

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)766/16-17

(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/FE

**Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene**

**Minutes of special meeting  
held on Monday, 19 December 2016, at 10:45 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** :

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan (Chairman)  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim  
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

**Members  
absent**

: Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung

**Public Officers : Item I  
attending**

Mr Kenneth CHAN Siu-yum  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 1

Dr Gloria TAM Lai-fan, JP  
Controller, Centre for Food Safety  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Dr Sarah CHOI Mei-yee, JP  
Assistant Director (Food Surveillance and Control),  
Centre for Food Safety  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Dr Samuel YEUNG Tze-kiu  
Consultant (Community Medicine) (Risk Assessment  
and Communication) (Acting), Centre for Food Safety  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

**Item II**

Professor Sophia CHAN, JP  
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Miss Diane WONG  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Mr CHIU Yu-chow  
Assistant Director (Grade Management and Development)  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr Keith TANG  
Deputy Head (Port and Land)  
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Louie LAU  
Chief Engineer (Lands Work) (Acting)  
Civil Engineering and Development Department

**Attendance** : Item I  
**by invitation**

Shiu Pong Trading (Hong Kong) Company Limited

Mr HO Kai-kwong  
General Manager

Wah Kee Wing Cheong Ho

Mr CHU Kar-cheong  
Director

Man Trompp Food Limited

Ms Carmen HA  
Director

Shing Lung Hung Company

Mr CHOI Ki  
Owner

Fat Kee Development Company Limited

Mr Dennis TSUI Chun-fat  
Manager

Tiang Ti Company Limited

Mr Ceasar CHAN Chun-kong  
General Manager

New Sam Yung (Hong Kong) Limited

Mr Tommy CHAN Tiu-ming  
Director

Old San Yang (Hong Kong) Limited

Ms Sandy KI Yuk-fung  
Director

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Josephine SO  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Wendy LO  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 2

Mr Roger CHUNG  
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Emma CHEUNG  
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

---

Action

**I. Update on the incidents of hairy crabs detected with dioxins and regulation of import of fresh food produce**  
(LC Papers No. CB(2)395/16-17(01) & (02))

Presentation of views by hairy crab traders

The Chairman reminded the hairy crab traders attending the meeting that they were not covered by the protection and immunity provided under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) when addressing the Panel.

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, a total of seven hairy crab traders presented their views on issues relating to the incidents of hairy crabs detected with dioxins ("the incidents"). A summary of their views is in the **Appendix**.

Discussion

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 1 ("PASFH(F)1") briefed members on the latest development of the incidents and the import control on fresh food, as set out

Action

in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)395/16-17(01)). Members noted the background brief entitled "Issues relating to the incidents of hairy crabs detected with dioxins" (LC Paper No. CB(2)395/16-17(02)) prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat.

4. In reply to Mr SHIU Ka-fai's enquiry, the Chairman said that according to media reports on 14 December 2016, two hairy crab traders had applied for judicial review against the Government's decision to suspend the import into and sale within Hong Kong of hairy crabs from two aquaculture farms in Jiangsu Province and sought compensation for their loss due to the suspension of the sale of hairy crabs. The Chairman reminded members that Rule 41(2) of the Rules of Procedure provided that reference should not be made to a case pending in a court of law in such a way as, in the opinion of the Chairman, might prejudice that case. As such, members should refrain from discussing any legal issues of the case pending in court. PASFH(F)1, Controller, Centre for Food Safety ("Controller/CFS") and Assistant Director (Food Surveillance and Control)/CFS ("AD(FSC)/CFS") said that to avoid making reference to the case pending adjudication in the judicial review, they were not able to comment on issues relating to the judicial review.

*Incidents of hairy crabs detected with dioxins*

5. In response to Mr SHIU Ka-fai's question about the testing of dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls ("PCBs") in foods, AD(FSC)/CFS advised that CFS had included the testing of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in foods since 1999 and in hairy crabs since 2014. This was the first time that hairy crab samples were found to contain dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs at a total level exceeding the action level adopted by CFS (i.e. 6.5 picograms toxic equivalent per gram (6.5 parts per trillion) of the food sample (wet weight) for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in edible portion of hairy crabs).

6. Mr SHIU Ka-fai urged the Administration to work with the Mainland authorities and the trade to come up with clear guidelines governing the import of hairy crabs, including the testing method for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs, so as to avoid recurrence of similar incidents. In Mr SHIU's view, a sudden suspension of import from the Mainland and sale within Hong Kong of any food items would have a devastating effect on the relevant food industries and traders. He opined that in handling food safety incidents, the Administration should strike a reasonable balance between protecting public health and mitigating the effect on the trade.

7. Mr WONG Ting-kwong considered that it was a bit reckless on the part of CFS to have instructed the traders to remove the hairy crabs from shelves, stop sale and initiate a recall. He expressed concern that the

Action

incidents had dealt a severe blow to the local and Mainland hairy crab traders, and soured the relationship between the Administration and the Mainland authorities. Noting that dioxins had never been made a mandatory test item for issuance of health certificates for hairy crabs exported to Hong Kong, he sought clarification on whether CFS had communicated with the trade and the Mainland authorities regarding CFS' decision to conduct the testing of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs, and whether CFS had requested the Mainland authorities to provide testing reports on dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs prior to the arrival of the crabs. He also sought information on how CFS determined the types of food samples to be collected for testing under the food surveillance programme.

8. PASFH(F)1 responded that CFS adopted a risk-based approach when determining the types of food samples to be collected, the frequency and number of samples taken for testing, and the types of laboratory analysis to be conducted, taking into account factors such as past food surveillance results, local and overseas food incidents, and relevant food risk analyses. Complementing day-to-day surveillance of food items, CFS also conducted surveillance of food items on a targeted basis. The presence of dioxins in aquatic food products had raised international concern some 10 years ago. Since then, there had been studies on the impact of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs on human health. After considering international practices and local dietary habits, CFS adopted the current action level for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in respect of hairy crabs. AD(FSC)/CFS supplemented that CFS had maintained close liaison with the Mainland authorities on food safety issues. Section 54 of the Public Health and Municipal Service Ordinance (Cap. 132) required that all foods for sale in Hong Kong, locally produced or imported, should be fit for human consumption. The health certificates issued by the relevant Mainland authorities had clauses stating that the foods exported to Hong Kong were fit for human consumption.

9. The Chairman said that while she was supportive of CFS' surveillance on dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs under its seasonal food surveillance programme, she was concerned whether CFS had communicated with the Mainland authorities regarding its decision to conduct from 2014 onwards testing of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs. She said that it was unreasonable for CFS to adopt an action level for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs while accepting health certificates issued by the issuing authorities of exporting countries/places which did not certify the non-existence of dioxins in the crabs. In her view, to safeguard public health, CFS should check whether the Mainland authorities would adopt Hong Kong's standards on dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs.

Action

10. Controller/CFS advised that as a general practice, the relevant authorities of importing and exporting countries/places maintained regular exchanges in matters concerning food safety and potential risk posed to food trading. The importing authorities might require food imports to be accompanied by health certificates proving that the imported foods did not contain harmful substances and veterinary drugs. At present, the General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine of the Central People's Government of the People's Republic of China ("AQSIQ") did not require health certificates to cover the existence or non-existence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs. CFS would continue to liaise with the Mainland authorities on issues relating to the standards and methodology for testing dioxin level in hairy crabs. In response to the Chairman's further question on whether CFS would impose a ban on other food items (e.g. aquatic products) containing dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs at a total level exceeding the action level adopted by CFS, Controller/CFS said that it would depend on the type of food involved and the actual circumstances of each case.

11. Ms Claudia MO noted that dioxins were ubiquitous in the environment resulting from natural processes or as by-products of industrial processes. As such, it was also possible for other food items to have absorbed dioxins from the environment. She queried the propriety of CFS to have announced the incidents in a high-profile manner which, in her view, had given consumers the impression that most of the hairy crabs supplied by the Mainland were contaminated with dioxins, thereby causing a serious drop in the business of hairy crab traders. She was also concerned about the difference in the testing results on hairy crabs conducted by CFS and the trade.

12. AD(FSC)/CFS responded that the prime objective of CFS was to ensure all foods for sale and intended for human consumption in Hong Kong were fit for human consumption. To address the public concern about food safety, CFS took samples at the import, wholesale and retail levels for testing under its regular food surveillance programme. AD(FSC)/CFS stressed that CFS had never said that all hairy crabs available for sale in Hong Kong were contaminated with dioxins and were not fit for consumption. CFS had kept hairy crab traders informed of the development of the incidents. Given that an application for judicial review had been filed against the Government, she was not able to provide further comment on the testing results conducted by the trade.

13. Mr Steven HO considered that the Administration should provide sufficient information about the incidents to help the public make informed choices. In announcing the test results, CFS should have made it clear that only abnormal and high consumption of contaminated hairy crabs exceeding

Action

the tolerable limit might have adverse effect on health. He urged the Administration to establish a mechanism to provide necessary support to farmers, importers and traders to minimize their loss in food incidents. Noting that many registered aquaculture farms in the Mainland were large in size, Mr HO suggested that the Administration should liaise with the Mainland authorities to explore the feasibility of dividing the aquaculture farms into smaller zones for easier identification. In his view, hairy crabs coming from different zones of the same aquaculture farm should be allowed for import into and sale in Hong Kong, as long as they were not contaminated with toxic substances.

14. PASFH(F)1 responded that CFS was mindful of the need to keep the public informed of the development of the incidents. In the announcements on excessive dioxins detected in hairy crab samples, CFS had issued risk alert and advised the public on ways to reduce the risk of dietary exposures to dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs. A document entitled "Hairy crabs with dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls exceeding CFS' action levels - Frequently Asked Questions" was also issued for this purpose.

15. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung considered it important for the Administration to identify the source of pollutants so as to formulate measures to tackle the problem. He urged the Administration to review with the Mainland authorities the methodology for testing dioxin level in hairy crabs and at what stage(s), e.g. before importation, during the transportation process or at the retail level, that hairy crab samples should be taken for testing. Mr LEUNG and Dr KWOK Ka-ki were of the view that CFS should not be blamed for taking vigorous action against traders upon detection of dioxins in hairy crabs, as such action was necessary to safeguard public health.

16. Mr CHAN Han-pan said that while he would not criticize CFS for taking control measures to safeguard food safety, he considered it more preferable for CFS to have released the test results of hairy crab samples at an earlier stage, so as to forewarn traders of the risks of detection of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs imported from two aquaculture farms in Jiangsu Province. Since dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs had not been made a mandatory test item for the import of hairy crabs and it was very difficult for the trade to engage local private laboratories with the required capability for provision of the testing services for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs, there was not much that the traders could do. He asked whether the Administration would consider granting compensation to those traders affected by the incidents.

17. In response, PASFH(F)1 explained that given that the analysis of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs involved very complicated process and high



Action

degree of precision, it normally took about two to four weeks for the analysis to be done. As the two hairy crab traders initiating the judicial review against the Government had demanded for compensation, it would not be appropriate to make any comment on this to avoid prejudicing the ongoing judicial review proceedings. In response to Mr CHAN Han-pan's further enquiry, AD(FSC)/CFS said that in general, in determining whether compensation should be made, it was necessary to first assess a party's role in the occurrence of the food safety incident which gave rise to the business/monetary loss in question.

Admin

18. Dr Pierre CHAN expressed concern about the Administration's handling of food safety incidents in recent years. In respect of food safety incidents occurred in the past three to five years, Dr CHAN requested the Administration to provide information on (i) the amount of compensation or ex-gratia payment that had been made to the affected parties, such as food retailers and suppliers, by the Administration in each of the cases and the reasons for granting the compensation/ex-gratia payment; (ii) whether the Administration had applied any formula for calculating the amount of compensation/ex-gratia payment paid to the affected parties and if yes, the details.

*Review of the Administration's monitoring measures and regulatory arrangements for the import of hairy crabs*

19. Dr Pierre CHAN suggested that the Administration should consider establishing local food safety standards in light of international practices to regulate local and imported foods. The Chairman asked whether the Administration would consider stipulating in laws the statutory standards for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in foods.

20. Dr KWOK Ka-ki held the view that the Administration should set local food safety standards and action levels for harmful substances (including dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs) in all food items by way of legislation. In doing so, food traders/importers would observe the statutory requirements and refrain from making wrong decisions in considering what should be imported for sale. He asked about the Administration's timetable for enacting legislation to regulate the levels of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in foods.

21. PASFH(F)1 gave the following responses:

- (a) dioxins were ubiquitous in the environment, which arose either naturally (e.g. volcanic eruptions and forest fires), or as by-products of industrial activities (e.g. production of chemicals, chlorine bleaching of paper pulp and metal smelting).

Action

At present, the Codex Alimentarius Commission had not recommended any standards on dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in foods. It should be noted that overseas countries set different maximum limits for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in foods, taking into account the dietary habits of their people and other relevant considerations; and

- (b) the current action level for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in respect of hairy crabs adopted by CFS did not apply to other food items. Nevertheless, CFS had, in the announcements on the incidents, advised the public on the Provisional Tolerable Monthly Intake for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs set by the Joint Food and Agriculture Organization/World Health Organization Expert Committee on Food Additives. The Administration would continue to keep in view the monitoring and regulatory arrangements and measures over dioxins in foods in the international arena and continue to review and optimize the Administration's existing measures and work in this regard. At the present stage, the Administration had no plan to set standards for dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in foods by way of legislation.

22. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and the Chairman sought clarification as to whether the Mainland authorities had agreed to include dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in their future food surveillance plan. AD(FSC)/CFS said that CFS and the Mainland authorities had been discussing the monitoring and regulatory arrangements for the import of hairy crabs to Hong Kong, including the standards and methodology for testing dioxin level in hairy crabs. The response of the Mainland authorities had been positive so far.

23. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan enquired whether any specific measures would be taken by the Administration to prevent recurrence of similar incidents in the next hairy crab season. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen said that both the hairy crab traders and consumers were victims of the incidents. He asked whether consideration would be given to conducting tests on hairy crabs at an earlier stage, increasing the frequency and number of hairy crab samples taken for testing, expediting the analysis process of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs, etc., to prevent the same problem from happening again in the next hairy crab season.

24. Controller/CFS and AD(FSC)/CFS made the following responses:

- (a) further investigation would have to be conducted by the relevant Mainland authorities to find out the causes of the incident and

Action

the source of the toxic substances. The Administration noted that apart from AQSIO, other relevant authorities (i.e. 江蘇省太湖漁業管理委員會辦公室 and 農業部漁業局) were also following up on the incidents. The Administration would decide whether any specific measures had to be taken, pending the investigation reports on the incidents to be provided by the Mainland authorities; and

- (b) CFS would continue to liaise with the Mainland authorities on the monitoring and regulatory arrangements for the import of hairy crabs to Hong Kong. CFS would consider various suggestions on enhancing the surveillance on hairy crabs, with a view to coming up with suitable improvement measures before the next hairy crab season.

25. The Chairman asked the hairy crab traders present at the meeting when they would start making preparations for the import of hairy crabs for the next year. Ms Sandy KI of Old San Yang (Hong Kong Limited) said that farmers would put crab seeds in Taihu every January for crab farming. The trade had to liaise with their Mainland counterparts and make preparations one year before the import of hairy crabs. Mr Ceasar CHAN of Tiang Ti Company Limited hoped that the Administration would discuss with the Mainland authorities the arrangements for the import of hairy crabs and inform the trade of the agreed arrangements as early as possible.

26. The Chairman sought information about the Administration's timetable for reviewing the policies and drawing up measures to enhance the monitoring and regulatory arrangements on hairy crabs, with a view to ensuring that the import into and sale of hairy crabs in Hong Kong in the next season would not be affected by similar incidents. She urged the Administration to consult the trade before formulating the relevant policies and measures. Dr KWOK Ka-ki surmised that Hong Kong and the Mainland might adopt different standards for testing of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in hairy crabs. He asked whether the Administration would (i) take any specific measures to ensure that hairy crabs imported into Hong Kong from the Mainland were fit for human consumption and (ii) consider conducting joint testing with the Mainland authorities before the hairy crabs were imported into Hong Kong. The Administration was requested to provide its response to the above issues after the meeting.

Admin

27. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan said that the incidents had undermined public confidence in consuming hairy crabs supplied by aquaculture farms in the Mainland. She asked whether any measures would be taken by the Administration (e.g. senior officials taking the lead to eat hairy crabs) to

Action

restore public confidence in the consumption of hairy crabs. Mr Steven HO said that the Administration should be proactive in making publicity efforts to rebuild public confidence in the consumption of hairy crabs.

28. Controller/CFS responded that while the consumption of a certain type of food item was a matter of personal choice, CFS would make its best efforts to ensure all food products available for sale in Hong Kong were fit for human consumption. PASFH(F)1 said that at present, some 70 aquaculture farms had registered with AQSIQ to export hairy crabs to Hong Kong. While CFS suspended on 1 November 2016 the import into and sale within Hong Kong of hairy crabs from two aquaculture farms in Jiangsu Province, hairy crabs from other registered aquaculture farms which complied with food safety regulations and requirements and were issued with health certificates by the Mainland authorities were allowed to be exported to Hong Kong for sale in the market.

**II. Site formation and associated infrastructural works for development of columbarium at Sandy Ridge Cemetery**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)337/16-17(05))

29. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") briefed Members on the proposal to upgrade part of the site formation and associated infrastructural works for development of columbarium, crematorium and related facilities at Sandy Ridge Cemetery ("5758CL") to Category A for the site formation and construction of associated road works as well as ancillary works before proceeding with the development of columbarium at the Sandy Ridge, details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)337/16-17(05)).

Impact on traffic flow arising from the operation of the columbarium and related facilities

30. Noting that the columbarium development at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery would provide a total of about 200 000 niches, Mr CHAN Han-pan was concerned whether it would generate a sudden upsurge in the number of grave sweepers, bringing about a substantial impact on traffic. He asked whether the Administration would introduce traffic management measures to relieve the heavy traffic flows and the additional pedestrian volume expected in the area following the commissioning of the columbarium facilities, in particular during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung Festivals.

Action

31. In response, USFH and Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2 ("PASFH(F)2") advised that:

- (a) the completed traffic impact assessment study concluded that the additional traffic and pedestrian volume arising from the operation of the columbarium and related facilities within the Sandy Ridge Cemetery during the Ching Ming and Chung Yeung festive periods should be manageable with the implementation of special traffic and transport measures;
- (b) as the 200 000 new niches would be completed and allocated to the public in phases, it was expected that there would not be a sudden sharp increase in pedestrian flow upon commissioning of the proposed columbarium development; and
- (c) after the commissioning of the columbarium facilities, the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department would work closely with the Hong Kong Police Force and other relevant departments to ensure that effective traffic and crowd control measures were implemented during the grave sweeping seasons. Also, the Administration would monitor the impact of the increase in traffic and pedestrian flow.

32. In response to Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's enquiry about the views of district personalities towards the development of columbarium at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery, USFH said that the North District Council had been consulted on 9 October 2014 and it had no objection to 5758CL. In general, members of the community had expressed concern on traffic issues and considered that impact on traffic should be minimized. The Administration would ensure that effective traffic and crowd control measures were implemented during the grave sweeping seasons. The proposed widening of two sections respectively on the existing Sha Ling Road and Lin Ma Hang Road were intended to increase the capacity of the roads concerned to cater for additional traffic and pedestrian volume.

33. Mr YIU Si-wing expressed support for the proposal. Noting that the proposed works project required land resumption of about 1 290 square metres of private land, he enquired whether any difficulties had been encountered in the process of land resumption. PASFH(F)2 responded that the Administration had adopted a "minimalistic" approach in resuming private land for public work projects. In the process of land resumption, the Food and Health Bureau was working closely with the Lands Department. Hitherto, no major difficulties were encountered.

Action

34. In response to the Chairman's and Mr YIU Si-wing's enquiries, USFH and PASFH(F)2 advised that the proposal under discussion was to upgrade part of 5758CL to Category A. The estimated capital cost of the proposed site formation and construction of associated road works as well as ancillary works for the development of columbarium at the Sandy Ridge Cemetery was about \$2,566.4 million in money-of-the-day prices. Approval for upgrading the remaining part of 5758CL to Category A would be sought when the picture on the overall implementation programme of the developments was clearer. For the building works on provision of the columbarium as well as related facilities in the Sandy Ridge Cemetery, separate funding applications would be required in due course.

Admin

35. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration undertook to explore the possibility of providing the Panel with further information on the estimated percentage share of the proposed project "site formation and associated infrastructural works for the development of columbarium at Sandy Ridge Cemetery" in the Government's total estimated expenditure for the entire Sandy Ridge Cemetery project.

Implementation progress of the district-based columbarium development scheme

36. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen held the view that to meet the demand for public niches, the Government policy under which the 18 districts should collectively share the responsibility of developing district-based columbarium facilities should prevail over other considerations. Noting that the Administration had identified 24 potential sites in the 18 districts for columbarium development, he enquired about the progress of respective public columbarium development projects under the district-based columbarium development scheme.

37. USFH and PASFH(F)2 replied that among the 24 sites identified for columbarium development, the Administration had consulted the relevant District Councils ("DCs") on the projects at 14 sites, and all DCs indicated support or no objection to the projects. These projects, which would provide about 590 000 new niches in total, accounted for around two-third of the total number of new niches available in all the 24 projects. The Administration would follow up on the projects in the remaining sites, including kicking start the consultation as early as possible with the relevant DCs and following up the design work. At the request of the Chairman, USFH undertook to provide the Panel with information on the latest progress of work in each of the sites and the estimated number of new niches to be provided by these projects in the coming five to 10 years.

Admin

Action

38. Summing up, the Chairman said that no members had objection to the Administration submitting its proposal to the Public Works Subcommittee.

**III. Any other business**

39. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:44 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
10 February 2017

**Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene**  
**Special meeting on Monday, 19 December 2016, at 10:45 am**  
**in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Item I - "Update on the incidents of hairy crabs detected with dioxins and regulation of import of fresh food produce"**

**Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations**

No.	Name of deputation	Submission / Major views and concerns
1.	Shiu Pong Trading (Hong Kong) Company Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● LC Paper No. CB(2)429/16-17(01)</li> </ul>
2.	Wah Kee Wing Cheong Ho	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The Centre for Food Safety ("CFS") should strike a balance between protecting public health and minimizing adverse effect on the trade in handling the incidents of hairy crabs detected with dioxins ("the incidents").</li> <li>● CFS' sudden ban on the import into and sale within Hong Kong of hairy crabs from the aquaculture farms concerned had dealt a severe blow to the hairy crab traders. CFS should have given more time to the trade to discuss how the problems should be dealt with before imposing the ban.</li> <li>● In announcing the incidents, CFS should have informed the public that only abnormal and high consumption of hairy crabs to a certain level might cause adverse health effect.</li> </ul>
3.	Shing Lung Hung Company	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● LC Paper No. CB(2)429/16-17(02)</li> </ul>
4.	Tiang Ti Company Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● CFS' sudden ban on the import into and sale within Hong Kong of hairy crabs from the aquaculture farms concerned had dealt a severe blow to the hairy crab traders.</li> <li>● CFS should give advice to the trade on how to handle the incidents to minimize the impact on the trade.</li> </ul>
5.	New Sam Yung (Hong Kong) Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● LC Paper No. CB(2)395/16-17(03)</li> </ul>
6.	Old San Yang (Hong Kong) Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● LC Paper No. CB(2)429/16-17(03)</li> </ul>
7.	Man Trompp Food Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● The results of the tests conducted by the trade indicated that the crabs did not contain excessive dioxins. CFS should identify the source of the pollutants and investigate whether the crabs were contaminated during the transportation process.</li> </ul>



No.	Name of deputation	Submission / Major views and concerns
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● The trade had complied with the relevant requirements in arranging import of hairy crabs into Hong Kong. CFS' sudden ban on the import into and sale within Hong Kong of hairy crabs from the aquaculture farms concerned had dealt a severe blow to the hairy crab traders and was unfair to the trade.</li></ul>

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
10 February 2017