立法會 Legislative Council

Ref: CB2/HS/2/16 <u>LC Paper No. CB(2)660/16-17</u>

(These minutes have been seen

by the Administration)

Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday, 23 November 2016, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)

present Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon Claudia MO

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

Hon KWOK Wai-keung

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Hon IP Kin-yuen

Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Hon CHU Hoi-dick

Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding

Hon SHIU Ka-fai Hon SHIU Ka-chun Hon CHAN Chun-ying

Member attending

:

Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang

Member

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

absent

Public Officers: Mr Kevin YEUNG Yun-hung attending Under Secretary for Education

Ms Jessie WONG Hok-ling Deputy Secretary for Education (2)

Mr Sheridan LEE Sha-lun

Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum Development)

Education Bureau

Ms IP Ling-bik

Principal Assistant Secretary (Education Commission and Planning)
Education Bureau

Mr WOO Chun-sing

Principal Assistant Secretary (Kindergarten Education)

Education Bureau

Clerk in : Miss Cindy HO

attendance Senior Council Secretary (2) 3

Staff in : Miss Karen LAI

attendance Council Secretary (2) 3

Mrs Fonny TSANG

Legislative Assistant (2) 3

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes of meeting

[LC Paper No. CB(2)212/16-17]

The minutes of the meeting held on 2 November 2016 were confirmed.

II. Application for late membership

[LC Paper No. CB(2)245/16-17(01)]

2. <u>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan</u> proposed that the Subcommittee should defer consideration of Mr Dennis KWOK's application to the next meeting as Mr KWOK was not present when the item was discussed. <u>Members</u> agreed.

- 3 -

III. Education for children of ethnic minorities ("EM") – implementation progress of the "Chinese language as the second language" curriculum, placement of EM students and support measures to these students and to schools admitting them

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)208/16-17(01) to (02) and CB(2)211/16-17(01)]

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Follow-up actions required of the Administration

Admin 4. <u>The Administration</u> was requested to provide:

- (a) the number of non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students enrolled in the programmes offered by the Vocational Training Council ("VTC") and the support services provided by VTC to NCS students;
- (b) the number of candidates (including NCS students) sitting for examinations of other recognized alternative Chinese language qualifications;
- (c) the number of teachers who had attended the five-week full-time "Certificate in Professional Development Programme on the Teaching of Chinese Language for NCS Students" course run by the Education University of Hong Kong ("EdUHK");
- (d) the demographic characteristics of EM children in Hong Kong with relevant breakdown (including ethnicity, place of birth and years of residence in Hong Kong);
- (e) information on relevant courses/studies conducted by EdUHK on enhancing teachers' capability of teaching Chinese as a second language; and
- (f) the number of briefing sessions and on-site school visits conducted for parents of NCS students regarding school admission.

(<u>Post-meeting note</u>: The Administration's written response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)338/16-17(01) on 8 December 2016.)

Admin 5. <u>The Administration</u> undertook to study the performance of NCS students in Chinese language in schools with breakdown by mainstream public sector schools and schools traditionally admitting more NCS students in future review of the effectiveness of various support measures for NCS students.

- 4 -

<u>The Administration</u> was requested to consider providing additional guidelines to kindergartens regarding the admission procedures and putting in place monitoring measures to ensure compliance with relevant guidelines where appropriate. <u>The Administration</u> was also requested to consider adopting additional parameters in assessing the performance of kindergartens as well as providing English version of the Quality Review reports of kindergartens.

IV. Any other business

[LC Paper No. CB(2)201/16-17(01)]

- 6. <u>The Subcommittee</u> agreed to invite deputations to give views on issues relating to education for children of ethnic minorities at the next meeting on 12 December 2016.
- 7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:37 am.

Council Business Division 2 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 19 January 2017

Proceedings of the meeting of the Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities on Wednesday, 23 November 2016, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required	
Agenda item I - Confirmation of minutes of meeting				
000321 - 000349	Chairman	The minutes of the last meeting were confirmed.		
Agenda ite	em II - Application for late	membership		
000350 - 000659	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	The Chairman invited members' views regarding the application for late membership by Mr Dennis KWOK. At the request of Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, members agreed to defer consideration of Mr KWOK's application to the next meeting.		
language d		ildren of ethnic minorities ("EM") – implementation progress of urriculum, placement of EM students and support measures to these		
000700 - 001449	Chairman Administration	Opening remarks Members noted the submission from the Equal Opportunities Commission ("EOC") [LC Paper No. CB(2)254/16-17(02)] and the Administration's reply letter in response to the submission from Hong Kong Unison Limited [LC Paper No. CB(2)254/16-17(01)], which were tabled at the meeting. Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(2)208/16-17(01)]		
001450 - 002220	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration	The Deputy Chairman enquired whether the Administration would consider setting up a new support service centre to provide after-school Chinese language remedial classes for non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") children. The Administration advised that after-school support was provided by individual schools for their NCS students as appropriate with additional funding provided by the Education Bureau ("EDB"). Besides, remedial programmes after school for NCS students were also offered through the Chinese Language Learning Support Centres operated by the University of Hong Kong commissioned by EDB, which were operating at 22 venues in the 2015-2016 school year. Referring to paragraphs 7 and 8 of the Administration's paper, the Deputy Chairman enquired whether the Administration had reviewed the effectiveness of the implementation of the		

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		"Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" ("Learning Framework") and related assessment tools on enhancing the Chinese proficiency of NCS students. The Administration explained that with the implementation of the Learning Framework starting from the 2014-2015 school year, EDB had been organizing complementary support measures to facilitate schools' implementation of the Learning Framework, which included among others, enhancement to teachers' professional development in teaching Chinese as a second language for Chinese language teachers, and developing assessment tools as well as learning/teaching materials. While EDB had informed publishers to develop textbooks by making reference to the Learning Framework and submit textbooks for review following the current procedures, EDB had yet to receive any such applications. Nonetheless, EDB had produced a series of Chinese as a Second Language Learning Packages in the form of textbooks, which had been delivered to schools for teachers' reference. The Administration pointed out that as it would take time for the Learning Framework to take root for sustainable effect and in the meantime, EDB would collate quantitative and qualitative data on the progress of NCS students under the Learning Framework for further analysis according to the research framework drawn up for this purpose. In response to the Deputy Chairman's enquiry about the funding support to schools admitting less than 10 NCS students, the Administration advised that notwithstanding that these students could benefit from an immersed Chinese language environment of the school, from the 2014-2015 school year these schools might have an additional funding of \$50,000 per year on a need basis to offer after-school Chinese language support programmes to help their NCS students consolidate what they had learnt in classes in light of their needs.	
002221 - 002748	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping Administration	At the request of Mr POON Siu-ping, the Administration undertook to provide information on: (a) the number of NCS students enrolled in the programmes offered by the Vocational Training Council ("VTC") and the support services provided by VTC to NCS students; and (b) the number of candidates (including NCS students) sitting for examinations of other recognized alternative Chinese language qualifications.	Admin (paragraph 4 of minutes)

Time	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action
marker 002749 - 003407	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW Administration	Mr Holden CHOW declared that he was a member of EOC. He expressed concern about the support for Chinese language teachers to teach NCS students in the implementation of the Learning Framework as set out in the EOC's submission, and stressed that teachers had been made responsible for adapting teaching materials for their NCS students but there were insufficient guidelines and reference materials for them. The Administration advised that EDB had been organizing diversified and progressively advanced professional development programmes for teachers to help schools implement the Learning Framework and enhance teachers' professional capability of teaching Chinese as a second language. Besides, EDB had also commissioned the Education University of Hong Kong ("EdUHK") to organize a five-week full-time "Certificate in Professional Development Programme on the Teaching of Chinese Language for Non-Chinese Speaking Students" course. Furthermore, topical seminars and workshops were organized regularly for teachers teaching NCS students for experience sharing in this regard. In response to Mr CHOW's enquiry about the number of teachers who had attended the above-mentioned five-week course run by EdUHK, the Administration undertook to provide the information for members' reference. Noting that there were more NCS candidates who had got admitted to University Grants Committee ("UGC")-funded institutions with the alternative Chinese language qualifications, Mr CHOW suggested that the Administration should step up publicity to encourage NCS students to attain other recognized alternative Chinese language qualifications apart from the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education ("HKDSE") Examination for such purpose. The Administration highlighted the diverse views on the issue, and some considered that the alternative Chinese qualifications might confine the opportunities of NCS students for improving their Chinese proficiency. The Administration advised that publicity on alternative Chinese language qualifications and related p	Admin (paragraph 4 of minutes)
003408 - 004129	Chairman Mr Andrew WAN Administration	Mr Andrew WAN urged the Administration to address the specific learning needs of NCS children who were born outside Hong Kong against those who were locally born. He pointed out that while many NCS students could communicate fluently in Chinese verbally, they encountered	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
marker		considerable difficulty in learning the Chinese language at schools, especially those who did not have an early start in learning Chinese. He called on the Administration to develop multiple pathways to cater for the diverse needs of NCS students in learning the Chinese language. The Administration emphasized that the Learning Framework provided a systematic set of objectives and expected learning outcomes that described the learning progress of NCS students at different learning stages. This was to support teachers to set progressive learning targets, learning progress and expected learning outcomes to enhance the learning effectiveness of NCS students. In tandem, EDB provided the Applied Learning Chinese (for NCS Students) ("ApL(C)") starting from the 2014-2015 school year to provide an additional channel for NCS students to acquire an alternative Chinese qualification to facilitate further studies and career pursuits. In response to Mr WAN's enquiry, the Administration advised that in the 2015-2016 school year, there were about 12 000 NCS students studying at kindergartens ("KGs"). Mr WAN wondered about the effectiveness of the diversified intensive learning and teaching modes by the schools concerned under the Learning Framework in the absence of	required
004130 - 005826	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan Mr IP Kin-yuen Administration	guidelines and called for a more systematic approach towards teaching and learning of the Chinese language for NCS students. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan welcomed the various support measures put in place in recent years by the Administration to facilitate NCS students' early adaptation to the local education system and mastery of the Chinese language. She requested the Administration to study the performance in Chinese language of NCS students studying at mainstream public sector schools vis-à-vis those studying at schools traditionally admitting more NCS students. She was particularly concerned that NCS students studying at schools traditionally admitting more NCS students might lack the opportunities to have exposure to an immersed Chinese language environment in schools and at home. The Administration undertook to consider Dr CHIANG's views in future review of the effectiveness of various support measures for NCS students. Dr CHIANG suggested that consideration should be given to designate one single division within EDB to provide education support for NCS students. Mr IP Kin-yuen expressed similar view and further suggested that relevant stakeholders should be involved in formulating policies related to EM education. The Administration advised that	Admin (paragraph 5 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
market		the education support for NCS students' learning of the Chinese language straddled across curriculum, teachers' professional development and professional support, provision of additional funding for schools, etc. To ensure targeted and appropriate support, relevant divisions of EDB should take up the tasks which called for the corresponding expertise as required. A dedicated team had been set up in EDB since the 2014-2015 school year to monitor schools' use of the additional funding for implementation of the Learning Framework to ensure optimal use of the funding by the schools concerned.	required
		Mr IP Kin-yuen requested the Administration to provide information on the demographic characteristics of EM children with relevant breakdown (including ethnicity, place of birth and years of residence in Hong Kong) to facilitate policy planning to meet the future education needs of EM children. The Administration advised that while EDB did not collate information on the place of birth of NCS students and parents concerned, they could dig out relevant data from the population census for members' reference.	Admin (paragraph 4 of minutes)
		views on issues relating to education for EM children.	
005827 - 010639	Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG Administration Chairman	Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed concern that the Administration had not provided adequate information to assist EM parents in their choice of schools under the Primary One Admission ("POA") System. Referring to paragraph 15 of the submission from Hong Kong Unison Limited [LC Paper No. CB(2)211/16-17(01)], Dr CHEUNG said that the POA application form might be misleading as EM parents would refer to the list of schools in Appendix 3 to the POA application form which were former "designated schools". It was considered that such arrangement might lead to the relatively high concentration of NCS students in these schools which was not conducive to their learning of Chinese language.	
		Regarding admission to schools, the Administration advised that having due consideration to the worries and needs of some NCS students, stakeholders in general agreed with the flexible arrangement adopted since 2005 (i.e. for admission to primary one in the 2005-2006 school year). Under the arrangement, NCS children joining POA might indicate in the application form that "they cannot use Chinese as the learning medium" and in turn they were allowed to choose from eight primary schools traditionally admitting more NCS students in other school nets in addition to schools in their residing school net for the Central Allocation. In tandem, EDB had	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		strongly appealed to parents of NCS students, through the Notes to Parents for POA, for sending their children to schools with an immersed Chinese language environment to facilitate their mastery of the Chinese language. The Notes had been translated into major EM languages for reference by parents of NCS students.	•
010640 - 011524	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	Ms Claudia MO urged the Administration to address the difficulties encountered by teachers in developing teaching materials for their NCS students as detailed in paragraph 6 of the EOC's submission. She was very concerned that some teachers had simply taught secondary school EM students using the Chinese teaching materials for Primary Two students. She considered that the Learning Framework fell short of a Chinese curriculum for second language learners. The Administration advised that EDB had produced a series of Chinese as a Second Language Learning Packages in the form of textbooks, which covered the primary and secondary curricula. The packages had been delivered to schools and students. Schools could either use the complete set of textbooks or adapt them into school-based learning materials to meet the school-based situation.	
011525 - 012147	Chairman Dr Junius HO Administration	Noting that 30.6% of the 1 046 NCS students taking the HKDSE Examination in 2016 had met the general entrance requirements of UGC-funded undergraduate programmes and that the number of NCS students receiving the offers for admission through the Joint University Programmes Admissions System ("JUPAS") had increased from 17.5% (i.e. 145) in 2015 to 21.4% (i.e. 224) in 2016, Dr Junius HO considered that the various support measures for NCS students had helped facilitate their effective learning of the Chinese language. In response to Dr HO's enquiry on the way forward of the Administration's policy on education for EM children, the Administration summed up that EDB would continue with the implementation of the Learning Framework and various	
		implementation of the Learning Framework and various support measures, as well as the arrangements for recognized Chinese language qualifications to facilitate NCS students' further studies and career pursuits under the multiple pathways.	
012148 - 012723	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-chun Administration	Noting that NCS students at senior secondary levels might choose to sit for the HKDSE Examination and/or attain other internationally recognized alternative Chinese qualifications, Mr SHIU Ka-chun expressed concern that EM parents had not been provided with adequate information on the aforementioned public examinations. In his view, the level	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
marker		of the General Certificate of Secondary Education ("GCSE") (Chinese) was yet too low as similar to primary two level of the local Chinese curriculum. The Administration explained that the purpose of the alternative Chinese language examinations such as GCSE was to help NCS students meet the general entrance requirements for admission to UGC-funded institutions by acquiring the necessary Chinese language qualifications which would better tie in with their language abilities. At the request of Mr SHIU, the Administration agreed to provide information on the number of NCS students sitting for examinations of other recognized alternative Chinese language qualifications, including GCSE, International General Certificate of Secondary Education and General Certificate in Education.	Admin (paragraph 4 of minutes)
		In response to Mr SHIU's enquiry, the Administration informed members that ApL(C) courses pegged at Qualifications Framework Levels 1 to 3 had been provided at the senior secondary levels starting from the 2014-2015 school year and were recognized by UGC-funded institutions and the Civil Service Bureau for further studies and employment. In this regard, students attaining the results of "Attained" and "Attained with Distinction" in the ApL(C) courses were recognized as attaining the competencies required at Level 2 and Level 3 in the HKDSE Examination respectively. The Administration added that the possibility of having an additional attainment level comparable to Level 4 in the HKDSE Examination would be explored.	
012724 - 013240	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed concern about the measures to enhance teachers' capability of teaching Chinese as a second language, and enquired whether EdUHK had conducted relevant courses/studies in this area. The Administration agreed to obtain relevant information from EdUHK for members' reference.	Admin (paragraph 4 of minutes)
013241 - 014544	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Administration	Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired about the number of EM students studying at KGs. The Administration advised that of the 12 000 NCS students studying at KGs, about 4 900 were studying at KGs under the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme who were expected to continue their study in public sector primary schools. Expressing concern that individual KGs had refused some parents' requests for admitting EM students due to language barrier, Mr CHU and the Chairman requested the Administration to take measures to tackle the problem. The	
		barrier, Mr CHU and the Chairman requested the	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		According to the guidelines on KG admission arrangements issued by EDB, KGs were required to arrange interpretation and/or translation service for applicants as appropriate. EDB had also advised schools (including KGs) through different channels (including school circulars and briefing sessions) that their school-based admission mechanism should be fair, just and open.	
		In response to Mr CHU's enquiry, the Administration advised that with the implementation of the free quality KG education policy starting from the 2017-2018 school year, a grant comparable to the salary of one KG teacher would be provided to KGs admitting eight or more NCS students for supporting NCS students. With the additional resources, KGs could strengthen manpower support and professional training for teachers and develop effective strategies to help NCS students.	
		The Chairman requested the Administration to address members' concern about the learning and teaching modes under the Learning Framework. The Administration explained that the Learning Framework was developed from the perspective of second language learners and a "small-step" learning approach with progressive learning targets was adopted. To facilitate implementation of the Learning Framework, schools admitting 10 or more NCS students were provided with the enhanced funding ranging from \$800,000 to \$1,500,000 per year depending on the number of NCS students to adopt diversified intensive learning and teaching modes as appropriate such as pull-out teaching, split-class/group learning, after-school consolidation, etc. with a view to helping NCS students bridge over to mainstream Chinese language classes as early as possible. On the other hand, different activities, such as lesson tryouts and experience sharing, etc. were organized to facilitate teachers' mastery of the learning and teaching strategies as appropriate.	
014545 - 014946	Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG Administration Chairman	Dr Fernando CHEUNG suggested that the Administration should further assist parents of NCS students to learn more about the mainstream schools by enriching the contents of the School Profiles to help parents grasp more information about the schools (including the percentage of their teachers equipped with the training on teaching NCS students and their school-based support measures). He suggested that EDB should set up a designated webpage and a hotline for EM parents to make enquiries on issues related to school admission.	
		The Administration informed members that dedicated phone numbers for enquiries on admission to Primary One under	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		POA and a designated webpage on support services for NCS students had been set up. Besides, dedicated briefing sessions were conducted for parents of NCS students during the course of POA every year. At the request of Dr CHEUNG, the Administration agreed to provide information on the number of briefing sessions conducted for parents of NCS students. (Extension of meeting)	Admin (paragraph 4 of minutes)
014947 - 015351	Chairman Mr IP Kin-yuen Administration	Mr IP Kin-yuen reiterated his request for setting up a dedicated division by EDB to provide support services for NCS students, similar to the arrangement for the newly arrived children support service under the School Administration Division of EDB. He also urged the Administration to take on board EOC's suggestion that EDB should undertake the development and publishing of appropriate teaching materials for NCS students as detailed in paragraph 6(c) of EOC's submission. In response to Mr IP's enquiry, the Administration informed members that in the 2015-2016 school year, there were about 12 000 NCS students at KG levels (accounting for about 6.5% of the total student population of KGs). As regards NCS students studying in public sector and Direct Subsidy Scheme secondary and primary schools, there were about 8 800 and 8 900 NCS students respectively.	
015352 - 020008	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-chun Administration Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Mr SHIU Ka-chun suggested that the Administration should put in place monitoring measures to ensure compliance of relevant guidelines on KG admission arrangements. He suggested that the Quality Review reports ("QR reports") of KGs, which were currently provided only in Chinese and uploaded to EDB's website, should also be provided in English to facilitate access by parents of NCS students. In assessing the performance of KGs under the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme, Mr SHIU also suggested that the review teams of EDB should have regard to additional parameters such as providing learning support for NCS students in schools and developing inclusive environment for NCS students; and that such information should be made available in the QR reports. The Administration would look into other suggestions of Mr SHIU and undertook to consider providing additional guidelines to KGs regarding the admission procedures. As regards the suggestion of monitoring the admission arrangements, the Administration's initial view was that there would be practical difficulties since there were about a thousand of KGs and registration for KG places would take place almost around the same time within a school year.	Admin (paragraph 5 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		In response to Mr CHU Hoi-dick's enquiry, the Administration informed members that EDB would implement the free quality KG education policy with effect from the 2017-2018 school year and participating KGs were required to provide information on their admission arrangements (including admission guidelines and application forms) in bilingual version. Parents of NCS students were encouraged to send their children to KGs with an immersed Chinese language environment as early as possible to facilitate their learning of the Chinese language.	
020009 - 020340	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung requested the Administration to address the phenomenon that the number of EM students attaining higher level of education was disproportionately low compared with their local counterparts. The Administration remarked that alternative qualifications for Chinese language had been recognized for eligible NCS students to meet the general entrance requirements for admission to UGC-funded institutions. In 2016, 224 NCS candidates (i.e. about 21.4% of the 1 046 NCS students who took the HKDSE Examination) had received the JUPAS offers.	
020341 - 020705	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	Ms Claudia MO opined that using Putonghua as the medium of instruction for teaching the Chinese Language subject for NCS students was not conducive to their learning of the Chinese language.	
Agenda item IV - Any other business			
020706- 020739	Chairman	Item for discussion at the next meeting and arrangement for inviting the public to give views.	

Council Business Division 2
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
19 January 2017