

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)997/17-18
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/DEV

Panel on Development

Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 27 February 2018, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP (Deputy
Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming

Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

Member attending : Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS

Member absent : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Public officers attending : **Agenda item IV**

Mr Victor CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Works)2

Mr Stephen KWOK
Assistant Secretary for Development (Infrastructure
Coordination) 1

Mr Michael FONG
Deputy Project Manager (West)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Desmond LAM
Chief Engineer/West 2
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Agenda item V

Mr Michael WONG Wai-lun, JP
Secretary for Development

Miss Joey LAM Kam-ping, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)1

Ms Deborah KUH Wen-gee
Head of Greening, Landscape and Tree Management
Section
Development Bureau

Miss Janet WONG Chin-kiu
Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Works)
(Special Duty)

Mr CHUI Wing-wah
Deputy Director of Highways

Mr Terence LAM Tat-ming
Assistant Director (Technical)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Simon LIU Wai-shing
Assistant Director (Leisure Services)³
Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr Joel NG Chung-lai
Principal Land Executive/Land & Vegetation Contract
Management
Lands Department

Mr Patrick LAI Chuen-chi
Assistant Director (Country & Marine Parks)
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department

Agenda item VI

Miss Joey LAM Kam-ping, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)¹

Ms Deborah KUH Wen-gee
Head of Greening, Landscape and Tree Management
Section
Development Bureau

Ms Vina WONG
Head of Greening and Landscape Office
Development Bureau

Mr Terence LAM Tat-ming
Assistant Director (Technical)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr CHUI Wing-wah
Deputy Director of Highways

Agenda item VII

Mr LIU Chun-san, JP
Under Secretary for Development

Ms Doris HO Pui-ling, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and
Lands)1

Mr Ivan CHUNG Man-kit
Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Planning
and Lands)5

Ms Amy CHEUNG Yi-mei
Deputy Director of Planning/Territorial (Acting)

Mr YAU Ka-tai
Chief Engineer/Cross-boundary Infrastructure and
Development
Planning Department

Mr Ambrose CHEONG Siu-yau, JP
Project Manager (West)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr LAU Wing-kam
Chief Engineer/West 1
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Doris LO
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Rita YUNG
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Mandy LI
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

I Confirmation of minutes

(LC Paper No. CB(1)585/17-18 — Minutes of meeting on 28 November 2017)

The minutes of the meeting on 28 November 2017 were confirmed.

II Information papers issued since the last meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)544/17-18(01) — Administration's response to the letter dated 8 January 2018 from Hon Tanya CHAN on Small House Policy and rural planning strategy [LC Paper No. CB(1)456/17-18(01)])

LC Paper No. CB(1)545/17-18(01) — Letter dated 29 January 2018 from Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki on implementation arrangements for the Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area Project)

2. Members noted that the above information papers had been issued since the last meeting on 23 January 2018.

III Items for discussion at the next meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(01) — List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(02) — List of follow-up actions)

3. Members agreed that the next regular meeting would be scheduled for Tuesday, 27 March 2018, from 2:30 pm to 5:30 pm to discuss the following items proposed by the Administration:

- (a) PWP Item No. 201WC — Relocation of Diamond Hill Fresh Water and Salt Water Service Reservoirs to Caverns;
- (b) PWP Item No. 399DS — Relocation of Sha Tin Sewage Treatment Works to caverns;
- (c) PWP Item No. 172CD — Rehabilitation of Underground Stormwater Drains; and
- (d) Amendment of levy threshold under Construction Industry Council Ordinance (Cap. 587), Construction Workers Registration Ordinance (Cap. 583) ("CWRO") and Pneumoconiosis and Mesothelioma (Compensation) Ordinance (Cap. 360), and cessation of provisional registration under CWRO.

IV PWP Item No. 268RS — Cycle track between Tsuen Wan and Tuen Mun — advance works

(LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(03) — Administration's paper on PWP Item No. 268RS (Part) — Cycle track between Tsuen Wan and Tuen Mun — Advance Works)

4. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the item under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the item.

5. At the invitation of the Chairman, Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Works)2 ("PAS/DEV(W)2") briefed members that the Administration had been making efforts in implementing the cycle track network in the New Territories. The cycle track between Tsuen Wan and Tuen Mun ("TW—TM cycle track") under PWP Item No. 268RS would form part of the network. In view of the considerable length of the TW—TM cycle track, the Administration would implement its construction in phases with higher priority accorded to those sections supported by the local community for early public enjoyment. The current proposal was to upgrade part of PWP Item No. 268RS for taking

Action

forward the proposed Advance Works to provide a section of cycle track from Tsing Tsuen Bridge to Bayview Garden in Tsuen Wan ("the proposed new cycle track").

6. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, Chief Engineer/West 2, Civil Engineering and Development Department then briefed members on the details of the proposed Advance Works, as well as the overall progress of the cycle track network in the New Territories.

(Post-meeting note: A soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)638/17-18(01) by email on 28 February 2018.)

Design and facilities

7. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting welcomed the Administration's efforts in linking up cycle tracks to improve connectivity. He called on the Administration to improve the design and safety facilities of existing and new cycle tracks, in particular at sections of steep ramps and sharp bends.

8. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed support for the proposed Advance Works, whilst suggesting that the Administration should minimize the number of mandatory dismount sections when designing the proposed new cycle track. Citing the cycle track in Tin Shui Wai as an example, Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that there were too many mandatory dismount sections, hence causing great inconvenience for cyclists having to dismount frequently.

9. In response, Deputy Project Manager (West), Civil Engineering and Development Department ("DPM(W)/CEDD"), advised that the Transport Department had commissioned a consultancy study on the cycling networks in Hong Kong, and carried out improvement works at existing cycle tracks to ensure the safety of cyclists and pedestrians. The Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD"), when designing new cycle tracks, had taken into account the recommendations of the consultancy study and provided safety facilities, where applicable and appropriate. He further said that cyclists would not be required to dismount their bicycles along the proposed new cycle track, except that they would be required to slow down at pedestrian crossings.

10. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung said that members belonging to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong

supported the proposed Advance Works. He asked whether the width (i.e. about 4 metres ("m")) of the proposed new cycle track was a standard width for cycle tracks, and whether there would be railings erected and hence blocking the sea views. DPM(W)/CEDD responded that 4 m was a standard width for cycle tracks. He advised that railings would only be installed at certain locations along the proposed new cycle track, and would not block the sea views.

11. Mr Frankie YICK said that members belonging to the Liberal Party supported the proposed Advance Works. He suggested installing more warning signs and setting up a designated area for children to practise cycling safely. PAS/DEV(W)2 responded that relevant traffic signs would be erected along the proposed new cycle track and a practising yard would be provided at the entry/exit hub.

12. Mr HO Kai-ming said that members belonging to The Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions supported the proposed Advance Works. Given that the proposed new section would pass through Tsuen Wan Riviera Park managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD"), Ms Alice MAK and Mr Andrew WAN expressed concern about whether cycling activities would affect other users of the park.

13. In response, DPM(W)/CEDD said that as the proposed new cycle track was only 4 m in width, it would not take up much space in the park and there would be sufficient space for other types of activities. On the further enquiry of Mr HO Kai-ming about LCSD's relevant regulations regarding cycling in the park area and on the designated cycle track within the park, DPM(W)/CEDD undertook to provide a written response after consulting LCSD.

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)801/17-18(01) on 13 April 2018.)

14. Mr Andrew WAN suggested the Administration to plant trees along the proposed new cycle track near MTR Tsuen Wan West ("TWW") Station to mitigate the noise generated by cycling activities that might affect the topside residential developments at TWW Station. DPM(W)/CEDD took note of Mr WAN's suggestion.

15. Ms Alice MAK suggested that the Administration should consider extending the proposed new cycle track to reach Wing Shun Street where a lift connecting the elevated walkway of Tsing Tsuen Bridge was being

Action

constructed, so as to provide an easy access from Tsing Yi to the proposed cycle track. Dr KWOK Ka-ki shared similar concern and suggested the Administration to consider permitting cycling on the walkway of Tsing Tsuen Bridge. Ms MAK and Dr KWOK requested the Administration to address their suggestions in the funding proposal to be submitted to the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC").

(Post-meeting note: The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)801/17-18(01) on 13 April 2018.)

16. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting asked whether public toilets would be provided on the proposed new cycle track. Mr LAM, Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr Holden CHOW urged the Administration to install drinking fountains at suitable locations along the proposed cycle track. PAS/DEV(W)2 responded that the proposed Advance Works included the construction of an entry/exit hub near TWW Station with supporting facilities including a public toilet. DPM(W)/CEDD undertook to follow up with relevant departments on members' suggestion regarding the installation of drinking fountains.

17. Mr Andrew WAN suggested that the Administration should consider providing bicycle rental facilities and refreshment kiosks at the entry/exit hub. DPM(W)/CEDD took note of Mr WAN's suggestion, and undertook to follow up with relevant departments on the provision of refreshment vending machines at the entry/exit hub.

18. Mr HUI Chi-fung, while generally supporting the development of cycle tracks, opined that the Administration should promote cycling as a mode of transport, and construct cycle tracks for transport, leisure and sports uses. He also called on the Administration to designate bicycle parking spaces on the proposed new cycle track for use by "bicycle sharing" service providers.

19. In response, PAS/DEV(W)2 said that when implementing new development area projects, the Administration would carefully consider the feasibility of constructing cycle tracks, and where circumstances allow, provide cycle tracks and related facilities for the public to use bicycles for recreational or short-distance commuting purposes. DPM(W)/CEDD advised that 115 bicycle parking spaces would be provided at the entry/exit hub of the proposed new cycle track. He took note of Mr HUI Chi-fung's suggestion on designating bicycle parking spaces for use by "bicycle sharing" service providers.

Project cost

20. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung and Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired about the reasons for the relatively high unit cost per metre for the construction of the proposed new cycle track, which would be about \$61,000/m given that the total estimate cost for the proposed Advance Works was \$140.9 million in money-of-the-day prices for the proposed new cycle track of about 2.3-kilometre ("km") long.

21. DPM(W)/CEDD clarified that in addition to the construction of the proposed new cycle track, the proposed Advance Works comprised the construction of one entry/exit hub and two resting stations with supporting facilities including bicycle parking spaces, benches and a public toilet. Furthermore, to make way for the proposed new cycle track, modification of an existing footbridge would be carried out to demolish an existing ramp and construct a lift for barrier-free access for the public.

Overall progress of the cycle track network in the New Territories

22. The Deputy Chairman said that members belonging to the Business and Professionals Alliance for Hong Kong supported the proposed Advance Works. The Deputy Chairman, Ms Alice MAK, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung, Mr Frankie YICK, Mr Holden CHOW and Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired about the implementation timetable of the remaining sections of the TW—TM cycle track. Mr Holden CHOW further enquired about the overall progress of the cycle track network in the New Territories.

23. PAS/DEV(W)2 and DPM(W)/CEDD responded that the comprehensive cycle track network in the New Territories broadly comprised two backbone sections. Regarding the Tuen Mun to Ma On Shan backbone section of about 60 km long, some 50 km from Tuen Mun to Yuen Long and from Sheung Shui to Ma On Shan had already been completed and were open to the public. Construction of the remaining section connecting Yuen Long to Sheung Shui was currently underway for completion by early 2020.

24. PAS/DEV(W)2 and DPM(W)/CEDD further advised that the TW—TM backbone section had been planned for implementation in phases. In the first phase, the Administration planned to commence the proposed Advance Works from Tsing Tsuen Bridge to Bayview Garden

Action

in Tsuen Wan in the third quarter of 2018 for completion in the fourth quarter of 2020. As regards the remaining Stage 1 Works (from Bayview Garden to Ting Kau) and Stage 2 Works (from Ting Kau to Tuen Mun), they were subjected to difficult site constraints such as inadequate space along the existing roads between Bayview Garden and Tuen Mun for the construction of cycle tracks. Moreover, the Administration had received strong objections from the local community on the proposed sections at Sham Tseng, So Kwun Wat and Sam Shing in previous public consultation exercises in terms of cycling safety, noise and visual impacts. To overcome the difficult site constraints and address the adverse public comments, the Administration had been liaising with the Tuen Mun District Council ("TMDC") and the Tsuen Wan District Council ("TWDC") and working out different options for the alignment of the sections concerned.

25. Mr Andrew WAN expressed concern about whether the value of the proposed new cycle track from Tsing Tsuen Bridge to Bayview Garden would be diminished if the remaining stages of the complete TW—TM cycle track would not be constructed. Mr Frankie YICK noted that no members had expressed objection to the proposed Advance Works, and called on the Administration to collaborate with various political parties to solicit support from the local community for the implementation of the remaining stages of the TW—TM cycle track.

26. PAS/DEV(W)2 responded that the Administration had consulted TWDC and obtained their support to proceed with the proposed Advance Works. TMDC and TWDC generally appreciated the constraints and difficulties encountered for implementing the cycle track project, and requested the Administration to take it forward in phases starting with the less controversial sections. The Administration would discuss with the stakeholders with a view to arriving at the most suitable alignment for taking forward the remaining stages of the TW—TM cycle track.

Concluding remarks

27. Concluding the discussion, the Chairman said that members had no objection to the Administration's submission of the funding proposal to PWSC for consideration.

V Landscape and tree management work in Hong Kong

(LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(04) — Administration's paper on
landscape and tree

management work in Hong Kong
LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(05) — Paper on landscape and tree management work in Hong Kong prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief))

Other relevant paper

(LC Paper No. CB(1)548/17-18(01) — Letter dated 30 January 2018 from Hon Tanya CHAN on landscape and tree management work in Hong Kong)

28. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)¹ briefed members on the landscape and tree management work in Hong Kong.

(Post-meeting note: A soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)638/17-18(02) by email on 28 February 2018.)

29. The Chairman referred to a letter from Ms Tanya CHAN concerning the landscape and tree management work in Hong Kong which was tabled at the meeting. He said that the Administration would be invited to provide a written response to the issues raised in the above letter.

(Post-meeting note: The letter from Ms Tanya CHAN was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)642/17-18(01) (Chinese version only) by email on 28 February 2018.)

Tree asset management

30. Mr HUI Chi-fung enquired about the Administration's efforts in protecting stonewall trees. SDEV responded that stone retaining walls in Hong Kong were not designed for plant growth, hence trees growing thereon required special management. The Administration had promulgated the "Management Guidelines for Stonewall Trees" as a reference for tree management departments to monitor stonewall trees,

Action

with a view to minimizing their risk of failure. Further, the Administration had undertaken geotechnical and arboricultural studies to examine the root anchorage and stability of stonewall trees. Also, with the support of the Hong Kong Jockey Club, the Administration was undertaking a collaborative project with local tertiary institutions to install sensors on stonewall trees to ascertain their stability during blustery weather. Subject to the results of this trial project, the smart sensing technology could be used for real-time tree management to protect public safety.

Landscape management

31. Citing the development of the Gardens by the Bay in Singapore as an example, Mr Holden CHOW called on the Administration to adopt new thinking in the implementation of greening and landscape planning and design in Hong Kong, in particular at the early planning stage of new development area projects.

32. In response, Assistant Director (Technical), Civil Engineering and Development Department, said that CEDD had been developing Greening Master Plan ("GMP") for each district as a guide for the design and implementation of greening works. Taking into account the local characteristics and public aspirations, the GMP for a district would define the overall greening framework of the district, and serve as a guide for all parties involved in the planning, design and implementation of greening works. At present, the GMPs for the urban areas and southeast and northwest New Territories had already been developed, and the greening works recommended had been completed. CEDD was currently developing GMPs for northeast and southwest New Territories.

Supply of tree management professionals

33. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung and Mr Holden CHOW called on the Administration to step up the efforts in nurturing personnel with professional qualifications and experience in tree management. In particular, Mr LEUNG suggested that professional degree programmes in tree management should be introduced.

34. In response, SDEV said that the Administration had been working closely with the arboriculture industry on the development of a quality workforce. At present, the priority task was to develop the Specification of Competency Standards ("SCS") for the industry to set out the skills, knowledge and outcome standards required for practitioners to effectively

perform various tasks of different complexity. Training courses developed and accredited with reference to the SCS would be recognized under the Qualifications Framework. Besides, the Administration would continue to strengthen collaboration with education and training institutions to uplift the quality of the training courses and to ensure continuous enhancement, thus improving the professional workforce in the tree management industry.

35. Mr HUI Chi-fung pointed out that at present there was not an Arborist grade in the civil service, and tree management and preservation work was performed by arborists on non-civil service contract terms or outsourced to contractors. He called on the Administration to create a dedicated Arborist grade in the civil service.

36. SDEV said that engaging contractors for tree management work was a flexible and cost-effective arrangement. On the other hand, Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department had deployed officers with relevant experience and qualifications to Development Bureau and some tree management departments for tree management work. That said, the Administration would keep in view the development of the arboriculture industry in Hong Kong, and review the need for an Arborist grade in the civil service in due course.

Introducing legislation on tree management

37. Mr HUI Chi-fung opined that the Administration should introduce legislation on tree management for effective regulation of the planning, planting, maintenance and removal of trees both on government land and within private properties.

38. SDEV responded that the Administration adopted a prudent and open attitude towards the introduction of legislation on tree management. Given that such legislation would have significant impact, such as compliance costs, on private property owners and property management companies, some of them might choose to remove the trees under their purview, hence defeating the intent of promoting proper tree management and enhancing tree protection. Another key consideration was the shortage of qualified personnel with relevant experience to implement the required tree inspection and maintenance works. At this stage, the Administration focused on working with the industry in enhancing the knowledge, skills and management standards of tree work personnel, so as to raise the level of professionalism of tree management work in Hong Kong.

Motions proposed by member

39. The Chairman advised that he had received a motion proposed by Mr HUI Chi-fung. The Chairman considered that the proposed motion was directly related to the agenda item under discussion. Members agreed that the motion be proceeded with at the meeting. As a quorum was not present at the meeting, the Chairman ordered that the quorum bell be rung to summon members to the meeting. When a quorum was present, the Chairman put to vote the following motion which was proposed by Mr HUI Chi-fung:

(Translation)

"This Panel requests that:

1. the Government should enact legislation on trees, so as to empower responsible authorities to regulate tree management on government and private land, and provide a legal framework for the planning, planting, maintenance and removal of trees;
2. as the existing arborists are mainly employed on non-civil service contract terms or through outsourcing, their level of employment stability is low and their remuneration packages are different from those of civil servants, the Government should include an Arborist grade in the civil service establishment and offer permanent posts for them, so as to facilitate the career development of arborists;
3. even though many surveys on "important trees" involving public works projects have been carried out in accordance with the standards set out in the Register of Old and Valuable Trees ("OVTs"), which include tree species, forms and ages, as the aforesaid trees have not been included in the Register of OVTs, they are thus being treated as second-rate, this Panel requests the Government to review and consider unifying the respective definitions of "important trees" adopted by various departments and the Register of OVTs, and implement measures to monitor and protect trees; and

4. the Government should report regularly the progress of its work on formulating a qualifications framework for arborists."

40. At members' request, the Chairman ordered a division. Six members voted for, and one member voted against the motion. Six members abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Mr Andrew WAN
Mr HUI Chi-fung
(6 members)

Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Mr KWONG Chun-yu

Against:

Mr Frankie YICK
(1 member)

Abstain:

Mr Kenneth LAU (Deputy Chairman)
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr CHAN Chun-ying
(6 members)

Mr CHAN Kin-por
Ms Alice MAK
Mr LAU Kwok-fan

41. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

(Post-meeting note: The wording of the motion passed was circulated to members by email on 1 March 2018 vide LC Paper No. CB(1)645/17-18(01). The Administration's response to the motion was circulated to members on 10 April 2018 vide LC Paper No. CB(1)777/17-18(01).)

VI Proposed creation of permanent posts of Chief Landscape Architect in the Civil Engineering and Development Department and Highways Department

(LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(06) — Administration's paper on proposed creation of permanent posts of Chief Landscape Architect in the Civil Engineering and Development Department and the Highways Department)

42. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)1 ("DS/DEV(W)1") briefed members on the proposed creation of two permanent Chief Landscape Architect ("CLA") (D1) posts, one each in CEDD and the Highways Department ("HyD"), to strengthen the landscape services of the two departments to enhance the quality, sustainability and liveability of the outdoor environment. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, Assistant Director (Technical), Civil Engineering and Development Department ("AD/T/CEDD") and Deputy Director of Highways ("DDHy") then briefed members on the details of the staffing proposals.

(Post-meeting note: A soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)638/17-18(03) by email on 28 February 2018.)

Proposed creation of two permanent Chief Landscape Architect posts

43. Mr Alvin YEUNG asked whether the proposed CLA posts in CEDD and HyD would be filled by internal deployment or open recruitment. He mentioned that the Finance Committee had recently also approved the proposed creation of a CLA post in the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") of the Development Bureau ("DEVB"). He asked whether there was any coordination at the bureau level regarding the greening and landscape work performed by the Landscape Architect ("LA") grade officers in its different departments.

44. In response, DS/DEV(W)1 said that the proposed two permanent CLA posts in CEDD and HyD would be filled by internal deployment. On the coordination of landscape work, DEVB was responsible for policy level issues including the promulgation of circulars and guidelines for implementation by the works departments, while the landscape divisions of individual departments played important roles in planning and implementing landscape programmes for works projects under their purview.

45. Mr LAU Kwok-fan enquired about the staffing arrangements in CEDD and HyD in support of the landscape and greening work of CEDD and HyD at present before the creation of the CLA posts.

46. AD/T/CEDD responded that CEDD was taking forward extensive mega-scale new development projects and infrastructure development works to expedite land supply. It had been conducting technical studies

Action

and carrying out site formation and infrastructure works for 59 public housing development projects, and would undertake similar tasks for another 11 new potential sites in 2018-2019 to meet the long-term public housing supply. Such works required proper integration with landscape planning and design, which was currently supported by a Landscape Unit and a Landscape Section under CEDD. To meet the service demand, the said Landscape Unit and Landscape Section would be amalgamated to form a new Landscape Division with an expanded staffing establishment. The proposed CLA post in CEDD would lead and manage the new Landscape Division comprising 21 LA grade officers, and play a pivotal role in enhancing CEDD's landscape services.

47. DDHy indicated that the existing Landscape Unit under HyD had an establishment of 55 civil service posts, of which 20 came from the LA grade while the others were inspectorates, technical and general grades. The proposed CLA post would support Assistant Director (Technical) and lead a new Landscape Division (which would replace the Landscape Unit) in providing an expanding scope of landscape and tree advisory services required by HyD. The leadership of the new CLA would facilitate the efficient use of resources in the division and elevate the breadth and quality of landscape and tree management services.

48. Citing the design of landscape works for railway development projects in the Netherlands as an example, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung called on the Administration to step up efforts in and improving the quality of landscape services for the local railway infrastructure projects. He was keen to ensure that by creating the proposed directorate post in HyD, the landscape and greening works of railway infrastructure projects could be enhanced. Overall, he supported the expansion of the staff capacity of the LA grade in the Government to strengthen its landscape development and tree management work.

49. DDHy responded that a dedicated directorate-level professional at the CLA level would steer and enhance landscape and tree management services for road and railway infrastructure projects. He indicated that HyD had all along been committed to the landscape management of a large area of around 1100 hectares in total on slopes and along expressways with some 0.6 million trees in it.

Tree asset management

50. Mr Holden CHOW noted that HyD was overseeing the vegetation and tree management work on slopes and along expressways under its

ambit. He asked whether the relevant work was performed inhouse by HyD or outsourced to contractors, and whether manpower was adequate to cope with the workload. He hoped that the new CLA post in HyD would closely monitor the tree management work outsourced to contractors and expedite the handling of public complaints relating to their work.

51. DDHy took note of Mr Holden CHOW's views, adding that HyD had engaged contractors to perform tree management work. The proposed CLA post would be responsible for monitoring the work of contractors to ensure that outsourced landscape works were effectively delivered.

52. Mr HUI Chi-fung considered that public funds should be better used for enhancing the work of tree preservation, instead of creating two directorate level posts intending to enhance the career prospect of existing staff. Expressing dire concern over some tree felling cases, he was disappointed that some LAs had not effectively execute the measures for preserving and protecting the trees in many cases. He called on the Administration to create a dedicated Arborist grade in the civil service.

53. DS/DEV(W)1 indicated that LAs generally delivered high quality landscape planning and design on the one hand, and carried out vegetation management and maintenance on the other. She explained that in some tree felling cases it was prudent to remove the unhealthy trees to ensure public safety and the long-term sustainability of the vegetation. While on the one hand the proposed creation of the two permanent CLA posts would not undermine the staffing resources required for taking forward frontline tree management work, the Administration would on the other hand continue to enhance training for tree management staff to raise their professional knowledge in arboriculture.

54. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed concern over the tree incidents, such as the felling of an old tree in Park Lane Shopper's Boulevard in Tsim Sha Tsui after typhoon Hato, and the tree pruning incident in Tai Po which caused adverse impact on some nests of ardeids with chicks on the trees. Dr KWOK opined that government departments lacked knowledge in tree asset management. He queried about the justifications for creating the two CLA posts for strengthening landscape services. He further enquired about how the Administration would manage the old trees in the built-up areas.

Action

55. DS/DEV(W)1 advised that the Administration had adopted a holistic approach when managing and maintaining trees. As living organisms with a finite life-cycle, trees would inevitably grow old, become sick and might ultimately require removal. Life-cycle management was important in minimizing tree risks for safeguarding public safety while replenishing and regenerating the urban forest.

Landscape management

56. Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired about (a) the mechanism in place for soliciting and incorporating expert views in the landscape design for individual development projects; and (b) the Administration's work in the development and uplifting of the urban landscapes of Hong Kong in the past five years.

57. DS/DEV(W)1 explained that the Administration strived to identify suitable greening opportunities at the planning and design stages of development projects, and promote proper planting practices in pursuance of healthy and sustainable urban landscapes. The Administration had established the Urban Forestry Advisory Panel to seek expert advice from recognized practitioners and to engage the community and industry stakeholders. Dr KWOK Ka-ki further requested the Administration to, before submitting the relevant staffing proposals to the Establishment Subcommittee ("ESC"), provide supplementary information in light of his enquiries and concerns.

(*Post-meeting note:* The Administration's supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)958/17-18(01) on 14 May 2018.)

Replacement of senescent *Acacia confusa*

58. Mr Alvin YEUNG asked about the Administration's plan to replace senescent *Acacia confusa* (Taiwan Acacia, 台灣相思), and whether further replacement would be required for a certain period.

59. DDHy responded that the Administration had adopted the principle of "Right Tree, Right Place" in landscape management. HyD launched the "Enhancement of Vegetated Slopes Programme" to replace *Acacia confusa* with native species. Depending on actual site conditions, suitable native tree species, such as *Sapium discolor* (Mountain Tallow Tree, 山烏桕), *Sterculia lanceolata* (Scarlet Sterculia, 假蘋婆), etc., would be planted as replacement.

Concluding remarks

60. The Chairman and the Deputy Chairman respectively stated that members belonging to the Liberal Party and members belonging to the Business and Professionals Alliance for Hong Kong supported the submission of the staffing proposals to ESC for consideration. Mr LAU Kwok-fan said that members belonging to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong supported the staffing proposals. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung and Mr Holden CHOW also expressed support for the proposals. Mr Alvin YEUNG said that members belonging to the Civic Party would need to further consider whether to support the proposals. Mr HUI Chi-fung said that members belonging to the Democratic Party objected to the proposed creation of the two CLA posts in CEDD and HyD.

VII Planning and Engineering Study for Housing Sites in Yuen Long South — Recommended Outline Development Plan

(LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(07) — Administration's paper on Planning and Engineering Study for Housing Sites in Yuen Long South — Recommended Outline Development Plan

LC Paper No. CB(1)608/17-18(08) — Paper on the Planning and Engineering Study for Housing Sites in Yuen Long South prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief))

61. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Development ("USDEV") briefed members that the Yuen Long South ("YLS") development project would transform and release the development potential of brownfield sites to a new town extension connected to the existing Yuen Long New Town and the planned Hung Shui Kiu ("HSK") New Development Area ("NDA"). In reviewing the development potential of YLS, the Planning Department and CEDD had jointly commissioned the Planning and Engineering Study for Housing Sites in Yuen Long South ("the Study") which adopted a three-stage community engagement to solicit public views. Based on

Action

the recommendations of the Study, the Recommended Outline Development Plan ("RODP") was promulgated on 8 August 2017. According to the RODP, the YLS Development Area would provide a total of about 28 500 new flats to help meet the medium to long term housing needs of Hong Kong.

62. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation, Deputy Director of Planning/Territorial (Acting), Planning Department ("DD(T)(Acting)/PlanD") then briefed members on the RODP for YLS and other key recommendations of the Study.

(Post-meeting note: A soft copy of the powerpoint presentation materials was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)638/17-18(04) by email on 28 February 2018.)

Land resumption and clearance

63. Mr Andrew WAN said that he did not object to unleashing the development potential of brownfield sites to increase land and housing supply. Yet, he enquired about (a) the estimated costs for the acquisition of private land including brownfield sites in the YLS Development Area; (b) the ownership status of private land in the area, such as whether the private land in question was owned by multiple owners and hence might affect the progress of land resumption; and (c) when and how the Administration would conduct a freezing survey to register the affectees.

64. In response, USDEV indicated that since the work of land resumption and clearance in respect of the YLS development had not yet commenced, the Administration could not provide specific figures on the total estimated cost for land resumption and compensation at this stage. When it was necessary to resume private land for development, the Government would exercise the powers in accordance with the relevant legislation to effect the land resumption and make statutory compensation accordingly. As an alternative to statutory compensation, there was an ex-gratia zonal compensation system consisting of four compensation zones under the existing mechanism, and generally speaking, areas falling within New Town Development areas would be classified as Zone A. In the meantime, depending on the statutory process for amending the relevant Outline Zoning Plans ("OZPs"), the Government might conduct a freezing survey in early 2019 to record existing structures and occupants which might be affected by the YLS development.

Action

65. USDEV further said that over 80% of the land within the YLS Development Area was in private ownership. To ensure timely and orderly development of YLS, the Government would consider adopting the Enhanced Conventional New Town Approach as the implementation mode, under which the Government would resume land required for the project while allowing the processing of land owners' applications for land exchange over individual sites planned for private developments subject to meeting specified criteria and conditions.

Arrangements for affected households

66. Mr LAU Kwok-fan and Mr Holden CHOW supported the provision of public housing to address the pressing housing needs of the general public. Mr LAU noted that the Administration had proposed special compensation and rehousing arrangements for the affected clearers of the YLS development project, drawing reference to the measures adopted for Kwu Tung North and Fanling North NDAs. He enquired whether and when the Administration would determine the compensation and rehousing arrangements for the land resumption in the two NDAs concerned. Mr LAU considered that the Administration should adopt a "rehouse first, develop later" approach in land resumption for development, and develop rehousing blocks when planning for the development of NDAs in the long run. Mr LAU and Mr LEUNG Che-cheung both called on the Administration to exempt affected households from the comprehensive income and asset tests in rehousing them to public rental housing ("PRH") units.

67. The Deputy Chairman relayed the concerns of affected occupants of squatter structures over the limited amounts of compensation, which were insufficient for them to afford alternative accommodation. There were also concerns about the inadequacy of compensation for resumption of private land and farmland within NDAs. Given that indigenous/non-indigenous villagers in general were dissatisfied with the compensation and rehousing arrangements, the Deputy Chairman called on the Administration to review the existing policies on clearance compensation and rehousing before resuming the private land in the YLS Development Area. Ms Alice MAK shared a similar view. The Deputy Chairman also hoped that the Administration would consider setting up a dedicated fund for development projects to expedite the disbursement of compensations to affected villagers.

68. USDEV advised that the Government was fully aware of the concerns of households and business undertakings affected by

Action

development projects. For the eligible clearerees, the Government had been adopting of "rehousing and relocation before clearance" approach. Under the existing land resumption and clearance mechanism, there were established procedures for seeking funding approval and the Government had no intention of establishing other dedicated funds. Detailed arrangements for the potential clearerees affected by the YLS development were under study and would be announced in due course.

Arrangements for affected brownfield operators

69. Ms Alice MAK sought details on the area and percentage of existing brownfield sites in the YLS Development Area, and the measures to re-provision affected brownfield operations. Mr Frankie YICK was concerned how the Administration would accommodate brownfield operations practically not feasible for moving into multi-storey buildings ("MSBs"), such as open storage of construction materials. Also, he was worried that most of the affected brownfield operations would be driven out of the area due to the possible high rents. Citing the HSK NDA project as an example, Mr YICK urged the Administration to engage the trades on suitable measures for accommodating brownfield operations, in particular the arrangements for the existing brownfield operations which would be moved into MSBs as well as those needed to be accommodated on suitable open-air sites.

70. USDEV responded that the YLS development covered a total development area of 185 hectares ("ha") including about 100 ha of brownfield sites. To explore the possible modes of operation and management of the proposed MSBs, the Government had commissioned two feasibility studies on MSBs for brownfield operations in mid-2016. It would strive to complete the studies within 2018. Relevant stakeholders and trade representatives would be consulted in due course. USDEV further said that the Government would make reference to the pilot case in HSK NDA and explore providing accommodation for some brownfield operations through development of multi-storey industrial compounds or other land-efficient means at suitable locations.

71. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung relayed that the Yuen Long District Council did not support the YLS development project unless appropriate relocation arrangements would be made for affected brownfield operations. Noting that the Administration had reserved land in Tong Yan San Tsuen for certain brownfield operations to be consolidated into MSBs, Mr LEUNG called on the Administration to consider inviting

Action

private participation, in particular those brownfield operators affected by the development project, in developing the MSBs there.

Arrangements for affected livestock farms

72. Mr Steven HO raised concerns that five livestock farms (including three pig farms and two chicken farms) which would be affected by land resumption for the YLS development were unable to identify suitable sites for relocation. He called on the Administration to identify suitable sites for relocating the affected livestock farms, while at the same time review the New Agriculture Policy to facilitate relocation of these livestock farms to the Agricultural Park. Mr HO urged that the relocation of livestock farms should be steered by the Chief Executive and relevant Secretaries of Bureaux as far as possible. USDEV undertook to relay Mr HO's views to the Food and Health Bureau.

Housing mix

73. Dr KWOK Ka-ki was disappointed that the ratio of PRH units in the YLS development was only 61%, and called on the Administration to increase the ratio so as to better contribute to meeting the demand of PRH applicants on the Waiting List. He also queried why the Administration had not increased the development intensity of YLS, and surmised whether the Low-density Residential Area and Garden Community Planning Area were reserved for developing private luxury residential housing to favour the landlords.

74. USDEV explained that the public-to-private housing ratio of the YLS Development Area was set at 61:39, which was broadly in line with the Long Term Housing Strategy. The YLS Development Area would provide different housing types to allow more choices and a diversity of lifestyles for accommodating a total population of about 88 000, which had been optimized within the constraints of the traffic and infrastructure capacity.

Village type development

75. The Deputy Chairman expressed concern over the relatively small size of "Village Type Development" ("V") zones in the YLS Development Area. He relayed the request of villagers for expanding the V zones. He also enquired about the area of "V" zones as shown on the RODP and the considerations in drawing up the boundaries of "V" zones. Moreover, he was concerned about the air ventilation impact of

Action

"wall effect" caused by the proposed high-rise buildings on existing villages including Lam Hau Tsuen and Shan Ha Tsuen.

76. DD(T)(Acting)/PlanD responded that the "V" zones for the adjacent villages of the YLS development on the OZPs were generally encompassing their respective Village Environs, and there was still land available within the "V" zones for small house developments.

Transport infrastructure

77. Expressing concerns over the existing traffic congestion along Kung Um Road, Ms Alice MAK enquired about the details of transport infrastructure to be provided for meeting the transport needs of existing and future residents in the area. Also, she was concerned how the Administration would minimize the impacts of the construction works on the existing villagers during the construction period.

78. Noting that the carrying capacity of the MTR West Rail Line ("WRL") would increase by 60%, Mr Holden CHOW further asked whether the increased capacity would be sufficient to cope with the anticipated traffic growth arising from the YLS development and other projects in the district. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung considered it incumbent upon the Administration to improve the transport network to enhance the connectivity and accessibility of the YLS Development Area.

79. Project Manager (West), Civil Engineering and Development Department explained that the 7-car WRL trains had been gradually replaced by 8-car trains from 2016 onwards, and the hourly train frequency would be increased from 20 to 28 after the commissioning of the "East-West Corridor". As a result, the carrying capacity of WRL would increase by 60%. Further, the Transport and Housing Bureau would take forward the "Strategic Studies on Railways and Major Roads Beyond 2030" to review the traffic demand of Hong Kong beyond 2031 comprehensively.

80. Mr Michael TIEN queried whether the increased capacity of WRL could cope with the population growth arising from the proposed developments in North West New Territories ("NWNT") including HSK NDA, YLS development, Kam Tin South development and Tuen Mun South Extension by 2030. He pointed out the saturation problem of WRL in 2030 that even with a passenger density level of 6 persons (standing) per square metre ("ppsm"), there would still be a shortfall of about 10 000 passengers in the total carrying capacity to meet

Action

the demand during peak hours; while if using the standard passenger density level of only around 4 ppsm, the shortfall would reach about 30 000 to 40 000 passengers. Due to the above concerns, Mr TIEN indicated that he would support the development projects of New Territories West only if the Administration would plan ahead for the construction of new heavy railways, including but not limited to the "fifth cross-harbour railway" or "Tuen Mun—Kowloon Railway" within the tenure of the current-term government, and draw up the relevant railway alignment proposal and construction timetable.

81. USDEV responded that the Administration would commence studies for improving the carrying capacity of the railways in NWNT beyond 2031. Mr Michael TIEN said that he would vote against the YLS development project if the Administration still failed to address his concerns in this regard.

Provision of facilities

82. Given that residential care places for the elderly were in huge demand, Dr KWOK Ka-ki was disappointed that the residential care places (about 450) to be provided in the YLS Development Area were inadequate. He called on the Administration to increase the supply of residential care places for the elderly in need. The Chairman concurred with Dr KWOK's views.

83. USDEV and DD(T)(Acting)/PlanD took note of members' views and indicated that there should still be room to accommodate more residential care places for the elderly. They undertook that the Administration would discuss with relevant departments to examine the feasibility of providing more of such places in the area.

84. In view of the shortage of parking spaces in Hong Kong, Mr Holden CHOW called on the Administration to consider providing more parking spaces at the proposed MSBs in the YLS Development Area.

Provision of employment opportunities

85. Given that the YLS project would only create about 10 500 employment opportunities, Mr LAU Kwok-fan queried how the employment needs of its future population of about 88 000 could be met. He called on the Administration to step up efforts in increasing local job opportunities in YLS.

86. USDEV explained that the developments of HSK NDA and YLS would create about 160 000 employment opportunities altogether. HSK NDA would be positioned as a "Regional Economic and Civic Hub" for NWNT offering about 150 000 jobs in various sectors, which would help redress the current shortage of jobs in the region.

Motions proposed by members

87. The Chairman advised that he had received three motions respectively proposed by Mr LAU Kwok-fan, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung and Mr Michael TIEN. The Chairman considered that the proposed motions were directly related to the agenda item under discussion. Members agreed that the motions be proceeded with at the meeting. As a quorum was not present at the meeting, the Chairman ordered that the quorum bell be rung to summon members to the meeting. A quorum was subsequently present.

Motion proposed by Mr LAU Kwok-fan

88. Mr LAU Kwok-fan read out his proposed motion:

(Translation)

"Due to strict regulations imposed by the existing laws on livestock farms, it is difficult for five livestock farms affected by the development in Yuen Long South to identify suitable sites for setting up new farms or relocation, thus resulting in irreversible and undue impact on local agriculture and the public.

As such, this Panel urges the Government to formulate a comprehensive farm relocation policy, so as to allow livestock farms affected by land resumption due to development or reasons such as plans for enhancing their operating environment or biosecurity measures to relocate as appropriate (such as relocating to the Agricultural Park or other suitable agricultural land) or merge with other livestock farms, so that the industry and the public will no longer be subject to unreasonable and irreversible blows and impacts because of obsolete legislation."

89. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman announced that 12 members voted for, no member voted against the motion, and no member abstained. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

Motion proposed by Mr LEUNG Che-cheung

90. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung read out his proposed motion:

(Translation)

"Although this Panel recognizes the importance of the planning for the housing sites in Yuen Long South in the overall housing supply, this Panel requests the authorities to face up to and respond proactively to the demands of affected households, farmers, operators of live poultry trade and brownfield operators in the new development area, especially their demands for "rehousing and relocation before clearance", so as to enable the households concerned to resettle in the current locality; farmers to resume farming; operators of live poultry trade to relocate their business and resume operation properly; and brownfield operators and their employees to continue their operations and maintain their livelihood; meanwhile, in order to expedite land resumption and the rehousing of the households concerned, the authorities should exempt affected households from the comprehensive income and asset tests in rehousing them to public housing units."

91. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman announced that 14 members voted for, no member voted against the motion, and no member abstained. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

Motion proposed by Mr Michael TIEN

92. Mr Michael TIEN read out his proposed motion:

(Translation)

"Given that the Administration is pressing ahead the implementation of a number of development plans in New Territories West to increase housing supply, it is expected that the population size in that area will continue to grow. This Panel urges the authorities to undertake immediately that they will definitely implement proposals to construct heavy rails, including but not limited to the "fifth cross-harbour railway" or "Tuen Mun—Kowloon Railway" within the tenure of the current-term government, so as to further improve the railway system connecting New Territories West to the urban area, and draw up

Action

the relevant railway alignment proposal and construction timetable."

93. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman announced that 11 members voted for, and one member voted against the motion. One member abstained. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

(Post-meeting note: The wordings of the three motions passed were circulated to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(1)645/17-18(02) to (04) on 1 March 2018. The Administration's response to the three motions was circulated to members on 12 and 23 April 2018 vide LC Paper Nos. CB(1)792/17-18(01) to (02) and CB(1)846/17-18(01) respectively.)

VIII Any other business

94. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:25 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
23 May 2018