

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1302/15-16
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/TP/1

Panel on Transport

**Minutes of meeting held on
Wednesday, 23 March 2016, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present :** Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG Ngok-kiu
- Members attending :** Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Members absent : Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item III**

Ms Ivy LAW
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 3

Ms Cordelia LAM
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 2

Mr LEUNG Tak-fai, JP
Assistant Commissioner/Technical Services
Transport Department

Mr LI Chi-chiu
Chief Engineer/Traffic Control
Transport Department

Agenda item IV

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 1

Ms Judy CHUNG Sui-kei
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 5

Mr CHENG Ting-ning, JP
Project Manager (New Territories East)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Michael LAW Hing-sun
Chief Engineer/New Territories East 1 (Acting)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong
Chief Engineer/Strategic Roads
Transport Department

Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 1

Ms Judy CHUNG Sui-kei
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 5

Mr CHUI Wing-wah
Deputy Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr CHU Shun-wah
Chief Highway Engineer/Works
Highways Department

Mr Everett LUK Yiu-wah
Chief Engineer/Strategic Planning
Highways Department

Mr Wilson PANG Wai-shing
Chief Traffic Engineer/Kowloon
Transport Department

Mr Kelvin SIU Kin-man
Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories West
Transport Department

Mr SIU Kang-chuen
Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories East
Transport Department

Clerk in attendance : Mr Anthony CHU
Chief Council Secretary (4)1

Staff in attendance : Ms Wendy JAN
Senior Council Secretary (4)7

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (4)6

Action

I. Information papers issued since the last meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)730/15-16(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon TANG Ka-piu on the safety of glass doors of franchised buses)

Members noted the above paper issued since the last meeting.

II. Items for discussion at the next meeting on 15 April 2016

(LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(02) - List of follow-up actions)

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting to be held on 15 April 2016 –

(a) Public Transport Strategy Study ("PTSS") Topical Study – Accessible public transport services for people with disabilities;

- (b) PTSS Topical Study – Mid-term review for ferry service of the current licence; and
- (c) Replacement of Manual Toll Collection System and Fire Alarm System in Aberdeen Tunnel.

3. Mr CHAN Kam-lam requested the Administration to report to the Panel the updated progress of the following two items as soon as possible:

- (a) Takeover arrangements of Eastern Harbour Crossing by the Government; and
- (b) Study on increasing the seating capacity of public light buses.

4. For item (a) in paragraph 3 above, the Chairman said that the Administration had proposed to report to the Panel the updated progress at a later stage. The Chairman also said that the Administration had originally proposed to report the progress of item (b) in paragraph 3 above to the Panel in June 2016. He would liaise with the Administration to see whether this item could be advanced to the Panel meeting in May 2016.

III. Relocation of Transport Department's operation centres to the West Kowloon Government Offices

(LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(03) - Administration's paper on relocation of Transport Department's operation centres to the West Kowloon Government Offices)

5. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the subjects under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the subjects.

6. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)3 ("DS(T)3") briefed members on the Administration's proposal of relocating five Transport Department ("TD")'s operation centres, namely the three Area Traffic Control Centres ("ATCCs") in Harbour Building ("HB"), Immigration Tower ("IT") and Kowloon Government Offices, the Emergency Transport Coordination Centre ("ETCC") and the Traffic Control & Surveillance Systems Centre in IT, to the West Kowloon Government Offices ("WKGO"), with a backup centre for the ATCCs set up in HB, at an estimated

non-recurrent cost of \$129,303,000. The cost also covered the provision of new equipment, including a unified interface, to enhance the capability of all the four Areas Traffic Control ("ATC") systems upon relocation. Subject to members' views, the Administration planned to seek the Finance Committee ("FC")'s funding approval as early as practicable. Assistant Commissioner/Technical Services ("AC/TS"), TD then briefed members with the aid of powerpoint on the relocation proposal.

(Post-meeting note: The powerpoint presentation materials was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4) 807/15-16(01) by email on 1 April 2016.)

Justifications and financial implications of the relocation proposal

7. While supporting the proposal in principle, Mr Frankie YICK and Mr YIU Si-wing enquired about the savings in manpower and overheads arising from the relocation proposal. AC/TS advised that upon relocation to WKGO, the five operation centres would be co-located, enabling TD to deploy its manpower flexibly and efficiently to meet the fluctuating workload of the ATC system operations. TD would make better use of its existing manpower to enhance its services to the public. Upon the relocation, system integration would be achieved, and hence the maintenance costs of the software/hardware of the ATC systems could be reduced. Details of the cost savings would be worked out at a later stage.

8. Noting that the estimated annual recurrent expenditure for maintaining the relocated and integrated systems in WKGO would be \$63.4 million, which was \$6.6 million higher than that of the existing systems, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan queried whether it was worthwhile to relocate the operation centres to WKGO. AC/TS advised that the additional annual recurrent expenditure was mainly due to the costs for extending the telecommunication lines connecting the on-street traffic signal controllers on Hong Kong Island across the harbour to WKGO. Responding to Mr LEE's further query on whether it would be more cost-effective to retain the Hong Kong Island ATCC in HB, thus obviating the need for the additional recurrent expenditure, DS(T)3 explained that the relocation of operation centres would enable TD's staff and resources to be used most efficiently and would be in the best interest of effective overall monitoring of the entire territory's traffic situation and handling of cross-district traffic incidents.

9. In reply to Ms Claudia MO's enquiry regarding the employment of consultants for the relocation project and the details of the provision of contingency of about \$10,261,000, DS(T)3 highlighted that the project

involved relocating eight sophisticated traffic control systems. The planning, design, coordination and implementation would be complex and require a high level of expertise and accuracy. Specialist consultants had to be engaged to carry out the planning, design, tendering and supervision of the associated re-location work. On the contingency fee, it was the practice of the Administration to earmark about 10% of the project expenditure for contingency purpose.

10. Given that significant amount of public resources was requested for the current relocation proposal, the Chairman and Mr Charles Peter MOK opined that the Administration had to provide members with comprehensive and detailed information on the benefits to the community arising from the relocation proposal. They therefore requested the Administration to provide an analysis of the cost and benefits to the community arising from the relocation proposal in the paper to be submitted to FC.

(Post meeting note: The Administration had provided supplementary information in its paper (LC Paper No. FCR(2016-17)47) submitted to FC for the meeting on 17 June 2016.)

Backup centres for ATCCs

11. Ms Claudia MO expressed concern about the risk of relocating all five operation centres of TD centrally at WKGO. She enquired about details of the contingency measures in cases of any accidents happened at the new co-located operation centre in WKGO, such as outbreak of fire or disruption of electricity supply, that might cause disruptions to the systems.

12. DS(T)3 advised that upon relocation of the three ATCCs to WKGO, an off-site backup centre in HB would be set up to allow continuous operation of the ATC systems in the event that serious incidents occurred in WKGO. The backup centres for the remaining two operation centres, i.e. ETCC and the Traffic Control and Surveillance Systems Centre, currently located at the Mong Kok Government Offices would continue to serve the same purpose.

13. Mr YIU Si-wing enquired about the reliability of the existing backup centres for the systems in the past few years and the possibility of setting up the new backup centre in other areas instead of in HB near Sheung Wan for better use of government office space located in such assessable business area. In reply, AC/TS said that if there was any malfunctioning of the main systems, the existing backup systems, being hot standby, were able to take over immediately. These backup systems had been performing their functions properly, and no serious system disruption was encountered in the past few

years. With regular maintenance and testing of the systems, the Administration had confidence in the performance of the backup systems and in maintaining high system reliability. As regards the location of the backup centre, HB was considered a suitable location for the new backup centre for ATCCs because the existing facilities at the Hong Kong Island ATCC could be re-used as far as possible. Moreover, the location was easily accessible, allowing TD staff to reach the centre quickly when needed.

System software and hardware

14. Mr CHAN Kam-lam and Mr WU Chi-wai were concerned about the useful lives of the hardware of the existing systems and whether they needed replacement upon their relocation to the new operation centre. They also sought details about the compatibility of the system software which would be upgraded after the relocation exercise.

15. AC/TS advised that due to different brands and implementation times of the four ATC systems, their system software and hardware were different and had different user interfaces. Upon relocation of ATCCs to WKGO, a unified graphical user interface for accessing all the four ATC systems would be developed and the ATC systems software would be aligned to the same version. AC/TS further advised that while a Traffic and Incident Management System ("TIMS") would be commissioned later in 2016 and the Tai Po & North Districts ATC system was now being replaced, the serviceable lives of most of the other major traffic control systems would go beyond 2019-2020.

Preparation for the changeover of the operation centres

16. Mr POON Siu-ping and Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about TD's preparation for the changeover of TD's operation centres to WKGO and the timeline. AC/TS replied that TD would make use of existing backup systems to facilitate the relocation. In order to minimize the disruption to existing services, the actual changeover would be implemented step by step over a period of 10 to 12 months, starting from the second quarter of 2019 for completion in the third quarter of 2020. TD would conduct the necessary tests to ensure the proper functioning of the systems being relocated to the new operation centre as well as in the backup centre prior to the commissioning of these systems.

17. Mr Charles Peter MOK sought more information on TD's risk assessments on the changeover. AC/TS replied that the risk of disruption to traffic during the relocation would be very low because even if the ATC

systems had any problem, the on-street traffic signal controllers were still capable of controlling the traffic signals locally according to the pre-set programs. Traffic signals could still operate safely even without signal co-ordination. For other systems such as TIMS, they performed supportive role to TD staff in the operation centres, and there were also backup systems. Even if these systems could not function, TD staff would still be able to handle transport incidents.

18. In reply to Mr CHAN Kam-lam's enquiry about the control of on-street traffic signals, AC/TS explained that the ATC system used a central computer to coordinate the operations of on-street traffic signals on a regional basis. This system also allowed TD's staff at the ATCCs to monitor and adjust on-street traffic signals timing in real time having regard to the prevailing traffic conditions. Sensors were also installed at some road junctions so that the traffic signals could respond accordingly to the traffic conditions.

19. In view of the large scale and complexity of the relocation proposal, the Chairman requested the Administration to provide information in the paper to be submitted to FC on the preparatory work and contingency measures to facilitate the smooth changeover of the existing TD's operation centres to WKGO, including the eight computer systems and telecommunication equipment, and whether extra manpower would be deployed to station at various districts to handle emergency situations during the changeover.

(Post meeting note: The Administration had provided supplementary information in its paper (LC Paper No. FCR(2016-17)47) submitted to FC for the meeting on 17 June 2016.)

Emergency Transport Coordination Centre

20. Regarding the concern of Mr POON Siu-ping and Mr WONG Kwok-hing on the operation of ETCC, DS(T)3 said that ETCC coordinated the actions and responses of different government departments and public transport operators in emergency situation, as well as during major events and incidents that had significant traffic implications. ETCC would also be relocated to WKGO in 2020. In addition, TIMS would be commissioned later in 2016 to support the work of ETCC staff in handling emergency traffic incidents.

Enforcement of yellow box marking

21. Mr Frankie YICK pointed out that it was common for drivers not to abide by the yellow box marking restriction by stopping their vehicles at these junctions, thus causing serious traffic jams. In this connection, he requested

the Administration to use advanced technology, such as close-circuit television ("CCTV") cameras, to facilitate the detection and strengthen enforcement actions with a view to achieving a greater deterrent effect.

22. DS(T)3 advised that the Transport and Housing Bureau ("THB"), TD and the Police had looked into the feasibility of, and overseas experience in, using technology to facilitate the enforcement of yellow box marking. The preliminary findings revealed that the use of existing technology such as CCTV cameras might not be suitable for enforcement purpose having regard to local circumstances. The Administration would continue to keep in view the development in this regard. In this connection, the Chairman strongly urged the Administration to consider taking this opportunity to step up the enforcement of yellow box marking by using footage from CCTV cameras recordings.

Handling of images and footage from traffic cameras

23. In reply to Ms Claudia MO's enquiries about the retention and handling of images and footage from various camera system installed by TD at major road junctions and strategic road sections for traffic monitoring, AC/TS advised that TD had internal guidelines on the retention and handling of the images or footage captured by traffic cameras. The guidelines stipulated that these images or footage were mainly used by TD for real-time traffic monitoring and incident management, and were not recorded. DS(T)3 supplemented that for traffic cameras in tunnels and control areas, while footage would be recorded for operational needs (e.g. toll collection), the footage would be erased after seven days to three months in accordance with established guidelines.

Provision of real-time traffic information

24. Dr Elizabeth QUAT remarked that TD's Hong Kong eRouting website, which provided point-to-point driving route searching service and real-time traffic information for pre-trip planning, was not user friendly. She hoped that the Administration would take this opportunity to greatly improve the provision of real-time traffic information to the public through the use of advanced technology.

25. Dr Elizabeth QUAT and Mr WONG Kwok-hing further asked about the provision of real-time traffic information and parking vacancy information by TD to the public. DS(T)3 replied that live webcast of road traffic conditions was currently available at TD's Road Traffic Information Service website and mobile application. TD had been in discussion with operators of private car parks to encourage them to provide real-time parking vacancy information to

TD for dissemination to the public through websites and mobile applications. Positive feedbacks from some operators had been received. This new service was expected to be rolled out in mid-2016.

Conclusion

26. In closing, the Chairman concluded that members supported the submission of the proposal by the Administration to FC for funding approval.

IV. Tseung Kwan O – Lam Tin Tunnel – construction

(LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(04) - Administration's paper on 823TH – Tseung Kwan O – Lam Tin Tunnel

LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(05) - Paper on Tseung Kwan O-Lam Tin Tunnel prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief))

27. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Transport and Housing ("USTH") briefed members on the Administration's proposal for upgrading part of **823TH**, entitled "Tseung Kwan O – Lam Tin Tunnel ("TKO-LTT") – main tunnel and associated works", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$15,093.5 million in money-of-the-day prices. Subject to the support of the Panel and the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC"), and the funding approval of FC in this legislative session, the Administration planned to commence construction in phases from July 2016 for completion in mid-2021. Chief Engineer/New Territories East 1 (Acting), Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD") then briefed members with the aid of powerpoint on details of the proposal.

(Post-meeting note: The powerpoint presentation materials was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4) 807/15-16(02) by email on 1 April 2016.)

Implementation of the project

28. Mr Gary FAN declared that he was a member of the Sai Kung District Council ("SKDC") and a resident of Tseung Kwan O ("TKO"). He criticized that the Administration had taken too long to implement the TKO-LTT

project. According to the information submitted by the Administration to SKDC, the conceptual design of TKO-LTT was completed in around 2007 and 2008, and the alignment of the tunnel was revised in around 2008 and 2009. It was therefore unreasonable and unacceptable that the completion date of the construction works of this project had been postponed repeatedly over the years. Furthermore, in the past years, the estimated costs of the TKO-LTT project had increased at a level similar to the inflation rates. However, the estimated cost of the project significantly escalated by 83% from about \$8,200 million in 2015 to about \$15,000 million in 2016. Mr Paul TSE also requested the Administration to explain the reasons for the substantial delay in the implementation of the project.

29. Project Manager (New Territories East), CEDD ("PM(NTE)") explained that TKO-LTT was a very complicated project. The Administration had spent considerable time on the design of TKO-LTT and on the handling of objections from the stakeholders relating to the project. Upon the approval of the Environmental Impact Assessment Report for the project in 2013, the Administration had made all efforts to implement the TKO-LTT project. USTH advised that the funding application for carrying out the detailed design and site investigation for TKO-LTT was approved by FC in 2013.

30. Mr CHAN Kam-lam expressed support for the Administration's funding proposal. He asked whether the Administration had confidence that the construction works of the TKO-LTT project could commence in July 2016, and whether the tendering exercise for this proposal had begun.

31. PM(NTE) replied that the Administration had already started the tendering exercise for the major contract of the TKO-LTT project in August 2015, and had now substantially completed the tender evaluation process. As such, the Administration had confidence the construction works of the TKO-LTT project could commence in July 2016 subject to FC's funding approval in this legislative session.

32. Mrs Regina IP also expressed support for the Administration's funding proposal and called on the Administration to speed up the implementation of the project. She sought details of the major contract and the measures to be taken by the Administration in cost control in the event that the present funding proposal could not be approved by FC in this legislative session.

33. In reply, PM(NTE) advised that the major contract involved the construction of Lam Tin Interchange and the main tunnel of TKO-LTT of about 2.2 km. If the present funding proposal could not be approved by FC within this legislative session, the Administration would try to liaise with the tenderers

to extend the validity of the tenders beyond 2016 at the original tender prices. USTH added that in such case, the funding application would be submitted to FC at the beginning of the new legislative term starting in October 2016.

34. In view of the long list of items awaiting deliberation by PWSC, Mrs Regina IP further asked whether the Administration would consider submitting the present funding proposal to FC without seeking the endorsement of PWSC, with a view to expediting the implementation of the project. USTH replied that the Administration noted Mrs IP's views on the matter.

Toll charges and collection method

35. Noting that the design of TKO-LTT did not include a toll plaza, the Chairman asked how tunnel tolls would be collected. USTH replied that the Administration would consider various means to collect tolls, including electronic toll system.

36. Mr Alvin YEUNG further asked when the Administration would decide on the toll levels and toll collection method for TKO-LTT. If a new toll collection method was to be adopted, he stressed that the Administration should give sufficient time for the public to familiarize themselves with any new method prior to the opening of the tunnel.

37. USTH noted Mr YEUNG's views. He advised that the toll levels and toll collection method for TKO-LTT would only be finalized near the time of completion of the tunnel, which was expected to be in 2021.

38. Referring to the estimated project cost of \$15,093.5 million, the Chairman expressed concern that if the Administration gave a higher weighting to cost recovery in setting the toll levels, the charges would be very high which might not be conducive to achieving traffic diversion. In this connection, the Chairman asked whether traffic diversion would be the main, if not the only, factor to be considered by the Administration in setting the toll levels for TKO-LTT. Mr Alvin YEUNG enquired whether the Administration would also take into consideration the toll levels of TKO Tunnel in this regard.

39. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan was of the view that the Administration should not consider cost recovery in setting the toll levels for TKO-LTT having regard to its benefit to the overall community. He hoped that the Administration would undertake that the toll levels for TKO-LTT would be at similar levels to those of TKO Tunnel in order to achieve an even distribution of traffic between two tunnels.

40. USTH replied that while it was the Administration's policy to recover the operating costs of Government tunnels through toll charges, the Administration would also take into consideration a host of factors such as traffic distribution, toll levels of TKO Tunnel, project cost, public affordability, etc. in setting the toll levels for TKO-LTT. In this connection, the Chairman requested the Administration to provide information in the paper to be submitted to PWSC on the toll levels of TKO-LTT; and the factors to be considered by the Administration in setting the tolls and the respective weighting of each factor.

(Post meeting note: The Administration had provided supplementary information in its paper (LC Paper No. PWSC(2016-17)14) submitted to PWSC for the meeting on 4 May 2016.)

Other concerns on the TKO-LTT project

41. Mr TANG Ka-piu enquired about the anticipated volume/capacity ("v/c") ratio of the TKO Tunnel in 2021 upon the completion of TKO-LTT, and asked whether the Administration would consider constructing another new route which would cater for further expansion of TKO population, in particular the anticipated population intake in TKO Area 137.

42. Chief Engineer/Strategic Roads, TD ("CE/SR") advised that upon the completion of TKO-LTT, it was anticipated that the v/c ratio during peak hours of Kowloon-bound traffic of TKO Tunnel in 2021 could be reduced from about 1.4 to about 0.9, and that there would be spare capacity for TKO-LTT and the TKO Tunnel in 2021 to cater for further expansion of TKO population. USTH supplemented that the Administration had not yet made a final decision on the development of TKO Area 137. If there were any developments at TKO Area 137, the Administration would conduct a traffic impact assessment for the projects.

43. Referring to the 2.83 million tonnes of inert construction waste generated by the project, Dr Elizabeth QUAT asked whether the Administration would deliver all the inert construction waste to the public fill reception facilities at TKO Area 137. She said that some TKO residents were worried that this arrangement might create additional burden on Wan Po Road. PM(NTE) replied that according to the contract of the project, these inert construction waste would be delivered to the public fill reception facilities at TKO Area 137 and Tuen Mun Area 38.

44. In reply to Mr Paul TSE's enquiry about the measures to be taken by the Administration to address the concerns raised by residents of Cha Kwo

Ling ("CKL") Village and Yau Lai Estate on the TKO-LTT project, PM(NTE) advised that the design of the project had been revised taking into account the views of the residents. The Administration would take appropriate mitigation measures to address their concerns on the structural safety of their buildings, and to lessen construction nuisances during tunnel construction.

Implementation of Cha Kwo Ling Tunnel and Trunk Road T2

45. Noting that the CKL Tunnel would connect between TKO-LTT and Trunk Road T2 but the Administration would only upgrade CKL Tunnel at a later stage, Mr TANG Ka-piu opined that it would be more preferable to construct the CKL Tunnel, with only 0.4 km in length, together with TKO-LTT to save cost.

46. As Trunk Road T2 would connect between the Central Kowloon Route and TKO-LTT, Mr Paul TSE enquired about its implementation programme. He was concerned that if Trunk Road T2 could not open to tie in with the commissioning of TKO-LTT in 2021, the additional traffic from TKO-LTT would cause serious traffic congestion in Kowloon East.

47. USTH advised that the implementation of Trunk Road T2 would align with the construction timetable of the Central Kowloon Route, which would be taken forward expeditiously.

48. In reply to Mr CHAN Kam-lam's enquiry on the Administration's plan to improve and widen CKL Road, PM(NTE) advised that according to the traffic impact assessment conducted for the project, the capacity of CKL Road would be able to cope with the future traffic demand.

Measures to relieve traffic congestion problem of TKO Tunnel

49. Dr Elizabeth QUAT enquired about the measures to be taken by the Administration, such as adoption of the tidal flow operation or adjustment of the operating hours of TKO fill bank and landfill to non-peak hours, to relieve the traffic congestion problem at TKO Tunnel prior to the completion of the TKO-LTT project. CE/SR advised that the Administration had considered the adoption of the tidal flow operation for TKO Tunnel, and had come to the view that this measure might cause an adverse impact by substantially increasing the travel time and queue for traffic in the TKO-bound direction. The Administration would relay Dr QUAT's suggestion on the adjustment of the operating hours of TKO fill bank and landfill to the relevant bureaux and departments for consideration.

Conclusion

50. In closing, the Chairman concluded that members supported the Administration to submit the proposal to PWSC for endorsement.

V. Provision of Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems, footbridges and elevated walkways

(LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(06) - Administration's paper on provision of Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems, footbridges and elevated walkways

LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(07) - Paper on the progress of provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief))

(At 12:49 pm, the Chairman extended the meeting for 15 minutes to 1:15 pm to allow sufficient time for discussion.)

51. At the invitation of the Chairman, USTH briefed members on the Administration's funding proposals of the construction of the following projects which targeted to enhance the accessibility of hillsides and urban area:

- (a) Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Cheung Hang Estate, Tsing Yi;
- (b) Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Kwai Shing Circuit and Hing Shing Road, Kwai Chung;
- (c) Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Waterloo Hill;
- (d) Footbridge connecting Tsuen Wan Plaza, Skyline Plaza and Adjacent Landscaping Area; and
- (e) Elevated Walkway between Tong Ming Street and Tong Tak Street, Tseung Kwan O.

Details of the funding proposals were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)736/15-16(06). Subject to the support of the Panel, the Administration planned to seek the endorsement of PWSC, and then to seek funding approval from FC for upgrading the construction works of the proposed projects to Category A. If FC approved the funding application within this legislative session, the Administration planned to commence the construction works of the proposed projects progressively from the fourth quarter of 2016.

(Post-meeting note: Soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4) 807/15-16(03) by email on 1 April 2016.)

Implementation progress

52. The Chairman and Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed grave disappointment over the slow progress of implementing the hillside escalator link and elevator system projects by the Administration. They pointed out that out of the 18 ranked hillside escalator link and elevator system proposals which had been received by the Administration in 2009, only two systems had been opened for public use. While the Administration was currently seeking funding approvals for three proposals (items (a) to (c) in paragraph 51 above) ("the Three Proposals"), 13 proposals were without concrete implementation timetable. They enquired about the way forward for these 13 proposals.

53. Deputy Director of Highways ("DD of Hy") explained that of the remaining 13 proposals, the Administration had commenced preliminary technical feasibility studies for seven proposals. Subject to the findings of the preliminary technical feasibility studies, the Highways Department had to carry out various tasks of pre-construction preparation, which covered investigation works and preliminary design, consultation with relevant District Councils and stakeholders, gazettal of the proposals and handling of any objections under the Roads (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap. 370), formulation of detailed design, and land acquisition, if necessary. Since these pre-construction tasks involved complicated procedures which might be controversial, the time required for implementing these works projects varied with the circumstances of individual projects.

54. Mr CHAN Han-pan further enquired whether the tendering exercises for the Three Proposals had begun. In reply, DD of Hy said that the Administration would start the tendering process on these proposed projects as soon as approval had been given by FC on the funding applications.

55. Dr Priscilla LEUNG expressed full support for the Administration's funding proposals, in particular the construction of the Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Waterloo Hill, and urged the Administration to speed up the implementation of the proposed projects to meet the needs of the local residents. In this connection, she asked whether the Administration would consider according a higher priority for the funding applications for the present five projects on the agenda of FC with a view to expediting the implementation of the projects. USTH took note of Dr LEUNG's views, and said that the Administration would consider a host of factors holistically when considering setting the order of agenda items of FC.

56. Mr WU Chi-wai also called on the Administration to speed up the implementation of the proposed projects. Dr Elizabeth QUAT was of the view that the Administration should take all possible measures to expedite the construction of the proposed projects, in particular the Elevated Walkway between Tong Ming Street and Tong Tak Street, Tseung Kwan O. She asked about the delay and additional cost to be incurred in the event that the present funding proposals could not be approved by FC within this legislative session.

57. USTH replied that in such circumstance, the Administration would submit the funding applications to FC as soon as possible in the new legislative term, and the commencement of the construction works of the proposed projects would inevitably be postponed for at least a few months. As the tendering process of these proposed projects had not yet commenced, the Administration was not in a position to provide an estimate on the impact on the cost at this stage. Nevertheless, the Administration would endeavour to seek FC's approval on the funding applications of the proposed projects within this legislative session so that the construction works could commence as soon as possible.

58. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked whether the Administration would undertake to submit in each year a certain number of hillside escalator link and elevator system proposals to FC for funding approval in the future. USTH responded that such an undertaking might not be possible as works for hillside escalator links often involved a multitude of issues, such as slopes, structures, soil properties, diversion of underground utilities and land resumption. In view of the complexity of the projects which involved extensive preparation and substantial manpower, the Administration could not undertake to submit each year a certain number of hillside escalator link and elevator system proposals for funding approval.

59. In reply to Dr KWOK Ka-ki's enquiry about whether the funding applications made by the Administration would be sufficient to cover the

construction costs of the proposed projects and possibility of cost overrun, DD of Hy said that the Administration had already carried out pre-construction preparation for the proposed projects, which covered investigation works and design. As such, the Administration had confidence that the funding applications would be sufficient to cover the construction costs of the proposed projects.

Dedicated fund for the implementation of the projects

60. Dr Elizabeth QUAT and Mr CHAN Han-pan asked whether the Administration would consider setting up a dedicated fund to provide funding for similar elevated walkway and footbridge projects with a view to expediting the projects' implementation. The Chairman expressed support for this proposal. In reply, USTH said that the installation of hillside escalator links and elevator systems involved significant capital investment ranging from approximately \$100 million to approximately \$200 million or more. THB would consider members' views in collaboration with the other relevant bureaux and departments. In this connection, Mr CHAN Han-pan said that he would raise a motion on the subject.

Details of the proposed projects

61. Referring to the Administration's proposal to construct a footbridge connecting Tsuen Wan Plaza, Skyline Plaza and adjacent landscaping area, Mr WU Chi-wai enquired about the Administration's policy on the construction of footbridges connecting private developments. USTH explained that it used to be the Administration's policy that public footbridges would not be provided to connect private developments. The proposal was taken forward considering existing pedestrian demand. Furthermore, there was land sale condition for the two relevant sites that the owners were required to provide a footbridge connection point with 24-hour public access to the footbridge. The proposed footbridge was a direct passage to connect the existing pedestrian walkway system in the area for public access between the northern and southern parts of Tsuen Wan. USTH further advised that the Administration would use Kowloon East as a pilot area for implementation of planned pedestrian links to enhance connectivity and walkability by providing suitable incentive to the private sector by way of waiving the land premium payable for lease modification for provision of the pedestrian links.

(At 1:13 pm, the Chairman proposed further extending the meeting for 15 minutes to 1:30 pm to allow sufficient time for discussion. Members raised no objection.)

62. Regarding the Three Proposals, Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired whether there were separate stairways that could be used by pedestrians in case the lifts were shut down and about the incorporation of environmentally friendly design for these proposals. DD of Hy replied that two or more lifts would be provided in each of the Three Proposals. In case that the lifts were not operating, say, due to power outage, the residents of Kwai Shing Circuit and Waterloo Hill could still use the existing staircases for access, while the residents of the Cheung Hang Estate area could use the proposed staircase to be constructed under the project. He further advised that the design in the Three Proposals had incorporated environmentally friendly concept, such as the use of concrete walls, instead of glass walls, for energy saving.

63. Given the anticipated great demand for lift facilities at Waterloo Hill, Mr James TO asked about the measures to be taken by the Administration to help maintain the queuing order, such as the provision of line markings on the ground. In reply, DD of Hy advised that the Administration proposed to construct a lift tower with two lifts at Waterloo Road, so that users could use the waiting area between the two lifts to queue up for the lifts. The Administration noted members' views and would review the need for additional measures having regard to the actual usage of the lifts. He said that subject to FC's funding approval within this legislative year, the proposed project was expected to be completed in 2019.

Scoring criteria and new suggestions

64. Given an ageing population in Hong Kong, the Chairman suggested that the Administration reviewed the scoring criteria for assessing hillside escalator link and elevator system proposals. Consideration should be given to adding a new criterion of the average level difference travelled by the elderly residents of 65 years old or above throughout each day within the catchment of the proposed works. USTH replied that the Administration had adopted an open mind in this matter and would consider the Chairman's views in assessing new suggestions on the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems.

65. As the residents living in Chak On Estate in Shek Kip Mei had to walk up and down a steep slope daily for access, Dr Priscilla LEUNG strongly hoped that the Administration would consider the construction of a lift and pedestrian walkway system at Chak On Estate. USTH undertook to look into the matter.

Motion

66. Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed his intention to move the following motion:

"本委員會要求政府成立 50 億元上坡地區升降機及扶手電梯基金，並要求政府採取措施加快推行相關工程。"

(Translation)

"That this Panel requests the Administration to set up a \$5 billion Hillside Elevator and Escalator Fund, and requests the Administration to take measures to expedite the works concerned."

Mr CHAN said that the amount of \$5 billion was proposed by making reference to the average cost of a similar project at \$250 million. This dedicated fund could enable the Administration to take forward about 20 hillside elevator and escalator projects expeditiously. The motion was seconded by Dr Elizabeth QUAT. However, the motion was not dealt with owing to a lack of quorum. The Chairman agreed to deal with the motion at the Panel's next regular meeting to be held on 15 April 2016.

Conclusion

67. In closing, the Chairman concluded that members had no objection for the Administration to submit the proposals to PWSC for endorsement.

VI. Any other business

68. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:27 pm.