

To: panel\_dev <panel\_dev@legco.gov.hk>

From: Vann Cheng

Date: 07/03/2017 05:10PM

Subject: Re: 立法會發展事務委員會：2017年3月10日的特別會議  
supplement to my opinion

Dear Sir/Madam,

I would like to enhance my opinion as opposition to the reclamation of Ma Liu Shui. As you see from the attachment p.158, (which I copied from the book - "Challenges for an Evolving City" written by Professor Ho Pui Yin), the last paragraph: **the reclamation had to allow for the funnelling effect when narrowing the inlet of the valley, as it could aggravate flooding. The Development Division thus advised that the reclamation be commenced at a wider section of the inlet of the Sha Tin Valley. Fo Tan was selected as the limit of the main reclamation along the valley.** This is a crucial point that the government must consider the reclamation of Ma Liu Shui!

Thanks for your attention.

Yours sincerely,

Cheng Yuk kam Vann

be held on the reclamation method and fill material used.

The feasibility report prepared by the Development Division pointed out that the major difficulty involved in Sha Tin reclamation was the frequent occurrences of storm surge along the shores of Tolo Harbour during the passage of typhoons. The most severe typhoons, such as those passing through Hong Kong in 1874, 1906 and 1937, had triggered storm surges in Tolo Harbour. The most destructive storm surge occurred took place when Typhoon Wanda lashed Hong Kong between 30 August and 2 September 1962. The Sha Tin Market was overwhelmed with floodwaters within a short period of time, which resulted in the loss of 150 lives<sup>214</sup>. Along the shores of Hong Kong Island, the water level usually rose to a maximum of 13 feet above PD, but could touch 16 feet above PD during a typhoon. When Tolo Harbour was hit by the most severe typhoon, it was possible for the general water level to rise to 21 feet above PD, a full eight feet higher than the 13-foot level registered along the shores of Hong Kong Island during high tides. And the wave crest level could even rise to 25 feet above PD. On 1 September 1962, in the midst of the onslaught by Typhoon Wanda, the highest water level reached in Sha Tin was only 16.5 feet. The town centre was already immersed in floodwaters even at this relatively low level. To afford absolute protection at all locations against storm surge, the reclamation would have to be implemented on the basis of a maximum water level of 25 feet; but the project cost would escalate drastically. Eventually, the Acting Director of Public Works proposed level of 16 feet for the reclamation, four feet higher than the existing level. It was also recommended that a wavebreak, up to a height of 20 feet above PD, be built along the front of the seawalls and other high-risk areas. The government was also advised to build a tidal model based on the tidal surge conditions in Tolo Harbour for in-depth studies. In addition, the reclamation had to allow for the funnelling effect when narrowing the inlet of the valley, as it could aggravate flooding. The Development Division thus advised that the reclamation be commenced at a wider section of the inlet of the Sha Tin Valley. Fo Tan was selected as the limit of the main reclamation along the valley.