

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. CB(4)1545/17-18  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB4/PL/TP/1

**Panel on Transport**

**Minutes of meeting held on  
Friday, 19 January 2018, at 10:00 am  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon CHAN Chun-ying  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

**Members absent** : Hon Mrs IP LAU Suk-ye, Regina, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP

**Public Officers  
attending** : **Agenda item IV**

Mr Frank CHAN, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Mable CHAN, JP  
Commissioner for Transport

Mr Kevin CHOI, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing  
(Transport) 2

Mr Philip HAR  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport)4

Miss Rosalind CHEUNG  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Development  
(Harbour)

Ms Stella LEE  
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/  
Management and Paratransit

Mr Dave HO  
Assistant Director of Environmental Protection  
(Air Policy)

Mr Louis KAU  
District Planning Officer/Hong Kong  
Planning Department

**Agenda item V**

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing  
(Transport)1

Ms Judy CHUNG Sui-kei  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport) 5

Mr WONG Wai-man, JP  
Project Manager (North)  
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Zorro YUEN Tat-yung  
Chief Engineer / N2  
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Ricky HO Wai-kee  
Chief Traffic Engineer / NTE  
Transport Department

Mr. SHEA Tin-cheung  
Chief Engineer / Transport Planning  
Transport Department

**Agenda item VI**

Dr Raymond SO, BBS, JP  
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Ivy LAW, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Transport & Housing  
(Transport) 3

Ms Stella LEE  
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/  
Management and Paratransit

Mr Samson LAM  
Assistant Commissioner for Transport / Planning

Mr LEE Che-kit  
Chief Engineer / Project

Mr Ken WONG  
Chief Transport Officer/ Transport Facilities  
Management

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Sophie LAU  
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

**Staff in attendance :** Miss Joyce CHING  
Senior Council Secretary (4)2

Ms Jacqueline LAW  
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM  
Legislative Assistant (4)2

---

Action

**I. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**

LC Paper No. CB(4)224/17-18(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon Claudia MO requesting to discuss the progress of the matters relating to boundary crossing facilities at West

Kowloon Station of the  
Guangzhou-Shenzhen-H  
ong Kong Express Rail  
Link

- LC Paper No. CB(4)225/17-18(01) - Administration's response to the joint letter from Hon OR Chong-sing and Hon CHAN Han-pan on the shortage of parking space in Hong Kong
- LC Paper No. CB(4)324/17-18(01) - Joint letter from Hon Charles Peter MOK and Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho on the recommendation on regulation of personalized point-to-point transport service (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(4)356/17-18(01) - Letter from Hon Michael TIEN requesting to discuss the proposed toll schemes for the Main Bridge of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(4)357/17-18(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon LAM Cheuk-ting on the incident at Lantau Link causing traffic congestion on 17 October 2017
- LC Paper No. CB(4)374/17-18(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon LAM Cheuk-ting on the incident at Tuen Mun-Chek Lap Kok Link

under the Hong  
Kong-Zhuhai-Macao  
Bridge Project

- LC Paper No. CB(4)380/17-18(01) - Administration's response to the joint letter from Hon Charles Peter MOK and Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho on the recommendation on regulation of personalized point-to-point transport service
- LC Paper No. CB(4)421/17-18(01) - Joint letter from Hon LAM Cheuk-ting and Hon HUI Chi-fung requesting to hold a joint meeting with the Panel on Environmental Affairs of the Legislative Council to discuss the policy relating to electric vehicles (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(4)435/17-18(01) - Letter from Hon Claudia MO requesting to discuss the progress of the Co-location arrangement (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(4)438/17-18(01) - Joint letter from Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho, Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki and Hon Tanya CHAN requesting to discuss the issues relating to the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Project (Chinese version only)

- LC Paper No. CB(4)438/17-18(02) - Joint letter from Hon CHU Hoi-dick, Hon Charles Peter MOK and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung requesting to discuss the issues relating to the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Project (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(4)450/17-18(01) - Letter from Hon CHAN Han-pan requesting to discuss the issues relating to the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Project (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(4)493/17-18(01) - Letter dated 15 January 2018 from Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan on withdrawal of membership (Chinese version only)

Members noted the above papers issued since the last meeting.

2. Referring to the joint letter from Hon LAM Cheuk-ting and Hon HUI Chi-fung requesting to hold a joint meeting with the Panel on Environmental Affairs ("EA") of the Legislative Council to discuss the policy relating to electric vehicles (LC Paper No. CB(4)421/17-18(01)), the Chairman advised members that he had discussed with the Chairman of the Panel on EA on the matter. He then sought members' view of whether a joint meeting should be held to discuss the policy relating to electric vehicles. The Chairman put the matter to vote. He declared that majority of the members voted against the arrangement of the proposed joint meeting.

## II. Items for discussion at the next meeting

LC Paper No. CB(4)445/17-18(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(4)445/17-18(02) - List of follow-up actions

3. Referring to the joint letter from Hon Tanya CHAN, Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho, Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki and Hon Alvin YEUNG requesting for information on the operating agreement and the latest operational details of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("the Joint Letter"), Ms Tanya CHAN requested to discuss the above matter at the next regular meeting to be held in February 2018. Ms Claudia MO also requested to discuss the matters relating to the progress of the co-location arrangement. The Chairman advised that written response from the Administration on the above matters was still pending. Subject to the response from the Administration, the above proposal of adding agenda items for the February meeting would be decided.

*(post-meeting note: The Joint Letter was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(4)515/17-18(01) to members on 22 January 2018 and the Chinese version and English version of the Administration's response to this letter was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(4)592/17-18(01) on 9 February 2018 and 14 February 2018 respectively).*

4. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting to be held on 23 February 2018 and advance the meeting to start at 10:00 am to allow more time for discussion–

- (a) 7822TH – Cross Bay Link, Tseung Kwan O – construction
- (b) Proposed creation of one permanent Principal Transport Officer post in Management and Paratransit Branch, one permanent Principal Transport Officer post in New Territories Regional Office and one permanent Chief Engineer post in Technical Services Branch of the Transport Department; and
- (c) Biennial review on the need to issue new Private Driving Instructors' licences ("PDI licences").



(*post-meeting note*: The meeting time of regular meeting scheduled for 23 February 2018 was subsequently changed to 8:30 to 11:00 am)

### III. Matters arising from the special meeting on 11 December 2017

LC Paper No. CB(4)1069/16-17(01) - Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon LUK Chung-hung

LC Paper No. CB(4)1069/16-17(02) Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon LAU Kwok-fan

LC Paper No. CB(4)1069/16-17(03) Wording of a motion to be moved by Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun

#### Motions

5. The Chairman said that three motions relating to "Parking Policy" raised at the meeting on 19 May 2017 were not dealt with at that meeting and a subsequent meeting (i.e. the special meeting on 11 December 2017) due to insufficient time.

6. The Chairman then referred members to the following motion moved by Mr LUK Chung-hung:

"鑒於社區的泊車位長期不足，因而令私家車及商用車輛車位短缺，違例泊車的狀況嚴重，本會要求當局盡快推行商用車輛泊車需要優先的泊車政策，同時從多方面紓緩泊私家車及商用車輛車位不足的狀況，當中包括在賣地條款內要求發展商必需根據《香港規劃標準與準則》提供泊車位、更新《香港規劃標準與準則》各類發展類別的泊車位比例，以配合本港人口及經濟、生活習慣的改變、同時在新發展區重新興建多層公眾停車場、並於新建的公共設施提供足夠泊車設施。"

(Translation)

"Given the long-standing inadequacy of parking spaces in the community and its resultant shortage of parking spaces for private cars and commercial vehicles as well as serious illegal parking

situation, this Panel requests the Administration to expeditiously implement a parking policy of according priority to meeting the parking needs of commercial vehicles and at the same time ease the shortage of parking spaces for private cars and commercial vehicles in various aspects, including requiring developers to provide parking spaces in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG") in the conditions of land sale; updating the proportions of parking spaces for various types of development in HKPSG to cater for changes in the population and economy of Hong Kong as well as the living habits of Hong Kong people; building new multi-storey public car parks in new development areas; and providing sufficient parking facilities in newly completed public facilities."

7. The Chairman put the motion to vote. A total of 13 members voted for the motion, none voted against it and none abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

8. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr LAU Kwok-fan:

"鑒於政府未能回應駕駛者對增設泊車位供應的訴求，本會促請政府：

- (一) 充分使用政府多層停車場，包括採取彈性泊車收費，於日間的非繁忙時段提供折扣收費，以及將現行政府多層停車場部份樓層改為營業車位專用區；
- (二) 善用政府建築物空地，於非辦公時間開放為公眾停車場；
- (三) 提供更多短期租約停車場，並加入必須停泊指定百分比的大型或中型營業車作為條款；
- (四) 訂立替代停車場設施原則，規定當局在拆卸或收回停車場設施前，必須在受影響停車場附近設立足夠的臨時泊車措施；
- (五) 引入簡易及方便的智能泊車信息系統，為市民提供全港政府及商廈停車場泊位的實時資訊；

- (六) 善用公共空間發展另類停車場，例如天橋底或附近空地等發展停車場；
- (七) 就各類車位的泊車位供求情況作定期調查，並分區檢視，以便更有效地完善各區的泊車位供求情況；
- (八) 檢討《香港規劃標準與準則》內有關泊車位的供應標準，研究將新界區新建屋苑的車位比例放寬；及
- (九) 結合嶄新科技和向高空發展引入新穎泊車系統，使有限的空間可同時容納更多車輛。”

(Translation)

"Given that the Government has failed to respond to drivers' demand for the provision of additional parking spaces, this Panel urges the Government to:

- (1) make full use of government multi-storey car parks, including adopting a flexible parking fee system to provide concessionary rates for day-time non-peak-hour parking, and converting some floors of the existing government multi-storey car parks into dedicated parking areas for commercial vehicles;
- (2) optimize the use of open spaces in government buildings by opening them up for use as public car parks during non-office hours;
- (3) provide more short-term tenancy car parks and include tenancy terms to stipulate a specified percentage of parking spaces for the use of large or medium commercial vehicles;
- (4) introduce the principle of replacement parking facility under which the authorities are required to provide sufficient temporary parking facilities in the vicinity of the affected car park before demolishing or resuming any car parking facility;
- (5) introduce a user-friendly and convenient smart parking information system and to provide to the public real-time information on parking spaces in government and commercial buildings across the territory;

- (6) optimize the use of public spaces for developing alternative car parks, such as utilizing spaces under flyovers or open ground in the vicinity for developing car parks;
- (7) conduct regular surveys on the demand and supply of parking spaces for various types of vehicles so as to ameliorate the demand and supply of parking spaces in various districts in a more effective way;
- (8) review the standards for parking space provision in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, and consider relaxing the parking space ratio for newly developed housing estates in the New Territories; and
- (9) introduce innovative parking systems by applying new technologies together with high-rise development concept so that limited space can be used to accommodate more vehicles at a time."

9. The Chairman put the motion to vote. A total of 14 members voted for the motion, none members voted against it and none abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

10. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr Michael TIEN:

"本委員會要求當局增加泊車轉乘設施，並提供誘因鼓勵駕駛人士泊車於大型交通以及鐵路轉運站，轉用集體運輸出入繁忙地段。"

(Translation)

"This Panel requests the Administration to provide additional park-and-ride facilities and offer incentives to encourage motorists to park their vehicles at major transport interchanges and railway interchanges and switch to public transport means for commuting to and from busy areas."

11. The Chairman put the motion to vote. A total of 14 members voted for the motion, three members voted against it and none abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

*(post-meeting note:* The Chinese version and English version of the Administration's response to the two motions moved by Hon LUK Chung-hung and Hon LAU Kwok-fan was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(4)589/17-18(01) to members on 8 February 2018 and 15 February 2018 respectively; and the Chinese version of the Administration's response to the motion moved by Hon Michael TIEN was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(4)621/17-18(01) on 15 February 2018 ).

#### **IV. New Franchise For The "Star" Ferry Company, Limited**

LC Paper No. CB(4)445/17-18(03) - Administration's paper on New Franchise For The "Star" Ferry Company, Limited

LC Paper No. CB(4)445/17-18(04) Paper on franchised ferry services in Hong Kong prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief)

#### Declaration of Interest

12. The Chairman declared that he was the director of The Star Ferry Company, Limited ("SF"). He then sought members' view on whether the discussion of the item on "New Franchise For The "Star" Ferry Company, Limited " should be chaired by the Deputy Chairman. Members agreed.

#### Briefing by the Administration

13. Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") briefed members on the findings of the public consultation and the progress of the discussion with SF on the terms of a new franchise. Members noted that the current franchise of SF for operating two ferry routes (i.e. "Central – Tsim Sha Tsui" and "Wan Chai – Tsim Sha Tsui" routes) would expire on 31 March 2018 and that SF had submitted to the Administration an application for extension of its franchise for 15 years upon the expiry. Members also noted that the new initiatives to be undertaken by SF under its new franchise would include fare concessions, service quality

enhancement, further environmental enhancement and protection and harbourfront enhancement.

## Discussion

### *The application of a new franchise*

14. Mr CHAN Chun-ying, Ms Claudia MO, Mr LO Wai-kwok, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr LAU Kwok-fan and Mr Tommy CHEUNG (on behalf of Liberal Party) expressed support of the proposed grant of a new franchise to SF. Mr CHAN Chun-ying, Mr LO Wai-kwok, Mr YIU Si-wing, Mr LAU Kwok-fan, Mr Tommy CHEUNG and Dr CHENG Chung-tai opined that the performance of SF had been generally satisfactory. Ms Claudia MO and Mr LAU Kwok-fan also pointed that SF was part of Hong Kong's heritage and SF ride had also been a tourist attraction in Hong Kong.

15. Noting the period of the new franchise of SF was proposed to be 15 years while the licence period for other ferry services routes was only three years at maximum, Mr CHAN Chun-ying asked about the reasons for adopting difference standards when granting the above mentioned licence and franchise periods.

16. STH advised that when considering the franchise period, consideration would be given to the overall service quality of the operator, including public feedback and assessment by the Administration on SF's performance in implementation of environment improvement measures as well as commitment in improving remuneration and work conditions of its staff. The results of the surveys conducted by the Administration in 2016-17 had shown that the service of SF was generally satisfactory. The proposed grant of a new franchise to SF for 15 years was considered appropriate to enable SF to recover its investment over a longer period.

17. Mr CHAN Han-pan concurred that the proposed extension of SF's franchise for 15 years was appropriate from the operator's point of view and thus he opined that consideration should be given to granting other ferry operators licences of longer period.

18. Ms Claudia MO enquired whether there would be any exit clause for both sides under the new franchise in case any problems or disputes arose during the franchise period of 15 years.

19. STH clarified that the proposed grant of franchise period for 15 years was the maximum period as set out under the Ferry Service Ordinance (Cap. 104) and it would be subject to the approval by Chief Executive-in-Council. Under the terms and conditions of the franchise, there would be an exit clause with regard to the right of the Administration to terminate the franchise of SF should the performance of its service was unsatisfactory. There would also be mechanism to allow SF to terminate the service under certain circumstances and there would be terms and conditions covering the arrangement for unforeseeable circumstances and dispute resolution.

*Harbourfront enhancement*

20. Dr CHENG Chung-tai noted that the Administration would seek to explore whether and how restrictions should be relaxed to allow SF to make better use of the areas of Central and Wan Chai Piers. In relation to sub-letting of premises and management rights of the above mentioned areas, Dr CHENG raised concern about any possible implication on the use of public space and how the Administration would ensure the public's right would be protected.

21. STH replied that public interest would be the prime concern in taking forward any matter relating to the provision of public services. With regard to the public space in the above mentioned areas, the Administration had conducted site visits to review the situation and considered that there was room for improvement in relation to its management. STH emphasized that the proposed relaxation of restrictions being discussed under the term of new franchise was only an initial plan. In implementing the plan, all the legal and other requirements under the existing mechanism would still have to be fulfilled by SF. Among others, planning permission from the Town Planning Board might be required with regard to changes in land use and/or existing use rights.

22. Mr Tommy CHEUNG expressed that the area between Central Piers No. 7 and No. 8 should be better utilized by SF and he sought clarification on whether the SF would be allowed to make use of the abovementioned area for commercial activities, such as for food and beverage service. STH advised that the Administration would explore how restrictions should be relaxed to allow SF to make better use of areas of the Central Pier with more flexibility, including the ground floor area between Central Piers No. 7 and No. 8. However, the matters relating to change of land use had to be discussed at the Harbourfront Commission

and subject to the planning permission from the Town Planning Board.

23. Mr CHAN Han-pan sought further elaboration on how the Administration would take forward the matters relating to the abovementioned relaxation of restrictions. The Commissioner for Transport advised that the Transport Department would take the initiative to collaborate with relevant departments to explore with SF on how the first floor of the Central Terminal Building could be better utilized with a view to revitalizing and beautifying the harbourfront. Moreover, the management responsibilities of the ground floor of the Central Terminal Building would be taken up by the SF during the new franchise period.

24. Noting that SF would be required to take up additional management responsibilities of the ground floor of the Central Terminal Building and the Observation Deck of the Wan Chai Ferry Pier during the new franchise period, Mr CHAN Chun-ying was concerned whether extra resources would be deployed for the above purpose. STH clarified that the additional responsibilities aimed at better utilization of the area concerned.

25. Ms Tanya CHAN suggested that SF should explore the feasibility of the provision of affordable food and beverage at the harbourfront. She expressed that the food stalls selling skewers and beer at Discovery Bay Pier was a good model for reference.

*Environmental enhancement and fare regulation*

26. In response to Mr LEUNG Che-cheung's enquiry about the arrangement for retrofitting of the diesel engine, Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Air Policy) explained that SF had retrofitted the diesel engine of a ferry serving non-franchised ferry routes with an energy saving and low emission diesel-electric propulsion system, with a view to reducing the emission of air pollutants and lowering the ferry's fuel consumption. Based on the preliminary data collected from the trial of the above mentioned system so far, fuel consumption had been reduced by about 8% and the emission of major air pollutants had also been reduced, e.g. around 75% reduction of dark smoke intensity.

27. Responding to Mr LEUNG Che-cheung's enquiry about fare regulation, STH advised that application for fare increases would have to be examined by the Administration and approved by Chief Executive-in-Council. Moreover, SF undertook that it would endeavor to keep its fare affordable throughout the new franchise period as far as



possible.

28. Having noted that a substantial amount was expected to be spent on hardware and for the retrofitting of ferries, Mr YIU Si-wing asked whether the cost for such investment would have any implication on the fare. Ms Tanya CHAN also noted that under the terms of the new franchise, SF would continue to invest in new green technology and that subsidy could be obtained from the Pilot Green Transport Fund ("the Fund") for the said purpose. Ms CHAN then asked about how retrofitting work for the diesel engines would be funded apart from obtaining the above subsidy.

29. STH advised that it was understood that the annual profit of SF was about \$4 million and that the amount would be spent on green technology and retrofitting of the diesel engines of the ferries. SF had committed that, so long as its financial position permitted, with due considerations given to prevailing technological standards, the company would retrofit the entire franchised ferry fleet, by phases, within the next franchise period with a view to reducing emission of pollutants. STH assured that application for fare increases by SF was subject to scrutiny by the Administration. STH supplemented that, apart from obtaining subsidy from the Fund, additional non-fare box revenue could also be used for subsidizing the above investment.

30. Mr LAU Kwok-fan noted that the total cost of retrofitting the eight ferries in the existing fleet would be \$56 million and that SF was only applying a subsidy of some \$6 million from the Fund for the time being. Mr POON Siu-ping also noted the same. Mr LAU thus queried that the subsidy from the Fund together with the fare box revenue would not be sufficient for covering the cost and he asked the Administration to consider increasing the subsidy amount. Mr POON Siu-ping also sought clarification on whether the Administration would provide additional subsidy and he was concerned about whether the investment on retrofitting by SF would affect the percentage of SF's expenditure on staff remuneration. Mr LAU Kwok-fan also suggested the Administration to explore with SF the means to increase non-fare box revenue by better utilization of the floor space of Central Pier.

31. STH clarified that SF had committed to retrofit the ferries by batches, say with one or two ferries per year, subject to the financial viability of the Company. Moreover, the maximum amount of subsidy from the Fund for each company would be \$12 million. STH also advised that the daily patronage of SF was about 50 000, i.e. an annual

patronage of about 19 million. STH reiterated that SF's operation and investment could also be cross-subsidized by non-fare box revenue.

32. Mr CHAN Han-pan also opined that the investment on the retrofitting, with a total amount of \$56 million for eight ferries, was on the high side given that the annual profit of SF was around \$4 million, i.e. about a total of \$60 million for the 15 years of franchise period. In the light of this, he asked whether the Administration would provide other initiatives, such as tax exemption, to subsidize SF's investment.

33. In response, STH advised that the Administration always allowed the SF to sub-let premise for generation of non-fare box revenue to cross-subsidize the franchised ferry service. STH supplemented that the rental revenue from January to October 2017 was about \$28.66 million.

34. Mr CHAN Chun-ying suggested SF to work with the Hong Kong Tourism Board ("HKTB") to promote tourism of Hong Kong via its ferry service and that the revenue generated from the publicity programmes should be utilized for subsidizing the retrofitting works.

*Long-term waterborne transport policy and ferry service expansion*

35. Pointing out the traffic congestion problem at the existing cross-harbour tunnels, Mr LO Wai-kwok opined that the Administration should conduct a long term review on waterborne transport policy with a view to easing the abovementioned situation.

36. Mr HO Kai-ming echoed with Mr LO Wai-kwok's view of mapping out a long term waterborne transport policy and he suggested the Administration to take the initiative to encourage the operation of more ferry routes, in particular, harbour cruise plying to and from Kwun Tong and around the Kowloon East area. Mr LAU kwok-fan also expressed that the Administration should explore the operation of more ferry routes for harbour crossing.

37. Dr Helena WONG also expressed that there were currently many abandoned piers in Hong Kong and the Administration should take the initiative to encourage SF to operate new ferry routes, especially in the West Kowloon district, to tie in with its recent development. STH explained that the current discussion with SF concerned the existing two franchised ferry routes being operated by SF and that separate tendering process had to be taken for the operation of other new ferry routes.

Admin

38. The Administration was requested to provide details on how the Administration would take forward the suggestion of increasing in-harbour ferry routes, such as the "Hung Hom - Wai Chai" route and other new ferry routes connecting new development areas such as West Kowloon Cultural District and Kai Tak Development area.

*Staff remuneration and training*

39. Highlighting the aging problem of sailors, Mr HO Kai-ming suggested that the current remuneration package of sailors was not attractive enough and thus SF and the Administration should work together to provide incentive and better career path to attract young people to join the local ferry industry. Moreover, staff training should be enhanced to equip staff with essential skills. Mr YIU Si-wing also expressed concern over the aging problem of SF staff.

40. STH acknowledged the staff situation mentioned above and advised that the Administration had been discussing with SF on its commitment to review staff remuneration and provide relevant on-the-job-training during the new franchise period. Moreover, vocational training on maritime services was provided by the Vocational Training Council.

41. Mr POON Siu-ping was concerned how the Administration could ensure appropriate level of staff remuneration would be provided by SF during the new franchise period, given that staff remuneration expenses accounted for over 60% of the overall SF expenditure in 2016.

42. STH advised that the Administration had the data with regard to the remuneration package of SF staff and would collect views from staff on matters relating to their remuneration as and when appropriate. Under normal circumstances, it would be up to the employer and employee to agree on the terms of employment.

*Other suggested improvements*

43. Ms Tanya CHAN suggested the Administration to explore with SF on the provision of baby care facilities, improvement of facilities in the toilet and enhancement of entry gates arrangement so as to better divert the passenger flow at the entrance. Moreover, the space in the waiting area should be better utilized. STH noted the above suggestion and would discuss with SF the related matters.

Admin 44. STH undertook to provide written response to Mr HO Kai-ming's request for SF's reasons for not allowing carriage of bicycle on the "Central –Tsim Sha Tsui" route while such restriction was not imposed by other ferry operators and to the suggestion of allowing bicycle carriage on the same route.

*(post-meeting note: The Chinese version of the Administration's response to the details requested in paragraphs 38 and 44 was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)760/17-18(01) on 16 March 2018).*

**V. 7861TH-2 – Widening of Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section) – construction**

LC Paper No. CB(4)445/17-18(05) - Administration's paper on 861TH – Widening of Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section)

LC Paper No. CB(4)445/17-18(06) - Paper on widening of Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section) prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Background brief)

Briefing by the Administration

45. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)1 ("DSTH(T)1") briefed members on the funding application for upgrading 861TH "Widening of Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section)" ("the Project") to Category A at an estimated cost of \$2,739.7 million in money-of-the-day prices.

46. With the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)514/17-18(01)), Chief Engineer/ N2 of Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD") then explained to members the justifications for the Project, the scope and nature of the Project as well as its implementation timetable.

47. Members noted the Administration's plan to commence the construction works in the second quarter of 2018 for completion in the second half of 2023, subject to the funding approval by the Finance Committee ("FC") in this legislative year.

### Discussion

#### *Works schedule*

48. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting, Dr LO Wai-kwok, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Mr LAU Kwok-fan, Mr Wilson OR and Mr CHAN Hak-kan supported the funding application and expressed concern over the traffic congestion at Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section), especially during peak hours. They urged for early implementation of the Project.

49. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting urged the Administration to consider ways to expedite the Project since the traffic congestion problem of the relevant road section had already existed for many years and that additional traffic would be generated by the future population growth in the North District.

50. Mr Wilson OR also expressed that the targeted completion date of the Project (i.e. 2023) was too late. He then suggested the Administration to explore ways to proceed with different phases of the construction works in parallel. Mr CHAN Hak-kan said that the Sha Tin Rural Committee Road interchange was currently a traffic bottleneck and he urged the Administration to commence the works as soon as practicable.

51. DSTH(T)1 said that members' concern over early implementation of the Project was understood. She advised that CEDD had planned to initiate parallel tendering for the contract in order to start the construction works as soon as possible. However, the construction contract would only be awarded after obtaining funding approval from FC. Project Manager (North) of CEDD advised that the modification of Sha Tin Rural Committee Road interchange would be a major part of the works. Currently, this section of Tai Po Road was already busy. During the construction period, the existing dual two-lane carriageway had to be maintained and thus the above mentioned modification work had to be done in nine phases. Together with the preparatory work and demolition work as well as the restoration work, there would be a total of 16 work phases. The Administration would strive to compress the work phases as far as practicable and closely work with the contractor(s) on the streamlining of work procedures. Project Manager (North) of CEDD

supplemented that, during the tender invitation, contractors would be invited to come up with better designs with a view to shortening the construction period.

*Environmental and traffic impact of the Project*

52. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting expressed that mitigation measures should be taken to minimize the noise impact and air pollution caused to the nearby residents by the road widening works. Mr LAU Kwok-fan also expressed concern about the impact on traffic flow during the construction period of the Project and asked about the measures to be taken to prevent the congestion problem from worsening. Mr CHAN Hak-kan also expressed grave concern about the contingency arrangement, especially during serious accident and/or emergency situation during the construction period.

53. DSTH(T)1 advised that suitable measures would be taken to mitigate the impact of the road widening works. Project Manager (North) of CEDD supplemented that before work commencement, a local liaison group with the representatives from the CEDD, the supervisors of the site, contractors and local residents, would be set up for dissemination of information about the Project and collection of views.

54. Project Manager (North) of CEDD advised that the contractor would be required to maintain the existing carriageway, i.e. the dual two-lane carriageway, during the construction period. Any road diversion plan and temporary road closure due to the works would be subject to the approval of the Transport Department ("TD") and the Police. The Administration would also require the contractor to include contingency plan along with any plan of road diversion and/ or closure so as to ensure smooth traffic flow during the construction period.

55. Mr Michael TIEN enquired about the reason for not installing full enclosure noise barrier along Tai Po Road during the construction to better mitigate the noise impact. Project Manager (North) of CEDD advised that only semi enclosure noise barrier could be installed due to technical constraints. Project Manager (North) of CEDD supplemented that in order to install full enclosure noise barrier, a number of fire service requirements such as ventilation installation had to be fulfilled under the Code of Practice for Minimum Fire Service Installations and Equipment. However, no suitable location could be identified for the above mentioned installation.

56. Mr LAU Kwok-fan requested the Administration to include volume/capacity ratio at Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section) before and during the construction work in its proposal for submission to the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC"). Mr CHAN Hak-kan requested the Administration to include the above mentioned contingency plan in the proposal for submission to PWSC and FC.

57. Dr LO Wai-kwok urged the Administration to plan for the preservation of roadside trees along Tai Po Road, in particular, the white Melaleuca.

*Other measures to alleviate traffic congestion of North East New Territories*

58. Dr LO Wai-kwok asked about the long-term plan to alleviate traffic congestion of North East New Territories. DSTH(T)1 advised that CEDD had reported to the Sha Tin District Council ("STDC") on 9 January 2018 on the results of the traffic review on major roads in Sha Tin and the proposed alignment of the T4 Trunk Road. Since STDC members generally expressed support for the T4 project, CEDD would proceed to carry out a detailed investigation study on T4 in order to take forward the project as one of the medium-term measures. To alleviate traffic congestion of North East New Territories, an overall review would be included under the future "Strategic Studies on Railways and Major Roads beyond 2030" ("the RMR 2030+ Studies") with a view to working out long-term measures.

59. Mr CHAN Han-pan opined that the widening works of the Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section) would not be a long term solution to alleviate traffic congestion because this road section might be operated beyond its capacity a few years after completion of the widening works. Mr Wilson OR, Mr LAU Kwok-fan and CHAN Hak-kan expressed similar views.

60. Chief Traffic Engineer / NTE of TD advised that, upon the completion of the Project, the volume/capacity ratio during the peak hours at Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section) in 2026 was anticipated to be around 1, which indicated a manageable degree of congestion. TD and other relevant departments would closely monitor the situation and take forward measures to ease traffic congestion as appropriate.

61. Mr CHAN Han-pan suggested and Mr Wilson OR and Mr LAU Kwok-fan concurred that the Administration should work out other means

to solve the congestion problem, for instance, the construction of a Shatin Bypass and implementation of other major road projects. He further urged the Administration to expedite the planning and implementation of the work under the RMR 2030+ Studies.

62. DSTH(T)1 advised that the Administration was open to all other proposed options. The Administration would strive to commence the work of the RMR 2030+ Studies as soon as practicable. She supplemented that, subject to funding approval, the RMR 2030+ Studies might commence in 2018. In the interim, the Administration would take forward the widening works of Tai Po Road and the T4 Trunk Road project as the medium-term measures.

63. DSTH(T)1 agreed to provide a written response on whether consideration would be given to setting up a Task Force to review the traffic conditions of all the major roads in Hong Kong with a view to alleviating traffic congestion and improving the road network; and to recommend corresponding major road projects or road improvement measures.

*(post-meeting note: The Administration's response was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)849/17-18(01)) on 29 March 2018.)*

### Conclusion

64. The Chairman sought members' views on the funding application of the Project. Members indicated support to the application.

65. In summing up, the Chairman urged the Administration to expedite the works of the Project and to take forward the work of different phases in parallel. Moreover, the Administration should expedite the work under the RMR 2030+ Studies and explore other long-term plans to ease the traffic congestion in the North East and North West New Territories.

## **VI. Implementation of a new generation of on-street parking meter system**

LC Paper No. CB(4)392/17-18(01) - Administration's paper on New Generation of Parking Meter System



## Briefing by the Administration

### Discussion

66. Ms Claudia MO, Mr CHAN Hak-kan, Mr LO Wai-kwok, Mr Michael TIEN, Mr Charles Peter MOK and Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed support for the Administration's plan to install a new generation of parking meters. However, Mr CHAN Hak-kan, Mr LAU Kwok-fan, Mr LO Wai-kwok, Mr Charles Peter MOK and Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed their strong views against the Administration's proposed upward adjustment of the maximum fee for metered parking spaces and Mr Michael TIEN also expressed reservation on the proposed fee adjustment.

### *Remote payment through mobile application*

67. Ms Claudia MO expressed support for the Administration's plan to include a "parking meter mobile application" and the proposed arrangement which allowed motorist to purchase up to a total of two sessions of the "longest parking period". However, she suggested the Administration to review the "longest parking period" for on-street parking spaces. Currently, the "longest parking period" allowed for each transaction was fixed at 30 minutes, 1 hour or 2 hours. Ms MO suggested to unify the "longest parking period" by fixing it at 2 hours.

68. Under Secretary for Transport and Housing ("USTH") clarified that under the existing legislation, any person could park a vehicle in a parking space for a continuous period of not more than 24 hours. The proposed payment arrangement through mobile application aimed at offering convenience to motorists. Moreover, the new parking meter system would be connected to the backend central system in real time through wireless networks. The data collected via the parking meters could be used for data analysis to facilitate traffic management.

69. While supporting the Administration's plan to include the above mentioned mobile application, Mr Michael TIEN objected to the proposed remote payment arrangement of allowing a motorist to purchase up to a total of two sessions of the "longest parking period". Mr TIEN expressed that, in effect, the "longest parking period" would become 4 hours and that would in turn encourage prolonged parking.

70. The Chairman expressed a contrary view with regard to the

proposed arrangement of remote payment. The Chairman opined that the crux of the issue lied with the current legislation, which in a way allowed a motorist to park a vehicle in a parking space for a continuous period of 24 hours. In the light of this, the Administration should review the current legislation in this regard in order to deter prolonged parking. Mr CHAN Han-pan pointed out that on-street parking spaces were often abused for commercial use. Sharing the Chairman's view, Mr CHAN said that the Administration should plug the loophole of the above legislation.

71. Mr Charles Peter MOK shared the Chairman's view and opined that since the new generation of parking meter would be equipped with the function to facilitate remote payment, it should be utilized for payment of an additional session in order to offer convenience to motorists. Noting that the data collected via the parking meters would include real-time data on vacancy of parking space, Mr MOK said that the dissemination of the above mentioned information could help motorists in finding vacant parking spaces more quickly thereby helping to relieve traffic congestion caused by strolling vehicles in search of parking spaces. Mr MOK also urged the Administration to explore ways to open up the data collected via the new parking meter system. Moreover, information collected should also be used to facilitate enforcement actions against illegal parking.

*Concern over the proposed upward adjustment of maximum fee for parking meters*

72. Mr CHAN Hak-kan expressed strong views on the proposed upward adjustment of maximum fee for use of metered parking spaces because private car park operators would follow suit thereby causing a vicious cycle of increase in parking fee.

73. Sharing Mr CHAN Hak-kan's view, Mr Charles Peter MOK pointed out that, when the Administration proposed the increase in fixed penalty charges for congestion-related traffic offences, members had opposed to the raising of the level of fines for illegal parking. Mr MOK further said that the proposed increase in the maximum fee for parking meters was very unreasonable. Moreover, even if the proposed increase was considered inevitable by the Administration, the maximum fee should be set at no more than \$3 per 15 minutes.

74. USTH advised that the maximum fee for use of on-street metered parking spaces had been set at \$2 per 15 minutes since 1994. At the Administration's invitation, the Transport Advisory Committee (“TAC”)

had examined and identified various factors contributing to road traffic congestion at the territorial level. The TAC in its the “Report on Study of Road Traffic Congestion in Hong Kong” submitted to the Administration in December 2014 suggested 12 short, medium and long-term additional mitigation measures for the consideration of the Administration. One of the measures set out in the report was to increase metered parking fee, which had remained the same during the past 20 odd years. USTH emphasized that the Administration was only proposing to increase the maximum fee. Depending on the traffic conditions and parking demands in individual areas, the Transport Department would determine the actual parking fees at not more than \$4 or \$5 per 15 minutes for on-street metered parking spaces. The Administration considered that the fee level after the increase would still be affordable by the general public.

75. Objecting to the proposed upward adjustment of metered parking fee, Mr LAU Kwok-fan expressed concern over the shortage of parking spaces. Mr LAU pointed out that the fee of on-street parking meters at Yau Yat Tsuen (an area in Kowloon Tong) was only \$2 for 30 minutes while that at Shek Wu Hui (a grassroot area in Sheung Shui) was \$2 for 15 minutes, Mr LAU queried the rationale for setting the above fee level. Mr LAU urged the Administration to look into the factors for setting the fee level and to review the matter in a holistic manner.

76. Dr LO Wai-kwok and Mr CHAN Han-pan also objected to the proposed upward adjustment of metered parking fee. Dr LO pointed out that members had earlier objected to the raising of level of fines for illegal parking and that many drivers were forced to park illegally due to lack of parking spaces. Mr CHAN opined that the measures recommended by the TAC were totally impractical since they could not tackle the problem at the root, i.e. the shortage of parking spaces. Mr CHAN urged the Administration to review the parking policy, in particular, the standards for parking space provision in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG").

77. USTH advised that the Administration’s parking policy was to accord priority to meeting the parking needs of commercial vehicles. Moreover, various measures had also been taken forward to increase the supply of parking spaces as far as practicable. USTH further advised that, among others, the Administration had been actively identifying suitable locations for constructing multi-storey public car parks and providing more on-street parking spaces and that the relevant standards in the HKPSG would be reviewed as appropriate.

*Procurement of the new generation of parking meter system*

78. Regarding the tendering procedures of the procurement of the new generation of parking meter system, Ms Claudia MO suggested the Administration to review the selection criteria and marking scheme of the tender assessment. Instead of using the established practice of awarding the tender to the lowest bidder, more weighting should be given to the functionality, in particular, the provision of various means and systems through which payments would be accepted. Sharing Ms MO's view, Mr Michael TIEN said that the Administration should not give preference to bids charging low transaction fees. He said that he would raise a motion in this regard.

79. Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Management and Paratransit ("AC/MP") advised that selection of operators would be conducted through open tender and the assessment criteria for selection of operators were being worked out. The Administration would take into account various aspects in the assessment.

*Policy on electric vehicles*

80. Pointing out that the Administration had been taking measures to promote the use of electric vehicles ("EVs"), Mr CHAN Hak-kan urged the Administration to plan for introducing parking meters equipped with public charging facilities along with its plan to install the new generation of parking meters in order to facilitate EV owners and popularize the use of EVs.

81. Mr Charles Peter MOK concurred with Mr CHAN Hak-han's view and made the same request. Mr MOK opined that Hong Kong had already been lagging behind other countries with regard to the development of EVs and thus the Administration should take initiatives to further promote the use of EVs.

82. AC/MP advised that on-street metered parking spaces were provided to cater for short-term parking needs of motorists. Equipping parking meters with charging facilities might bring about extra demand for parking space arising from the charging needs of EVs and thus the Administration had to be cautious in this regard.

83. Despite the above concern mentioned by the Administration, the Chairman opined that the Administration should at least equip some of the parking meters, if not all, with charging facilities and charge a fee for this

service.

*Enforcement action*

84. Mr Michael TIEN opined that the Administration should step up enforcement actions against illegal parking. Among others, the Administration should explore with the Police on the installation of closed-circuit television ("CCTV") cameras to monitor vehicles with parking time expired. He said that he would raise a motion in this regard.

85. USTH responded that the backend computer would consolidate the utilization situation and payment information collected by vehicle sensors of the parking meters and compile information on the locations of parking meters with parking spaces being occupied but without payment of parking fees. This information would facilitate the Hong Kong Police Force to deploy as far as practicable frontline law enforcement officers to the concerned parking spaces to take enforcement actions..

Admin

86. In summing up, the Chairman requested the Administration to provide written response to the following:

- (a) members' strong views against the Administration's proposed upward adjustment of the maximum fee for metered parking spaces;
- (b) members' request to review the relevant provisions in the Road Traffic (Parking) Regulations (Cap. 374C), which in a way allow a motorist to park a vehicle in a parking space for a continuous period of 24 hours; and
- (c) how enforcement actions would be taken against prolonged occupation of parking spaces through repeated payment of parking fees in person.

*(post-meeting note: The Chinese version and English version of the supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1184/17-18(01) on 1 and 7 June 2018 respectively.)*

Motion

87. The Chairman said that there was one motion moved by Mr Micheal TIEN under this agenda item:

"鑑於政府即將推行新一代停車收費錶系統，本會建議政府：

1. 公開招標選取「結算服務營辦商」時，以爭取更多繳費系統或工具為目標，以及不應以收取交易費用低者為優先，希望能吸引更多投標者入場；及

2. 與警方研究安裝CCTV，監察逾時泊位的車輛並影下車牌用以抄牌，提升阻嚇性且節省警力，從而增加泊車位的流轉性。  
"

(Translation)

"As the Government will soon introduce a new generation of parking meter system, this Panel proposes to the Government that:

1. it should aim at seeking more payment systems or means when selecting the "clearing service contractor" through open tender and should not give preference to bids charging low transaction fees, with a view to attracting more prospective bidders; and

2. it should explore with the Police the installation of closed-circuit televisions ("CCTVs") to monitor vehicles with parking time expired and to take photographs of their licence plates for issuing fixed penalty tickets so as to enhance the deterrence and save police manpower, thereby increasing the turnover of parking spaces."

88. The Chairman put the motion to vote. A total of 9 members voted for the motion, none voted against it and none abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

*(post-meeting note: The Administration's response to the motion was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)596/17-18(01) on 12 February 2018.)*

**VII. Any other business**

89. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:21 pm

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
7 September 2018