

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/HS/2/16

LC Paper No. CB(2)2084/16-17
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities

Minutes of the meeting
held on Monday, 10 July 2017, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun

Member attending : Dr Hon Pierre CHAN

Member absent : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public Officers : Policy and Project Coordination Unit,
attending Chief Secretary for Administration's Private Office

Ms Angelina KWAN
Deputy Head

Mr Timothy WONG
Administrative Officer (1)

Education Bureau

Ms IP Ling-bik
Principal Assistant Secretary (Education Commission &
Planning)

Working Family and Student Financial Assistance
Agency

Mr Esmond LEE Chung-sin, JP
Head

Labour Department

Mr Charles HUI, JP
Assistant Commissioner (Employment Services)

Home Affairs Department

Mr CHENG Kwan-yam
Chief Executive Officer (3)

Attendance by : Session One
invitation

EM NTK Social Concern Group

Miss Rizwana LATIF
Group Member

Labour Party

Miss WU Sui-shan
Chairperson

DAB

Ms Neena PUSHKARNA
Committee Member of DAB Ethnic Minorities
Committee

Liberal Party

Mr LEE Chun-keung
Vice Party Chair

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Ms LAW Lam
Officer (Family & Community)

Cleaning Worker Union

Ms Rabina LIMBU
Organizer

Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong – Diocesan Pastoral
Centre for Workers (Kowloon)

Mr LI Ka-shu

Mr Leslie CHAN Ka-long

Equal Access Group

Miss Yaqub MARYA

Mr Shoaib HUSSAIN

Catholic Workers Centre, Yau Ma Tei

Mrs Abbas SAIRAH
Assistant Program Worker

Mr Abdull Ghafar KHAN

Mr POON Wing-lok

Equal Opportunities Commission

Mr HO Wing-keung
Senior Equal Opportunities Officer (Ethnic Minorities
Unit)

Hong Kong Unison

Ms Phyllis CHEUNG
Executive Director

Miss Nargas Sultana SHAKOOR

Ms Payal BISWAS

Society for Community Integration

Ms CHEUK Man-po

Session Two

Hong Kong Christian Service (Elderly Core Business)

Miss Peggy LAU
Project Leader (Support to Ethnic Elderly (SEE)
Project)

Miss Nebra YOUNIS

Mr Abbas ARIF

Mr Basnet PANKAJ

Miss CHAN Sze-ki

Mr HAR Ho-pan

Mr Oscar LEUNG Lok-tin

Mr MAK Long-wai

The Civic Party

Mr Andy YU Tak-po
Executive Committee

Mrs Abeer TAFAZZUL

Mrs Shabana AKBAR

Health In Action

Miss Karen LAU
Research and Advocacy Coordinator

Ms Puja Kapai PARYANI

Ms Bushra KHALIQ

Employment Concern Group EM

Mr Muhammad QADEER

Mr HO Wang-tat

Mr Azan MARWAH

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (2) 3

Staff in attendance : Miss Cindy HO
Senior Council Secretary (2) 3

Mrs Fanny TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2) 3

Action

I. Poverty problem of ethnic minorities

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1571/16-17(01) and FS08/16-17]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received views from 35 deputations/individuals attending the meeting. The Subcommittee noted the following major views relating to poverty issues of ethnic minorities ("EMs") expressed by the deputations/individuals:

- (a) EMs of South Asian origins in Hong Kong had increased from about 60 000 in 2011 to 76 000 in 2016. Over 32% of them were non-skilled workers and the majority were Pakistanis and Nepalese. Many of them worked in the construction industry and got a salary lower than local workers or were only employed as casual workers with little employment protection. These EM households in general had a few working members and a large number of dependent children;
- (b) instead of implementing general policies on poverty alleviation for EMs, the Administration should examine the causative factors and implement specific measures to tackle the poverty issues of EMs;
- (c) some deputations considered that employment and education were crucial to the alleviation of poverty. However, they considered that the Labour Department ("LD") failed to provide effective employment services for EMs;
- (d) as pledged by the Chief Executive in her Election Manifesto in 2017, the Administration would take steps to employ more EMs in the civil service by reviewing the requirements of Chinese Language proficiency. Some deputations also suggested setting a recruitment ratio for hiring EMs in the civil service so as to enhance their employment opportunities;
- (e) LD should remind employers to specify the language requirements based on genuine needs of the job. It was suggested that if applicants were only required to be able to speak Chinese, employers should specify clearly in the job requirement so as to enable more EMs to apply for their vacancies;
- (f) many EMs were unaware of the employees' rights and protection as well as information on occupational safety and health. LD was urged to enhance its efforts in this regard;
- (g) some EM women wanted to work but they had to look after their children. The Administration should improve child care/after-school care services and provide training and retraining services to EM women so as to help them join the workforce. Besides, training and retraining services should be provided to middle-aged EM workers for skills upgrading to enhance their job opportunities;

- (h) the Administration should continue to review the implementation of the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" as discussed at previous meetings of this Subcommittee;
- (i) many EMs were not aware of the poverty alleviation measures available to them and no interpretation service was arranged by some Government departments. The Administration was urged to improve the provision of interpretation service for EMs to facilitate them to gain access to various public services; and
- (j) Government departments/public service providers should disaggregate their statistics on users by ethnicity, so as to ascertain the number of EMs using various kinds of public services and facilitate review of their interpretation services for EMs.

Follow-up actions required of the Administration

Admin 3. The Administration was requested to:

- (a) consider according priority, when subsidizing after-school support for non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students to learn Chinese, to those classes/programmes having recruited EMs who were born and raised in Hong Kong and had the experience in learning Chinese in local schools;
- (b) consider setting a recruitment ratio of NCS permanent residents for civil service posts to enhance their employment opportunities;
- (c) provide information on (i) the effectiveness of the pilot scheme of engaging two employment assistants proficient in EM languages at the Kowloon West Job Centre and the Employment in One-stop and the EM language(s) which the employment assistants were conversant with; and (ii) whether there were plans to hire more employment assistants to be deployed to other LD job centres;
- (d) follow up on some concerns raised at previous meetings about enhancing professional capabilities of Chinese Language teachers in teaching Chinese as a second language and the need to have standardized curriculum to facilitate NCS students' Chinese learning;
- (e) follow up on the suggestion of the Equal Opportunities Commission [LC Paper No. CB(2)1833/16-17(01)] that vocational

training courses in more subject areas should be provided in English by the Vocational Training Council and Employees Retraining Board so as to facilitate skills enhancement of EMs, thereby improving their job prospects;

- (f) explore members' suggestion of introducing a central mechanism for the provision of interpretation service for EMs to facilitate their use of public services;
- (g) advise whether and how the Administration would follow up on the allegedly high dropout rates of EM students, especially those with special educational needs, before Secondary 5; and
- (h) relay some members' suggestion that a high-level commission on EMs should be set up to co-ordinate various policy areas related to issues of EMs.

II. Any other business

4. The Chairman said that as approved by the House Committee at its meeting on 7 July 2017, the Subcommittee would continue to operate for 12 more months up to 1 November 2018. He said that members' views would be sought on the items for discussion in the 2017-2018 legislative session at the next meeting. Members also agreed to discuss the implementation and review of the Race Discrimination Ordinance at the next meeting to be held in the new session.

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:36 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
15 September 2017

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities
on Monday, 10 July 2017, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I - Poverty problem of ethnic minorities</i>			
001249 - 001533	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001534 - 001905	EM NTK Social Concern Group	Presentation of views	
001906 - 002218	Labour Party	Presentation of views	
002219 - 002531	DAB Ethnic Minorities Committee	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1796/16-17(01) and CB(2)1921/16-17(01)]	
002532 - 002847	Liberal Party	Presentation of views	
002848 - 003221	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1921/16-17(02)]	
003222 - 003528	Cleaning Worker Union	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1921/16-17(03)]	
003529 - 003850	Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong - Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1571/16-17(02)]	
003851 - 004152	Mr Leslie CHAN Ka-long	Presentation of views	
004153 - 004339	Equal Access Group	Presentation of views	
004340 - 004653	Mr Shoaib HUSSAIN	Presentation of views	
004654 - 005013	Catholic Workers Centre, Yau Ma Tei	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
005014 - 005337	Mr Abdull Ghafar KHAN	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1796/16-17(02)]	
005338 - 005645	Mr POON Wing-lok	Presentation of views	
005646 - 010013	The Equal Opportunities Commission	Presentation of views [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1591/16-17(01) and CB(2)1833/16-17(01)]	
010014 - 010326	Hong Kong Unison	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1571/16-17(03)]	
010327 - 010708	Miss Nargas Sultana SHAKOOR	Presentation of views	
010709 - 010916	Ms Payal BISWAS	Presentation of views	
010917 - 011228	Society for Community Integration	Presentation of views	
011229 - 012027	Chairman Administration	The Administration's initial response to the views and concerns expressed by the deputations.	
012028 - 012413	Chairman Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	<p>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan shared the deputations' view that some schools receiving the additional funding to facilitate the implementation of the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" ("Learning Framework") and creation of an inclusive learning environment in schools mainly hired additional teaching staff to help non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students, and that ethnic minority ("EM") parents were very concerned about the progress of their children in learning Chinese. She urged the Administration to ensure effective use of funding by schools to implement the Learning Framework. Dr CHIANG made the following suggestions:</p> <p>(a) the Administration should consider according priority, when subsidizing after-school support for NCS students to learn Chinese, to those classes / programmes having recruited EMs who were born and raised in Hong Kong and had the experience in learning Chinese in local schools; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should consider setting a recruitment ratio of NCS permanent residents for civil service posts to enhance their employment opportunities.</p>	Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
012414 - 012720	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping Administration	<p>Noting that the Pakistanis had the highest poverty rate amongst the EM groups, Mr POON Siu-ping enquired whether the Administration had devised specific poverty alleviation measures to assist them.</p> <p>The Administration advised that according to the findings of the thematic study in the Hong Kong Poverty Situation Report on Ethnic Minorities 2014, the poverty rate of Pakistanis was relatively high, and most of these families had four or five members but only one breadwinner in the family. The Low-income Working Family Allowance launched in May 2016 provided cash allowance to the low-income working families including families of EMs.</p> <p>At the request of Mr POON, the Administration was requested to advise on:</p> <p>(a) the effectiveness of the pilot scheme of engaging two employment assistants proficient in EM languages at the Kowloon West Job Centre and the Employment in One-stop, and the EM language(s) which the employment assistants were conversant with; and</p> <p>(b) whether there were plans to hire more employment assistants to be deployed to other Labour Department job centres.</p>	Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)
012721 - 013037	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW	<p>Mr Holden CHOW requested the Administration to follow up on some concerns raised at previous meetings about enhancing professional capabilities of Chinese Language teachers in teaching Chinese as a second language and the need to have standardized curriculum to facilitate NCS students' Chinese learning.</p> <p>Mr CHOW requested the Administration to review and lower the Chinese Language proficiency requirements in the civil service recruitment, with a view to recruiting more EM staff in the Government. Mr CHOW suggested that the Government should provide incentive to encourage employers in the private sector to hire more EM employees.</p>	Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)
013038 - 013357	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	<p>Ms Claudia MO pointed out that many EMs particularly young people were unable to find jobs. She requested the Administration to follow up on the Equal Opportunities Commission's suggestion [LC Paper No. CB(2)1833/16-17(01)] that vocational training courses in more subject areas should be provided in English by the Vocational Training Council and Employees Retraining Board so as to facilitate skills enhancement of EMs. She said that some young Nepalese had reflected to her that certain</p>	Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>construction industry-related training courses (e.g. cement finisher) were conducted only in Chinese.</p> <p>Ms MO shared the deputations' view that the Chinese proficiency required under the General Certificate of Secondary Education (Chinese) examination was similar to local Primary 1 or Primary 2 level, and such a low Chinese proficiency level would have an adverse impact on the employability of the NCS students concerned.</p> <p>Ms MO urged the Administration to take note of the concern raised by a deputation that the South Asians were unfairly labelled as bogus refugees. The Administration dismissed that there was negative labelling of EM people in its poverty alleviation work and provision of other areas of public services.</p>	
013358 - 013846	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Administration	<p>Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired:</p> <p>(a) whether the Immigration Department would ensure that each EM would be given a copy of the booklet entitled "Your Guide to Services in Hong Kong" upon arrival at Hong Kong;</p> <p>(b) whether the Administration would introduce a central mechanism to oversee the provision of interpretation service for EMs to facilitate their use of public services as the current measures provided by various bureaux/departments were piecemeal and lacked coordination; and</p> <p>(c) whether the Education Bureau ("EDB") would address the concern raised by some deputations about the difficulties encountered by NCS students in applying for admission to local mainstream schools.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) the Home Affairs Department coordinated the publication of the booklet entitled "Your Guide to Services in Hong Kong" ("給少數族裔人士的服務指南") in English and six EM languages. The booklets were distributed to newly arrived EMs at the airport. Recently, the booklets were also made available at all offices of the Immigration Department;</p> <p>(b) the Administration agreed to explore the suggestion of introducing a central mechanism for the provision of interpretation service for EMs to facilitate their use of public services; and</p>	<p>Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)</p>

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		(c) to facilitate parents of NCS students to grasp the basic information of all public sector schools, EDB had distributed the English version of the School Profiles to each NCS student and had been encouraging schools to keep on enriching the contents of their English School Profiles. Besides, dedicated briefing sessions on the Primary One Admission System were organized annually for parents of NCS students with simultaneous interpretation service provided.	
<i>Break</i>			
014412 - 014501	Chairman	Opening remarks	
014502 - 014825	Hong Kong Christian Service (Elderly Core Business)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1796/16-17(03)]	
014826 – 015102	Miss Nebra YOUNIS	Presentation of views	
015103 - 015415	Mr Abbas ARIF	Presentation of views	
015416 - 015703	Mr Basnet PANKAJ	Presentation of views	
015704 - 015846	Miss CHAN Sze-ki	Presentation of views	
015847 - 020227	Mr HAR Ho-pan	Presentation of views	
020228 – 020559	Mr Oscar LEUNG Lok-tin	Presentation of views	
020600 - 020856	Mr MAK Long-wai	Presentation of views	
020857 - 021219	The Civic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1921/16-17(04)]	
021220 - 021509	Mrs Abeer TAFAZZUL	Presentation of views	
021510 - 021856	Mrs Shabana AKBAR	Presentation of views	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
021857 - 022241	Health In Action	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1796/16-17(04)]	
022242 - 022629	Ms Puja Kapai PARYANI	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1921/16-17(05)]	
022630 - 023022	Ms Bushra KHALIQ	Presentation of views	
023023 - 023800	Mr Muhammad QADEER	Presentation of views	
023801 - 024145	Mr HO Wing-tat	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1796/16-17(05)] <i>(extension of meeting)</i>	
024146 - 024543	Mr Azan MARWAH	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1833/16-17(02)]	
024544 - 025149	Chairman Administration	The Administration's initial response to the views and concerns expressed by the deputations. <i>(further extension of meeting)</i>	
025150 - 025736	Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG Administration	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether there were policies on the ratio of EMs' appointment to various advisory/statutory bodies; (b) what measures would be taken to address the deputations' concern about refusals of some local kindergartens ("KGs") to admit EM students; and (c) whether and how the Administration would follow up on the allegedly high dropout rates of EM students, especially those with special educational needs, before Secondary 5, as some statistics showed that the dropout rate of Nepalese students before Secondary 5 was 20% and that the dropout rate of EM students with special educational needs before Secondary 5 was 57%. <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) in response to Dr CHEUNG's concerns on the appropriate complaint channel for any aggrieved cases of admission to KG, the Administration advised that KGs had been reminded through different channels including school circulars that their school-based admission mechanism 	<p>Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)</p>

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>should be fair, just and open and relevant complaints, if any, would be followed up by EDB to ensure fairness in admission of students in KGs; and</p> <p>(b) appointments to advisory/statutory bodies were made with regard to the background, experience and expertise of candidates. While there was no guideline on the ratio of EMs' appointment to advisory/statutory bodies, the Administration had been making efforts to engage EMs through public forums and other platforms. For instance, the annual Commission on Poverty ("CoP") Summit specifically invited groups and organizations to bring in EM representatives to ensure their participation among representatives of other sectors in the community. In addition, the Chief Executive in her Election Manifesto committed to enhance EMs' participation in Government statutory bodies and committees.</p> <p>Dr CHEUNG suggested that an EM representative could be appointed to CoP. The Administration advised that the appointment of CoP membership would be considered in a holistic manner upon expiry of the current tenure of CoP.</p>	
025737 - 030127	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>The Deputy Chairman questioned why despite the large amount of resources that had been devoted to tackling the poverty issues of EMs, many of them still complained about the inaccessibility to support services or queried their effectiveness. She asked for a review on whether there was a mismatch of services. The Administration responded that the Special Needs Groups Task Force ("SNGTF") under CoP was conducting an in-depth study by way of focus groups to collect information on the awareness and satisfaction of EMs towards certain key public services. The findings would be available later this year, which could shed light on the issues involved and provide a basis for review for improvement. The Deputy Chairman, however, queried that the study would only be confined to the area of poverty alleviation. She considered that a high-level commission would be necessary to co-ordinate measures in a wider range of policy areas (including education, housing, healthcare, etc.) to address the mismatch of services for EMs.</p>	Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)
030128 - 030528	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	<p>With reference to the submission from Ms Puja Kapai PARYANI [LC Paper No. CB(2)1921/16-17(05)], Ms Claudia MO concurred with the view that "Current measures appear to be broad and too general and as such, fail to tackle the needs of ethnic minorities living in poverty". Ms MO opined that the Administration's efforts were only half-hearted and there should be at least one EM legislator in Hong Kong. In addition, she suggested that the Administration should set up a</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>high-level commission on EMs to deal with various policy issues related to the rights and well-being of EMs.</p> <p><i>(further extension of meeting)</i></p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) the Administration had been conducting thematic studies and surveys, including the study commissioned by SNGTF of CoP, from time to time to analyze the social characteristics and poverty situation of EMs in Hong Kong. They were useful references for relevant bureaux and departments to understand the needs of EMs and to formulate and provide services dedicated to EMs; and</p> <p>(b) members' suggestion on setting up a high-level commission on EMs would be relayed for consideration by the Administration at a higher level.</p>	<p>Admin (Paragraph 3 of minutes)</p>
<i>Agenda item II - Any other business</i>			
030529 - 030625	Chairman	Continuation of work of the Subcommittee and discussion item for next meeting	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
 15 September 2017