

# **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

For information  
on 21 April 2017

WKCDA CP/04/2017

## **Report on the Key Findings of the Public Consultation Exercise on the Hong Kong Palace Museum Project**

### **PURPOSE**

This paper briefs Members on the key findings and initial assessment of the feedback and views collected during the consultation period of the public consultation exercise. Consumer Search Group (CSG), an independent consultant appointed by the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) to analyse the feedback and views collected during the consultation period, has prepared an Executive Summary of the key findings, at the **Annex**.

### **BACKGROUND**

2. Following the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding on Cooperation (MOU) on the Hong Kong Palace Museum (HKPM) between WKCDA and the Palace Museum on 23 December 2016, a public consultation exercise on the project was launched on 11 January 2017. After extension by two weeks, the public consultation period ended on 8 March.

3. The public consultation exercise's objective was to solicit public views on the HKPM project generally and, in particular, on its design, programming, learning and interpretation opportunities. An exhibition introducing the project was presented at the City Gallery in Central and an online exhibition on the project was also presented on the WKCDA website. Members of the public were invited to fill in a questionnaire to give their views on the different aspects of the project in person at the City Gallery or online through the WKCDA website.

# **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

WKCD A CP/04/2017

4. In order to reach out to more members of the public and collect their views on the HKPM project, WKCD A commissioned a territory-wide public opinion poll from 28 February 2017 to 7 March 2017. The poll covered the Hong Kong resident population aged 15 or above. Quota sampling<sup>1</sup> was adopted to ensure that the enumerated samples represent an appropriate composition of the target population.

## **HIGHLIGHTS OF THE PUBLIC CONSULTATION**

### **Consultation Activities**

5. WKCD A's Consultation Panel is an important channel for gathering public opinion. During the consultation period, two special meetings of the Consultation Panel were held to gauge views of the Members on the HKPM project. WKCD A also organised five consultation sessions for major stakeholders - two of them tailored for the professional bodies in the architectural, engineering, landscape, planning and surveying fields; another two for the arts and culture sector; and one for the arts and culture-related committees of the 18 District Councils. Apart from these sessions, WKCD A also participated in panel discussions and talks organised by local professional groups, professional institutions, the Task Force on Harbourfront Developments in Kowloon, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing of the Harbourfront Commission as well as a session organised by The Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups. WKCD A also briefed the Chairmen and Vice-chairmen of the 18 District Councils on the HKPM project at a regular meeting arranged by the Home Affairs Department.

### **Analysis of the Views Received**

6. During the consultation period, a public opinion poll was carried out with face-to-face interviews on the street with 1 805 people

---

<sup>1</sup> The quota was set with reference to the corresponding population figures as at the third quarter of 2016 provided by the Census and Statistics Department, including (i) age, (ii) gender, (iii) highest educational attainment, and (iv) working status.

# Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

---

WKCDA CP/04/2017

in 18 districts. Qualitative views were received mainly through three main channels in both hardcopy and electronic format – records of consultation activities, questionnaires, and written submissions. All the documents received during the consultation period, including 623 paper and 905 online questionnaires, and 54 written submissions (encompassing 119 individuals/ associations/ bodies) were analysed.

7. The key findings are set out below:-

- Support for the HKPM project was consistently recorded across the consultation channels:
  - For the **public opinion poll**, 52.0% of the public were supportive (very supportive/ supportive) to development of the HKPM project while 14.7% were not supportive (not supportive at all/ not supportive) (the remaining part of the public had no opinion either way, i.e. neither supporting nor opposing the proposed HKPM project);
  - 41.2% of the respondents of the **questionnaire** were supportive while 34.9% were not supportive; 73.1% of the **written submissions** were supportive while 22.7% were not supportive (the remaining respondents did not express or express clearly their stance); and
  - 34.0% of the respondents at the **consultation activities** supported the HKPM project while 11.3% were not (the remaining respondents did not express or express clearly their stance).
- Suggestions on HKPM's operation and the museum design were provided from various consultation channels other than the public opinion poll:
  - The top five facilities to be incorporated into HKPM include exhibition galleries, restaurants/ coffee shops, activity rooms, lecture theatre and workshop facilities.
  - The most preferred learning programmes to be presented in HKPM include community engagement programmes, as well as activities specifically designed for enhancing

# **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

WKCD CP/04/2017

knowledge of culture and history.

- Top suggestions for exhibitions and programmes include artefacts across different dynasties in terms of arts and culture, the history and the related artefacts, as well as collaboration with other museums and collectors.
- Interpretation service or tools suggested to be available in HKPM are audio guide, mobile applications, and guided tours.

## **Further Considerations to Be Taken into Account from the Qualitative Views Collected from Various Consultation Channels except Public Opinion Poll**

8. There were views expressed on a lack of transparency and public consultation in the development of the HKPM project. In view of the special circumstances of the project and the need to maintain confidentiality, the Board of WKCD has no basis to conduct public consultation prior to the signing of the MOU with the Palace Museum. Upon the signing of the MOU, WKCD has immediately engaged the public. The undertaking of this consultation exercise has indeed fulfilled precisely the demand of these views. Although WKCD has a provisional view about the merits of the proposed project, which have been explained to the public, WKCD has yet to reach a final view and has been considering returns of the public consultation exercise conscientiously and with an open mind.

9. WKCD was perceived by some as a body only to be involved in the promotion of local art and culture and thus HKPM should not be developed in the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD). It should be noted that WKCD is committed to facilitating and enhancing cultural exchange and cooperation among Hong Kong, Mainland China and beyond, and to enhancing the appreciation of a diverse and pluralistic range of the arts as set out in the WKCD Ordinance (Cap. 601). According to the Planning Themes and Design Principles of the Development Plan approved in January 2013, WKCD is to be developed

# **Consultation Panel of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority**

---

WKCDA CP/04/2017

into a world-class integrated arts and cultural district comprising local, traditional as well as international elements.

10. There were suggestions that consultation should allow sufficient time and sufficient opportunities for the public to express their views. WKCDA, with the support of Rocco Design Architects Limited (RDA), had presented the proposed internal layout and spatial design concepts of the museum starting from 15 February 2017 and extended the public consultation for two weeks to a total of eight weeks ended on 8 March 2017 to allow more time for the general public and the stakeholders to offer their views on the project.

11. There were concerns about the selection of the design consultant of HKPM. The direct appointment of RDA as the design consultant of the HKPM was approved by the Board with full justification and authority.

## **ADVICE SOUGHT AND WAY FORWARD**

12. Members are invited to note and give views on the key findings of the public consultation exercise as analysed by CSG. CSG is finalising a report on their analysis of the feedback received during the consultation exercise. This will be shared with Members when it is ready.

**West Kowloon Cultural District Authority  
April 2017**

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF KEY FINDINGS

### Introduction

1. The West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD), located on the waterfront of Hong Kong's Victoria Harbour, is one of the largest cultural projects in the world. Its vision is to create a vibrant new cultural quarter for Hong Kong. With a complex of theatres, performance space, and M+, WKCD will produce and host world-class exhibitions, performances and cultural events, as well as provide 23 hectares of public open space, including a two-kilometre waterfront promenade.
2. The West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) announced the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding of Cooperation (MOU) between WKCDA and the Palace Museum in Beijing on 23 December 2016 to launch a new museum in WKCD with long-term loans from the Palace Museum. Under this special arrangement, the Hong Kong Palace Museum (HKPM) will be established by WKCDA as a new focal point of WKCD for displaying the visual culture of 5 000 years of rich historical Chinese art from the imperial courts.
3. Following the signing of the MOU, WKCDA has undertaken a multi-pronged public consultation exercise from 11 January to 8 March 2017 to hear the views of the general public and stakeholders including those from professional bodies in the architectural, engineering, landscape, planning and surveying fields as well as the arts and culture sector. Information on the proposed HKPM project was on display at the City Gallery in Central and online on the WKCDA website throughout the consultation period. Members of the public and stakeholders were invited to submit their views on the HKPM project within this period. The outcome of the public consultation exercise will be reported to the WKCDA Board for deliberation on the way ahead.

4. An independent consulting firm (the Consumer Search Group, the “Consultation Consultant”) was commissioned by WKCDA to provide data collection and analysis services for the public consultation process.
5. From the views expressed by participants of various consultation activities, paper questionnaires collected at the City Gallery, online questionnaire conducted via the WKCDA website, written as well as call submissions from members of the public, the Consultation Consultant understands the attitudes and opinions of relevant persons on the proposed HKPM project and their reasons behind. Views and opinions published in the print media throughout the consultation period had been reviewed as reference materials. Since this information had been collected from the open sources and it was not received from the official consultation channels, it was thus excluded in the consolidated analysis.
6. In addition to the qualitative views as collected from the various consultation activities, the Consultation Consultant also conducted a public opinion poll among the general public covering the Hong Kong resident population of age 15 or above.
7. This summary covers the overall analysis of the views and opinions received during the public consultation exercise covering:-
  - Public opinion poll through on-street face-to-face interviews;
  - Questionnaires (i) distributed at the City Gallery in Central where the proposed HKPM project details were on display, and (ii) conducted via the WKCDA website where the proposed HKPM project details were uploaded;
  - Views expressed at the consultation activities that WKCDA organised or took part in; and
  - Direct written and call submissions from the public.

# Methodology

## I. Public Opinion Poll

8. The public opinion poll collected and analyzed the opinions from the general public in order to understand the similarities and differences of their views on the HKPM project and provide information for WKCDA's reference in the deliberation of the project development.
9. The public opinion poll covered the Hong Kong resident population aged 15 or above. Quota sampling was adopted to ensure that the enumerated samples could represent an appropriate composition of the target population. The quota was set with reference to the corresponding population figures as at the third quarter of 2016 provided by the Census and Statistics Department, including (i) age, (ii) gender, (iii) highest educational attainment and (iv) working status.
10. A total of 1 805 respondents were successfully enumerated in 18 locations with major traffic junctions, transport hubs and landmarks in Hong Kong<sup>1</sup>, covering Hong Kong Island, Kowloon and the New Territories, between 28 February and 7 March 2017 via on-street face-to-face interviews.

---

<sup>1</sup> The fieldwork locations included

i. four (4) sampling points on the Hong Kong Island (Smithfield Market in Sai Wan, Wan Chai MTR station, Tai Koo Shing Aeon, Aberdeen Centre);

ii. five (5) sampling points in Kowloon (Mong Kok Soy Street, Carpenter Road Park in Kowloon City, Kwun Tong Yue Man Square, Sham Shui Po MTR station, Wong Tai Sin MTR station);

iii. four (4) sampling points in New Territories East (Shatin Market, Tai Po Centre, Sheung Shui Shek Wu Hui Market, Po Lam MTR station); and

iv. five (5) sampling points in New Territories West (Tung Chung MTR station, Tsuen Wan Lo Tak Court, Kwai Fong MTR station, Tuen Mun Yan Oi Tong, Colour Yuen Long).



11. To correct the potential bias as introduced by the incidence of non-response and non-contact cases, all information collected was properly weighted by age group (15-19, 20-29, 30-39, 40-49, 50-59, and 60 or above), gender (male and female) and highest educational attainment (primary or below, secondary and post-secondary or above) in accordance with the corresponding Hong Kong population figures of persons aged 15 or above as at the third quarter of 2016<sup>2</sup> (i.e. N = 6 143 600 in total)<sup>3</sup>.

## **II. Public Consultation Activities**

12. During the public consultation period from 11 January to 8 March 2017, in addition to the public opinion poll, WKCDA organised and took part in a range of public consultation activities to involve the public and stakeholders and to collect their views using a more qualitative approach. Specifically, WKCDA:
  - (i) held an eight (8)-week exhibition on the project at the City Gallery in Central and hosted its online versions (i.e. the WKCDA website) to introduce the HKPM project to the public, where public could submit their views and comments in person at the exhibition venue, by post, via email or via the online platform using the questionnaires provided;
  - (ii) arranged two (2) special meetings of the Consultation Panel to gauge the views of the panel members on the HKPM project<sup>4</sup>;

---

<sup>2</sup> Corresponding population figures were sourced from the “Hong Kong Resident Population of persons aged 15 or above as at the third quarter of 2016 (excluding foreign domestic helpers)”, The Census and Statistics Department, Hong Kong.

<sup>3</sup> The maximum sampling error or precision level at 95% confidence level for a sample size of 1 805 respondents will be in the region of 2.3 percent.

<sup>4</sup> The Consultation Panel is an important channel for gathering public opinion. The first special meeting was held on 12 January 2017, right after the launch of the public consultation exercise, and the second special meeting was held on 20 February 2017 after the presentation of the proposed internal layout and spatial design concepts of HKPM at the exhibition.

(iii) organized five (5) consultation sessions with relevant stakeholders to gauge their comments and advice, viz. two (2) sessions with the Arts and Culture sector, two (2) sessions with the professional bodies in the Architectural, Engineering, Landscape, Planning and Surveying sectors, and one (1) session with the Arts and Culture-related committees of the 18 District Councils<sup>5</sup>; and

(iv) participated in one (1) youth forum<sup>6</sup> and one (1) open forum<sup>7</sup> organized by professional group/ institution.

13. WKCDA also took part in the following public consultation activities. Views and opinions discussed during the sessions had been documented as internal record for reference of relevant parties only. Upon availability of the official minutes for item (ii) below, the contents of the discussions would be appended in the full report.

(i) WKCDA briefed the Board of the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong<sup>8</sup> at their Board meeting;

(ii) WKCDA gave a presentation to the Task Force on Harbourfront Developments in Kowloon, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing of the Harbourfront Commission<sup>9</sup>; and

(iii) WKCDA briefed the Chairmen and Vice-chairmen of the 18 District Councils at a meeting arranged by the Home Affairs Department<sup>10</sup>.

---

<sup>5</sup> The first sessions with the Architectural, Engineering, Landscape, Planning and Surveying sector and the Arts and Culture sector were held in January 2017 (i.e. 23 January 2017 and 26 January 2017 respectively), and the second sessions were held after the presentation of the proposed internal layout and spatial design concepts of HKPM at the exhibition in February 2017 (i.e. 22 February 2017 and 16 February 2017 respectively). As for the session with the Arts and Culture-related committees of the 18 District Councils, it was held on 6 March 2017.

<sup>6</sup> The youth forum was organised by the Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups (HKFYG) on 1 March 2017.

<sup>7</sup> The open forum was organized by the International Institute of Management (IIM) on 25 February 2017.

<sup>8</sup> The Board meeting of the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong was held on 14 February 2017 with a written submission submitted before the meeting.

<sup>9</sup> The meeting of the Task Force on Harbourfront Developments in Kowloon, Tsuen Wan and Kwai Tsing of the Harbourfront Commission was held on 14 February 2017.

<sup>10</sup> The regular meeting of Chairmen and Vice-Chairmen of the 18 District Councils arranged by the Home Affairs Department was held on 16 February 2017.

14. Upon completion of the eight (8)-week public consultation on the HKPM project,
- (i) a total of 1 528 valid questionnaires were obtained (623 paper questionnaires and 905 online questionnaires);
  - (ii) views of 97 participants of the consultation activities (including consultation sessions, meetings and forums) were collected; and
  - (iii) some 54 valid written submissions (encompassing 119 individuals/ associations/ bodies) and four (4) incoming call submissions were received from individuals and associations/ bodies by email, fax, post and phone etc.
15. Other submissions (as summarised below) were also provided by WKCDA for reference only:
- (i) two (2) written submissions were received prior to the public consultation period<sup>11</sup>;
  - (ii) two (2) written submissions were received after the public consultation period<sup>12</sup>; and
  - (iii) a total of 285 media reports of various journalists and columnists published during the consultation period were captured<sup>13</sup>.

---

<sup>11</sup> Of the two (2) written submissions received prior to the public consultation period, one (1) of them is observed with a clear supporting stance on the HKPM project.

<sup>12</sup> Both written submissions received after the public consultation period are observed with a clear stance on the HKPM project (i.e. one (1) supports the HKPM project and one (1) opposes the development).

<sup>13</sup> A total of 285 media reports had been captured and reviewed. Among these media reports, only 66 of them are observed with a clear stance on the HKPM project (i.e. 64 supports the HKPM project and two (2) opposes the development).

## Summary of Key Analysis and Opinions

16. Overall findings indicated that supporting views outnumbered opposing views by a significant margin in all consultation channels.
- Public opinion poll (N=1 805: 52.0% supporting vs. 14.7% opposing); questionnaire (N=1 528: 41.2% vs. 34.9%); written submission (N=119: 73.1% vs. 22.7%); and consultation activities (N=97: 34.0% vs. 11.3%)
  - Moreover, there was a significant proportion of the general public (33.3% from public opinion poll) that had no opinion either way (i.e. neither supporting nor opposing the proposed HKPM project);

### I. Public Opinion Poll

17. General awareness of the proposed HKPM project was high with more than four-fifths of the (81.2%) general public being aware of the proposed HKPM project.
18. Supporting views towards HKPM project exceeded opposing views by a big margin. About 52.0% of the general public were supportive of the development of the HKPM while 14.7% were not supportive. 33.3% had no opinion either way.
19. The key reasons for those in supporting this project (52.0%) evolved around strengthening the ties between Hong Kong and China; establishment of a new attraction and its impact on the tourism industry; and the macro benefits that it would bring to Hong Kong<sup>14</sup>. Specifically,
- Nearly a quarter (25.2%) believed the HKPM would offer good educational value and could facilitate the learning and understanding of Hong Kong and China, particularly the history (11.1%), culture (10.5%) and cultural relics (3.3%);

---

<sup>14</sup> Similar observations were noted from other public consultation activities organized during the consultation period.

- 8.2% of them believed that the HKPM would become a new attraction in Hong Kong and a good place to go for leisure; the development of the HKPM would attract more tourists to Hong Kong (7.8%); visitors could conveniently enjoy and see the artefacts from the renowned Palace Museum in Hong Kong (5.1%).
20. Nearly three-fifths (58.3%) of the general public agreed with the statement that this project would provide the WKCD visitors a more diverse range of cultural facilities and experience.
21. Almost half (49.9%) of them agreed that this project would be beneficial to Hong Kong as a whole, bringing cultural, social and economic benefits; and
- 4.7% of them expected the project to bring about social and economic benefits to Hong Kong; and
  - Additionally, a few (0.1%) had mentioned that this world-class museum would uplift Hong Kong's overall international stature.
22. However, those general public who opposed the HKPM project (14.7%) were more concerned with the resources spent in building the museum (4.9%), and the lack of public consultation (2.4%) than establishing the HKPM itself<sup>15</sup>. Nevertheless, their key opposition against establishing the HKPM could mainly be categorized into three aspects:
- *The role of the HKPM amongst existing Hong Kong museums* – 1.6% of the general public stated that there were already a lot of museums in Hong Kong; of which, some were considered to be of similar nature (0.8%);
  - *The appropriateness to build the HKPM in Hong Kong* – 2.3% of the general public stated that people could simply and easily go to Beijing to visit the Palace Museum if they would like to enjoy the exhibits and artefacts; and

---

<sup>15</sup> Similar opposing concerns were observed among respondents from other public consultation activities.

- *The appropriateness to build the HKPM within WKCD* –1.5% of the general public were not supporting building the HKPM within WKCD.

## **II. Qualitative Views and Suggestions Collected from Various Consultation Channels except Public Opinion Poll**

23. When asked to provide suggestions for the HKPM development, individuals from other consultation channels activities were very responsive with over 1 300 specific views on the HKPM's design, programming, learning and interpretation opportunities, in addition to the general views about the HKPM project collected. The top mentions were summarized as follows:

- *Views on the HKPM project in general* - supporting views towards HKPM project exceeded opposing views by a fair margin. About 43.0% of the individuals/ associations/ bodies who had submitted views during the consulting period were supportive of the development of the HKPM while 32.8% were not supportive.
  - The main supporting views were related to (i) the benefits for Hong Kong's cultural development and a better understanding of the Chinese culture and Chinese history; and (ii) the benefits for Hong Kong's tourism and economy.
  - The main opposing views were related to (i) whether the proposed HKPM project had to be built in WKCD; (ii) lack of transparency and public consultation and (iii) whether the HKPM project was needed.

### Specific Views on the HKPM Project

- *Exhibitions and Programmes* - more thematic exhibition; thematic exhibitions should cover different dynasties in terms of the arts and culture, the history and the related artefacts exhibitions; and more collaboration with other museums and collectors to showcase more artefacts;

- *Proposed Facilities* - the top five mentions were exhibition galleries; restaurants/coffee shops that could be government sponsored, with reasonable price and perhaps, with Palace Theme restaurants; activity rooms for education and video sharing; lecture theatre and workshop facilities;
- *Learning and Interpretation Support* – providing audio guide; mobile applications to give detailed description of exhibits and interactive programmes to allow experiencing virtual reality; and guided tours including those for visitors with special disabilities, for example the deaf;
- *Learning Programmes and Activities* – providing community engagement programmes including internship and tours tailored for the public and youth; and organizing activities which could specifically be designed for enhancing knowledge of culture and history; and
- *General Operation* - admission fee (free, special rate or special waiver); management by professional and local Hong Kong residents; and the operation should be managed as an independent, non-profit and self-sufficient organization.

24. Last but not least, despite not as highly mentioned as the above suggestions, the general public expected an enhancement in the consultation sessions for the HKPM project (8.9%). Specifically, this would include making more information available to the public and ensuring that sufficient and ample time would be allocated for respective consultation sessions so the public could share their views in a timely manner.