

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)944/16-17  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/FE

**Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene**

**Minutes of meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 10 January 2017, at 2:30 pm**  
**in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan (Chairman)  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP

Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung  
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim  
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

**Members  
absent** : Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

**Public Officers  
attending** : Item IV

Professor Sophia CHAN, JP  
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Miss Diane WONG  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Mr FORK Ping-lam  
Assistant Director (Operations) 3  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr LEE Ming-wai  
Pest Control Officer-in-charge  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr YUEN Ming-chi  
Consultant (Pest Control)  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Item V

Professor Sophia CHAN, JP  
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Miss Diane WONG  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Mr FORK Ping-lam  
Assistant Director (Operations) 3  
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Josephine SO  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Wendy LO  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Emma CHEUNG  
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)529/16-17)

The minutes of the meeting held on 8 November 2016 were confirmed.

**II. Information papers issued since the last meeting**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)413/16-17(01), CB(2)514/16-17(01) and CB(2)519/16-17(01))

2. Members noted that the following papers had been issued since the last meeting:

- (a) letter dated 12 December 2016 from Hon CHU Hoi-dick concerning the need for the Administration to review the Co-operative Societies Ordinance (Cap. 33) and relevant policy support;
- (b) Administration's response to the letter dated 12 December 2016 from Hon CHU Hoi-dick concerning the need for the Administration to review the Co-operative Societies Ordinance (Cap. 33) and relevant policy support; and
- (c) Administration's information paper on its work plan regarding antimicrobial resistance ("AMR").

Action

3. Referring to item (c) in paragraph 2 above, the Chairman suggested and members agreed that the Administration should explain to the Panel in detail the progress in tackling the threat of AMR at a Panel meeting, the agenda of which would include an item covering issues relating to the use of veterinary drugs in food animals and cultured fish and the surveillance of veterinary drug residues in meat and aquatic products.

**III. Date of next meeting and items for discussion**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)531/16-17(01) and (02))

Policy briefing on 24 January 2017

4. The Chairman reminded members that a meeting had been scheduled for Tuesday, 24 January 2017, from 4:30 pm to 6:00 pm, to receive a briefing by the Secretary for Food and Health ("SFH") on the Chief Executive's 2017 Policy Address in respect of food safety, environmental hygiene and agriculture and fisheries.

Regular meeting in February 2017

5. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting scheduled for Tuesday, 14 February 2017 at 2:30 pm:

- (a) Bio-security measures implemented in local chicken farms;
- (b) Report on the Food Surveillance Programme for 2016; and
- (c) Implementation of the Nutrition Labelling Scheme.

6. The Chairman informed members that Dr CHIANG Lai-wan had written in on 10 January 2017, i.e. on the same day of this meeting, expressing concern about a recent case reported in the media where a restaurant was suspected to have used "fake" rice. Dr CHIANG said that the matter had caused wide public concern. The Chairman suggested that the Administration should be requested to provide a written response to the issues raised in Dr CHIANG's letter. In the Chairman's view, the Administration should look into the matter and take rice samples at various levels for testing and analysis under the Food Surveillance Programme of the Centre for Food Safety ("CFS"), and make available the test results to members of the public as early as possible so as to address their concerns. As the Administration would brief members on the work of CFS in respect of the Food Surveillance Programme for 2016 at the regular meeting in February 2017, the Chairman considered it opportune for the Administration to make a report on the matter under the relevant agenda item. Members agreed to the Chairman's suggestion.

Action

(*Post-meeting note*: Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's letter dated 10 January 2007 was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)583/16-17 on 12 January 2007. The Chinese and English versions of the Administration's response to Dr CHIANG's letter were circulated to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(2)648/16-17 and CB(2)682/16-17 respectively on 18 and 23 January 2017.)

**IV. Enhanced mosquito prevention and control measures in face of threats from Zika Virus Infection**

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)531/16-17(03) and (04))

7. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") briefed members on the concerted efforts made by various government departments in mosquito prevention and control in face of threats from Zika virus infection, as detailed in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)531/16-17(03)). Members noted the updated background brief on the subject prepared by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat (LC Paper No. CB(2)531/16-17(04)).

Anti-mosquito work

8. Noting that ovitraps placed at selected locations under the dengue vector surveillance programme ("surveillance programme") could only detect the larval breeding rate of Aedine mosquitoes but not other mosquito species, Mr LUK Chung-hung expressed concern that the data collected under the surveillance programme could not fully reflect the mosquito problem in the territory.

9. USFH responded that two different indices were recorded under the surveillance programme, namely (a) the Area Ovitrap Index for *Aedes albopictus* ("AOI"); and (b) the Monthly Ovitrap Index for *Aedes albopictus*. In monitoring the distribution of *Aedes albopictus* in selected areas, the Food and Environmental Department ("FEHD") would step up its mosquito control work targeted at all species of mosquitoes when AOI of a particular area reached or exceeded 20%. Consultant (Pest Control), FEHD further advised that other than placing ovitraps at selected locations to monitor the distribution of *Aedes albopictus* to guard against dengue fever, FEHD also took preventive and control measures to minimize the risks of other mosquito-borne diseases, including Zika virus infection, Japanese encephalitis and malaria. For instance, trapping of adult mosquitoes, including *Culex tritaeniorhynchus*, would be conducted in all selected locations (e.g. Yuen Long, Tuen Mun and Sai Kung) monthly throughout the year for test on Japanese encephalitis virus; and some 600 streams in the

Action

territory were covered under the malaria vector prevention programme for the prevention of the anopheles mosquitoes which could transmit malaria.

Admin

10. Mr LUK Chung-hung asked whether any new and more effective measures, other than the mosquito prevention and control measures already in place, would be adopted/considered in the Government's anti-mosquito work. The Administration was requested to provide a written response after the meeting.

11. In view of the tampering of ovitrap case occurred in 2006, Mr CHAN Han-pan suggested that FEHD should engage an independent organization to place ovitraps and collect data under the surveillance programme. In his view, the surveillance work and the regular mosquito control operations should be carried out by different parties to enhance the transparency and credibility of the surveillance programme. Pest Control Officer-in-charge, FEHD ("PCO I-c/FEHD") responded that ovitraps were placed by FEHD at selected locations according to the recommendations given by the World Health Organization ("WHO") for the surveillance programme. FEHD had two different teams of staff responsible for placing ovitraps and carrying out regular anti-mosquito operations. Ovitrap were mainly set up in areas where local dengue fever cases had been reported, as well as densely populated housing estates, schools, and so on. To prevent recurrence of ovitrap tampering, FEHD had improved the design of ovitraps by adding caps to cover the ovitraps so as to avoid inadvertent spilling of mosquito control pesticides into the ovitraps when anti-mosquito operations were carried out. If there were suspected cases of tampering with ovitraps, FEHD would collect the data again at the location concerned to ensure accuracy.

12. Mr Steven HO suggested that consideration be given to setting up ovitraps at places with higher human concentration, such as schools, parks and elderly homes. As Hong Kong people enjoyed hiking in the countryside, Mr HO considered that FEHD should also set up ovitraps at country parks and main transport interchanges in the countryside to monitor the situation of mosquito breeding. PCO I-c/FEHD advised that FEHD would review the locations for placing ovitraps from time to time. For instance, in response to the four local dengue fever cases reported in 2016, a total of 20 ovitraps had been added to seven locations starting from January 2017. FEHD would also take into account the latest developments in the districts, such as the establishment of new housing estates, schools and hospitals, in deciding the locations for placing ovitraps in the surveillance areas. As countryside and rural areas were natural habitats of mosquitoes, it was difficult to eliminate all the breeding grounds for mosquitoes in these areas. Instead of setting up ovitraps for mosquito surveillance in these areas, it was more advisable for visitors to take preventive measures to avoid mosquito bites when they visited the countryside.

Action

13. Noting that FEHD would launch by phases the Anti-mosquito Campaign 2017 with relevant government departments, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired about the differences in the anti-mosquito work carried out during FEHD's regular control operations and the Anti-mosquito Campaign. Mr CHAN also asked whether FEHD would take any targeted measures to tackle the mosquito problem in areas where a high AOI was recorded (e.g. Tseung Kwan O North where high AOIs of 31.7% and 35% were recorded in May and June 2016 respectively) and whether FEHD would examine the reasons for the high AOIs recorded in some locations.

14. Assistant Director (Operations) 3, FEHD ("AD(Ops)3/FEHD") responded that manpower resources would be pooled up for FEHD to step up inspection, preventive and control actions, as well as publicity work during the Anti-mosquito Campaign. FEHD would also work with relevant government departments to promote the message of mosquito prevention and control and would identify potential breeding sites and trouble spots which required enhanced anti-mosquito actions. AD(Ops)3/FEHD further advised that when AOI of a particular area reached the alert level of 20%, FEHD would convene district task force meetings with a view to stepping up the co-ordination of government efforts in mosquito control. FEHD would also conduct detailed inspections, increase the survey frequency and eliminate potential mosquito breeding sites within a radius of 100 metres around ovitraps with positive finding. Mosquito breeding places would be eliminated or applied with larvicides, if needed. AOIs usually dropped to a lower level as a result of the measures taken.

15. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen expressed concern about the effectiveness of the public education and publicity programmes on prevention of mosquito-borne diseases. He observed that the Facebook page of Keep Clean Ambassador "Ah Tak" was not frequently viewed by the public. AD(Ops)3/FEHD responded that the publicity and educational programmes were mainly implemented by FEHD's staff. Apart from disseminating promotional messages through Facebook, FEHD would make use of a wide range of publicity channels, such as broadcasting television and radio Announcements in the Public Interest and video clips, to alert the public of the importance of taking anti-mosquito measures.

16. Noting from paragraph 3 of the Administration's paper that some countries and territories in Southeast Asia had been classified as Category 2 countries with vector-borne Zika virus infections, the Chairman enquired whether the Administration would provide any advice to outbound travellers on the need to take mosquito preventive and control measures while travelling overseas. USFH responded that the Centre for Health Protection of the Department of Health ("DH") had been adopting preventive measures at boundary control points and providing health advice to travellers via various

Action

publicity channels. To minimize the risks of importation of infected mosquitoes by aircrafts and infections on flights, DH would launch a new scheme requiring aircraft disinsection on all incoming flights with last port of call from Zika-affected areas before landing in Hong Kong. FEHD would work closely with the Port Health Office of DH on the disinsection of aircrafts.

Monitoring the infestation of biting midges

17. Ms Starry LEE expressed concern about the infestation of biting midges in some areas of Hong Kong. She said that some LegCo members and District Council ("DC") members belonging to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong ("DAB") had put bug stickers at 169 selected sites in Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan, Tung Chung as well as the Lantau and several outlying islands from 12 to 16 May 2016 and caught 8 536 midges within 96 hours. It was also reported in the media that people bitten by midges might develop serious symptoms. She was disappointed that the Administration's paper had not mentioned any control measures targeting at biting midges. Ms LEE asked whether FEHD had conducted any studies on the problem of biting midges infestation in Hong Kong and whether the Administration would consider DAB's suggestion of formulating relevant indicators for assessing the infestation of biting midges.

18. USFH responded that in view of the public concern about Zika virus infection, the Administration's paper gave a detailed account of the anti-mosquito measures taken by government departments in face of the threats from Zika virus infection. Regarding the problem of biting midges, FEHD had been in liaison with parties concerned to explore the measures for addressing the problem. PCO I-c/FEHD advised that FEHD had invited Professor YU Yixin of China, a renowned expert in studying biting midges, to visit Hong Kong in late June 2016 for conducting studies and providing guidance on how to monitor the infestation of biting midges. During the visit, Professor YU inspected and collected samples at various locations. It was discovered that biting midges found in Hong Kong were not vectors of mosquito-borne diseases such as dengue fever, Japanese encephalitis and Zika virus infection. FEHD had taken into account the advice of Professor YU as well as experiences of other countries/areas in monitoring the infestation of biting midges in Hong Kong.

19. Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed concern that the nuisance caused to the public by biting midges was much more serious than that caused by mosquitoes. He and Mr Steven HO called on the Administration to formulate relevant indicators for monitoring biting midges, announce regularly the surveillance results and take targeted measures to control midges in areas where the infestation problem was particularly serious. PCO I-c/FEHD



Action

advised that WHO had not published guidelines for systematic surveillance of biting midges. According to the Administration's understanding, the Mainland, Taiwan, Singapore, Malaysia as well as some countries in America and Europe had not formulated any index for the surveillance of biting midges.

Admin

20. The Chairman requested the Administration to provide the Panel with details of the studies on the surveillance of biting midges infestation in Hong Kong conducted by experts and the measures taken/to be taken by the Administration to address the problem of biting midges in various districts of the territory.

21. The Deputy Chairman said that many residents who were affected by the infestation problem of biting midges, in particular parents, were worried that their children would be bitten by midges when they were playing at parks. He urged FEHD to advise the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") on the right approach for maintenance of vegetation so as to reduce the breeding places for midges, and to work with LCSD to step up control measures against biting midges at venues managed by LCSD. PCO I-c/FEHD advised that FEHD had been keeping records on the number of complaints received by government departments about nuisances caused by midges in areas under their management, with a view to formulating strategies and measures to control midges. Apart from collaborating with LCSD to carry out anti-mosquito work at the district level, FEHD also provided training to LCSD staff on mosquito prevention and control work, including knowledge for controlling biting midges.

22. The Deputy Chairman suggested the Administration regularly disseminate relevant information and complaint figures about the biting midges problem at various parks and playgrounds, so as to keep the public informed of the situation. AD(Ops)3/FEHD said that in face of threats from Zika virus infection, FEHD convened district task force meetings with relevant departments and organizations every month to enhance the anti-mosquito work under their purview. FEHD's staff would co-ordinate the Government efforts in mosquito control. While FEHD would keep the number of complaints received about biting midges problem at public places, the number of complaints in relation to parks and playgrounds was provided by LCSD.

Motion proposed by a member

23. Mr CHAN Han-pan indicated his intention to move a motion. The Chairman ruled that the motion was related to the agenda item under discussion and members present agreed that it should be dealt with. After Mr CHAN had briefed the Panel on his proposed motion, the Chairman

Action

ordered that the voting bell be rung for five minutes to notify Panel members of the voting.

24. Mr CHAN Han-pan moved the following motion, which was seconded by Mr Steven HO:

(議案中文措辭)

本事務委員會促請政府當局檢討現行針對蚊蟲的監察制度，研究將其他有害生物如蠓蟲等納入為監察對象，並制訂相關指標，以便根據指數的不同制訂相應的預防與應對策略。

(English translation of the motion)

This Panel urges the Administration to review the existing surveillance system targeting mosquito pests, consider including other pests, such as biting midges, under the surveillance system, and formulate relevant indicators so that preventive strategies and responses corresponding to different index levels can be drawn up.

25. The Chairman put Mr CHAN Han-pan's motion to vote. Mr CHU Hoi-dick requested a division. The voting results were as follows:

(a) the following members voted for the motion:

Mr LAU Kwok-fan (Deputy Chairman), Mr Tommy CHEUNG, Mr WONG Ting-kwong, Ms Starry LEE, Ms Claudia MO, Mr Steven HO, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Ms Alice MAK, Mr KWOK Wai-keung, Mr Christopher CHEUNG, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Dr Elizabeth QUAT, Mr Martin LIAO, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan, Mr Andrew WAN, Mr CHU Hoi-dick, Mr SHIU Ka-chun, Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, Mr LUK Chung-hung, Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Dr YIU Chung-yim and Dr LAU Siu-lai  
(22 members)

(b) no member voted against the motion or abstained from voting.

26. The Chairman declared that 22 members voted for the motion, and no member voted against the motion or abstained from voting. The motion was carried.

*(Post-meeting note: The Chinese version of the Administration's response to the motion was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)760/16-17(01) on 7 February 2017).*

**V. Annual report regarding the dialogue between the Secretary for Food and Health and the Environmental Hygiene Committees under District Councils on matters related to keeping Hong Kong clean**

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)531/16-17(05) and (06))

27. At the invitation of the Chairman, USFH briefed members on the outcomes and follow-up actions of the meetings held between SFH and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Committees ("FEHCs") of the 18 DCs on keeping Hong Kong clean, as set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)531/16-17(05)). Members noted the information note on the subject prepared by the LegCo Secretariat (LC Paper No. CB(2)531/16-17(06)).

Pilot scheme on installation of Internet Protocol cameras

28. Ms Starry LEE said that the environmental hygiene condition of some streets and public areas in certain old districts was far from satisfactory, probably due to the poor services provided by FEHD's outsourced cleansing service contractors. She called on FEHD and its contractors to step up the cleansing services so as to improve district environmental hygiene. Ms LEE expressed support for the implementation of the pilot scheme under which Internet Protocol ("IP") cameras had been installed at certain refuse dumping black spots ("pilot scheme") to facilitate the monitoring of the offences and planning of more effective enforcement actions. She, however, was concerned that only three districts, namely the Central & Western, Sham Shui Po and Yuen Long Districts, had been selected for conducting the trial. She asked whether consideration would be given to extending the pilot scheme to cover other districts before the completion of the six-month pilot scheme.

29. Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed disappointment that the Administration did not install IP cameras at those hygiene black spots suggested by him and some DC members. While expressing support for the pilot scheme, he and Mr KWOK Wai-keung hoped that the Administration would expeditiously extend the pilot scheme to cover all 18 districts across the territory.

30. USFH and AD(Ops)3/FEHD made the following responses:

- (a) FEHD identified one district each on Hong Kong Island, Kowloon and the New Territories which had relatively more fly-tipping black spots and environmental hygiene complaints received for conducting the pilot scheme. The pilot scheme had commenced since 30 December 2016, whereby IP cameras had been installed at six fly-tipping black spots in Central & Western, Sham Shui Po and Yuen Long Districts to step up surveillance on illegal dumping of refuse;

Action

- (b) FEHD would examine the effectiveness of the pilot scheme upon its completion before deciding on the way forward. FEHD would assess the additional resources required for extending the pilot scheme and stepping up the law enforcement efforts. Also, it would understand public expectations and identify areas of concern of relevant parties (e.g. the privacy concern of the public) over the installation of IP cameras, with a view to improving the effectiveness of the scheme; and
- (c) on the selection of sites for installation of IP cameras, the primary consideration of FEHD was whether the site was technically suitable for installing IP cameras. FEHD would also take into account the seriousness of the fly-tipping problem and the views of the DCs concerned. Respective DCs could put up their requests for installation of IP cameras at hygiene black spots in their districts for FEHD's consideration. Subject to positive outcome and DCs' endorsement of the scheme, FEHD would consult respective DCs on installation of IP cameras at the hygiene black spots and consider the extension of the pilot scheme in a timely manner when circumstances and resources permitted.

Admin

31. Given that the Administration would examine the effectiveness of the pilot scheme on installation of IP cameras upon its completion, the Chairman requested the Administration to provide the Panel with the findings of the review of the pilot scheme once available.

32. Mr KWOK Wai-keung said that the hygiene condition of rear lanes and private streets had been a long-standing problem and a matter of public concern. Many rear lanes and private streets were plagued with refuse, abandoned articles and construction waste. He enquired whether consideration would be given to installing IP cameras to monitor the fly-tipping activities in rear lanes/private streets and putting in place a mechanism to encourage members of the public to report illegal dumping activities.

33. AD(Ops)3/FEHD said that since the "Keep Cleans 2015 @ Hong Kong : Our Home" Campaign, the Administration had been providing assistance to owners of problematic private streets as far as practicable. As regards the suggestion of installing IP cameras on private streets, it might involve complex legal issues in respect of land right or property right which needed further consideration. As advised earlier, FEHD would examine the effectiveness of the pilot scheme upon its completion before deciding on the way forward. USFH and AD(Ops)3/FEHD further advised that apart from launching the pilot scheme, FEHD had plans to reinforce the street washing

Action

services provided to the 18 districts (including the cleansing services for central road dividers located on streets with high traffic flow) by enhancing the service requirements for street washing when the street cleansing contracts in the respective districts were next due for renewal. To combat public cleanliness offences, FEHD would step up enforcement actions against littering and waste disposal.

34. The Deputy Chairman said that he had received complaints from members of the public that the effect of collaboration among bureaux and departments in improving environmental hygiene was not sustainable after the keep clean campaigns, and that the environmental hygiene condition of some areas had even got worse. In his view, the Administration should extend the pilot scheme to cover all the 18 districts.

35. USFH responded that the installation of IP cameras at hygiene black spots to step up surveillance on illegal dumping of refuse was in fact one of the initiatives arising from at the regular meetings between SFH and the Chairmen/Vice-Chairmen of FEHCs under DCs set up after the "Keep Clean 2015 @ Hong Kong: Our Home" Campaign. FEHD would ride on the experience gained in the pilot scheme and consider extending the scheme to other districts, subject to positive outcome and DCs' endorsement of the scheme. On the other hand, FEHD would strengthen civic education through various publicity channels on the importance of keeping the environment clean, which was also an effective strategy of improving environmental hygiene in the long run.

36. Mr Steven HO shared the view of the Deputy Chairman that the pilot scheme should be extended to cover all 18 districts. In his opinion, if the cost for installing IP cameras was not too high, the Administration should, for the sake of fairness to all, identify areas across the territory which had serious hygiene problem for installation of IP cameras. He requested the Administration to provide information on the expenditure incurred on the installation of IP cameras at refuse dumping black spots in the Central & Western, Sham Shui Po and Yuen Long Districts.

Admin

37. Mr Tommy CHEUNG and Dr KWOK Ka-ki both pointed out that the installation of IP cameras at public places might give rise to privacy concerns. They asked whether notices would be posted within the coverage of the IP cameras to warn the public that IP cameras were in operation and whether any guidelines had been drawn up to regulate the use, disclosure, retention and destruction of footage recorded by IP cameras.

38. USFH and AD(Ops)3/FEHD advised that FEHD had sought legal advice on the pilot scheme on installation of IP cameras from the Department of Justice, which remarked that the scheme basically did not contravene

Action

relevant legislation. FEHD would implement the arrangements in accordance with the Guidance on CCTV Surveillance Practices issued by the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data, including posting notices within the coverage of the IP cameras to warn the public that IP cameras were in operation. FEHD would also formulate clear guidance notes and operational guidelines in order to comply with the provisions on the manner of collecting personal data under the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Cap. 486) ("PDPO"). Should no prosecution be instituted against the offences within six months, the footage so recorded would be deleted. At the request of Mr Tommy CHEUNG, the Administration undertook to provide the Panel with a copy of the guidance notes and operational guidelines on the use and disclosure of the footage recorded by IP cameras to be drawn up by FEHD to ensure compliance with the provisions on the manner of collecting personal data under PDPO.

Admin

39. Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired how the law enforcement agencies would make use of the footage recorded by IP cameras for taking legal actions and the number of prosecutions instituted since the implementation of the pilot scheme. In response, AD(Ops)3/FEHD explained that the main purpose of installing IP cameras at selected locations was to enhance deterrent effect and facilitate planning of more effective enforcement strategies/actions. FEHD would identify the time and patterns of the offences through the information captured from the footage recorded, and FEHD would plan and carry out on-site enforcement operations against offenders. In parallel, on-site enforcement operations could allow real-time surveillance on black spots to enable on-the-spot prosecutions against offenders by the law enforcement officers who stationed nearby. AD(Ops)3/FEHD further advised that although the pilot scheme had only been launched for a short time, the initial feedback on the scheme was positive. So far, no prosecutions were instituted under the scheme.

#### Review of the cleansing contract tendering system

40. Mr CHAN Han-pan opined that FEHD's practice of awarding cleansing service contracts under the existing service contract tendering mechanism to the lowest bidder was the root cause for inferior cleansing services. He enquired about FEHD's progress of reviewing the tendering system and its timetable for completing the review.

41. USFH and Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2 ("PASFH(F)2") responded that FEHD agreed that there was scope for improving the relevant tendering arrangements as well as contract supervision and management. It was reviewing its cleansing contract tendering system, guided by the needs to uphold the requirements on service quality and to observe the principle of value for money. FEHD would

Action

strengthen its supervision of outsourced street cleansing services through the provision of additional supervisory staff and sustained efforts to keep the service performance of contractors under close monitoring, in a bid to ensure that the contractors delivered services in accordance with the contract requirements. At the request of Mr CHAN Han-pan, the Administration undertook to report to the Panel on FEHD's progress of fine-tuning the cleansing contract tendering system and its timetable for completing the exercise.

Admin

42. Mr Steven HO asked whether the Administration would consider revamping the service contract awarding system so as not to award cleansing service contracts merely on account of tender price. PASFH(F)2 responded that FEHD let out its cleansing service contracts through open tender in accordance with the procurement requirements and procedures of the Government and evaluated the tenders using the "standard marking scheme" ("SMS") approved by the Government's Central Tender Board. Under SMS, the relative weightings of technical score and price score were 30% and 70% respectively. The assessment criteria for technical score comprised, among others, the contractors' service experience/past performance track records for relevant government contracts. To ensure the competence of the selected contractor, tenderers must attain passing marks for individual items as well as overall passing mark in the technical quality assessment before they could proceed to the next stage of price assessment. The tender with the highest overall score would be accepted by the Government. In gist, the Government did not award service contracts merely on the basis of the tender price. PASFH(F)2 further advised that about 40% of the 132 service contracts awarded during the period between 2013 and 2015 were awarded to tenderers not offering the lowest bid price, with about 6% to those offering the 5<sup>th</sup> lowest price. USFH said that FEHD would set out clearly in the contracts the performance requirements and standards that must be met by the contractors and closely monitor the contractors' performance throughout the contract period.

Admin

43. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration undertook to provide information on the criteria adopted by the Administration in evaluating the tenders before letting out the cleansing service contracts.

44. The Deputy Chairman considered that FEHD should collaborate with DCs in respect of improving district environmental hygiene. In his view, the Administration should consider allocating additional funding to DCs for setting up "Funds for Improving Community's Environmental Hygiene" so that individual DCs might make use of the additional resources to address the environmental hygiene problems unique to their districts. Regarding the review on FEHD's service contract tendering mechanism, the Deputy Chairman was of the view that the Administration should take into account

Action

the comments of DCs and district personalities on the daily performance of the tenderers in considering awarding and renewing the service contracts. He requested the Administration to provide a written response to his suggestion in this regard.

Admin

Marine and coastal cleanliness and other environmental hygiene issues

45. Mr Tommy CHEUNG and Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed concern about the problems of floating refuse in the harbour waters and refuse on beaches. Noting that an inter-departmental working group had been set up in November 2012 to review and formulate measures to improve the cleanliness of shorelines, Mr CHEUNG asked how the Administration would assess the effectiveness of the improvement measures implemented as per the recommendation of the working group. Dr KWOK asked what specific measures had been taken by the Administration for improving the cleanliness of shorelines and the amount of additional resources allocated for stepping up the frequencies of clearing marine refuse in the harbour waters as well as refuse on beaches.

46. AD(Ops)3/FEHD responded that while the control of marine dumping was overseen by the Environmental Protection Department ("EPD"), FEHD was responsible for the clearing of marine refuse at unallocated coastal areas. With the provision of additional resources, FEHD now had two contractual cleansing teams responsible for clearance of refuse at unallocated coastal areas. In the light of the findings of the consultancy study commissioned by EPD, FEHD had strategically stepped up the frequencies of clearing marine refuse at 22 priority sites under its purview. FEHD had also drawn up actions plans to clear the marine refuse at 70 other sites identified. The Administration would provide supplementary information after the meeting to address in detail Mr CHEUNG's and Dr KWOK's enquiries.

Admin

47. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen expressed concern about the environmental hygiene situation of camping sites on outlying islands, such as Tung Lung Island and Grass Island. He noted from media reports that many people left rubbish at the camping sites after the camping activities. USFH and AD(Ops)3/FEHD responded that FEHD was responsible for the clearing of refuse on Tung Lung Island and Grass Island. While FEHD's staff and its contractors could not perform cleansing services frequently at some dangerous locations on these islands for safety's sake, FEHD would step up the cleansing services at the black spots during weekends and public holidays.

48. Pointing out the serious rodent problem at specific locations/districts, including rear lanes, private streets and old tenement buildings having poor hygiene conditions, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan reckoned that residents living in "three-nil" buildings (i.e. buildings without Owners' Corporations, residents'



Action

organizations or property management companies) might have difficulties in engaging garbage collectors to collect and deliver domestic waste to the Public Refuse Collection Points. The residents living in these "three-nil" buildings might therefore throw domestic waste into litter containers on the streets. She was concerned that the newly designed litter containers with smaller openings introduced by FEHD in June 2016 had made it inconvenient for the public to put large-sized refuse into the containers. The refuse discarded at the side or on the top of the litter containers might then cause rodent infestation. She cautioned that the improper dispose of refuse might get worse after the implementation of the Municipal Solid Waste Charging Policy.

49. AD(Ops)3/FEHD responded that through the newly designed litter containers coupled with publicity, the Government hoped that the public would understand that litter containers were placed for pedestrians to discard small refuse, and that the bad habits of disposing domestic or industrial waste into (or even at the side or on the top of) litter containers would be gradually changed. He further said that residents living in "three-nil" buildings should arrange for the delivery of the domestic waste to the nearby public refuse collection points.

50. Mr SHIU Ka-chun said that he was not convinced that the enhanced cleansing efforts during the keep clean campaigns could sustain. It was his understanding that the environmental hygiene condition of Cha Kwo Ling squatters' village was poor. He thus urged FEHD to reinforce its cleansing services. USFH assured members that FEHD would continue to promote concerted efforts in improving environmental hygiene after the keep clean campaigns. In response to the enquiries of Mr SHIU and the Chairman, AD(Ops)3/FEHD advised that according to a study conducted by a university and the observation of FEHD's staff, some shop tenants still disposed of commercial refuse at the side or on the top of the litter containers placed in public places with smaller openings. FEHD had taken two ad hoc enforcement operations in August and September 2016 to take prosecutions against offenders. Additional resources had also been provided to FEHD for stepping up enforcement actions against littering offences. The situation had improved with the measures taken. FEHD would replace existing litter containers in public places with the newly designed litter containers when the stock of the old ones was used up.

Motions proposed by members

51. Mr CHAN Han-pan and the Deputy Chairman both indicated their intention to move motions under this discussion item. The Chairman ruled that the two motions proposed by Mr CHAN and the Deputy Chairman were directly related to the agenda item and members present agreed that the

Action

motions should be dealt with and be voted upon. The Chairman thus ordered that the voting bell be rung for five minutes to notify Panel members of the voting.

*Motion 1*

52. Mr CHAN Han-pan moved the following motion, which was seconded by Ms Starry LEE and Mr Steven HO:

(議案中文措辭)

本事務委員會促請政府當局全面檢討潔淨服務的招標制度，並盡快向公眾交代檢討進度。

(English translation of the motion)

This Panel urges the Administration to comprehensively review the tendering system for cleansing services and inform the public of the review progress as soon as possible.

53. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The results were: 21 members voted in favour of the motion; no member voted against it or abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

*Motion 2*

54. The Deputy Chairman moved the following motion, which was seconded by Mr Steven HO:

(議案中文措辭)

本事務委員會促請政府當局加強改善地區環境衛生的相關工作，具體建議包括：

- (一) 盡快將「安裝網絡攝錄機試驗計劃」擴展至全港十八區，並由十八區區議會就安裝網絡攝錄機的位置提出建議；以及
- (二) 研究撥款予區議會設立「社區環境衛生改善基金」，讓區議會能自主運用相關撥款，用於社區環境改善及相關的宣傳與公眾教育工作，以改善各區面對的不同社區環境衛生問題。

Action

(English translation of the motion)

This Panel urges the Administration to strengthen its work in improving district environmental hygiene and the specific recommendations include:

- (1) expeditiously extending the pilot scheme on installation of IP cameras to cover all 18 districts across the territory, with the sites for installation of IP cameras to be recommended by the 18 DCs; and
- (2) examining the allocation of funding to DCs for setting up "Funds for Improving Community's Environmental Hygiene" so that DCs may, at their own discretion, use the funds to improve the community's environment and conduct related publicity and public education work, so as to address the different community environmental hygiene problems faced by various districts.

55. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Mr CHAN Han-pan requested a division. The voting results were as follows:

- (a) the following members voted for the motion:

Dr Helena WONG (Chairman), Mr LAU Kwok-fan (Deputy Chairman), Mr WONG Ting-kwong, Ms Starry LEE, Ms Claudia MO, Mr Steven HO, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Dr Elizabeth QUAT, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan and Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan  
(11 members)

- (b) the following members voted against the motion:

Mr Tommy CHEUNG, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr Alvin YEUNG, Mr SHIU Ka-fai, Dr YIU Chung-yim and Dr LAU Siu-lai  
(six members)

- (c) the following members abstained from the voting:

Mr Martin LIAO and Mr KWONG Chun-yu  
(two members)

56. The Chairman declared that 11 members voted in favor of the motion, six members voted against it and two members abstained from voting. The motion was carried.

Action

Concluding remarks

57. The Chairman said that due to time constraints, the discussion item "Implementation of the Demerit Points System for licensed food premises" could not be dealt with at this Panel meeting. The Chairman said that she would decide after the meeting whether the discussion of the above item should be deferred to the next meeting scheduled for 24 January 2017 or the regular meeting on 14 February 2017.

*(Post-meeting note: The Chairman subsequently instructed that discussion on the item was deferred to the meeting on Tuesday, 24 January 2017. The revised agenda for the relevant meeting was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)590/16-17 on 12 January 2017.)*

**VI. Any other business**

58. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:28 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
13 March 2017