立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)2037/15-16 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB2/PL/SE

Panel on Security

Minutes of special meeting held on Tuesday, 16 February 2016, at 10:45 am in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members : Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman)
present Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan (Deputy Chairman)

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon WONG Yuk-man

Hon Claudia MO

Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP

Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS

Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

Hon Kenneth LEUNG Hon KWOK Wai-keung Hon Dennis KWOK

Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members attending

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP

Hon IP Kin-yuen

Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP

Members absent Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

Public Officers attending

: <u>Item I</u>

 $Mr\;LAI\;Tung\text{-}kwok,\;SBS,\;IDSM,\;JP$

Secretary for Security

Dr KO Wing-man, BBS, JP Secretary for Food and Health

Mr John LEE Ka-chiu, PDSM, PMSM, JP

Under Secretary for Security

Mr Dennis CHING Chung-cham

Acting Principal Assistant Secretary for Security E

Mr Alan LAU Yip-shing Director of Operations Hong Kong Police Force

Mr Nelson CHENG Yiu-mo

Assistant Commissioner of Police (Operations)

Hong Kong Police Force

Mr Jeffrey LEUNG Kwun-hong Assistant Director (Headquarters)

Fire Services Department

Miss Vivian LAU Lee-kwan, JP Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene

Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr LAM Wing-hong

Assistant Director (Operations) 2

Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Clerk in : Miss Betty MA

attendance Chief Council Secretary (2) 1

Staff in : Mr Timothy TSO

attendance Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Mr Raymond LAM

Senior Council Secretary (2) 7

Miss Lulu YEUNG Clerical Assistant (2) 1

Action

I. Police's handling of riots

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)874/15-16(01) to (05))

<u>Secretary for Security</u> ("S for S") briefed Members on the Police's handling of riots, as detailed in the paper provided by the Administration. <u>Secretary for Food and Heath</u> briefed Members on the Administration's policy on hawker management as well as the policy on the development of open-air hawker bazaars and night markets, as detailed in the paper tabled at the meeting.

(*Post-meeting note*: The speaking note of S for S and the paper tabled at the meeting were issued to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(2)913/15-16(01) and (02) respectively on 19 February 2016.)

Issues relating to the clashes between the Police and the public in Mong Kok in the early hours of 9 February 2016 ("the incident")

2. <u>Dr Elizabeth QUAT</u> strongly condemned the violent acts in the incident and expressed her sympathy with police officers and members of the media who were injured in the incident. She expressed grave concern

that rioters had thrown bricks at police officers, set fire on streets as well as a taxi and obstructed firemen's fire-fighting operations. She said that under no circumstances should anyone injure any other persons for any cause with such violence.

- 3. Mr YIU Si-wing expressed concern that there were indications that the incident and a series of "shopping tour" protests over the previous year were premeditated and aimed at undermining the economy of Hong Kong as well as the governance of the Administration. Such a series of incidents had resulted in a drop in the number of visitors to Hong Kong and impacted negatively on the economy of Hong Kong.
- 4. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung said that it could be noted from live television ("TV") footages on the incident that a number of police officers were assaulted by violent rioters. He considered that violence at meetings of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") had promoted violence in the community. He sought information on the circumstances under which the Central People's Government might issue an order for the application of relevant national laws to Hong Kong under Article 18 of the Basic Law.
- 5. Mr Christopher CHEUNG declared that he was one of the Deputy Chairmen of the Independent Police Complaints Council ("IPCC"). He condemned the violent acts of persons who had launched violent attacks at police officers and members of the media with bricks, wooden planks as well as glass bottles in the incident. He expressed concern that these persons had worn masks in order to conceal their identities and evade legal liability. He commended frontline police officers for standing fast to their posts with restraint despite facing danger to their lives.
- 6. <u>Dr Priscilla LEUNG</u> said that the Police should carry out investigation to identify persons who incited, by online means, hatred and assault against police officers. <u>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan</u> expressed concern about whether notice for wanted persons would be issued in relation to such persons.
- 7. Mr KWOK Wai-keung said that any person with conscience would condemn the violent acts concerned after watching TV footages of the incident. He said that there were many established channels for persons dissatisfied with government policy to express their views instead of resorting to violent acts, which had aroused worries among members of the public about the future stability of Hong Kong.

- 8. Mr CHAN Kin-por declared that he was one of the Deputy Chairmen of IPCC. He expressed concern that some people had sought help from the Police when there was a need, but on the other hand assaulted police officers in the incident. He said that the venting of anger by assaulting police officers was unacceptable.
- 9. <u>Ms Claudia MO</u> considered that the incident arose from the governance of the Administration. She expressed concern that the Administration's paper had not mentioned the firing of warning shots by a police officer and the assault of a member of the media by police officers.
- 10. <u>Mr WONG Yuk-man</u> said that he was supportive of demonstrators. He considered that the Administration should look into the cause of the incident.
- 11. <u>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung</u> considered that a dedicated commission of inquiry should be established to conduct a detailed investigation into the incident and identify the cause for the incident.
- 12. Mr James TO noted from the Administration's paper that in the incident, staff of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") had sought the Police's assistance at 9:40 pm on 8 February 2016. He expressed concern about the time taken for the mobilization of additional police officers and police vehicles to handle the escalated situation, including when the situation had escalated, when emergency police vehicles arrived at the scene, the arrival time of anti-riot police officers and police officers of the Police Tactical Unit as well as the respective number of police officers deployed.
- 13. Mr Alan LEONG said that it was saddening to recall the scenes of the incident. While he did not support the violent acts, the discontent of participants of the disturbance was understandable and he was more dissatisfied with persons who suppressed those defending freedom and human rights in Hong Kong. He considered that a commission of inquiry chaired by a judge should be set up to conduct a detailed investigation into the cause for the incident.
- 14. <u>Dr Kenneth CHAN</u> said that the Administration should set up an independent commission of inquiry to conduct a detailed investigation into the incident, identify the cause for the incident and make recommendations on improvements to governance and prevention of the recurrence of similar incidents. He said that this request was supported by a number of members of the public, including a former Chief

Secretary for Administration, a former principal official, academics and professionals.

- 15. Mr IP Kin-yuen said that the Administration should set up a commission of inquiry to identify the cause for the incident. He said that such a commission could be set up when criminal investigation was being carried out by the Police, an example of which was the Commission of Inquiry into the Collision of Vessels near Lamma Island on 1 October 2012.
- 16. Ms Cyd HO said that violent acts could not resolve problems of governance, but would only deepen conflicts. She considered that both demonstrators and police officers should not assault the other party or members of the media. She said that although the incident was saddening, it was important to identify the cause for the incident and public discontent.
- 17. <u>Dr Fernando CHEUNG</u> said that Members should condemn all persons who used violence, including police officers who assaulted demonstrators and a member of the media. He said that a commission of inquiry should be set up to look into the cause for the incident.
- 18. <u>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen</u> considered that an independent commission of inquiry should be set up to conduct a detailed investigation into the incident and identify the cause. He said that Members who condemned the violent acts should also condemn police officers who assaulted members of the public and a member of the media.
- 19. Mr WU Chi-wai said that the violent acts in the incident were unacceptable. However, the review of adequacy and upgrading of Police equipment alone could not address social problems and conflicts. He expressed support for the setting up of a commission of inquiry to identify the cause for the incident.
- 20. Mr WONG Kwok-kin said it was obvious from the live TV footages in the early hours of 9 February 2016 that the incident was a riot. He said that there was a need to convey a clear message of zero tolerance of violent acts to the community. However, some Members had attempted to rationalize the violent acts in the incident and divert the attention of the community by calling for the establishment of a commission of inquiry to investigate into the cause for the incident. He also said that although some people claimed that the incident arose from

discontent with the governance of the Administration, violent acts could not change governance.

- 21. <u>Mr Christopher CHEUNG</u> considered that the claim of some Members that the governance of the Administration was the major cause for the incident would only encourage violence. <u>Dr Priscilla LEUNG</u> said that attempts to rationalize violent acts and arson in the incident would only promote escalated violence.
- 22. Mr WONG Kwok-hing strongly condemned the violent acts and expressed his sympathy with police officers injured in the incident. He said that the violent acts of rioters had created an adverse impact on the safety image of Hong Kong. He also condemned some Members for trying to rationalize the violent acts and shift the responsibility of the incident to the Administration. He said that the throwing of objects by Members at meetings of LegCo had encouraged violence in the community.
- 23. Mr MA Fung-kwok expressed his sympathy with police officers injured in the incident. He said that under no circumstances should violence be accepted in a civilized society. He expressed grave concern that some Members were trying to rationalize the violent acts in the incident. Regarding the firing of warning shots at the air by a police officer, he said that it was appropriate for the police officer concerned to have done so to prevent an injured police officer from being further attacked. He also commended the media for revealing the facts despite the threat of being assaulted by rioters. He said that the incident was obviously premeditated and there were some people inciting violence through the Internet. TV footages showed that rioters were commanded by a person standing on a car with a loudspeaker. He expressed concern about whether law enforcement actions had been taken against persons who incited the violent acts.
- 24. Mr Christopher CHUNG expressed concern that rioters had set fire at many places on the streets and assaulted police officers as well members of the media, causing the injury of more than 90 police officers and several members of the media. Some rioters had even continued to throw wooden planks and paving bricks at injured police officers lying on the ground. He said that some Members were not only indifferent to the injury of members of the media and a large number of police officers, but tried to rationalize the violent acts. He considered that the establishment of a commission of inquiry would only hinder the criminal investigation currently undertaken by the Police.

- 25. <u>Mr IP Kin-yuen</u> said that persons who used violence should face the legal consequence. He said that Members belonging to the pan-democratic camp had condemned the violent acts in the incident.
- 26. S for S responded that it was saddening to see the degree of violence exhibited by rioters and to note that 110 square metres of paving bricks had been dug out from pavements and used by rioters to assault police officers from all directions. He said that as initial information only indicated that there would be gathering of crowds who claimed to support hawkers, the Police had deployed officers for crowd management at the initial stage. As more people gathered at the scene and the situation significantly worsened later in the night, more police officers and equipment were deployed to the scene. As the rioters were scattered over 14 streets, traffic police officers had been deployed to the scene to divert traffic, or else both the rioters and road users would be in danger. However, these police officers were besieged and assaulted by rioters. The Police had been deploying officers to handle the riot in accordance with the latest situation. He said that the Police were making all efforts to apprehend the rioters involved, collect evidence and bring them to justice. The Police would not preclude that the riot was premeditated and organized. The Police's investigation would be a comprehensive one and would not only be confined to people at the scene, but would also include those who were involved in the riot at different stages. The Police had also established a review committee on the riot in Mong Kok. Administration did not consider it necessary to set up an independent commission of inquiry, headed by a judge, to look into the incident.
- 27. <u>Director of Operations</u> ("D/Ops") said that the Police received a request for assistance at around 9:40 pm on 8 February 2016 from FEHD staff who were surrounded and pushed around near Langham Place. The Police deployed a small team of police officers who were performing duty nearby to the scene, where a large group of people had gathered and blocked the road. At the same time, other police officers performing duties in the vicinity, including those originally performing crowd management duties at the International Chinese New Year Parade, were deployed to provide support at the scene. Police officers arranged FEHD staff and vehicles stranded in the streets concerned to leave the area, while the number of people gathering at the scene was increasing quickly. After midnight, around 700 persons gathered in the area. Despite the Police's repeated call for these persons to stop blocking the traffic and disperse, these persons refused to comply and charged police cordon. The Police

Admin

deployed more officers to the scene, including Emergency Unit officers and those who had just concluded crowd management duties in the Parade. Violence escalated to a high level at around 1:30 am on 9 February 2016, while rioters went to other streets. More police officers, including police officers with anti-riot equipment, were deployed to the scene. Mr James TO requested the Administration to provide a chronology of events for the incident, such as the police manpower and number of police vehicles deployed to the scene at different hours.

(*Post-meeting note*: Information on the course of events of the Mong Kok riot provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1927/15-16(01) on 19 July 2016.)

- 28. D/Ops added that the behaviour of rioters who attacked police officers and reporters, which was the most violent since Hong Kong's return to China, was unacceptable. Rioters utilized information and communications technology to gather a large number of people within a short time. He said that as a member of the management of the Police Force, he was very furious and saddened about the violent attacks on police officers and damages made by rioters. He expressed appreciation and respect to the professional and fearless spirit, dedication and brave performance of frontline police officers in maintaining Hong Kong's law and order. He informed Members that persons arrested in connection with the riot included those alleged of inciting the riot. Among the 68 persons arrested so far in connection with the riot, 54 were arrested at the scene. Investigation into cases relating to the riot was being carried out by the Organized Crime and Triad Bureau, and prosecution would be instituted after investigation. The Police would continue to apprehend other rioters involved.
- 29. <u>Mr YIU Si-wing</u> expressed concern that rioters had set fire at many locations and deliberately obstructed firemen's fire-fighting operations. He asked about the measures to be adopted by the Administration to deal with such a situation.
- 30. Assistant Director (Headquarters), Fire Services Department responded that the Fire Services Department received 22 fire calls and 36 emergency ambulance calls in Mong Kok during the riot. In the case of 11 of the fire calls, the arrival of fire appliances had been delayed for five to 72 minutes. The arrival of emergency ambulance had been delayed for seven to 17 minutes in the case of three of the emergency

ambulance calls. Rioters threw objects at police officers who protected firemen and ambulance personnel. Rioters also used bricks and other objects to obstruct fire appliances from arriving at the scene. At the junction of Sai Yeung Choi Street South and Soy Street, rioters scolded and threw glass bottles at firemen who arrived at the scene to carry out fire fighting work. Some rioters also inserted bricks before the tyres of fire appliances to inhibit their movement and prevent the fire appliances from attending to the fire scenes. At the junction of Tung Choi Street and Soy Street, rioters set fire on tarpaulin covers with accelerants and other objects, producing flames of 10 metres in height as well as heavy smoke which reached 20 metres in height, posing serious threat to the safety of residents inside buildings in the area, as the fire might spread to those buildings. Mr CHAN Kin-por expressed concern that as there were many people living in Mong Kok, any fire in the area could easily become uncontrollable and result in serious casualties. He considered that if similar situations arose in future, the Administration should cordon off the entire area to prevent any possible disaster arising from people setting fire on the streets.

<u>Deployment of police manpower and equipment and review of police operations</u>

- 31. Mr CHAN Kam-lam strongly condemned the violent acts in the incident. He considered that the Police had deployed inadequate manpower and equipment for handling the incident and had been too restrained in law enforcement in the incident. Mr WONG Kwok-kin considered that the Police should conduct a review on their operations in the incident.
- 32. <u>Mr Christopher CHUNG</u> expressed concern about the measures to be adopted by the Police to reduce injuries of police officers under similar situations. <u>Mr NG Leung-sing</u> said that police officers should be provided with adequate and suitable equipment to protect themselves from violence.
- 33. <u>S for S</u> said that in response to the riot, the Police had set up a committee to conduct a review to enhance the safety and professional competency of police officers in the execution of duties. The handling of the situation with appropriate equipment and protection of the safety of police officers would be part of the major areas to be studied by the review committee. He said that training for police officers in the handling of riots would be strengthened.

- 34. Mr Kenneth LEUNG said that to his knowledge, D/Ops was in charge of the operations concerned and also appointed to the review committee. He considered that it would be more appropriate for the review to be conducted by officers of a more senior level in the Police who had not been involved in the operations concerned. He expressed concern about the scope of the Police's review and whether the results of the review would be made public.
- 35. <u>D/Ops</u> responded that as in the case of all large-scale operations, the Police would sum up and examine various aspects of operations including deployment, manpower, tactics and equipment in order to meet future operational needs. Every such review would involve observations and recommendations on police policy, tactics and training etc. Those which could not be publicized would not be made public. The review committee set up in response to the riot was chaired by Deputy Commissioner of Police (Management). The review would be comprehensive so that the Police could handle similar situation in future more effectively.
- 36. <u>Dr Elizabeth QUAT</u> considered that adequate anti-riot equipment should be provided to police officers for handling riots. She suggested that the specialized crowd management vehicles with water spray devices to be procured by the Police should possess the capability of spraying liquid dye to facilitate the identification of offenders.
- 37. Mr Christopher CHEUNG expressed concern about the progress of procurement of specialized crowd management vehicles with water spray device. D/Ops responded that the Police would procure such vehicles and the tendering and approval procedures for acquisition of the vehicles had commenced.

Gathering of intelligence relating to violence

38. The Deputy Chairman commended the Police for exercising restraint in the incident. He condemned the violent acts in the incident and said that such violence was unacceptable regardless of the cause. Noting that many persons had responded to calls on the Internet and rapidly gathered at the scene in the incident, he asked whether the Administration would review its intelligence gathering work. He also expressed concern about whether actions had been taken in relation to the weapons workshop of persons who had resorted to violence in the

incident. <u>Mr Christopher CHUNG</u> expressed concern about the measures to be adopted by the Police to strengthen their intelligence gathering work.

- 39. <u>D/Ops</u> said that it was the practice of the Police to make appropriate deployment having regard to information of various events collected from various channels, including publicly accessible information on the Internet. In the incident, there was no intelligence indicating that there would be any riot in the area. The Police arrived at the scene on that day after receiving request of assistance from FEHD. Police officers were then attacked by rioters and the Police had made deployment to deal with the riot. He said that the Police would continue to gather intelligence through different channels and the Criminal Intelligence Bureau would also follow up on intelligence involving crime.
- 40. Mr NG Leung-sing expressed support for the Police's work in maintaining law and order in Hong Kong. He said that what had happened was clear from the TV footages concerned. He said that prosecution should be instituted as soon as possible against persons who breached the law. The Police should consider reinstating their Special Branch, which had been abolished after PRC had resumed the exercise of sovereignty over Hong Kong, to facilitate intelligence gathering work.
- 41. <u>S for S</u> responded that prosecution had been instituted against 41 of the 68 arrested persons and investigation was being carried out on the remaining persons. He said that since Hong Kong's return to China, there was no longer a Special Branch in the Police. The Police had a unit to gather crime-related intelligence.

Rights of detainees

42. Mr Kenneth LEUNG declared that he was a member of IPCC. He expressed concern that some persons arrested in connection with the incident had complained of being prohibited from making telephone calls to contact their legal advisers for 20 to 30 hours during detention. D/Ops stressed that the Police respected the rights of all persons, including the rights of arrestees. He said that there was an established mechanism for handling complaints against police officers. Complaints would be handled fairly and impartially by the Complaints Against Police Office. He said that at that moment there was no information indicating that a complaint as mentioned by Mr LEUNG had been received.

Enactment of legislation to prohibit the wearing of masks by participants of public assemblies

- 43. <u>Dr Elizabeth QUAT</u> considered that the Administration should consider enacting legislation to prohibit the wearing of masks by participants of public assemblies. She pointed out that legislation prohibiting the wearing of masks by participants of public assemblies could be found in Austria, Canada, Denmark, France, Germany, Russia, Spain, Sweden and the United States of America. She expressed concern that many people who had been prosecuted for breach of the law in connection with the Occupy Movement had been sentenced to light punishment by court and this had encouraged violence in Hong Kong.
- 44. <u>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan</u> expressed concern that many persons who resorted to violence in the incident had worn masks in order to conceal their identities and evade legal liability. She shared the view that consideration should be given to enacting legislation to prohibit the wearing of masks by participants of public assemblies.
- 45. <u>Mr WONG Kwok-hing</u> expressed concern about whether measures would be adopted by the Police to tackle the wearing of masks by participants of public assemblies to evade legal liability.
- 46. <u>S for S</u> said that although public assemblies and processions had been held peacefully in the past, a small number of radical participants of public assemblies had disturbed order and deliberately worn masks for the purpose of, in his view, concealing their identities and evading legal liability for breach of the law. He stressed that the Police would take resolute actions against all unlawful acts. <u>D/Ops</u> added that the Police Force Ordinance (Cap. 232) conferred power to police officers to stop and search a person found by police officers in a public place to act in a suspicious manner. During the process, police officers would demand that person to produce proof of identity for inspection.

Moving of motions by members

47. The Chairman said that Dr Elizabeth QUAT and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung had indicated respective intentions to move a motion in relation to the agenda item and he had examined the wording of the two motions in accordance with Rule 22(p) of the House Rules. He ruled that the two motions were directly related to the agenda item and were not inconsistent with each other. He said that the two motions

would be proceeded with and be voted on in the order in which they were presented to the Panel.

[To allow sufficient time for discussion, the Chairman advised that the meeting would be extended to 1:05 pm.]

48. <u>Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT</u> moved the following motion:

"本委員會嚴厲譴責有暴徒目無法紀及罔顧人命安全,暴力襲擊執法人員及記者、四處縱火、毀壞公物,嚴重危害公共安全和社會秩序的暴亂行為;並對警方在艱難危險的環境下,堅守崗位,全力維護社會安寧,維護本港法治表達謝意;全力支持警方嚴正執法,呼籲盡快將所有暴徒繩之於法;同時,本委員會促請保安局增加處理暴亂事件的人手及提升警隊裝備,保障大眾市民及執勤警務人員的人身安全及維護社會安寧。"

(Translation)

"That this Panel strongly condemns the rioters for their blatant defiance of the law and reckless disregard for people's life and safety as they violently attacked law enforcement officers and journalists, set fires in multiple locations and damaged public properties, which seriously endangered public safety and social order; expresses gratitude to members of the Police who, in such difficult and dangerous situations, remained steadfast in their duties and spared no effort in maintaining social peace and upholding the rule of law in Hong Kong; fully supports the Police in their efforts to strictly enforce the law, and calls on them to expeditiously bring all the rioters to justice; at the same time, this Panel urges the Security Bureau to increase manpower for handling riots and upgrade Police equipment, so as to safeguard the personal safety of members of the public and police officers on duty, and to maintain social peace."

49. The Chairman put Dr Elizabeth QUAT's motion to vote.

The following members voted in favour of the motion:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam, Mr CHAN Kin-por, Dr Priscilla LEUNG, Mr WONG Kwok-kin, Mr NG Leung-sing, Mr Frankie YICK, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr MA Fung-kwok, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung,

Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Mr Christopher CHEUNG, Dr Elizabeth QUAT, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan, Mr Christopher CHUNG and Mr Tony TSE. (16 members)

The following members voted against the motion:

Ms Cyd HO, Mr Alan LEONG. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr WONG Yuk-man, Ms Claudia MO. Mr Charles MOK. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Dr Kenneth CHAN and Mr Fernando CHEUNG. (nine members)

The following member abstained from voting:

Mr James TO (one member)

- 50. <u>The Chairman</u> declared that 16 members voted for and nine members voted against the motion and one member abstained. He declared that the motion moved by Dr Elizabeth QUAT was carried.
- 51. <u>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung</u> moved the following motion:

"鑒於梁振英政府聲稱2月9日凌晨旺角發生'暴亂',並多次予以 譴責,本席動議當局成立專責調查委員會,就此事件展開詳細 調查及尋找引起事件的社會、經濟、政治的原因及相關事宜, 發表詳細報告。"

(Translation)

"That as the LEUNG Chun-ying administration claims that a 'riot' took place in Mong Kok at midnight on 9 February and repeatedly condemns the incident, I move that the Administration should set up a dedicated commission of inquiry to conduct a detailed investigation into this incident and identify the social, economic and political causes leading to the incident and related issues, and publish a detailed report."

52. <u>The Chairman</u> put Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's motion to vote.

The following members voted in favour of the motion:

Mr James TO, Ms Cyd HO, Mr Alan LEONG, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr WONG Yuk-man, Ms Claudia MO, Mr Charles MOK, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Dr Kenneth CHAN and Mr Fernando CHEUNG. (10 members)

The following members voted against the motion:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam, Mr CHAN Kin-por, Dr Priscilla LEUNG, Mr WONG Kwok-kin, Mr NG Leung-sing, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr MA Fung-kwok, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung, Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Mr Christopher CHEUNG, Dr Elizabeth QUAT, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Mr Christopher CHUNG and Mr Tony TSE. (14 members)

- 53. <u>The Chairman</u> declared that 10 members voted for and 14 members voted against the motion. He declared that the motion moved by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung was negatived.
- 54. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:05 pm.

Council Business Division 2
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
9 September 2016