

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1599/16-17
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/HS/2/16

**Subcommittee to Follow Up Issues Relating to the Three-runway System at
the Hong Kong International Airport**

**Minutes of the sixth meeting held on
Monday, 10 July 2017, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** :
- Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP (Chairman)
 - Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho (Deputy Chairman)
 - Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
 - Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
 - Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP
 - Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
 - Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
 - Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
 - Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
 - Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
 - Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
 - Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
 - Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
 - Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
 - Hon CHU Hoi-dick
 - Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
 - Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
 - Hon Tanya CHAN
 - Hon HUI Chi-fung
 - Hon LUK Chung-hung
 - Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
 - Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim
- Member attending** : Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Members absent : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public Officers attending : Agenda item II

Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Frank CHAN, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mr Wallace LAU, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 4

Mr Andy YAU, JP
Head (Airport Expansion Project Coordination Office)

Civil Aviation Department

Mr Kevin CHOI, JP
Deputy Director-General of Civil Aviation (2)

Mr Raymond LI
Acting Deputy Director-General of Civil Aviation (1)

Mr Samuel NG
Senior Evaluation Officer (1)

Clerk in attendance : Ms Shirley CHAN
Chief Council Secretary (4)5

Staff in attendance : Ms Shirley TAM
Senior Council Secretary (4)5

Ms Lauren LI
Council Secretary (4)5

Ms Zoe TONG
Legislative Assistant (4)5

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes of meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1345/16-17 — Minutes of meeting held on 12 June 2017)

The minutes of the meeting held on 12 June 2017 were confirmed.

II. Airspace management in relation to the three-runway system implementation

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1185/16-17(02) — Administration's paper on the latest development of airspace management issues in relation to the three-runway system

LC Paper No. CB(4)1202/16-17(01) — Letter from Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho dated 8 June 2017 on issues relating to airspace management in relation to the three-runway system implementation (Chinese version only) and the Administration's response)
and
LC Paper No. CB(4)1343/16-17(01)

Declaration of interest

2. Mr Jeffrey LAM declared that he was a member of the Board of the Airport Authority Hong Kong.

Discussion

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

(At 5:28 pm, the Chairman left the meeting and the Deputy Chairman took the chair.)

Action

III. Any other business

Date of next meeting

4. The Deputy Chairman informed members that the next meeting of the Subcommittee would be held on Friday, 29 September 2017 at 10:45 am to discuss the detailed funding plan for the three-runway system.

Application for extension of the Subcommittee's period of work

5. The Deputy Chairman proposed to submit an application to the House Committee for extending the period of work of the Subcommittee, which would be due in November 2017.

6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:10 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
20 September 2017

**Proceedings of the sixth meeting of
the Subcommittee to Follow Up Issues Relating to the Three-runway System at
the Hong Kong International Airport
on Monday, 10 July 2017, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
Agenda item I – Confirmation of minutes of meeting			
000431 – 000709	Chairman	Opening remarks Confirmation of minutes of meeting	
Agenda item II – Meeting with the Administration			
000710 – 002439	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration on airspace management in relation to the three-runway system ("3RS") implementation with the aid of powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)1385/16-17(01)]	
002440 – 003158	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration	<p>Noting that the 1992 New Airport Master Plan ("1992 NAMP") estimated that the two-runway system ("2RS") at the Hong Kong International Airport ("HKIA") could handle a theoretical maximum of 86 air traffic movements ("ATMs") per hour, and that a target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour was to be achieved progressively under the 3RS operation at HKIA, Dr Kwok Ka-ki enquired about the timetable to achieve the abovementioned runway capacities. Dr KWOK questioned if the "air wall" problem, which referred to the current arrangement that an aircraft departing from Hong Kong must reach an altitude of over 15 700 feet before it could enter the Mainland airspace, was a cause that HKIA was not able to achieve the runway capacity of 86 ATMs per hour.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the consultancy study commissioned by the Civil Aviation Department ("CAD") in 1994 had confirmed that the maximum capacity under the 2RS operation at HKIA was 63 ATMs per hour, taking into account the surrounding terrain of HKIA. Another consultancy study commissioned by the Airport Authority Hong Kong ("AAHK") in 2008 revised the figure to 68 ATMs per hour, which had already been achieved considering the technologies and practices available at the time of study. Taking into account new air traffic management planning tactics and technologies, the Administration was working closely with AAHK to study various means to further marginally raise the runway capacity of 2RS. 3RS provided the basis for gradually achieving the ultimate target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour at HKIA.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Dr Kwok urged the Administration to disclose the full contents of the "Pearl River Delta Region Air Traffic Management Planning and Implementation Plan (Version 2.0)" ("the 2007 Plan") which was drawn up by the Tripartite Working Group ("TWG") in 2007. TWG was established jointly by the Civil Aviation Administration of China ("CAAC"), CAD of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region and the Civil Aviation Authority of the Macao Special Administrative Region in 2004. In response, the Administration advised that the 2007 Plan was a government-to-government agreement among the Mainland, Hong Kong and Macao, the full contents of which were to be kept confidential.</p>	
003159 – 003804	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing Administration	<p>Mr YIU Si-wing was concerned about the problem of flight delays at HKIA and urged the Administration to devise measures to improve the situation in parallel with the construction of 3RS.</p> <p>The Administration advised that priority had been accorded to improving the on-time performance of flights among the work of TWG. Flight delays, in particular flights leaving for the Mainland, had increased in the past year due to a number of factors including adverse weather, airspace constraints, heavy air traffic demand, aircraft technical issues and air traffic flow management ("ATFM") measures being in force in the Mainland, etc., many of which were beyond control of CAD. In the first six months of 2017, 2 420 flight delays were recorded at HKIA out of the 103 795 departing flights. The ATFM measures in the Mainland had been in force for 262 times during the period.</p>	
003805 – 004411	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim Administration	<p>Dr YIU Chung-yim expressed concern about the safety issues arising from the use of airport collaborative decision making platform within the Pearl River Delta ("PRD") airspace. He enquired about –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the detailed decision-making process under such an arrangement, in particular the party responsible for making the final decisions; and (b) the air traffic management arrangement to be adopted to achieve the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour. <p>In response, the Administration advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) relevant civil aviation authorities would still be responsible for the decision-making of their 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>respective Flight Information Regions ("FIRs") despite the use of airport collaborative decision making platforms;</p> <p>(b) the 2007 Plan had touched upon joint airspace planning as well as "delegation of airspace", which was an air traffic management arrangement endorsed by the International Civil Aviation Organization ("ICAO") and meant a certain degree of "shared use" in airspace between Hong Kong and the Mainland which might be adopted to facilitate the achievement of the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour under the 3RS operation at HKIA in the long term. This arrangement would not be in breach of Article 130 of the Basic Law ("BL130"); and</p> <p>(c) CAD would ensure aviation safety by observing the relevant requirements set out by ICAO.</p>	
004412 – 005138	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>Upon the enquiry of the Deputy Chairman, the Administration advised that –</p> <p>(a) there was no need to adjust the FIR boundary between Hong Kong and the Mainland as a result of implementing the 2007 Plan; and</p> <p>(b) the High Court judgment in March 2016 on the applications for leave to apply for judicial review seeking to challenge the legality of, among other things, the principle of "shared use of airspace" under the 2007 Plan affirmed that the "delegation of airspace" arrangement would not violate BL130.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman noted that nearly 20% of departing flights used the northbound flight route for entering the Mainland airspace. The "air wall" constraint meant that these flights would have to reach 15 700 feet before they were allowed to enter the Mainland airspace. Since these flights had to climb to the designated altitude by flying in circles within the Hong Kong airspace instead of entering the Mainland airspace right after airborne, the Deputy Chairman considered it environmentally unfriendly as more fuel would have to be consumed during the course. In this connection, he urged the Administration to solve the "air wall" problem expeditiously.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman expressed concern that the problem of flight delays at HKIA might affect the air cargo business, especially express delivery services, of Hong Kong.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005139 – 005744	Chairman Mr LUK Chung-hung Administration	<p>Mr LUK Chung-hung enquired about –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the utilization of the capacity of the present 2RS; (b) whether the "air wall" problem had prevented the present 2RS from fully utilizing its runway capacity; and (c) the communication with the Mainland air force as regards airspace management. <p>In response, the Administration advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the runway capacity of 2RS was already very close to saturation, i.e. handling 68 ATMs per hour, or 420 000 flights per year. Through the application of new air traffic management planning tactics and technologies, the runway capacity could probably be raised slightly for around 5% under the 2RS operation at HKIA; (b) the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour was planned to be achieved progressively after the commissioning of 3RS at HKIA in 2024, though it was not envisaged that the traffic demand would require such a capacity immediately upon 3RS commissioning; and (c) CAD would be responsible for matters relating to airspace planning and design within the Hong Kong FIR. If coordination with the People's Liberation Army Air Force is required, it would be done through CAAC. 	
005745 – 010445	Chairman Deputy Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration	<p>Ms Tanya CHAN enquired –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether the 2007 Plan had taken account of the projected air traffic condition of HKIA after completion of 3RS; and (b) about the timetable to achieve the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour progressively under the 3RS operation at HKIA. <p>The Administration replied that the 2007 Plan had taken into account the operational need for 3RS of HKIA, as well as the planned development of the five key airports, including HKIA, in the PRD region. Back in 2007, 3RS was planned to be completed in 2020 with a long-term target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour. Since the estimated completion time of 3RS had been revised to 2024, the target runway capacity was expected to be achieved progressively after 2024.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Ms CHAN queried if the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour under the 3RS operation could finally be achieved, given that the maximum runway capacity of 86 ATMs per hour as mentioned in the 1992 NAMP was not achieved.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the estimation in the 1992 NAMP had not taken into account the surrounding terrain of HKIA and the figure had been revised to 68 ATMs per hour in 2008 with due consideration to the factor. The target maximum capacity of 102 ATMs per hour under the 3RS operation at HKIA was devised based on the assumptions of the current maximum capacity of 68 ATMs per hour under the 2RS operation. The Administration was confident that such a target could be achieved progressively.</p>	
010446 – 011211	Deputy Chairman Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Administration	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung raised concern about the aircraft noise, in particular the noise generated at night by aircraft flying in circles due to the "air wall" constraint, suffered by residents. In this connection, he enquired if the airspace enhancement measures being put in place could or if any other measures would be devised to mitigate the noise impact on residents.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that –</p> <p>(a) aircraft noise levels would be continuously monitored by assessments with regard to the noise exposure forecast 25 contour. It was also stated in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report that demand for night flights would be managed at HKIA to ensure that the noise contour in the remaining years of 2RS operation would not expand to any new noise sensitive receivers; and</p> <p>(b) various measures had been devised to mitigate the aircraft noise impact on the residents concerned. For example, AAHK had introduced a Quota Count Pilot Scheme with a view to encouraging airlines to use quieter aircraft types. Besides, aircraft departing to the northeast of HKIA between 11 pm and 7 am were required to use the southbound route via the West Lamma Channel to avoid overflying populated areas, and that the existing South Runway would mainly be put on standby mode at night after the commissioning of 3RS to minimize the noise disturbance to residents nearby.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
011212 – 011834	Deputy Chairman Mr Jeffrey LAM Administration	<p>Declaration of interest</p> <p>Noting that aircraft departing to the northeast of HKIA between 11 pm and 7 am were required to take an alternative flight path to avoid overflying populated areas, Mr Jeffrey LAM suggested that CAD and AAHK should consider letting quieter aircraft take up the take-off/landing slots of the original flight path so as to increase the runway capacity of HKIA.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that AAHK had put in place a Quota Count Pilot Scheme to encourage airlines to use quieter aircraft types in exchange for more take-off/landing slots. CAD might consider expanding the prohibition on the use of noisier aircraft types in future if necessary.</p>	
011835 – 012513	Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>Pointing out that the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour could only be achieved if the "air wall" problem could be resolved, the Deputy Chairman asked if the Administration had estimated the drop in the maximum runway capacity upon the commissioning of 3RS at HKIA in the event that the problem could not be solved by then. The Deputy Chairman also expressed concern that residents in Tung Chung and Ma Wan might have to endure more aircraft noise with the increase in the number of ATMs upon 3RS commissioning.</p> <p>The Administration replied that –</p> <p>(a) it was confident that the ultimate target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour under the 3RS operation at HKIA could be achieved progressively. The Administration took note of the situation put forward by the Deputy Chairman and would take appropriate follow up actions; and</p> <p>(b) the Mainland, Hong Kong and Macao would continue to work together through TWG for harmonizing the air traffic management arrangements in the PRD region. This would form the basis for increasing the runway capacity of 3RS at HKIA progressively to the ultimate target of 102 ATMs per hour.</p>	
012514 – 013206	Deputy Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim Administration	<p>Noting the example of shared use of airspace between Malaysia and Singapore demonstrated by the Administration, Dr YIU Chung-yim sought similar information, such as a 3-D illustration, regarding the planned "delegation of airspace" arrangement</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>between Hong Kong and the Mainland. He also enquired about the locations where the two air traffic control ("ATC") units concerned would hand over the control of an aircraft under the "delegation of airspace" arrangement.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the detailed information regarding the "delegation of airspace" arrangement would be made available to users before implementation. In line with other aeronautical information, the release of such information would be in accordance with the relevant ICAO requirements. It added that air traffic management efficiency would be a factor of consideration when ATC units decided where the control of an aircraft should be handed over.</p>	
013207 – 013916	Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>The Deputy Chairman doubted whether the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour could finally be achieved under the 3RS operation at HKIA if the "air wall" problem was not solved. He reiterated the need for the Administration to gain an understanding about the impact of the problem on the runway capacity. In this connection, he urged the Administration to consider commissioning a consultancy study on the matter. The Administration agreed to consider the Deputy Chairman's proposal but advised that it might not be able to release the results arising from the study considering its sensitivity.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman urged the Administration to make public the milestones for achieving the target runway capacity of 102 ATMs per hour. He also urged the Administration to discuss with its counterparts in TWG regarding the disclosure of the contents of the 2007 Plan.</p>	
Agenda item III – Any other business			
013917 – 014051	Deputy Chairman	<p>Date of next meeting</p> <p>Application for extension of the Subcommittee's period of work</p>	