

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC304/17-18
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/1(34)B

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 35th meeting
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Wednesday, 11 July 2018, at 8:30 am**

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP (Chairman)

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon Claudia MO

Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS

Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP

Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon AU Nok-hin
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Public officers attending:

Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ³
Miss Joey LAM Kam-ping, JP	Deputy Secretary for Development (Works) ¹
Ms Bernadette LINN, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)

Mr Donald TONG Chi-keung, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment
Ms Margaret HSIA Mai-chi	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Mr LAU Kong-wah, JP	Secretary for Home Affairs
Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP	Deputy Director of Home Affairs (1)
Mr Steve TSE Ling-chun, JP	District Officer (Kwun Tong) Home Affairs Department
Mr Rick CHAN Tin-chu, JP	District Officer (Wan Chai) Home Affairs Department
Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong	Chief Engineer (Works) Home Affairs Department
Mrs Alice CHING WOO Wai-ling	Chief Project Manager 303 Architectural Services Department
Mr Chris LIU Chi-ho	Chief Project Manager 302 Architectural Services Department
Ms LAI Mei-ling	Chief Leisure Manager (Kowloon) Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr LUK Chi-kwong	Chief Leisure Manager (Hong Kong East) Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Attendance by invitation:

Dr Bunny CHAN Chung-bun, GBS, JP	Chairman Kwun Tong District Council
Mr Stephen NG Kam-chun, BBS, MH, JP	Chairman Wan Chai District Council

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Doris LO

Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance:

Mr Raymond CHOW

Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Keith WONG

Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU

Legislative Assistant (1)2

Ms Christy YAU

Legislative Assistant (1)7

Ms Clara LO

Legislative Assistant (1)8

Action

The Chairman advised that there was one funding proposal on the agenda for the meeting, which was an item carried over from the previous meeting. He reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP") of the Legislative Council, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the funding proposals under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the proposals. He also drew members' attention to Rule 84 of RoP on voting in case of direct pecuniary interest.

Head 707 – New Towns and Urban Area Development

PWSC(2018-19)28 458RO Signature Project Scheme (Kwun Tong District) – Construction of Music Fountains at Kwun Tong Promenade
68RE Signature Project Scheme (Wan Chai District) – Construction of Moreton Terrace Activities Centre

2. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)28, sought to upgrade 458RO and 68RE to Category A, with the former at an estimated cost of \$49.7 million in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices for the construction of music fountains at Kwun Tong ("KT") Promenade ("the Promenade Project") as one of the two projects under the Signature Project Scheme ("SPS") in KT District, and the latter at an estimated cost of \$133.1 million in MOD prices for the construction of the Moreton Terrace Activities Centre ("MTAC") as the SPS project in Wan Chai District. The Subcommittee had commenced the deliberation on the proposal at the meeting on 4 July 2018.

Motion to adjourn the discussion on PWSC(2018-19)28

3. The Chairman said that at the meeting on 4 July 2018, Mr Gary FAN had moved a motion to adjourn the discussion on the item pursuant to paragraph 33 of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") Procedure and some members had spoken on the motion. He said that the Subcommittee would continue to deal with Mr FAN's motion.

4. Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr WU Chi-wai, Ms Claudia MO, Ms Tanya CHAN, Dr CHENG Chung-tai and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen spoke in support of the motion proposed by Mr Gary FAN.

5. Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr WU Chi-wai opined that after the funding proposal for the two controversial SPS projects, i.e. the construction of music fountains at KT Promenade and the construction of MTAC, had been voted down by the Subcommittee, the relevant District Councils ("DCs") should re-examine how to spend the funding on other SPS projects that better served public interest and consult the public accordingly.

6. Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Ms Claudia MO, Mr HUI Chi-fung and Mr CHU Hoi-dick were dissatisfied that after the funding proposal for the two SPS projects had been voted down by the Subcommittee, the Administration only made minor revisions to their designs and submitted the new funding proposal to the Subcommittee for consideration. Mr KWONG and Ms Tanya CHAN also criticized the Administration for submitting the revised funding proposal to the Subcommittee for consideration after revising the project designs without the relevant DCs discussing the revised designs beforehand.

7. Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Dr CHENG Chung-tai said that by making just minor revisions to the design and operational arrangements of the Promenade Project, the Administration could not address the concerns and opposing views raised by members on the project. Dr CHEUNG urged the Administration and Kwun Tong DC ("KTDC") to consider further enlarging the wet play area of the music fountains, so as to provide the public with more space for activities.

8. Dr KWOK Ka-ki opined that given the higher proportion of elderly and poor people in KT District, KTDC should accord priority to using the funding to strengthen the support for those people instead of developing "white elephant" projects such as the Promenade Project. Dr KWOK suggested that KTDC should follow the practice of Kwai Tsing District by initiating SPS projects to strengthen community health services. Mr WU Chi-wai, Mr Claudia MO, Mr KWONG Chun-yu,

Dr Fernando CHEUNG and Dr CHENG Chung-tai shared the view that KTDC should use the resources to strengthen community services.

9. Mr CHU Hoi-dick queried why the Administration had only cited the findings of the opinion survey conducted by some KTDC members on the music fountains at KT Promenade without mentioning the findings of the survey conducted by Kwun Tong District Office on the project in 2015. He considered that that the public opinion on the project was unclear.

10. Ms Tanya CHAN, Mr HUI Chi-fung, Mr KWONG Chun-yu and Mr CHU Hoi-dick raised a number of concerns about the MTAC Project, including its unduly high project cost, the overly small size of MTAC, the suitability of the selected location, and whether the design of the stage and the backstage of MTAC met the practical needs of users. Ms CHAN, Mr HUI and Mr KWONG shared the concern that while the existing volleyball courts at the Moreton Terrace Temporary Playground would be demolished to make way for the construction of MTAC, the new volleyball court was proposed to be provided at a remote location (i.e. Ka Ning Path Garden), and the Administration had not consulted Wan Chai DC ("WCDC ") on the new location.

11. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen was dissatisfied that the Chairman had declared the end of the "question and answer session" at the meeting on 4 July 2018 without allowing sufficient time for members to discuss the revised funding proposal for the two SPS projects.

12. When speaking on the motion, Mr Gary FAN said that he considered both the Promenade Project and the MTAC Project controversial "white elephant" projects. As such, he urged KTDC and WCDC to initiate uncontroversial SPS projects as other DCs did, so that the projects could commence early. Mr FAN also said that by making minor revisions to the designs of the two SPS projects after the Subcommittee had voted down their funding proposal, and submitting the revised proposal to the Subcommittee for consideration, the Administration was disrespectful to the decision of the Subcommittee. For that reason, he proposed the motion to adjourn the discussion on PWSC(2018-19)28.

13. The Chairman pointed out that the Subcommittee had spent a total of three hours and 50 minutes on discussing the original funding proposal for the two SPS projects at the meetings on 28 May, 30 May and 11 June 2018 and during the discussion, 27 members had spoken for a total of 55 times. After the funding proposal had been voted down, the Administration made amendments to the projects and submitted the new discussion paper , i.e. PWSC(2018-19)28, to the Subcommittee. The submission of the new

discussion paper by the Administration complied with the requirement under paragraph 25 of the PWSC Procedure, which stipulated that if the Subcommittee did not approve a proposal, it would then be for the Financial Secretary to consider whether to make a fresh proposal amended in such a way as might make it acceptable to the Subcommittee. At the meeting on 4 July 2018, the Subcommittee spent more than two hours on discussing the revised funding proposal and during the discussion, 17 members had spoken for a total of 29 times. Moreover, several members had spoken on the motion to adjourn the discussion on PWSC(2018-19)28. To sum up, the Subcommittee had spent quite a long time on discussing the two SPS projects.

14. The Chairman put to vote the question that the discussion on PWSC(2018-19)28 be adjourned. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. Fourteen members voted for, 22 members voted against the motion and no one abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Ms Claudia MO	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Fernando CHEUNG	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr HUI Chi-fung	Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	Mr Jeremy TAM
Mr Gary FAN	Mr AU Nok-hin

(14 members)

Against:

Mr Tommy CHEUNG	Ms Starry LEE
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Dr Priscilla LEUNG
Mr Paul TSE	Mr Michael TIEN
Mr Frankie YICK	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr MA Fung-kwok	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Ms Alice MAK
Mr Christopher CHEUNG	Dr Junius HO
Mr HO Kai-ming	Mr Holden CHOW
Mr Wilson OR	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan
Mr LUK Chung-hung	Mr LAU Kwok-fan
Mr Vincent CHENG	Mr Tony TSE

(22 members)

Abstained:

(0 member)

15. The Chairman declared that the motion was negatived. The Subcommittee resumed discussion on PWSC(2018-19)28.

Motions proposed under paragraph 32A of the Public Works Subcommittee Procedure

16. The Chairman advised that he had declared the end of the "question and answer session" at the last meeting on 4 July 2018. The Subcommittee would hence proceed forthwith to deal with the motions proposed by members under paragraph 32A of the PWSC Procedure ("Rule 32A motions").

17. At 9:10 am, the Chairman said that he had received a total of eight Rule 32A motions proposed by members. Among them, motion numbered 1 was proposed by Mr AU Nok-hin, motion numbered 2 by Dr KWOK Ka-ki, motion numbered 3 by Mr CHU Hoi-dick, motion numbered 4 by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, motion numbered 5 by Mr Gary FAN, motion numbered 6 by Ms Tanya CHAN, motion numbered 7 by Mr Jeremy TAM, and motion numbered 8 by Dr Fernando CHEUNG. The Chairman considered that all of the eight proposed motions were directly related to the agenda item.

Proposed motion numbered 1

18. The Chairman put to vote the question that the proposed motion numbered 1 (Chinese version only) be proceeded forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. With the concurrence of the Chairman, Mr AU Nok-hin who proposed the motion numbered 1, read out his motion during the ringing of the division bell. The question was negatived.

19. When reading out his proposed motion, Mr AU Nok-hin enquired why the written questions raised by him on 6 July 2018 in respect of PWSC(2018-19)28 and the Administration's written reply dated 9 July 2018 had not been circulated to members. The Chairman directed the Clerk to follow up Mr AU's enquiry after the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The written questions raised by Mr AU Nok-hin on PWSC(2018-19)28 ([LC Paper No. PWSC291/17-18\(01\)](#)) (Chinese version only) and the Administration's written reply ([LC Paper No. PWSC291/17-18\(02\)](#)) were circulated to members after the meeting on the same day (i.e. 11 July 2018).)

Motion proposed under paragraph 40A of the Public Works Subcommittee Procedure

20. Mr CHAN Hak-kan moved a motion that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under this agenda item, the Subcommittee should proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. Twenty-one members voted for, 15 members voted against the motion and no one abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Tommy CHEUNG	Ms Starry LEE
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Dr Priscilla LEUNG
Mr Paul TSE	Mr Michael TIEN
Mr Frankie YICK	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr MA Fung-kwok	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Ms Alice MAK
Dr Junius HO	Mr HO Kai-ming
Mr Holden CHOW	Mr Wilson OR
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr LAU Kwok-fan	Mr Vincent CHENG
Mr Tony TSE	
(21 members)	

Against:

Ms Claudia MO	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Mr Christopher CHEUNG	Dr Fernando CHEUNG
Mr Alvin YEUNG	Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Ms Tanya CHAN	Mr HUI Chi-fung
Dr CHENG Chung-tai	Mr KWONG Chun-yu
Mr Jeremy TAM	Mr Gary FAN
Mr AU Nok-hin	
(15 members)	

Abstained:

(0 member)

21. The Chairman declared that the motion proposed by Mr CHAN Hak-kan was carried.

Proposed motions numbered 2 to 8

22. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the proposed motions numbered [2](#), [3](#), [4](#), [5](#), [6](#), [7](#) and [8](#) (Chinese version only) be proceeded forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute before members voted on individual questions. With the concurrence of the Chairman, members who proposed the motions read out their respective motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the aforesaid seven questions were negatived.

23. When reading out his proposed motion (i.e. the motion numbered 5), Mr Gary FAN added some wordings that were not found in his motion. The Chairman directed that members should consider whether the motion proposed by Mr FAN should be proceeded forthwith based only on the wording of the motion proposed.

Voting on PWSC(2018-19)28

24. The Chairman then put PWSC(2018-19)28 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. Twenty-two members voted for, 16 members voted against the proposal and no one abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Tommy CHEUNG
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr Paul TSE
Mr Frankie YICK
Mr MA Fung-kiok
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG
Mr HO Kai-ming
Mr Wilson OR
Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr Vincent CHENG
(22 members)

Ms Starry LEE
Dr Priscilla LEUNG
Mr Michael TIEN
Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr CHAN Han-pan
Ms Alice MAK
Dr Junius HO
Mr Holden CHOW
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan
Mr LAU Kwok-fan
Mr Tony TSE

Against:

Ms Claudia MO
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Fernando CHEUNG
Mr Andrew WAN
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Mr HUI Chi-fung

Mr WU Chi-wai
Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Ms Tanya CHAN
Dr CHENG Chung-tai

Mr KWONG Chun-yu
Mr Gary FAN
(16 members)

Mr Jeremy TAM
Mr AU Nok-hin

Abstained:
(0 member)

25. The Chairman declared that the item was endorsed by the Subcommittee. Mr Gary FAN requested that the item, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)28, be voted on separately at the relevant meeting of the Finance Committee.

26. The meeting ended at 9:37 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
7 August 2018