立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)1465/17-18
(These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PL/TP/1

Panel on Transport

Minutes of special meeting held on Monday, 22 January 2018, at 2:45 pm in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present: Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon LAM Cheuk-ting (Deputy Chairman) Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon Claudia MO

Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP

Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

Hon Alvin YEUNG

Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH

Hon CHAN Chun-ying

Hon Tanya CHAN Hon LUK Chung-hung

Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP

Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai Hon KWONG Chun-yu Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

Members absent: Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

Hon CHU Hoi-dick

Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

Hon HO Kai-ming

Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH

Member attending: Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Public Officers attending

Agenda item I

:

Dr Raymond SO, BBS, JP

Under Secretary for Transport and Housing

Miss Crystal YIP

Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and

Housing (Transport) 1

Mr Philip HAR

Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and

Housing (Transport) 4

Ms Stella LEE

Assistant Commissioner for Transport/

Management and Paratransit

Miss Rachel KWAN

Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Bus and

Railway

Attendance by invitation

: Agenda item I

The Lion Rock Institute
Mr NG Kin-wah
Event Officer

Hong Kong Taxi Owners' Assn Ltd Mr WONG Po-keung Chairman

The Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport in Hong Kong
Mr LEUNG Kong-yui
Council Member

<u>Tsuen Wan District Tourists and Passengers</u>
<u>Omnibus Operators Association</u>
Mr TANG C.k.
Chairman

Hong Kong District Tourists and Passengers
Omnibus Operators Association
Mr KWOK Si-yuen
Chairman

Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Civic Party
Mr Michael YUNG Ming-chau
Deputy Spokesperson on Transportation Policy

DAB
Mr YAU Kin-wo
Deputy Spokesperson of DAB

<u>萬利來旅運公司</u> Mr LUNG Wing-ming Reprsentative 恒寶客運巴士有限公司

Mr CHEUNG Po-shing Owner

西北邨巴大聯盟

Mr MAN Hoi-tik

Chairman

Civic Exchange

Mr JAIN Alok

Fellow

Mr LAU Ka-yeung

Miss CHAO Suet-ying

New Territories Taxi Operations Union

Mr CHAN Shu-sang

Chairman

H.K Public Light Bus Owner & Driver Assn.

Mr CHEUNG Hon-wah

Chairman

Public Transportation Think Tank of Hong Kong

CHAN Tik-yiu

幹事

Dr. HUNG Wing-tat

Liberal Party

HO Wang

Member

民主黨港島支部

谷傑斐先生

代表

DAB TUEN MUN BRANCH

Mr CHAN Tsim-heng

Community Officer

Mr LIN Kuan-tsun

Public Transport Research Team
Mr CHENG Quentin
Project Manager, Public Transport Research
Team

Mr HON Ben

<u>Direction Association For The Handicapped</u> Ms Rabi YIM Chor-pik Chairman

Hong Kong Land Transport Council Limited
Mr MA Kiu-sang
Vice-Chairman

Yuen Long District Tourists and Passengers
Omnibus Operators Association
Mr CHAN Sze-leung
Member

Kowloon District Tourists and Passengers
Omnibus Operators Association
Mr LEE Johnny
Vice-Chairman

Clerk in attendance: Ms Sophie LAU

Chief Council Secretary (4)2

Staff in attendance: Miss Joyce CHING

Senior Council Secretary (4)2

Ms Jacqueline LAW Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM

Legislative Assistant (4)2

I. Progress of Implementation of Measures under Public Transport Strategy Study

LC Paper No. CB(4)490/17-18(01)

- Administration's paper on Transport Public Transport Strategy Study – Implementation Progress of Measures

LC Paper No. CB(4)490/17-18(02)

- Paper on the Public Transport Strategy Study prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief)

<u>Members</u> noted the following submission from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting –

LC Paper No. CB(4)490/17-18(06) - 鄭 俊 鴻 先 生 (Chinese version only)

Briefing by the Administration

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, <u>Under Secretary for Transport and Housing</u> ("USTH") gave a brief introduction on the implementation progress of the measures recommended under the report of the Public Transport Strategy Study ("PTSS"). Details were set out at the Annex of the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)490/17-18(01)).

<u>Presentation of views by deputations/individuals and the Administration's response</u>

3. The Chairman invited deputations/individuals to present their views. He reminded them that, when addressing the Panel at the meeting, they were not covered by the protection and immunity under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382), and their written submissions were also not covered by the Ordinance. In total, 28 deputations/individuals presented their views at the meeting, a summary of which was in the **Appendix**.

- 4. In response to the views expressed by deputations/individuals, USTH made the following response:
 - (a) the broad directions laid down by the third Comprehensive Transport Studies ("CTS-3") remained applicable. Different public transport modes had served their functions according to their respective roles and positioning and had maintained a delicate balance;
 - (b) among various public transport modes, heavy rails operated on dedicated rail corridor and provided high-capacity, convenient and emission-free services. Given that Hong Kong was a compact and densely-populated city with limited road space, the Administration would continue to adopt the policy of using the heavy rail as the backbone of the public transport system;
 - (c) while heavy rail was the backbone of the public transport system, other public transport services continued to play an important supplementary role, particularly serving areas inaccessible by the heavy rail and providing choices for the public; and
 - (d) the objective of the PTSS was thus to enhance the roles and positioning of the public transport services other than the heavy rail. The measures under the PTSS would help maintain the delicate balance among various public transport services and enhance their complementarity, while ensuring that the public could enjoy highly efficient, convenient and diversified public transport services.

Discussion

Franchised taxis and point-to-point transport services

5. <u>Ms Claudia MO</u> urged the Administration to revamp its overall transport policy. <u>Ms MO</u> expressed that due regard should be given to free market and economy in formulating transport policy and that consideration should be given to opening to market to new modes of transportation and operators, such as Uber, to meet public expectations.

6. <u>USTH</u> acknowledged that the demand in the community for personalized and point-to-point public transport services of higher quality and with online hailing features should be addressed. Yet, any carriage of passengers for reward must be lawful to protect the passengers' safety and public interest. <u>USTH</u> advised that the Administration was preparing the necessary legislative work for introducing franchised taxis to meet the new demand in the community. The Administration would decide whether to explore other new services (such as regulated online hailing services) depending on the outcome of the scrutiny of the proposal on franchised taxis by the Legislative Council.

Barrier-free public transport services

- Echoing the views of a deputation, Direction Association for the Handicapped, Dr Fernando CHEUNG was concerned about the progress of promoting "Transport for All" and implementation of related initiatives by operators of public light buses ("PLBs") and taxis. Dr CHEUNG pointed out that only one of the routes under the "low-floor wheelchair-accessible light bus trial scheme" had come into operation. Moreover, Dr CHEUNG opined that the introduction of franchised taxi was not the right direction despite the fact that at least 50% of the franchised taxi fleet must be wheelchair-accessible. Dr CHEUNG expressed that the fare of franchised taxi service could be 50% higher than that of ordinary taxi service. Since it was currently almost impossible to find a wheelchair-accessible taxi by street hailing, the introduction of franchised taxis would have the effect of forcing wheelchair users to use a more expensive type of taxi service.
- 8. <u>Dr Fernando CHEUNG</u> urged that the Administration to encourage the operators of ordinary taxis to change to wheelchair-accessible taxis and to further promote the concept of "Transport for All". <u>Dr CHEUNG</u> also enquired about the concrete timetable for mandating barrier-free transport facilities, including the introduction of wheelchair-accessible models for all PLBs and taxis.
- 9. <u>USTH</u> clarified that apart from the proposal of introducing franchised taxi fleet comprising at least 50% of the wheelchair-accessible vehicles, the Administration had been encouraging the taxi trade to deploy wheelchair-accessible models. As regards the low-floor wheelchair-accessible light bus trial scheme, the Administration would review its operational effectiveness in the fourth quarter of 2018. If the trial scheme was proven effective and desirable, the Administration

would discuss with the trade on the feasibility of further promoting low-floor PLBs.

10. <u>Dr Fernando CHEUNG</u> urged the Administration to provide subsidy and/or incentives, such as tax exemption, to assist the operators of taxi and PLB service in introducing wheelchair-accessible vehicles.

Franchised bus service

- 11. Mr LEUNG Che-cheung opined that despite the fact that the Administration was adopting the policy to use railway as the backbone of the public transport system, the supplementary role played by other transport modes was also essential. Mr LEUNG opined that the Administration should take forward initiatives to improve other modes of public transport services and encourage commuters to use bus services. Mr LEUNG suggested the Administration to waive the tunnel fee of franchised bus services to subsidise the passengers of the routes concerned.
- 12. <u>Mr POON Siu-ping</u> opined that the proposed new long-haul bus services might affect the business of non-franchised bus operators, in particular the operation of their residents' services. In this regard, <u>Mr POON</u> asked whether the non-franchised buses ("NFB") operators could submit proposals for the operations of the above long-haul services in the future and how the Administration would regulate the fare of the new service routes.
- 13. <u>USTH</u> advised that the new long-haul services aimed at providing passengers with alternative choice of franchised bus services in response to the community needs. Currently, there was no plan to invite NFB operators to submit proposals for the operation of this type of service. <u>USTH</u> further advised that the operation of the new long-haul services would not affect the operation of the existing routes.
- 14. Mr Jeremy TAM noted that the new long-haul services aimed at providing passengers with another option of higher quality service to meet passenger demand, such as providing more spacious seating and charging a fare 50% higher than that of the existing routes. In this regard, Mr TAM asked how the Administration would balance the passenger's demand for higher quality service and the need for better utilization of road space. Mr TAM also asked whether the frequency of the existing franchised services would be adjusted after the

commissioning of the new long-haul services, if so, the basis for such adjustment.

- 15. <u>USTH</u> advised that the enhancement of franchised bus services with the operation of more diversified services were explained in the report of PTSS. As stated clearly in the report, the new long-haul services would be provided on the condition that the efficiency of the existing franchised services would not be compromised.
- 16. <u>Mr Jeremy TAM</u> suggested that, with a view to providing more spacious environment in a bus compartment, the Administration should first consider reviewing the current standard of 6 persons (standing) per square meter instead of introducing the long-haul service.

Transport planning in the New Territories, provision of park-and-ride facilities and supply of parking spaces

17. <u>Dr Elizabeth QUAT</u> expressed grave concern about the traffic congestion situation and overloading of railway lines in New Territories East. <u>Dr QUAT</u> opined that the development of transport network could not meet the transport demand arising from rapid population growth. Overall speaking, <u>Dr QUAT</u> opined that the Administration did not have any long term vision to address the changing transport demand and that the transport needs of commuters residing in remote areas could not be addressed. <u>Dr QUAT</u> opined that while adopting the policy of using railway as the backbone of the public transport system, the Administration should take forward initiatives to facilitate the transport arrangement for commuters residing in areas with no railway coverage. Among others, transit and transfer services provided by other transport modes should be enhanced and large scale park-and-ride facilities should be provided at major transport interchanges.

(At 4:49 pm, the Chairman extended the meeting for 15 minutes to allow more time for discussion.)

18. Mr Steven HO concurred with Dr Elizabeth QUAT's view that transit service and park-and-ride facilities should be enhanced. Mr HO quoted an example that a parking area in Sheung Shui which had been previously used for park-and ride purpose was taken back for development. Mr HO opined that the provision of parking spaces should not be compromised as a result of land development and urged the Administration to increase the supply of car parks. In this connection, Mr HO asked whether the Administration would review the standards for

parking space provision in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines. Moreover, <u>Mr LEUNG Che-cheung</u> opined that more parking spaces should be provided for PLBs.

19. <u>USTH</u> noted members' concern about the supply of parking space. The Administration would consider reviewing the relevant standards and guidelines as appropriate.

Ferry Services

20. <u>Mr LEUNG Che-cheung</u> opined that ferry services should also be enhanced. <u>Mr LEUNG</u> suggested the Administration exploring the operation of ferry routes plying from Tuen Mun to Central and Tsim Sha Tsui.

Strategic plans for transport planning

- 21. <u>Ms Claudia MO</u> opined that the report of the PTSS failed to address the transportation needs of the general public. <u>Ms MO</u> pointed out that transport policy in Hong Kong was biased towards mass transit system and the government was a majority shareholder of the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL"), with over 70% of shareholding. <u>Ms MO</u> opined that the Administration often acted in favour of the MTRCL.
- 22. <u>USTH</u> advised that the Administration had adopted the public transport-oriented policy and the policy to use the railway as the backbone of the public transport system as well as formulated development plans and infrastructure to facilitate better use of railway for mass transport. <u>USTH</u> emphasised that railways were environmentally friendly and efficient mass carriers and that the MTR in Hong Kong had been regarded as one of the world's leading railways for safety, reliability, customer service and cost efficiency.
- 23. The Chairman opined that the findings and measures presented in the report of the PTSS piecemeal and that it failed to take into account the latest development to achieve a long-term goal or vision. He mentioned that the Panel had passed a motion, raised by Mr Jeremy TAM, in an earlier meeting requesting the Administration to commence the CTS-4 as soon as possible so as to map out a planning vision and blueprint for transport. The Chairman also pointed out that the planning of transport infrastructure should come with the development plan of new towns. Moreover, in taking forward transport planning, the time cost incurred by

commuters due to traffic congestion and its impact on the productivity of the society as a whole should be taken into account for consideration.

Concluding remarks

The Chairman said that quite a number of members and deputations found the report of the PTSS lacking in vision, strategy and performance indicators. Barrier-free facilities were considered by some members as inadequate on public transport services like the railway, PLBs and taxis. The report also lacked overall vision of the current and future development of new towns in the New Territories North, the pressing needs for green transport for health reasons and the increasing flow of passengers and goods across the border as a result of a higher degree of integration of the economy of China and Hong Kong. Moreover, some of the measures, including the introduction of franchised taxis as well as the long-haul services and mid-sized single-deck buses, had caused confusion on the part of the operators in respect of the role and positioning of various public transport services. Lastly, quite a number of the Panel members and deputations urged the government to conduct the CTS-4.

(post-meeting note: The letter from the Chairman to the Administration on the observations and opinions expressed by members and deputations/individuals on the Public Transport Strategy Study and the Administration response were issued to members vide LC Paper CB(4)714/17-18 on 12 March 2018.)

II. Any other business

25. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:11 pm

Council Business Division 4
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
6 August 2018

Panel on Transport

Special meeting on Monday, 22 January 2018, at 2:45 pm

Progress of Implementation of Measures under Public Transport Strategy Study

Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Name of deputation/individual		Submission/Major views and concerns
1.	The Lion Rock Institute	as the expression of material company.	ned that the Administration should revamp the policy of using railway ne backbone of public transport system ressed the Administration should open up the market for the operation nore franchised bus routes and public light buses ("PLBs") service, even routes which overlapped with railway services, so as to provide muters with more choices of transportation and to minimize invenience to the public in case of railway service disruption
2.	Hong Kong Taxi Owners' Assn. Ltd.		entation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No. 4)527/17-18(01) (Chinese version only)
3.	The Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport in Hong Kong	_	entation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No. 4)490/17-18(08) (English version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual		Submission/Major views and concerns
4.	Tsuen Wan District Tourists and Passengers Omnibus Operators Association	•	found that the Report of the Public Transport Strategy Study ("the Report") lacking in vision and strategy. In particular, the growing demand for modes of transportation being provided by Uber and light goods vehicles were not covered under the study pointed out that Uber was commonly utilized for students service and van-type light goods vehicles were often used for passenger transport to the airport pointed out the number of light goods vehicles as at 2017 was 72,000 which was doubled the total number of franchised buses, non-franchised buses ("NFBs"), PLBs and taxis, indicating a genuine and growing demand for the services provided by this type of vehicle
5.	Hong Kong District Tourists and Passengers Omnibus Operators Association		presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No. CB(4)527/17-18(04) (Chinese version only)
6.	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	•	opined that the Administration should focus on the planning and construction of transport infrastructure to mitigate traffic congestion in the territory of Hong Kong instead of investing in large-scale cross boundary transport infrastructure such as the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
7.	The Civic Party	 the Administration should further expand fare concession scheme to include interchange concession among different transport operators, in particular the cross harbour routes via the Cross Harbour Tunnel urged the Administration to explore the provision of interchange along with the works of widening of Tai Po Road (Sha Tin Section) urged the Administration to take forward the implementation of trial scheme for low-floor public light buses
8.	DAB	 found that the Report lacking in vision and strategy and opined that the findings and measures presented in the Report piecemeal opined that the introduction of franchised taxis could not solve the existing problem of taxi service opined that the new long-haul franchised bus services might affect the business of NFB operators, in particular the operation of the residents' services ("RS") urged the Administration to set a clear direction on cycling policy and to closely monitor the operation of shared bike opined that the lack of manpower in the transport industry should be addressed
9.	萬利來旅運公司	 opined that the new long-haul franchised bus services might affect the business of RS urged the Administration to maintain the balance of the roles played by

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		different transportation modes
10.	恒寶客運巴士有限公司	 opined that the new long-haul franchised bus services might affect the business of RS pointed out the RS had been providing high quality point-to-point services, especially in the New Territories and that the Administration should consider relaxing the operating conditions of RS
11.	西北邨巴大聯盟	 opined that the measures which were related to NFB services recommended in the Report could not really help the NFB trade opined that the new long-haul franchised bus services might affect the business of RS suggested the Administration should open up the market for the new bus services, i.e. long-haul franchised bus services and new shuttle services, to NFB operators
12.	Civic Exchange	• presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No. CB(4)490/17-18(09) (English version only)
13.	Mr LAU Ka-yeung	 opined that new shuttle services to be provided by mid-sized single-deck franchised buses would overlap with the services being provided by PLBs expressed dissatisfaction that the long-haul franchised bus services would be much more expensive, around 50% higher than the fare of ordinary bus

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		 services urged the Administration to facilitate the operators to provide transport services with higher quality without increasing the fare and to play a more active role in the rationalization of bus services
14.	Miss CHAO Suet-ying	 urged the Administration to revise the current standard of 6 person (standing) per square meter for franchised buses urged the Administration to further enhance barrier-free facilities instead of just confining to the introduction of trial scheme for low-floor PLBs. The market should be open up to all kinds of transport operators and that reference could be made to the arrangement under the Pilot Green Transport Fund the Administration should further expand fare concession scheme to include interchange concession among different transport operators
15.	New Territories Taxi Operations Union	• presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No CB(4)490/17-18(04) (Chinese version only)
16.	H.K Public Light Bus Owner & Driver Assn.	• presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No CB(4)490/17-18(03) (Chinese version only)
17.	Public Transportation Think Tank of Hong Kong	• presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No CB(4)527/17-18(02) (Chinese version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
18.	Dr. HUNG Wing-tat	• presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No. CB(4)490/17-18(07) (Chinese version only)
19.	Liberal Party	 opined that the current transport policy failed to take into account the latest and future development to achieve long-term goal or vision opined that commuters should be provided with more choices of transportation mode given the current saturation level of all railway lines opined that the new long-haul franchised bus services might affect the business of RS
20.	民主黨港島支部	 opined that the section fares for harbour-crossing franchised bus routes on the Hong Kong Island side were still expensive and urged the Administration to review the existing policy on section fares of franchised bus routes. suggested that bus companies should provide two Octopus machines on each bus, one at the entrance and one at the exit, to facilitate passengers who do not need to cross the harbour while riding on harbour-crossing franchise buses to receive partial fare reimbursement by tapping the Octopus on the machine when leaving the bus
21.	DAB Tuen Mun Branch	• welcomed some of the short term measures in relation to light rail recommended under the Report, including the purchase of 10 additional light rail vehicles

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
		 expressed view against the rationalization of light rail routes, in particular the cancellation of routes 614 and 615 opined that the carrying capacity of light rail could be enhanced by full deployment of coupled-set light rail vehicles urged the Administration to expedite the planning of the Tsuen Wan-Tuen Mun railway line
22.	Mr LIN Kuan-tsun	 opined that the Administration should revamp the policy of using railway as the backbone of public transport system opined that the Administration should encourage the use of public transport by commuters and control growth of private vehicles
23.	Public Transport Research Team	• presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No. CB(4)527/17-18(03) (Chinese version only)
24.	Mr HON Ben	 opined that the findings and measures presented in the Report piecemeal the Administration should further expand fare concession scheme to include interchange concession among different transport operators urged the Administration to open up transport data opposed to the use of bus-only lanes by taxis
25.	Direction Association For The Handicapped	• presentation of views as set out in submission LC Paper No. CB(4)490/17-18(05) (Chinese version only)

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission/Major views and concerns
26.	Hong Kong Land Transport Council Limited	 opined that the recommendations under paragraph 4.18 of the Report. i.e. the introduction of the long-haul services and mid-sized single-deck buses as well as more community hospital routes by franchised bus operators, were unfair and unacceptable opined that new shuttle services using mid-sized single-deck franchised buses would overlap with the services being provided by public light buses and thus the livelihood of the PLB operators would be affected urged the Administration to expedite the work in relation to the conversion of red minibuses to green minibuses
27.	Yuen Long District Tourists and Passengers Omnibus Operators Association	 opined that the introduction of many franchised bus services in recent years had affected the business of RS and deprived commuters of alternative means of transportation expressed grave concern about the situation that many NFB routes had ceased operation due to high operating costs and competition from the "Special Routes" of franchised buses
28.	Kowloon District Tourists and Passengers Omnibus Operators Association	 opined that the recommendations and measures of the Report were biased and unfair to NFB operators opined that the sanctions imposed on NFB operators were very stringent when compared to the penalty for taxis and MTR in cases of services disruption