



26<sup>th</sup> February, 2018

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
The Chairman of Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities  
Room 714 Legislative Council Complex  
1 Legislative Council Road  
Central, Hong Kong

**立法會 CB(2)944/17-18(01)號文件**  
**LC Paper No. CB(2)944/17-18(01)**

Dear Hon. Tse,

**RE: Accountability of EDB’s enhanced funding for the implementation of  
the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework”**

I am writing to bring to your attention to the lack of accountability of the Education Bureau’s (EDB) enhanced recurrent funding for the implementation of the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” (Learning Framework), in the hope that you would discuss this issue at the LegCo Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities meeting tomorrow (27<sup>th</sup> February).

Since 2014, the EDB spent about \$200 million every year to allocate an additional funding to primary and secondary schools admitting non-Chinese speaking students to support the implementation of the Learning Framework and the learning and teaching of Chinese language of non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students with the aim to bridge them to mainstream Chinese Language classes. Depending on the number of NCS students in the school, the amount of funding ranges from \$50,000 to \$1.5 million per year for each funded school.

Unison recently conducted the “**Research on the Accountability of the EDB Enhanced Funding for the Implementation of ‘Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework’ in schools**” and examined the websites and uploaded school documents of *97 Primary Schools* and *86 Secondary Schools* in Yau Tsim Mong, Yuen Long and Eastern districts. It was found that **the implementation of the funding and Learning Framework lack accountability and transparency, and it is difficult for stakeholders and the public to monitor the implementation and its effectiveness.** The full report can be accessed here: <https://goo.gl/xgJfnu>.



Information on the support measures for NCS students subsidised by the enhanced funding and their effectiveness are largely inaccessible by the public

The research revealed that **not all schools that received the enhanced funding disclosed this information publicly**. Among those schools that indicated the receipt of enhanced funding, **about 20% of them did not provide information related to the support measures** for the learning and teaching of NCS students on their school websites or uploaded documents; important information, such as adapted Chinese curriculum, Chinese class arrangement or Chinese learning performance of NCS students, is largely missing. Furthermore, **a large majority of the surveyed schools published their school websites, annual plans and annual reports in Chinese only**; just a few of them provided information that was fully bilingual. A small number of schools uploaded the plans or reports on the enhanced funding, but all of them provided only the Chinese version.

The EDB did not ensure the transparency and accountability of the implementation of the enhanced funding and Learning Framework

Starting from the 2014/15 school year, **the EDB has set up a dedicated team to examine the annual plans** submitted by the funded schools, conduct supervisory visits to the schools, **collect feedback from major stakeholders**<sup>1</sup> through questionnaires, interviews, etc. and **verify them against the schools' annual reports**.<sup>2</sup> The EDB has also commissioned the University of Hong Kong to analyse the overall Chinese learning performance of NCS students using the Assessment Tools. **Nonetheless, the public has almost no access to the above information and results, especially for non-Chinese speaking stakeholders and members of the public.**

Consequence of lack of transparency and accountability

Strong quality assurance, monitoring and evaluation, and accountability mechanisms are necessary to ensure the implementation of policy goals. The lack of transparency of the enhanced

---

<sup>1</sup> Including the principal and the coordinator of the enhanced support measures for NCS students, Chinese Language teachers teaching NCS students, parents of NCS students, NCS students and non-governmental organisations in collaboration with the schools concerned.

<sup>2</sup> LC Paper No. CB (2)254/16-17(01), 22 November 2016



funding implies that the public had limited ways and means to monitor the effectiveness of these funding and holding the government accountable.

Unison's suggestions

In order to enhance the transparency and accountability of the enhanced funding and Learning Framework, **the EDB should ensure that separate and publicly accessible funding plans and reports are uploaded to the school websites**, and the documents should include **information on the support measures as well as Chinese learning progress and performance of NCS students**. The EDB should also disclose the research framework for the evaluation of the Learning Framework, and provide **a clear timeline for the launch of the evaluation report**.

It will be much appreciated if you could circulate this letter and attachments to other members in the Panel of Education for their understanding on this issue. Attached are the executive summary and press release of the aforementioned research.

Yours sincerely,

Phyllis Cheung  
Executive Director

Attachments:

1. Executive Summary: Research on the Accountability of the EDB Enhanced Funding for the Implementation of 'Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework' in schools
2. Press release on 26<sup>th</sup> February, 2018



**Research on the Accountability of the EDB Enhanced Funding for the Implementation of  
"Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" in schools**

*Hong Kong Unison (February, 2018)*

**Executive Summary**

Since 2014, the Education Bureau (EDB) has provided additional recurrent funding to primary and secondary schools for Enhanced Chinese Learning and Teaching for Non-Chinese Speaking Students ("CSL Funding") as well as After-school Support for Non-Chinese Speaking Students in Learning Chinese ("After-school CSL Funding"). The aim of the funding is to support the school-based implementation of the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" (Learning Framework), with the objectives to ensure equal opportunities for all non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students in learning Chinese on par with their Chinese-speaking counterparts and to create an inclusive learning environment in schools. Depending on the number of NCS students in the school, the amount of funding ranges from \$50,000 to \$1.5 million per year for each funded school. Approximately \$200 million was spent every year.

Strong quality assurance, monitoring and evaluation, and accountability mechanisms are necessary to ensure the implementation of policy goals. The objective of this research is to assess the accountability and transparency of the aforementioned funding and the Learning Framework. School websites and uploaded school annual plans and reports of 97 primary schools and 86 secondary schools in Yau Tsim Mong, Yuen Long and Eastern districts were examined. Information related to the receipt and use of the additional funding were recorded and coded for frequency analysis. To further evaluate the accessibility of funding information to non-Chinese speakers, language used in the websites and annual plans and reports were recorded and analysed.

**Research Findings**

1. Only 28.9% (28) of surveyed primary schools and 22.1% (19) of surveyed secondary schools indicated in their schools websites or uploaded documents that the school had received either the CSL Funding or After-school CSL Funding; whereas the statistics provided by the EDB revealed that 38.1% (37) of primary schools and 31.4% (27) of secondary schools in the studied districts had received CSL related funding. A comparison between the figures revealed that **not all schools that received the additional funding from the EDB disclosed this information publicly. This implied a lack of transparency of the additional funding.**
2. Among those schools that indicated the receipt of additional funding, about 20% of them did not provide information related to the support measures on the learning and teaching of NCS students on their school websites or uploaded documents. Important information, such as the availability of adapted Chinese curriculum, Chinese class arrangement and Chinese learning



performance of NCS students, is largely missing. **The additional funding lacked accountability, and the public had limited means to monitor the effectiveness of these funding.**

3. A large majority of the surveyed schools published their school websites, annual plans and annual reports in Chinese; only a few of them provided information that was fully bilingual. A small number of schools uploaded the plans or reports on the additional funding to the school websites, but all of them provided only the Chinese version. **Information on the availability and use of the additional funding is largely inaccessible to non-Chinese speaking stakeholders and members of the public.**

### **Policy Suggestions**

1. The EDB should review the current monitoring system and strength its role to ensure **CSL funding related information is transparent and made available to NCS parents, concerned stakeholders and the public.** Since the main objective of the CSL funding is to provide intensive learning of Chinese for NCS students to help them bridge over to mainstream Chinese classes, information on the effectiveness of different support measures, teaching strategies, and the Learning Framework, the learning performance and progress of NCS students in Chinese language must be made public. For better quality assurance, the **CSL funding plans and reports should be uploaded on the school websites in both Chinese and English versions.**
2. To ensure the transparency and accountability of the evaluation of the Learning Framework, **the EDB should disclose the research framework for the evaluation of the Learning Framework, and provide a clear timeline for the launch of the evaluation report.**



26/2/2018

To: News/ Education Assignment Editors (For immediate release)

Press release

**Education Bureau \$200 million per year lacks transparency and accountability**

**Hong Kong Unison releases the report of the “Research on the accountability of the EDB enhanced funding for the implementation of ‘Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework’ in schools”**

Hong Kong Unison, together with legislative councillors Hon. Dennis Kwok and Hon. Alice Mak, held a press conference on 26<sup>th</sup> February to release the findings of the “Research on the accountability of the EDB enhanced funding for the implementation of ‘Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework’ in schools”. Since 2014, the Education Bureau (EDB) spent about \$200 million every year, ranging from \$50,000 to \$1.5 million to primary and secondary schools admitting non-Chinese speaking students to support the implementation of “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” and the learning and teaching of Chinese language of non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students with the aim to bridge them to mainstream Chinese Language class. Hong Kong Unison found that the implementation of the funding and Learning Framework lack accountability and transparency, and it is difficult for stakeholders and the public to monitor the implementation and its effectiveness.

The research examined the school websites, as well as annual plans and annual reports uploaded to the websites of 97 primary schools and 86 secondary schools from Yau Tsim Mong, Yuen Long and Eastern districts, and recorded and analysed information on the receipt and use of the enhanced funding.

The research results showed that not all schools that received the enhanced funding disclosed this information publicly. Among those schools that indicated the receipt of enhanced funding, about 20% of them did not provide information related to the support measures for the learning and teaching of NCS students on their school websites or uploaded documents; important information, such as adapted Chinese curriculum, Chinese class arrangement or Chinese learning performance of NCS students, is largely missing. Furthermore, a large majority of the surveyed schools published their school websites, annual plans and annual reports in Chinese only, meaning non-Chinese speaking stakeholders and members of the public can hardly access information related to the availability and use of the additional funding.

*Please refer to the executive summary or full report (<https://goo.gl/xgJfnu>) for the major research findings.*



**Hon. Dennis Kwok** stated that education is the basic right of every student. As local residents, ethnic minority should be given an equitable education opportunity as their Chinese peers, to acquire the necessary language ability through mainstream education system to support further studies and employment, and contribute to the society. The Learning Framework has been implemented for 4 years and the EDB has spent more than \$800 million on the provision of funding to schools to support Chinese learning of NCS students on a ‘school based approach’. Each year a generation of students graduate; the progress of Chinese learning of NCS students would be slowed down without proper monitoring and evaluation on the effectiveness of the Framework and funding.

**Hon. Alice Mak** shared that the Chinese education of ethnic minority has been discussed at the LegCo for years without much progress. She observed that local born ethnic minority residents still have language barriers in their access to public services and employment even after 12 years in the mainstream education system. Allocating resources would be able to help NCS students in Chinese learning; however, the Government bears the responsibility to enhance the accountability and transparency on the utilization of funding. Public support for these measures would be lessened if monitoring and evaluation is not rigorous.

### **Policy suggestions**

In order to enhance the transparency and accountability of the enhanced funding and Learning Framework, the EDB should ensure that separate and publicly accessible funding plans and reports are uploaded to the school websites, and the documents should include information on the support measures as well as Chinese learning progress and performance of NCS students. The EDB should also disclose the research framework for the evaluation of the Learning Framework, and provide a clear timeline for the launch of the evaluation report.

*Encl.: Executive Summary of the “Research on the accountability of the EDB enhanced funding for the implementation of ‘Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework’ in schools”*

For media enquiries, please contact Ms. Mandy Cheuk, Project Manager, on 2789 3246.