams

- HA had enhanced the Community Geriatric Assessment Team services to better cover RCHE residents. In particular, enhanced support had been provided to the terminally ill residents living in RCHEs to improve the quality of end-of-life care. HA would regularly assess the Community Geriatric Assessment Team coverage and would take into consideration the service demand and healthcare manpower when planning the service. HA would consider further service development as appropriate through the annual planning exercise in 2016-2017 and beyond to meet the needs, particularly in areas where there were expansion of RCHEs.

22. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

New Civil Aviation Department Headquarters

(Chapter 3 of Part 8 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

23. The Committee was informed that regarding the review report of the Director-General of Civil Aviation on the irregularities on the implementation of the new Civil Aviation Department ("CAD") headquarters project, THB was carrying out detailed examination to verify and review all pertinent facts and causes giving rise to the irregularities from various perspectives. In addition to examining the Director-General of Civil Aviation's review report and supplementary information provided by CAD, THB officers had visited CAD office to inspect relevant files and records and might also seek further input from relevant departments, as appropriate. THB aimed to complete the investigation as soon as possible, with a view to

establishing responsibilities for various irregularities. In case of any misconduct, THB would follow up in accordance with the established procedures, including taking appropriate administrative or disciplinary action.

24. The Committee wrote to Secretary for Transport and Housing on 8 January 2016 to enquire about the progress of the investigation conducted by THB regarding the irregularities on the implementation of the new CAD headquarters project, and when the investigation would be completed and the results released to the public. The replies from Secretary for Transport and Housing are in *Appendix 5*.

25. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Government's efforts in enhancing tree safety
(Chapter 5 of Part 8 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

26. The Committee was informed that:

Coordinating the work of tree management departments

Delineation of management responsibilities for roadside trees

- DEVB had reviewed the policy considerations on roadside tree maintenance and was working with the relevant departments to enhance the maintenance for roadside trees on unallocated government land towards a regular maintenance regime;

Maintenance of roadside trees on unallocated government land

- the tree inspection work was started in December 2013 and was in progress. LandsD would endeavour to expedite action to complete it in 2016-2017;

Management information systems and databases

Tree Management Information System

- the Tree Management Information System enhancement project had been launched since November 2014 for completion in November 2015. Among others, the project would tackle the system development issues encountered previously. Upon completion of the enhancement project, the Tree Management Office would consider how to put the complaint handling function to effective use;

Tree Register

- a review of the Tree Register had been conducted. It was found that the Tree Register had been generally well patronized and information on trees under monitoring in various districts had been adequately provided. The original PDF files of the Tree Register had been replaced by a format with searchable fields such as districts, management departments, and locations of trees since September 2015;

Way forward

Addressing safety risks of trees on private land

- the Tree Management Office had prepared a draft Handbook on Tree Maintenance for private property owners and was consulting relevant parties on their views. Upon its issuance, DEVB would invite the Home Affairs Department to incorporate the Handbook into the Code of Practice issued under the Building Management Ordinance (Cap. 344);
- the Tree Management Office had also been working closely with the Home Affairs Department and professional institutions to organize seminars for private property owners and property management personnel on proper tree management; and
- DEVB would continue to keep LegCo Panel on Development informed of the progress in the implementation of tree management policy.

27. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Provision of cycle track network in the New Territories

(Chapter 7 of Part 8 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

28. The Committee was informed that:

Implementation of New Territories Cycle Track Network

- on 22 July 2015, DEVB and the Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD") provided LegCo Panel on Development with the updated overall progress of the New Territories Cycle Track Network and the estimated cost of the works of Sheung Shui to Tuen Mun section Stage 2. CEDD also obtained support from LegCo Panel on Development on 22 July 2015 on the works of Sheung Shui to Tuen Mun section Stage 2. CEDD would seek funding approval for the works in due course;
- for Section D, in view of the major physical and environmental constraints associated with the Yuen Long to Nam Sang Wai section, the Ma On Shan to Sai Kung section, the Tuen Mun to Lung Kwu Tan section, and the Tai Wo section, CEDD had deleted these branching off sections after reporting to the relevant District Councils. As for the planning and design of the branching off section at Sam Mun Tsai and the resting station at Tai Wo, CEDD consulted the Traffic and Transport Committee of Tai Po District Council on 10 July 2015 and obtained their support on the proposed cycle track alignment of the Sam Mun Tsai section. In view of the reservation expressed by Tai Po District Council on the need of the resting station at Tai Wo, CEDD would conduct a review and consult Tai Po District Council again upon completion of the review;

Works contract management

- CEDD's review on the feasibility of widening the cycle-track sections with a width of less than 3.5 m along Ma On Shan to Sheung Shui Section and Sheung Shui to Tuen Mun section was still on-going, which should be completed in 2015;

- CEDD had incorporated the requirement to properly document the justifications for adjusting the scope of a project in the Project Administration Handbook;
- TD had completed the collection of relevant information of narrow cycle-track sections and was reviewing if there were any critical sections where improvement measures, such as additional traffic signs, road markings or ancillary street furniture, were warranted;

Traffic management and maintenance of cycle tracks

- in July 2015, TD issued works requests for all Phase 2 improvement works to HyD and HyD had targeted to complete the works in 2016; and
- TD was reviewing whether some mandatory dismount zones at existing cycle tracks could be lifted or replaced by advisory ones. The review was targeted to be completed by end 2015. Upon completing the review of the mandatory dismount zones on existing cycle tracks, TD would collaborate with HKPF to review cyclists' compliance with the mandatory dismount requirement with a view to exploring measures to increase compliance as appropriate.

29. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Services provided by the Government Laboratory

(Chapter 8 of Part 8 of P.A.C. Report No. 63)

30. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of laboratory services to user bureaux and departments

- the Government Laboratory ("GL") continued to review its performance targets with a view to improving the dissemination of information on its performance. Two sample information management systems had been enhanced and the relevant information was now more readily available for the management of GL. GL might further modify the systems after the completion of the review;

- regarding liaison with clients, GL had discussed the issue of amplifying the existing memoranda of understanding ("MOUs") with HKPF and the Customs and Excise Department ("C&ED"), which had signed MOUs with GL. While updating the current MOU with C&ED was considered not necessary, amplification of MOU with HKPF would be required. GL had also consulted its major clients, who were of the view that the current work arrangements with GL were adequate and there was no pressing need to sign MOU with GL. GL would continue to keep in touch with its major clients to ascertain their service needs;

Outsourcing of laboratory services

- GL conducted a post-implementation review on the outsourcing of laboratory services in August 2015. It was considered that the outsourcing exercise had enabled effective use of resources in GL to meet food safety challenges; and

Management of chemicals, samples, exhibits and equipment

- GL had issued checklists for store management for use by the Supplies and User Sections to ensure stock records were kept in accordance with the Stores and Procurement Regulations. GL had also issued guidance notes on regular stocktaking and monitoring of stock levels. In addition, GL planned to develop a new computer system integrating management and administration systems for sectional budget control, purchasing request and ordering processes. The new system would also include stock management functions such as the indication of stock levels and expired chemicals.

31. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.