

Ref : CB2/SC/16

**Select Committee to Inquire into Matters about the Agreement
between Mr LEUNG Chun-ying and the Australian firm UGL Limited**

**Minutes of the closed meeting
held on Thursday, 11 June 2020, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room 5 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan, JP

Clerk in attendance : Miss Josephine SO
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

Staff in attendance : Miss Flora TAI
Assistant Secretary General 2

Mr Timothy TSO
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Miss Joyce CHAN
Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Mr Clement HAU
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Michelle TANG
Council Secretary (2) 6

X X X X X X X X

II. Consideration and endorsement of the report of the Select Committee paragraph by paragraph
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1166/19-20(01))

3. Mr Kenneth LEUNG declared that Mr LEUNG Chun-ying had brought a defamation suit (HCA 533/2017) against him. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting also declared that he might be involved in litigation with Mr LEUNG Chun-ying in the future.

4. The Chairman said that at the last closed meeting on 7 May 2020, members had agreed that the Clerk should proceed to draft the report of the Select Committee according to the directions proposed by members. The draft report so prepared (LC Paper No. CB(2)1166/19-20(01)) had been issued to members on 9 June 2020. The Chairman reminded members that the content of and the Select Committee's upcoming discussion on the draft report should be kept confidential.

5. The Chairman gave a brief introduction on the layout of the draft report.

6. In accordance with RoP 79(7)(a), the Chairman put to members the question that the draft report (LC Paper No. CB(2)1166/19-20(01)) be adopted as the Chairman's report and accepted as a basis for discussion. The question was agreed to.

7. The Chairman then proposed that the Chairman's report be read a second time paragraph by paragraph. As the question was also agreed to, the Chairman led members through the Chinese version of the report.

Preamble

8. Preamble read and agreed to.

Part I - Chapter 1

9. Paragraphs 1.1 to 1.4 read. Members expressed views on the structure of Chapter 1 "Introduction". Some members suggested that

paragraphs 1.3 and 1.4 under the heading "Establishment of the Select Committee" should be moved to the beginning of Chapter 1, and that paragraphs 1.1 and 1.2 under the heading "Background" and subheading "The UGL incident and the UGL Agreement" should be moved to the later part of the report.

10. Some members did not see a need to provide detailed information about the history and business development of DTZ Holdings plc ("DTZ") and suggested deleting footnote 4 under paragraph 1.1. Some other members, however, considered it necessary to refer to the events leading to the sale of DTZ to UGL Limited to facilitate readers' understanding. These members opined that should footnote 4 be deleted in its entirety, other paragraphs of the report should be amended to ensure that relevant information was included in the report.

(At this juncture, the voting bell started ringing. At 5:14 pm, the Chairman ordered that the closed meeting be suspended in order to allow members to return to the Chamber to take part in the voting. The closed meeting resumed at 5:27 pm.)

11. Members continued to consider paragraphs 1.1 to 1.4 of the report. The Deputy Chairman and Dr Priscilla LEUNG suggested that:

- (a) a footnote be added to the relevant paragraph to specify that Mr LEUNG Chun-ying was the fourth term Chief Executive, who served his term of office from 1 July 2012 to 30 June 2017;
- (b) the provisions of RoP that had been referred to in the report (including RoP 20(1)) be set out in full; and
- (c) the names of the 28 Members in support of the request to refer the petition presented at the Council meeting of 2 November 2016 to a select committee be shown in the report.

12. After discussion, the Chairman suggested that the Clerk be directed to amend Chapter 1 and other parts of the report (if necessary) according to the views expressed and suggestions made by members at this meeting. Members raised no objection.

Part I - Chapter 2

13. Paragraphs 2.1 to 2.4 read and agreed to.

14. Paragraph 2.5 read. The Deputy Chairman and Dr Priscilla LEUNG suggested that the last line of footnote 8 under this paragraph be amended to make it clear that the Select Committee was unable to adhere to the schedule as set out in the work plan. Members raised no objection to their proposal.

15. Paragraphs 2.6 and 2.7 read and agreed to.

16. Paragraphs 2.8 to 2.12 read. Some members suggested trimming down the contents of paragraphs 2.8 to 2.29 as these paragraphs covered peripheral issues. Some other members, however, objected to the proposal, on the basis that the events described in paragraphs 2.8 to 2.29 provided a factual account of all matters relevant to the operation of the Select Committee.

17. After discussion, the Chairman suggested that the Clerk be directed to amend paragraphs 2.8 to 2.29 according to the views expressed and suggestions made by members at this meeting. Members raised no objection.

18. The Chairman said that as it was approaching the appointed end time of the meeting at 6:30 pm, he would declare the meeting closed. The Chairman suggested and members agreed that the Select Committee should hold another closed meeting on Thursday, 18 June 2020 at 4:30 pm to continue its discussion on the unfinished items on the agenda.

(Post-meeting note: To allow sufficient time for discussion, the Chairman had, after the meeting, directed that the next closed meeting started at 2:30 pm and ended at 6:30 pm.)

19. The meeting ended at 6:24 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 July 2020

Ref : CB2/SC/16

**Select Committee to Inquire into Matters about the Agreement
between Mr LEUNG Chun-ying and the Australian firm UGL Limited**

**Minutes of the closed meeting
held on Thursday, 18 June 2020, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 5 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan, JP

Member absent : Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

Clerk in attendance : Miss Josephine SO
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

Staff in attendance : Miss Flora TAI
Assistant Secretary General 2

Mr Timothy TSO
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Miss Joyce CHAN
Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Mr Clement HAU
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Michelle TANG
Council Secretary (2) 6

Miss Cally LAI
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

X X X X X X X X

II. Consideration and endorsement of the report of the Select Committee paragraph by paragraph
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1210/19-20(03))

5. The Chairman recapitulated that at the last closed meeting on 11 June 2020, members had taken the decisions to (a) adopt the draft report prepared by the Clerk and issued on 9 June 2020 (LC Paper No. CB(2)1166/19-20(01)) ("the first draft report") as the Chairman's report and to accept it as the basis for discussion; and (b) start reading the first draft report a second time paragraph by paragraph ("the two decisions made at the last closed meeting"). Thereafter, members had expressed various views and made suggestions to amend the first draft report. The Clerk had amended the first draft report accordingly. The amended version of the draft report (as at 16 June 2020) (LC Paper No. CB(2)1210/19-20(03)) had been issued to members on 16 June 2020 ("the amended draft report"). Before proceeding to consider the amended draft report, the Chairman reminded members that the content of and the Select Committee's upcoming discussion on the amended draft report should be kept confidential.

6. The Chairman drew members' attention to RoP 79(7)(a) which stated that when the question that the Chairman's report be read a second time paragraph by paragraph had been agreed to, the same question should not be proposed on further reports but portions thereof might be offered as amendments to the report under consideration if they were relevant to it. Since the first draft report had been substantially amended, the Select Committee had to rescind the two decisions made at the last closed meeting and put afresh the questions to adopt the amended draft report as the Chairman's report and to accept it as the basis for discussion in order to carry on with the consideration of the report.

(At this juncture, the quorum bell was ringing to summon Members back to the Chamber to attend the Council meeting held concurrently. At 2:37 pm, the Chairman ordered that the closed meeting be suspended for a short while in order to allow members to return to the Chamber. The closed meeting resumed at 2:47 pm.)

7. The Chairman put the proposal of rescinding the two decisions made at the last closed meeting to vote. Two members voted in favour of the proposal, two members voted against it and no member abstained. The Chairman exercised his casting vote in accordance with RoP 79(6) and RoP 79A(1) and declared that the proposal was negatived.

(At 2:59 pm, the Chairman ordered that the closed meeting be suspended to allow him to discuss procedural matters with the Clerk and the Legal Adviser to the Select Committee. The closed meeting resumed at 3:10 pm.)

8. The Select Committee continued its consideration and endorsement of the first draft report paragraph by paragraph.

9. After discussion, to allow time for members to consider whether to propose amendments to the first draft report and if so, to prepare their proposed amendments, the Chairman suggested and members agreed that the Select Committee should hold another closed meeting on Wednesday, 24 June 2020 from 9:00 am to 11:00 am to continue the discussion on the unfinished items on the agenda. Members also agreed that if individual members wished to propose amendments to the first draft report, their proposed amendments should be provided to the Secretariat by close of play on Monday, 22 June 2020.

10. At members' request, the Chairman instructed the Clerk to send the electronic copy of the Chinese version of the first draft report to members to facilitate their preparation of proposed amendments, if any. Members were reminded to observe the confidentiality requirement when making use of the electronic file(s) in preparing their respective proposed amendments.

11. The meeting ended at 4:16 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 July 2020

Ref : CB2/SC/16

**Select Committee to Inquire into Matters about the Agreement
between Mr LEUNG Chun-ying and the Australian firm UGL Limited**

**Minutes of the closed meeting
held on Wednesday, 24 June 2020, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 4 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan, JP

Member absent : Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

Clerk in attendance : Miss Josephine SO
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

Staff in attendance : Miss Flora TAI
Assistant Secretary General 2

Mr Timothy TSO
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Miss Joyce CHAN
Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Mr Clement HAU
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Michelle TANG
Council Secretary (2) 6

Miss Cally LAI
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

I. Consideration and endorsement of the report of the Select Committee paragraph by paragraph
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1166/19-20(01) and CB(2)1248/19-20(01))

Members continued to consider paragraph by paragraph the Chinese version of the report of the Select Committee adopted at the closed meeting on 11 June 2020 as the Chairman's report (LC Paper No. CB(2)1166/19-20(01)) ("the report"). The Chairman reminded members that the content of and the Select Committee's upcoming discussion on the report should be kept confidential.

2. The Chairman said that after the last closed meeting on 18 June 2020 at which members agreed to defer the discussion on the report pending members' submission of proposed amendments, he had received proposed amendments from Ms YUNG Hoi-yan (issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1248/19-20(01) on 23 June 2020).

3. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and Mr Kenneth LEUNG said that both of them as well as Mr Alvin YEUNG and Mr Andrew WAN did not agree with the amendments proposed by Ms YUNG Hoi-yan. They would not participate in the ensuing discussion. Mr LAM and Mr LEUNG further said that they, together with Mr YEUNG and Mr WAN, were considering presenting a minority report to the Council.

(At this juncture, Mr Kenneth LEUNG, Mr Alvin YEUNG, Mr Andrew WAN and Mr LAM Cheuk-ting withdrew from the meeting.)

4. Members noted that Ms YUNG Hoi-yan had proposed amendments to paragraphs 2.1, 2.3, 2.6 and 2.7 of the report. As the Preamble, paragraphs 2.1 to 2.4 and paragraphs 2.6 and 2.7 had already been read and endorsed at the closed meeting on 11 June 2020, members agreed that Ms YUNG's proposed amendments to paragraphs 2.1, 2.3, 2.6 and 2.7 would not be dealt with. Members continued to consider the remaining paragraphs by reference to the original paragraph numbers/headings/subheadings as printed in the report (LC Paper No. CB(2)1166/19-20(01)).

Part I - Chapter 1

5. Heading and subheading immediately preceding paragraph 1.1 read and deleted.
6. Paragraphs 1.1 and 1.2 read and deleted.
7. Paragraph 1.3 (updated paragraph number as 1.1) read, amended and agreed to.
8. Paragraph 1.4 (updated paragraph number as 1.2) read and agreed to.

Part I - Chapter 2

9. The Chairman reminded members that at the closed meeting on 11 June 2020, the content of paragraph 2.5 was agreed to, subject to a minor amendment to be made to the last line of the footnote under this paragraph. He invited members to note Ms YUNG Hoi-yan's proposed amendments to the footnote. After discussion, the Chairman proposed and members agreed to amend the last line of the footnote under paragraph 2.5 (updated as footnote 3) by adding "所載列的目標時序" before "行事。".
10. Paragraph 2.5 read, amended and agreed to.
11. Heading after paragraph 2.5 read, amended and agreed to.
12. Subheading immediately preceding paragraph 2.8 read and deleted.
13. Paragraph 2.8 read, amended and agreed to.
14. Paragraph 2.9 read and deleted.
15. Paragraph 2.10 (updated paragraph number as 2.9) read, amended and agreed to.
16. Paragraphs 2.11 and 2.12 read and deleted.
17. Heading and subheading immediately preceding paragraph 2.13 (updated paragraph number as 2.10) read and deleted.

18. Paragraphs 2.13 and 2.14 (updated paragraph numbers as 2.10 and 2.11) read, amended and agreed to.
19. Paragraph 2.15 (updated paragraph number as 2.12) read and agreed to.
20. Paragraph 2.16 (updated paragraph number as 2.13) read, amended and agreed to.
21. Paragraph 2.17 read and deleted.
22. Paragraphs 2.18 and 2.19 (updated paragraph numbers as 2.14 and 2.15) read, amended and agreed to.
23. Paragraph 2.20 (updated paragraph number as 2.16) read, amended and agreed to.
24. Paragraph 2.21 read and deleted.
25. Paragraph 2.22 (updated paragraph number as 2.17) read, amended and agreed to.
26. Paragraph 2.23 (updated paragraph number as 2.18) read and agreed to.
27. Members agreed to amend paragraphs 2.24 and 2.25, and to merge the two paragraphs into one (updated paragraph number as 2.19). The updated paragraph 2.19 read and agreed to.
28. Paragraph 2.26 read and deleted.
29. Members agreed to delete paragraph 2.28, and to amend and merge paragraphs 2.27 and 2.29 into one (updated paragraph number as 2.20). The updated paragraph 2.20 read and agreed to.
30. Members agreed to amend paragraphs 2.30 and 2.31, and to merge the two paragraphs into one (updated paragraph number as 2.21). The updated paragraph 2.21 read and agreed to.

Part II - Chapter 3

31. Paragraphs 3.1 and 3.2 read, amended and agreed to.
32. Paragraphs 3.3 and 3.4 read and agreed to.

33. Paragraph 3.5 read, amended and agreed to.
34. Paragraph 3.6 read and agreed to.
35. Paragraphs 3.7 and 3.8 read, amended and agreed to.
36. Paragraph 3.9 read and deleted.
37. Paragraph 3.10 (updated paragraph number as 3.9) read, amended and agreed to.
38. Paragraphs 3.11 and 3.12 (updated paragraph numbers as 3.10 and 3.11) read, amended and agreed to.
39. Paragraphs 3.13 and 3.14 (updated paragraph numbers as 3.12 and 3.13) read and agreed to.

Table of contents

40. Table of contents read, amended and agreed to.

Abbreviations, appendices and lists of documents

41. Members noted that the amended paragraphs, as endorsed, would entail consequential changes to the list of abbreviations, appendices and lists of documents. Members agreed that subject to the Chairman's concurrence and where necessary, the Secretariat could make corresponding amendments to these three sections.

Other textual/editorial amendments

42. Members agreed that the Chairman and the Secretariat be authorized to make textual and editorial amendments to the Chinese version of the report, if necessary.

43. The Chairman advised that the Select Committee had completed consideration and endorsement of the Chinese version of the report paragraph by paragraph. The question that the Chinese version of the report, as amended, be adopted as the Select Committee's report for presentation to the Council was proposed, put and agreed to.

44. Members noted and agreed that all minutes of proceedings on consideration and endorsement of the report would be circulated to members for confirmation and appended to the Select Committee's report after it had been finalized.

X X X X X X X X

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 July 2020

Ref : CB2/SC/16

**Select Committee to Inquire into Matters about the Agreement
between Mr LEUNG Chun-ying and the Australian firm UGL Limited**

**Minutes of the closed meeting
held on Tuesday, 30 June 2020, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 5 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan, JP
- Members absent** : Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
- Clerk in attendance** : Miss Josephine SO
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2
- Staff in attendance** : Miss Flora TAI
Assistant Secretary General 2
- Mr Timothy TSO
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1
- Miss Joyce CHAN
Assistant Legal Adviser 1
- Mr Clement HAU
Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Michelle TANG
Council Secretary (2) 6

Miss Cally LAI
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

I. Consideration and endorsement of the English version of the report of the Select Committee paragraph by paragraph (LC Paper No. CB(2)1272/19-20(01))

The Chairman said that at the closed meeting on 24 June 2020, members had completed consideration and endorsement of the Chinese version of the report of the Select Committee ("the report") paragraph by paragraph.

2. The Chinese version of the endorsed report (LC Paper No. CB(2)1272/19-20(01)), as finalized after some textual and editorial amendments and issued to members on 26 June 2020, was confirmed.

3. The Chairman invited members to consider and endorse paragraph by paragraph the English version of the report which was prepared based on the Chinese version.

4. In accordance with Rule 79(7)(a) of the Rules of Procedure, the Chairman put to members the question that the English version of the report (LC Paper No. CB(2)1272/19-20(01)) be adopted as the Chairman's report and accepted as a basis for discussion. The question was agreed to.

5. The Chairman then proposed that the Chairman's report be read a second time paragraph by paragraph. As the question was also agreed to, the Chairman led members through the English version of the report.

Preamble

6. Preamble read and agreed to.

Part I - Chapter 1

7. Paragraphs 1.1 and 1.2 read and agreed to.

Part I - Chapter 2

8. Paragraph 2.1 read and agreed to.

9. Paragraph 2.2 read and agreed to.
10. Paragraphs 2.3 and 2.4 read and agreed to.
11. Paragraph 2.5 read and agreed to.
12. Paragraphs 2.6 to 2.12 read and agreed to.
13. Paragraph 2.13 read and agreed to.
14. Paragraphs 2.14 and 2.15 read and agreed to.
15. Paragraphs 2.16 to 2.19 read and agreed to.
16. Paragraph 2.20 read and agreed to.
17. Paragraph 2.21 read and agreed to.

Part II - Chapter 3

18. Paragraphs 3.1 to 3.5 read and agreed to.
19. Paragraphs 3.6 to 3.9 read and agreed to.
20. Paragraphs 3.10 and 3.11 read and agreed to.
21. Paragraphs 3.12 and 3.13 read and agreed to.

Table of contents

22. Table of contents read and agreed to.

Abbreviations

23. The list of abbreviations read and agreed to.

Appendices

24. Appendices 1 to 18 to the report read and agreed to.

Lists of documents

25. The lists of documents read and agreed to.

26. As the English version of the report was endorsed without any amendments, it was confirmed as the finalized English version of the endorsed report.

27. The Chairman concluded that the Select Committee had completed consideration and endorsement of the English version of the report paragraph by paragraph. The question that the English version of the report be adopted as the Select Committee's report for presentation to the Council was proposed, put and agreed to.

28. Members noted that the minutes of proceedings on consideration and endorsement of the English version of the report would be circulated to members for confirmation and appended to the Select Committee's report accordingly.

X X X X X X X X

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 July 2020