立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. PWSC28/18-19 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/1(2)B

Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 2nd meeting held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex on Wednesday, 24 October 2018, at 8:30 am

Members present:

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP (Chairman)

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon Claudia MO

Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP

Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Hon Alvin YEUNG

Hon CHU Hoi-dick

Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

Hon HO Kai-ming

Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding

Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH

Hon Tanya CHAN

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP

Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP

Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH

Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai

Hon KWONG Chun-yu

Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho

Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai

Hon AU Nok-hin

Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH

Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Member attending:

Hon HUI Chi-fung

Members absent:

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Public officers attending:

Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP Deputy Secretary for Financial Services

and the Treasury (Treasury)3

Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP Permanent Secretary for Development

(Works)

Ms Doris HO Pui-ling, JP Deputy Secretary for Development

(Planning and Lands)1

Mr Donald TONG Chi-keung, JP Permanent Secretary for the Environment

Ms Margaret HSIA Mai-chi Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial

Services and the Treasury (Treasury)

(Works)

Mr Victor CHAN Fuk-yiu Principal Assistant Secretary for

Development (Works)2

Mr Wallace TANG Wing-keung Assistant Secretary for Development

(Infrastructure Coordination)4

Mr Michael LEUNG Chung-lap,

JP

Project Manager (East)

Civil Engineering and Development

Department

Mr Peter CHUI Si-kay Chief Engineer (East)3

East Development Office

Civil Engineering and Development

Department

Mr George MAK Kin-ming Chief Engineer (East)5

East Development Office

Civil Engineering and Development

Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Doris LO Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance:

Mr Kelvin LEE Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 3

Mr Keith WONG

Ms Christina SHIU

Ms Christy YAU

Ms Clara LO

Council Secretary (1)2

Legislative Assistant (1)2

Legislative Assistant (1)7

Legislative Assistant (1)8

Action

Application for late membership

The Chairman advised that the meeting would first deal with the application for late membership from Mr HUI Chi-fung (Mr HUI's

application letter was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. PWSC4/18-19 on 16 October 2018). <u>The Chairman</u> drew members' attention to paragraph 4B of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") Procedure on applications for late membership, and sought members' views on Mr HUI's application.

- 2. <u>Mr Tony TSE</u> enquired about Mr HUI Chi-fung's reason for not signifying membership for the Subcommittee before the relevant deadline. Besides, he also asked whether Mr HUI could be allowed to attend a meeting of the Subcommittee to explain his case.
- 3. As Mr HUI Chi-fung was not present, the Chairman invited members to take note of his application letter, and pointed out that Mr HUI had stated in the letter that as the Subcommittee was responsible for scrutinizing and approving the public expenditure proposals put forward by the Government, which was a matter of public concern, he wished to join the Subcommittee to participate in its scrutiny work.
- 4. Mr Tony TSE opined that Mr HUI should attend the meeting of the Subcommittee in person to respond to members' questions on his application, so that the Subcommittee could consider his application thoroughly. He suggested that the Chairman might defer discussion on the agenda item until Mr HUI could attend a meeting to explain to members the reason for his late application. Mr CHAN Han-pan also opined that Mr HUI's application should be dealt with only when Mr HUI attended a meeting to respond to members' questions. He pointed out that there had been precedent cases in which Members were requested to attend a meeting and respond to other members' questions before a decision on their applications were made.
- 5. <u>Ms Tanya CHAN</u> and <u>Mr WU Chi-wai</u> raised objection to deferring the consideration of Mr HUI Chi-fung's application. <u>Ms CHAN</u> opined that the Chairman should allow the Subcommittee to put to vote the question as to whether Mr HUI's application should be accepted in order to make a decision without having to wait for Mr HUI to attend a meeting. <u>Mr WU</u> opined that members should respect Mr HUI's wish to join the Subcommittee. <u>Mr Gary FAN</u> suggested that the Subcommittee could first vote on Mr HUI's application and then the Chairman might invite Mr HUI to provide supplementary information in writing after the meeting to explain the reason for not signifying membership for the Subcommittee before the deadline.
- 6. <u>Mr Michael TIEN</u> enquired whether Members applying for late membership must attend the relevant meeting of the Subcommittee in respect of their applications. <u>Mr TIEN</u> also asked the Clerk to confirm whether PWSC Procedure stipulated that the Chairman must proceed forthwith to deal

with the applications from the Members concerned, or the Chairman could decide when such applications should be dealt with.

- 7. The Chairman said that Members applying for late membership were not required to attend the relevant meeting of the Subcommittee in respect of their applications. Moreover, the Clerk confirmed that the PWSC Procedure did not prescribe a timeframe for the Subcommittee to deal with those applications. The Chairman also said that for Mr HUI Chi-fung's application, as some members had requested for allowing Mr HUI to first explain the reason for not signifying membership before the deadline, he considered that the agenda item should be deferred until Mr HUI Chi-fung attended a meeting to respond to members' questions to facilitate thorough consideration by the Subcommittee.
- 8. The Chairman directed that the Subcommittee should first deal with other agenda items for the meeting. He advised that there were two funding proposals, which were newly submitted by the Administration, on the agenda for the meeting. He reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP") of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the funding proposals under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the proposals. He also drew members' attention to Rule 84 of RoP on voting in case of direct pecuniary interest.

Head 707 – New Towns and Urban Area Development PWSC(2018-19)29 702CL Kai Tak development – remaining infrastructure works for developments at the former runway and south apron

9. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)29, sought to upgrade part of 702CL to Category A at an estimated cost of \$2,874.7 million in money-of-the-day prices. The Administration consulted the Panel on Development on the proposed works on 26 June 2018. Panel members generally supported the submission of the funding proposal to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the Panel's discussion was tabled at the meeting.

Items of works under 702CL

Landscaped decks and landscaped area

10. <u>Mr Gary FAN</u> pointed out that according to the Administration's submission, the part of the works located at the former runway under 702CL

would provide a total of about 3.9 hectares of public open space, including the proposed landscaped decks above Road D3 (Metro Park Section ("MPS")) and the landscaped area adjoining Road D3 (MPS), at an estimated cost exceeding \$390 million. He found the project estimate too high, and enquired whether the Administration had considered other less costly design options. Mr AU Nok-hin enquired about the facilities on the proposed landscaped decks that would be open for public use.

- Chief Engineer (East)5, East Development Office, Civil Engineering 11. and Development Department ("CE(E)5/CEDD"), said that facilities such as a stepped plaza, lawn, a water play area, a look-out tower for the public to enjoy the sea view, a "GreenWay" for shared use by pedestrians and cyclists, and toilets would be provided at the proposed landscaped decks. proposed landscape decks would adopt a simplistic design. Administration had consulted the Harbourfront Commission and the District Council ("DC"), as well as seeking public views on the conceptual design. The estimated cost of the structure of the some 200-metre-long elevated portion of the proposed landscaped decks was around \$120 million. cost of the above elevated portion and the remaining at-grade portion of about 180 metres long of the landscaped decks located on top of the proposed vehicular underpass, was covered by the cost estimate for road works set out in paragraph 12(a) of the discussion paper (i.e. PWSC(2018-19)29). relevant cost estimate was generally in line with that of open spaces in general.
- 12. <u>Project Manager (East), Civil Engineering and Development Department</u> ("PM(E)/CEDD"), supplemented that the design of the landscaped decks had taken into account such factors as the physical constraints. The project estimate had also made reference to the prices of the tenders received recently by the Government for similar projects.
- 13. Mr WU Chi-wai and Ms Claudia MO opined that it was unnecessary and a waste of public money to design part of Road D3 (MPS) as a covered vehicular underpass with landscaped decks built atop its entrance sections. Mr LUK Chung-hung enquired whether the landscaped decks had any specific facilities or functions to complement the overall development of Kai Tak Development ("KTD").
- 14. Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Works)2 ("PAS(W)2/DEVB") said the proposed landscaped decks would adjoin an elevated landscaped deck located at Shing Fung Road at one end, and the future Metro Park at the other. Upon completion, the landscaped decks would provide pedestrians with direct and barrier-free access between the former runway area and the future Metro Park, thereby enhancing the

accessibility of the open spaces in KTD. <u>PM(E)/CEDD</u> supplemented that both the Harbourfront Commission and DC supported turning part of Road D3 (MPS) into a vehicular underpass, so as to reduce the noise impact on the Metro Park.

- 15. Mr WU Chi-wai and Mr CHU Hoi-dick noted that according to the plan at Enclosure 1 (Sheet 2) to the Administration's submission in which the proposed landscaped decks were shaded with blue diagonal lines, there was a small gap in the landscaped decks on top of the vehicular underpass of Road D3 (MPS). They enquired about the purpose of the design. Besides, Mr WU also enquired why the proposed landscaped decks ended at the roundabout of the future Road D3A as shown in the plan.
- 16. CE(E)5/CEDD and Chief Engineer (East)3, East Development Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CE(E)3/CEDD") advised respectively that the gap in the landscaped decks on top of the vehicular underpass of Road D3 (MPS) would be the ventilation opening of the Such a design would obviate the need to install mechanical ventilation equipment in the underpass and could save energy. The Administration was implementing another project in the former runway area, i.e. "711CL – Kai Tak development – infrastructure works for developments at the southern part of the former runway", which included expanding Shing Fung Road into a dual two-lane distributor road and building an elevated landscaped deck about 1.4 kilometres long above it. This elevated landscaped deck would be connected to the proposed landscaped decks under 702CL.
- 17. Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Mr KWONG Chun-yu opined that as the landscaped decks proposed under 702CL and the elevated landscaped deck being built under 711CL belonged to the same infrastructure, it was not desirable for the Administration to split the project into different works items for implementation and seeking funding. CE(E)3/CEDD responded that as the development progress in different sub-districts in KTD varied, it was necessary to implement the related road and support facilities development projects in phases.
- Mr WU Chi-wai, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr CHU Hoi-dick, 18. Mr KWONG Chun-yu and Mr Gary FAN pointed out that the information provided by the Administration in its submission (i.e. PWSC(2018-19)29) was insufficient and unclear, making it difficult for members to grasp the details of the proposed public open space with a total area of about 3.9 hectares (including the landscaped decks and landscaped area) at the former runway, such as its spatial layout, facilities, and interface with other works projects and infrastructure requested in KTD. They

the Administration to provide (a) an artist impression of the proposed public open space; (b) how the proposed landscaped decks would be connected to (i) the future Metro Park and (ii) the elevated landscaped deck being constructed under 711CL; and (c) the facilities to be provided at the proposed landscaped decks and the remaining public open space, as well as a breakdown of the estimated cost.

(*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide <u>LC Paper No. PWSC26/18-19(01)</u> on 14 November 2018.)

- 19. Mr WU Chi-wai suggested that the Administration should select those plant species which were more resistant to wind for the open space under the proposed project so that the plants would be less likely to be damaged during typhoons. PM(E)/CEDD said that the Administration had selected highly wind-resistant plant species for the open spaces in KTD. For instance, the Terminalia mantaly trees planted in the former runway area were able to withstand strong winds and were not damaged when Severe Typhoon Mangkhut stroke Hong Kong in September 2018.
- 20. Mr Jeremy TAM and Ms Claudia MO opined that the Administration should consider allowing pets in the open spaces in KTD (including the proposed landscaped decks), so that members of the public could bring their pets along. Mr KWONG Chun-yu also pointed out that as the Hong Kong Children's Hospital ("HKCH") was located in KTD, the Administration should consider promoting the idea of doctor pets at the open spaces of KTD to support the rehabilitation of sick children.
- 21. <u>PM(E)/CEDD</u> said that as a general practice, the open spaces in KTD would be managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD"). Should the funding proposal be approved by LegCo, the Administration would consult DC on the specific design of the open spaces, including whether pets should be allowed. The relevant consultation exercise was expected to commence in late 2019 to early 2020. LCSD would give active consideration to making available the open space for pets if the idea was supported by DC. CEDD would undertake the construction of the associated support facilities should the relevant proposal be implemented eventually.

Landscaped elevated walkway

22. <u>Dr KWOK Ka-ki</u> noted that 702CL comprised the construction of a landscaped elevated walkway which served as a linkage between the former south apron and the Kowloon Bay hinterland at a cost exceeding

\$190 million. He criticized the project for being too costly and requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on the reasons for the high cost, and whether the estimate had been vetted by the Project Cost Management Office ("PCMO") and adjusted; if so, the original estimate before vetting.

(*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide <u>LC Paper No. PWSC26/18-19(01)</u> on 14 November 2018.)

23. <u>PAS(W)2/DEVB</u> said that in planning the construction of the landscaped elevated walkway, the Government had taken into account local views and adopted a simple design for the walkway. <u>CE(E)3/CEDD</u> advised that the landscaped elevated walkway, which was about 140 metres long, would connect Kowloon Bay to the planned developments and the waterfront at the former south apron, including the New Acute Hospital ("NAH") under construction. As far as the project estimate was concerned, it was slightly lower than the average cost estimate of other recent footbridge projects of similar nature. In addition, since the establishment of PCMO, all capital works projects had been subject to its review before submission to LegCo for funding approval. The cost estimate of the relevant works item had also been vetted by PCMO.

Road works

- 24. <u>Mr WU Chi-wai</u> pointed out that cyclists had all along been prohibited from using vehicular tunnels. He enquired whether the Administration would consider relaxing the relevant ban in KTD by allowing the public to cycle along the vehicular underpass of Road D3 (MPS). Expressing support for the suggestion, <u>Dr KWOK Ka-ki</u> considered it conducive to promoting green commuting.
- 25. <u>PM(E)/CEDD</u> said that the 13-kilometre-long cycle track the Government planned to build at the waterfront promenade of KTD, presumably, could meet the need of the public to move around KTD by cycling while striking a balance with road safety. <u>PAS(W)2/DEVB</u> supplemented that whether cyclists should be allowed to use vehicular tunnels concerned traffic management policy. He would relay Mr WU's views to the Transport and Housing Bureau for consideration.
- 26. Mr Tony TSE expressed support for the funding proposal for 702CL so that the construction of KTD could be completed as soon as possible. Noting that Road D3 (MPS) would comprise an elevated section, he suggested that the Administration should explore ways to make the best use

of the space below the elevated section. <u>CE(E)5/CEDD</u> responded that the area below the elevated section of Road D3 (MPS) would be turned into a public open space adjoining the open space of the Metro Park.

- 27. Mr HO Kai-ming expressed support for the funding proposal for 702CL. He pointed out that as HKCH would soon be commissioned and NAH at the former south apron was under construction, the Administration had to commence the works of Road D3 (MPS) as soon as possible in order to enhance the accessibility of the two hospitals. Besides, he suggested providing an additional bus stop on Kai Fuk Road and widening the roads at the Kowloon City roundabout, thereby making the two hospitals more accessible to residents of Kwun Tong, Tseung Kwan O and Wong Tai Sin by road transport.
- 28. <u>Dr Fernando CHEUNG</u> said that as the road works in the vicinity of the soon-to-be-commissioned HKCH were not yet completed, there were concerns that nearby roads could not cope with the additional traffic after the commissioning of HKCH. He enquired how the road construction works under 702CL could help enhance the transport connectivity of HKCH. He also urged the Administration to coordinate with minibus operators to arrange for the provision of barrier-free green minibus routes serving HKCH.
- 29. <u>CE(E)3/CEDD</u> said in addition to the construction of Road L10 and Road L18 connecting to NAH, 702CL also comprised the construction works of Road D3 (MPS), which linked up the former runway and south apron with the former north apron. It was considered that the newly-built roads would facilitate public access to the two hospitals from different parts of Kowloon. Moreover, the widening works of Shing Cheong Road, a road connecting to HKCH, would be completed in 2019 to accommodate more traffic. <u>PM(E)/CEDD</u> supplemented that CEDD, together with the Transport Department and the Hospital Authority, would closely monitor the traffic conditions after the commissioning of HKCH so that transport services could be adjusted and improved in a timely manner.
- 30. Mr AU Nok-hin noted that it took four years to implement 702CL for completion in 2023. He was concerned that works vehicles would increase the traffic load on Shing Cheong Road during construction, which might obstruct public access to HKCH. In response, PM(E)/CEDD pointed out that the contractor would deliver most of the inert construction waste by sea when carrying out the construction works of Road D3 (MPS), so as to minimize the traffic impact on the vicinity of KTD.
- 31. <u>Mr Holden CHOW</u> pointed out that two sites in the former runway area were newly zoned for residential development in 2018. He enquired

whether the implementation progress of various road projects would tie in with the completion time of the residential flats at the two sites to ensure that the new road network would be available for use by residents moving in. PAS(W)2/DEVB said that the two sites had not yet been put up for auction, and the various items of works under 702CL were expected to be completed one after another from 2022. It was believed that they could tie in with the population intake schedule of the two residential sites.

Handling of waste generated from construction works

- 32. <u>Dr KWOK Ka-ki</u> and <u>Mr CHU Hoi-dick</u> noted that a total of 680 000 tonnes of construction waste was expected to be generated from various items of works under 702CL. <u>Dr KWOK</u> enquired why such a large amount of construction waste would be generated from the construction works carried out in a new development area ("NDA"). <u>Mr CHU</u> also sought details about the cost estimate of waste handling.
- 33. <u>CE(E)3/CEDD</u> said that construction waste would be generated from the excavation works to remove the underground soil for construction of Road D3 (MPS), which comprised depressed road sections. Regarding the cost of waste handling, <u>CE(E)5/CEDD</u> said that the relevant expenses would be subsumed under the cost of miscellaneous works.

Environmentally Friendly Linkage System

- 34. Mr Tony TSE pointed out that the Administration was conducting a detailed feasibility study for the construction of the Environmentally Friendly Linkage System ("EFLS") for Kowloon East ("KE"). He enquired whether the various items of works under 702CL would cause obstruction to the construction of EFLS for KE in future should EFLS be implemented. In addition, Mr TSE and Mr AU Nok-hin also enquired whether the transport and road networks of KTD could meet future development needs if the Administration decided against the construction of EFLS for KE eventually.
- 35. PAS(W)2/DEVB said that the Kai Tak Outline Zoning Plan covered reserve for the possible construction of EFLS for KE. The Government had also reserved sites in KTD for the proposed system, and the items of works under 702CL would not cause any hindrance. He added that the Government was conducting the second stage of the detailed feasibility study on the EFLS scheme, including the system coverage, alignment and station locations. Relevant technical and financial assessments were also being conducted to confirm the feasibility of the proposal. The Administration would consider the way forward of EFLS in the light of the findings of the feasibility study.

Other developments in Kai Tak Development

36. Dr CHENG Chung-tai pointed out that the estimated project cost of 702CL was over \$2.8 billion. Together with other works projects for which funding had been sought earlier, the total infrastructure cost of KTD would He criticized the Administration for adopting a exceed \$10 billion. piecemeal approach by submitting separate funding requests to LegCo for different projects, aiming at lowering the amount of funding involved in each funding proposal to stand a better chance of approval. He requested the Administration to explain whether further funding approval would be sought from LegCo for other KTD projects in future. Dr KWOK Ka-ki also requested the Administration to provide supplementary information setting out the details of the remaining projects in KTD for which funding approval had yet been sought from LegCo, and the estimated project costs concerned.

(*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide <u>LC Paper No. PWSC26/18-19(01)</u> on 14 November 2018.)

37. <u>PAS(W)2/DEVB</u> said that as KTD covered an area of more than 300 hectares, and given its enormous scale and diversity of development, the implementation of the project had to synchronize with the pace of development of different works projects in an orderly manner. Such an approach was in line with the Government's practice in implementing major NDA projects. He added that the Administration's submission (i.e. <u>PWSC(2018-19)29</u>) had set out the contents and brief accounts of progress of the Category A items under the KTD Public Works Programme for members' reference.

[At 10:23 am, the Chairman asked members if they agreed to extend the meeting for 15 minutes in order to complete the voting on the item. Members present agreed.]

38. Mr Tony TSE enquired how the Administration would promote the concept of smart city in KTD. PM(E)/CEDD replied that the Government had taken forward measures such as installing smart water meters at new buildings in KTD and smart lampposts in the former runway area. The Kai Tak Office of CEDD would continue to work with relevant government departments to explore the provision of additional facilities for the promotion of the smart city concept in KTD.

<u>Action</u> - 13 -

Voting on PWSC(2018-19)29

39. There being no further questions on the item from members, the Chairman put PWSC(2018-19)29 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. Twenty-five members voted for and 1 member voted against the proposal. Five members abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Mr Charles Peter MOK (Deputy Chairman) Mr Abraham SHEK Mr Tommy CHEUNG Ms Starry LEE Mr CHAN Hak-kan Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mr Frankie YICK Mr WU Chi-wai Mr MA Fung-kwok Mr CHAN Han-pan Mr LEUNG Che-cheung Ms Alice MAK Dr KWOK Ka-ki Mr Alvin YEUNG Mr HO Kai-ming Mr Holden CHOW Mr Wilson OR Ms Tanya CHAN Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan Mr LUK Chung-hung Mr LAU Kwok-fan Mr KWONG Chun-yu Mr Vincent CHENG Mr Jeremy TAM

Mr Tony TSE (25 members)

Against:

Dr CHENG Chung-tai

(1 member)

Abstain:

Ms Claudia MO Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

Mr CHU Hoi-dick Mr Gary FAN

Mr AU Nok-hin (5 members)

40. <u>The Chairman</u> declared that the item was endorsed by the Subcommittee. <u>Dr KWOK Ka-ki</u> requested that the item (i.e. <u>PWSC(2018-19)29</u>) be voted on separately at the relevant meeting of the Finance Committee.

Application for late membership

41. <u>The Chairman</u> advised that since Mr HUI Chi-fung had arrived at the conference room, he would proceed to deal with Mr HUI's late application for membership.

- 42. The Chairman invited Mr HUI Chi-fung to explain the reason for not signifying membership for the Subcommittee before the deadline. Mr HUI Chi-fung said that he had not signified membership for the Subcommittee before the deadline because the meeting schedule of the Subcommittee clashed with his other official commitment. He had subsequently rescheduled his official commitment so that he could attend the Subcommittee meetings. He therefore submitted an application for late membership.
- 43. There being no further questions or comments from members on Mr HUI Chi-fung's application, the Chairman put to vote the question as to whether Mr HUI Chi-fung's late application for membership should be accepted. Mr Tony TSE requested a division.
- 44. <u>The Chairman</u> said that there were less than five minutes to the end time of the meeting, and asked members if they agreed to further extend the meeting to conduct a division. <u>Mr Tony TSE</u> objected to further extending the meeting and considered that Mr HUI Chi-fung's application could be carried over to the next meeting.
- 45. <u>The Chairman</u> directed that as the remaining time of the meeting was insufficient, Mr HUI's application would be carried over to the next meeting.
- 46. The meeting ended at 10:44 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
16 November 2018