

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(4)1158/16-17  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration and  
Airport Authority Hong Kong)

Ref: CB4/HS/2/16

**Subcommittee to Follow Up Issues Relating to the Three-runway System at  
the Hong Kong International Airport**

**Minutes of the fourth meeting held on  
Tuesday, 11 April 2017, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim
- Member attending** : Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
- Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH

**Public Officers  
attending**

: Agenda item II

Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Andy YAU, JP  
Head (Airport Expansion Project Coordination Office)

Airport Authority Hong Kong

Mr Wilson FUNG  
Executive Director, Corporate Development

Mr Kevin POOLE  
Executive Director, Third Runway

Mr Peter LEE  
General Manager, Environment, Third Runway

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Shirley CHAN  
Chief Council Secretary (4)5

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Bonny LOO  
Assistant Legal Adviser 4

Ms Shirley TAM  
Senior Council Secretary (4)5

Ms Lauren LI  
Council Secretary (4)5

Ms Zoe TONG  
Legislative Assistant (4)5

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes of meeting**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)771/16-17 — Minutes of meeting held on 7 February 2017)

The minutes of the meeting held on 7 February 2017 were confirmed.

**II. Meeting with the Administration and Airport Authority Hong Kong**

Environmental issues: progress of implementation of key Environmental Impact Assessment commitments

(LC Paper No. CB(4)810/16-17(01) — Airport Authority Hong Kong's paper on environmental issues: progress of implementation of key Environmental Impact Assessment commitments)

Declaration of interest

2. Mr Steven HO declared that he was a member of the Board of the Airport Authority Hong Kong ("AAHK").

Discussion

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Follow-up actions to be taken by the Administration/ Airport Authority Hong Kong

4. The Administration / AAHK was requested to provide the following information –

- (a) measures in place to control and monitor the filling materials used in the three-runway system ("3RS") reclamation;
- (b) details of the contracts signed between AAHK and its contractors regarding the filling materials used in the 3RS reclamation, including the grading and specification requirements of filling materials as well as the number of suppliers used by the contractors;

Admin/  
AAHK

Action

- (c) details of the tests conducted by AAHK on the some 800 barges of filling materials received, including the dates, barge size, test items and results of the tests;
- (d) details of the non-dredge reclamation and the seawall construction methods to be adopted by AAHK, including the measures to prevent similar incidents of extension of reclaimed land concerning the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Hong Kong Link Road Project which had also adopted the non-dredge reclamation method;
- (e) given that exceedances of suspended solids ("SS") had been recorded at the water quality monitoring stations in the past four months, the independent laboratory reports regarding the relevant tests on SS;
- (f) AAHK's findings of its investigation into the allegations made in the anonymous letter it received in March 2017 on the use of substandard filling materials in the 3RS reclamation; and
- (g) whether AAHK would consider making arrangements for members to peruse the reclamation contract signed between AAHK and its contractor regarding the supply of filling materials used in the 3RS reclamation under a confidentiality agreement.

Motion

5. Mr CHU Hoi-dick moved a motion as follows –

"由於採購機三跑填海物料與工程成本、填海質量及環境影響關係密切，本小組委員會要求機管局提供承建商所有採購及訂購海砂和機砂的數量、價格(預算總價格及每公噸單價)、供砂企業及來源地。"

(Translation)

"Given the sourcing of reclamation materials for the three-runway system project at the Hong Kong International Airport has significant bearing on the project costs, quality of reclamation and the environment, the Subcommittee requests the Airport Authority Hong Kong to provide information on the quantities and prices (estimated total price and price per tonne) of all the marine sand and mechanical sand procured and ordered by contractors, the names of the sand suppliers as well as the places of origin of the sand."

6. The Chairman ruled that the motion was directly related to the agenda item and put the motion to vote. Eight members voted for the motion. No members

Action

voted against it and four members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

**III. Any other business**

Visit

7. Members noted that a visit to the Hong Kong International Airport had been scheduled for 5 May 2017.

Date of next meeting

8. The Chairman advised that the next meeting of the Subcommittee would be held on Monday, 12 June 2017 at 2:30 pm to discuss "Hong Kong International Airport's enhancement plan" and "Airspace management in relation to the three-runway system implementation".

9. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:29 am.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
6 June 2017

**Proceedings of the fourth meeting of  
the Subcommittee to Follow Up Issues Relating to the Three-runway System at  
the Hong Kong International Airport  
on Tuesday, 11 April 2017, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<b>Agenda item I – Confirmation of minutes of meeting</b>			
000445 – 000538	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of meeting	
<b>Agenda item II – Meeting with the Administration and Airport Authority Hong Kong</b>			
000539 – 003031	Chairman Assistant Legal Adviser 4 Administration Dr KWOK Ka-ki Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Ms Tanya CHAN Airport Authority Hong Kong ("AAHK") Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Hon CHU Hoi-dick's letters dated 7 and 11 April 2017 [LC Paper Nos. CB(4)828/16-17(01) and (02)] (Chinese version only) (Restricted to members only)  Briefing by AAHK on "environmental issues: progress of implementation of key Environmental Impact Assessment commitments" with the aid of powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)832/16-17(01)]	
003032 – 003315	Chairman Administration AAHK	In response to the matters relating to the filling materials used in the three-runway system ("3RS") project as allegedly reported in the media and raised in Hon CHU Hoi-dick's letter dated 7 April 2017, AAHK advised that –  (a) AAHK took compliance of the filling materials with the requirements set out in the Environmental Permit ("EP") and the specifications in the contract very seriously;  (b) the need to use filling materials for reclamation from multiple sources had long been planned and allowable as long as the filling materials met the specifications in the contract and EP requirements; and  (c) tests had been conducted on samples from every barge of filling materials delivered. To date, samples of some 800 barges had been tested and passed the tests.	
003316 – 003810	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok AAHK	Noting the allegations relating to the filling materials used in the 3RS project made in Hon CHU Hoi-dick's letters to the Subcommittee and the anonymous letter as reported by the media, Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok sought information on AAHK's investigation into those allegations.  AAHK said that it had looked into the allegations which were considered to be unsubstantiated.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		AAHK pointed out that it was the contractors' responsibility to ensure the filling materials should comply with the specifications in the contract and the condition set out in the relevant EP. It reiterated that tests were conducted on every barge of filling materials received to ensure compliance. In view of AAHK's response, Ir Dr LO requested for written information on the measures in place to control and monitor the filling materials used in the 3RS project.	The Administration to follow up as per paragraph 4(a) of the minutes
003811 – 004427	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration AAHK	<p>Dr KWOK Ka-ki doubted if AAHK had jumped to the conclusion that the allegations were unsubstantiated, and worried that contractors might be tempted to mix the cheaper yet substandard sand with the quality one for larger profits given the higher price of marine sand. In this connection, Dr KWOK enquired about –</p> <p>(a) the Administration's role in monitoring the mitigation and enhancement measures carried out by AAHK, in particular the on-site Environmental Team ("ET") and Independent Environmental Checker ("IEC") commissioned and managed by AAHK to monitor and audit the contractors' works in connection with environmental compliance; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration's follow-up actions as regards the allegations made in Hon CHU Hoi-dick's letters and the anonymous letter.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that the Customs and Excise Department ("C&amp;ED") and Environmental Protection Department ("EPD") would follow up respectively any non-compliance, if identified, in relation to customs clearance and EP requirements as appropriate.</p> <p>Upon the enquiry from Dr KWOK on the latest estimates on the price of marine sand, AAHK advised that –</p> <p>(a) the price for filling materials was commercially sensitive and therefore could not be revealed. However, it was within the estimate; and</p> <p>(b) the cost of filling materials incurred by the reclamation contractors included, amongst others, material and transportation costs and only comprised part of the total reclamation cost.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
004428 – 005057	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai AAHK	<p>In order to gather more information on the alleged rejection of sand barges delivered to the reclamation site on 11 and 24 March 2017, Dr CHENG Chung-tai requested the customs documentation of the barges of sand delivered and the test results of the sand barges on the two dates.</p> <p>AAHK advised that no sand barges had been rejected by AAHK so far, and that mechanical sand did not require customs documentation to be delivered.</p>	The Administration to follow up as per paragraph 4(c) of the minutes
005058 – 005705	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick AAHK	<p>Mr CHU Hoi-dick criticized AAHK for ignoring the source of the sand for the reclamation works. Mr CHU recalled that at the Subcommittee meeting in December 2016, members were advised that marine sand instead of rock dust would be used for the reclamation. He also considered that the price of marine sand should presumably be higher than rock dust. In this connection, Mr CHU queried why the Administration and AAHK allowed both materials to be used in 3RS reclamation works.</p> <p>AAHK advised that it had visited and inspected the quarries where the mechanical sand came from, and that specification in the contract did not require only marine sand to be used in the reclamation works as long as the materials met the specifications in the contract and the requirements of maximum fines content stated in the relevant EP. The cost of the sand, which was commercially sensitive, was within budget.</p> <p>Mr CHU maintained that the Administration and AAHK should consider the unit price and sources of the sand and the credibility of suppliers when procuring the sand, instead of merely meeting the budget. Mr CHU urged the Administration and AAHK to improve the transparency in the process of procuring the filling materials.</p>	
005706 – 010217	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing AAHK	<p>Mr YIU Si-wing was concerned about the usage and sustainability of the Marine Ecology Enhancement Fund ("MEEF") and the Fisheries Enhancement Fund ("FEF"). He also enquired about the details of the mitigation and enhancement measures implemented by AAHK to address the environmental issues arising from the 3RS project.</p> <p>In response, AAHK advised that –</p> <p>(a) MEEF and FEF, together with a \$100 million "top-up" fund, totaled \$400 million. The MEEF and FEF were put under an endowment</p>	



Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>arrangement which was targeted to generate an annual return of 4%. To ensure stable funding support for both MEEF and FEF, any shortfall in the targeted annual return would be topped up by the \$100 million "top-up" fund; and</p> <p>(b) about \$20 billion out of the total cost of the 3RS project would be spent on environmental mitigation and enhancement measures.</p>	
010218 – 010727	Chairman Mr HUI Chi-fung AAHK	<p>Mr HUI Chi-fung was worried that the use of substandard filling materials might cause an ecology disaster to marine lives. He was of the view that the Administration should initiate an independent investigation into the allegations in respect of the filling materials. In this connection, Mr HUI enquired about details of the sand, including the price, sources, composition, transportation and the relevant control measures.</p> <p>AAHK clarified that the use of "marine sand" was not specified in the contract. The fine contents and grading of the filling materials were specified. It also advised that the price of mechanical sand was more or less the same as that of the marine sand. In reply to Mr HUI's enquiry about the possible impact if the price of sand was divulged, AAHK advised that up to six contracts which might involve the supply of sand would be affected.</p>	
010728 – 011241	Chairman Mr Steven HO AAHK	<p>Declaration of interest</p> <p>As regards the filling materials, Mr Steven HO was concerned about –</p> <p>(a) the relevant procurement and testing criteria;</p> <p>(b) the procedures in receiving the sand barges; and</p> <p>(c) the work of water quality monitoring in the areas concerned.</p> <p>AAHK replied that –</p> <p>(a) a sample from each barge would be tested for compliance with the EP requirement and specification in the contract;</p> <p>(b) concentration of suspended solids ("SS") recorded by the water quality monitoring programme would be examined to determine the water quality impacts associated with marine filling activities; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) AAHK would see if the sample-taking method for the barge test might possibly be enhanced.	
011242 – 011811	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN AAHK	<p>Ms Tanya CHAN requested the following information –</p> <p>(a) details of the contracts signed between AAHK and its contractors regarding the filling materials used in the 3RS reclamation, including the grading and specification requirements of filling materials as well as the number of suppliers used by the contractors;</p> <p>(b) details of the tests conducted by AAHK on the some 800 barges of filling materials received, including the dates, barge size, test items and results of the tests; and</p> <p>(c) details of the non-dredge reclamation and the seawall construction methods to be adopted by AAHK, including the measures to prevent similar incidents of extension of reclaimed land concerning the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Hong Kong Link Road Project which had also adopted the non-dredge reclamation method.</p> <p>Upon the enquiry of Ms CHAN, AAHK confirmed that temporary works reclamation was not required as regards the reclamation works of 3RS.</p>	The Administration to follow up as per paragraphs 4(b), (c) and (d) of the minutes
011812 – 012548	Chairman Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung sought information on the Administration's investigation into the allegations made in the anonymous letter, and its monitoring work over the relevant investigation conducted by AAHK.</p> <p>The Administration advised that while it was the contractual responsibility of AAHK and its contractors as regards the requirements of the sand, C&amp;ED and EPD would follow up respectively any non-compliance in relation to customs clearance and EP requirements as appropriate. The corresponding law enforcement agency would also take action if any criminal acts were suspected.</p>	
012550 – 013247	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung AAHK Administration	Upon the enquiry of Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, AAHK advised that the reclamation works commenced in mid-November 2016, and that it had long been expected the filling materials to be used would not be confined to marine sand and that mechanical sand would be needed.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
013248 – 013811	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim AAHK	<p>Given that exceedances of SS had been recorded at the water quality monitoring stations in the past four months, Dr YIU Chung-yim enquired about the relevant follow-up actions taken by the Administration and AAHK, and requested for the independent laboratory reports regarding the relevant tests on SS.</p> <p>In response, AAHK advised that ET and IEC would look into every occasion of the exceedances. The reclamation works contractors would be alerted for proper implementation of the required mitigation measures for compliance even if the exceedance was found to have no direct relations with the works concerned.</p> <p>To understand better whether there was significant change in water quality around the reclamation site in March 2017, Dr YIU requested the relevant SS data in March. In response, AAHK advised that the SS level recorded in February and March 2017 did not differ significantly, and that the relevant monthly Environmental Monitoring and Audit Report would be uploaded to the dedicated website.</p>	The Administration to follow up as per paragraph 4(e) of the minutes
013812 – 014316	Chairman Deputy Chairman AAHK	<p>In response to the Deputy Chairman's request for the report on AAHK's investigation into the allegations made in the anonymous letter, AAHK advised that such report was not available as no formal investigation was conducted for the anonymous allegations. AAHK, however, did look into the allegations and a summary of the finding could be provided to the Subcommittee.</p> <p>Upon the enquiry of the Deputy Chairman, AAHK advised that the waters around Southwest and West Lantau were found to be used by Chinese White Dolphins ("CWDs") more in 2016 than in the past. So far, there was only one occasion whereby a particular marine construction activity had to be suspended for 30 minutes due to the spotting of CWD in the dolphin exclusion zone with a 250-metre radius from the concerned marine construction activity.</p>	The Administration to follow up as per paragraph 4(f) of the minutes
014317 – 014645	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW AAHK	To address members' concern about the allegations regarding filling materials made in the anonymous letter, Mr Holden CHOW requested information on the results of tests conducted on the barges of filling materials received on 11 and 24 March 2017.	The Administration to follow up as per paragraph 4(c) of the minutes

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
014646 – 015248	Chairman Mr LUK Chung-hung AAHK	Mr LUK Chung-hung was concerned about –  (a) the supply of marine sand in future, given the more stringent regulation of such supply in the Mainland; and  (b) the availability of any supporting facilities for CWD abundance in the waters around Southwest and West Lantau.  In response, AAHK –  (a) expressed confidence in the future supply of filling materials for the 3RS reclamation works; and  (b) advised that the waters around Southwest and West Lantau were relatively less developed hence human impact on CWDs was minimal.	
<b>Agenda item III – Any other business</b>			
015249 – 015409	Chairman	Visit  Date of next meeting	
015410 – 015529	Chairman Deputy Chairman	The Deputy Chairman suggested AAHK should consider making arrangements for members to peruse the reclamation contract signed between AAHK and its contractor regarding the supply of filling materials used in the 3RS reclamation under a confidentiality agreement.	The Administration to follow up as per paragraph 4(g) of the minutes
015530 – 020014	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Mr LUK Chung-hung Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung	Motion	