

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/HS/2/16

LC Paper No. CB(2)1932/17-18
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities

Minutes of the meeting
held on Monday, 9 July 2018, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present** : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Claudia MO
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH
- Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
- Public Officers attending** : Human Resources Planning and Poverty Co-ordination
Unit, Chief Secretary for Administration's Private
Office

Ms Angelina KWAN Yuen-ye
Head

Ms Emily MO Yuen-ching
Deputy Head

Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau

Mr D C CHEUNG
Principal Assistant Secretary (Constitutional &
Mainland Affairs) 5

Education Bureau

Ms Teresa CHAN Mo-ngan
Principal Assistant Secretary (Education Commission
& Planning)

Home Affairs Department

Mr Howard YAM, JP
Assistant Director (3)

Labour Department

Ms Catherine LAW Sui-fong
Senior Labour Officer (Employment Services) (Policy)

Social Welfare Department

Ms PANG Kit-ling
Assistant Director (Family & Child Welfare)

Working Family and Student Financial Assistance
Agency

Mr Esmond LEE Chung-sin, JP
Head

Employees Retraining Board

Mr Patrick PANG
Deputy Executive Director (Training Services)

**Attendance by
invitation**

Mr Abdull Ghafar KHAN

Mr KWONG Man-shek

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Ms Lynn LAW
Officer (Family & Community Service)

Tsz Lok Estate Resident Association

Mr CHEUNG Mau-ching
Community Service Officer

Miss Sammi FU, Islands District Council Member

Ethnic Minorities Employment Concern Group

Ms SIU Leung-sea
Member

Equal Access Group

Mrs Sairah ABBAS
Assistant Program Officer

Hey Group

Mr TSENG Ka-chun
Member

DAB

Ms Anita Kumari GURUNG
Senior Assistant Coordinator, Ethnic Minorities
Service Centre

AIM Group

Mr Shoaib HUSSAIN
Assistant Program Officer

Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong - Diocesan Pastoral
Centre for Workers (Kowloon)

Ms BUT Ngan-ping
Centre Supervisor

Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

Mr Anthony LAI

Ms Hussain ISMA

Mr POON Wing-lok

Kwai Tsuen Tsing Ethnic Minorities Concern Group

Mr LAU Chak-chun
Organization Officer

Miss Mahek Binod SINGH

Miss Rubilyn Bajado GABAYAN

Miss Kristeen ROMERO

Mr Syed M AGHA

Miss Syyeda Muneeba AGHA

Women Support Group

Mrs Shamim AKHTER

Hong Kong Unison

Miss Phyllis CHEUNG Fung-mei
Executive Director

Society for Cultural Integration

Miss TAM Yuen-yee

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (2) 3

Staff in attendance : Mr Dennis HO
Council Secretary (2) 3

Mrs Fanny TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2) 3

Action

I. The work of the Ethnic Minorities Steering Committee and support measures for ethnic minorities

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1131/17-18(01), CB(2)1329/17-18(01), CB(2)1736/17-18(01) and (02)]

The Subcommittee deliberated and received views from 24 deputations/individuals (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Motions

2. Ms Claudia MO moved the following motion:

(Translation)

"This Subcommittee urges the Chief Secretary for Administration, with his political determination, to formulate the following strategies for the Steering Committee, including:

- (1) to coordinate the policies and support measures in respect of ethnic minorities ("EMs") of various departments, such that a common vision and goal are in place for the Government in formulating the policies and support measures;
- (2) to establish open channels to proactively get in touch with EM groups and the relevant organizations on a regular basis for the purpose of effective public engagement and monitoring, as well as effective expression of public views on the Steering Committee, in order to enhance transparency;
- (3) to instruct various bureaux to plan for long-term policies in gradual replacement of the existing short-sighted remedial

Action

measures; develop short, medium and long-term and measurable performance indicators; as well as make reference to overseas experience and those available studies by local academics and non-governmental organizations when formulating policies,

in order to bring hopes for resolving the EM issues which have remained enmeshed for a long time, and help EMs integrate into Hong Kong more quickly."

3. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Members present unanimously voted for the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was passed. The Administration was requested to provide a written response to the motion.

Admin

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's response to the motion was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1899/17-18 on 30 July 2018.)

4. Dr Junius HO then moved the following motion:

(Translation)

"This Subcommittee urges the Chief Secretary for Administration, when studying ways to provide long-term support measures for ethnic minorities ("EMs"), should have clear instructions for the Ethnic Minorities Steering Committee to study the following short-term measures:

- (1) among the current employment quota for overseas domestic helpers, setting aside 5 000 to 10 000 posts for application by local EMs;
- (2) providing comprehensive training for domestic helpers;
- (3) setting the entry pay to be 110% of the minimum wage."

5. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The voting result was as follows: 1 member voted for the motion, 4 members voted against the motion and no members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was negatived.

6. Dr Fernando CHEUNG then moved the following motion:

(Translation)

"This Subcommittee strongly requests the Government to appoint ethnic

Action

minorities ("EMs") and persons who are concerned about the rights of EMs to the Ethnic Minorities Steering Committee, in order to ensure that the Steering Committee will optimize the use of the \$500 million public resources and effectively address the needs of EMs."

Admin

7. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Members present unanimously voted for the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was passed. The Administration was requested to provide a written response to the motion.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's response to the motion was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1899/17-18 on 30 July 2018.)

II. Any other business

Clerk

8. Members agreed that the Subcommittee would cease its work upon completion of the extended period of work which would end on 1 November 2018. The Chairman said that a draft report of the Subcommittee would be prepared for members' consideration and comment in due course.

9. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:48 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
13 August 2018

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities
on Monday, 9 July 2018, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I - The work of the Ethnic Minorities Steering Committee and support measures for ethnic minorities</i>			
001057 - 001342	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001343 - 001648	Mr Abdull Ghafar KHAN	The \$500 million earmarked by the Government should be effectively utilized for strengthening support services for ethnic minorities ("EMs") to boost their employment opportunities, facilitate their integration into the mainstream society, alleviate poverty and eliminate discrimination against EMs.	
001649 - 001944	Mr KWONG Man-shek	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1736/17-18(03)]	
001945 - 002311	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1778/17-18(01)]	
002312 - 002619	Tsz Lok Estate Resident Association	Presentation of views: (a) the \$500 million earmarked by the Government should be effectively utilized to enhance the Chinese language proficiency of non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students; and (b) efforts should be made to address the difficulties encountered by EMs in applying for the Working Family Allowance ("WFA").	
002620 - 002844	Miss Sammi FU, Islands District Council Member	The Government should step up its efforts to address EMs' employment difficulties, housing problems, and difficulties in accessing public healthcare services due to the language barrier.	
002845 - 003200	Ethnic Minorities Employment Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1736/17-18(04)]	
003201 - 003519	Equal Access Group	Presentation of views: (a) EM staff should be employed and posted in various departments such as the Working Family Allowance Office of the Working Family and Student Financial Assistance Agency ("WFAO"), the Housing Department ("HD") and the	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>Social Welfare Department to provide service for EM service users;</p> <p>(b) the Labour Department ("LD") should engage qualified and experienced EM staff to provide more effective employment support services to EM job seekers;</p> <p>(c) the Home Affairs Department ("HAD") should seek ways to step up interpreter training and accreditation so as to ensure the quality of interpretation services; and</p> <p>(d) the Government should provide economic incentives to encourage employers to provide job training for EM employees and release them to attend skill/language training courses during working hours.</p>	
003520 - 003849	Hey Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1736/17-18(04)]	
003850 - 004206	DAB	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1796/17-18(01)]	
004207 - 004519	AIM Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1736/17-18(04)]	
004520 - 004907	Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong - Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1736/17-18(04)] [LC Paper No. CB(2)1769/17-18(01)]	
004908 - 005248	Mr Anthony LAI	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1796/17-18(02)]	
005249 - 005524	Ms Hussain ISMA	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <p>(a) the Government should ensure the quality of the interpretation services for EMs to facilitate their access to public services;</p> <p>(b) EMs should be invited to join Government advisory bodies such that their views could be heard; and</p> <p>(c) non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") should be sponsored by the Government to raise EM parents' awareness of the education system and career options for their children.</p>	
005525 - 005922	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <p>(a) performance indicators and monitoring mechanism should</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>be introduced to ensure that support measures for EMs (including additional funding provided to schools admitting NCS students) were effective; and</p> <p>(b) a designated commissioner should be appointed to oversee issues relating the rights of EMs.</p>	
005923 - 010250	Mr POON Wing-lok	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <p>(a) it was far from satisfactory that the EM Steering Committee ("the Steering Committee") only comprised official representatives. It was suggested that the Steering Committee should conduct more focus group meetings on at regular intervals to maintain close liaison with representatives from NGOs and EM communities;</p> <p>(b) a designated commissioner should be appointed to oversee how the \$500 million earmarked for strengthening EM services could be effectively utilized;</p> <p>(c) the adoption of Administrative Guidelines on Promotion of Racial Equality by government departments should be made mandatory and the coverage of these Guidelines should be extended to cover more public authorities (e.g. the Urban Renewal Authority);</p> <p>(d) the Race Discrimination Ordinance ("RDO") should be amended to cover all Government functions and powers within its scope of application; and</p> <p>(e) government departments should collect and analyze relevant statistical data (disaggregated by ethnicity) about EMs for better planning of public services for EMs.</p>	
010251 - 010657	Kwai Tsuen Tsing Ethnic Minorities Concern Group	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <p>(a) EM ambassadors should be employed to provide services in more frontline offices of government departments, such as HD and the Employees' Compensation Division of LD, to assist EMs;</p> <p>(b) the Government should commission NGOs to operate EM job centres;</p> <p>(c) the Government should take the lead to hire more EM staff and lower the Chinese language proficiency requirements for Government positions;</p> <p>(d) subsidies should be provided to EMs holding non-local qualifications to conduct qualification assessments;</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>(e) HAD should organize community events and activities that were truly inclusive and could promote racial harmony effectively; and</p> <p>(f) WFAO should seek more effective ways to promote the awareness of WFA among EM households.</p>	
010658 - 010911	Miss Mahek Binod SINGH	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <p>(a) a structured curriculum for the teaching of Chinese as a second language should be developed;</p> <p>(b) cultural sensitivity training should be provided for school staff to eliminate racial discrimination; and</p> <p>(c) more job training and shadowing opportunities should be provided to EMs to enhance their employability.</p>	
010912 - 011137	Miss Rubilyn Bajado GABAYAN	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <p>(a) given that a number of research studies on issues relating to EMs had already been conducted by various organizations (e.g. the Equal Opportunities Commission, NGOs and universities), the Steering Committee should make reference to the relevant findings and take immediate action to tackle the problems encountered by EMs in Hong Kong; and</p> <p>(b) the Government should seek ways to raise the Chinese language levels of NCS students.</p>	
011138 - 011441	Miss Kristeen ROMERO	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <p>(a) the Steering Committee should conduct focus group meetings with EM communities and NGOs regularly so that their views could be heard and duly considered;</p> <p>(b) performance indicators and measurable goals should be set to assess and evaluate the effectiveness of the support measures for EMs; and</p> <p>(c) official documents of the Steering Committee should at least be translated into English and uploaded for public access.</p>	
011442 - 011650	Mr Syed M AGHA	<p>The Government should tackle discriminatory practices in the admission process of some kindergartens and eliminate the arrangements to segregate NCS students adopted by schools. The Steering Committee should address difficulties in learning the Chinese language by EMs, as well as the racial discrimination, harassment and vilification experienced by EMs in Hong Kong.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
011651 - 011926	Miss Syyeda Muneeba AGHA	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) EMs should be represented in the Steering Committee; (b) subsidies should be provided for EM students to attend private Chinese tutorial classes to help them catch up with the Chinese language standard of mainstream classes at school; and (c) NCS students should not be segregated in schools. 	
011927 - 012624	Women Support Group	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) EM new arrivals encountered many difficulties in obtaining and understanding information pertaining to the application of public rental housing due to the language barrier; and (b) government departments (e.g. HD) should engage staff who were conversant with EM languages to provide assistance to EMs to facilitate their access to public services. 	
012625 - 012936	Hong Kong Unison	<p>Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1769/17-18(02)] [LC Paper No. CB(2)1778/17-18(02)]</p>	
012937 - 013309	Society for Cultural Integration	<p>Presentation of views:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) given that a number of research studies on issues relating to EMs had already been conducted by various organizations, the Steering Committee should make reference to the relevant findings and take immediate action to tackle the problems encountered by EMs in Hong Kong; (b) RDO should be amended to cover all Government functions and powers within its scope of application; (c) the Government should eliminate the segregation of NCS students in public sector schools and provide better Chinese language education to them; and (d) performance indicators and measurable goals should be set to assess and evaluate the effectiveness of the support measures for EMs, so as to make the work of the Steering Committee more accountable and transparent. 	
013310 – 013727	Chairman Administration	<p>The Administration made the following initial response to the views expressed by the deputations/individuals:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the suggestion that the Steering Committee should engage with EM communities and relevant stakeholders on a regular basis would be conveyed to the Steering Committee for consideration; and 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>(b) taking into account the views and suggestions gathered, the Steering Committee would draw up measures with the use of the \$500 million earmarked to strengthen support services for EMs. Announcement on the measures would be made as soon as they were ready in the coming few months.</p>	
013728 - 014721	<p>Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration Mr POON Siu-ping</p>	<p>Ms Claudia MO considered that there should be EM representatives in the Steering Committee and in the Legislative Council. She and Mr POON Siu-ping took the view that a commissioner for multi-cultural affairs should be appointed to coordinate inter-departmental initiatives for supporting EMs. The Administration replied that the Steering Committee would consider various views collected including this suggestion. Besides, the Steering Committee would draw up support measures for EMs in around the third quarter of 2018.</p>	
014722 - 015921	<p>Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-chun Dr Fernando CHEUNG Administration</p>	<p>Mr SHIU Ka-chun considered that the Steering Committee should come up with "groundbreaking" solutions to various problems encountered by EMs and a commissioner for multi-cultural affairs should be appointed to oversee support measures for EMs. He and Dr Fernando CHEUNG raised concern about the composition of the Steering Committee and the lack of information about the Steering Committee (e.g. terms of reference and reporting schedules). They suggested that working groups should be set up by the Steering Committee to work on strengthening the support measures for EMs under different policy areas.</p> <p>In response to Mr SHIU's enquiry, the Administration advised that the findings and recommendations in the report on the Study on EMs' Awareness and Satisfaction towards Selected Public Services commissioned by the Special Needs Groups Task Force under the Commission on Poverty formed a basis for deliberation of enhancement of support for EMs, particularly in areas of engagement and promotion of awareness of public services amongst EMs.</p> <p>The Administration further advised that the Steering Committee was would be a coordinated platform within the Government to drive cross-departmental efforts to review and formulate policies and initiatives and monitor their implementation. It would continue to engage EM representatives and stakeholders on an on-going basis.</p> <p><i>(extension of meeting)</i></p>	
015922 - 020448	<p>Chairman Dr Junius HO Administration</p>	<p>Dr Junius HO suggested ways to address the employment problems of EMs.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
020449 - 020938	Chairman Mr Vincent CHENG Administration	Mr Vincent CHENG considered that indicators should be set for monitoring the effectiveness of the support measures to be introduced by the Steering Committee. In particular, efforts should be made to improve the Chinese language proficiency of NCS students in order to facilitate their integration into the community. As many EMs were construction workers, information on labour rights and occupational safety should be promoted to them.	
020939 - 021335	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Administration	Dr Helena WONG considered that there should be EM representatives in the Steering Committee. In reply to Dr WONG's enquiries, the Administration advised that the \$500 million was earmarked for strengthening support measures for EMs in different policy areas. Based on the views and suggestions collected, proposals would be formulated for consideration by the Steering Committee. These proposals might include improving existing measures and introducing new measures to support EMs. There was no specific timeframe during which the \$500 million allocation would be spent. Additional resources would be sought wherever necessary.	
021336 - 022023	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Dr Junius HO Mr Abdull Ghafar KHAN Dr Fernando CHEUNG	Voting on three motions moved respectively by Ms Claudia MO, Dr Junius HO and Dr Fernando CHEUNG. <i>(further extension of meeting)</i>	
<i>Agenda item II - Any other business</i>			
022024 – 022215	Chairman Clerk	Closing remarks	