

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)13/17-18
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/TP/1

Panel on Transport

**Minutes of meeting held on
Friday, 19 May 2017, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP (Chairman)
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim

Members absent : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon KWONG Chun-yu

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public Officers : **Agenda item IV**
attending

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Linda SO Wai-Sze
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport) 6

Mrs Lilian LEUNG CHEUNG Suet-mui
Acting Assistant Commissioner for Transport
(Administration and Licensing)

Mr Eric WAN Pak-yan
Chief Transport Officer/Driving Services Transport
Department

Ms YAU Sin-man
Acting Chief Superintendent of Police (Traffic)
Hong Kong Police Force

Mr LAM Chi-ping
Superintendent of Police (Central Traffic
Prosecutions Division)
Hong Kong Police Force

Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Ivy LAW Chui-mei, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 3

Ms Stella LEE Yim-fong
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Management
& Paratransit

Mr Chris CHAN Yu-yuen
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Planning

Ms Vivian KWAN Kwok-yan
Chief Transport Officer/Tunnels and Tsing Ma 2
Transport Department

Agenda item VI

Prof Anthony CHEUNG, GBS, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Mrs Ingrid YEUNG HO Poi-yan, JP
Commissioner for Transport

Ms Ivy LAW Chui-mei, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport) 3

Mr Chris CHAN Yu-yuen
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Planning

Clerk in attendance : Ms Doris LO
Chief Council Secretary (4)6

Staff in attendance : Ms Macy NG
Senior Council Secretary (4)6

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (4)6

Action

I. Information papers issued since the last meeting

- (LC Paper No. CB(4)978/16-17(01) - Administration's response to the submission from the Hong Kong Blind Union proposing introduction of warning sound generating devices on electric vehicles
- LC Paper No. CB(4)1012/16-17(01) - Letter from Hon LAU Kwok-fan on "bicycle-friendly" policy
- LC Paper No. CB(4)1035/16-17(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon LAM Cheuk-ting on the delay in the construction of the Tuen Mun — Chek Lap Kok Link
- LC Paper No. CB(4)1044/16-17(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung on franchised taxis)

Members noted the above papers issued since the last meeting.

II. Items for discussion at the next meeting

- (LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion
LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(02) - List of follow-up actions)

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting to be held on 16 June 2017:

- (a) Public Transport Strategy Study ("PTSS");
- (b) Proposed retention of three supernumerary posts; and extension of internal redeployment of one permanent post in the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Hong Kong Project Management Office of the Highways Department; and
- (c) Strategic studies on railways and major roads beyond 2030.

III. Proposal for setting up a subcommittee on hillside escalator links and elevator systems under the Panel

- (LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(03) - Paper on proposal for setting up a subcommittee on hillside escalator links and elevator systems under the Panel prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

- LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(04) - Submission from The Incorporated Owners Saddle Ridge Garden)

3. Further to the decision of the Panel on Transport ("the Panel") at the meeting on 21 April 2017 on setting up a subcommittee on hillside escalator links and elevator systems ("the HEL Subcommittee") under the Panel, the Chairman asked members to consider the proposed Terms of Reference, work plan and time frame for completion of work of the HEL Subcommittee set out in the proposal vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(03). Members agreed with the above proposal, and noted that the HEL Subcommittee

would commence work as soon as a slot for its activation would be available pursuant to rules 26(a) and (b) of the House Rules.

IV. Proposals on revision of certain fees and charges under the Road Traffic Ordinance and its regulations

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(05) - Administration's paper on proposed revision to fees and charges relating to road traffic (Batch 3)

LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(06) - Paper on the revision to fees and charges relating to road traffic prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief))

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Transport and Housing ("USTH") briefed members on the Administration's proposals to revise 13 government fee items relating to road traffic, and to remove three obsolete fee items. He informed members that the Administration planned to submit the relevant legislative amendments to the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in 2017-2018.

5. On Mr Jeremy TAM's enquiry about the validity period of the respective permits and licences issued pertaining to the said 13 government fee items, Acting Assistant Commissioner for Transport (Administration and Licensing) replied that the validity period for most of those permits or licences was one year.

6. Regarding the proposed fee increase in respect of the issuance of advertising vehicle permits from \$110 to \$155, Mr CHAN Chun-ying pointed out that the cost recovery rate for this item would still be on the low side (i.e. 17.8 %) after the increase. To avoid a steep fee increase in future to achieve full cost recovery, he suggested a bigger increase in the current revision such that the cost recovery rate could reach around 30% to 40%. Separately, he indicated that he did not object to other fee revision items.

7. USTH explained that the Administration had followed the guidelines set out in paragraph 4 of the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(05)) in determining the rate of fee increases. That said, he undertook that the Administration would take into account Mr CHAN's

above suggestion when finalizing the legislative proposals for submission to LegCo.

V. Legislative amendments relating to the Government's takeover of Tate's Cairn Tunnel

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(07) - Administration's paper on takeover arrangements of Tate's Cairn Tunnel

LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(08) - Paper on the Tate's Cairn Tunnel and the Government's takeover arrangements for Build-Operate-Transfer tunnels prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief))

8. At the invitation of the Chairman, USTH briefed members on the legislative amendments and arrangements for the Government to take over the ownership of the Tate's Cairn Tunnel ("TCT") upon expiry of its existing Build-Operate-Transfer ("BOT") franchise on 11 July 2018.

9. Members noted that the prevailing toll levels of TCT, which ranged from \$15 to \$35 for different vehicle types, would remain unchanged upon the Administration's takeover. The toll levels of TCT would be reviewed in the context of the study on the rationalization of traffic distribution among the three road harbour crossings ("RHCs") (i.e. the Cross-Harbour Tunnel ("CHT"), the Eastern Harbour Crossing ("EHC") and the Western Harbour Crossing ("WHC")) and the three land tunnels between Kowloon and Sha Tin (i.e. TCT, the Lion Rock Tunnel ("LRT") and the Eagle's Nest Tunnel and Sha Tin Heights Tunnel ("Route 8K")) ("the toll rationalization study"). Members also noted that the Administration had undertaken to put the toll adjustment proposals for discussion by the Panel within the 2017-2018 legislative year.

Rationalization of tunnel tolls and traffic distribution

10. Mr CHAN Hak-kan, Mr LUK Chung-hung and Mr LAU Kwok-fan urged the Administration to, upon taking over TCT, lower its prevailing toll levels to a flat rate of \$8 to align with those of the alternative tunnels, i.e. LRT and Route 8K, instead of pending for the outcome of the toll

rationalization study. Expressing concerns over the unevenly high vehicle flow and frequent congestion at LRT, Mr CHAN pressed for an early toll alignment of the three land tunnels to facilitate redistribution of the tunnel traffic. He and Mr LUK both saw room for toll reduction of TCT upon expiry of the BOT franchise as the construction costs should have been fully recovered by then. Mr LUK and Mr LAU asked if the fares of franchised bus and public light bus ("PLB") routes using TCT would also be reduced following TCT's toll reduction in future.

11. In response, USTH explained that due to the geographical locations of the tunnels, there was a natural pairing effect on the use of the three RHCs and the three land tunnels. The rationalization of traffic distribution among the three land tunnels would therefore impact on the usage of the three RHCs, and vice versa. Hence, toll adjustment proposals, including that for TCT, should be formulated under the toll rationalization study for rationalizing traffic distribution among the six tunnels in a holistic manner. As regards the fares of franchised bus and PLB routes using TCT, USTH advised that as tunnel tolls only accounted for a relatively small part of the operating costs of the routes, it was envisaged that any toll reduction of TCT would not have a major impact on the fares.

12. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen queried why the Administration had not conducted the toll rationalization study earlier to tie in with the takeover of TCT in 2018. Whilst rationalization of the traffic flow of the three land tunnels could be achieved either by reducing the tolls of TCT or increasing those of the alternative tunnels, he hoped that the Administration would take the former approach to reduce the tolls of TCT.

13. Mr Nathan LAW was disappointed that the Administration had not taken forward the recommendations of earlier studies on rationalization of toll levels and traffic flow of existing tunnels, including the publicly supported option of "toll increase at CHT and toll reduction at EHC". He had no confidence in the Administration honouring the recommendations of the toll rationalization study this time if the outcome was not what the Administration had expected and preferred. Besides, he queried why no impact assessment on traffic flow was required in respect of the eight toll increases of TCT in the past.

14. Dr KWOK Ka-ki also said that the public was very disappointed that the toll levels of EHC were not reduced even after it was taken over by the Government in 2016. The Administration should seriously consider reducing the tolls of TCT upon the takeover to divert more tunnel traffic from LRT to TCT, which was indeed a more direct route option for motorists

travelling between Sha Tin and Kowloon East.

15. USTH responded that previous proposals on redistribution of tunnel traffic were put in abeyance due to the lack of consensus among Members of LegCo and the community. For example, the proposed increase in the tolls of CHT met with oppositions from the relevant districts. The Administration had also explained to the Panel in the past that the tolls of EHC should be reviewed holistically taking into account the overall traffic redistribution among the three RHCs. With the takeover of TCT in 2018, there would be more favourable conditions for rationalizing traffic flow among the six tunnels by toll adjustment.

16. USTH further explained that toll adjustments of TCT were currently regulated under the TCT Ordinance (Cap. 393). It should also be noted that a major principle of adopting BOT arrangements was that the franchisee should be allowed to make a reasonable return on their upfront investment while bearing the commercial risk. After the takeover, the toll revenue from TCT would form part of the Government's general revenue. On Dr KWOK Ka-ki's enquiries regarding whether the Administration had made projections of the operating costs and revenues of TCT based on the existing toll levels, as well as assuming that the tolls were to be reduced to \$8 in line with those of LRT and Route 8K, USTH agreed to provide the relevant information.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's written response was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1441/16-17(01) on 21 July 2017.)

17. Mr Michael TIEN agreed that the toll levels of TCT should not be adjusted before completing the toll rationalization study. He considered that the Administration should suitably adjust, either upward or downward, the toll levels of all or some of the six tunnels with a view to strategically facilitating traffic redistribution among the tunnels, while it should not link the toll levels to the financial returns of the tunnels. Suitable toll increases could also have the effect of encouraging the public to use more public transport instead of private cars. Yet, in view that the BOT franchise of WHC would not expire until 2023, he doubted how the Administration would comprehensively review the tolls and traffic flow of the six tunnels before then.

18. Dr CHENG Chung-tai also asked if the toll rationalization study would be affected as the BOT franchise of WHC had not yet expired. Regarding the review of the traffic distribution of TCT and LRT, he reminded the Administration not to underestimate the increasing traffic

demand arising from the new population intakes in the new development areas including Shui Chuen O Estate.

19. USTH responded that the Administration would carefully consider the relative impact of toll adjustments on the traffic flow of the six tunnels. It would not rule out the possibility of raising the toll levels of some of the tunnels to achieve redistribution of the traffic flow. He further advised that it was essential to include WHC for a holistic review in the toll rationalization study. Any toll adjustments at WHC before 2023 needed to be dealt with under the franchise of WHC. If necessary and agreed by the franchisee of WHC, the Administration could consider the possibility of providing toll subsidies to effect toll adjustments before 2023. Further review could be conducted after the takeover of WHC in 2023.

20. Mr Charles MOK emphasized that the toll rationalization study should be scientifically sound. He asked about the details of the toll rationalization study, such as the timetable, survey methodology, types of data collected, scenario analysis, and background of the consultant, etc. Mr WU Chi-wai asked if the Administration would set a target for completion of the toll rationalization study before the takeover of TCT, and whether it would submit the toll adjustment proposals together with the associated legislative amendments for consideration by the Panel.

21. Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Planning advised that the toll rationalization study commenced in early January 2017. The consultant had collected relevant data, such as traffic flow at the six tunnels and areas in the vicinity of the tunnels, for analyzing the impact of various toll adjustment options. The Administration planned to consult the Panel on the toll adjustment proposals within the 2017-2018 legislative year.

Operation and management of the Tate's Cairn Tunnel after the Government's takeover

22. Mr YIU Si-wing asked about the tender assessment criteria for the granting of the management, operation and maintenance ("MOM") contract for TCT. He asked if the Administration would simply grant the contract to the lowest bidder, or would take into account other factors such as commitments on employing the existing tunnel staff to ensure better transition; and proposals for improving the operation and management of TCT, as well as maintenance and replacement of the old tunnel facilities.

23. Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Management & Paratransit ("AC for T/M&P") replied that there would be terms in the MOM contract

requiring the contractor to undertake to make first offer of employment to the existing tunnel staff. Interested tenderers would be required to submit technical proposals on operation and traffic management; the operation and maintenance of tunnel equipment; and non-structural maintenance of TCT. USTH reiterated that the MOM contract would not be granted by simply selecting the bidder submitting the lowest price proposal. In addition, to facilitate smooth transition, the Administration would liaise with the TCT franchisee to ensure that the conditions of all tunnel facilities could meet a certain standard upon the takeover.

24. Mrs Regina IP asked if the Administration would encourage the MOM contractor to introduce more advanced technology to enhance tunnel services, including improving the toll collection system. She relayed the complaints from some motorcyclists that at present Autotoll was not available for use by motorcycles due to technical constraints. Mrs IP also suggested the use of big data for collecting and analyzing traffic data of tunnels, including the tunnel usage by different vehicle types.

25. AC for T/M&P advised that there were at present five Autotoll lanes at TCT. Along with other Government tolled tunnels and roads at which "stop-and-go" electronic payment facilities would be installed starting from July 2017, such facilities were planned to be installed also at TCT after the takeover and expected to be put into operation in about 2021. USTH added that the Administration was exploring the use of an automatic toll collection system which would not require toll booths at Tseung Kwan O — Lam Tin Tunnel. If proved feasible, similar systems could be used for other tolled tunnels and roads.

26. Given that buses had to queue up for a long time waiting to pull in at the TCT bus interchange during peak hours, Mr LAU Kwok-fan requested the Administration to consider expanding the TCT bus interchange. AC for T/M&P undertook that the Transport Department ("TD") would look into the actual situation and review the utilization rate and design of bus bays, and consider modification works where necessary.

Protection of the interests of existing tunnel staff

27. Mr LUK Chung-hung was keenly concerned about the protection of the interests of the existing frontline employees of the TCT franchisee. As most of them had long years of service, he asked how the Administration would ensure that their pay and benefits including leave entitlements commensurate with their seniority could be retained. Likewise, Mr POON Siu-ping considered it necessary to make provisions in the MOM contract

requiring the contractor to guarantee that the pay, benefits and conditions of service including working hours of the tunnel staff after the takeover would be no less favourable than before.

28. AC for T/M&P assured members that there would be provisions in the MOM contract relating to the protection of the employment and salary levels of the existing tunnel staff. Furthermore, the fringe benefits proposed to be offered by tenderers to the employees would be one of the assessment criteria in the tender evaluation. Proposals which offered better fringe benefits to tunnel staff would score higher marks. That said, it would also be necessary to strike a balance between protection of the benefits of tunnel staff and the business operation of the MOM contractor.

29. Mr Jeremy TAM mentioned the case of a serving staff of the TCT franchisee who had been in service for over 20 years, but was taking no pay sick leave for nearly a year. The staff worried that the new MOM contractor might refuse to offer appointment to him. Mr TAM asked if the Administration would intervene in such a case.

30. AC for T/M&P replied that pursuant to the MOM contract requirement, the contractor would be required to make first offer of employment to the staff concerned if he was a frontline staff serving in the operations, engineering and maintenance departments. If necessary, the Administration would provide appropriate assistance to those employees in need.

Motion

31. Mr LUK Chung-hung moved the following motion which was seconded by Mr LAU Kwok-fan:

鑒於大老山隧道將於2018年7月11日由政府接收，本會要求政府在接收大老山隧道後馬上調整收費，將隧道費劃一調整至與獅子山隧道和尖山及沙田嶺隧道的相同水平，直至政府完成研究及制訂六條隧道的隧道費調整方案為止，以減輕市民交通費及達至車輛分流效果。

(Translation)

Given that the Tate's Cairn Tunnel ("TCT") will be taken over by the Government on 11 July 2018, this Panel requests the Government to immediately adjust the tolls of TCT after taking over it to bring its toll

levels in line with those of the Lion Rock Tunnel, and the Eagle's Nest Tunnel and Sha Tin Heights Tunnel, until the completion of the Government's study and formulation of toll adjustment proposals for the six tunnels, so as to reduce the travelling expenses of the public and achieve the traffic diversion effect.

32. The Chairman put the motion to vote. A total of eight members voted for the motion, two members voted against it and three members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

VI. Parking Policy

(LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(09) - Administration's paper on parking policy

LC Paper No. CB(4)1021/16-17(10) - Paper on parking policy prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief)

LC Paper No. CB(4)1026/16-17(01) - Letter from Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho on the closure of Murray Road Multi-storey Car Park)

33. Given the limited time left (about 45 minutes) before the appointed ending time of the meeting at 12:45 pm while many members wished to speak on this agenda item, the Chairman considered that the discussion on this item would unlikely be finished at this meeting. He sought members' views on the following two options: (a) defer the discussion of this item to a special meeting; or (b) proceed to discuss this item, and if the discussion could not be finished, hold a special meeting to complete the discussion. The Chairman further said that he had acceded to the requests made by Mr LAU Kwok-fan and Mr Wilson OR to receive views from deputations on the subject at the special meeting to be held. The Chairman invited members to indicate their preferences between the above two options. The majority of members present were in favour of option (b). The Panel then proceeded with the discussion.

34. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") briefed members on the Government's parking policy, and measures to mitigate the shortage of parking spaces. He advised that the Administration would accord priority to considering and meeting the parking

demand of commercial vehicles, and commence a two-year consultancy study within 2017 to formulate appropriate measures. Meanwhile, the Administration had rolled out various immediate measures to address the shortage of parking spaces for commercial vehicles. In respect of the parking needs of private cars, the Administration would provide an appropriate number of parking spaces for private cars if the overall development permitted, while the limited land resources in Hong Kong would not permit the continuous provision of additional parking spaces to match the rapidly growing private car fleet.

Measures to mitigate the shortage of parking spaces

Controlling the growth of private car fleet

35. Mr LAU Kwok-fan considered that the Administration should look into the reasons for the rapid growth of private cars in recent years in order to formulate appropriate measures to tackle the problem at root. As in some newly developed and remote areas where public transport service might not be conveniently available, many local residents needed to use private cars for commuting. For this reason, the Administration should enhance public transport service and provide more park-and-ride facilities to encourage people living in more remote areas to drive to public transport interchanges and change to public transport.

36. STH advised that the Administration had all along adopted a public transport-oriented policy. The public transport usage rate in Hong Kong was among the highest in the world. The Administration would continue to extensively develop the public transport network, and would progressively take forward measures for increasing the capacity of public transport service as recommended under the PTSS report. The Administration would brief members on the relevant details at the next regular meeting of the Panel in June 2017.

37. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered that to ease the acute shortage of parking spaces, it was necessary to provide more parking spaces on the one hand and reduce the number of vehicles on the other. He believed that providing sufficient parking spaces would not necessarily induce car purchases or discourage the use of public transport. In order to identify effective measures for controlling the growth of private cars, the Administration should find out how people's decisions on whether to buy a car were affected by factors like availability of parking spaces, fuel costs, registration tax and licence fee payments, tolls and road charges, and the level of fixed penalties for illegal parking, etc. Referring to the measure

adopted in Tokyo of Japan, as cited in the Administration's discussion paper, where a person intended to purchase a car was required to first produce a certificate of availability of parking spaces within two kilometres of his residence, Mr CHAN expressed disagreement to such an extreme measure.

38. STH advised that the examples of other major cities cited in the discussion paper served only to demonstrate that there could be different approaches for controlling the growth of private cars. When formulating suitable measures for controlling the growth of private cars in Hong Kong, the Administration would take into account the specific situation of Hong Kong. It would adopt a multi-pronged approach to deal with the issue.

Priority in the provision of parking spaces for commercial vehicles

39. Mr Wilson OR recognized the priority need for meeting the parking needs of commercial vehicles. Yet, he was concerned that the shortage of parking spaces involved not only commercial vehicles, and the recent demolition of multi-storey car park buildings had aggravated the shortage problem. As such, he urged the Administration to, apart from commercial vehicles, study also the parking needs of all types of vehicles, including private cars and motorcycles, and formulate corresponding measures.

40. STH reiterated the Government's policy in the provision of parking spaces that priority would be accorded to considering and meeting the parking demand of commercial vehicles. As for private cars, it was not feasible to continuously provide additional parking spaces to meet the high private car fleet growth given the limited land resources. It would suitably provide parking spaces for private cars and other vehicles if the overall development so permitted.

41. Mr YIU Si-wing expressed specific concern over the mismatch between the demand and supply of parking spaces for coaches/non-franchised buses ("NFBs"). He pointed out that there were at present over 7 000 coaches/NFBs but only about 5 000 suitable parking spaces. He asked about the number of parking spaces required to meet the night-time parking needs of cross-boundary coaches, excluding those which were parked on the Mainland at night. He also asked about the measures for containing the growth of coaches/NFBs, say, in the coming five to 10 years.

42. Commissioner for Transport ("C for T") advised that there were currently around 1 100 cross-boundary coaches. The Administration did not have information on the number of those that were parked on the Mainland at night. As learned from a survey on cross-boundary trucks in

2011, about 5% of these trucks were parked on the Mainland at night and some at brownfield sites in the New Territories. To contain the growth of NFBs, the utilization of which had declined due to the decreasing number of tourists in the past two years, the Administration would maintain the sourcing requirement that applicants applying for expanding their fleets or entering the NFB market should procure buses from the existing NFB fleets in the market. Further details on the regulation of NFB supply would be given in the PTSS report to be published. She added that the Administration would continue to identify suitable locations to provide more night-time parking spaces for commercial vehicles and car parks for large vehicles including trucks and coaches. For example, under the construction project of a government office building in Area 67 of Tseung Kwan O, more than 100 car parking spaces for large vehicles would be provided.

Reprovisioning of existing parking spaces after closure of multi-storey public car parks and short-term tenancy car parks

43. Members including Mr LAU Kwok-fan, Mr Wilson OR and Mr Kenneth LAU were concerned about the closure of multi-storey public car parks and short-term tenancy ("STT") car parks one after another for redevelopment purposes. As it would take years before reprovisioning of the existing parking spaces upon completion of the redevelopment projects, the net decrease in parking spaces in the interim would aggravate the shortage problem. Mr Wilson OR asked if the Administration would review the demand for parking facilities in the areas concerned and provide temporary car parking spaces to meet the demand. Mr Kenneth LAU requested the Administration to stop pulling down other multi-storey public car parks, and build more STT car parks for use by commercial vehicles.

44. STH explained that the Administration had to balance the land use planning to satisfy different demands. When there were development needs with higher priority, there might be a need for the Administration to cease the operation of its multi-storey public car parks, or take back the STT sites. To reprovision some of the relinquished public parking spaces, the Administration would make reference to the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines in planning for the provision of sufficient parking spaces for the developments' own use in future, and also public parking spaces where necessary. It would also actively identify suitable locations for constructing new stand-alone multi-storey public car parks, as well as alternative STT sites where possible subject to relevant land use considerations.

45. Mr Jeremy TAM pointed out that the number of parking spaces to be reprovisioned was often fewer than the original provision. For example,

there were 785 and 388 parking spaces for private cars at the Middle Road Car Park and the Murray Road Multi-storey Car Park ("MRMSCP") respectively, but only 417 and 102 parking spaces would be reprovisioned under the redevelopment projects concerned. He was worried that the lost in parking spaces would aggravate traffic congestion. He urged the Administration to take appropriate measures to control the growth of private cars and mitigate the shortage of parking spaces, including providing more park-and-ride facilities at suitable locations. Mr Charles MOK also asked if the Administration had assessed the impact of the closure of the multi-storey car parks.

46. STH explained that the prime locations of many sites used as multi-storey public car parks made them suitable for other developments. An example was MRMSCP, the conversion of which into commercial uses was an initiative under the 2014 Policy Address for meeting the commercial and business land use demands in Central and Wan Chai. C for T further advised that a traffic impact assessment in relation to the demolition of MRMSCP was conducted in 2015. It had been affirmed that the supply of public parking spaces for private cars in the five car parks located within a radius of 300 metres from MRMSCP and well connected to major office buildings by covered walkways should be adequate to cope with the demand. The TD had also been monitoring the utilization of the said five car parks after the closure of MRMSCP. It was found that during the peak hours between 12:00 noon to 2:00 pm, the highest and lowest utilization rates were 98% and 85%, suggesting that there were still some spare parking spaces in these car parks. At the request of the Chairman, C for T agreed to provide supplementary information on the utilization rates of these five car parks during the peak hours.

(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information in Chinese and English versions provided by the Administration were issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1549/16-17(01) on 30 August and 4 September 2017 respectively.)

Parking vacancy information

47. Mr Charles MOK and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered it essential to keep motorists informed of real-time parking vacancies near their destinations so that they would not have to circulate on roads looking for available parking spaces, thus aggravating traffic congestion. Mr MOK considered it incumbent upon the Administration to take the lead to open up access to parking vacancy data for use by mobile application developers, and encourage more car park operators to follow suit. Mr CHAN suggested

uploading vacancy information on on-street metered parking spaces onto the "Hong Kong eRouting" mobile application.

48. C for T responded that the parking vacancy information of over 50 car parks, including all car parks managed by TD, on the "Hong Kong eRouting" mobile application was open to the public. The Administration would continue to encourage other car park operators to upload the parking vacancy information onto the Government's public sector information portal "Data.Gov.HK". She further advised that TD was discussing with the Office of the Government Chief Information Officer on opening up access of relevant data to outside parties.

Enforcement against illegal parking

49. Mr Wilson OR was concerned that the acute shortage of parking spaces had led to serious road traffic problems and rampant illegal parking. Mr Jeremy TAM pointed out that the serious shortage of parking spaces had pushed up the parking fees in the industrial area in Kwun Tong. Illegal parking problem was very serious, and double parking was not uncommon in the district. Worst still, frequent obstruction of the road by non-vehicular items such as wooden pallets had aggravated traffic congestion, but the Police had passed the buck to the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department saying that the matter was under the latter's purview. He also pointed out that the night-time parking spaces for commercial vehicles along Hung To Road were often occupied by private cars or other obstructions. He demanded the Police to take stringent enforcement actions including towing away illegally parked vehicles. In his view, without addressing the shortage of parking spaces, the Administration should not increase the fixed penalty charges for congestion-related traffic offences.

50. STH responded that the Administration had continued to step up law enforcement actions against illegal parking. At some traffic black spots like Central, the Police had taken targeted actions and the number of vehicles being towed away had increased this year. He stressed the need to increase the fixed penalty charges lest the deterrent effect would be further eroded.

Concluding remarks

51. The Chairman said that the discussion on this agenda item and the three motions raised thereon would be carried forward to a special meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The special meeting was originally scheduled for 12 June 2017 but was subsequently cancelled due to adverse

weather condition. On the instruction of the Chairman, the special meeting would be rescheduled to a later date to be confirmed. The wordings of the three motions were issued vide LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1069/16-17(01)-(03) on 26 May 2017.)

VII. Any other business

52. On the request of Mr CHU Hoi-dick to discuss the "Adjustment of Airport Express Fares" before the close of this meeting, the Chairman replied that he would not accede to the request as the item was not on the agenda of the meeting. He suggested that Mr CHU could write to the Panel for further follow up with the Administration on his concerns.

(Post-meeting note: A joint letter from Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Mr Nathan LAW dated 19 May 2017 was issued via LC Paper No. CB(4)1083/16-17(01) on 24 May 2017, and the Administration's response was issued via LC Paper No. CB(4)1102/16-17(02) on 26 May 2017.)

53. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:44 pm.