

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(1) 915 /19-20  
(These minutes have been cleared  
with the Chairman)

Ref : CB1/BC/2/18/2

**Bills Committee on Waste Disposal (Charging for Municipal Solid Waste)  
(Amendment) Bill 2018**

**Minutes of 16<sup>th</sup> meeting  
held on Monday, 22 June 2020, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai, JP  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH, JP  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Members absent** : Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon Kenneth LEUNG  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kiwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Angel SHEK  
Chief Council Secretary (1)1

**Staff in attendance** : Mr Cliff IP  
Assistant Legal Adviser 8

Mr Jason KONG  
Senior Council Secretary (1)1

---

Action

**I. Way forward of the Bills Committee**

(LC Paper No. CB(1)787/ — Paper prepared by the Legislative  
19-20(01) Council Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(1)748/ — Hon Steven HO Chun-yin's letter dated  
19-20(01) 9 June 2020 to the Chairman (Chinese  
version only)

LC Paper No. CB(1)703/ — Bills Committee Clerk's reply letter on  
19-20(01) behalf of the Chairman to Hon HUI  
Chi-fung's letter dated 14 May 2020  
(Chinese version only)

LC Paper No. CB(1)641/ — Hon HUI Chi-fung's letter dated 14  
19-20(01) May 2020 to the Chairman (Chinese  
version only))

The Chairman remarked that earlier on he had directed that members' views be sought by way of circulation of paper on whether they agreed that the Bills Committee should discontinue its scrutiny work on the Waste Disposal (Charging for Municipal Solid Waste) (Amendment) Bill 2018 ("the Bill") and report to the House Committee. Among members who had responded to the invitation by the specified deadline, 12 members signified agreement while nine signified disagreement. In the light of the consultation results, he had decided that the Bills Committee should discuss its way forward at this meeting.

Action

2. The Chairman said that he strongly supported the implementation of the proposed municipal solid waste ("MSW") charging scheme, and as the Chairman of the Bills Committee, he hoped that the Bill's legislative process could be completed in a timely manner. Unfortunately, the scrutiny work of the Bills Committee had been affected by a series of violent protests since 2019 and the outbreak of 2019 coronavirus disease. In recent months, he had directed that meetings be held more frequently, in the hope that the Bills Committee could complete its work in time for resumption of the Bill's Second Reading debate in the current legislative session. However, up to the last meeting, the Bills Committee had only examined up to clause 4 of the Bill, which had 37 clauses in total. As the current term of the Legislative Council would be prorogued soon, he had come to the view that there would not be sufficient time for the Bills Committee to complete its scrutiny work on the Bill.

3. The Chairman asked the Clerk to brief members on the current situation, and invited members to give views on the way forward of the Bills Committee. The Clerk said that if the Bill was to resume its Second Reading debate before prorogation of the Sixth Legislative Council and at the Council meeting of 15 July 2020 the latest, the Bills Committee should report to the House Committee on or before 3 July 2020. There were limited time slots in the coming two weeks for holding Bills Committee meetings, and some other committees (such as the Finance Committee) had meetings scheduled in the same period of time.

4. The Deputy Chairman, Mr SHIU Ka-fai and Mr Tommy CHEUNG expressed strong reservation on the feasibility of completing scrutiny of the entire Bill and potential amendments to the Bill under a tight timeframe, and whether it would be effective use of time and resources to continue with the Bills Committee's work.

5. The Deputy Chairman added that two other bills committees had also decided to discontinue their work for similar reasons. Although it appeared that most Members were supportive of the general direction of MSW charging, the Administration had not adequately incorporated Members' views into the proposed MSW charging scheme. Mr Tommy CHEUNG stressed that Bills Committee members should be given sufficient time to exercise their duties of scrutinizing the provisions of the Bill to ensure that the policy objective of the proposed MSW charging scheme would be achieved.

6. Mr Tony TSE remarked that he had signified disagreement to the discontinuation of the Bills Committee's scrutiny work on the Bill. He would participate in the Bills Committee's meetings as far as possible if members decided to carry on with the Bill's scrutiny.

Action

7. Mr HUI Chi-fung and Mr Jeremy TAM considered that the meetings held in the past were not frequent enough and the Bills Committee should endeavour to complete the scrutiny of the Bill by expediting its work as far as possible. Mr TAM opined that meeting time had not been efficiently used in the past because no time limits had been set for discussion on individual issues concerning the Bill. Mr HUI and Mr TAM asked whether the Chairman would consider convening intensive meetings on the coming Saturday and Sunday for examining the remaining clauses of the Bill.

8. Mr Paul TSE said that even if the clause-by-clause examination of the Bill could be completed during such intensive meetings suggested by the above members, the Administration and members should still be given sufficient time to prepare proposed amendments to the Bill based on the outcome of the clause-by-clause examination for discussion by the Bills Committee. It would not be in public interest to overly compress the duration of the process. The Deputy Chairman echoed Mr TSE's views.

9. The Chairman advised that whether a meeting should be convened depended on, among other things, the availability of different parties involved and a meeting venue. Taking all relevant factors into account, he did not consider it appropriate to convene meetings on the coming Saturday and Sunday.

*(When the Chairman was speaking, Mr HUI Chi-fung interrupted several times. At 9:32 am, the Chairman warned Mr HUI that he should not interrupt the Chairman when the Chairman was speaking.)*

10. Mr CHU Hoi-dick considered that public officers should be invited to attend the current meeting for explaining the Administration's position on the way forward of the Bills Committee.

11. The Chairman said that public officers' attendance for the current agenda item was not necessary. He pointed out that the Secretary for the Environment ("SEN") had explained the Administration's latest views on the scrutiny process of the Bill at a media session on 20 June 2020.

12. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Clerk added that before the meeting, she had sought the Administration's views on the way forward of the Bills Committee. The Administration responded that the Bills Committee might refer to the [press release](#) containing SEN's remarks at the said media session.

Action

13. After discussion, the Chairman put the following question to vote:

"the Bills Committee agrees to discontinue its scrutiny work on the Bill and report this decision to the House Committee."

14. At the request of Mr KWOK Wai-keung, the Chairman ordered a division. The Chairman declared that seven members voted for and four members voted against the question, and the question was agreed to. The votes of individual members were as follows:

*For:*

Mr MA Fung-kwok  
Mr Steven HO  
Mr SHIU Ka-fai  
Mr Vincent CHENG  
(7 members)

Mr Tommy CHEUNG  
Mr KWOK Wai-keung  
Mr CHAN Chun-ying

*Against:*

Mr CHU Hoi-dick  
Mr Jeremy TAM  
(4 members)

Mr HUI Chi-fung  
Mr Tony TSE

*(An index of the meeting proceedings is attached at the **Annex.**)*

**II. Any other business**

15. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 9:56 am.

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
29 July 2020

## Bills Committee on Waste Disposal (Charging for Municipal Solid Waste) (Amendment) Bill 2018

**Proceedings of the 16<sup>th</sup> meeting  
on Monday, 22 June 2020, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda Item I – Way forward of the Bills Committee</i>			
000617 – 000849	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000850 – 001202	Chairman Deputy Chairman	Expression of views	
001203 – 001452	Chairman Mr HUI Chi-fung	Expression of views	
001453 – 001800	Chairman Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Expression of views	
001801 – 002109	Chairman Mr Tommy CHEUNG	Expression of views	
002110 – 002553	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Mr SHIU Ka-fai	Expression of views	
002554 – 002820	Chairman Mr Tony TSE	Expression of views	
002821 – 003430	Chairman Clerk	The Chairman's expression of views and the Clerk's briefing on the current situation	
003431 – 005543	Chairman Mr HUI Chi-fung Mr Jeremy TAM Mr SHIU Ka-fai Mr Paul TSE Mr CHU Hoi-dick Deputy Chairman Clerk	Discussion on the way forward of the Bills Committee	
005544 – 005819	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai- keung	The Bills Committee's decision on its way forward	

<i>Agenda Item II – Any other business</i>			
005820 – 010023	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai- keung	Concluding remarks	

Council Business Division 1  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
29 July 2020