

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1935/16-17  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/1/16

**Panel on Welfare Services and Panel on Health Services**

**Joint Subcommittee on Long-term Care Policy**

**Minutes of the fifth meeting**  
**held on Wednesday, 19 April 2017, at 9:30 am**  
**in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu

**Members absent** : Hon SHIU Ka-chun (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

**Member attending** : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

**Public Officers attending** : Item I

Professor Sophia CHAN Siu-chee, JP  
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Miss Fiona CHAU Suet-mui  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health  
(Health)1

Ms Alice CHEONG Fung-yu  
Chief Executive Officer (Health)3  
Food and Health Bureau

**Attendance by invitation** : Item I

The Against Elderly Abuse of Hong Kong

Ms Locasi LEUNG Ka-chung  
Consultant (Elderly Services)

Civic Party

Mr James PANG Hin-to  
Secretary of the New Territories East Branch

Miss KWAN Kit-man

殘疾人士及長期病患者就業關注組

Mr CHIU Ho-lam  
主席

Mr YU Kam-chung

Ms KOT Mei-wa

關注長者口腔健康聯席

李淑卿女士  
發言人

香港社區組織協會

連瑋翹先生  
社區組織幹事

香港老人權益聯盟

陳慕貞女士  
長者代表

長者健康關注組

林伯鴻先生  
代表

長者牙科關注組

譚秀蘭女士  
代表

Ms HO Bo-ching

Kwai Chung Estate's Tooth Concerning Group

郭容根先生  
Representative

The Power of Tooth!

Ms SO Sim-yan  
Representative

Kwai Chung Estate Elderly's Tooth Concerning Group

Ms CHENG Pui-chun  
Representative

Kwai Chung Estate ㉟ I want tooth!

Mr TSANG Hoi-pang  
Representative

Elderly's Right Concerning Group @ Tin Shui Wai

Mr Yo KWOK Man-ho  
Representative

Neighbourhood and Worker's Services Centre

Mr HO Wai-pan  
Representative

敬老權益關注組

梁倩英女士  
發言代表

何麗芬女士

曾錫堅先生

陳景良先生

鄭耀輝先生

廖瑞蘭女士

徐世儀女士

陳建國先生

黎志珍女士

關注家居照顧服務大聯盟

Mr KWONG Wai-tai  
代表

Ms LAU Oi-lam

劉維女士

The Parents' Association of Pre-School Handicapped  
Children

---

劉榮麗女士  
發言人

The Hong Kong Joint Council of Parents of the  
Mentally Handicapped

---

Ms Sindy Cat LEE Cheung-pui  
Executive Member (Advocacy and Service)

無障礙牙科關注組

Mr CHAN Yat-sum  
家長會員

Mr YEUNG Ka-keung

Mr HUI Siu-fung

關注特殊教育權益家長大聯盟

Mr Richard LEE Pak-ying  
代表

**Clerk in attendance** : Mr Colin CHUI  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Miss Kay CHU  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 5

Miss Meisy KWOK  
Legislative Assistant (2) 6

Miss Cally LAI  
Legislative Assistant (2) 10

---

Action

**I. Dental care for the elderly and people with disabilities**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1186/16-17(01) to (05), CB(2)1203/16-17(01), CB(2)1222/16-17(01), CB(2)1243/16-17(01) to (02), CB(2)1262/16-17(01), CB(2)1620/16-17(01) and RB02/16-17]

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Admin

2. As requested by the Chairman, the Administration undertook to provide information on the percentages of the recurrent government expenditure on dental services (including public dental services and relevant support services) in the recurrent government expenditure on health and the government's total recurrent expenditure respectively.

**II. Any other business**

3. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:41 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
19 July 2017

**Proceedings of the fifth meeting of the  
Joint Subcommittee on Long-term Care Policy  
on Wednesday, 19 April 2017, at 9:30 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s) / Discussion</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda item I – Dental care for the elderly and people with disabilities</i>			
000956 – 001519	Chairman	Opening remarks	
001520 – 001740	The Against Elderly Abuse of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
001741 – 002036	Civic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1262/16-17(01)]	
002037 – 002359	殘疾人士及長期病 患者就業關注組	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1203/16-17(01)]	
002400 – 002714	關注長者口腔健康 聯席	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1620/16-17(01)]	
002715 – 003018	香港社區組織協會	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1620/16-17(01)]	
003019 – 003303	香港老人權益聯盟	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1620/16-17(01)]	
003304 – 003618	長者健康關注組	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1620/16-17(01)]	
003619 – 003923	長者牙科關注組	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1620/16-17(01)]	
003924 – 004235	Ms HO Bo-ching	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1243/16-17(02)]	
004236 – 004344	Kwai Chung Estate's Tooth Concerning Group	Presentation of views	
004345 – 004659	The Power of Tooth!	Presentation of views	
004700 – 005037	Kwai Chung Estate Elderly's Tooth Concerning Group	Presentation of views	
005038 – 005340	Mr YU Kam-chung	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1243/16-17(01)]	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s) / Discussion</b>	<b>Action required</b>
005341 – 005527	Ms KOT Mei-wa	Presentation of views	
005528 – 005844	Kwai Chung Estate の I want tooth!	Presentation of views	
005845 – 010157	Elderly's Right Concerning Group @ Tin Shui Wai	Presentation of views	
010158 – 010452	Neighbourhood and Worker's Services Centre	Presentation of views	
010453 – 010826	敬老權益關注組	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
010827 – 011128	何麗芬女士	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
011129 – 011510	曾錫堅先生	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
011511 – 011904	陳景良先生	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
011905 – 012232	鄭耀輝先生	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
012233 – 012401	廖瑞蘭女士	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
012402 – 012647	徐世儀女士	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
012648 – 013049	陳建國先生	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(03)]	
013050 – 013409	黎志珍女士	Presentation of views	
013410 – 013709	關注家居照顧服務 大聯盟	Presentation of views	
013710 – 014051	Ms LAU Oi-lam	Presentation of views	
014052 – 014439	劉維女士	Presentation of views	



<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s) / Discussion</b>	<b>Action required</b>
014440 – 014759	關注特殊教育權益 家長大聯盟	Presentation of views	
014800 – 015140	無障礙牙科關注組	Presentation of views	
015141 – 015508	The Hong Kong Joint Council of Parents of the Mentally Handicapped	Presentation of views	
015509 – 015827	Mr YEUNG Ka-keung	Presentation of views	
015828 – 020146	The Parents' Association of Pre-School Handicapped Children	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(04)]	
020147 – 020433	Mr HUI Siu-fung	Presentation of views	
020434 – 022424	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman summarized the major views expressed and suggestions made by the deputations/individuals as follows:</p> <p>(a) the Administration should consider earmarking \$1 billion for the development of special dental care services, making reference to the School Dental Care Service to provide annual check-ups for persons with disabilities and elderly persons, and providing dental care services in elderly health centres and by means of vehicles;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should regularize the Pilot Project on Dental Services for Persons with Intellectual Disabilities ("the Pilot Project");</p> <p>(c) the annual amount of Elderly Health Care Voucher ("EHV") and supply of dental care services in residential care homes, in particular those privately operated, were inadequate; and</p> <p>(d) there was concern about the complicated procedures and long waiting time for the application for a dental grant under the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance Scheme.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>The Administration briefed members on its dental care policy and the implementation of the Elderly Dental Assistance Programme under the Community Care Fund ("CCF"), the EHV Scheme, the "Dandelion Oral Care Action" programme and the Pilot Project set out in paragraphs 2, 12-14, 16 and 18-21 respectively in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1186/16-17(01)) and added that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the Administration had increased the number of University Grants Committee-funded degree places in dentistry from 53 to 73 in the 2016-2017 to 2018-2019 triennium to address the shortage problem of dentists;</li> <li>(b) in spite of the current shortage of dentists and limited resources, the Administration would continue to accord higher priority to providing emergency dental treatments for the general public in need of the services, and enhance the dental care support services for elderly persons with financial needs and persons with special dental care needs. The Administration would also continue to encourage charitable organizations to enhance their provision of dental care services;</li> <li>(c) the Department of Health ("DH") would follow up the cases which alleged some medical organizations under the EHV Scheme charging some elderly persons higher fees when they used EHV;</li> <li>(d) government dental clinics were set up mainly to provide dental services for civil servants based on the civil service agreement terms;</li> <li>(e) the suggestion of providing public dental care services in elderly health centres would be examined when the shortage problem of dentists was improved; and</li> <li>(f) the suggestion of enhancing the oral health education for elderly persons and persons with special needs would be relayed to DH for consideration.</li> </ul> <p>The Chairman expressed concern about the Administration's slow action in addressing the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		long-standing shortage problems of dentists and its reluctance to allocate more financial resources to enhance the provision of dental care services for elderly persons and persons with disabilities.	
022425 – 023423	Chairman Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Admin	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung expressed dissatisfaction that the Administration had all along neglected the repeated calls for improving inadequacies in the provision of dental care services for elderly persons and persons with disabilities. He urged the Administration to provide a blue print for the enhancement of dental care services for elderly persons and persons with disabilities, and advise on the amount of financial resources required.</p> <p>The Administration advised that it:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) would continue to strive for more resources to enhance the provision of dental care support services for elderly persons and persons with disabilities. In addition, the Administration would continue to listen to stakeholders' views in this regard, and relay them to relevant bureaux and departments for follow up and consideration as appropriate;</li> <li>(b) would keep in view the supply of dentists and examine the need to further increase the annual number of degree places in dentistry as and when necessary; and</li> <li>(c) was evaluating the operation of the Pilot Project with an aim to enhance its implementation details. Stakeholders' views in this regard would be taken into account.</li> </ul> <p>As requested by the Chairman, the Administration undertook to provide information on the percentages of the recurrent government expenditure on dental services (including public dental services and relevant support services) in the recurrent government expenditure on health and the government's total recurrent expenditure respectively.</p>	<b>Admin</b> (para. 2 in the minutes)
023424 – 024914	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Admin	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung was discontent that although some members had time and again made in various meetings the request for setting up government dental clinics in each of the 18 districts, the Administration had never acceded to	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s) / Discussion</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		<p>the request by giving the reason that there was no relevant policy.</p> <p>The Chairman asked if the current term Government had any plan to take measures in its remaining term of office (i.e. before 30 June 2017) to address inadequacies in the provision of public dental services and relevant support services.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the amount of EHV had been increased for several times in recent years with an aim to, among others, provide eligible elderly persons with more flexibility in using EHV for healthcare services, including dental services. The Administration would continue to strive for more financial and manpower resources to enhance the provision of public dental services and relevant support services.</p>	
024915 – 025806	Chairman Mr KWONG Chun-yu Admin	<p>Mr KWONG Chun-yu strongly urged the Administration to regularize the Pilot Project, which was effective, and enhance the implementation details of the Pilot Project by taking into account the views expressed by the deputations/individuals at the meeting. In addition, he called on the Administration to expand the Pilot Project to cover not only persons with intellectual disabilities, but also elderly persons in need. He also strongly requested the Administration to review the policy on the provision of dental care services for persons with disabilities and elderly persons.</p> <p>The Chairman was concerned that the Administration might plan to regularize the Pilot Project by introducing a means-tested assistance programme under CCF. Mr KWONG Chun-yu expressed strong objection to the plan.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the implementation of all pilot programmes was time-limited. If a pilot programme was proven effective during its pilot period, the feasibility of regularizing the programme would be examined. On the aforesaid basis, the Administration was currently evaluating the operation of the Pilot Project with an aim to enhance the implementation details, and would continue to</p>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s) / Discussion</b>	<b>Action required</b>
		subsidize the participating organizations under the Pilot Project to provide relevant dental services in the coming year for patients with intellectual disabilities who were already on the waiting list.	
025807 – 030417	Chairman Miss KWAN Kit-man Ms HO Bo-ching Mr YU Kam-chung The Parents' Association of Pre-School Handicapped Children Mr YEUNG Ka-keung	At the invitation of the Chairman, a deputation and some individuals expressed further views on the dental care for elderly persons and persons with disabilities.  At 12:30 pm, the Chairman extended the meeting for 10 minutes beyond the appointed ending time.	
030418 – 030826	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun Admin	Sharing a successful experience of the trial provision of mobile dental services in Sham Shui Po, Dr Priscilla LEUNG called on the Administration to consider piloting the provision of mobile dental clinics in the 18 districts to address the dental care needs of the general public, in particular elderly persons residing in the community.  The Administration advised that Dr LEUNG's suggestion would be examined. In addition, the Administration would examine the feasibility of regularizing the Pilot Project by taking into account the views expressed by members and the deputations/individuals in this regard.	
030827 – 031222	Chairman	The Chairman expressed concern that the current term Government had not yet addressed the long-standing inadequacies in the provision of dental care services for elderly persons and persons with disabilities, and the handling of these issues by the next term Government was unknown. He said that the subject would be followed up and the Administration should consider the views expressed and suggestions made by members and the deputations/individuals at the meeting.	