

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC17/17-18
(These minutes have been
cleared with the Chairman)

Ref : CB1/F/2/1(1)B

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 1st meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Wednesday, 11 October 2017, at 10:00 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP (Chairman)
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP

Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

Member attending:

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Member absent:

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Doris LO Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
Miss Rita YUNG	Senior Council Secretary (1)2
Mr Raymond CHOW	Senior Council Secretary (1)6
Ms Mandy LI	Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Alice CHEUNG	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Christina SHIU	Legislative Assistant (1)2
Ms Sharon CHAN	Legislative Assistant (1)4
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6
Ms Christy YAU	Legislative Assistant (1)7
Ms Clara LO	Legislative Assistant (1)8
Ms Haley CHEUNG	Legislative Assistant (1)9

Action

Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, the Chairman in office, presided over the election of the Chairman of the Public Works Subcommittee ("the Subcommittee") for the 2017-2018 session.

2. Mr CHU Hoi-dick referred to the joint proposal to amend the procedural rules of the Finance Committee ("FC") and its two Subcommittees (i.e. the Public Works Subcommittee and the Establishment Subcommittee) put forward by Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok and a number of FC members after the deadline for signifying Subcommittee membership. Mr CHU said that he was particularly concerned about one of the amendments which proposed that in future, any item already supported by the two Subcommittees should not be subject to further discussion and separate voting at the FC meetings unless agreed to by the Subcommittee concerned. In this connection, Mr CHU requested Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok to give members an explanation before standing for the election of the Chairman of the Subcommittee. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok said that discussion of the proposed amendments was not on the agenda for the meeting.

3. Mr Jeffrey LAM pointed out that nomination was a prerequisite for a member to become a candidate for the chairmanship. Since the nomination process had not yet started, there were still no candidate for the chairmanship

among members of the Subcommittee. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen asked whether Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok was willing to respond to members' questions on the proposed amendments should he be nominated for the chairmanship. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok said that if members wished to put forward questions to the candidates before voting, the Subcommittee might make reference to the arrangements for holding election forums in the elections of the House Committee and FC Chairmen and Deputy Chairmen last week.

Election of Chairman

4. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok invited nominations for the chairmanship of the Subcommittee.

5. Mr CHU Hoi-dick was nominated by Dr KWOK Ka-ki and the nomination was seconded by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen. Mr CHU Hoi-dick accepted the nomination.

6. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok was nominated by Mr Kenneth LAU and the nomination was seconded by Mr CHAN Hak-kan. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok accepted the nomination.

7. As Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok was nominated for the chairmanship, Mr Charles Peter MOK, the Deputy Chairman in office, presided over the election of the Chairman of the Subcommittee. Mr MOK asked if there were other nominations. There was no other nomination.

8. Since members requested to put questions to the candidates, Mr Charles Peter MOK consulted members on the relevant arrangements and directed that: given the time constraints, any member who wished to ask questions might do so in a brief and precise manner within a time limit of 30 seconds, followed by replies from the two candidates one by one for no more than 30 seconds each, making a total of one minute and 30 seconds for asking and answering one question. The whole question and answer session should be concluded in 20 minutes.

9. In response to the enquiries of Miss Alice MAK, Mr Charles Peter MOK said that if necessary, he would decide, in consultation with members, whether the meeting should be extended so as to complete the election process. Mr MOK then invited members to raise questions.

10. Mr Jeffrey LAM, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr WONG Ting-kwong, Ms Starry LEE, Dr Fernando CHEUNG,

Ms Claudia MO, Mr Alvin YEUNG, Mr Michael TIEN and Mr Andrew WAN took turns to put forward questions to Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, the two candidates for the chairmanship. Contents of the questions were summarized as follows:

- (a) how the candidates, if elected as the Chairman, would deal with controversial items submitted by the Administration or requests for additional funding for cost overrun items;
- (b) the candidates' views on how the Chairman should address the issue of meeting progress being slowed down by members asking repeated questions;
- (c) as Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, one of the candidates, had commented that the Subcommittee took too much time to consider an item, Ir Dr LO's view on the appropriate average length of time for the Subcommittee to consider each item;
- (d) the candidates' views on whether it was unnecessary to proceed forthwith a motion to adjourn further proceedings of the Subcommittee if a motion to adjourn discussion on the agenda item under consideration had already been moved;
- (e) the number of motions moved by Mr CHU Hoi-dick, one of the candidates, during the 2016-2017 session to adjourn further proceedings of the Subcommittee or discussion on an agenda item; Mr CHU's view on whether it was appropriate to move those motions such that members could not ask further questions on the works projects; and
- (f) given that the aforesaid joint proposal submitted by Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, one of the candidates, and a number of FC members to amend the procedural rules, if implemented, would diminish the power of those Members who were non-Subcommittee members to discuss and vote on an item when it was considered by FC, why Ir Dr LO disclosed his involvement in the joint proposal only after the deadline for signifying Subcommittee membership.

11. Mr CHU Hoi-dick's response to the above questions was summarized as follows:

- (a) the Chairman of the Subcommittee should request the Administration to provide detailed information (including the

full texts of the reports concerned) on the project items when the funding proposals of the items were submitted to the Subcommittee for consideration, and respond to members' questions seriously to expedite the progress of scrutiny;

- (b) the motions he had moved to adjourn further proceedings of the Subcommittee or discussion on an agenda item were to allow members to state their stances on the proposed project items, in addition to putting questions to the Administration. Moreover, should the motions be carried, the Administration would have time to review the project details and address members' requests;
- (c) he disagreed with Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok's comments that the Subcommittee took too much time to consider an item, and opined that members should carefully consider the funding proposals submitted by the Administration instead of completing its scrutiny work on a target basis; and
- (d) he considered that the proposed amendments to the procedural rules would in effect diminish FC's power to examine project funding. As some Members might reconsider joining the Subcommittee for that reason, he opined that Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok, if elected as the Chairman, should accept such applications for late membership of the Subcommittee.

12. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok's response to the above questions was summarized as follows:

- (a) the Chairman of the Subcommittee must ensure the orderly, fair and proper conduct of the meetings of the Subcommittee. The Chairman should caution members if they asked repeated questions;
- (b) regarding applications for additional funding for cost overrun projects, members should perform their monitoring role. Members who were non-Subcommittee members might also attend meetings of the Subcommittee and speak on projects of their concern;
- (c) in the 2016-2017 session, the Subcommittee took more than 73 hours to endorse only about 20 items. The average length of time spent on considering an item was longer than before, while the actual meeting time was also far much longer than that set out under the meeting schedule. As the Administration

submitted more than 40 project items each year for the Subcommittee's consideration, members should waste no time in completing the scrutiny work;

- (d) the Subcommittee meeting could not proceed further if a motion to adjourn further proceedings was carried. Not only would it affect the progress of scrutiny, but would also let the public down. He recalled an occasion where the Subcommittee held an additional eight-hour meeting on Saturday during which a few hours of the scheduled meeting time was wasted after a motion to adjourn further proceedings of the Subcommittee was carried; and
- (e) the proposed amendments he put forward was to allow the Subcommittee to consider the funding proposals for project items more effectively.

13. Mr Charles Peter MOK announced a vote by secret ballot. After all the present members had cast their votes, Mr Charles Peter MOK invited Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr Kenneth LAU, who had nominated the two candidates, to monitor the counting of votes. Of the members present, 16 voted for Mr CHU Hoi-dick and 32 voted for Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok. Mr MOK declared that Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok was elected Chairman of the Subcommittee for the 2017-2018 session. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok took over the chair in his capacity as the Chairman.

[At 10:25 am, Mr Charles Peter MOK announced that the meeting would be extended until the election of Chairman/Deputy Chairman was completed.]

14. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting suggested that in future, the ballot papers should be mixed thoroughly before counting so as to ensure the confidentiality of members' votes. The Chairman asked the Clerk to take note of Mr LAM's comment.

Election of Deputy Chairman

15. The Chairman invited nominations for the deputy chairmanship of the Subcommittee.

16. Mr Charles Peter MOK was nominated by Ms Tanya CHAN and the nomination was seconded by Mr Andrew WAN. Mr Charles Peter MOK accepted the nomination. There being no other nomination, the Chairman

declared that Mr Charles Peter MOK was elected Deputy Chairman of the Subcommittee for the 2017-2018 session.

Schedule of meetings for the 2017-2018 session

17. The Chairman said that the next meeting would be held on 18 October 2017. The schedule of meetings of the Subcommittee for the 2017-2018 session would be issued to members once being worked out with the Clerk.

(Post-meeting note: The schedule of meetings of the Subcommittee for the 2017-2018 session was circulated to members vide PWSC4/17-18 on 12 October 2017.)

18. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:39 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 October 2017