

# **立法會**

## ***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. CB(4)1638/16-17  
(These minutes have been seen by  
the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/ED

### **Panel on Education**

#### **Minutes of the special meeting on Saturday, 7 January 2017 at 9:00 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP (Chairman)  
Hon IP Kin-yuen (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP

Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung  
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

**Members  
absent**

: Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LUK Chung-hung

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

**Public Officers : Item I  
attending**

**Session One (9:00 am - 11:51 am)**

**Education Bureau**

Mr Eddie NG, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

Mrs Michelle WONG, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Education (3)

Mr Sheridan LEE  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum Development)

Mr Godwin LAI  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Special Education)

Dr Verena LAU  
Senior Specialist (Educational Psychology Service/ Kowloon)

**Social Welfare Department**

Mr Peter NG  
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Youth and Corrections)

**Session Two (12:00 noon - 2:52 pm)**

**Education Bureau**

Mrs Michelle WONG, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Education (3)

Mr Sheridan LEE  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum Development)

Mr Godwin LAI  
Principal Assistant Secretary (Special Education)

Dr Verena LAU  
Senior Specialist (Educational Psychology Service/ Kowloon)

**Social Welfare Department**

Mr Peter NG  
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Youth and Corrections)

**Attendance by : Item I  
invitation**

**Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides**

Professor Paul YIP  
Chairman

**Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union**

Mr CHEUNG Yui-fai  
Vice President

**Ms CHEUNG Man-ching**

**Action Q**

Mr NG Man-him  
Member

**Ms HO Nga-lai**

The Civic Party

Mr Brandon KAU Tin-yu  
Representative

The Young Civics

Mr Matthew WAN Chung-yin  
Vice-President

League in Defense of Hong Kong's Freedoms

Mr James HON  
Spokesman

守護生命行動群組

群組成員  
陳智聰先生

Dr WONG Wai-kwok

防止學童自殺民間聯席

Mr CHEUNG Sau-yin  
Representative

Association for Holistic Life Education

Dr Roger CHENG Hon-man  
President

Demosisto

Mr CHENG Ka-long  
Member

The EduLab

Miss WONG Ji-yuet  
Contact Person

Progressive Teachers' Alliance

Mr Simon HUNG Ling-fai  
Member

Mr LAU Ki-wang

Civic Passion

Miss WONG Yuk-ting  
Member

Shatin Community Network

Mr LAU Wing-hong  
Chairman

Miss HO Shuk-yi

Miss WONG Lai-hang

Ms Doreen HO Mei-yee

Miss Victoria NG Ka-yee

Miss Carmel WONG Ching-yung

WONG Long-fun

Miss TONG Chung-yee

動心行動

Miss Annie CHEUNG Yim-shuen

CHAN Yu Ling

Mr LUK Yam-ming

Mr CHAN Chi Sum

Miss LEE Sheung

Hong Kong Policy Viewers

Mr KUNG Wai-sum  
Exco Member

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Miss Louisa YAU Shui-ling  
Children and Youth Service Development Officer

Youth Policy Advocacy Platform

Miss LAI Wan-yiu  
Youth Organizer

Special Educational Needs Rights Association

Mr HO Cheuk-hin  
Community Organizer

ACDRs - Group of Youth

Mr CHIN Sze-hang  
Youth representative

廢青尋夢關注組

Miss WONG Chiu-nga  
廢青代表

Mr CHEUNG Chin-kiu

基層兒童話事團

Miss LO Ka-lai  
團長

Alliance for Children Development Rights

Ms HO Yu Ying  
Community Organizer

Miss HA Ting

Mr LI Ting-fung

天水圍兒童權利關注組

Miss CHEUNG Man  
家長代表

ACDRs - World see

Mr HO Chun-yin  
Youth representative

街坊工友服務處

Miss PAK Wing-yan  
Organizer

Miss FUNG Yu-qin

香港教育大失敗 逼死學童關注組

Mr KWOK Man-ho  
代表

Passion Babies

Ms CHEUNG Yiu-sum  
Presenter

黃鳳鳴女士

Dr Tony KEE Chi-wai

Mr LAM Ming-yat

The Hong Kong University Students' Union

Miss Althea SUEN  
President

Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers

Dr WU Siu-wai  
Vice-Chairman

Mr Jason YU

Hong Kong Parents League For Education Renovation

Mr Eiffel CHAU King-lun  
Chairman

Concern Group on Prevention of Student Suicides  
(TKO Branch)

---

Mr LAI Wai-tong  
Member

HK Psychologists Concern

Mr WONG Yu-kwan  
Spokesperson

Reclaiming Social Work Movement

Mr LAU Ka-tung  
Member

Students' Union of Open University of Hong Kong

Mr CHAN Tsz-wai  
President

Neo Democrats

Mr FUNG Kwan-on  
Community Officer

Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union

Ms Lam Wan-chi

Mr NG Chung-tat

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Angel WONG  
Chief Council Secretary (4)4

**Staff in attendance** : Mr KWONG Kam-fai  
Senior Council Secretary (4)4

Miss Mandy NG  
Council Secretary (4)4

Ms Sandy HAU  
Legislative Assistant (4)4

Miss Emma LAM  
Clerical Assistant (4)3

---

Action

**I. The recommendations in the Final Report of the Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides**

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| (LC Paper No. CB(4)380/16-17(01)  | -- Paper provided by the Administration  |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)79/16-17(05)  | -- Paper provided by the Administration  |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)79/16-17(06)  | -- Background brief entitled "Issues related to student suicide" prepared by the LegCo Secretariat |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)126/16-17(01)   | -- Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon IP Kin-yuen  |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(01)   | -- Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon SHIU Ka-chun   |
| LC Paper No. CB(4)399/16-17(01)   | -- Paper provided by Hon IP Kin-yuen)  |
| LC Paper Nos. CB(4)392/16-17(07), CB(4)392/16-17(17) and CB(4)404/16-17(06) | -- Written submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting)                     |

Action

**Session One**

The Chairman invited participants of the meeting to observe a minute of silence for the students who had committed suicide last year.

Briefing by the Administration

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Secretary for Education ("SED") briefed members on the Government's follow-up progress of the recommendations in the Final Report of the Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides ("the Committee"), details of which were set out in the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)380/16-17(01)].

3. Professor Paul YIP, Chairman of the Committee advised that there was no panacea for solving student suicide problem. The Committee's recommendations strived to fill the existing service gaps and address the needs of students holistically. The Committee was pleased to note that the media had responded to its appeal in news reporting. With the significant improvement in media reporting, there was a rapid decline of suicide number in the past few months.

4. Noting that SED would not attend the second session of this meeting, some members expressed discontent. SED explained that the meeting had been changed to a two-session meeting and extended to 1:40 pm. He could not stay for the whole meeting because of official duties. The Deputy Secretary attending this meeting was a high-ranking officer responsible for the subject under discussion.

Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

5. A total of 28 deputations/individuals presented their views in the first session of the meeting. Their major concerns were summarized in **Appendix I**.

Initial response by the Administration

6. SED thanked the deputations for presenting their views. On the deputations' concerns about kindergarten ("KG") students being stressed by homework loads and over-drilling, SED advised that the Education Bureau ("EDB") would follow up with the cases if the deputations concerned agreed to provide further information. He explained that the Government had been promoting happy learning and providing multiple articulation pathways for secondary school leavers. Student suicide involved complex socio-psychological issues. Causes of suicide should not be oversimplified as learning pressures alone. EDB would carefully consider the Committee's recommendations, and work in collaboration with relevant government bureaux/departments and stakeholders to study how to take forward the recommendations, including

Action

reviewing relevant domains of the education system in order to strengthen the support and protect the students and youth from the risk of suicide.

7. To allow more time for discussion with SED, the Chairman extended the first session of the meeting to 11:45 am.

Discussion

*Final Report of the Committee*

8. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Dr CHENG Chung-tai and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen expressed regret at the Committee's findings that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and the education system.

9. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen noted from the submission of the Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union that it had discussed with the Committee and the Administration, and put forward the suggestion to increase the number of school counselling personnel so as to improve the stability of counselling service in schools. However, the Final Report had not made such recommendation. Professor Paul YIP responded that apart from collecting views from various stakeholders, the Committee had analyzed thoroughly the recent student suicide cases in Hong Kong in order to provide more timely information for formulating evidence-based recommendations in the report.

*Concerns about pressure on students*

10. Dr Priscilla LEUNG urged the Administration to consider alleviating the pressure on students by reducing the number of examinations, including the Territory-wide System Assessment ("TSA") at Primary 3 and the public examination of Liberal Studies subject. Ms Claudia MO and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung enquired whether TSA would be abolished to reduce students' pressure. While Ms Tanya CHAN asked whether improvements would be made to the education system, Dr LAU Siu-lai and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung considered it necessary to review the education system to reduce homework load and number of assessments so as to enable happy learning. Mr SHIU Ka-chun requested for a clear timetable for the education reform.

11. SED reiterated that there should not be undue pressure on students. EDB would follow up with those individuals who complained of schools' assigning a lot of homework at the meeting. In fact, various domains of the education system were reviewed and enhanced on a regular basis. Subsequent to the review on the New Senior Secondary ("NSS") curriculum and assessment from 2012 to 2015, enhancement measures had been implemented in stages. Regarding TSA, the Administration would study the report of the Coordinating Committee on Basic Competency Assessment and Assessment Literacy and decide on the

### Action

arrangements of future TSA at the end of the month. SED further assured members that the Administration would formulate practicable follow-up measures based on the recommendations in the Committee's Final Report.

12. Dr Priscilla LEUNG advised that there were diverse views in the public about the rights of sexual minorities and the Administration should take different views into consideration. In response to Dr LEUNG's remarks, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Dr LAU Siu-lai pointed out that sexual orientation discrimination might lead to bullying in schools, which was another kind of pressure imposed on some students.

### *Other issues*

13. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Dr CHENG Chung-tai expressed dissatisfaction about the non-attendance of SED at the next session of the meeting. Ms Claudia MO enquired whether SED would resign immediately in response to deputations' views. Dr LAU Siu-lai said that she would propose to move a motion urging the Government to immediately replace SED Mr Eddie NG.

14. The Chairman thanked the deputations for attending the meeting and sharing their views and concerns.

*(The Chairman left the meeting after the first session. The Deputy Chairman took over the chair.)*

### Session Two

15. The Deputy Chairman announced that the four motions respectively proposed by himself, Mr SHIU Ka-chun, Mr Michael TIEN and Dr LAU Siu-lai would be dealt with after oral presentation by deputations and discussion by members (wording of the motions in **Appendix II**). In this connection, he suggested that the meeting would be extended to 2:25 pm. Members raised no objection.

### Oral presentation by deputations/individuals

16. A total of 32 deputations/individuals presented their views in the second session of the meeting. Their major concerns were summarized in **Appendix I**.

### Initial response by the Administration

17. In response to some deputations' view that more bureaux/departments should be invited to attend the meeting, the Deputy Chairman pointed out that when the subject matter was discussed at the Panel meeting in November 2016, there were representatives from the Home Affairs Bureau, the Food and Health

## Action

Bureau and the Hospital Authority. However, only a representative from the Social Welfare Department attended today's meeting. He advised that although it was the normal practice for the policy bureau concerned to coordinate the attendance of public officers for discussion on a certain subject area, the Panel would take note of it and make better arrangements in the future.

18. The Deputy Secretary for Education (3) ("DS(Ed)3") thanked the deputations for presenting their views. Referring to the views of deputations calling for a comprehensive review on the education system, DS(Ed)3 advised that EDB and relevant bureaux/departments were in the process of formulating practicable follow-up measures based on the recommendations in the Final Report. One of the key areas for follow-up was to review relevant domains of the education system. Short- and medium-term recommendations to fine-tune the NSS curriculum and assessment were implemented in stages. Vocational and professional education and training would be promoted so as to encourage students to develop their talents and abilities in various aspects. The Vocational Training Council and self-financing post-secondary institutions would be encouraged to recognize students' other learning experiences in sports, music or social services, etc.

19. Professor Paul YIP supplemented that the Committee had carefully examined the 71 suicide cases in primary schools, secondary schools and post-secondary institutions in the last three school/academic years. The findings revealed that multiple factors interacted and contributed to students' suicidal behavior. Any attempt to link up suicide with a single factor, such as the education system, might over-simplify the problem. He hoped that different sectors of the community could work collaboratively to cultivate a caring culture and environment to support students' development.

20. To allow sufficient time for discussion and handling the four motions, the Deputy Chairman sought members' views on further extending the meeting to about 2:50 pm. Members raised no objection.

## Discussion

### *Homework policy*

21. Mr Michael TIEN recalled that he had in the past moved three motions, urging the Government to face up to the pressure on students and introduce measures to resolve the problem, conduct a comprehensive survey on the amount of homework in primary and secondary schools, and critically examine the homework policies of KGs when revising the Guide to the Pre-primary Curriculum. All motions were passed, however, the homework load had not been reduced. He called on EDB to issue strict guidelines to ensure that students should complete their assignments at schools and the amount of homework

Action

should be minimized. DS(Ed)3 advised that EDB issued guidelines to schools in October 2015 reminding them to formulate an appropriate and transparent school-based homework policy. Many schools had set less homework thereafter. Regarding KG education, the Guide to the Pre-primary Curriculum which covered homework policies was also under review.

*Territory-wide System Assessment*

22. Dr LAU Siu-lai, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Mr HUI Chi-fung asked whether the Administration would abolish Primary 3 TSA. DS(Ed)3 advised that as mentioned by SED earlier at the meeting, the Administration would decide the 2017 TSA arrangements at the end of the month.

23. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Ms Claudia MO enquired whether Professor Paul YIP would recommend EDB to abolish Primary 3 TSA and whether it was the Committee's intention to avoid examining issues relating to the education system. Professor Paul YIP reiterated that all Committee members had worked hard in analyzing the possible causes of student suicides, reviewing the current situation and existing services and proposing targeted strategies on student suicide prevention. It was recognized that student suicides were mostly brought about by multiple interacting factors, including education system. On the abolition of TSA, as the Coordinating Committee on Basic Competency Assessment and Assessment Literacy had conducted a review on the implementation arrangements of TSA, he was not in a position to make any further recommendation.

*Concerns about pressure on students*

24. Ms Starry LEE said that the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong had recently conducted a survey on more than 200 parents. Over 80% of respondents indicated that their children were under learning pressure because of the local education system. She urged the Administration to consider reviewing the education system and offering different curricula for students, e.g. International Baccalaureate Diploma Programmes. While appreciating the recommendations made by the Committee, Ms LEE considered that the Administration should take forward the recommendations to provide appropriate support to students and update the Panel on the follow-up progress.

25. Mr SHIU Ka-chun concurred with Ms Starry LEE's request for the Administration to update the Panel on the follow-up progress of the Committee's recommendations. Moreover, he opined that life planning education might not be able to tackle student suicide problem effectively. The Administration should consider providing more resources to improve teaching and learning such as enhancing class-to-teacher ratio.

Action

26. Mr HUI Chi-fung opined that learning pressure had contributed to student suicides and the Committee should not play down the significance of this. Both the students and parents were stressful under the examination-oriented education system. Heavy homework and assessments imposed pressure on students and put stains on relationships at home.

27. Mr Charles MOK thanked Professor Paul YIP and the Committee for their hard work. He considered that the Administration should have a timetable and roadmap for an education reform in order to make the learning process more enjoyable. In addition, as e-learning was becoming popular, he said that families with financial difficulties were stressful because they could not afford to buy computers for their children and pay for the Internet services.

28. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung stressed that education should be able to cater for diverse needs of students. Given limited publicly-funded university places, students had no choice but to concentrate on examinations to meet university entrance requirements. More resources should be allocated to provide more choices for students.

29. Mr Michael TIEN noted that among the 38 suicide cases in primary and secondary schools recorded in the past three school years, as many as 33 cases involved issues in relationships, and 31 cases involved issues in adjustment. He considered that additional resources should be deployed to enhance students' abilities in coping with relationships and adjusting to changes. Mr TIEN said that he would move a motion in this respect.

30. Dr LAU Siu-lai criticized the Administration for not addressing the problems of the education system which had existed for years. The Final Report recommended to provide gatekeeper training for teachers to enhance early identification and intervention for students at risk. However, teachers were so fully engaged with teaching and administrative work that they did not have time to perform the gatekeeping role. In addition, as Professor Paul YIP had advised that the causes of student suicides involved multiple factors and education system was one of these factors, Dr LAU Siu-lai suggested that instead of concluding that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and education system, it would be more desirable to state in the Final Report that education was one of the causes of student suicides.

31. In response to Dr CHENG Chung-tai's enquiry about whether the Administration had provided resources, such as funding and manpower, to facilitate the work of the Committee, Professor Paul YIP advised that all members of the Committee were on voluntary basis without any remuneration. The Committee had obtained relevant information for the analysis from various sources, including the Police, Department of Health, EDB, and the Centre for

Action

Suicide Research and Prevention. The Administration had arranged meetings with parents of students to obtain more details about the cases under analysis.

Motions

32. The Deputy Chairman referred members to the four motions respectively moved by himself, Mr SHIU Ka-chun, Mr Michael TIEN and Dr LAU Siu-lai.

33. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen said that the Administration should inform members of the follow-ups taken in response to the motions passed by the Panel.

34. At the order of the Deputy Chairman, the voting bell had been rung for five minutes to notify members of the voting. As a quorum was not present at the expiry of the five minutes, the Deputy Chairman announced that the motions could not be put to vote.

35. To conclude, the Deputy Chairman thanked the deputations for attending the meeting and sharing their views and concerns.

**II. Any other business**

36. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 2:54 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
4 October 2017

**Panel on Education**  
**Special meeting on Saturday, 7 January 2017 at 9:00 am**

**Agenda item I: The recommendations in the Final Report of the  
Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides**

**Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals**

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
<b>Session One</b>		
1.	Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(02)]
2.	Ms CHEUNG Man-ching	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(03)]
3.	Action Q	The deputation expressed concern about discrimination against sexual minorities in schools. It urged the Administration to strengthen sexual equality education with a view to eliminating sexual orientation discrimination and building up a gender friendly school environment.
4.	Ms HO Nga-lai	She shared her experience that her daughter in Primary 1 had heavy homework load. She urged the Government to disburse additional resources to improve the education system, such as enhancing the teacher-to-student ratio.
5.	The Civic Party	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)404/16-17(03)]
6.	The Young Civics	The deputation expressed discontent at the non-attendance of the Secretary for Education ("SED") at the next session of the meeting. It opined that the education system was one of the main causes of student suicides and urged the Government to enhance the class-to-teacher ratio and provide each primary school with one social worker to help early identify students with mental health issues.
7.	League in Defense of Hong Kong's Freedoms	The deputation considered that Mr Eddie NG should step down as SED as he had contravened various provisions of the Code for the Education Profession of Hong Kong. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system with a view to advocating happy learning and set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem.
8.	守護生命行動群組	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(04)]

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
9.	Dr WONG Wai-kwok	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)399/16-17(02)]
10.	防止學童自殺民間 聯席	The deputation expressed regret at the conclusion of the Final Report of the Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides ("the Committee") that education system and student suicides were not correlated. It urged Mr Eddie NG to step down as SED and the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, abolish the Territory-wide System Assessment ("TSA") and set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem.
11.	Association for Holistic Life Education	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(05)]
12.	Demosisto	The deputation expressed regret at the conclusion of the Final Report of the Committee that education system and student suicides were not correlated. It expressed concern about students being under too much learning pressure and called for an education reform, abolition of Primary 3 TSA and reduction of homework load. Young people should be encouraged to make career choices in accordance with their interests, abilities and orientations.
13.	The EduLab	The deputation expressed regret at the conclusion of the Final Report of the Committee that education system and student suicides were not correlated. It took the view that the prevailing examination-oriented education system was the main cause of student suicides. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
14.	Progressive Teachers' Alliance	The deputation expressed concern that the Administration was not aware of the pressure on students and teachers under the prevailing examination-oriented education system. Teachers might not have time to perform the gatekeeping role if the teacher-to-student ratio was not improved. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, abolish TSA, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
15.	Mr LAU Ki-wang	He opined that the prevailing examination-oriented education system failed to foster students' all-round development. SED should be replaced as he did not attach importance to the views and concerns of the public.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
16.	Civic Passion	The deputation did not subscribe to the view of the Committee that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and the education system. Students faced immense pressure under the prevailing education system. The Administration should abolish TSA in response to the views of deputations.
17.	Shatin Community Network	The deputation expressed concern about the heavy workload of students and teachers. It was of the view that the examination-oriented system had to some extent limited the development and pathways of students talented in non-academic areas, such as sports and art.
18.	Miss HO Shuk-yi	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)404/16-17(04)]
19.	Miss WONG Lai-hang	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(06)]
20.	Ms Doreen HO Mei-yee	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)399/16-17(03)]
21.	Miss Victoria NG Ka-yee	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)404/16-17(05)]
22.	Miss Carmel WONG Ching-yung	She expressed concern about kindergarten students being stressed by homework loads. She opined that the Administration had failed to introduce measures to effectively tackle the problem. Parents and children faced immense pressure under the prevailing education system. She urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system and replace SED.
23.	WONG Long-fun	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)399/16-17(04)]
24.	Miss TONG Chung-yee	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)399/16-17(05)]
25.	動心行動	The deputation pointed out that students were under immense pressure arising from academic competition. It did not subscribe to the view of the Committee that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and the education system. The Government should listen to the views of the public and SED should step down.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
26.	CHAN Yu-ling	She shared her experience that she was under immense pressure when she was a local school student and described local schools as a "prison". Studying in an international school currently, she had much less homework and a lot of time for reading and playing.
27.	Mr LUK Yam-ming	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(08)]
28.	Mr CHAN Chi-sum	He expressed discontent at the non-attendance of SED at the next session of the meeting. He took the view that the examination-oriented education system had given rise to students' pressure and called for a review of the system to reduce students' burden. He also urged the Government to set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
<b>Session Two</b>		
29.	Miss LEE Sheung	She shared the experience that her son faced immense pressure under the prevailing education system which subsequently affected his well-being. She urged the Administration to reduce homework load and abolish TSA to alleviate students' pressure.
30.	Hong Kong Policy Viewers	The deputation did not accept the findings of the Committee's Final Report that there was no causal relationship between student suicides and the education system. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
31.	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)487/16-17(01)]
32.	Youth Policy Advocacy Platform	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(09)]
33.	Special Educational Needs Rights Association	The deputation did not subscribe to the view of the Committee that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and the education system. It was concerned that the Final Report had not mentioned the pressure of students with special educational needs under the integrated education policy. It urged the Government to replace SED.
34.	ACDRs - Group of Youth	The deputation highlighted that senior secondary students were under immense pressure because they had to complete the School-based Assessments of various subjects and Independent Enquiry Study, and attend after-school classes and tuition classes. It urged the Government to conduct a

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		comprehensive review on the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education Examination, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
35.	廢青尋夢關注組	The deputation expressed concern that the Government's policies and measures, such as life planning education, failed to meet the aspirations and needs of young people. The Government should promote diversified economy, enhance student financial assistance programmes and provide more employment opportunities for young people. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
36.	Mr CHEUNG Chin-kiu	He expressed discontent at the non-attendance of SED and urged SED to step down. He did not subscribe to the view of the Committee that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and the education system. He expressed concern about the difficulties faced by needy students and urged the Government to enhance its financial support for these students. In the long run, the Government should conduct a comprehensive review on the education system and set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem.
37.	基層兒童話事團	The deputation expressed discontent at the non-attendance of SED and expressed regret at the Final Report. It urged the Government to replace SED, conduct a comprehensive review on the education system and set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem.
38.	Alliance for Children Development Rights	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(10)]
39.	Miss HA Ting	She expressed concern about the difficulties faced by needy students. She urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
40.	Mr LI Ting-fung	He considered that the Committee had not put much emphasis on the education system which was the main cause of student suicides and urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
41.	天水圍兒童權利關注組	The deputation expressed concern about the difficulties faced by needy students who could not afford to attend tuition classes or purchase computers for doing homework. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
42.	ACDRs – World see	The deputation expressed concern about the pressure on secondary students brought about by over-drilling for TSA and the examination-oriented senior secondary curriculum. It urged the Government to establish a youth committee with young people as members so that the views of young people could be represented.
43.	街坊工友服務處	The deputation was of the view that teachers and parents might not have time to perform the gatekeeping role as recommended by the Committee. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
44.	Miss FUNG Yu-qin	She expressed concern that needy students could not afford to buy computers for doing homework. She urged the Government to strengthen its support for these students, conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
45.	香港教育大失敗逼死學童關注組	The deputation did not subscribe to the view of the Committee that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and the education system. It considered that teachers and parents would not have time to perform the gatekeeping role as recommended by the Committee if no additional resource or support was provided for them. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
46.	Passion Babies	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(11)]
47.	黃鳳鳴女士	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)417/16-17(01)]
48.	Dr Tony KEE Chi-wai	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)404/16-17(07)]

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
49.	Mr LAM Ming-yat	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(12)]
50.	The Hong Kong University Students' Union	The deputation expressed concern that the prevailing education system failed to cater for various needs of young people. It called for an education reform and a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem. SED should also be replaced.
51.	Hong Kong Federation of Education Workers	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(13)]
52.	Mr Jason YU	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(14)]
53.	Hong Kong Parents League For Education Renovation	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(15)]
54.	Concern Group on Prevention of Student Suicides (TKO Branch)	The deputation expressed regret at the non-attendance of SED. It considered that the Government should provide additional resources to facilitate teachers and parents to perform the gatekeeping role and non-governmental organizations to provide support to students. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system and set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem.
55.	HK Psychologists Concern	Presentation of views as detailed in the submission [LC Paper No. CB(4)392/16-17(16)]
56.	Reclaiming Social Work Movement	The deputation did not subscribe to the view of the Committee that there was no substantial direct link between student suicides and the education system. The representative shared his experience as a suicide attempt survivor and highlighted that life education for young people was more important than life planning education. The number of social workers in primary schools, secondary schools and tertiary institutions should be increased.
57.	Students' Union of Open University of Hong Kong	The deputation expressed concern about the drilling practice and heavy homework load in primary schools, and the financial burden of students pursuing self-financing post-secondary education. It urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
58.	Neo Democrats	The deputation considered that the recommendations of promoting life planning and providing training on gatekeeping might not be able to tackle the student suicide problem. It was

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		important for the Administration to listen to the views of the public and take immediate actions to enhance the existing support and services, such as providing each primary school with one social worker.
59.	Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union	The deputation expressed concern about the increasing number of senior primary students and parents suffering from depression and anxiety because of learning pressure. The Government should provide each primary school with one social worker, conduct a comprehensive review on the education system, set up a high-level and cross-bureaux/departmental committee to address the student suicide problem and replace SED.
60.	Mr NG Chung-tat	He shared his experience as a suicide attempt survivor. He considered that the Final Report had not touched the crux of the problem. He urged the Government to conduct a comprehensive review on the education system and SED to step down.

**就議程項目"防止學生自殺委員會最終報告的建議"  
動議的議案**

**Motion moved under the agenda item  
"The recommendations in the Final Report  
of the Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides"**

**議案措辭**

本委員會認為《防止學生自殺委員會最終報告》(《報告》)沒有觸及學生自殺問題的核心，建議空泛，未能有效對應學生自殺問題，本委員會感到失望和遺憾。本委員會更不認同《報告》指「教育系統所造成學習壓力與學生自殺之間，並無明顯及直接的關連」，認為報告避重就輕，迴避了教育制度衍生的問題與學生自殺的重要關連。本委員會認為，學生學習壓力極大，自殺問題不容忽視，促請政府必須從檢討教育制度、增加資源和改善整體教師及輔導人員三方面著手，方能讓學生在關愛校園中健康成長，減低學生自殺的風險。

(葉建源議員動議)

**Wording of the Motion**

(Translation)

This Panel considers that the Final Report of the Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides ("the Report") has not dealt with the crux of the student suicide problem. Its recommendations are empty and cannot effectively address the student suicide problem. In this regard, this Panel expresses disappointment and regret. This Panel all the more disagrees with the observation in the Report that "there was no substantial direct link between learning pressure arising from the education system and student suicides" and considers that the Report has downplayed the situation and circumvented the significant link between the issues arising from the education system and student suicides.

This Panel is of the view that students are facing enormous learning pressure and their suicide problem must not be neglected. This Panel urges the Government to tackle the problem from three fronts, namely reviewing the education system, increasing resources and improving the overall manpower of teachers and guidance personnel so as to provide a caring campus for the healthy development of students and reduce their risk of committing suicide.

(Moved by Hon IP Kin-yuen)

## **議案措辭**

本委員會認為，學童自殺問題不但與教育制度有直接關係，更涉及家庭關係、工時問題、社區支援等不同面向的問題，故不應單由教育局獨自處理。本委員會要求特區政府成立更高層次的跨部門小組以處理學童自殺問題。

(邵家臻議員動議)

## **Wording of the Motion**

(Translation)

This Panel considers that the student suicide problem not only has a direct link with the education system, but also involves multifaceted issues such as family relationship, working hours, community support. Hence, this problem should not be handled by the Education Bureau alone. This Panel urges the HKSAR Government to set up a higher level inter-departmental group to address the student suicide problem.

(Moved by Hon SHIU Ka-chun )

## **議案措辭**

本委員會接納防止學生自殺委員會最終報告的研究及分析，認同自殺是複雜問題，涉及多種成因。而過去三個學年錄得的38宗中、小學生自殺個案中，高達33宗個案涉及關係問題，另外有 31宗個案涉及適應問題，情況值得關注。2000年教育改革的前提，是以學生為主體，訓練學生多方面能力，包括處理人際關係及適應轉變。而學校是年輕人學習、生活和成長的重要場所，因此由教育系統處理學生的關係及適應問題是責無旁貸的。本委員會促請政府從速檢討教育制度，並增加資源及人手，加強學生處理關係及適應轉變的能力，以符合教育改革的目標，讓學生能夠愉快學習及全面發展。

(田北辰議員動議)

## **Wording of the Motion**

(Translation)

This Panel accepts the study and analysis in the Final Report of the Committee on Prevention of Student Suicides and recognizes that suicide is a complicated problem with multifactorial causes. Among the 38 suicide cases in primary and secondary schools recorded in the past three school years, as many as 33 cases involved relationship problems, and 31 cases involved adjustment issues. Such situation warrants attention. Students are the focus of the education reform in year 2000. The basic premise is to provide students with training of various abilities, including handling social relationships and adjusting to changes, and the school is an important arena for young people to learn, live and grow. Therefore, the education system is duty-bound to address the relationship and adjustment problems of students. This Panel urges the Government to review the education system expeditiously and deploy additional resources and manpower to enhance students' abilities in coping with relationships and adjusting to changes, with a view to meeting the objectives of the education reform and enabling students' happy learning as well as all-round development.

(Moved by Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun)

## **議案措辭**

本委員會認為，現時教育局局長領導無方，無法帶領局方做好防止學生自殺的工作；同時，局長作為政治問責官員，必須承擔責任，面向公眾交代和問責。因此，本委員會要求特區政府立即撤換教育局局長吳克儉。

(劉小麗議員動議)

## **Wording of the Motion**

(Translation)

This Panel considers that the incumbent Secretary for Education is incompetent at leading the Bureau to properly carry out its work in preventing student suicides. Moreover, being an official under the political appointment system, the Secretary must bear his responsibilities, and be answerable and accountable to the public. Hence, this Panel urges the HKSAR Government to immediately replace the Secretary for Education Mr Eddie NG.

(Moved by Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai)