

立法會  
*Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. CB(2)1660/18-19

Ref : CB2/H/5/18

**House Committee of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 26th meeting  
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex  
at 2:30 pm on Friday, 14 June 2019**

**Members present :**

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Kenneth LEUNG  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon AU Nok-hin  
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS  
Hon CHAN Hoi-yan

**Members absent :**

Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Hon Tanya CHAN

**Clerk in attendance :**

Miss Flora TAI Clerk to the House Committee

**Staff in attendance :**

Mr Kenneth CHEN, SBS	Secretary General
Ms Connie FUNG	Legal Adviser
Miss Odelia LEUNG	Deputy Secretary General
Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
Ms Dora WAI	Assistant Secretary General 3
Mr Matthew LOO	Assistant Secretary General 4
Mr Timothy TSO	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1
Mr YICK Wing-kin	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2
Mr Kelvin LEE	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 3
Ms Amy YU	Principal Council Secretary 1
Ms Hallie CHAN	Head (Public Information)
Ms Alice LEUNG	Chief Council Secretary (2)6
Miss Joyce CHAN	Assistant Legal Adviser 1
Miss Rachel DAI	Assistant Legal Adviser 2
Ms Vanessa CHENG	Assistant Legal Adviser 5
Ms Clara TAM	Assistant Legal Adviser 9
Miss Connie AU	Senior Council Secretary (2)6
Mr Richard WONG	Senior Council Secretary (2)8
Miss Michelle TANG	Council Secretary (2)6
Ms Anna CHEUNG	Senior Legislative Assistant (2)3
Mr Arthur KAN	Legislative Assistant (2)7

---

Action

**I. Confirmation of verbatim transcript/minutes of meetings**

- (a) **Verbatim transcript of the 24th meeting held on 24 May 2019**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1637/18-19)
- (b) **Minutes of the 25th meeting held on 31 May 2019**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1638/18-19)

Before the Chairman invited Members to confirm the above two sets of verbatim transcript and minutes, Mr Kenneth LEUNG raised a query as to whether it was appropriate to hold this meeting when the Amber alert (which was issued on 12 June 2019) was in force and the Police had declared that the incident happened on 12 June 2019 was a riot.

Action

Expressing concern about the personal safety of users of the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Complex, Mr LEUNG questioned whether the public liability insurance policy procured by The Legislative Council Commission ("LCC") could provide adequate coverage. Sharing similar concern, Mr Gary FAN expressed strong dissatisfaction with the situation that a large number of police officers were stationing within the LegCo Complex.

2. The Chairman said that in deciding whether to hold this meeting, Members' personal safety was one of the most important considerations. To her understanding, meetings of the Council and its committees might continue to be held when the Amber alert was in force. Besides, she had arrived at the LegCo Complex early on the day of this meeting so as to ascertain whether there was smooth traffic in the vicinity of the LegCo Complex. The Chairman added that up to the present moment, no Members had complained to her that they had difficulty in returning to the LegCo Complex.

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Secretary General ("SG") advised that the Amber alert had been issued following LCC's approval. On the instruction of LCC, the Secretariat had been in liaison with the Police to ensure that the LegCo Complex was safe and accessible to Members so that meetings of the Council and its committees might be held. However, the decision as to whether to hold committee meetings rested with the respective Chairmen. He added that of the five types of insurance policies procured by LCC, the Employees' Compensation Insurance, the Property All Risks Insurance and the Motor Insurance continued to provide coverage for losses/damage due to riots, whereas the Money All Risks Insurance and the Public Liability Insurance would not cover losses and damage due to riots.

*(Some Members spoke loudly in their seats expressing disapproval of the explanation given by SG.)*

4. Noting that the Money All Risks Insurance and the Public Liability Insurance would not cover losses and damage due to riots, Mr Alvin YEUNG and Mr Jeremy TAM queried whether it was appropriate to hold any meetings for the time being. Mr YEUNG raised a query as to which person/entity would be held responsible in the event of any relevant damage/losses. He also complained that the President and SG were out of contact on 12 June 2019, and expressed dissatisfaction with the situation that a large number of police officers were stationing within the

Action

LegCo Complex. Mr TAM was concerned that the insurance policy procured by LCC could not provide adequate coverage for some users of LegCo Complex (e.g. media representatives) and considered it necessary for the Secretariat, before any meetings were held, to make clear the implications of inadequate insurance coverage on different types of users of the LegCo Complex.

5. Mr HUI Chi-fung, Dr CHENG Chung-tai and Mr AU Nok-hin expressed strong dissatisfaction with the security arrangements under the Amber alert, particularly the situation that a large number of police officers were permitted to station within the LegCo Complex and use the facilities therein arbitrarily. Mr HUI complained that on the day of this meeting, he had to spend about ten minutes going through the security screening procedures conducted by police officers when he was driving to the Complex through Lung Wo Road. Dr CHENG said that some media representatives also had difficulty in going through the security screening procedures conducted by police officers. Mr AU questioned why police officers were not requested to go through any security screening procedures before entering the LegCo Complex. Mr HUI and Dr CHENG shared a similar view that if it was already safe for committee meetings to be held in the LegCo Complex, it should no longer be necessary for police officers to station therein. Mr AU noted that one of the conditions for issuing the Amber alert was that "large numbers of protestors have assembled in the drum area and/or the vicinity of the LegCo Complex and some of them are engaging in rowdy behaviour and conflicts among them are highly possible." He queried whether the present situation met the condition as he did not see a large number of protestors or any protestors engaging in rowdy behaviour.

6. In response, the Chairman said that it was the Police, instead of LCC or the Secretariat, who was responsible for the way police officers were deployed. As the decision to issue the Amber alert rested with LCC, HC should not discuss LCC's decision.

7. Ms Claudia MO strongly queried why a large number of police officers were permitted to station within the LegCo Complex. She expressed strong dissatisfaction with the Chairman's response, and criticized her as being shameful. The Chairman disapproved of the remark made by Ms MO and pointed out that Ms MO should not use insulting language.

Action

8. Mr IP Kin-yuen said that at about 3:00 pm to 5:00 pm on 12 June 2019 when the Police was using tear gas against protesters in the vicinity of the LegCo Complex, several Members including himself were denied access to the LegCo Complex. He had later learnt that the decision not to open the gates of the LegCo Complex was made by the management of the Secretariat. Mr IP strongly protested against such an arrangement. At the invitation of the Chairman, SG explained that the security arrangements on 12 June 2019, including whether and when the gates of the LegCo Complex could be opened, were made in consultation with the Police after taking into account security considerations prevailing at that time.

9. In response to Members' various views and concerns, the Chairman said that Members might, if they so wished, follow up issues relating to the incident that happened on 12 June 2019 on other platforms, and might raise with LCC and/or the Secretariat issues under the purview of LCC (such as the procurement or coverage of insurance policies for the LegCo Complex). The Chairman drew to Members' attention that more than 20 minutes had been used for dealing with issues which were not relevant to any agenda items of this meeting, and requested that Members should not raise points of order for the purpose of expressing views on those issues.

*(Some Members spoke loudly in their seats in protest of the Chairman's remark.)*

10. The Chairman ordered that the meeting be suspended for a while.

*(The meeting was suspended at 2:51 pm and resumed at 3:15 pm.)*

11. When the meeting resumed, the Chairman said that she understood that the recent atmosphere in the society as well as in LegCo was tense. In the light of this, she had allowed Members to raise issues (including the security and insurance arrangements for the LegCo Complex in respect of the incident that happened on 12 June 2019) at the beginning of this meeting, even though such issues were not relevant to any agenda items of this meeting. Notwithstanding that Members had spent more than 20 minutes raising the above issues, the atmosphere among Members remained very tense. After having consulted Members belonging to various political parties and groupings, she had decided not to continue this meeting having regard to the fact that there was no agenda item that must be dealt with at this meeting.

Action

*(Some Members spoke loudly in their seats requesting for the withdrawal of draconian laws.)*

12. The Chairman further said that before declaring this meeting closed, she wished to point out that Members should reflect to LCC their views on the security and insurance arrangements for the LegCo Complex in respect of the incident that happened on 12 June 2019, instead of using HC's meeting time to express those views. The Chairman also pointed out that it was LCC, not the Secretariat, to decide whether the Amber alert should remain in force. Therefore, the condemnations or accusations against the Secretariat in this regard made by many Members earlier at this meeting were unfair and inappropriate. She added that she considered it necessary for the Secretariat to give due regard to the personal safety of its staff members in the discharge of duties.

*(Some Members left their seats and stood near the Chairman's podium, speaking loudly requesting for the withdrawal of draconian laws.)*

13. At 3:17 pm, the Chairman declared the meeting closed.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
20 June 2019