

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1)407/16-17  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/1/16

**Panel on Environmental Affairs**

**Subcommittee on Refuse Collection and Resource Recovery**

**Minutes of the second meeting  
held on Tuesday, 13 December 2016, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Tanya CHAN (Chairman)  
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick

**Members absent** : Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung

**Public Officers attending** : **For item II**  
  
Mrs Vicki KWOK  
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2)  
Environmental Protection Department

Mr WONG Hon-meng  
Assistant Director (Waste Reduction and Recycling)  
Environmental Protection Department

Mr FORK Ping-lam  
Assistant Director (Operations) 3  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Angel SHEK  
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

**Staff in attendance :** Mr Kari CHU  
Chief Council Researcher 2

Mr CHEUNG Chi-fai  
Senior Council Researcher 6

Mr Joey LO  
Senior Council Secretary (1)8

Miss Mandy POON  
Legislative Assistant (1)1

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes**

(LC Paper No. CB(1)237/16-17 — Minutes of the meeting held on  
15 November 2016)

The minutes of the meeting held on 15 November 2016 were confirmed.

**II. Measures and initiatives to promote and support waste reduction, source separation, and collection of roadside recyclables in Hong Kong**

(LC Paper No. CB(1)251/16-17(01) — Administration's paper on  
"Measures to promote and support waste reduction, source separation, and collection of roadside recyclables"

Relevant paper

LC Paper No. CB(1)121/16-17(01) — Background brief prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat)

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at the **Annex**).

Follow-up actions required of the Administration

3. The Administration was requested to provide the following information:

Admin

*Composition of municipal solid waste*

- (a) composition of municipal solid waste ("MSW") disposed of at landfills from 2010 to 2015 based on the Government's annual waste statistics published in "Monitoring of Solid Waste in Hong Kong", with breakdown of the major components (e.g. glass, metals, paper, plastics and putrescibles (including food waste and yard waste)) by quantities and percentages by weight;

*Waste plastics*

- (b) types and quantities of waste plastics imported to or exported/re-exported from Hong Kong in 2010 to 2015, with breakdown by the outlets for the imported waste plastics (e.g. exported, recycled locally for re-export, disposed of illegally in Hong Kong);
- (c) types and quantities of locally generated waste plastics, with breakdown by their movements/outlets (e.g. disposed of at landfills, recovered/recycled for export or local consumption, recovered/recycled but disposed of at landfills ultimately);
- (d) market prices of different types of plastic recyclables, including polyethylene ("PE"), polypropylene ("PP"), phenol formaldehyde ("PF") and polyethylene terephthalate ("PET");

*Recycling network*

- (e) information on the Community Recycling Network, which included 18 Community Recycling Centres and 60 collection points at present, and whether and how it could facilitate the collection, on-site preliminary treatment and bulk transport of

waste plastics and other recyclables; and

*Design and use of refuse collection facilities*

- (f) measures or facilities being considered or to be put in place regarding the design and use of refuse collection facilities (in particular refuse collection points) managed by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department to complement the future implementation of MSW charging.

**III. Selection of overseas cities for comparison of refuse collection and resource recovery systems**

Discussion

4. The Subcommittee noted that the Research Office ("RO") of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat proposed to select three overseas cities, namely Seoul, Taipei and Tokyo, for preparation of fact sheets to facilitate the Subcommittee to compare their refuse collection and resource recovery systems with those of Hong Kong. The fact sheets would be circulated to members when ready.

5. Members suggested that a non-Asian city, e.g. Berlin or San Francisco, be included for making the comparison, and Tokyo (or another Asian city if considered more appropriate) be excluded from the list.

*(Post-meeting note: After taking into account members' views raised at the meeting and with the concurrence of the Chairman, three cities, namely Berlin, Seoul and Taipei, were subsequently selected for preparation of fact sheets. Members were informed accordingly vide LC Paper No. CB(1) 344/16-17 on 21 December 2016.)*

**IV. Date of next meeting and item(s) for discussion**

Invitation for public views

6. Members noted that at the next meeting scheduled for Monday, 16 January 2017, the Subcommittee would receive views from members of the public on refuse collection and resource recovery in Hong Kong. A general notice would be posted on the LegCo website and the Secretariat would also write to the 18 District Councils to invite their views on the subject. Members might advise interested parties to respond to the Subcommittee's

invitation on the LegCo website by completing the online registration form and/or submitting their views.

*(Post-meeting note: The relevant circular informing members of the above arrangements was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(1)335/16-17 on 19 December 2016.)*

**V. Any other business**

7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:06 pm.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
9 January 2017

## Panel on Environmental Affairs

## Subcommittee on Refuse Collection and Resource Recovery

**Proceedings of the second meeting  
on Tuesday, 13 December 2016, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I — Confirmation of minutes</i>			
000635 - 000811	Chairman	The minutes of the meeting held on 15 November 2016 (LC Paper No. CB(1)237/16-17) were confirmed.	
<i>Agenda Item II — Measures and initiatives to promote and support waste reduction, source separation, and collection of roadside recyclables in Hong Kong</i>			
000812 - 001703	Chairman Administration	Opening remarks by the Chairman  Briefing by the Administration on the measures and initiatives to promote and support waste reduction, source separation, and collection of roadside recyclables (LC Paper No. CB(1)251/16-17(01))	
001704 - 002323	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration	Mr WU expressed the following views/suggestions:  (a) the Administration should put in place measures/facilities to facilitate and lower the costs associated with bulk transportation of plastic recyclables, which would in turn raise their economic value and provide incentives for the recycling industry to collect and recycle such recyclables; and  (b) reference might be made to Taiwan to provide price subsidies to recyclables, which could be calculated with reference to, among others, the cost of disposing of recyclables at landfills that might otherwise incur public expenditure if the recyclables were not recovered/recycled.  The Administration advised that:  (a) it had been providing support to the recycling industry through the	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>promotion of source separation of waste and clean recycling, provision of recycling infrastructures and facilities as appropriate, and setting up of the Community Recycling Network ("CRN"), etc.; and</p> <p>(b) small local recyclers could apply for the Recycling Fund to enhance their operational efficiency under streamlined procedures.</p>	
002324 – 002933	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Administration	<p>Mr CHU expressed concern that:</p> <p>(a) the amount of waste plastics disposed of at landfills had risen sharply from around 700 000 tonnes in 2014 to around 800 000 tonnes in 2016;</p> <p>(b) the effectiveness to reduce waste plastics by passively providing recycling bins in public places was limited; and</p> <p>(c) minimum performance targets should be set for contractors engaged by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") to collect recyclables from recycling bins.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) the increase in waste plastics disposed of at landfills and the declining recovery rates of waste plastics in recent years were mainly caused by exogenous economic factors including a significant drop in both the demand for and prices of plastic recyclables;</p> <p>(b) as the supply/demand and prices of recyclables were subject to different factors, it would be impractical to impose minimum performance targets for the government contractors in question;</p> <p>(c) as part of the Government's waste</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>recovery/recycling initiatives, the provision of recycling bins in public places were meant to facilitate resource recovery/recycling in areas not covered by CRN and the Programme on Source Separation of Waste, and to enhance promotional and educational efforts; and</p> <p>(d) the Administration would continue to discuss with the relevant stakeholders in the recycling chain with a view to improving the quantity and quality of recyclables recovered, and enhancing the efficiency of the recovery/recycling process.</p>	
002934 - 003510	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim Administration	<p>Dr YIU enquired about the targets set to boost the quantities of recycled plastics, and reduce yard waste disposal at landfills.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) as the demands for plastic recyclables and recycled plastics were subject to external factors beyond the Government's control, it was difficult to set rigid targets on recycling of waste plastics;</p> <p>(b) yard waste made up about 1% of Hong Kong's total municipal solid waste ("MSW") going to landfills;</p> <p>(c) yard waste generated from premises (e.g. country parks) managed by the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department ("AFCD") and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") were treated through natural degradation or composting where space permitted;</p> <p>(d) not all yard waste could be treated in situ, given their large volume, the considerable space and time required for the decomposition process, and the physical constraints to install composting or other</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>treatment facilities at certain existing premises; and</p> <p>(e) the Environmental Protection Department ("EPD") would continue to liaise with the relevant departments with a view to raising the efficiency in the treatment of yard waste and reducing disposal of yard waste at landfills.</p> <p>Dr YIU suggested EPD set up a dedicated working group comprising representatives from AFCD and LCSD to enhance and expedite the measures for reducing yard waste disposal at landfills. The Administration took note of the suggestion.</p>	
003511 - 004145	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT Administration	<p>Dr QUAT enquired about the latest situation of waste plastics recovery/recycling in Hong Kong. She opined that the Administration should provide more information (e.g. outlets for recyclables) to the public with a view to demonstrating the effectiveness of, and restoring public confidence in, resource recovery and recycling initiatives.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) EPD published annual waste statistics in "Monitoring of Solid Waste in Hong Kong"; and</p> <p>(b) the quantities of waste plastics imported to Hong Kong were by and large equivalent to the quantities exported/re-exported from Hong Kong in recent years.</p>	The Administration to take action as paragraph 3(a), (b) and (c) of the minutes
004146 - 005233	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration	<p>Mr WU expressed the following views/suggestions:</p> <p>(a) the Administration should promote recovery and recycling of waste plastics by giving due regard to the commercial value and market prices of different types of plastic recyclables, and export as a major outlet for plastic recyclables; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) the Administration might follow the example of some European countries to provide compressors and/or reverse vending machines at housing estates and public areas for recycling of plastic/aluminium containers, so as to reduce the volume of such recyclables and hence their transportation costs on recyclers.</p> <p>The Chairman shared Mr WU's observation and suggested similar machines be provided in Hong Kong.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) Community Recycling Centres ("CRCs") and collection points under CRN served as multiple collection outlets to provide logistics support (including baling services) for the collection and transportation of recyclables by the recyclers in their catchment areas;</p> <p>(b) Community Green Stations ("CGSs") were being developed in each of the 18 districts to provide recycling support for recyclables especially those of low economic value;</p> <p>(c) according to market intelligence, the market price per tonne of scrap plastics was around \$1,000, whereas polyethylene ("PE"), high density PE, and phenol formaldehyde ("PF") which were more popular in the recycling market could fetch up to \$2,000 to \$3,000 per tonne. The Administration would continue to keep track of the market conditions of recyclables; and</p> <p>(d) plastic recyclables might undergo some form of treatment, such as melting for conversion into pellets, before they might be exported as raw materials.</p>	<p>The Administration to take action as paragraph 3(d) of the minutes</p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005234 - 005935	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT Administration	<p>Dr QUAT raised the following views/suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) some CGSs, such as the one in Shek Mun, Sha Tin, were too small vis-à-vis their target catchment areas to provide sufficient recycling support for the local community; and</li> <li>(b) consideration should be given to making use of CGSs (particularly those located further away from residential areas) for in-situ preliminary treatment of recyclables, such as underground crushing of waste glass containers into glass sands.</li> </ul> <p>The Chairman opined that the Administration should closely monitor overseas development of new technologies and consider their adoption in CGSs in order to achieve greater synergy in the community's recycling efforts.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) Recycling Fund provided funding support to various programmes including those which aimed to promote recycling technologies;</li> <li>(b) the Administration would continue to monitor the performance of CGSs and the latest developments in recycling technologies; and</li> <li>(c) with the future implementation of the mandatory producer responsibility scheme on glass beverage containers, the glass management contractors concerned would be tasked to coordinate territory-wide collection of spent glass containers and their proper treatment by recyclers.</li> </ul>	
005936 - 010947	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Administration	<p>Mr CHU enquired about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) whether members of the Subcommittee could have access to</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the discussion papers of the Steering Group on the Modification of Recycling and Refuse Collection Facilities in Public Places ("the Steering Group"); and</p> <p>(b) how the design and management of relevant facilities, in particular refuse collection points ("RCPs"), would complement the implementation of MSW charging in future, such as whether preliminary treatment facilities for source separation and clean recycling of waste would be provided at RCPs.</p> <p>The Chairman suggested that some existing RCPs be selected for trial provision of preliminary waste treatment/recycling facilities, and the provision of such facilities should be taken into account when planning new RCPs.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) the Steering Group was reviewing the design and distribution of refuse collection and recycling facilities in public places, and had commissioned a consultancy study in this respect;</p> <p>(b) the preliminary findings of the consultancy study indicated a general call from the community to increase the provision of recycling bins and reduce the number of litter containers;</p> <p>(c) there were practical difficulties in providing preliminary waste treatment/recycling facilities at existing RCPs because:</p> <p>(i) they were not purposely designed to accommodate such facilities; and</p> <p>(ii) with the growth in population and waste production over the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>years, and increased number of FEHD's in-house staff or contractors' employees using the ancillary facilities of off-street RCPs, the problem of space shortage within RCPs had become acute. It was also necessary to provide enough room for manoeuvring of refuse collection vehicles in and out of RCPs, and ensure a safe environment for workers at RCPs;</p> <p>(d) currently, some 900 recycling bins were provided in the vicinity of off-street RCPs, village-type RCPs and bin sites for public use. At the RCPs on Luard Road, Peace Avenue and Lan Kwai Fong, and 29 RCPs in the outlying islands, FEHD had been working with non-profit-making organizations ("NPOs") to provide glass container recovery facilities and services thereat; and</p> <p>(e) when planning for the construction of new RCPs, FEHD would discuss with EPD on the space and facility requirements of the RCPs.</p>	
010948 - 011649	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration	Further discussion on the feasibility to provide (a) compressors and reverse vending machines for recycling of plastic recyclables, and (b) price subsidies for recyclables	
011650 - 012230	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman urged the Administration to expedite its efforts to educate the public on clean recycling in preparation for implementation of MSW charging.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) the Administration had been pressing ahead with the various initiatives in accordance with the "Blueprint for Sustainable Use of Resources 2013-2022";</p> <p>(b) in collaboration with EPD, the Environmental Campaign</p>	The Administration to take action as paragraph 3(e) of the minutes

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Committee ("ECC") had launched the Clean Recycling Campaign since 2015, including roving exhibitions, publicity events, advertisements and television episodes, etc., to promote source separation of waste and clean recycling. NPOs had also been engaged to carry out education and promotional activities on clean recycling at private housing estates; and</p> <p>(c) the 18 District Councils, the Home Affairs Department, EPD and ECC had been collaborating to implement the Community Participation Programme to jointly promote environmental protection at the district level. The theme of the Programme 2015/16 was "Community Waste Less Action – Waste Not, Re-Use More, Recycle Properly".</p>	
012231 - 012810	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT Administration	<p>Dr QUAT expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) recycling bins placed in public housing estates were often mis-used as litter containers, reflecting that the Administration's efforts to educate the public on waste recovery and recycling were grossly inadequate and ineffective; and</p> <p>(b) the Administration should step up efforts to drive behavioural change in the public towards a culture of recycling by stressing that their participation in waste recovery and clean recycling would indeed help alleviate the pressure on landfills.</p> <p>The Administration assured members that it would continue to promote source separation and clean recycling of waste.</p>	
012811 - 013439	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Administration	Mr CHU considered that implementation of MSW charging would reduce the amount of waste handled at RCPs and make way for retrofitting of RCPs with	The Administration to take action as paragraph 3(f) of

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>on-site waste treatment/recycling facilities to complement MSW charging.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) it remained to be seen whether and how much space at RCPs could be released even if MSW charging would bring down the amount of waste collected at RCPs; and</p> <p>(b) space limitation remained a major constraint for existing RCPs to incorporate waste treatment/recycling functions.</p>	the minutes
<b><i>Agenda Item III — Selection of overseas cities for comparison of refuse collection and resource recovery systems</i></b>			
013440 - 013730	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Chief Council Researcher 2	Selection of overseas cities for preparation of fact sheets to facilitate the Subcommittee to compare the cities' refuse collection and resource recovery systems with those of Hong Kong	Research Office to follow up as paragraph 5 of the minutes.
<b><i>Agenda Item IV — Date of next meeting and item(s) for discussion</i></b>			
013731 - 013739	Chairman	Meeting arrangements	Clerk to follow up on meeting arrangements
<b><i>Agenda Item V — Any other business</i></b>			
013740 - 013743	Chairman	Concluding remarks	