



中華人民共和國香港特別行政區政府總部教育局
Education Bureau
Government Secretariat, Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region
The People's Republic of China

本局檔案 Our Ref. : EDB(CDI/ETV)/1-80/3/12(2)

電話 Telephone : (852) 2892 5803

來函檔案 Your Ref. : CB4/PAC/R71

傳真 Fax Line : (852) 2573 5299

8 January 2019

Mr Anthony Chu
Clerk to Public Accounts Committee
Legislative Council Secretariat
Legislative Council Complex
1 Legislative Council Road
Central, Hong Kong

Dear Mr Chu,

Public Accounts Committee
Consideration of Chapter 5 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 71
Radio Television Hong Kong: Provision of programmes

I refer to your letter dated 14 December 2018 to the Secretary for Education requesting for response and/or information. Our reply is set out at Annex for reference by the Public Account Committee.

Yours sincerely,

(Joe KS NG)
for Secretary for Education

Encl

c.c. Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development (fax no. 2588 1421)
Director of Broadcasting (fax no. 2337 2403)
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (fax no. 2537 3210)
Director of Audit (fax no. 2583 9063)

Public Accounts Committee
Consideration of Chapter 5 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 71
Radio Television Hong Kong: Provision of Programmes

Secretary for Education's reply to
written questions raised by the PAC

Background

The broadcast of Educational Television (ETV) was first made in the 1970s and its development has changed ever since. The work of the ETV Unit of the Education Bureau (EDB) is no longer confined to the production of ETV programmes but includes the development of other multimedia resources at the same time (see Appendix for the list of resources).

Given that the mode of use of video resources in the education sector has changed, there has been a downward trend in watching ETV programmes by teachers and students in the classroom in recent years. In this connection, the EDB has divided the programmes into chapters and short clips with a length of a few minutes have been uploaded to the Hong Kong Education City (HKEdCity) ETV website (<https://etv.hkedcity.net>) for schools' flexible use. Teachers can even download these resources according to their needs. Students may watch the ETV video segments over the Internet at home for lesson preparation or revision, thereby making the most of the lesson time to engage in in-depth problem solving or consolidation activities. This could help enhance learning and teaching effectiveness.

In view of today's mode of use, the HKEdCity ETV website was revamped in 2016 with enhancements such as adopting a responsive web and web accessibility design, the provision of programme chapters and other multimedia resources available for download by teachers, and the addition of on-demand subtitles (also available in text files), etc. Since the revamp of the HKEdCity ETV website, over three million hits are recorded every year. Moreover, the "ETV mobile application" was launched by the EDB in late 2012 and the number of downloads has been rising steadily, exceeding 77,000 at end-2018.

To evaluate the utilisation rate and effectiveness of ETV service, since 2002 the EDB has been commissioning a tertiary institute or agency to conduct annual surveys, and continuously improving the quality of service based on the survey results and teachers' feedback. However, the surveys are targeted at schools and rely on curriculum co-ordinators or panel chairpersons to collect and collate subject and class data. It relates only to students' viewing ETV resources arranged by teachers and for this reason, the survey findings cannot adequately reflect students' access to ETV

resources over the Internet outside class. The EDB will improve the methodology of surveys on the use of ETV multimedia resources with a view to yielding more comprehensive data which can fully reflect their utilisation. Given the absence of complete usage figures, we cannot simplistically conclude that “the usage of ETV service is dropping continuously”.

As regards other multimedia resources, since 1998 the ETV Unit of the EDB has been developing multimedia resources for schools’ flexible use. Examples include a multimedia interactive teaching kit on environmental education (consisting of videos, interactive learning software and electronic presentation slides) and digital disc series for different subjects produced in earlier years; theme-based short videos, multi-ending micro movies, photos and sound tracks (e.g. the sounds of Asiatic Painted frogs and trams to support the development of descriptive writing skills) developed in recent years; and a learning and teaching resource package for kindergartens (《做個健康好寶寶》) which contains picture books, numbered musical notations and music videos of nursery rhymes, videos, animations, etc. (see Appendix for the list of resources). Besides, various sections of the EDB also produce video resources related to school subjects and the introduction to education policies while adhering to the principle that such initiatives do not duplicate the work of the ETV Unit. The ETV Unit and other sections of the EDB both commission outside production houses to handle the technical aspects of the production work.

Today, ETV, whether it is a full programme or a short clip, is one of the myriad educational video resources.

4(a) According to paragraph 4.50(a), schools are gradually ceasing to designate lessons for watching school ETV programmes, has RTHK discussed with the Education Bureau (EDB) to consider introducing other multimedia educational resources so as to making better use of public money? If yes, what are the details? If not, what are the reasons? As there is a continuous decline in the usage of school ETV services, does the Government think that assessment review should be conducted to evaluate whether it is cost effective to continue providing this service?

The EDB has all along been reviewing the production and transmission of ETV programmes. The following actions have been taken in response to the findings of the reviews and the development of the media and learning and teaching modes:

- (1) Changes were made in the form of ETV: the programmes are available not only in a full-programme form, but also in segments with a length of a few minutes;
- (2) Changes were made in the mode of broadcast of ETV: apart from broadcasting ETV programmes on a commercial channel for one

hour on each school day and via RTHK Channels TV 31 and 31A for one hour on weekdays, these resources are available for viewing and download on the HKEdCity ETV website. Moreover, the ETV mobile application was launched by the EDB in late 2012 and the number of downloads has been rising steadily, exceeding 77,000 at end-2018.

- (3) Other multimedia resources have been developed (see 'Background' and Appendix).

In view of these changes and the developmental needs, the EDB has made several reductions in the funding for RTHK, resulting in reductions in the total financial provision as follows:

- (1) from \$44.2 million in the 2002-03 financial year to \$39.5 million in the 2003-04 financial year;
- (2) from \$35.2 million in the 2006-07 financial year to \$27.3 million in the 2011-12 financial year; and
- (3) from \$29.8 million in the 2017-18 financial year to \$27.7 million (estimate) in the 2018-19 financial year.

Moreover, the EDB does not confine the development of video resources to the ETV programmes produced by RTHK. Instead, the EDB has proactively developed other multimedia resources (see Appendix). In particular, the learning and teaching resource package for kindergartens 《做個健康好寶寶》, which contains picture books, numbered musical notations and music videos of nursery rhymes, videos, animations, puppets, etc., has been distributed to all kindergartens in Hong Kong and the feedback is positive.

However, as mentioned in 'Background', the survey findings at present cannot fully reflect students' use of ETV resources over the Internet outside class. Therefore, we could not simplistically conclude that "the usage of ETV service is dropping continuously".

- 4(b)&(c) Although paragraphs 4.51 and 4.57 explained the reasons of low staff productivity and high production cost, the staff productivity and production cost of school ETV programmes is still high when compared to the production of commercial television broadcasters. How will RTHK and EDB follow up on this issue?**

As some of the departments producing multimedia programmes (e.g. Information Services Department) do not outsource the programme production to RTHK and ETV programmes are not broadcast on RTHK or commercial television channels, will the Government consider carrying out a study to examine whether it

will be more cost-effective for EDB to produce ETV programmes itself?

The EDB will conduct a comprehensive and in-depth evaluation of the position of ETV as one of the e-learning resources and the need for its production, as well as the cost-effectiveness of the ETV programmes currently produced by RTHK. The EDB will consider outsourcing the production of suitable programmes, even before the completion of the holistic review, if the cost is significantly lower.

- 4(d) According to paragraph 4.60, why did RTHK and EDB not take forward the proposal of the Standing Committee on the Development of the ETV Service in 2003, to jointly formulate commissioning strategy or draw up definite plan for commissioning the production of school ETV programmes? As RTHK's hourly cost of production on the ETV programmes is high, does the Government agree that EDB and RTHK should explore the possibility of increasing the scale of commissioning of school ETV programme productions?**

Between 2002 and 2003, the EDB negotiated with RTHK about clawing back 5% of the production funding for the 2003-04 financial year for the purpose of outsourcing the production of nine ETV programmes. The proposal was supported by the Standing Committee on the Development of ETV Service. After then both parties explored ways to formulate the targets and strategies of the outsourcing, and it was expected that 25% of the ETV programmes could be outsourced. However, later on RTHK was concerned about the impact of outsourcing on the size of its staff establishment, so the abovementioned proposals (including the transfer of 5% of the production funding from RTHK to the EDB and the progressive increase in the number of outsourced programmes) were not implemented. In view of the development of the media and learning and teaching modes, the EDB has reduced the allocation to RTHK (see part (a)) and produced other educational video resources, with outside production houses being commissioned to handle the technical aspects of the production work (see 'Background'). These measures have in fact achieved the objective of outsourcing the production of part of the multi-media resources.

The EDB will conduct a comprehensive and in-depth evaluation of the position of ETV as one of the e-learning resources and the need for its production, as well as the cost-effectiveness of the ETV programmes currently produced by RTHK.

- 4(e) According to paragraph 4.61, since 2005, various committees have been set up by EDB to review its ETV service on an on-going basis. Please inform the results and the follow-up actions taken by EDB.**

Since the dissolution of the Standing Committee on the Development of ETV Service in 2004, the EDB has set up different committees including the Programme Development Committee for the Primary and Pre-primary Sector (2005-2007) and the Programme Development Committee for the Secondary Sector (2005-2007), which were responsible for the in-depth evaluation of the content and quality of individual programmes, the Curriculum Development Council Committee on Learning Resources and Support Service (since 2001), which reviews at a macro-level the direction for the development of learning and teaching resources, as well as the Ad Hoc Committee on the Development of School ETV Programmes (since 2012), which provides suggestions on the direction for the development of ETV service. These committees seek to continually review the development of ETV and adopt follow-up actions, leading to significant changes in the content, format, target users, channels of transmission, etc. For example, in light of social changes, ETV has transcended time and geographical constraints, evolving into digital discs in earlier years and videos transmitted primarily over the Internet and mobile applications in recent years (see 'Background'). In response to the findings of the reviews and the development of the media and learning and teaching mode, educational video resources have been transformed from television programmes into a variety of multimedia resources.

With the support of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Development of School ETV Programmes, the ETV Unit has introduced the following changes:

- (1) Apart from the eight Key Learning Areas, the programmes also cover cross-curricular themes like moral and civic education, information technology in education, etc. Besides, a programme series entitled "Education Magazine" is produced to present information on the latest developments in local education;
- (2) The ETV Unit develops other multimedia resources mentioned in 'Background' more proactively;
- (3) The target users have also been extended to include students from the kindergarten level to the senior secondary level, teachers, parents and the general public;
- (4) The ETV mobile application has been launched and the HKEdCity ETV website (<https://etv.hkedcity.net>) revamped with enhanced features such as adopting a responsive web and web accessibility design;

- (5) Teacher professional development programmes and school visits have been organised to introduce different kinds of newly developed multimedia resources, share schools' experiences in using ETV resources to support e-learning and collect views from frontline teachers. In the Learning and Teaching Expo held in 2010 and 2016, exhibition booths and talks on ETV were arranged to share the strategies and experiences of using ETV resources to facilitate e-learning. The response was very enthusiastic.
- (6) As regards publicity, promotional materials such as leaflets, posters and folders, etc. on different resource series, including "STEM Education", "Lifelong Love of Reading" and "Introduction to Chinese Classics", are regularly produced by the ETV Unit for distribution to kindergartens, primary schools and secondary schools with the aim of keeping teachers informed about the latest developments of ETV. In addition, "Monthly Update" on the newly uploaded resources and links is disseminated to over 1,500 subscribed teachers via email and social media groups.

4(f) According to paragraphs 4.64(b), 4.65 and 4.66, have EDB and RTHK completed the comprehensive review on RTHK's production of school ETV programmes to determine the way forward and the improvement measures? If yes, what are the results? If not, when will the review be completed?

As mentioned in (b), the EDB will conduct a comprehensive and in-depth evaluation of the position of ETV as one of the e-learning resources and the need for its production, and review in collaboration with RTHK the cost-effectiveness of the ETV programmes currently produced by RTHK. The review has not been completed yet. On the other hand, the EDB needs to improve the methodology of surveys on the use of ETV multimedia resources with a view to revealing more comprehensively the usage of ETV resources across various transmission platforms. Because of the need to conduct a comprehensive review of the future direction for the development of ETV and the mode of collaboration with RTHK as well as to extensively solicit stakeholders' views, a target date of completion of the review cannot be fixed at the moment. In the meantime, the EDB will also consider outsourcing the production of suitable programmes if the cost is significantly lower.

Examples of Multimedia Resources Outsourced by the EDB

Year	Title
1998 – 2007	1. 后羿射日
	2. 本地史——史前至南北朝
	3. 本地史——隋代至明代
	4. 本地史——香港開埠
	5. 本地史——孫中山遺蹟與辛亥革命
	6. 本地史——抗日戰爭與日治香港
	7. 校園檔案：書包重嗎？
	8. Give me back my name
	9. Phonics Segments (1-3)
	10. Alice in Cyberland
	11. 探索追蹤
	12. 小碗豆與巨人
	2007 - 2018
14. 大豆回家	
15. 米的未來	
16. 科研之光	
17. 通訊新領域	
18. 電子教科書宣傳短片	
19. 《景物描寫 (步移法)》(第一部分)	
- 短片及動畫 25 段	
20. 《景物描寫 (定點觀察)》	
- 短片及動畫 11 段	
21. 《聽聽這聲音》及《聲音描寫》	
- 短片 16 段	
- 聲效 30 段	
- 相片 23 張	
22. 《多感官觀察及描寫》	
- 短片 32 段	
23. 《做個健康好寶寶》幼稚園學與教資源套	
- 短片 19 段	
- 動畫 13 段	
- 繪本 12 本	
- 歌曲集(兒歌曲譜 20 首)	
- 手偶、貼紙	
24. 《抉擇人生》價值觀教育學與教資源套	
- 《文具店》(一個故事及四個不同結局)	
- 《舞台上下》(一個故事及四個不同結局)	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 小學課堂片段及訪問片段 3 段 - 中學課堂片段及訪問片段 3 段
	<p>25.活學趣論・基本說法《基本法》視像教材套</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 緣來《基本法》 - 「一國兩制」與五十年不變 - 中央和香港特別行政區的關係 - 法律與高度自治 - 日常生活與港人治港
	<p>26.《基本法》視像教材套(小學)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 《基本法》與香港歷史 - 一個國家・兩個制度 - 治港有道 - 樂活香港 - 《基本法》與我 - 守法小公民
	<p>27.全港性系統評估介紹——校園篇</p>
	<p>28.全港性系統評估介紹——家長篇</p>
	<p>29.《景物描寫 (步移法)》(第二部分)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 短片及動畫 3 段
	<p>30.《景物描寫 (綜合法)》</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 短片及動畫 8 段
	<p>31.通識教室 (共有 4 個約 10 分鐘節目)</p>
	<p>32.兒歌動畫</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 兒歌動畫 10 個(中秋節、端午節、農曆新年、數字歌、小雨點、Find the ABC、筆順歌 (一)至(四))
	<p>33.《探索與發現》</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 短片 86 段
	<p>34.《非物質文化遺產——傳統手工藝》(製作中)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 短片 12 段
	<p>35.幼兒數學動畫系列 (製作中)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 解難短片 7 段