

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/HS/2/16

LC Paper No. CB(2)2029/16-17
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities

Minutes of the meeting
held on Monday, 8 May 2017, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun

Members absent : Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public Officers : Food and Health Bureau
attending

Miss Linda LEUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health
(Health) 2

Hospital Authority

Dr Ian CHEUNG
Chief Manager (Cluster Performance)

Mr Hans LI
Chief Manager (Business Support Services)

Mr Antony LUI
Senior Manager (Business Support Services)

Department of Health

Dr Darwin MAK
Acting Principal Medical and Health Officer (2)

Housing Department

Mrs Rosa HO LOK So-fun
Assistant Director (Housing Subsidies)

Miss Catharine CHUI Kit-wan
Chief Executive Officer (Private Housing)

Mrs LAW KO Siu-chu
Senior Housing Manager (Rent and Special Services)

Home Affairs Department

Mr Howard YAM
Assistant Director (3)

Mr CHENG Kwan-yam
Chief Executive Officer (3)

Attendance by : Session One
invitation

The Civic Party

Mr Andy YU Tak-po
Executive Committee

Mr MAK Ip-sing
Member of Yuen Long District Council

Miss WONG Ching-sum

New People's Party

Miss Sammi FU

Miss LEUNG Wing-ting

Kwai Chung Ethnic Minority Concern Group

Mr Minhas RASHAD
Committee Member

Mr Phillip KHAN

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Ms LAW Lam
Officer

HK Catholic Commission for Labour Affairs

Ms BUT Ngan-ping
Centre Supervisor

Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)

Mr LI Ka-shu
Program Officer

Catholic Workers Centre Yaumatei

Mrs Sairah ABBAS
Assistant Program Officer

Equal Accessibility Group (2)

Mrs Chandra Kala GURUNG

Equal Access Group Core (Ladies)

Ms Jan MUSRAT

Equal Access Group

Mrs Shaheen SHABANA

A.I.M. Group

Mr Mohammad Tahir MAHMOOD

Nepali Social Service Hong Kong

Mr Main Bahadur THAPA
Chairperson

Association Concerning Sexual Violence Against Women

Ms CHOI Suet-wah
Project Officer (Advocacy)

Ms Amina KHAN

Equal Opportunities Commission

Mr Raymond HO
Senior Equal Opportunities Officer (Ethnic Minorities Unit)

Mr CHAN Wing-yin

Miss LO Sin-chi

Session Two

Mr FONG Ho-kiu

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of
Hong Kong

Mr Derek HUNG
Ethnic Minorities Committee Chairman

Mr FOK Hon-kiu

Mr WONG Yuk-ming

Health In Action

Miss Karen LAU
Research and Advocacy Coordinator

Translate For Her (THEM)

Miss HUNG Chung-huen

Mr Syed M AGHA

Women's International Guild

Ms Shazia ALI
President

EM NTK Housing Concern Group

Miss Rizwana LATIF
Group Member

Health Connection

Dr Dhiraj GURUNG
Co-founder

Mr CHAN Ho-fai

Miss TSOI Sin-man

Mrs Tahreem YOUNUS

Yan Oi Tong Community Centre

Mr Daniel MA Ho-kwan
Chief Supervisor

Miss Sharmila GURUNG

The Democratic Party

Mr Leo CHU

Ms Nebra YOUNIS

Ms Iqra QUNWAL

Hong Kong Unison

Miss Mandy CHEUK Man-po

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (2) 3

Staff in attendance : Miss Cindy HO
Senior Council Secretary (2) 3

Mr Dennis HO
Council Secretary (2) 3

Mrs Fonny TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2) 3

Action

- I. Difficulties encountered by ethnic minorities in gaining access to housing and healthcare services, and views on services provided by Support Service Centres for Ethnic Minorities**
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1351/16-17(01), CB(2)940/16-17(01), CB(2)1119/16-17(01), CB(2)1119/16-17(03) and CB(2)1315/16-17(01) to (02)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received views from 40 deputations/individuals attending the meeting. The Subcommittee noted the following major views expressed by the deputations/individuals:

(a) Housing services:

- (i) many deputations considered that the frontline staff of the Housing Department ("HD") failed to provide the necessary assistance to the public rental housing ("PRH") applicants and sitting tenants who were ethnic minorities ("EMs"). To cater for the needs of EM PRH applicants and tenants who did not understand Chinese or English, some deputations suggested that interpretation services should be promoted to EMs more proactively by HD staff and be extended to more estate management offices; the interpreters should also be allowed to complete PRH application forms on EM applicants' behalf at the Housing Authority Customer Service Centre;
- (ii) some deputations raised concern about the higher rent incurred by EM households which were allocated by HD two adjacent PRH flats, rather than one large PRH flat, for EMs with large household sizes; and
- (iii) some landlords and estate agents were biased against EM tenants of private housing, worrying that these tenants might create nuisance to neighbours due to their habits of curry cooking and their large household sizes. Some deputations also raised that the rents of private premises had created heavy financial burden to many low-income EM families and it was difficult for them to find economical flats that could accommodate their large household sizes;

(b) Public healthcare services:

- (i) the interpretation services for EMs at public hospitals and clinics were inadequate. Some deputations considered that resident interpreters should be provided in each hospital/cluster under the Hospital Authority ("HA") to provide urgent interpretation (e.g., at the Accident and Emergency departments) and on-site interpretation for inpatients, at general out-patient clinics and at Pharmacy departments. Moreover, the interpreters providing interpretation services at public hospitals and clinics should possess adequate medical qualifications and knowledge to provide accurate medical interpretation;

- (ii) EM languages should be provided alongside Chinese and English in the automated General Out-patient Clinic Telephone Appointment System under HA;
 - (iii) drug labels should be presented in a way comprehensible to EMs, by using accurately translated information in plain language and, for the illiterate, graphical images. Moreover, health education messages should be disseminated in EM languages as well to ensure that EMs could gain access to them; and
 - (iv) some deputations suggested that an EM health database on the basis of ethnicity should be established to facilitate the monitoring of health trends (such as incidence rates for diseases and cancers as well as trends in the body mass index) of EMs and the formulation of specific health education policies and preventive measures;
- (c) Support service centres ("SSCs") for EMs:
- (i) many EM residents were not aware of the services provided by SSCs and the deputations called on the Administration to step up its promotion efforts. There was also a view that the information on the SSCs' websites should be provided in full in EM languages;
 - (ii) the provision of tutorial classes offered at SSCs should be enhanced, since many EM students had to rely on these tutorial classes to catch up with the level taught at school. It was considered that the tutorial classes should tailor for the specific needs of EM students;
 - (iii) translation and interpretation services should be strengthened. Some deputations suggested that the Government should provide more funding for the SSC providing interpretation services, namely the Centre for Harmony and Enhancement of Ethnic Minority Residents, to provide more effective services. There was another view that interpretation services should be provided by all SSCs to make the services more accessible; and
 - (iv) concern was also raised that the two committee/forum on EM matters under the Home Affairs Department, namely, the Committee on the Promotion of Racial Harmony and the Ethnic Minorities Forum, did not hold meetings regularly.

In the deputations' view, these bodies were not effective in enhancing the livelihood of EM communities and in representing the views and difficulties faced by many EMs.

Follow-up actions required of the Administration

Admin
/HA

3. The Subcommittee requested the Administration to:
- (a) explore, in collaboration with HA, introducing an entry on ethnicity information in the electronic patient record for monitoring and statistical purposes and provide a written reply on the outcome; and
 - (b) provide information on the meeting schedule and issues discussed by the Committee on the Promotion of Racial Harmony and the Ethnic Minorities Forum.

Admin
/HA

4. The Subcommittee also requested HA to consider:
- (a) introducing EM languages in the General Out-patient Clinic Telephone Appointment System and on drug labels; and
 - (b) providing resident interpreters at major hospitals with high demands for interpretation services.

The Administration and HA were requested to provide a response on the above issues to the Subcommittee.

II. Any other business

5. Members agreed to discuss the poverty problem of EMs at the next meeting to be held on 12 June 2017 at 2:30 pm.
6. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:44 pm.

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities
on Monday, 8 May 2017, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I - Difficulties encountered by ethnic minorities in gaining access to housing and healthcare services, and views on services provided by Support Service Centres for Ethnic Minorities</i>			
000434 - 000722	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000723 - 001034	The Civic Party	Presentation of views	
001035 - 001342	Mr MAK Ip-sing	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(01)]	
001343 - 001637	Miss WONG Ching-sum	Presentation of views	
001638 - 001947	New People's Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1337/16-17(01)]	
001948 - 002309	Miss LEUNG Wing-ting	Presentation of views	
002310 - 002624	Kwai Chung Ethnic Minority Concern Group	Presentation of views	
002625 - 002932	Mr Phillip KHAN	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1315/16-17(03) and LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(02)]	
002933 - 003247	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views	
003248 - 003608	HK Catholic Commission for Labour Affairs	Presentation of views	
003609 - 003925	Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)972/16-17(01) and CB(2)1148/16-17(04)]	
003926 - 004256	Catholic Workers Centre Yaumatei	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
004257 - 004922	Equal Accessibility Group (2)	Presentation of views	
004923 - 005435	Equal Access Group Core (Ladies)	Presentation of views	
005436 - 005754	Equal Access Group	Presentation of views	
005755 - 010159	A.I.M. Group	Presentation of views	
010200 - 010520	Nepali Social Service Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
010521 - 010852	Association Concerning Sexual Violence Against Women	Presentation of views	
010853 - 011136	Ms Amina KHAN	Presentation of views	
011137 - 011501	Chairman Equal Opportunities Commission	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1315/16-17(04)] Suspension of meeting	
<i>Break</i>			
012444 - 012718	Mr CHAN Wing-yin	Presentation of views	
012719 - 013132	Miss LO Sin-chi Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(03)]	
<i>Break</i>			
013719 - 013823	Chairman	Opening remarks	
013824 - 014142	Mr FONG Ho-kiu	Presentation of views	
014143 - 014452	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
014453 - 014800	Mr FOK Hon-kiu	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
014801 - 015134	Mr WONG Yuk-ming	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(04)]	
015135 - 015452	Health In Action	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1315/16-17(05)]	
015453 - 015754	Translate For Her (THEM)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1468/16-17(01)]	
015755 - 020036	Mr Syed M AGHA	Presentation of views	
020037 - 020409	Women's International Guild	Presentation of views	
020410 - 020654	EM NTK Housing Concern Group	Presentation of views	
020655 - 021006	Health Connection	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1315/16-17(06)]	
021007 - 021327	Mr CHAN Ho-fai	Presentation of views	
021328 - 021621	Miss TSOI Sin-man	Presentation of views	
021622 - 021919	Mrs Tahreem YOUNUS	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(05)]	
021920 - 022235	Yan Oi Tong Community Centre	Presentation of views	
022236 - 022603	Miss Sharmila GURUNG	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1315 /16-17(07)]	
022604 - 022917	The Democratic Party	Presentation of views	
022918 - 023235	Ms Nebra YOUNIS	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(06)]	
023236 - 023611	Ms Iqra QUNWAL	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(07)]	
023612 - 023958	Hong Kong Unison	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1453/16-17(08)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
023959 - 024449	Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG Hospital Authority ("HA")	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG called on HA to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) introduce ethnic minority ("EM") languages in the General Out-patient Clinic Telephone Appointment System; and (b) provide translation of drug label content in EM languages. <p>HA advised that its interpreters were assigned to different clusters to cater for service requests. HA would continue to monitor the demand for interpreters at different hospitals and would increase the number of interpreters if necessary. HA added that staff would include a remark for the EM patients in need of interpretation service in their electronic patient records for future reference.</p>	
024450 - 024953	Chairman Dr Helena WONG HA	<p>Dr Helena WONG enquired whether HA and the Administration would consider adding ethnicity information in the patient records for statistical purposes. HA agreed to consider introducing an entry on ethnicity information in the electronic patient record.</p>	HA (para. 3 of minutes)
024954 - 025433	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>The Deputy Chairman expressed that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) HA should record patients' ethnicity data, which, in her view, would be useful in evaluating HA's performance in supporting EM patients, and in providing target-oriented preventive health education; (b) officials from the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau should be present when the Subcommittee discussed issues relating to tackling racial discrimination in future; (c) the frontline staff of the Housing Department should be more proactive to offer the necessary assistance to EM public rental housing ("PRH") applicants; and (d) the support service centres for EMs should organize more activities to foster their social integration. <p>The Administration undertook to provide a written reply on collecting patients' ethnicity information after the meeting.</p>	Admin (para. 3 of minutes)
025434 - 030300	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Administration	<p><i>(Extension of meeting)</i></p> <p>Ms Claudia MO expressed disappointment that the difficulties encountered by EMs in accessing public services still</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>remained over the years. She and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung raised concern that the current support services for EMs were inadequate and uncoordinated across Government bureaux and departments. They urged the Administration to set up a team to centrally coordinate EM support services, including interpretation service.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the Home Affairs Department was responsible for providing support services for EMs to facilitate their integration into the community. The Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau had issued the Administrative Guidelines on Promotion of Racial Equality to provide guidance to relevant bureaux/departments and public authorities to promote racial equality and ensure equal access to public services in key areas concerned.</p>	
030301 - 031449	Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG Administration HA	<p>In response to Dr Fernando CHEUNG's enquiries, HA undertook to explore:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) introducing EM languages in its General Out-patient Clinic Telephone Appointment System; (b) providing resident interpreters in major hospitals with high demands for interpretation services; and (c) providing translation of drug labels in EM languages. <p>HA advised that the interpreters at public hospitals would provide interpretation service to the patients concerned throughout their stay in the hospital, from medical consultation to collecting medicine. Dr Fernando CHEUNG, however, pointed out that given the long waiting time at the Pharmacy department, EM patients were seldom accompanied by any interpreter at the Pharmacy department when waiting to collect medicine.</p> <p>Dr CHEUNG enquired and the Administration advised that the Committee on the Promotion of Racial Harmony had met in February 2017 and the Ethnic Minorities Forum was scheduled to meet next in June 2017. The Chairman requested information on the meeting schedule and issues discussed by the Committee on the Promotion of Racial Harmony and the Ethnic Minorities Forum.</p> <p>In reply to Dr CHEUNG's enquiry regarding the services provided by the Housing Authority Customer Service Centre ("HACSC"), the Administration advised that the Hall Attendants were EM staff serving all customers, including EM PRH applicants. They were tasked to provide reception services to PRH applicants including EMs, but were not</p>	<p>HA (para. 4 of minutes)</p> <p>Admin (para. 3 of minutes)</p>

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>required to provide interpretation services. For EM customers who spoke neither Chinese nor English, a list of national flags were displayed at HACSC for the customers concerned to indicate their countries of origin such that interpretation services could be arranged in their EM languages accordingly. The Administration reported that HACSC served about 600 EM customers between August 2016 and January 2017, about 100 of whom did not understand Chinese or English. Among them, about 90 EM customers visited HACSC just to collect or submit leaflets/documents, whereas the remaining 10 brought along their friends or relatives for assistance.</p>	
<i>Agenda item II - Any other business</i>			
031450 - 031528	Chairman	<p>Discussion item for next meeting</p> <p>Closing remarks</p>	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 21 August 2017