

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)71/18-19
(These minutes have been seen by
the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/2/16

Panel on Development and Panel on Home Affairs

**Joint Subcommittee to monitor the implementation of
the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting held on
Friday, 11 May 2018, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Chairman)
Hon Tanya CHAN (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Member attending : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Members absent : Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

**Public officers
attending**

: Agenda items II to IV

Mrs Cherry TSE LING Kit-ching, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mrs Sorais LEE KWAN Siu-kuen, JP
Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

Agenda items II & III

Mrs Angelina CHEUNG FUNG Wing-ping, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (2)

Agenda item IV

Ms Alice PANG, JP
Project Manager (South)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Edmund CHAN Ping-wa
Chief Engineer/South 2
Civil Engineering and Development Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda items II to IV

Mr Duncan PESCOD, GBS, JP
Chief Executive Officer
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Agenda item II

Mr Richard TSE
Executive Director, Finance
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Agenda items III & IV

Mr Jeremy STOWE
Director, Project Control
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Agenda item III

Mr Louis YU
Executive Director, Performing Arts
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Ms Alison FRIEDMAN
Artistic Director, Performing Arts
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Ms Naomi CHUNG
Head of Xiqu, Performing Arts
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Ms Lisa TSANG
Head, Venue Operations (Performing Arts)
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Agenda item IV

Mr NG Ying-chuen
Head, Technical Services
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Patrick LAM
Senior Traffic and Transport Engineer
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Clerk in attendance : Ms Doris LO
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Mandy LI
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

Action

- I Confirmation of minutes**
(LC Paper No. CB(1)895/17-18 — Minutes of meeting held on
20 December 2017

LC Paper No. CB(1)896/17-18 — Minutes of meeting held on 9 February 2018)

The minutes of the meetings held on 20 December 2017 and 9 February 2018 were confirmed.

II Update on the financial situation of and the enhanced financial arrangement for the West Kowloon Cultural District project

(LC Paper No. CB(1)559/17-18(01) — Administration's paper on update on the financial situation of and the enhanced financial arrangement for the West Kowloon Cultural District project

LC Paper No. CB(1)559/17-18(02) — Paper on the financial situation of and the enhanced financial arrangement for the West Kowloon Cultural District project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief)

LC Paper No. CB(1)609/17-18(01) — Letters dated 12 February 2018 from Hon Tanya CHAN)

LC Paper No. CB(1)938/17-18(01) — Administration's response to the letter dated 12 February 2018 from Hon Tanya CHAN (LC Paper No. CB(1)609/17-18(02)))

Motions proposed by Hon Tanya CHAN

(LC Paper Nos. — Wording of the motions
CB(1)609/17-18(03) and (04) proposed by Hon Tanya CHAN)

2. The Chairman indicated that the Joint Subcommittee spent a whole meeting discussing this item at the last meeting on 9 February 2018.

Given that there were other agenda items to be considered at this meeting, he would only allow about 30 minutes for continuing the discussion on this item and dealing with the two motions proposed by the Deputy Chairman at the last meeting.

3. The Deputy Chairman referred to her letter dated 11 April 2018 (LC Paper No. CB(1)805/17-18(01) circulated to members on 16 April 2018) requesting the Administration and West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") to disclose again the confidential consultancy study reports in relation to the development of Mega Performance Venue and Exhibition Centre for Members' perusal, and the response from WKCDA indicating that it had no plan to release the reports further (LC Paper No. CB(1)927/17-18(01) circulated to members on 8 May 2018). Expressing disappointment about WKCDA's response, the Deputy Chairman strongly demanded the Administration and WKCDA to take heed of her request and make the same arrangements as that in April 2017 to allow Members to peruse the redacted consultancy study reports again.

4. The Chairman considered that given the legitimate role of the Joint Subcommittee to monitor the implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District project and the fact that the same arrangements had previously been made for Members to inspect the redacted consultancy study reports in April 2017, the Deputy Chairman's request was reasonable. He said that he would, on behalf of the Joint Subcommittee, write to the Administration on the request after the meeting. The Chairman then ordered that the discussion on the current agenda item be continued.

(Post-meeting notes:

- On the instruction of the Chairman, the Clerk to the Joint Subcommittee wrote to the Secretary for Home Affairs on 23 May 2018 conveying the Chairman's and members' request for the disclosure of the above consultancy study reports for Member's perusal (LC Paper No. CB(1)1088/17-18(01) circulated to members on 8 June 2018).
- On 6 June 2018, the Administration forwarded WKCDA's reply on the arrangements for Members' perusal of the above consultancy study reports (LC Paper No. CB(1)1088/17-18(02) circulated to members on 8 June 2018). A note on "Disclosure of requested consultancy reports by WKCDA" together with the terms for accessing the reports were then provided by WKCDA on

28 June 2018 (LC Paper Nos. CB(1)1205/17-18(01) & (02) circulated to members on 29 June 2018).)

5. Mr Frankie YICK declared that he was a member of the Council of the Hong Kong Repertory Theatre.

6. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings in the **Annex**).

Motions

7. The Chairman put to vote the following first motion which was proposed by the Deputy Chairman:

(Translation)

"This Joint Subcommittee urges the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority to submit a breakdown of all the expenses incurred since 2008 with reference to the financial analysis in Enclosures 3 to 11 to the Public Works Subcommittee paper dated 18 June 2008."

8. The Chairman announced that five members voted for, four members voted against the motion, and no member abstained. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

(Post-meeting note: The wording of the motion passed was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)952/17-18(01) on 14 May 2018. The Administration's written response to the motion was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1083/17-18(01) on 7 June 2018.)

9. The Chairman then put to vote the following second motion which was proposed by the Deputy Chairman:

(Translation)

"Given that ever since the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") was granted \$21.6 billion in 2008, its development, financial arrangements and cost estimates have deviated significantly from what was contained in the 2007 consultancy report and the papers submitted to the Council by the Government, this Joint Subcommittee urges WKCD to re-submit to this Council

the financial assessments for the next 10 years made by an independent consultant."

10. The Chairman announced that four members voted for, four members voted against the motion, and one member abstained. The Chairman declared that the motion was not carried.

III Update on the development of Xiqu Centre

(LC Paper No. CB(1)559/17-18(03) — Administration's paper on update on the development of Xiqu Centre

LC Paper No. CB(1)559/17-18(04) — Paper on the development of Xiqu Centre prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief))

Relevant paper

(LC Paper No. CB(1)852/17-18(01) — Submission from Rehabilitation Alliance Hong Kong dated 19 April 2018)

11. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings in the **Annex**).

IV Integration and connectivity of the West Kowloon Cultural District with its neighbouring district

(LC Paper No. CB(1)908/17-18(01) — Administration's paper on integration and connectivity of the West Kowloon Cultural District with its neighbouring district

LC Paper No. CB(1)908/17-18(02) — Paper on the integration and connectivity of the West Kowloon Cultural District with its neighbouring districts prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief))

12. The Chairman reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council, they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the subjects under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the subjects.

13. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings in the **Annex**).

14. At the request of Mr Tony TSE, the Chairman put to vote the question whether members supported the Administration's submission of the funding proposal to upgrade part of 754CL entitled "Infrastructure Works for West Kowloon Cultural District, phase 1 – third construction package" to Category A as set out in Annex A to the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)908/17-18(01)) to the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC"), and ordered a division. Three members voted for, one member voted against the question and no one abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Frankie YICK
Mr Holden CHOW
(3 members)

Mr YIU Si-wing

Against:

Mr Tony TSE
(1 member)

Abstain:

(0 member)

15. The Chairman concluded that the Joint Subcommittee was largely in support of the Administration's submission of the above funding proposal to PWSC for consideration.

V Any other business

Date of the next meeting and items for discussion

16. Members agreed that the next meeting would be scheduled for Monday, 11 June 2018, from 8:30 am to 10:30 am to discuss the following items proposed by the Administration:

- (a) Relocation of supporting operational facilities of Tsim Sha Tsui Fire Station Complex, Fire Services Club and other Fire Services accommodations to To Wah Road, Kowloon;
- (b) Proposed retention of a supernumerary Principal Government Engineer Post and a supernumerary Administrative Officer Staff Grade C Post relating to the West Kowloon Cultural District project; and
- (c) The Art, Commerce and Exhibitions Development Package (formerly known as the Exhibition Hub Development Area) and Artist Hostel/Residence of the West Kowloon Cultural District.

(Post-meeting note: Members were informed vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1066/17-18 on 4 June 2018 that at the request of the Administration and with the concurrence of the Chairman, the title of item (b) above was revised as "Proposed extension of supernumerary directorate posts in the Home Affairs Bureau and the Civil Engineering and Development Department relating to the West Kowloon Cultural District project".)

17. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 11:27 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
22 October 2018

Panel on Development and Panel on Home Affairs

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project
held on Friday, 11 May 2018, at 9:00 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes			
000505-000750	Chairman Deputy Chairman	Confirmation of minutes [LC Paper Nos. CB(1)895/17-18 and CB(1)896/17-18] Suggestion of the Chairman and the Deputy Chairman on listing the papers issued since the previous meeting in the Joint Subcommittee's agenda in future	
Agenda Item II – Update on the financial situation of and the enhanced financial arrangement for the West Kowloon Cultural District project			
000751-001716	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD")	Discussion on the Deputy Chairman's request for the disclosure of the confidential consultancy study reports in relation to the development of Mega Performance Venue and Exhibition Centre ("EC") for Members' perusal, and the Chairman's decision to, on behalf of the Joint Subcommittee, write to the Administration on the request after the meeting	Clerk to Joint Subcommittee
001717-002322	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Administration	Mr CHAN enquired about the possible options that the Administration would pursue to expedite the development of the remaining Core Arts and Cultural Facilities ("CACF") in the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") while WKCD was facing a capital funding gap, so as to address the pressing problem of shortage of performance venues in Hong Kong. The options might include: (a) providing additional funding or loans to WKCD; and (b) taking back the sites leased to WKCD for the remaining CACF for the development of performance venues by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD"). The Administration responded that: (a) it had all along been closely following up with WKCD on the works progress of and financial position for taking forward the WKCD project. The Administration and WKCD would continue to update the Joint Subcommittee on the latest	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>status and target completion dates of CACF in WKCD;</p> <p>(b) the Government would provide sufficient but not excessive resources to WKCDA to ease its financial difficulties. With an upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion (in 2008 Net Present Value) for implementation of the WKCD project, WKCDA was required to manage its finances flexibly and with due care and diligence. It was not in line with the Government's policy intent to invariably meet the funding requests from WKCDA;</p> <p>(c) the WKCDA Ordinance had the provision for WKCDA to borrow money and it would be up to the Board of WKCDA to decide on the borrowing plan for bridging the funding gap from private market or the Government; and</p> <p>(d) it was not conducive to the integrated development of WKCD if part of the district was resumed for development by LCSD.</p>	
002323-003032	Chairman Deputy Chairman Administration	<p>The Deputy Chairman said that the Administration's information paper (LC Paper No. CB(1)938/17-18(01)) could not fully respond to her questions raised in her letter dated 12 February 2018 (LC Paper No. CB(1)609/17-18(02)). She pressed for the Administration's responses regarding the term of the Build-Operate-Transfer ("BOT") agreements, and how the Administration could ensure that the hotel, offices and residential ("HOR") developments concerned would bring an enhanced recurrent income stream and enable WKCDA to achieve an operating surplus upon expiry of the BOT agreements.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) the WKCD project had undergone various unforeseen development and changes since the upfront endowment was granted in 2008, such as the adoption of the "City Park" design concept, and the serious delay in the receipt of retail, dining and entertainment income, which was intended to be a steady recurrent income source to meet the operating deficits of CACF, etc.;</p> <p>(b) the site currently occupied for the Hong Kong Section ("HKS") of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") project in Zone 2 of WKCD was expected to be ready for handing over by the MTR Corporation Limited to WKCD in phases in 2018, upon which WKCD would tender out HOR in several BOT packages in phases subject to the construction programme of the integrated basement. It was expected that the BOT arrangement could bring in considerable cash inflow for WKCD, during and after the BOT period. The income to be shared by WKCD would depend on the terms and conditions of individual BOT packages which were still being drawn up as well as market response, and it was premature to make any estimates; and</p> <p>(c) WKCD will also engage a financial consultant to draw up a comprehensive and affordable external borrowing plan to tide over the interim operating deficit.</p>	
003033-003159	Chairman Mr Frankie YICK	<p>Declaration of interest by Mr YICK</p> <p>Mr YICK agreed with the view of Mr CHAN Chi-chuen on the need to expedite the development of CACF in WKCD to address the shortage of local performance venues. While he considered that the option of taking back the sites for the remaining CACF for development by LCSD was not viable as this fragmented development approach might cause operational and management issues in WKCD in future, he agreed with the suggestion on providing loans by the Government to WKCD to bridge the capital funding gap.</p>	
003200-003601	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCD Administration	<p>Expressing concerns over the effectiveness of the BOT arrangements under the Enhanced Financial Arrangement ("EFA") in addressing the funding gaps both in capital and future operating expenditure of WKCD, Mr YIU asked if the Administration would instead consider partially or fully funding the construction costs of the remaining CACF and then granting the operation and management rights to WKCD, with a view to taking forward the developments as soon as possible.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) the Government had already provided the upfront endowment for the construction of CACF and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>would grant the site to WKCD at nominal land premium. EFA would provide WKCD with an additional and steady source of recurrent income. The Administration had no plan to provide further funding to WKCD for the construction of CACF at this stage;</p> <p>(b) under the BOT arrangements, the private sector investors/partners would shoulder development risks (including construction, financing and marketing risks) of the development packages as much as possible in accordance with commercial decisions, while WKCD would share rental income from the development packages with private sector investors/partners. The WKCD Ordinance also contained a provision for WKCD to engage in external borrowing; and</p> <p>(c) to address the shortage of cultural facilities, the Financial Secretary had set aside \$20 billion for the improvement and development of various cultural facilities in Hong Kong in the 2018-2019 Budget.</p>	
003602-003957	Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCD	<p>Mr TSE sought details of EFA, including the term of the BOT agreements, income sharing between WKCD and private developers under BOT, timetable for tendering out the BOT packages, as well as why it had taken so long to finalize the BOT arrangements since EFA was announced in 2017.</p> <p>WKCD responded that:</p> <p>(a) it had planned to seek private sector partners to first take forward the Art, Commerce and Exhibition ("ACE") developments through BOT and income sharing arrangement by the end of 2018. It had also been considering the case for providing an artist hostel/residence in WKCD through a public-private partnership approach;</p> <p>(b) as the procurement model and implementation strategies for each development package might differ, WKCD had to conduct individual business case review and consider the market engagement approach on a case by case basis. No one single model could fit all; and</p> <p>(c) the terms of the BOT development packages would normally not be longer than 30 to 40 years.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
003958-004232	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW Administration	<p>Mr CHOW hoped the Administration would ensure that there would be a favourable income sharing for WKCDA under the BOT arrangement.</p> <p>The Administration responded that WKCDA would be requested to engage independent valuation consultant(s) to conduct the pre-tender market estimates of the BOT development packages based on the pre-defined terms, conditions and development mix. For the ACE development package, WKCDA would also retain the right to cancel the tender if the income to be shared with WKCDA offered by the tenderers was unreasonably low.</p>	
004233-004508	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	<p>Ms MO enquired about:</p> <p>(a) whether WKCDA would secure external borrowing by issuing bonds or raising loans or both, and whether the approach for bridging the capital funding gap by external borrowing was a means for bypassing the scrutiny of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") over the spending for the WKCD project; and</p> <p>(b) whether the Administration would be required to cover any cost overrun of the Hong Kong Palace Museum ("HKPM") exceeding the donation of \$3.5 billion provided by the Hong Kong Jockey Club Charities Trust.</p> <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <p>(a) while it was premature to ascertain the means of borrowing of WKCDA, the Administration had no intention to bypass LegCo's scrutiny over the WKCD project. That notwithstanding, the Administration respected the independent operation of WKCDA in flexibly taking forward the WKCD project and to manage its finance with due care and diligence; and</p> <p>(b) it was too early to assume that there would be cost-overrun for the HKPM project. The project was an integral part of the WKCD development, and WKCDA would be responsible for the delivery of the HKPM project.</p>	
004509-004812	Chairman Deputy Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing	Voting on the two motions proposed by the Deputy Chairman	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
Agenda Item III – Update on the development of Xiqu Centre			
004813-005659	Chairman Administration WKCD	Briefing by the Administration and WKCD [LC Paper Nos. CB(1)559/17-18(03) and CB(1)950/17-18(01)]	
005700-010136	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen WKCD	<p>Mr CHAN enquired about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the arrangements of the opening programmes for the opening season (first quarter of 2019) of the Xiqu Centre; whether the disappointment expressed by The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong ("CAAHK") that it was not invited for staging opening performances had been placated, and whether only Yam Pak Charitable Foundation ("Yam Pak") would stage opening performances at the Grand Theatre during the entire period of the opening season; and (b) the venue hiring arrangements, including when WKCD would start to accept preliminary advance bookings for the venues in the Xiqu Centre, and the mechanism to determine the booking priority of different performance troupes. <p>WKCD responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Artistic team of WKCD had scheduled various performances during the three-month opening season, to be kicked off with the performances staged by Yam Pak; (b) bookings were now open for Xiqu Centre with dates available starting from April 2019. Preliminary bookings could be accepted up to three years in advance; and (c) to achieve financial sustainability for its venues, WKCD had adopted a venue hiring policy under which all hirers would have to pay hire charges. While the charging principle for ticketed events would be based on a low threshold two-tier approach comprising a base hiring fee and a percentage share of box office income, non-ticketed events would be charged for a lump sum hiring fee. WKCD would also receive an agreed percentage of the gross ticket sales, meaning that hirers should pay more when a show had a higher ticket price and/or when a show that sold better. WKCD would be flexible in scheduling and negotiating bookings in order to 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		achieve an appropriate mix of events balancing artistic and financial merits of individual programmes. Given that this venue hiring approach was quite new in Hong Kong, WKCDA would provide more specific details and explanations to potential hirers upon enquiry.	
010137-010432	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration WKCDA	<p>Ms MO enquired about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the reasons for using the English translation "Xiqu Centre" for 戲曲中心, instead of "Chinese/Cantonese Opera Centre"; and (b) given the press report in 2012 that the construction cost of the Xiqu Centre soared from the original estimate of \$1.3 billion to \$2.7 billion and the opening time was deferred from 2016 to 2019, the causes of the cost overrun and the delay. <p>The Administration and WKCDA responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the term "Xiqu" had been used for representing a unique traditional Chinese performing and theatrical art form covering not only Cantonese opera but other Xiqu genres, hence matching the prime objective of the Xiqu Centre on encouraging the development of all forms of Chinese opera in Hong Kong; and (b) WKCDA had all along been taking forward the Xiqu Centre project without cost overrun or delay. The estimated project cost of \$2.7 billion was based on the current scope of the Xiqu Centre, and from the outset, the project had been targeted for completion within 2018. 	
010433-011000	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW WKCDA	<p>Mr CHOW asked about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) given that CAAHK had previously cast doubt on the appointment of a non-local Artistic Director ("AD") of WKCDA and was concerned that the development of xiqu would be overlooked, how WKCDA would set out clearly the positioning of the Xiqu Centre, foster communications with the local xiqu sector, and build a greater xiqu audience, in particular comprising the younger generation; and (b) while supporting longer-run productions was among the guiding principles for the venue hiring 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>policy of WKCDA, whether it would allow flexibility such that smaller arts troupes with limited capacity to stage long-run productions could still secure venue bookings.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that:</p> <p>(a) WKCDA had established a Xiqu Centre Advisory Panel comprising members from the local xiqu sector, experienced xiqu performers, and the academia to offer advice to the Performing Arts Committee on the management and operation of the Xiqu Centre and other matters relating to the development of the xiqu art form;</p> <p>(b) there was a division of work among the Executive Director ("ED"), AD and the Head of Xiqu of Performing Arts. While ED and AD were overseeing broader policy issues and management and operation of various performing arts venues in WKCD, the incumbent Head of Xiqu, who was a seasoned producer of xiqu performances, would be responsible specifically for formulating the artistic plan for xiqu, developing partnerships in Hong Kong, China and globally, as well as other matters relating to the development of xiqu art form; and</p> <p>(c) the low threshold two-tier charging approach for venue hiring in WKCD could better enable troupes of various sizes, including small and medium performing companies, to run their productions for a longer period of time by sharing financial risks between the hirer and WKCDA. This charging approach would not favour only large performing companies. Xiqu productions, which belonged to the preferred art forms specific to the Xiqu Centre, would be accorded higher booking priority under the artistically-driven approach adopted for venue hiring.</p>	
011001-011440	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA	<p>Dr WONG enquired about:</p> <p>(a) the admission arrangements for the opening performances of the Xiqu Centre, including whether free or paid access would be offered, and the means to distribute/sell the tickets in an orderly, open and fair manner; and</p> <p>(b) the ticketing arrangements for future</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>performances, and the measures for preventing ticket touting.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that:</p> <p>(a) with a view to allowing more people to participate in the opening programmes, free access with tickets would be offered. The free admission tickets should be obtained in person at the box office or through online platforms, the detailed arrangements of which would be announced in due course; and</p> <p>(b) WKCDA would develop its own ticketing system for performances and events held in WKCD. To avoid ticket touting, WKCDA would encourage the programme organizers to make available most of the tickets for selling through the ticketing system, and minimize the percentage of tickets reserved for internal distribution by the hirer as far as possible to not exceeding 30-40% of the total number of tickets available.</p>	
011441-011845	Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCDA	<p>Mr TSE enquired about the measures to ease the traffic congestion at the nearby roads of the Xiqu Centre, and the crowd control plan during the first couples of weeks after the opening of the Xiqu Centre when a particularly high number of visitors would be expected.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that:</p> <p>(a) a new head of security of WKCDA was appointed to take charge of the crowd control planning and other security issues for the district. In fact, WKCDA had built up experience in crowd control since the opening of the Nursery Park although it was on a relatively smaller scale and it had to be further built up to cope with future development;</p> <p>(b) WKCDA would plan seriously for the measures, including a proper ticketing system for controlling access to the free opening programmes within the capacity limits, deployment of sufficient manpower and cooperation with the police, etc., to ensure smooth opening of the Xiqu Centre; and</p> <p>(c) the road widening works at the junction of Canton Road with Austin Road would be completed in the next three months prior to the opening the Xiqu</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		Centre. In the long term, the planned relocation of the supporting operation facilities of the existing Tsim Sha Tsui Fire Station Complex, Fire Services Club and accommodations would enable a vehicle-free avenue stretching west from Canton Road, linking up Xiqu Centre and other parts of WKCD.	
011846-012259	Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCD	<p>Ms MO pointed out that as she mentioned earlier at the meeting, it was reported in the South China Morning Post on 10 December 2012 that the original estimate of the Xiqu Centre project in 2006 was \$1.3 billion. She then enquired about the specific measures to be taken by WKCD to prevent ticket touting, and whether it would limit the number of tickets, including the free tickets for the opening programmes, that a person could obtain.</p> <p>WKCD responded that:</p> <p>(a) the occurrence of ticket touting could be minimized by proper control over the ticketing arrangements, as well as ensuring the release of the majority number of tickets through box office or an online ticketing system; and</p> <p>(b) whether to limit the number of tickets a person could buy would be decided by the programme organizers, but not being mandated by WKCD.</p>	
012300-012435	Chairman WKCD	<p>The Chairman enquired whether the Xiqu Centre would be open on schedule by the end of 2018. He hoped that a site visit for all LegCo Members could be arranged at an appropriate time before the opening of the Xiqu Centre for Members to interact with the Xiqu Centre team and have a preview of the Tea House Theatre performances.</p> <p>WKCD confirmed that the Xiqu Centre would open on schedule in December 2018. It welcomed LegCo Members to visit the Xiqu Centre in due course.</p>	
Agenda Item IV – Integration and connectivity of the West Kowloon Cultural District with its neighbouring district			
012436-014002	Chairman Administration WKCD	<p>Briefing by the Administration and WKCD [LC Paper Nos. CB(1)908/17-18(01) and CB(1)950/17-18(02)]</p> <p>On the funding proposal to upgrade part of 754CL entitled "Infrastructure Works for West Kowloon</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>Cultural District, phase 1 – third construction package" to Category A at an estimated cost of about \$380 million (in money-of-the-day prices) (as set out in Annex A to LC Paper No. CB(1)908/17-18(01)), the Administration advised that taking heed of members' concerns on the design and estimated cost of the proposed Artist Square Bridge ("ASB") expressed at the Joint Subcommittee's meeting held on 21 April 2017, the Administration and WKCDA had critically reviewed the design. The new design of ASB had been worked out with an overall cost saving of approximately 30% as compared with the original design.</p>	
014003-014459	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA	<p>Dr WONG indicated that the Democratic Party accepted the new simplified design of ASB. She urged the Administration to ensure that the materials used for ASB would be non-corroding and heat insulating. With regard to the development of marine transport connecting WKCD, she enquired about the details including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether existing landing steps/berthing were readily available at the marine access points planned to be provided at WKCD; (b) whether WKCDA had liaised with the Harbourfront Commission, the Hong Kong Tourism Board ("HKTB"), and/or the Transport Department on the development of marine transport connecting WKCD; (c) the routes of the marine transport service connecting WKCD with other districts; and (d) whether WKCDA would operate the marine transport service or engage other service providers to operate the service. <p>WKCDA responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it had explored with the Harbourfront Commission and HKTB regarding the development of marine transport connecting WKCD; and (b) while it was outside WKCDA's capacity to operate marine transport service itself, it had approached some water tour service providers in this regard, and two companies had indicated their interest in particular in routes connecting WKCD with major 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		tourist attractions along both sides of the Victoria Harbour.	
014500-015023	Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCD	<p>The Deputy Chairman appreciated that the Administration had accepted members' views and simplified the design of ASB, and looked forward to further improvements of the design if plausible. She hoped that in future, the Administration would engage the Board of WKCD and the Joint Subcommittee on proposals for public works projects relating to WKCD at an advance stage with adequate information including the estimated costs so as to obviate the need for late stage revisions.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman also asked about the details of the trial on using autonomous vehicle to serve visitors within WKCD, including the cost of each autonomous vehicle, the reasons why a vehicle conductor was required to station on board, the experience gained overseas on the use of such autonomous vehicle, and the timing of launching autonomous vehicle in WKCD.</p> <p>WKCD replied that:</p> <p>(a) the current design for ASB had been simplified as far as possible to reduce the costs, while there might not be much room for further add-ons due to the cost implications; and</p> <p>(b) with a view to providing cultural facilities that were accessible for everyone, WKCD considered it suitable to use autonomous vehicle, which had been in use in many overseas countries, within WKCD to serve visitors, in particular the elderly and people with disabilities. To ensure safety, WKCD tended to extensively test the vehicle before launching it within WKCD. In the trial rides, a vehicle conductor was stationing on board to override control of the vehicle in case needed. WKCD would extend the trial in phases and keep liaising with the Transport Department on the implementation in due course.</p>	
015024-015525	Chairman Mr Tony TSE WKCD	Mr TSE was disappointed that the Administration had attributed the high construction cost of ASB mainly to the original aesthetic design, whilst he pointed out that good designs were not necessarily expensive ones. He criticized that the Administration was sacrificing the design features for a cost saving of 30%, rendering	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>the new design featureless. He queried about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether the original and the new designs of ASB were drawn up by the same designer; and (b) the extent to which the design factor, as among such other factors as the site conditions and other technical constraints, had contributed to the high construction costs of the original design; and the additional cost incurred respectively for the relevant factors. <p>WKCD A explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the original and the new designs of ASB were drawn up by different designers; (b) in view of members' earlier concern over the high construction cost, WKCD A had critically reviewed the original design through a value engineering exercise with a view to reducing the construction cost; and (c) the new design emphasized simplicity with various adjustments made to reduce construction cost, such as reducing the length of ASB by about 18 metres, shifting the landing location of the footbridge from the central area to the northern side of the Artist Square, and adopting clear expression of structural form with open-sided bridge deck. In all and in particular due to the simplification of the substructure of the new design, an overall cost saving of about 30% was achieved comparing to the original design. 	
015526-015951	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	<p>Ms MO regretted that the problem of the high construction cost of the original design of ASB had resulted in the need for an unnecessary waste of time revising the original design. Learning from this experience, she called on the Administration to duly assess the reasonableness of the construction costs of public works projects so as to avoid repeating the same problem in future.</p> <p>The Administration noted her views.</p>	
015952-020515	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCD A Administration	<p>Mr YIU expressed support for the revised proposal of ASB. He then enquired about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the bureau/department responsible for taking 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>forward the initiative of exploring the provision of water taxi service; and</p> <p>(b) latest progress of the SmartBike service launched by WKCD in WKCD, including the utilization rate, whether the bike route and locations of rental service stations could extensively serve the entire district, as well as the liability and insurance issues in case of accidents.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the Transport and Housing Bureau was responsible for exploring the provision of water taxi service.</p> <p>WKCD responded that:</p> <p>(a) the SmartBike service was well-received by the public;</p> <p>(b) the SmartBike service was designed to complement the future provision of cycle paths in WKCD, and to encourage visitors to use bicycles as a sustainable means of getting around the Art Park. It currently allowed visitors to enjoy the views of Victoria Harbour. In future it would also allow easy access to cultural venues, cafes, restaurants and shops in the park and along the harbourfront; and</p> <p>(c) the management of public open space of WKCD was regulated by a set of Bylaw. Visitors were also covered by public liability insurance if in the rare case of injury when using the SmartBike service.</p> <p>Despite only a small number of accidents involved the use of the SmartBike service so far, the Chairman suggested WKCD to be prepared for handling related accidents within WKCD.</p>	
020516-021009	Chairman Administration WKCD	<p>The Chairman expressed support for the revised proposal of ASB. He further asked about:</p> <p>(a) whether the new simplified design of ASB could be beautified by, for example, adding some art decorations or making it more colourful; and</p> <p>(b) details of the provision of water taxi service connecting WKCD, including whether WKCD would tender out the service to potential service operators.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>The Administration and WKCD A responded that:</p> <p>(a) the new simplified design of ASB allowed flexibility to add visual elements and art decorations to match with various WKCD programmes in future; and</p> <p>(b) WKCD A had been discussing with some potential operators on the operation of different means of marine transport connecting WKCD.</p>	
021010-021525	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration	<p>Dr LEUNG called on the Administration/WKCD A to actively explore the development of water taxi service to enhance marine connectivity across the Victoria Harbour to link up locations such as WKCD, Kai Tak Cruise Terminal, Hung Hom and Tai Kok Tsui, etc. for tourism and transport purposes.</p> <p>The Administration advised that WKCD A had initiated discussion with HKT B on relevant matters.</p>	
021526-022139	Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCD A	<p>The Deputy Chairman asked about:</p> <p>(a) whether there would be adequate parking spaces in WKCD, in particular for coaches, to meet the demand;</p> <p>(b) the provision of parking spaces nearby the Xiqu Centre; and</p> <p>(c) the access route to EC in future.</p> <p>WKCD A responded that:</p> <p>(a) based on the forecast of visitor numbers of all WKCD facilities and their modal split, it was anticipated that 24 coach parking spaces would be required upon completion of the entire WKCD facilities. To better cater for the need, 43 coach parking spaces would be provided within WKCD;</p> <p>(b) there would be about 50 parking spaces (temporary provision) adjacent to the Xiqu Centre and about 210 parking spaces below the Art Park adjoining the M+ building. Also, additional 400 parking spaces would be provided upon the commissioning of the West Kowloon Station of the HKS of XRL; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		(c) to serve the western part of WKCD, an at-grade carriageway around the portal of Western Harbour Crossing was under construction for completion in the third quarter of 2018. There would be a single access point at Nga Cheung Road/Austin Road West and a roundabout at the far end section of the U-shaped road adjacent to EC.	
022140-022533	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCD	<p>Mr YIU asked about:</p> <p>(a) whether pick-up and drop-off facilities in WKCD would be sufficient to cater for the demand of coaches during major events; and</p> <p>(b) to avoid further aggravating traffic congestion in the vicinity of West Kowloon, how WKCD would avoid coaches circling on roads while searching for parking spaces within the district.</p> <p>WKCD advised that there would be about 10 pick-up and drop-off points throughout the district. Apart from the west gate lay-by of about 300 metres long on Austin Road West, an east lay-by of about 50 metres long had been built along Austin Road West near the Xiqu Centre and would be open soon for use by public transport. WKCD would closely monitor the actual parking demand and review the provision of parking facilities for coaches in WKCD as and when necessary.</p>	
022534-023034	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG WKCD	<p>Dr LEUNG called on WKCD to ensure adequate provision of parking spaces in WKCD, including those for coaches.</p> <p>WKCD replied that according to the parking provision requirements stipulated in the Hong Kong Planning Standard and Guidelines, the planned provision of more than 2 000 car parking spaces in WKCD should be sufficient.</p>	
Agenda Item V – Any other business			
023035-023111	Chairman	Date of the next meeting and items for discussion	