

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)839/16-17(04)

Ref : CB4/PL/TP

Panel on Transport
Meeting on 21 April 2017

**Background brief on the provision of
hillside escalator links and elevator systems**

Purpose

This paper provides background information on the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems ("HEL") in Hong Kong. It also summarizes the major views and concerns expressed by Legislative Council ("LegCo") Members on the subject.

Background

2. In view of the growing number of requests from the public for HEL, the Administration established in 2009 an assessment system for evaluating the merits and priority of the proposals for HEL. Details of the assessment system are in **Appendix I**.

3. Based on the assessment system, the Administration determined the priority for conducting preliminary technical feasibility studies for 20 project proposals received at that time, and reported the assessment results to the Panel of Transport ("the Panel") at its meeting on 26 February 2010.¹ Two proposals were screened out initially,² and 18 others were ranked. The Administration indicated at that time that preliminary technical feasibility studies for the proposals ranked top 10 in the assessment would be conducted by batches, and

¹ The detailed assessment results were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)1190/09-10(03)) issued in February 2010.

² The two proposals were screened out due to the following reasons: similar facility had already been provided in close proximity for one proposal; and the level difference of the other proposal did not exceed six metres.

that for the remaining proposals would be followed up after the smooth implementation of the top 10 proposals. Subsequently, following a review on its manpower resources, the Highways Department ("HyD") also completed the preliminary technical feasibility studies for the proposals ranked 11th and 12th.

4. The list of the 18 ranked proposals and their implementation progress provided by the Administration to the Finance Committee ("FC") in March 2017 is in **Appendix II**.

5. According to the Administration, of the 18 proposals, two have been completed and are open for public use (ranked 13th and 14th), one is partially completed and open for public use (ranked 1st), two are under construction (ranked 3rd and 9th), and one is undergoing tendering procedures (ranked 5th). The construction cost estimates for these projects are as follows:

Rank	Proposal	Status (as in March 2017)	Construction cost estimate (\$ million)
1	Pedestrian Link at Tsz Wan Shan	Partially completed and opened for public use	608
3	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Cheung Hang Estate, Tsing Yi	Under construction	222.7
5	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Kwai Shing Circuit and Hing Shing Road	Undergoing tendering procedures	239.4
9	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Waterloo Hill	Under construction	116.7
13	Yuet Wah Street Pedestrian Linkage	Completed and opened for public use	78
14	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai King Hill Road and Princess Margaret Hospital	Completed and opened for public use	13.5

6. Among the above three proposals which are completed or partially completed, the Pedestrian Link at Tsz Wan Shan (ranked 1st) was implemented under the Shatin to Central Link project. The Yuet Wah Street Pedestrian Linkage (ranked 13th) was implemented by the Civil Engineering and Development Department under the Kwun Tong Town Centre Redevelopment. The Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai King Hill Road and

Princess Margaret Hospital (ranked 14th) was implemented by the Hospital Authority.

7. The funding proposal for the above three on-going projects for the lift and pedestrian walkway systems at Cheung Hang Estate in Tsing Yi (ranked 3rd), between Kwai Shing Circuit and Hing Shing Road (ranked 5th), and at Waterloo Hill (ranked 9th) was approved by FC at its meeting on 13 May 2016.

8. Seven other proposals (ranked 2nd, 4th, 6th, 7th, 8th, 11th and 12th) are at different stages of investigation and design. At the policy briefing of the Panel held on 20 January 2017, the Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") advised that the Administration planned to seek funding approval from LegCo within 2016-2017 legislative session to take forward the construction of the proposal ranked 11th, i.e. Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Tai Wo Hau Road and Wo Tong Tsui Street in Kwai Chung. The advance construction works was expected to commence in the first quarter of 2018 and the main construction works would commence in the second quarter of 2018.

9. Besides, HyD will process the proposal ranked 10th after repair works to private dangerous slopes are completed by concerned parties. The remaining proposals ranked 14th,³ 16th, 17th and 18th will be followed up after the implementation of those higher-ranking proposals.

Major views and concerns of Members

10. Members in general supported the implementation of the HEL projects to enhance the accessibility of the hillside. Major views and concerns on the provision of HEL expressed at the meetings of the Panel and the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") are summarized below.

Implementation progress

11. When members were consulted on the funding proposal for the construction of the three lift and pedestrian walkway systems in Tsing Yi, Kwai Chung and Waterloo Hill at the meetings of the Panel and PWSC on 23 March and 20 April 2016 respectively, some members expressed grave concern over the slow progress of implementing the HEL projects by the Administration. They pointed out that of the 18 ranked proposals received by the Administration in 2009, only two systems had been completed and opened for public use. They urged the Administration to speed up implementation of the proposals to

³ There are two proposals with the same ranking of 14. This one is "Escalator Link System between Hong Sing Garden and Po Hong Road". There is no proposal ranked 15.

meet the needs of the local residents. The Panel passed a motion requesting the Administration to set up a dedicated Hillside Elevator and Escalator Fund of \$5 billion ("the Fund"), and take measures to expedite the works concerned.

12. According to the Administration, works for HEL often involved considerations such as slopes, structures, soil properties, diversion of underground utilities and land resumption, and were therefore considerably complex. Further, HEL works also involved various tasks of pre-construction preparation, which covered investigation and preliminary design, consultation with District Councils and relevant stakeholders, gazettal of the proposals and handling of any objections under the Roads (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap. 370), land acquisition if necessary, formulation of detailed design, application for funding approval from LegCo in respect of individual projects and invitation for tenders, etc. Since these pre-construction tasks involved complicated procedures and were relatively controversial in nature, the time required varied with actual circumstances. Among others, as HEL projects involved the construction of new public walkways, local residents often had different opinions regarding the proposed alignments which would warrant longer consultation periods.

13. On the suggestion of setting up the Fund to administratively expedite the implementation of HEL projects through simplified funding process, the Administration advised that generally speaking, for works with smaller scales and lower project costs, they could be funded under a block vote. However, since HEL projects were of larger scales and involved higher project costs, allocation of resources and prioritization of the entire public works programme ("PWP") would have to be considered. Therefore, they were taken forward according to the established PWP mechanism. Nevertheless, the Administration would study the feasibility of setting up such Fund in consultation with the relevant policy bureaux and departments and would report to LegCo on the progress timely.

Handling of new suggestions

14. In response to members' enquiry about whether the Administration would continue to accept new suggestions on the provision of HEL, STH advised at the policy briefing on 16 January 2015 that there was an established set of criteria for assessing proposals for HEL to determine the priority for conducting preliminary technical feasibility studies. The Administration would first deal with the 18 ranked proposals before following up on any new suggestions. The Administration also advised that the construction of HEL involved huge investment with long implementation period, and that there should be prior consensus in the district before implementation.

Review of the assessment system

15. Some Panel members suggested that the Administration should review the scoring criteria for assessing the HEL proposals. Consideration should be given to adding a new criterion of the average level difference travelled by the elderly residents of 65 years old or above each day within the catchment of the proposed works. The Administration responded that it adopted an open mind in this matter and would consider the above suggestion in assessing new suggestions on provision of HEL.

16. Members also noted STH's advice at the policy briefing of the Panel held on 20 January 2017 that the Administration would commence a study at the end of 2017 to review and improve the assessment mechanism for HEL, and on the basis of the study outcome, to carry out screening, traffic assessments and preliminary technical feasibility assessments for other proposals received in the past years so as to draw up a timetable for implementing the proposals in future. The study would take about 30 months. Upon completion of the study, the Administration would seek resources for implementing proposals that were considered feasible after preliminary technical assessments gradually.

Approach for conducting technical feasibility studies for the proposals by batches

17. When the Panel was consulted on the assessment results on the 20 HEL proposals at its meeting on 26 February 2010, members expressed concern about the approach of the Administration to conduct the relevant technical feasibility studies by batches and in different stages. The Panel passed two motions respectively urging the Administration to include all the districts covered by the 18 ranked proposals in conducting feasibility studies; and strongly requesting the Administration to immediately conduct feasibility studies on all the 20 proposals which had already been assessed based on the assessment system.

18. In response to the motions, the Administration advised in its letter dated 28 September 2010 that there was a genuine need for the Administration to take forward the proposals received in stages having regard to manpower and resource considerations. Proposals not selected for feasibility studies in the initial stage would remain on the waiting list for consideration in the next assessment exercise together with other proposals on the list. The Administration would assess the proposals on the waiting list in due course, subject to the progress of implementation of the proposals, as well as availability of manpower and resources.

Relevant questions raised at Council meetings

19. During 2012-2013 to 2015-2016 legislative sessions, four questions relating to HEL were raised at Council meetings of 9 January 2013, 16 April 2014, 26 November 2014 and 16 December 2015. The hyperlinks to the questions and the Administration's responses, together with other relevant papers, are in **Appendix III**.

Latest developments

20. The Administration plans to consult members at the Panel meeting scheduled for 21 April 2017 on the funding proposal for the construction of the project "Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Tai Wo Hau Road and Wo Tong Tsui Street, Kwai Chung", i.e. the proposal which was ranked 11th among the 18 ranked HEL proposals.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 April 2017

Details of the Assessment System for Provision of Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems

The assessment system on provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems ("HEL") comprises initial screening and scoring stages.

Initial Screening

2. The initial screening helps screen out proposals which are obviously infeasible or unjustifiable for implementation. A proposal will not be taken forward if it has any of the following characteristics –

- (a) land unavailability – inadequate land and/or infeasible land resumption to possibly accommodate the proposed facility;
- (b) redundancy – similar facility/facilities is/are already provided or committed in close proximity to the proposed facility;¹
- (c) insurmountable construction or operational difficulties; or
- (d) small level difference – level difference to be overcome is less than six metres ("m").

Scoring System

3. Proposals which pass the initial screening will be evaluated by the scoring system based on the following set of evaluation criteria (figures in brackets denote their respective maximum score) –

- (a) Circumstantial factors (total score : 40)
 - (i) existing population/employment within catchment² (6);
 - (ii) existing population of 65 year-old or above within

¹ A facility located within 300 m of the proposed facility is generally regarded as one within close proximity.

² Catchment is defined as the area within the radius of 300 m from every entrance/access point of the proposed facility.

- catchment (5);
 - (iii) topographical conditions, i.e. steep gradient/level difference (11);
 - (iv) connectivity with other existing/committed pedestrian facilities (4);
 - (v) connectivity with existing/committed mass public transport facilities within catchment (4);
 - (vi) connectivity with existing/committed centres of activity within catchment (4);
 - (vii) steadiness of existing pedestrian flow (6);
- (b) Beneficial factors (total score : 35)
- (viii) revitalization of / benefits to local community (6);
 - (ix) journey time/cost saving (8);
 - (x) improvement to existing traffic conditions (6);
 - (xi) improvement to existing pedestrian conditions (6);
 - (xii) road safety (6);
 - (xiii) tourism promotion (3);
- (c) Implementation factors (total score : 25)
- (xiv) land requirement (6);
 - (xv) technical/environmental constraints (6); and
 - (xvi) cost-effectiveness (13).

4. The respective weightings for the circumstantial, beneficial and implementation factors, as well as the individual items thereunder, reflect their relative importance, forming a total score of 100. Based on the scores obtained, the relative rankings among various proposals on HEL will be determined in an objective manner. Those proposals with higher

rankings will obviously have priority to proceed to the next stage of planning and investigation.

5. However, the proposed assessment system will not be applicable to the following proposals –

- (a) proposals which cross a single road – they will be evaluated under the criteria for footbridge construction;
- (b) proposals which entirely fall within the boundary of public housing estates – the Housing Department will consider the feasibility of the escalator and elevator systems within the boundary of public housing estates separately; or
- (c) proposals which form an integral part of major projects –justifications for them will be considered as part of the respective major projects.

(Source: Annex A to LC Paper No.: CB(1)1190/09-10(03))

Progress of the proposals of the hillside escalator links

Rank	Proposal	Progress of Project
1	Pedestrian Link at Tsz Wan Shan	<p>The pedestrian link is implemented under the Shatin to Central Link project. The construction work commenced in July 2012. As at end of February 2017, 12 out of the 15 facilities under this pedestrian link have already been completed and opened for public use, while 1 facility is expected to be completed in the second quarter of 2017. Regarding the 2 remaining facilities, the target completion date is the third quarter of 2017.</p>
2	Braemar Hill Pedestrian Link	<p>The preliminary technical feasibility study has been completed. The Highways Department ("HyD") has engaged works consultants to carry out the investigation and preliminary design.</p> <p>The HyD consulted and obtained the support from the Planning, Works and Housing Committee of the Eastern District Council on the design scheme in September 2016. The HyD is currently making preparation for the gazetting of the works.</p>
3	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Cheung Hang Estate, Tsing Yi	<p>The Government has obtained funding approval from the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in May 2016. The construction work has commenced since February 2017 and is expected to be completed in mid-2019.</p>
4	Escalator Link and Pedestrian Walkway System at Pound Lane	<p>The preliminary technical feasibility study has been completed. The HyD has engaged works consultants to carry out the investigation and preliminary design.</p> <p>In 2015, the HyD consulted the Central and Western District Council ("C&WDC") on the refined proposal and held a public forum. The department is currently collating and analysing the comments received with a view to briefing the C&WDC on the proposal's progress in the first half of 2017.</p>

Rank	Proposal	Progress of Project
5	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Kwai Shing Circuit and Hing Shing Road	The Government has obtained funding approval from the LegCo in May 2016. The invitation to tender for this proposal ended in February 2017. The HyD is assessing the relevant tenders with a view to commencing the construction works in the second quarter of 2017 for completion in 2020.
6	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Castle Peak Road and Kung Yip Street	<p>The preliminary technical feasibility study has been completed. The HyD has engaged works consultants to carry out the investigation and preliminary design.</p> <p>The HyD consulted and obtained the support from the Traffic and Transport Committee of the Kwai Tsing District Council on the design scheme in April 2016. The department is currently making preparation for the gazetting of the works.</p>
7	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai Cho Road and Wah Yiu Road	The preliminary technical feasibility study has been completed. The HyD has engaged works consultants to carry out the investigation and preliminary design.
8	Pedestrian Link near Chuk Yuen North Estate	<p>The preliminary technical feasibility study has been completed. The HyD has engaged works consultants to carry out the investigation and preliminary design.</p> <p>The HyD consulted and obtained the support from the Traffic and Transport Committee of the Wong Tai Sin District Council on the preliminary design in July 2016. The department is making preparation for the gazetting of the works.</p>
9	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System at Waterloo Hill	The Government has obtained funding approval from the LegCo in May 2016. Construction work has commenced since December 2016 and is expected to be completed in mid-2019.
10	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai King Hill Road and Lai Cho Road	It is revealed in the preliminary technical feasibility study that the project involves two dangerous private slopes. The HyD will revisit this proposal after the parties concerned have completed repairing the dangerous slopes.

Rank	Proposal	Progress of Project
11	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Tai Wo Hau Road and Wo Tong Tsui Street	<p>The preliminary technical feasibility study has been completed. The HyD has engaged works consultants to carry out the investigation and preliminary design.</p> <p>The HyD consulted and obtained the support from the Traffic and Transport Committee of the Kwai Tsing District Council on the preliminary design in September 2016.</p> <p>The Government gazetted the proposed project in pursuance of the Roads (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap. 370) in February 2017.</p> <p>The Government plans to seek funding approval from the LegCo within this legislative session to take forward the construction work for the proposal.</p>
12	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway at Luen On Street	<p>The preliminary technical feasibility study has been completed. The HyD has engaged works consultants to carry out the investigation and preliminary design for this project.</p> <p>The consultancy is studying the alignment and preliminary design scheme for reduction in land acquisition and impacts on the environment.</p>
13	Yuet Wah Street Pedestrian Linkage	<p>To support the Kwun Tong Town Centre Redevelopment, the Civil Engineering and Development Department commenced construction for this project in April 2013. The Linkage has been completed and opened for public use since October 2015.</p>
14*	Escalator Link System between Hong Sing Garden and Po Hong Road	<p>This proposal would be followed up after the smooth implementation of the higher-ranking proposals.</p>
14*	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Lai King Hill Road and Princess Margaret Hospital	<p>The Hospital Authority commenced the works for this proposal in November 2015. The works has been completed and the facility opened for public use since January 2017.</p>

Rank	Proposal	Progress of Project
16	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Saddle Ridge Garden and Sai Sha Road	This proposal would be followed up after the smooth implementation of the higher-ranking proposals.
17	Lift and Pedestrian Walkway System between Hing Shing Road and Tai Wo Hau Road	This proposal would be followed up after the smooth implementation of the higher-ranking proposals.
18	Escalator Link System between Sha Tin Sui Wo Court and MTR Fo Tan Station	This proposal would be followed up after the smooth implementation of the higher-ranking proposals.

* There are two proposals with the same ranking of 14. Hence, there is no proposal ranked 15.

(Source: Reply to an initial written question raised by Finance Committee Members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2017-2018 - Annex to THB(T)032)

Provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems

List of relevant papers

Date of meeting	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
15.3.2002	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on "Provision of Escalator Link/Elevator System"	CB(1)1266/01-02(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0315cb1-1266-3e.pdf
		Minutes of the meeting	CB(1)1517/01-02 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp020315.pdf
6.2002	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on "Territory-wide Review on Provision of Escalator Links/Elevator Systems"	CB(1)2130/01-02(04) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr01-02/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0315cb1-2130-4e.pdf
22.5.2009	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on "Establishment of an assessment system for provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems"	CB(1)1613/08-09(06) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0522cb1-1613-6-e.pdf
		Minutes of the meeting	CB(1)2756/08-09 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr08-09/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20090522.pdf

Date of meeting	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
26.2.2010	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on "Assessment results on proposals for provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems"	CB(1)1190/09-10(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0226cb1-1190-3-e.pdf
		Background brief on the provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems	CB(1)1191/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0226cb1-1191-e.pdf
		Administration's paper responding to the motions on assessment results on proposals for provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems	CB(1)2983/09-10(02) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/papers/tp0226cb1-2983-2-e.pdf
		Minutes of the meeting	CB(1)1596/09-10 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr09-10/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20100226.pdf
9.1.2013	Legislative Council	Question raised by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung on provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201301/09/P201301080376.htm
16.4.2014	Legislative Council	Question raised by Hon Paul TSE on hillside escalator links and elevator systems	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201404/16/P201404160474.htm
26.11.2014	Legislative Council	Question raised by Hon Michael TIEN on hillside escalator links and elevator systems	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201411/26/P201411260360.htm

Date of meeting	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
16.1.2015	Panel on Transport	Minutes of the meeting	CB(4)1390/14-15 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr14-15/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20150116.pdf
16.12.2015	Legislative Council	Question raised by Hon Frankie YICK on hillside escalator links and elevator systems	http://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201512/16/P201512160340.htm
28.12.2015	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper responding to the letter from Hon CHAN Han-pan on the progress of providing hillside escalator links and elevator systems	CB(4)414/15-16(01) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/panels/tp/papers/tpcb4-414-1-e.pdf
23.3.2016	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on provision of Hillside Escalator Links and Elevator Systems, footbridges and elevated walkways	CB(4)736/15-16(06) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20160323cb4-736-6-e.pdf
		Background brief on the progress of provision of hillside escalator links and elevator systems prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat	CB(4)736/15-16(07) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20160323cb4-736-7-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	CB(4)1302/15-16 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20160323.pdf

Date of meeting	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
15.4.2016	Panel on Transport	Minutes of meeting	CB(4)1321/15-16 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/panels/tp/minutes/tp20160415.pdf
20.4.2016	Public Works Subcommittee	Administration's paper	PWSC(2016-17)5 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/fc/pwsc/papers/p16-05e.pdf
		Administration's follow-up paper	PWSC203/15-16 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/fc/pwsc/papers/pwsc20160420pwsc-203-1-e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	PWSC208/15-16 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/fc/pwsc/minutes/pwsc20160420.pdf
13.5.2016	Finance Committee	Recommendations of the Public Works Subcommittee on Public Works Programme and Capital Subvention Projects	FCR(2016-17)20 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/fc/fc/papers/f16-20e.pdf
		Minutes of meeting	FC294/15-16 http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr15-16/english/fc/fc/minutes/fc20160513.pdf

Date of meeting	Committee	Minutes/Paper	LC Paper No.
20.1.2017	Panel on Transport	Administration's paper on transport-related policy initiatives of the Transport and Housing Bureau under the 2017 Policy Address and Policy Agenda	CB(4)413/16-17(03) http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr16-17/english/panels/tp/papers/tp20170120cb4-413-3-e.pdf
5.4.2017	Finance Committee	Replies to initial written questions raised by Finance Committee Members in examining the Estimates of Expenditure 2017-2018 - THB(T)032 - THB(T)101 - THB(T)104 - THB(T)194	http://www.legco.gov.hk/yr16-17/english/fc/fc/w_q/thb-t-e.pdf

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
12 April 2017