立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CRM 432/18-19

Ref: AM 12/01/19 (16-20)

Subcommittee on Members' Remuneration and Operating Expenses Reimbursement

Review of Members' Remuneration and Operating Expenses Reimbursement for Members of the Seventh Legislative Council

PURPOSE

This paper reports the outcome of the survey conducted by the Subcommittee on Members' Remuneration and Operating Expenses Reimbursement ("the Subcommittee") in relation to the review of remuneration and operating expenses reimbursement ("OER") for Members of the Seventh Legislative Council ("LegCo").

BACKGROUND

- 2. It is an established practice for the Subcommittee to review the remuneration package and expenses reimbursement arrangements for LegCo Members at least one year before the start of a new LegCo term. After the review, any proposals to change the level of remuneration and operating expenses reimbursement for Members of the new term will be put forward to the Administration for consideration by the Independent Commission on Remuneration for Members of the Executive Council and the Legislature, and Officials under the Political Appointment System of the HKSAR ("the Independent Commission").
- 3. After consultation with all Members, the Subcommittee agreed at its meeting on 4 June 2018 to propose to the Administration the adoption of a weighted index instead of Consumer Price Index (C) ("CPI(C)") as the basis for annual adjustment to Members' office operation expenses reimbursement ("OOER") with effect from the Seventh LegCo. The proposed weighted index should comprise three main components of OOER, with each component to be adjusted in accordance with the relevant adjustment indicator as follows:

- (a) salary expenses, with its relative weighting of 70% of OOER, should be adjusted with reference to civil service pay adjustment for middle and lower salary bands;
- (b) office accommodation expenses, with its relative weighting of 10% of OOER, should be adjusted with reference to rental index for Grade C offices published by the Rating and Valuation Department; and
- (c) other operating expenses, with its relative weighting of 20% of OOER, should be adjusted with reference to Composite Consumer Price Index.
- 4. To ascertain whether any other proposals to change the level of remuneration and OER for Members of the Seventh LegCo should be put forward to the Administration, the Subcommittee conducted a survey in February 2019 to collect relevant information and seek views from all Members. The questionnaire issued to all Members for this purpose is in **Appendix I**.

OUTCOME OF SURVEY

5. Of the 69 Members, 1 54 have responded to the survey. The findings of the survey are set out in paragraphs 6 to 30 below.

I. Operating Expenses Reimbursement

(A) Office Operation Expenses Reimbursement – staff expenses

6. In 2018-2019², the ceiling of OOER is \$2,703,390 per annum (i.e. \$225,283 per month). Based on the utilization rates of OOER in the previous LegCo terms, a Member on average deploys about 70% of OOER on staff expenses (i.e. \$157,698 per month). To assess the amount of resources required for recruiting and retaining a team of quality staff to support the work of a LegCo Member and the adequacy of the current level of OOER for meeting Members' staff expenses, Members have been invited to provide relevant information for analysis.

When the survey was conducted in February 2019, one LegCo seat remained vacant.

² 2018-2019 refers to the third reimbursement year of the Sixth LegCo, covering 1 October 2018 to 30 September 2019. All the years in this paper refer to reimbursement years covering the period from 1 October to 30 September of the following year.

Actual staffing complement in Members' offices during the survey period

7. Forty-nine Members have provided information on this part of the survey. Their responses are summarized as follows:

Number of staff

(a) These 49 Members employed a total of 391 full-time³ and 125 part-time staff⁴ in 2017-2018, i.e. an average of 8 full-time staff and 3 part-time staff per Member. Detailed breakdowns of Members' responses are in **Appendices II** and **III**;

Salaries of full-time staff

- (b) 32% (125 staff) of the full-time staff received a monthly salary between \$10,000 and less than \$15,000, while 29% (115 staff) received a monthly salary between \$15,000 and less than \$20,000. **Appendix IV** shows the salary ranges of the full-time staff;
- (c) 24% (94 staff) were given a pay increase of less than 5%, and 24% (93 staff) had a pay increase between 5% and 10%;

Education and experience of full-time staff

- (d) 71% (277 staff) possessed university education or above;
- (e) 23 % (89 staff) had less than 5 years' work experience; 10% (39 staff) between 5 and 10 years, and 31% (122 staff) over 10 years; and
- (f) 60% (234 staff) had less than 3 years' service in Members' offices, 21% (81 staff) between 3 years and 10 years, and only 4% (16 staff) had more than 10 years' service.⁵

Staff turnover in Members' offices

8. Of the 348 full-time staff employed in 2016-2017 and the 391 full-time staff employed in 2017-2018 by the 49 responding Members, 70 left during 2016-2017 and 71 during 2017-2018. The average turnover rates⁶ for these two years are 20% and 18% respectively, which are on the

⁴ Part-time staff refer to those who work less than 30 hours per week.

These percentages do not add up to 100% as some of the responding Members did not provide relevant information for analysis.

Full-time staff refer to those who work 30 hours or more per week.

For part-time staff, the average turnover rate in 2016-2017 and 2017-2018 are 20% (20 out of the 100 part-time staff left during 2016-2017) and 23% (29 out of the 125 part-time staff left during 2017-2018) respectively.

high side.⁷ The turnover rates of full-time staff in 2017-2018 in each of the offices of the responding Members are set out in Appendix III.

- 9. Among the 71 full-time staff who left during 2017-2018:
 - (a) 40% (28 staff) received a salary between \$10,000 and less than \$15,000, and 37% (26 staff) received a salary between \$15,000 and less than \$20,000;
 - (b) 25% (18 staff) received an annual pay adjustment of less than 5%, and 14% (10 staff) received an annual pay adjustment of 5% to 10%;
 - (c) 66% (47 staff) possessed university education or above;
 - (d) 27% (19 staff) had less than 5 years' work experience;
 - (e) 20% (14 staff) left within 1 year, and 41% (29 staff) left within 1 to 3 years of working in Members' offices; and
 - (f) 31% (22 staff) found another job with better prospects, and 23% (16 staff) found a job with better pay.

Details of the above findings are in **Appendix V**.

10. While the high turnover rates are attributable to a number of factors, the findings indicate that the lack of a competitive remuneration package and good career prospects are the major reasons leading to the staff retention problem.

Optimal staffing complement

11. Regarding optimal staff complement in Members' offices, based on the returns of 39 Members, there is no majority view among Members. A breakdown of the views of the responding Members are shown in the following table:

According to the surveys conducted in the Fifth LegCo, the staff turnover rates in Members' offices in the first two legislative years of the Fifth LegCo were 21% and 16% respectively.

- 5 –

		Number of staff required by Members							
Method by which Members are returned	Functional Constituencies ("FC")			Council d) FC	Geogra Constit ("G		Overall		
	Full-time	Part-time	Full-time	Part-time	Full-time	Part-time	Full-time	Part-time	
	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff	
Range	3-13	0-3	11-15	0-5	5-27	0-6	3-27	0-6	
Average	6.6	0.9	13.0	2.3	11.9	2.3	9.6	1.7	

A further breakdown of the responding Members' views on the categories of staff required by them is in **Appendix VI**.

- 12. On staff remuneration package, 34% (13 of the 38 responding Members) consider that to ensure the salary is competitive enough to retain the service of staff, the minimum salary of their full-time staff at managerial/professional level should be in the range of \$35,000 to less than \$45,000; while 32% (12 Members) and 26% (10 Members) consider that the minimum salary of those who are degree holders below managerial level should be in the range of \$15,000 to less than \$20,000 and \$30,000 to less than \$35,000 respectively. Furthermore, 92% (35 Members) consider that in addition to salary, it is necessary to provide other benefits to these groups of staff. The types of cash benefits suggested include: (a) Bonus/Double pay/Gratuity (33 Members); (b) Medical benefits (26 Members); (c) Study allowance (4 Members); and (d) Travelling allowance (2 Members).
- 13. In addition to the amount required for employing full-time staff at managerial/professional level and those who are degree holders below managerial level, 22% (8 of the 36⁹ responding Members) consider that they require \$40,000 to less than \$50,000 per month for employing other full-time staff and part-time staff irrespective of their education level, while 19% (7 Members) consider that they require \$100,000 to less than \$150,000 per month for this purpose.
- 14. As mentioned in paragraph 6 above, the total amount of OOER available to Members for meeting staff expenses in 2018-2019 is \$157,698 per month. Based on this level of financial provision and the views of the 36 responding Members on optimal staffing complement, the majority (30 Members or 83%) consider that the current financial provision is insufficient to meet the expenses required for maintaining an optimal staffing complement. Views of individual Members on the optimal level of staffing complement and the funding required are summarized in **Appendix VII**.

Some Members have suggested more than one type of benefits.

⁹ Two of the 38 Members who responded to the parts of the survey on optimal staffing complement and remuneration package did not specify the amount required for retaining part-time staff.

(B) Office Operation Expenses Reimbursement – district offices

- 15. Based on the utilization rates of OOER in the previous LegCo terms, a Member on average deploys about 10% of OOER on office accommodation expenses¹⁰ (i.e. about \$22,528 per month based on the level of OOER in 2018-2019). To facilitate the Subcommittee's review of the resources required by Members for operating district offices, Members have been invited to provide relevant information for 2017-2018 for analysis.
- 16. According to the returns of 47 Members, the average number of district offices operated by Members in 2017-2018 is shown in the following table:

		District offices operated by Members*						
	F	C	DC (seco	DC (second) FC GC		C	Overall	
	Number	%	Number	%	Number	%	Number	%
Hong Kong Housing Authority	5.5	38.6	4	28.6	47.18	60.1	56.68	53.1
Link REIT	0	0	0	0	1	1.3	1	0.9
Private landlords	8.75	61.4	10	71.4	30.3	38.6	49.05	46.0
Total	14.25	100	14	100	78.48	100	106.73	100
Range	0-3	•	1-9	•	0.7-8	•	0-9	•
Average	0.8	-	3.5	-	3.0	-	2.3	-

(*The central office in the LegCo Complex provided for each Member is excluded.)

- 17. Of the above 47 Members, 9 Members (19%) do not operate a district office. The district office rental expenses incurred by 27 Members (57%) in 2017-2018 were fully funded by Members' OOER and their average annual rental expenses were \$226,226 (i.e. \$18,852 per month). Among the remaining 11 Members (24%) whose office rental expenses were not fully funded by Members' OOER, 8 Members have provided information on their office rental expenses and their average annual office rental expenses in 2017-2018 were \$330,900 (i.e. \$27,575 per month).
- 18. Regarding the optimum number of district offices (excluding the central office) required for effectively discharging their role and responsibilities as a LegCo Member, based on the returns of 29 Members who have responded to this part of the survey, the average optimum number of district offices required by a Member is 4.2. A breakdown of their views is shown in the following table:

Accommodation expenses include rental expenses, rates, government rents, management fees and utility charges.

- 7 —

	Numb	Number of district offices required by Members*								
	FC	DC (second) FC	GC	Overall						
Range	0-6	2-4	2-10	0-10						
Average	3.0	3.0	4.8	4.2						

(*The central office in the LegCo Complex provided for each Member is excluded.)

- 19. Based on the average annual rental expenses per office ¹¹ calculated on the basis of information provided by 35 Members, the projected expenses for renting 4.2 district offices would be \$388,180 per annum or \$32,348 per month, which exceeds the current financial provision of \$22,528 per month for office rental mentioned in paragraph 15 above.
- 20. Further details of the findings relating to district offices as reported in paragraphs 16 to 18 are in **Appendix VIII**.
- 21. In addition to the above findings, some Members have expressed the view that Members should be provided with adequate funding for leasing offices of at least 30m² from private landlords in the districts they are serving.

(C) Entertainment and Travelling Expenses Reimbursement

- An annual provision of Entertainment and Travelling Expenses Reimbursement ("ETER") is provided to each LegCo Member for covering entertainment, liaison and travelling expenses incurred by the Member or his/her staff in or outside Hong Kong for LegCo business. In 2018-2019, the ceiling for ETER is \$215,910 per annum (i.e. \$17,993 per month). To facilitate the review, Members have been invited to give views on the current level of ETER.
- 23. Among the 50 Members who have responded to this part of the survey, 48% (24 Members) consider the current level of ETER inadequate; 8% (4 Members) consider it adequate; and 44% (22 Members) have no comment.
- 24. Of the 24 Members who consider that the amount of ETER should be increased, 18 Members have specified the proposed amount of increase, as summarized in the table below:

_

¹¹ The average annual rental per office is \$92,424 as shown in Appendix VIII.

Range of the proposed amount of ETER	Number of Members
\$220,000 to less than \$230,000	1
\$230,000 to less than \$240,000	4
\$240,000 to less than \$250,000	10
\$250,000 to less than \$260,000	1
\$260,000 to less than \$270,000	1
\$270,000 to less than \$280,000	0
\$280,000 to less than \$290,000	0
\$290,000 to less than \$300,000	0
\$300,000 to less than \$310,000	1
Not specified	6
Total	24

- 25. Other views expressed include: (a) ETER should be adjusted according to the inflation rate as well as the percentages of fare and toll increases applied by franchised public transport companies and tunnel companies (1 Member); and (b) the current level of ETER cannot cater to the different needs of Members. Given the high tunnel tolls, consideration should be given to reimbursing Members' actual tunnel toll charges on an accountable basis with no pre-set ceiling (1 Member).
- 26. Other views given by Members in the survey relating to OER arrangements are set out in **Appendix IX**.

II. Members' Remuneration

27. LegCo Members are provided with a monthly remuneration, an annual accountable medical allowance and an end-of-service gratuity pitched at 15% of the total remuneration received by a Member during a LegCo term. Members' monthly remuneration and the medical allowance are adjusted annually in October in accordance with the movement of CPI(C). In 2018-2019, the remuneration of Members is \$98,540 per month¹² and the medical allowance is \$34,320 per annum. Any unused medical allowance in a year can be carried forward to the following year until the end of a LegCo term. Members have been invited to indicate whether they have any views on the level of remuneration, gratuity and medical allowance for LegCo Members.

(A) Monthly remuneration

28. Among the 50 Members who have responded to this part of the survey, 68% (34 Members) have no specific views, and 32% (16 Members)

¹² LegCo Members who also serve on the Executive Council receives two-thirds of the remuneration of other LegCo Members.

-

consider that the remuneration of LegCo Members should be increased. Eleven of these 16 Members consider that in determining the level of Members' remuneration, reference should be made to that of politically-appointed officials¹³ or directorate officers in the civil service. Among the 11 Members, 7 Members have also expressed the view that Members with other remunerated work should receive a different level of remuneration.¹⁴

(B) Medical allowance

- 29. A total of 54 Members have responded to this part of the survey. 35% (19 Members) of them have provided views on this issue:
 - (a) the level of medical allowance should be set with reference to the age of Members, so as to ensure that Members of different age strata have adequate resources to take out medical insurance which meets their needs (7 Members);
 - (b) it is suggested that group medical insurance be arranged for Members (5 Members);
 - (c) the medical allowance should be provided to Members on a term basis instead of an annual basis to enable Members to have more flexibility in using the allowance and to cater for unforeseen circumstances (5 Members);
 - (d) the medical allowance should be increased by 10-15% (1 Member); and
 - (e) making reference to the relevant arrangements in universities, the medical allowance should also cover a Member's direct relatives (1 Member).

(C) Gratuity

30. Among the 50 Members who have responded to this part of the survey, 98% (49 Members) have no specific view on the level of gratuity for Members. One Member is of the view that as the gratuity is for Members' retirement protection, it should be non-taxable; alternatively the level of gratuity should be increased to offset the tax payment.

Proposals include setting LegCo Members' remuneration at 30%-50% of that of a Director of Bureau ("DoB"); and making reference to the remuneration of a Deputy Director of Bureau in determining Members' remuneration. There is also a view that Members' remuneration be adjusted annually according to civil service pay adjustment for senior officers or CPI(C), whichever is the higher.

These Members have suggested that LegCo Members should receive 50% of the remuneration of a DoB, while Members with remuneration from other work which exceeds the remuneration of Members by 5% to 10% should receive 30% of the remuneration of a DoB.

ADVICE SOUGHT

- 31. Members are invited to note that:
 - (a) based on the outcome of an earlier consultation with all Members, the majority of all LegCo Members have indicated support for the proposal to adopt a weighted index as the basis for annual adjustment of Members' OOER (paragraph 3 refers); and
 - (b) other than the proposal on weighted index, based on the findings of the recent survey, there is no majority view among Members (i.e. 35 Members or more) on other proposals.
- 32. In the light of (a) and (b) above, members are invited to advise whether apart from the proposal on weighted index, the Subcommittee should put forward any other proposals to the Administration for consideration by the Independent Commission.

Complaints and Resources Management Division Legislative Council Secretariat May 2019

QUESTIONNAIRE (to be completed by all Members)

(please return on or before 22 February 2019)

Ref: AM 12/01/19 (16-20)

To: Ms Amy YU

Clerk to Subcommittee on Members' Remuneration and Operating Expenses Reimbursement Legislative Council Secretariat

(Fax: 2521 7518)

Subcommittee on Members' Remuneration and Operating Expenses Reimbursement

Review of Members' Remuneration and Operating Expenses Reimbursement for Members of the Seventh Legislative Council

Part I - Operating Expenses Reimbursement

(A) Office Operation Expenses Reimbursement - staff expenses

Under the existing reimbursement arrangements, each Legislative Council ("LegCo") Member is provided with an annual accountable provision of Office Operation Expenses Reimbursement ("OOER") for reimbursing Members' office operation expenses such as staffing expenses, office accommodation expenses, expenses on publicity items, etc. OOER is subject to annual adjustment in October in accordance with the movement of Consumer Price Index (C) ("CPI(C)"). Any surplus from a year's OOER can be rolled over to the following year until the end of a LegCo term. Currently, the ceiling of OOER is \$2,703,390 per annum (i.e. \$225,282 per month). Based on the utilization rates of OOER in the previous LegCo terms, a Member on average deploys about 70% of OOER on staff expenses (i.e. \$157,698 per month based on the current level of OOER). According to the findings of the survey conducted by the former Subcommittee formed in the Fifth LegCo in March 2015, the number of full-time staff¹ and part-time staff² employed by Members ranged from 3 to 20 and 0 to 11 respectively, with an average of 9 full-time staff and 2 part-time staff.

To assess the amount of resources required for recruiting and retaining a team of quality staff to support the work of a LegCo Member and the adequacy of the current level of OOER for meeting Members' staff expenses, Members are invited to provide relevant information on their actual staffing support during the second reimbursement year of the current term (i.e. from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018) in Question 1 below; and their views on the optimal staffing support required for effectively discharging their LegCo duties in Question 2 below.

¹ Full-time staff refer to those who work 30 hours or more per week.

² Part-time staff refer to those who work less than 30 hours per week.

QUESTION 1: Please provide details of all the staff employed by you (including those not funded by Members' operating expenses reimbursements) during the second reimbursement year (i.e. from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018) in the two tables below.

(a) Full-time staff employed for the period from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018

Staff	Post title		Remur	neration		Educ	ation	Total years	Years of
employed		Monthly	Annual pay	Year-end	End-of-service	University	Below	of work	service in
during the		salary	adjustment,	bonus /	gratuity,	or above	university	experience	Member's
period		\$	if any %	double pay, if any	if any %	(pls tick)	(pls tick)		office
		Ф	70	s \$	70	(pis tick)	(pis tick)		
1 st									
2 nd									
3 rd									
4 th									
5 th									
6 th									
7^{th}									
8 th									
9 th									
10 th									

(If space is insufficient, please provide the information in a separate sheet.)

(b) Part-time staff employed for the period from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018

Staff	Post title		Remun	Education		Total years	Years of		
employed		Monthly	Annual pay	Year-end	End-of-service	e University Below		of work	service in
during the		salary	adjustment,	bonus /	gratuity,	or above	university	experience	Member's
period			if any	double pay,	if any				office
		\$	%	if any	%	(pls tick)	(pls tick)		
				\$					
1^{st}									
2^{nd}									
$3^{\rm rd}$									
(TC :					1 1				

(If space is insufficient, please provide the information in a separate sheet.)

In working out the level of OOER for LegCo Members of the Sixth LegCo, one of the working assumptions adopted by the Independent Commission on Remuneration for Members of the Executive Council and the Legislature, and Officials under the Political Appointment System of HKSAR was that each Member would employ 7 full-time staff, comprising 1 at management/professional level, 2 degree-holders with three to five years' work experience, and 4 clerical support staff, with salaries comparable with those of workers of similar qualifications and experience in the private sector. Members are invited to indicate their views on the optimal staffing support in their offices.

QUESTION 2: To effectively discharge my role and responsibilities as a LegCo Member, I consider that the **optimal staffing complement** in my offices and the pay packages which are competitive enough to retain the service of my staff should be:

			Pay package for Member's staff						
Category	Total	Minimum	Minimum	Double	End-of	Other benefits			
	number of	relevant	monthly	pay/year-end	service	(Yes/No)			
	staff	work	salary for	bonus	gratuity	If yes, please			
	required*	experience	each staff	(Yes/No)	(Yes/No)	specify nature			
		required	\$	If yes, please	If yes,	and amount			
				specify	please				
				amount (\$)	specify %				
(I) Full-time staff									
(a) Staff at managerial									
/professional level									
(b) Degree holders									
below managerial									
level									
ie vei									
(c) Clerical support									
staff									
Staff									
(1) Others			+						
(d) Others									
(please specify)									
(II) Part-time staff									

(*Can be zero for any category.)

(B) Office Operation Expenses Reimbursement - district offices

Based on the utilization rates of OOER in the previous LegCo terms, a Member on average deploys about 7% to 10% of OOER on office accommodation expenses³ (i.e. about \$15,770 to \$22,528 per month based on the current level of OOER). According to the reimbursement claims submitted by Members in June 2016, the average number of district offices (excluding the central office in the LegCo Complex) operated by each Member in the Fifth LegCo ranged from 0 to 4.2, with an average of 1.6.

To facilitate the Subcommittee's review of the resources required by Members for operation of district offices, Members are invited to provide relevant information covering the second reimbursement year of the current term (i.e. from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018) in Questions 3 to 5 below; and their views on the optimal number of district offices required for effectively discharging their LegCo duties in Question 6 below.

QUESTION 3 : The average number of district offices (excluding the central office in
the LegCo Complex) operated by me during the period from 1 October 2017 to
30 September 2018 was (regardless of whether the expenses involved were funded
by Members' OOER). Of these district offices, was/were leased from the Housing
Authority, from Link REIT, and from private landlords.
QUESTION 4 : The total district office rental expenses incurred by me during the period from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018 was \$
QUESTION 5 : Please indicate whether the total district office rental expenses incurred by you in 2017-2018 as stated in your answer to Question 4 above were fully funded by Members' OOER.
Yes. The office rental expenses were fully funded by Members' OOER.
No. Only \$ of the total rental expenses stated in my answer to Question 4 were funded by Members' OOER.
<u>QUESTION 6</u> : I consider that the optimum number of district offices (excluding the central office) required for effectively discharging my role and responsibilities as a LegCo Member should be

(C) Staff turnover in Members' offices

OTTEGETORI A

According to the findings of the survey conducted by the former Subcommittee formed in the Fifth LegCo in March 2015, the average turnover rate of Members' full-time staff in the 2013-2014 legislative year was 16%. To ascertain the latest staff turnover information, Members are invited to provide relevant information covering the first two reimbursement years of the current term (i.e. from 1 October 2016 to 30 September 2017 and from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018) in Questions 7 and 8 below.

Accommodation expenses include rental expenses, rates, government rents, management fees and utility charges.

For a joint district office, please indicate your shared portion. For example, if a LegCo Member shares a district office with another LegCo Member on a 50:50 basis, it should be counted as 0.5 office.

QUESTION 7: The average number of staff employed by me and the number of staff who left during the periods from 1 October 2016 to 30 September 2017 and from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018 were:

	2016	5-2017	2017-2018		
	Average	Number of staff	Average	Number of staff	
	number of staff	left	number of staff	left	
	employed		employed		
Full-time staff					
Part-time staff					

QUESTION 8: Details of the staff who left during the period from 1 October 2016 to 30 September 2018 are provided in the two tables below.

(a) Staff who left during the period from 1 October 2016 to 30 September 2017

Staff	Post title	Remuneration			Education		Total years Years of		Reasons for	
employed		Monthly	Annual pay	Year-end	End-of-service	University	Below	of work	service in	leaving
during the		salary	adjustment,	bonus /	gratuity,	or above	university	experience	Member's	(*pls mark
period			if any	double pay,	if any				office	the relevant
		\$	%	if any	%	(pls tick)	(pls tick)			numbers)
(I) Full-	time staff			\$						
1 st	unic stan									
1										
- nd										
2 nd										
3 rd										
4 th										
-										
~th										
5 th										
(II) Part	t-time staff									
1 st										
2 nd										
3 rd										
3										
4 th										
5 th										

(if space is insufficient, please provide the information in a separate sheet)

(b) Staff who left during the period from 1 October 2017 to 30 September 2018

Staff	Post title Remuneration					Educa	ation	Total years Years of		Reasons for
employed during the period		Monthly salary	Annual pay adjustment, if any	Year-end bonus / double pay,	End-of-service gratuity, if any	University or above	Below university	of work	service in Member's office	leaving (*pls mark the relevant
		\$	%	if any	%	(pls tick)	(pls tick)		omee	numbers)
(I) Full-	time staff									
1 st										
2 nd										
3 rd										
4 th										
5 th										
(II) Part	t-time staff									
1 st										
2 nd										
3 rd										
4 th										
5 th										

(if space is insufficient, please provide the information in a separate sheet)

* Reasons for leaving : (can choose more than one reason)

- (1) find a job with better pay
- (2) find a job with better prospect
- (3) find a job with better working hours
- (4) find a job with different job nature
- (5) long working hours
- (6) great work pressure
- (7) undesirable work environment
- (8) lack of job security
- (9) pursue further study
- (10) family reason
- (11) work for another Member
- (12) dismissal due to performance, misconduct, etc
- (13) other reasons (pls specify)

(D) Entertainment and Travelling Expenses Reimbursement

At present, an annual provision of Entertainment and Travelling Expenses Reimbursement ("ETER") is provided to each LegCo Member. Entertainment, liaison and travelling expenses incurred by a Member or his/her staff in or outside Hong Kong for LegCo business can be reimbursed against claims certified by the Member without supporting documents. Up to 50% of ETER can be deployed for meeting staff expenses, but the portion so deployed will be accountable. The ceiling for ETER is adjusted annually in October in accordance with the movement of CPI(C). Following the latest price adjustment with effect from 1 October 2018, the amount of ETER is \$215,910 per annum. The overall average utilization rates of ETER per Member in the Fifth LegCo and the first reimbursement year of the Sixth LegCo (i.e. 2016-2017) were about 96.7% and 97.9% respectively. Members are invited to give views on the current level of ETER.

QUESTION 9: Please indicate whether you consider that the current level of ETER is adequate for covering the entertainment, liaison and travelling expenses incurred by Members and their staff in or outside Hong Kong in performing their LegCo duties.

I consider that the current level of ETER is adequate.
I consider that the amount of ETER provided to each LegCo Member should be increased from \$215,910 to \$ per annum (or by%).
I have no comment.

Part II - Members' Remuneration

LegCo Members are provided with a monthly remuneration, an annual accountable medical allowance and an end-of-service gratuity pitched at 15% of the total remuneration received by a Member during a LegCo term. Members' monthly remuneration and the medical allowance are adjusted annually in October in accordance with the movement of CPI(C). After the latest CPI(C) adjustment on 1 October 2018, the remuneration of Members is \$98,540 per month and the medical allowance is \$34,320 per annum. Any unused medical allowance in a year can be carried forward to the following year until the end of a LegCo term. The overall average utilization rates of medical allowance per Member in the Fifth LegCo and the first reimbursement year of the Sixth LegCo (i.e. 2016-2017) were about 55.5% and 61.2% respectively.

ESTION 10 : You are invited to indicate whether you have any views on the level of monthly remuneration of LegCo Members.
I have no specific view.
I have the following views on the level of the monthly remuneration of LegCo Members:
(If space is insufficient, please provide the information in a separate sheet.)
ESTION 11 : You are invited to indicate whether you have any views on the level of medical allowance provided to LegCo Members.
I have no specific view.
I have the following views on the level of the medical allowance provided to LegCo Members:
(If space is insufficient, please provide the information in a separate sheet.)
ESTION 12 : You are invited to indicate whether you have any views on the rate of uity of LegCo Members.
I have no specific view.
I have the following views on the rate of gratuity of LegCo Members:
(If space is insufficient, please provide the information in a separate sheet.)

Part III - Other Comments

Other comments, if any:		
(If space is insufficient, pleas	e provide the information in	a separate sheet.)
of Members' Remuner of the Seventh LegCo.	ation and Operating The Secretariat may	n will be used for the conduct of the review Expenses Reimbursement for Members contact (name of the (telephone number) for enquiries on the
	Signature	:
	Name of Member	:
	Name of contact pers	
	Date	

Appendix II

Summary of findings of the survey on number of staff employed by Members

Number of responding Members: 49

		Number of staff employed by Members											
Method by which Members are returned Functional Constituencies ("FC")			Council ad) FC		aphical uencies	Overall							
	Full-time Part-time		Full-time	Part-time	Full-time	Part-time	Full-time	Part-time					
	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff	staff					
Range ¹	3-12	0-3	6-12	2-6	5-16	0-11	3-16	0-11					
Average ¹	5.8	1.1	9.0	3.3	9.4	3.5	8.0	2.6					

A Member returned by Geographical Constituencies submitted a return indicating that 9 staff are jointly employed by him and other Members. These 9 staff are excluded in calculating the range of staff employed but included in calculating the average number of full-time staff for Members returned by Geographical Constituencies.

Staff employed by Members and turnover rates of Members' staff (2017-2018)

Member	Number	of staff emp Members	oloyed by	Number of	of Members	s' staff left	Turnover rate of full-time	Turnover rate of part-time
	Full-time	Part-time	Total	Full-time	Part-time	Total	staff	staff
Functions	l Constitue							
(1)	3	0	3	0	0	0	0.0%	N/A
(2)	7	2	9	0	0	0	0.0%	0%
(3)	5	0	5	0	0	0	0.0%	N/A
(4)	7	0	7	0	0	0	0.0%	N/A
(5)	5	0	5	0	0	0	0.0%	N/A
(6)	4	0	4	0	0	0	0.0%	N/A
(7)	6	2	8	0	0	0	0.0%	0%
(8)	3	3	6	0	0	0	0.0%	0%
(9)	3	1	4	0	1	1	0.0%	100.0%
(10)	4	3	7	0	2	2	0.0%	66.7%
(11)	6	0	6	1	0	1	16.7%	N/A
(12)	5	1	6	1	0	1	20.0%	0%
(13)	5	2	7	1	1	2	20.0%	50.0%
(14)	5	1	6	1	0	1	20.0%	0%
(15)	9	0	9	2	0	2	22.2%	N/A
(16)	7	0	7	2	0	2	28.6%	N/A
(17)	9	3	12	3	2	5	33.3%	66.7%
(18)	6	1	7	2	0	2	33.3%	0%
(19)	12	2	14	5	0	5	41.7%	0%
, ,		nd) function		_	U	3	41./ 70	U 70
(20)	6	6	12	0	2	2	0.0%	33.3%
(21)	11	2	13	2	0	2	18.2%	0%
(22)	12	2	14	3	0	3	25.0%	0%
(23)	7	3	10	2	0	2	28.6%	0%
, ,		_	10	Δ	U	2	28.0%	U 70
	ical Constit		8	0	0	0	0%	00/
(24)	8	3	11	0	0	0	0%	0%
, ,	7	4	11	0	0	0		
(26)	6	3	9	0	0	0	0%	0%
(27)							0%	0%
(28)	11	0	11	0	0	0	0%	N/A
(29)	9	3	12	0	1	1	0%	33.3%
(30)	9	9	18	0	0	0	0%	0%
(31)	9	1	10	0	1	1	0%	100.0%
(32)	13	4	17	1	1	2	7.7%	25.0%
(33)	10	0	10	1	0	1	10.0%	N/A
(34)	9	2	11	1	0	1	11.1%	0%
(35)	9	0	9	1	0	1	11.1%	N/A
(36)	8	5	13	1	1	2	12.5%	20.0%
(37)	8	1	9	1	0	1	12.5%	0%
(38)	7	0	7	1	0	1	14.3%	N/A
(39)	6	3	9	1	0	1	16.7%	0%
(40)	5	0	5	1	0	1	20.0%	N/A
(41)	9	11	20	2	4	6	22.2%	36.4%
(42)	14	2	16	4	1	5	28.6%	50.0%
(43)	10	3	13	3	1	4	30.0%	33.3%
(44) No. 4	10	10	20	3	1	4	30.0%	10.0%
(44) Note	9	0	9	3	0	3	33.3%	0%
(45)	6	5	11	2	1	3	33.3%	20.0%
(46)	7	5	12	3	1	4	42.9%	20.0%
(47)	16	5	21	7	4	11	43.8%	80.0%
(48)	9	0	9	4	0	4	44.4%	N/A
(49)	13	11	24	6	4	10	46.2%	36.4%
	Total: 391	Total: 125	Total: 516	Total: 71	Total: 29	Total: 100	Average: 18.2%	Average: 23.2%

Note: These are the staff jointly employed by Member (44) and other Members.

Summary of findings of the survey on the salary ranges of full-time staff employed by Members

Based on the returns of 49 Members, the salary ranges of the 391 full-time staff employed by these Members are summarized below:

	Number of full-time staff employed by Members									
Method by which Members are returned	Functional Constituencies ("FC")		District Council (second) FC		Geographical Constituencies		Overall			
Salary range	Number	%	Number	%	Number	%	Number	%		
\$5,000 to less than \$10,000	0	0	1	2.8	3	1.2	4	1.0		
\$10,000 to less than \$15,000	14	12.6	18	50.0	93	38.1	125	31.9		
\$15,000 to less than \$20,000	23	20.7	12	33.4	80	32.8	115	29.4		
\$20,000 to less than \$25,000	31	28.0	1	2.8	34	13.9	66	16.9		
\$25,000 to less than \$30,000	14	12.6	2	5.5	10	4.1	26	6.7		
\$30,000 to less than \$35,000	6	5.4	0	0	7	2.9	13	3.3		
\$35,000 to less than \$40,000	7	6.3	2	5.5	7	2.9	16	4.1		
\$40,000 or above	16	14.4	0	0	10	4.1	26	6.7		
Total	111	100	36	100	244	100	391	100		

 ${\bf Appendix} \ V$ Details of findings relating to Members' full-time staff who left in 2017-2018

Salary range	Full-time staff	%	Part-time staff	%
Less than \$5,000	0	0.0	6	20.7
\$5,000 to less than \$10,000	0	0.0	11	37.9
\$10,000 to less than \$15,000	28	39.5	4	13.9
\$15,000 to less than \$20,000	26	36.6	1	3.4
\$20,000 to less than \$25,000	8	11.3	0	0.0
\$25,000 to less than \$30,000	3	4.2	0	0.0
\$30,000 to less than \$35,000	2	2.8	0	0.0
\$35,000 to less than \$40,000	1	1.4	0	0.0
\$40,000 or above	3	4.2	1	3.4
Hourly rate	0	0.0	5	17.3
Not specified	0	0.0	1	3.4
Total	71	100.0	29	100.0

Annual pay adjustment	Full-time staff	%	Part-time staff	%
Less than 5%	18	25.4	6	20.7
5% to less than 10%	10	14.1	0	0.0
10% to less than 15%	0	0.0	0	0.0
15% or above	2	2.8	0	0.0
Not specified	41	57.7	23	79.3
Total	71	100.0	29	100.0

Education	Full-time staff	%	Part-time staff	%
University or above	47	66.2	14	48.3
Below university	15	21.1	9	31.0
Not specified	9	12.7	6	20.7
Total	71	100.0	29	100.0

Total years of working experience	Full-time staff	%	Part-time staff	%
Less than 5	19	26.8	8	27.6
5 to less than 10	8	11.3	2	6.9
10 to less than 15	7	9.8	1	3.4
15 to less than 20	0	0.0	0	0.0
20 or above	3	4.2	7	24.2
Not specified	34	47.9	11	37.9
Total	71	100.0	29	100.0

Years of service in Member's office	Full-time staff	%	Part-time staff	%
Less than 1	14	19.7	11	37.9
1 to less than 2	23	32.4	7	24.2
2 to less than 3	6	8.5	3	10.3
3 to less than 5	3	4.2	1	3.4
5 to less than 8	5	7.0	2	6.9
8 to less than 10	0	0.0	0	0.0
10 or above	1	1.4	0	0.0
Not specified	19	26.8	5	17.3
Total	71	100.0	29	100.0

Reasons for leaving	Full-time staff	Part-time staff
(1) find a job with better pay	16	2
(2) find a job with better prospect	22	1
(3) find a job with better working hours	6	0
(4) find a job with different job nature	10	1
(5) long working hours	7	0
(6) great work pressure	8	0
(7) undesirable working environment	4	0
(8) lack of job security	5	0
(9) pursue further study	7	8
(10) family reason	7	1
(11) work for another Member	6	2
(12) dismissal due to performance, misconduct, etc	0	0
(13) other reasons	18	14
Not specified	4	1
Total	120 ¹	30 ¹

 $^{^{1}\,\,}$ Some Members' staff have more than one reason for leaving.

Summary of findings of the survey on optimal staffing complement in Members' offices

Number of responding Members: 39

	Optimal number of full-time staff required by Members											
Method by which Members are returned	Riincfional Constituencies			District Council (second) FC		Geogra	ncies	s Overall				
	Managerial/	Degree holders	Clerical	Managerial/	Degree holders	Clerical	Managerial/	Degree holders	Clerical	Managerial/	Degree holders	Clerical
	professional	below managerial	support	professional	below managerial	support	professional	below managerial	support	professional	below managerial	support
	level	level	and other	level	level	and other	level	level	and other	level	level	and other
			staff			staff			staff			staff
Range	0-4	1-8	0-3.5	2	5-8	0-5	1-4	1-15	0-10	0-4	1-15	0-10
Average	1.4	3.5	1.7	2.0	7.0	4.0	2.3	5.7	3.9	1.9	4.8	2.9

Optimal staffing complement in Members' offices and funding required

	Optimal staffing complement in Members' offices and funding required							,							
Member	Full-time staff at managerial/ professional level	Full-time staff who are degree holders below managerial level	Full-time clerical support staff	Other full-time staff	Total full-time staff required	Part-time staff required	Minimum monthly salary of (A)	Minimum monthly salary of (B)	Minimum monthly salary of (C)	Minimum monthly salary of (D)	Minimum monthly salary of (F)	Other benefits that should be provided to (A)	Amount required per month for full-time staff at managerial/ professional level and those who are degree holders below managerial level	Amount required per month for full- time clerical support staff, other full-time staff and part-time staff	Total amount required per month for maintaining an optimal staffing complement
	A	В	С	D	E	F	G	Н	I	J	K	L	M	N	0
Functiona	al Constitue	encies													
(1)	-	3	-	-	3	-		28,779				medical allowance and study allowance	86,337	0	86,337
(2)	1	1	1	1	4	-	53,000	30,000	10,000	10,000		Double pay	83,000	20,000	103,000
(3)	1	3	-	1	5	-	45,000	25,000		15,000		Double pay, bonus and medical allowance	120,000	15,000	135,000
(4)	1	3	-	-	4	1	55,000	15,500			23,500		119,500	23,500	143,000
(5)	1	3	2	-	6	-	50,000	30,000	20,000			Double pay and gratuity 15%	140,000	40,000	180,000
(6)	1	3	2	-	6	-	50,000	30,000	20,000			Double pay and gratuity 15%	140,000	40,000	180,000
(7)	2	7	3.5	-	12.5	1.5	20,000	14,000	10,000		6,000	Double pay and medical allowance	138,000	44,000	182,000
(8)	2	2	2	-	6	-	45,000	30,000	20,000			Gratuity 10% and medical allowance	150,000	40,000	190,000
(9)	1	3	2	1	7	-	45,000	30,000	20,000	15,000			135,000	55,000	190,000
(10)	1	4	2	-	7	2	50,000	25,000	20,000		10,000	Double pay, gratuity 15% and medical allowance	150,000	60,000	210,000
(11)	2	4	-	-	6	1	40,000	30,000			10,000	Double pay and gratuity	200,000	10,000	210,000
(12)	4	4	-	-	8	2	35,000	19,000			6,000	Double pay, bonus, medical allowance, travelling allowance and study allowance	216,000	12,000	228,000
(13)	1	3	3	1	8	1.5	45,000	30,000	19,000	18,000	15,000	Double pay and gratuity 10-15%	135,000	97,500	232,500
(13)	2	8	-	-	10	2	25,000	20,000			10,000	Double pay, gratuity 15%, medical allowance and study allowance	210,000	25,000	235,000
(15)	1	4	1	-	6	-	60,000	40,000	25,000			Double pay and medical allowance	220,000	25,000	245,000
(16)	2	2	3	3	10	3	25,000	18,000	18,000	18,000	\$800/day	Double pay, bonus, gratuity 10-15%, medical allowance and study allowance	86,000	Note	
(17)	1	2	1	-	4	1	Note					Double pay	Note	Note	
	District Council (second) functional constituency														
(18)	2	5	2	2	11	-	38,000	25,000	18,000	35,000		Gratuity 10% and medical allowance	201,000	106,000	307,000
(19)	2	8	5	-	15	5	30,000	20,000	15,000			Double pay, gratuity 10% and medical allowance	232,143	122,143	354,286
(20)	2	8	2	1	13	2	40,000	25,000	15,000	20,000	10,000	Gratuity 10% and medical allowance	287,143	72,143	359,286
	Geographical Constituencies														
(21)	2	3	1	-	6	1	18,000	17,000	12,000		8,000	Double pay and medical allowance	87,000	20,000	107,000
(22)	2	2	2	-	6	-	18,000	18,000	18,000			Double pay and gratuity	72,000	36,000	108,000
(23)	2	5.5	1.5	-	9	-	35,000	15,000	15,000			Gratuity 10-15% and medical allowance	152,500	22,500	175,000
(24)	2	2	2	1	7	2	30,000	30,000	13,000	13,000	10,000	Double pay, gratuity 15% and medical allowance	120,000	59,000	179,000
(25)	2	2	4	-	8	-	40,000	25,000	15,000		0.000		130,000	60,000	190,000
(26)	1	2	8	-	11	4	30,000	20,000	11,000			Double pay, gratuity 5-6.7% and medical allowance	70,000	120,000	190,000
(27)	2	4	2	-	8	2	35,000	20,000	18,000			Double pay, gratuity 10% and medical allowance	150,000	46,240	196,240
(28)	2	4	2	-	8	3	40,000	20,000	14,000			Double pay, gratuity 15% and bonus	160,000	38,500	198,500
(29)	2 2 5	1	2	-	5	4	25,000	30,000	20,000	10.000	20,000	Bonus Double rouged medical allowerses	80,000	120,000	200,000
(30)	2.5	6	1	2	11.5	- 1	25,000	22,000	18,000	18,000	10.000	Double pay and medical allowance	194,500	54,000	248,500
(31)	4	8	2	- 1	14	1	20,000	18,000	15,000	22.000		Medical allowance	224,000	40,000	264,000
(32)	1	10	4	1	16	3	35,000	16,000	14,500	22,000	4,950	Double pay, gratuity 10% and medical allowance	195,000	94,850	289,850
(33)	2 2 5	5	2	8	17	2	40,000	15,000	12,000	13,000		Gratuity 10% and medical allowance	155,000	136,000	291,000
(34)	2.5	9	1.5	-	13	2	35,000	18,000	16,000			Double pay, gratuity 15%, medical allowance and travelling allowance	249,500	44,000	293,500
(35)	4	9	2	-	15	6	26,000	15,000	13,000			Double pay, gratuity 10% and medical allowance	256,143	40,143	296,286
(36)	2	6	10	-	9	2	45,000	30,000	15,000		!	Double pay and medical allowance	270,000	35,000	305,000
(37)	2	11	10	-	23	5	40,000	20,000	13,000			Gratuity 10%	312,143	147,143	459,286
(38)	4	15	8	7	27	4	35,000	20,000	15,000	12 000		Gratuity 10% and medical allowance	452,143	142,143	594,286
(39)	2	3	-	,	12	3	20,000	18,000		13,000	\$50/nour	Bonus and medical allowance	94,000	Note	222 107
Average	1.9	4.8	2.2	0.7	9.6	1.7									232,107

[☐] Government funding provision of \$157,698 per month is insufficient to meet the expenses required.

Note: These Members did not provide views on the remerunation package that should be provided to full-time staff or the amount required for retaining part-time staff.

Details of district offices operated by Members in 2017-2018 and the number of district offices required by Members

	I	District offices currently opera			
Member	Number	Annual office rental expenses (\$)	Fully covered by Office operation expenses reimbursement (Yes/No)	Number of district offices required by Members	
Functional Constituencie	es				
(1)	1.25	81,600	Yes	5	
(2)	2	94,200	Yes	Not specified	
(3)	1	144,000	Yes	Not specified	
(4)	1	277,485	Yes	Not specified	
(5)	2	343,800	Yes	3	
(6)	3	351,000	Yes	6	
(7)	3	208,800	No	Not specified	
(8)	1	Not specified	No	2	
(9)	0	0	N/A	3	
(10)	0	0	N/A	2	
(11)	0	0	N/A	0	
(12)	0	0	N/A	Not specified	
(13)	0	0	N/A	Not specified	
(14)	0	0	N/A	Not specified	
(15)	0	0	N/A	Not specified	
(16)	0	0	N/A	Not specified	
(17)	0	0	N/A	Not specified	
District Council (second)	0		W	4	
(18)	2	108,000	Yes	4	
(19)	1	146,400	Yes	2 3	
(20)	9	155,760	Yes	_	
(21)	_	Not specified	No	Not specified	
Geographical Constituen		48,060	Yes	4	
(22)	0.7	96,000	Yes	3	
(23)	1	102,267	Yes	Not specified	
(25)	3	160,400	Yes	Not specified 5	
(26)	2	172,800	Yes	3	
(27)	2	187,200	Yes	Not specified	
(28)	2	189,150	Yes	3	
(29)	3.2	194,040	Yes	Not specified	
(30)	1.5	204,150	Yes	3	
(31)	3.05	247,800	Yes	3	
(32)	3.03	252,672	Yes	Not specified	
(33)	3	276,000	Yes	2	
(34)	2	277,800	Yes	3	
(35)	4.2	278,835	Yes	6	
(36)	4	309,500	Yes	Not specified	
(37)	6	327,120	Yes	8	
(38)	4	370,955	Yes	Not specified	
(39)	4	711,115	Yes	5	
(40)	2	59,196	No	4	
(41)	3	208,800	No	Not specified	
(42)	2.83	240,200	No	10	
(43)	2	363,600	No	2	
(44)	5	396,600	No	4	
(45)	8	507,000	No	8	
(46)	2	663,000	No	6	
(47)	2	Not specified	No	9	
Average – per Member	2.3	198,984 (excluding those not specifying the office rental expenses)	N/A	4.2 (excluding those not specifying the number of district offices required)	
Average – per office		92,424			

Summary of other views given by Members relating to operating expense reimbursement arrangements

- (a) The level of annual expenses reimbursement should be increased. An additional accountable allowance for engaging outside parties to conduct policy research should be made available to Members (7 Members);¹
- (b) The level of office operation expenses reimbursement ("OOER") provided to Members returned by Geographical Constituencies ("GC") should be higher than that returned by Functional Constituencies ("FC") (excluding those returned by District Council (second) FC), having regard to the large number of constituents served by these Members (2 Members²);
- (c) Expenses incurred by Members on activities for socializing and building up ties with local communities should be reimbursable (1 Member); and
- (d) Under the existing arrangements, when a Member ceases office, he may purchase the capital items he has acquired with operating expenses reimbursement ("OER") at depreciated value as determined by the Secretariat. Consideration should be given to allowing serving Members to purchase obsolete capital items they have procured with OER at a value determined by the Secretariat³ (4 Members).

Such a proposal had been submitted by the former Subcommittees formed in the Fourth Legislative Council ("LegCo") and Fifth LegCo to the Administration for consideration. In response to the view of the Independent Commission that a more appropriate way forward in addressing the research needs of Members was for the LegCo Secretariat to augment its research capabilities to provide better support to Members, the Administration had provided additional resources to the LegCo Secretariat to provide research services to individual Members since the Sixth LegCo;

One of the Members has suggested that the amount of OOER for GC Members should be increased to \$400,000 per month.

Under the existing guidelines for reimbursement of Members' OER, when a Member ceases office, he/she is required to return to the Secretariat those capital items for which reimbursement of expenses has been claimed. Outgoing, returning or incoming Members may purchase these capital items at depreciated value. An outgoing Member has the first option to purchase his/her capital items. While serving Members may return capital items acquired with OER to the Secretariat, they may not purchase such items.