

# **立法會**

## ***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. CB(4)628/17-18  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/PS

### **Panel on Public Service**

**Minutes of meeting held on  
Friday, 22 December 2017, at 10:45 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH (Chairman)  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN

**Members absent** : Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan

**Public Officers  
attending** : **Agenda item IV**  
  
Mr Joshua LAW, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

Mr Eddie MAK, JP  
Acting Permanent Secretary for the Civil  
Service

Mr Eric CHAN  
Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service 3

**Agenda item V**

Mr Eddie MAK, JP  
Acting Permanent Secretary for the Civil  
Service

Ms Amy WONG  
Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service 2

Ms Bernadette LAM  
Acting Principal Assistant Secretary for the  
Civil Service (Pay & Leave)

Ms Angela LEE  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing  
(Transport)5

Ms Maisie CHENG, JP  
Director of Marine

Mr Freely CHENG, JP  
Deputy Director of Marine (Special Duties)

Mr CHENG Yeung-ming  
Acting Deputy Director of Marine

Mr LAI Chi-tung  
Assistant Director of Marine (Port Control)

**Clerk in attendance** : Mr Anthony CHU  
Chief Council Secretary (4)1

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Wendy JAN  
Senior Council Secretary (4)7

Ms Maggie CHUNG  
Council Secretary (4)1

Mr Griffin FUNG  
Legislative Assistant (4)8

Mr Terry HON  
Clerical Assistant (4)1

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of minutes**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)352/17-18 -- Minutes of the policy briefing cum meeting on 16 October 2017)

The minutes of the meeting held on 16 October 2017 were confirmed.

**II. Information paper(s) issued since the last regular meeting on 20 November 2017**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)251/17-18(01) -- Letter from Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee on the division of work of the Joint Offices for Investigation of Water Seepage Complaints

LC Paper No. CB(4)344/17-18(01) -- Administration's response to the letter dated 10 October 2017 from Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan concerning the grade structure review of disciplined services

LC Paper No. CB(4)363/17-18(01) -- Joint letter from Hon Charles Peter MOK and Hon SHIU Ka-chun

Action

regarding the alignment of the pay frameworks of all disciplined services departments with that of the Hong Kong Police Force)

2. Members noted that the above papers had been issued since the last meeting.

**III. Date of next meeting and items for discussion**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(01) -- List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(02) -- List of follow-up actions)

3. Members agreed that the next regular Panel meeting would be held on 15 January 2018 to discuss the following items proposed by the Administration:

- (a) Non-civil service contract staff; and
- (b) Use of agency workers.

4. Regarding the joint letter dated 6 December 2017 from Mr Charles Peter MOK and Mr SHIU Ka-chun requesting the Panel to discuss the alignment of the pay frameworks of all disciplined services departments with that of the Hong Kong Police Force (LC Paper No. CB(4)363/17-18(01)), the Chairman informed members that the issue had been included in the "List of outstanding items for discussion" under the item "Grade structure review of disciplined services". The Administration was also requested to provide a response to the joint letter.

*(Post-meeting note: The joint letter and the Administration's response were issued to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(4)363/17-18(01) and CB(4)416/17-18(01) on 12 and 28 December 2017 respectively.)*

Action

**IV. The Civil Service Outstanding Service Award and other commendation schemes for civil servants**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(03) -- Administration's paper on the Civil Service Outstanding Service Award and Other Commendation Schemes for Civil Servants

LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(04) -- Paper on the Civil Service Outstanding Service Award and other commendation schemes for civil servants prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief))

5. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary for the Civil Service ("SCS") briefed members on the Civil Service Outstanding Service Award Scheme ("CSOSAS") and other commendation schemes for civil servants, as well as other supporting measures to boost morale of civil servants, details of which were set out in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(03)).

The Civil Service Outstanding Service Award Scheme

*Publicity and public engagement of the Scheme*

6. Mr IP Kin-yuen remarked that there was a general perception that civil servants were bureaucratic and would only follow the rules. However, as the Chairperson of one of the four Final Adjudication Panels of CSOSAS in 2015 and 2017, he realized that many civil servants discharged their duties in a serious and diligent manner. Quoting the examples of the Social Welfare Department's evacuation of the elderly from the residential care homes during the Ngau Tau Kok mini-storage fire incident and the Fire Services Department ("FSD")'s new techniques for deep sea rescue, he was particularly impressed by their extraordinary performance, proactive attitude and innovative mindset. In view of the above, he considered that the public's understanding and recognition of

## Action

the commendable services of civil servants should be enhanced, and the Administration could further co-operate with local media to showcase the work of winning departments and teams.

7. SCS replied that as stated in the Administration's paper, a one-hour TV documentary was produced by the Radio Television Hong Kong to recognize and promote the public awareness of the praiseworthy efforts and outstanding performance of the awardees. Besides, the Administration had created a dedicated website for CSOSAS to introduce the award winning services with video footages and in-depth description. Videos about the prize presentation ceremony and award recipients were also uploaded onto the Civil Service Bureau ("CSB")'s Website.

8. Dr Elizabeth QUAT echoed the view that publicity for CSOSAS should be stepped up. Noting that a video series would be produced to introduce the work of civil servants, she suggested that more short videos of a few minutes' duration should be produced and uploaded onto different social media given their wider promotion coverage. She asked whether short videos would be produced for all bureaux/departments ("B/Ds"), in particular for disciplined services to capture their behind-the-scene efforts and commitment in serving the public as well as work challenges, taking into consideration that the public might not know much about their day-to-day work.

9. SCS said that to enhance the public's understanding of the exemplary but lesser-known services provided by different B/Ds, CSB would, from time to time, upload videos and pictures with details of the services onto CSB's Website. In addition, school promotion programmes would be organized to introduce government services to the young generation.

10. Dr Elizabeth QUAT said that as community involvement played a crucial role in facilitating the promotion of public awareness and understanding of the Scheme, public participation in CSOSAS should be strengthened and should not be limited to voting for the Best Public Image Award. The Chairman and Mr IP Kin-yuen also suggested that the Administration should invite more Members to participate in the CSOSAS. SCS noted members' views and assured them that the Administration would consider measures to enhance the publicity and public participation in CSOSAS.

## Action

### *Award categories*

11. Mr IP Kin-yuen pointed out that given the design of the awards, some teams or departments, for example those in the disciplined services or engineering/professional/technical grades, were in a more advantageous position in winning the Crisis/Incident Support/Specialized Service awards, and this might render other teams or civil servants less willing to participate in CSOSAS. In light of the above, he enquired whether the Administration would consider expanding the award categories or implementing measures to further stimulate the interests of B/Ds in participating in CSOSAS.

12. SCS said that some B/Ds might, due to their service nature, have more interactions with the community and hence had advantages in competing in certain categories of awards. That said, departments and teams which provided general counter services could compete in other awards, such as the General Public Service Award and the Internal Services Award. Regarding the measures to inspire more B/Ds to take part in CSOSAS, SCS advised that before the commencement of each term of the Scheme, seminars would be organized for the awardees to share their experience in providing quality public service, and all civil servants were invited to join the seminars.

13. Given that the Administration was actively promoting innovative technology and smart city development in Hong Kong, Dr Elizabeth QUAT asked whether relevant awards would be added under CSOSAS as a measure to motivate B/Ds' participation in this regard.

14. SCS explained that to inspire B/Ds and teams to innovate in the delivery of public service, Special Citations for Innovation had been given out under the category of Team Awards. In 2017, the Inshore Patrol Sub-Unit of Hong Kong Police Force's Marine North Division won this award for their invention of "Vessel Searching Platform". Nevertheless, the Administration would consider introducing awards to further recognize B/Ds in the development of innovative technology and smart city.

15. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan enquired whether any relevant awards would be introduced to galvanize B/Ds to improve the organization structure, streamline the work procedures and enhance their efficiency and productivity. She believed that upon improving the working procedures, civil servants would have a higher sense of achievement and thus would proactively render high quality service.

## Action

16. In response, SCS advised that the Commendation Letter Scheme was already in place to recognize civil servants who made significant contribution towards enhancing the efficiency of B/Ds. As regards the proposals raised by Dr CHIANG Lai-wan to quantify the output of civil servants, SCS explained that the duties of civil servants were different from employees working in the private sector, and it was sometimes difficult to assess the civil servants' performance purely based on the volume of output.

17. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan was not convinced by SCS's reply and pointed out that the value for money audits conducted by the Audit Commission were to examine the efficiency and effectiveness with which any B/Ds had discharged its functions. In response, SCS explained that while the Audit Commission was responsible for performing value for money audits to identify maladministration and inadequacies of B/Ds, CSOSAS was to recognize B/Ds which provided meritorious public service that met the community's needs.

### *Rating criteria of the awards*

18. In reply to Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's enquiry about the rating criteria of the awards under CSOSAS, Deputy Secretary for the Civil Service 3 ("DSCS3") said that there were different types of awards under CSOSAS, namely the Inter-departmental Partnership Award, the Departmental Awards and the Team Awards, and each award had different adjudicating criteria. For example, the extent of co-operation among departments in the delivery of quality services was the key consideration in selecting the winners of the Inter-departmental Partnership Award. As for the Best Public Image Award under Departmental Awards, winners were ranked and selected according to votes from all Legislative Council Members, District Councils members and the public.

### *Effectiveness of the Scheme*

19. Noting that CSOSAS had been organized since 1999, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan asked whether the Administration had assessed its overall effectiveness.

20. SCS advised that the Administration had conducted regular reviews on CSOSAS. Upon the completion of the 2017 CSOSAS, questionnaires were sent to all participating B/Ds to gauge their feedbacks. The respondents strongly supported the continuation of CSOSAS as it helped enhance their team spirit and staff morale.



## Action

Notwithstanding this, the Administration would continuously consider measures to further improve CSOSAS.

### Long and Meritorious Service Travel Award Scheme

21. The Deputy Chairman recalled that last year, he had suggested the Administration allowing unmarried award-winners of the Long and Meritorious Service Travel Award ("LMSTA") Scheme to bring friends or family members as travel companions. Noting that the suggestion had not been incorporated in the Administration's paper, he asked whether the Administration had given thoughts to it. He stressed that it was reasonable to allow those awardees who were separated, divorced or widowed to bring their family members as travel companions.

22. SCS pointed out that in the past years, around 85% of the award recipients traveled with their spouses under the LMSTA Scheme, and the estimated expenditure in 2017-2018 had already reached \$114 million. Given that the number of eligible staff was increasing and many civil service fringe benefits were limited to civil servants and their spouses, the Administration must prudently consider the resource implications of any proposals on enhancing the quota and eligibility under the Scheme as well as the potential read-across implications for other civil service fringe benefits. At the moment, the Administration had no plan to expand the eligibility of the LMSTA Scheme.

23. The Deputy Chairman did not subscribe to SCS's explanation since the Administration would have to bear the costs if all awardees, instead of 85%, brought their spouses as travel companions. Moreover, the additional cost would only be a few million dollars under this scenario. Moreover, the travel allowance under the LMSTA Scheme was an award to civil servants, which was distinct from the civil servants' fringe benefits in nature. He did not consider changes in the LMSTA Scheme would have any policy implications for civil servants' fringe benefits.

24. The Chairman shared the views of the Deputy Chairman and urged the Administration to take into account the Deputy Chairman's suggestions seriously when reviewing the LMSTA Scheme in the future.

### Other supporting measures for civil servants

25. In response to Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's question about the utilization rates of the hotline counselling service on stress management provided to civil servants, DSCS3 advised that in the past few years, the number of users remained quite stable at around 300 per year. In 2016

## Action

and 2017 (up to September 2017), 288 and 252 users had respectively called the hotline. Among the 288 users in 2016, 487 telephone counselling sessions, 292 face-to-face counselling sessions and 26 clinical psychologists sessions were provided.

26. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan was concerned that some civil servants might not use the hotline counseling service fearing that it might affect their promotion prospects. SCS advised that the service was provided by the Christian Family Service Centre, and the Administration would not obtain any personal information of the service users from the Centre for privacy reasons.

## Other matter

27. Pointing out that FSD had won many awards in CSOSAS, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan considered that staff of FSD should be recognized for their excellent services. She therefore called on the Administration to discuss and review the grades in FSD and remuneration of fire personnel as soon as practicable.

28. The Chairman advised that the issue had been included in the "List of outstanding items for discussion" under the item "Grade structure review of disciplined services". He would further discuss with CSB on the proposed timing for discussion.

## Conclusion

29. To conclude, the Chairman asked the Administration to take note of members' views expressed at the meeting.

## **V. Grade Structure Review for Marine Officer and Surveyor of Ships grades**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(05) -- Administration's paper on Grade Structure Review for Marine Officer and Surveyor of Ships Grades of Marine Department

LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(06) -- Paper on grade structure reviews for non-directorate civilian

Action

grades prepared by the  
Legislative Council  
Secretariat (updated  
background brief)

LC Paper No. CB(4)394/17-18(01) -- Submission from the  
Hong Kong Marine  
Department Local  
Professional Officers'  
Association

LC Paper No. CB(4)394/17-18(02) -- Submission from the  
Marine Officers  
Association)

30. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the subject under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the subject.

31. At the invitation of the Chairman, Acting Permanent Secretary for the Civil Service ("PSCS(Atg)") and Director of Marine ("D of Marine") briefed members on the findings and recommendations of the grade structure review ("GSR") for Marine Officer ("MO") and Surveyor of Ship ("SoS") grades of the Marine Department ("MD") conducted by the Standing Commission on Civil Service Salaries and Conditions of Service ("the Commission"), as set out in the Administration's paper and Report 57 of the Commission (LC Paper No. CB(4)377/17-18(05)). PSCS(Atg) further said that in the event of any change to the pay and grade structure of the MO and SoS grades, the endorsement of the Establishment Subcommittee and the approval of the Finance Committee would be sought.

Entry requirements and starting pays of MO and SoS grades

32. While expressing support for implementing new measures to improve the recruitment of the MO and SoS grades, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan enquired about the entry requirements and starting pay of the two grades.

## Action

33. D of Marine pointed out that the prevailing entry requirements of the professional ranks of both MO and SoS grades were very stringent as entry into the two ranks normally required a professional qualification at Certificate of Competency ("CoC") Class 1, which was the highest class attainable. In order to obtain the CoC Class 1 qualification, a candidate must work on board sea-going vessels at designated positions for at least seven to eight years. A degree in a relevant discipline was also required for entry into the SoS rank. As regards the starting pay of the two ranks, D of Marine advised that the current entry pay points of the MO rank and SoS rank were Master Pay Scale ("MPS") Point 29 (about \$55,000 per month) and MPS Point 34 (about \$67,000 per month) respectively. Housing allowance at around \$18,000 per month would also be provided for eligible officers in the SoS rank.

### Succession problem faced by MD

34. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan was gravely concerned that a large number of directorate and senior officers of MD would retire in the coming few years, and that the MO and SoS grades, which were the two feeder grades of the senior directorate ranks in MD, had very high vacancy rates of 38% and 26% at the non-directorate level respectively. Sharing similar concern on the succession problem, the Deputy Chairman suggested that MD should consider grooming and developing officers in the Senior MO and Senior SoS ranks with good potential for advancement at a faster pace to the directorate level with a view to alleviating the serious succession problem of MD.

35. D of Marine acknowledged that MD was facing acute succession problem as 16 out of the 17 directorate officers in MD would retire in five years' time and the average age of senior officers in MD was about 56 to 57. To address the serious succession problem, the MO and SoS grade officers with good potential were provided with promotion opportunities at a much faster pace than before. In addition, direct recruitment had been conducted for the Senior SoS rank, but due regard must be paid to the sentiments of the serving officers. MD had also employed retired officers under the Post-retirement Service Contract Scheme to help alleviate the manpower shortage problem.

### Measures to attract young people to join MD

36. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan called on the Administration to strengthen its efforts to attract young people with potential to join MD and asked whether the Government would provide financial incentives to encourage them to obtain the CoC qualification required for the two grades.

Action

37. D of Marine replied that the Administration had launched a Maritime and Aviation Training Fund in 2014 to encourage young people to join the maritime industry. In particular, the Sea-going Training Incentive Scheme under the Training Fund offered a monthly subsidy of \$6,000 to deck or engineer cadets on ocean-going vessels for a maximum period of 18 months. However, among the students pursuing a study in logistics or maritime programmes, only a small number of students opted for sea-going deck cadet training. As such, the supply of home-grown trained seafarers had been limited. MD also had to compete with the private sector for a small pool of suitable candidates.

38. Mr HO Kai-ming remarked that the neglect of the development of some industries, such as the maritime and waterworks industries, by the Government had led to their diminution. This had resulted in the shortage of home-grown experienced professionals to work in those industries, and hence the succession and recruitment difficulties in the MO and SoS grades faced by MD. As the Administration could not rely on overseas recruitment for the MO and SoS grades, he called on the Administration to consider introducing measures to nurture local maritime professionals from junior grades, including non-degree grades, to take up the duties of these two professional grades.

39. PSCS(Atg) explained that the Government's recruitment policy was to recruit Hong Kong permanent residents as civil servants. In any event, as MOs and SoSs were the two feeder grades of the senior directorate ranks in MD, the Administration should groom local talents rather than relying on overseas recruitment for the two grades. He further explained that, with reference to the arrangement of grooming assistant rank officers to take up professional duties in the Engineer grade and related grades through further training or study and after gaining relevant experience, the Commission agreed with MD's proposal to create new assistant ranks, i.e. Assistant Marine Officer ("AMO") and Assistant Surveyor of Ships ("ASoS"), for MO and SoS grades to attract younger candidates who were not yet fully qualified for entry at the MO and SoS ranks to join MD, and to provide designated training programmes to groom them to take up the duties of the professional ranks in due course. MD also proposed that the proposed assistant ranks should form a combined establishment of "AMO/MO" and "ASoS/SoS" to provide flexibility for MD to conduct recruitment at both the assistant and professional ranks.

40. D of Marine supplemented that the assistant rank officers were expected to meet the professional standard equivalent to CoC Class 1

## Action

qualification upon successful completion of the designated training and attain the required level of competency for undertaking the duties of the MO and SoS grades. Arrangements had also been made for the assistant rank officers to be on attachment to the shipping companies and classification societies for a short time. The training programmes would last for about four years. They would be qualified for advancement to the MO/SoS rank through a promotion step subject to meeting other necessary requirements set by the appointment authority. MD would at the same time continue with the existing arrangements of direct recruitment of MOs and SoSs.

### New assistant ranks of MO and SoS

41. Noting the findings of the GSR for the MO and SoS grades by the Commission and the support of two staff associations of the MO and SoS grades respectively for the recommendations of the Commission, the Deputy Chairman expressed the support on behalf of the Civic Party for the relevant recommendations. He further suggested that MD should review the effectiveness of the proposal to create the new assistant ranks in one to two years after its implementation, and further consider the introduction of cadetship or trainee programmes to address the recruitment difficulties of the two grades.

42. D of Marine advised that the proposal to create the new assistant ranks was made in consultation with the serving MOs and SoSs, relevant tertiary education institutions, shipping companies and classification societies. If this proposal was considered not sufficiently effective in addressing MD's manpower shortage problem, MD was open to other suggestions in this regard.

43. In reply to the Deputy Chairman's enquiry about the reasons to set a lower proposed starting pay for ASoS(Ship) (MPS point 16) than that of ASoS(Engineer & Ship) and ASoS(Nautical) (MPS point 19), D of Marine explained that while the proposed entry requirement for ASoS(Engineer & Ship) and ASoS(Nautical) included a degree qualification and the passing of the CoC Class 3 examination, the proposed entry requirement for ASoS(Ship) only included a degree in a relevant discipline. As such, the starting pay was lower for ASoS(Ship).

### Post-corporate membership experience requirement of SoS(Ship)

44. Mr HO Kai-ming noted that one of the recommendations made by the Commission was to reduce the post-corporate membership

## Action

experience requirement of SoS(Ship) from four to two years. In this regard, he enquired how MD would ensure SoS(Ship) possessed the required experience to perform its professional duties, in particular those concerning vessel safety.

45. D of Marine explained that the supply of candidates for SoS(Ship) had been very limited due to the absence of a degree programme in naval architecture in Hong Kong, which was the relevant qualification required for this post, and the number of overseas universities offering such degree course was on the decline. In addition, there were no longer any major shipyards in Hong Kong for students to accumulate the required working experience. In view of the severe recruitment difficulties of SoS(Ship), lowering the post-corporate membership experience requirement could be a way to attract more candidates at an early stage of their career to apply for the post. D of Marine further assured members that on-the-job coaching from experienced and senior SoSs would be provided to new recruits to ensure their competency for undertaking their professional duties.

## Safety survey of vessels

46. In reply to Dr CHIANG Lai-wan's enquiry about the number of qualified MOs and SoSs both inside and outside the Government and the number of vessels registered in Hong Kong, D of Marine advised that there were about 60 MO and 60 SoS posts in MD together with 17 directorate officers who possessed professional qualifications. Acting Deputy Director of Marine supplemented that according to his understanding, about 300 members had been registered under the relevant discipline with the Hong Kong Institution of Engineers and about 50 to 100 of them were active members. He further advised that more than 2 500 vessels were on the Hong Kong Shipping Register and nine classification societies were authorized by MD to carry out the certification duties of these vessels. For local vessels, the list of those authorized surveyors under the relevant Ordinance to carry out works on ship inspection and surveying could be found on the MD's Website.

47. Referring to some complaints from local vessel owners on the charging of unreasonable price for conducting safety survey and the quality of services provided by some authorized surveyors, Dr CHIANG Lai-wan opined that the Administration should step up measures to ensure that the prices charged and the service offered by the authorized surveyors should be reasonable and up to standard. Acting Deputy Director of Marine noted Dr CHIANG's view and advised that MD would look into this matter.

Action

Conclusion

48. The Chairman concluded that members supported in principle the recommendations of the GSR for MO and SoS grades of MD conducted by the Commission.

**VI. Any other business**

49. In view of the early ending of this meeting, the Deputy Chairman requested the Chairman to consider arranging three discussion items in each regular Panel meetings in the future. The Chairman said that he would consider this request in consultation with the Administration and the Clerk.

50. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:22 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
23 February 2018